The religious identity of the church and its social and political mission in South Africa 1948-1984: a historical and Theological Analysis

Baai, Gladstone Sandi

How to cite:

Use policy
The full-text may be used and/or reproduced, and given to third parties in any format or medium, without prior permission or charge, for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes provided that:

- a full bibliographic reference is made to the original source
- a link is made to the metadata record in Durham E-Theses
- the full-text is not changed in any way

The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

Please consult the full Durham E-Theses policy for further details.
The copyright of this thesis rests with the author.
No quotation from it should be published without
his prior written consent and information derived
from it should be acknowledged.

The Religious Identity of the
Church and Its Social and
Political Mission in South Africa
1948-1984 - a Historical
and Theological Analysis

A thesis submitted for the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in the University of Durham
Department of Theology

by

GLADSTONE SANDI BAAI

1988

2 3 MAR 1989
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

"Lead From Strength"

## PART I

The Theory of Identity and its Application to the Interpretation of religion in South Africa

### Chapter 1

**INTRODUCTION** .................................................. 1

1.1 Contextual Factors and Resources ...... 1

1.2 The Organisation of the Thesis ....... 8

### Chapter 2

**THE HERMENEUTICS OF IDENTITY** .......................... 10

2.1 Identity theories and African Religion............................................. 10

2.2 Methodology and the Interpretative Hypothesis ............................. 40

## PART II

An Analysis of Culture, Land and Social Control in South Africa

### Chapter 3

**IDENTITY AND CULTURE IN AFRICAN SOCIETY** ............... 59

3.1 The Rites of Passage ................. 59

(i) Childbirth ............................. 62
(ii) Initiation ................. 65
(iii) Marriage ................. 79

3.2 The Family ................. 87
3.3 The Role of Women .......... 106

Chapter 4
RELIGIOUS IDEOLOGIES OF IDENTITY IN SOUTH AFRICA .... 111
4.1 The Problem of Ideology ........ 111
4.2 Dutch Ideology and Identity ...... 126
4.3 English Ideology and Identity ..... 136

Chapter 5
LAND AND THE DENUDATION OF AFRICAN IDENTITY ........ 143
5.1 The Religious Communal Land Process .. 145
5.2 The Religious Capitalist Land Process ................. 161

Chapter 6
SOCIAL STRUCTURE AND CONTROL IN SOUTH AFRICAN SOCIETY 175
6.1 The Unmasking of Social Structures ... 175
6.2 Education and Social Control ........ 203
   (i) The Structure of Primary Education ................. 216
   (ii) The Structure of Secondary Education ................. 220
   (iii) University Education and Racial Policy ................. 227
PART III
A Sociological and Theological Analysis of Social Activism

Chapter 7
THE RISE OF SOUTH AFRICAN SOCIAL ACTIVISM .......... 230
7.1 The ANC in the Context of South African Social Activism: Identity and the Struggle for Unity .......... 232
7.2 Alienation and Social Transformation . 252
7.3 The Rise of Black Theology .......... 265

Chapter 8
ORGANISED RELIGION AND THE PROPHETIC DENUNCIATORY INHERITANCE OF MISSION .................... 272
8.1 General Theological Factors ............ 272
8.2 Church Typology ...................... 301
   (i) The Afrikaans Reformed Churches . 302
   (ii) The South African Council of Churches' Member Churches ....... 306

Chapter 9
COMMITMENT AND THE FULFILMENT OF IDENTITY .......... 322
9.1 Violence and the Just War Theory ..... 327
9.2 The History of Violence in the History of Black Protest in South Africa ..... 330
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>The Theological Thought of the Church in the Context of Violence in South Africa</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>The Sacraments</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>The Implications of this Study</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MAP</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GLOSSARY</td>
<td>372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>378</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis has not previously been submitted for any other degree in this or in any other University. It is the original work of the Author.

Si

Da
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many people and organisations to whom I owe a special debt of gratitude for their unfailing support at the initial stage and during the course of researching and writing this thesis.

I would like to thank the Overseas Division of the Methodist Church in Great Britain for the award of Scholarship which enabled me to undertake doctoral research in the University of Durham. For that, above all, I shall always remain grateful. I should also wish to record my thanks to the Committee of Vice-Chancellors and Principals of the Universities of the United Kingdom for the Overseas Research Student Award.

It is my pleasure to thank Dr. R.H. Roberts for his interest in my field of research, his thoroughness and unselfish offering of scholarship, time and supervision in order to ensure the accuracy and completeness of this study. His invaluable comments and suggestions upon earlier drafts of my thesis have been appreciated. I also owe a special debt of gratitude to Professor J.D.G. Dunn for his encouragement and warm recommendations of me for financial support from the above organisations. Furthermore, my thanks are expressed to Professors D.W. Hardy and E.D.A. Hulmes whose kindness in reading parts of my manuscript and making suggestions has provided intellectual stimulation.
I express my thanks to Mr. Brian Woodward, the staff of the
University Library and in particular the excellent Inter-Library
Loan section. They have been unfailingly helpful. To Miss
Catherine Reed and Mrs. Margaret Bell, my typists, both of whom
turned my manuscript into a beautifully typed piece of work.

My most grateful thanks are due to my wife Zinnia and my children
whose support has been a constant stimulus to me for many years.
For these reasons, the thesis is dedicated to them.
ABSTRACT

This study is concerned with the identity of the Church and its social and political mission in South Africa. Here the argument is that the religious identity of the Church is fulfilled in the realization of the Kingdom of God through the historical event of incarnation which liberates human identity from oppression and alienation. This doctrine in turn, it is contended, depends for its relevance upon the significance of the concepts of prolepsis and commitment for the mission of the Church. Prolepsis signifies that the Church exists to bear witness to that which has come and is coming in Jesus Christ. In this way the thesis attempts to situate the proclamation of the Kingdom of God in relation to a particular problem of oppression and exploitation in South Africa. Hence commitment should be understood as the fulfilment of Black identity and thus as a liberation which brings about the transformation of the South African identity as a whole.

In this thesis the hermeneutic circle as a theory of interpretation is applied in the theological and historical analysis of the South African social formation. Part One of the thesis lays the theoretical foundations of the study by developing the hypothesis and discussing identity theories and methodology.

Part Two contains an analysis of South African social reality in which the variable of class is identified as that which underpins the South African social structure. Consequently, Apartheid is explained with reference to the economy rather than race. It is an economic rather than a racial factor.

Part Three consists of a theological and sociological analysis of South Africa. It employs the Marxist social theory of alienation and applies the conception of identity advocated by the Liberation Movements of Southern Africa, particularly the African National Congress.

It is concluded that the religious identity is a crucial factor in the emergence of a full humanity.
This study undertakes a historical and theological analysis of the religious identity of the Church and its social and political mission in South Africa. In the introductory chapter the religious identity of the Church is understood as the realization of the Kingdom of God enacted through the historical event of incarnation, an act which liberates human identity from the status of oppression, alienation and domination. Within this theological stance the proclamation of the proleptic Kingdom of God is conceived as a commitment to the fulfilment of Black identity through liberation. The mission of the Church therefore implies commitment to, and active participation in God's liberation and reconciliation of man in history.

In chapter two drawing up various levels of identity theory the individual level of identity is given particular significance. Identity is selfhood defined in its own terms in relation to other selves in a historical setting. Because the self experiences the fragmentation of self-identity there is always in religion a search for the integration of self with reference to a transcendental order. In this study we have made use of selected tape-recorded materials and papers and essays written by Blacks themselves in South Africa. In addition, my own South African religious experience constitutes a primary source of this thesis. Here, the author as it were "leads from strength". Although our theological inquiry is not focussed solely on identity in Xhosa society but in the religious identity of the Church in the
context of South African society as a whole, our theory of interpretation nevertheless begins with a review of traditional thought patterns in black South African culture.

In Chapter three we use the theory of Van Gennep who maintains that the life of the self in traditional society is marked by culturally approved ceremonies such as at childbirth, initiation and marriage. Here, the concept of the family is important. There is, however, a conception of the religious in identity integration. It is the experience of the other which underpins and strengthens identity. The concepts of filiopiety and familialism have not only expressed the religious conception of man in Africa but they also demonstrate that identity is relational and self-relative. The periodization of man's life is an expression of man's desire to integrate himself. On the other hand, man has to redefine his relation to other selves in the light of circumstances of fragmentation, such as those brought about by Christian Mission and the development of Capitalism in South Africa.

Christianity fragmented traditional African identity in that it functioned ideologically in support of the beliefs and ideas of the dominant classes. It justified the class divisions and contradictions in society by its very acquiescence in the status quo. The mystification of the identity of Christianity was aggravated by its support of colonialism, imperialism and capitalism.
Furthermore, the capitalist conception of land compounded the situation of Christianity in that there arose a dialectic between the religious communal land and the capitalist land processes. The former emphasised the integration of identity by means of culturally approved rites whereas the latter fragmented African family structure through slavery, feudalism and capitalist modes of production which eventually brought about a centre-periphery economic structure in South Africa. Through a process of stripping, what we term "denudation", South African capitalist society seriously but did not completely erode Black identity. In this process the emergent independent peasantry were reduced to a proletarian status in order to serve the interests of the white economy. Apartheid is therefore to be understood as an economic rather than as a racial factor. Racial cleavages which now have religious overtones must be understood within the history of industrial development and class division.

In Chapter six we see that the arguments of Adam and Kuper, even though they acknowledge the class factor, maintain that Apartheid must be explained with reference primarily to race. They argue that the colour of the skin is used in South Africa to discriminate against persons in a system of race rule. On the basis of oral tradition and historical evidence, in this thesis we dispute the above arguments and show that there was no racial discrimination at the original Refreshment Station at the Cape. It is inconceivable that a clash between the early European settlers and the indigenous tribes could have been constituted along racial lines because social distinctions were religious rather than racial.
However, it is likely that beliefs pertaining to the exploitation of raw materials were initially more significant than the colour of the skin. Legassick and Johnstone underline our arguments that Apartheid is primarily to be understood as an economic issue. They are of the view that the fundamental distinctiveness of South African society is grounded in class. Especially worth of comment here is that we cannot, of course, fully make sense of the objective relational position of the Black working class, qua class, without also taking account of their race as a basis of what has been referred to as the "exploitability" of the black workers. This is to say, the use of extra-economic coercive measures to facilitate a supply of "ultra-cheap labour" for capitalist enterprise. In order to maintain the economic base, it is argued here, that education in South Africa is consistently used as a means of the extension of social control, particularly since 1948. It is designed to maintain White hegemony.

In Chapter seven we argue that sensitive to racial separation with its concomitant maintenance of the White hegemony, the liberation movements, and in particular the African National Congress of South Africa, postulated an integrated system of South African identity based upon appeals for justice and political inclusion. Just as later in the Black Theology of liberation, they had no social theory as such with which to transform South African society. In both movements there was no materialist conception of history which would have effectively called for the de-alienation of the South African society. In this thesis the analysis of alienation is used as a critical
principle which locates the convergence between the economy and human identity. Consequently, the ills of society are exposed. Both the traditional communal and the capitalist conceptualizations of identity are strengthened by religion.

In Chapter eight our church typology indicates that although the Church in South Africa endorses the demands of the ANC Freedom Charter, Christianity nevertheless failed to transform South African society because it functioned primarily in ideologic terms. The consequences of which included the postulation of the reconciliation of the contradictions of society in the form of a vertical relation to God without a horizontal commitment to the fulfilment of black identity and thus to liberation. We argue in this chapter that the doctrine of the Trinity reflects God as a relational being in which the Father, Son and Holy Spirit fulfils the supremacy of the Father in love and fellowship. Jesus Christ has expressed his relational identity by showing solidarity with the Father and the oppressed in the preaching of the Kingdom of God. His self-identity is constituted by his solidarity with those whom society has placed in conditions of alienation and oppression.

In order to restore a dialectical relationship between the grace of God and the world, the Church in mission must commit itself to the fulfilment of black identity in South Africa thus giving Christianity a place in defining the identity of a particular people. The Kingdom of God should be proclaimed as a real anticipation of the future in the midst of history. While
rejecting violence as a means of social change in the South African context, the sacraments and non-violence should be perceived as means of identity fulfilment in which we could celebrate the Jubilee.

The thesis concludes with reflections concerning the implications of this thesis for the South African Church, its training and its further theological reflection in relation to society. We also see in the conflict between traditional identity and modernisation a fundamental problem for both Church and Society in South Africa.
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

1.1 Contextual Factors and Resources

My argument in this thesis is that the identity of the church is to be understood as the realization of the Kingdom of God in time and space and in this the concepts of prolepsis and commitment are significant. Prolepsis signifies that the church exists in the present history to bear witness to that which is coming. It should be perceived as an anticipatory sign of the Kingdom which fulfils the oppressed being by bringing about his liberation. Commitment indicates a commitment to the liberation of the whole oppressed being in South Africa thereby bringing about the fulfilment of both the identity of the oppressor and the oppressed in history and through history.

Further clarification and delimitation of this argument will, of course, emerge from succeeding Chapters. Here it may be indicated in a preliminary way that this pioneer piece of work focuses on the religious identity of the church and its social and political mission in South Africa.¹ The chronological and geographical limits of the research study are significant.

¹ See Map Diagram of South Africa.
Chronologically the study is a historical and theological analysis of the religious character of the South African society from 1948 to 1984. However, identity references may be made to the years before 1948 and after 1984. This period is crucial in three ways. First, 1948 was the year in which the United Nations adopted a universal declaration of Human Rights to eliminate all forms of discrimination and promote fundamental freedoms for all Nations in the world. Second, the same year saw the formation of the World Council of Churches in Amsterdam when Christians acknowledged unity in Jesus Christ the Lord of history. Third, contrary to world spirit of unity and racial tolerance, 1948 saw the assumption of power by the Nationalist Party under the leadership of Dominee Dr. D.F. Malan who had left his pulpit to lead South Africa in a policy of Apartheid which refers to a rigid racial discrimination and segregation. Furthermore, the incongruity of the ideology of Apartheid with the basic tenets of Christianity was so stark that the World Reformed Alliance of Churches in 1982 declared it a theological heresy.²

Subsequently, a Black South African Bishop who had been outspokenly critical of the Apartheid regime was awarded a Nobel Peace Prize in 1984. So, thirty six years of Nationalist rule in South Africa should give us a manageable and coherent picture

---

which might not have been otherwise possible if we began from the first encounter of black and white in the tribal settings of South Africa.

Geographically the area of research is the Republic of South Africa which is divided politically into four Provinces, namely, Cape of Good Hope, Natal, Orange Free State, Transvaal and the ten Bantustans. They are (1) BophuthaTswana for the Tswana tribes which is 14,500 square miles with 880,000 inhabitants. (2) Gazankulu for the Shangaans which is 2,600 square miles with 269,000 inhabitants. (3) Kwazulu for the Zulus which is 12,100 square miles with 2,115,000 inhabitants. (4) Lebowa for the North Ndebele and Pedi which is 8,500 square miles with 1,089,000 people. (5) Qwaqwa for the Southern Sotho which is 200 square miles with 26,000 people. (6) Kwa Ndebele for the southern Ndebele which is only 309 square miles with 160,000 inhabitants. However, the 1970 Census indicated that 450,000 people were living in other areas. (7) Kangwane for the Swazi which is only 800 square miles with 118,000 inhabitants. (8) Transkei for the Xhosa ethnic group which is 15,830 square miles with 1,743,000 inhabitants. (9) Venda for the Amavenda people which is only 2,300 square miles with 269,000 people and (10) Ciskei for the Xhosa which is 3,500 square miles with 529,000 inhabitants. 3

---

Three things emerge from this schematic analysis. First, that all of these Bantustans are not recognized by the international community. Second, in 1970 seven million Black people lived in these areas and eight million were still in white areas. Finally, it is noticeable that the Xhosa ethnic group is divided into two groups, namely, those of the Ciskei and Transkei.

Although this study is based on the South African social formation used here to refer to the whole of South Africa including the Bantustans, the examples on which it draws are largely based on Xhosa society. This ethnic group has been chosen because the author belongs to that group ethnically and knows them better than any other ethnic group in South Africa. Furthermore the history of South African Protestantism began in the Cape Colony from where it spread throughout the Republic. A church typology developed here proves useful in evaluating the identity of Christianity in South Africa.

The Institute of Race Relations supplied us with the following figures for the size of the population as at the last 1970 Census. The distribution was: White, 3751 328; Coloured, 2018 453; Asians 620 436; Africans 15057 952. This gives us a total

---

of 21,448 169 inhabitants who speak a number of different languages. The major ones of which are, Afrikaans, English, Xhosa, Zulu, Setswana, Sepedi, Sesotho, IsiSwati, Tsonga, Venda, Portuguese, Greek, Tamil, Hindi, Telugu, Gujarati and German. Briefly, we may say that the general design of this study is based on the author's experience of the South African culture as an ordained Methodist minister with pastoral charge of churches there. Having received a normal three-year basic training for the ministry at John Wesley College, the constituent college of the Federal Theological Seminary of Southern Africa, he then served the church in rural and urban settings in South Africa. For over twenty years now in the Ministry, most of which has been spent in the Eastern Cape, he has known very few quiet hours in which he did not reflect on the relation of Church and Society. Initially having received a Bachelor of Theology degree from the University of South Africa the opportunity to reflect further presented itself and he proceeded to Drew University where he earned a Master's degree in divinity, magna cum Laude. A year later he graduated with a Master of Sacred Theology in 1985. In the light of this experience of Church life and academic training in South Africa and overseas, I focus in this thesis on the identity of the church in relation to the South African society. By applying a Segundian methodology in the study, I aim to delimit and then carefully relate concepts and theories to the

identity of Christianity in South Africa. It is hoped that we will then be in a somewhat better position to know the degree to which some theories such as class and race are related to Christianity.

Furthermore, preparations for the present study have been supplemented by a detailed investigation of some characteristics of European means of investigations, namely, History, Anthropology, Sociology and Liberation Theology. As we have said above, Professor Luis J. Segundo's methodology of the hermeneutic theory is adopted in this study and applied to South Africa. Who is Segundo?

Juan Luis Segundo, a Jesuit theologian, was born in 1925 at Montevideo in Uruguay and was ordained priest in 1955. He read theology at the Faculty of Jesuit Theology at Louvain and at the Faculty of Literature at the University of Paris in France. He holds a Licentiate in Theology and a D. Litt. from the University of Paris. Dr. Segundo was at one time Director of the Pedro Fabro Centre at Montevideo for social study and action. He has been a visiting Professor at Harvard, Chicago, Montreal, Sao Paulo and Birmingham Universities. His previous works include the five-volume Theology for Artisans of a New Humanity; The Liberation of Theology; and The Hidden Motives of Pastoral Action.6

The research sources used in this thesis include tape-recorded oral material supplied by Blacks themselves from some of the areas in which the author served congregations. In addition, papers and essays from the Black Renaissance Convention and Black Theology of Liberation and the Study Project of Christianity in Apartheid Society (Spro-cas) constitute our primary sources. Beyond it has been necessary to use an extremely wide range of secondary sources. 7

Besides accomplishment of the primary research objectives, this thesis offers several other prospective contributions to the study of theology. First, in order to undertake a study of the religious identity of the church and its social and political mission in South Africa, the class variable is introduced here as an indicator of that which underpins the South African social structure. Therefore Apartheid is explained with reference to class rather than race. It is an economic factor. As we shall see, this factor has been used by the South African neo-Marxist historians, but never used by South African theologians. Second, the study proposes to assess the religious identity of Christianity in terms of the hermeneutics of identity. Finally, though it was not anticipated at the hypothesis formulation stages of this thesis, the Kairos Document has raised some of the critical issues with which we engage in the course of the following study.

7. See Primary and Secondary Sources.
However, the preliminary stage of our theory of interpretation tends to be descriptive. This is because much of the material here is contextual. For example, the Rites of Passage\(^8\) which though familiar enough to Black people in South Africa are not generally known to European readers. The methodology concerned is not descriptive. This is but the necessary preliminary to the next stage of presenting the arguments, namely, that which requires in more critical, analytical, interpretative methodology.

1.2 The Organisation of the Thesis\(^9\)

The thesis is developed in three parts. Chapter 2 lays the theoretical foundation for our research. Chapters 3, 4, 5 and 6 are an analysis of the South African social reality. Chapters 7, 8, 9 and 10 present theological and sociological reflections and conclusions.

In order to set this study in context and clarify further its focus, the following chapter discusses identity theories and the hypothesis is developed and methodology described. In Chapter 3 identity is analysed and the case is made for the Rites of Passage as indicators of individual identity in Xhosa society.

---

8. See Chapter three of this Thesis.
9. See Glossary of Xhosa and foreign Words retained in the text.
Chapter 4 discusses both the Dutch and English Settler's social theories in South Africa. Here, it is concluded that Christianity functioned ideologically in support of the dominant classes.

In Chapter 5 the study analyzes land and the argument is made for the land as an indicator of the original conflicts between black and white in South Africa. So, land as a source of identity and freedom is examined in the context of a clash of the ideologies of communalism and capitalism. Chapter 6 is an examination of the social structure and education. Here the case is made for class, the major independent variable of the study.

In Chapter 7 a sociological analysis is made by discussing the identity of the African National Congress and its approach to the unity of races in South Africa. Here the case for the utility of the Marxist social theory of alienation is made. Chapters 8 and 9 are a theological analysis which reviews contemporary literature relevant to our problem and introduces the concepts of spirituality and commitment. Here the case is made for the use of these concepts as indicators of the commitment of the church to Black liberation, therefore fulfilment of identity. The final Chapter presents the principal conclusions. The fundamental problem for church and society is the conflict between traditional identity and modernisation.
CHAPTER TWO

THE HERMENEUTICS OF IDENTITY

The objective of this chapter is twofold. First, it is to lay a theoretical foundation for the whole study by examining in detail several current theories of identity. It is important to note here an overlapping of theology and social sciences. This unity is grounded in reality itself. Since the concept of identity is widely used in various and often ill-defined ways, attending to the clarification and contextualization of the terms is particularly important from the outset. Second, we adopt the self-conscious methodology of Professor Juan Luis Segundo, a member of the Society of Jesus and a native of Latin America the application of which we shall later explain. With the hypothesis formulated in this chapter an attempt will be made to test the notion of the Kingdom of God in relation to the social and political mission of the Church in South African social formation.

2.1 Identity Theories and African Religion

Identity, as a key issue in the Sociology of religion, has always been inextricably bound with other theoretical analysis in the Social Sciences. ¹ Its multidisciplinary theoretical heritage

can be seen from the way in which H. Mol and E. Erikson, have used it. They have done so in different contexts and ways. Erikson has used the term in his psychoanalytic studies in which he said that it connoted both a persistent sameness within oneself and a persistent sharing of some kind of essential character with others. 4

Contrastingly, Mol has used it as a sketch for a new social-scientific theory of religion. He has said that identity formulations take place at three different, but interdependent levels, namely Individual, Group and Society. 5 He argues that religion is strengthened through its symbols, ritual and rites at the three levels to which we have just referred especially "in times of powerlessness, frustration, superordination and subordination of of men in race relations". Seemingly, identity


as a social-psychological concept contributes to the understanding of the persistence of religion.  

In both Erikson and Mol, a wide range of theoretical and empirical material has been well synthesised. The theory of the latter, in my view, is a little more than an elaboration of the basic functionalist explanation of religion. However familiar and incomplete though, the substantive content of functional theory is sufficiently rich and well grounded to justify his investment in it. However, where functionalism fails him is not in the reasons it offers but in the mode of reasoning it employs. For him, "the sacralization of identity" is both the defining characteristic of religion over the social function by which it is explained. In this elision of conceptualization and explanation, common in functional analysis, the conceptualization of religion is neglected.

My second objection concerns the validity of his antipathy to Marxists and exponents of "Modern deprivation theories of religion." I suspect that when this view is held in religion it

often means only that the Marxist's analysis as a tool for critical theological reflection is either misplaced or mislocated. If that is his basic view, how would he account for the emergence of Liberation Theology which used the Marxist analysis as a tool for a theological reflection in the sixties. Our argument is that the Marxist analysis should be welcomed only as a tool for analysis because there are already conflicts between different classes in society resulting in oppression. The Church's teaching on reconciliation can only be effective through a historical resolution of these conflicts. However, we should register the view that the Marxist analysis would only be appropriate when Marxism's atheism and materialism have been completely and utterly rejected.

Yet for this analysis it is significant to have observed that the issue of identity has been, and is, central to the Western and Third World industrial societies. It is in effect symptomatic of individuals, groups, and society at large. The starting point in the line of my argument develops from the individual. That is to say, we may conceivably begin with the analysis of individual identity and then proceed to consider group and social identity.

To argue that anything is the same, implies that there is a symmetrical relation of some kind that exhibits a correspondence in size and shape of parts. For example, we may speak of a human body as symmetrically balanced or we may say, if a is the same as b, b is always the same as a. There is a symmetrical relation which implies a self-relativeness of identity. The self-relativeness may be likened to self-love, (Uzithanda Ngokwakhe). It goes back to Protagoras (480-411 B.C.) who saw man as the measure of all things. The Renaissance itself emphasised the self-relativeness of identity in such a way that that period in history may be referred to as an era of "the autonomous individual." The question of the identity of man was the basis from which to begin an analysis by Descartes. The identity was perceived from the principle of (cogito ergo sum) "I think therefore I am". The "I", was so important to him that he sought a cause for it in a second postulate: God. A thing could be understood only if brought into line with the principle of cause and effect. It may be further argued that identity is

12. Feuerbach, L. 1957 The Essence of Christianity, pp. 17-61; (Harper & Row, N.Y.); and also Descartes, René, 1965 Correspondence, VI. (Paris).
related to man's striving to transcend the "I" that still remains a problem in his personality which may be split up into two main personality directions of activity.\(^{13}\) Firstly, that personality develops through a movement out into the world which is called extroversion. Secondly, it may turn towards the inner world of thought and imagination which is called introversion.\(^{14}\) My argument is that both the extrovert and introvert would be concerned about the products of their self-identity which in essence refers to who or what one is and to various meanings attached to the self.

The self is that part of personality that represents the individual as he experiences himself and adapts to the external reality. The "I", begins his life as a member of a family community and nation and "I", draws on a heritage of experience from the past. Referring to him, we might say,

"He lives on the conscious level as an ego, but is also an embodiment of the collective psyche and draws on the energy created by the tension between conscious and unconscious."\(^{15}\)


According to Jung the conscious and unconscious self should be transcended so that one may reach his true self which is the midpoint of his personality. He calls this a process of individuation. Of course, we may discern this process in religion. This would be the case from most traditional to the most highly developed types of religions such as the African traditional religions and Christianity. There is a deep significance here attached to symbolism. This maps out the path to salvation and makes it possible to embark consciously on the process of individuation. However, psychoanalysts such as Jung, to whom we have referred several times in the above arguments, have reductionist tendencies which tend to reduce religion to psychology.

The basic argument in the above analysis is that identity is selfhood, (ubumna). We should like to suggest that there is bifurcation of selfhood which manifests itself in two ways. First, selfhood appears not only self-relative, but it also shows a transitive character which may be observed in human development particularly in the African rites of passage such as birth, (ukubeleka), circumcision, (ukwaluka), and marriage, (ukutshata), (Chapter Three). Second, it is selfhood defined in my own terms among other selves in a similar historical context. To this, I propose to turn in the next discussion of group identity.

At present and in the course of the following exploration, we are claiming that identity is transitive.
"Only the self can constitute the bond of connection by which the self of the past passes over into the present, then edge into the future. It is I who integrate myself, including my past and present." 16

The concern with the self is developed in the sense that the subjective sense of identity which underlines the sense of sameness and continuity of the individual is emphasised. It is my view that growing up in an African society illustrates this very well in that while your identity remains the same, one has to go through stages in his life that are ceremonially marked such as that of childbirth, boyhood to manhood. On this hand, there is a persistent sameness within oneself that can be conscious. There is also our unconscious striving for continuity of personal character. William James asserted that a man's character is discernible in the mental or moral attitude in which, when it came upon him, he felt himself most deeply and intensely active and alive. At such moments there is a voice inside which speaks and says, "this is the real me". For me, such an experience always involves an element of active tension of holding my own, as it were, and trusting outward things to perform their past so as to make it a full harmony, but without any guarantee that they will. In essence the transitive sense of

identity could be observed and spotted by others. They would say this boy has "become himself", (unguye), at the very moment when he can be said to be "loosing himself" in work. He suddenly seems to be "at home in his body", and he "knows where he is going".

Before we come to the analysis of group identity, we should recapitulate in the following way, that identity is basically a relation which is both self-relative and transitive. I am quite clear that identity is selfhood, (ubumna). To put it differently, the spark in the eye of any person might give one a clue of his identity. However, it is possible to speak of absolute identity, that is, something that is marked by freedom without constitutional restrictions, without identity of formal structure. To support my argument, I should refer to the old question of whether the pair of stockings which had been darned so often that no part of the original silk remained was still the same. 17 It seems to me that in a case like this, we mean in ordinary life to assert something more than the structural identity of the pair of stockings. I know that the identity of the stockings is not preserved unless at least some part of the material has remained all through the process of mending. But we have no fixed standard by which to determine how much of the

material must be preserved. Difficult as it may be we can speak here of absolute identity.

In what follows, we wish to concentrate on group identity by returning to one of my basic propositions that, identity is selfhood defined in its own terms among other selves in a similar historical context. We wish to affirm that individual and group identity are fundamentally interdependent. Given the relational character of individual identity, two (Xhosa) words may shed some light on the analysis of group identity. They are (mna) and (thina). The former refers to (I), while the latter refers to (we).

Locating these two words within a South African social context, we should argue that there is a dialectic between them. (Mna), is basically selfhood in a given historical context. It denotes a relation with other selves. The (Xhosa) saying is, " a person is a person through other people", (umntu ngumntu ngabantu). In other words, although you are an individual you are basically united with one another in a group. There is a group fellowship which recognizes diversity and individual uniqueness within a group. We should suggest that, (mna), receives its fulness of being through relations with one another. Because, (mna), is less without (thina) who brings about the fulfilment of both, it would seem to me that there is a discernible dialectic between the two which can only be understood by examining that which constitutes a group. The concept of group refers in this argument to a social unit that consists of selves who stand in
status and role relationships to one another that are stabilized in some degree at a given time. Groups are underpinned by values and norms that generate and regulate a sense of belonging together. However a critical issue with groups can be pointed out, it is that they have tendencies to exclude him who does not share the same values and norms.

We may say that values and norms are distinguishable. The former are standards of desirability that are nearly independent of specific situations. The latter are rules for behaving. They say more or less specifically what should not be done by particular types of actors in given circumstances. It is possible that the same value may be a point of reference for a great many specific norms. A particular norm may represent the simultaneous application of several separable values. Furthermore, values as standards for establishing what should be regarded as desirable provide the grounds for accepting or rejecting particular norms.

In fairness it should be observed that (thina) reflects directly values, norms and goals that could express solidarity and identity of any group. The most glaring examples could be found in The Christian Institute of South Africa, Witches and

Sorcerers, the family as a unit, boys in the circumcision lodge, land as a focus of identity, class and race. For us, the most striking features of each group does not only lie on the fact that it was brought into being in time and space, but also that the composition of each group consisted of members whose basic values, goals and norms were the same. The possession of shared values and norms can serve as an interpretative insight of identity. We must isolate the Christian Institute and the character of Witches and Sorcerers as subjects of concentrated investigation in which these issues come to the fore.

The formation of the Christian Institute brought about by those with shared norms and values, was primarily a move inspired by the loneliness of (mna). Basically, it was an initiative taken by individuals who felt a need to enter into a fellowship with those who share the same values and norms in a given historical social context. Historically, after the World Council of Churches Cottesloe Consultation in Johannesburg, 1960, had taken its stand on their theological understanding of race relations, there was a feeling of discontent especially among certain conservative theologians and members of both the Dutch Reformed Church (DRC) and the (Nederduitsch Hervormde Kerk) (NHK). The former through its Orange Free State and Natal branches which

were not even present at the Consultation called on their Cape and Transvaal branches to resign from the world body which they did.21 The latter rejected the Cottesloe theological statement and subsequently withdrew its membership of the World Council of Churches. The consequences of this were a spirit of discontent which led to the reconsideration of Article III of the (Hervormde Kerk), which placed a racial restriction of Church membership. Dominee Albert Geyser and Dr. A. Van Selms who were both Professors of Theology at the University of Pretoria were of the view that Article III must be "tested by the word of God in the scriptures".22 Of course, their motion was defeated. The former was in September, 1961 called to appear before the (Hervormde kerk) Commission which instructed him to resign the Professorship of New Testament Theology which was funded by the Church. Coincidently, three students later brought a charge of heresy and insubordination against him. Although he was acquitted on the charge of insubordination, he was, however, found guilty of heresy and defrocked. The latter resigned from the (Hervormde) Faculty of Theology at the University of Pretoria and was also expelled from the Ministry.23 As we indicated above that Professor Geyser was expelled from the ministry of his

Church, he subsequently appealed to the South African Supreme Court which restored his good standing. From the above exploration, it would seem that there is a sense in which we may speak of an identity crisis when all of a sudden certain people seemed to have changed their theological outlook. That this was the case is discernible in the lives of Albert Geyser and Van Selms who were previously theological conservatives nurtured in families that had been at the centre of the Afrikaner struggle for identity and survival. It might be possible that in the process of socialization they internalised values and norms which were meant not only to preserve White identity but also to exclude the non-white from the Covenant. But the identity crisis which changed their lives also affected that of Dominee Beyers Naude with whom they formed the Christian Institute.

Dr. Beyers Naude is a son of the manse whose father Jozua Francis Naude was a teacher and (predikant) (pastor). He was named after General Christian Beyers who joined the abortive Afrikaner rebellion of 1914 and was drowned while fleeing from the Government troops. He was brought up in a theologically and politically aware home in which politics and religion were not separated. Theology was conceived as an adherence to a Christian

tradition which perceived the doctrine of predestination to mean that the Afrikaner people were in effect the Israel of Africa. Contemporaneously, politics meant the safeguarding of the political interest of the Afrikaner Volk (race). With this background, Naudé entered the Ministry of the Dutch Reformed Church (DRC) in 1939 and like his father joined the League of Brothers, (Broederbond), a secret movement whose basic responsibility has always been to formulate and help enforce a particular social theory of the state. However, as we have indicated above, he experienced an identity crisis which caused him to resign from the (Broederbond). There were two reasons for this change of heart. First, he felt that the (Broederbond's) principle of secrecy was incompatible with the biblical call to openness in one's dealings. Secondly, the Dutch Reformed Church aligned itself with the (Broederbond), therefore the freedom of the Church as an institution had been severely curtailed. With these arguments, he did not see any possibility to work for change within such structures.


When the Christian Institute was formed in August 1963, Beyers Naude became its Director. It was formed by 280 people who shared the same theological values such as justice and peace, love and equality. They were concerned with the betterment of the uprooted and relocated black communities.

The above arguments show that in an identity crisis, I, (mna), may be in need of other selves in similar historical context in order for him to be completed. It is in the unity of (mna) and (thina) that group identity can be fulfilled. In other words people who possess and share the same values tend to be found in the same group. For further evidence and understanding of the significance of values in the community of (mna) and (thina), we may turn to the exploration of the social reality of witches and sorcerers.

According to the Oxford English Dictionary, a sorcerer refers to a wizard or a magician as well. Sorcery may mean the use of magic and a witch could refer to a woman who is supposed to have dealings with the devil and evil spirits and is able, by their co-operation, to perform supernatural acts. In African traditional society there is a marked conception that the possession of familiars is a value around which witches and sorcerers construct their form of identity.

Of the familiars, Pauw has said,

"Familiars are mostly conceived of as having the form of animals which at times
may take the form of human beings. Often
the witch is supposed to have sexual
relations with his or her familiar,
which is sometimes inherited from a parent."28

The notion of familiars involve sexuality which is one of the
factors in identity. Although belief in familiars is empirically
unverifiable, it may be possible that this belief is evidence of
the importance of sexuality as one of the focal points of
identity. However, sexuality does imply love while the concept
of the familiar is related to both the protection of individual
identity and the harming of other selves. However, the argument
is that the possession of the same values and norms are a
unifying factor in group identity.

"Groups are often the defenders of social
values vis-a-vis the individual and the
protectors of individuals against social
alienation."29

Underlying both individual and group identity are values and
norms which reinforce identity in the process of socialization.
We have explored individual and group identity. It is only

232-233.
(Oxford University Press, Cape Town, London.
New York).

logical that we should take the issue of identity further to include the analysis of the social aspect of this term.

This reconsideration of the issue of identity in the South African social context still has a basic flaw in that South Africa is not a single society, but a racial pluralism. Our argument should therefore begin here with the clarification of the concepts of society and community. They are interrelated but they may be distinguished. Society basically indicates a group, within which men can live a total common life, rather than an organization limited to some specific purpose or purposes. In other words, of all groups a society has the highest degree of dependence on other groups."

This indicates that a group of people with a common heritage and culture which they transmit from generation to generation through the process of socialization form a society. It is something that is self-sufficient and united by a submission to a common set of group values. Contrary, a community refers to a locally-centred life based upon the family. It is a situation


where life is unified and cohesive, the community is, "my group", the family is "my family". Associations are essentially face-to-face and personal. There is a web of common experiences and mutuality of interests that are reinforced by kinship and by commonly held community traditions which make a closely knit organization. In the translation of Toennies' (Gemeinschaft-Gesellschaft), Zimmerman recognized that these were, of course, ideal types and that no actual community conformed completely to one or the other of the two poles of localism-cosmopolitanism. Zimmerman argued that a balance of the two factors was necessary for a healthy, viable community.

It is important to note that the traditional African community directly reflects two distinguishable groups of people who share the same values and norms to which we referred several times in the foregoing arguments of this section. There is a distinct contrast between the "Red people" and the "School people." The basic difference is that some school people are Church members and value school education, whereas Red people do not associate with either Christianity or the school. There is a difference


33. Soga, J.H. 1932 The Ama-Xosa (Lovedale Press); and also Mayer, P. 1961 Townsmen and Tribesmen (2nd Edtn) (Cape Town, Oxford Press).
also in the way in which they dress. Red people, particularly women, wear red long skirts and traditional bead decorations. They smear themselves with red ochre (ibomvu). The Red girls often appear in public naked above the waist. They also wear beads. Generally speaking, Red people gather regularly for beer (utywala), drinks and traditional dancing (ukuxhentsa okanye ukugiya). The young boys enjoy stick-fighting. By contrast, school people tend to follow the Western fashions in dress, and some of them attend social gatherings such as weddings, installation of chiefs, circumcision ceremonies where some of them drink beer, (utywala). Traditional African communities are small with regard to the number of people and area. They have a relatively simple technology and economy. However, they have a strong sense of community and identity whose significance lie in the degree to which patrilineal clan identity is emphasised. Attachment to one's clan does not annihilate the identity of the whole community which is maintained irrespective of clan, tribe or religious persuasion. The community with which we are concerned takes kinship and genealogical position as significant in its life. The significance is two-fold.

First, kinship determines the succession of chiefs and headmen and marriages which are generally exogamous. Second, there is a tendency for families to settle in the same neighbourhood in accordance with lineage groups. This indicates that, on the whole, kinship and genealogical positions define a person's general status. In African philosophy a community is a place in which children are not an individual possession: your own children are not yours, but ours, as it were. They belong to the community. With this point in mind, there are some communities where members who have just joined the Church, particularly men, wear the same coat every Sunday alternately. The basic point is that this is our coat. It is as if it belongs to the whole community.

Returning to our argument on group identity, it does seem that identity can be formed by a community process in which a dialectic between a person and community emerges. This is intimately interwoven with the social context within which a person grows and matures. May we say that underlying the difficult problem and question of the social aspect of identity is the process of "becoming", which as we have indicated, takes place at the individual level of identity. Becoming occurs in interaction with the world in which a child is born. Through the process of becoming there is always a search for meaning which takes the form of a communal quest rather than an individual one. Peter Berger has called this "externalization" which refers to
the outpouring of human beings into the World. According to him externalization acquired objectification in the sense of being there over against man and acting upon him. Man acquires a language and the language acquiring an objectivity in turn controls man's thinking and speaking. Before we turn to the role of language in the social aspect of identity, the insights drawn from the above arguments have shown that although the concept of society is distinguishable from that of community, they are closely related. But in this work, they are not used interchangeably. Let us now concentrate on language which plays a crucial role in constructing, as it were, the "world" which is given to us in perception and made available for reflection.

Language functions as a powerful institution in shaping structured identities. Our argument is that identity structured in terms of race, clan, gender and ethnicity can be communicated by language. We suggest that the Afrikaans language in South Africa could illustrate my claims. The Afrikaans language was in the early years of the history of South Africa


preferred to Dutch even though the latter was richer than the former in content. It might have been felt that Afrikaaners were culturally different from the Dutch although most of the early Europeans settlers in South Africa were direct descendants of Dutch people from the Netherlands. Therefore, Afrikaans was introduced to communicate race-consciousness and Afrikaaner ethnic identity. Given the nature of South African culture, it was possible for Afrikaners to prohibit their children from studying English before Afrikaans. If they had not done so this would have blurred racial differences and conflict of identity between the Afrikaans and English speaking South Africans. The same argument might be applicable to other racial groups such as the English who could insist that English should be given priority to any European language such as French or German as it gives structure to their identity. The basic argument is that my language signifies my own identity. Of course there is an underlying danger in that this might create a cultural chasm between me and those who speak a different language from mine. Returning to my argument at the beginning of our consideration of the social aspect of identity in which I said that there was a "flaw" in South Africa. We wish to dispute the thesis that South

Africa is a "plural society". It is basically a contradiction of the term society. The idea of a society implies a unit, as indicated in the foregoing pages of this section, which is an antithesis of plurality. Societies cannot both be plural and societies. They refer to groups within which people can live a common life in community with one another. The groups which form a society are underscored by values and norms which become significant in the process of socialization. The traditional values into which one is brought up are owned by him through the process of internalization. In Hegelian terminology a person experiences true moments of externalization, objectification and internalization which should be understood as a cyclical movement. For us, language plays a major role in the social aspect of identity. The social aspect of identity in a given social context depends on a complementarity of an inner synthesis in the individual and of role integration in his group. The children tell, hear stories, and are told to share in external symbols. In our view this legitimates the social aspect of


identity in that it places it within the context of a symbolic universe. Yet, symbols represent and typify other things such as action or sound. When human beings use symbols they operate with articles, acts, sounds and colour in a given social context which are meant to be associated with that which typifies thereby becoming meaningful to those who feel, see, hear, or act in the ritual containing the symbol. Finally, language should be regarded as important in identity formation in that it gives structure and meaning to the social and individual aspect of identity.

In any case, if our objective at this level of analysis is to subject to exploratory investigation of the notion of symbols, it is obviously necessary to examine the colour of the skin with which, however implicitly, they work. In a more specific way into an understanding of the dynamics of colour, Bob Marley has said:

"Until the colour of a man's skin is of no more significance than the colour of his eyes everywhere is War ...." 43

42. Berglund, Axel-Ivar, 1976 Zulu-Thought-Patterns and Symbolism, p. 28.
The contextualization of the arguments on colour requires an examination of Black and White encounter in South African society. From a historical perspective it can be argued that the transmission of the Western culture with its concomitant symbol of "White" reinforced white supremacy in South Africa. Some years after Jan Van Riebeeck had arrived at the Cape in 1652 there emerged tendencies that sought to classify "Blacks" as Blacks and "White" as Whites. This tendency was more pronounced among the Dutch and English colonialists as they tended to exclude persons of mixed ancestry from their fellowship whom the Hispanics accepted.\(^{44}\) The consolidation of small African chiefdoms into powerful Kingdoms and the consequent wars that were fought between Black and White were basically propelled by the feeling that White as a symbol of power had to conquer and rule. Even the Great Trek in 1836 was basically motivated by the grant of limited freedom to the non-Whites which, implied that the Whites and Non-Whites were to be on equal footing in spite of their colour.\(^{45}\) In 1838 at the Battle of Blood River the Zulus were defeated by the Afrikaners.\(^{46}\) Consequently an annual commemoration of that Battle is held in which the Afrikaners


renew their covenant with God. This is rooted in the belief that white as a symbol of peace has to rule. The white God chose them to be the "Israel" of Africa. Given the history to which we have referred and the circumstances under which the Afrikaners lived under the British imperial rule in South Africa, it should be argued that the sense of "who I am" is strong among people who consider themselves as deprived. They always require a categorization that would situate them in society. The definition of their identity in terms of "white" as a symbol might be considered a dynamic response which is aroused by political stimulation. But if identity means selfhood, as we have argued in this section, it should be selfhood defined in its own terms among other selves in a similar historical context. However, to define other selves as "Bantu", "Non-White", "Koolie" and "Kaffir", is tantamount to racial arrogance which evolved with the consolidation of segregation in nineteenth century South Africa.

The above terminology cannot be accepted on the following grounds. First, because identity is a selfhood which defines itself in its own terms. Therefore an imposed definition will


always be rejected by Blacks as it has been rendered by an ideology of exploitation based on racial logic. Second, an imposed identity cannot be a source of pride, but a stigma. These arguments show that the imposition of identity on subordinates by superordinate groups inevitably leads to rejection even if human rights are guaranteed. In the above exploration, we did emphasise the significance of values and norms in identity formation, we therefore do not see how an identity that has not been self-defined and chosen can be internalised. Rejecting imposed identities, the Non-Whites in South Africa have defined their identity in their own terms in relation to the other selves in the same social context. The self-chosen term is "Black". Black connotes all those who are oppressed and discriminated against by the white forces. It is an expression of identity which asserts personhood and dignity. It is a dignity bestowed on human beings through their creation in God's image and their redemption in Jesus Christ. To argue that you should be called Black is to imply that blackness has a liberating force. Although a symbol of oppression it can be used creatively to proclaim a new understanding of identity. Colour does raise the question of religious symbolism which plays an important function within societal existence insofar as it formulates a response to the very ambiguity of human existence. 49

It has been our concern in the foregoing arguments to show how identity is constructed and given meaning in society. In recapitulation we may say that identity means selfhood, (ubumna), defined in my own terms among other selves and can be known by investigating other selves in relation to myself in a similar historical context. Basically, it means the state of being with its values and norms located in a social context symbolised in myth and ritual. However, the arguments have reflected two complementary, but distinguishable and equally fundamental issues in the theories of identity. One involves the dimensions of identity, the other concerns the process through which identity operates. First, the dimensions of identity: we may indicate three levels of analysis: (1) Individual; (2) Group; and (3) social. These three dimensions are interdependent in operation. We may observe that scholars in the sociology of religion have a tendency which is concerned with the social dimension of identity. However, Durkheim underlined the harmony that exists between individual and social identity. 50 Radcliffe-Brown and Malinowsky gave primacy to social identity with concomitant emphasis on the harmony that exists with the group and

individual. In contrasting terms, the psychoanalytic school of thought maintained the significance of individual identity. The integration thesis of the individual is placed at the centre of their analyses. Second, with regard to process, we may say that identity first and foremost begins from the individual in his social context and immediately assumes the form of identification which leads through groups to society. Fundamental to the process is socialization which takes place through the externalization, objectification and internalization of values and norms. Dimension and process is underscored by language and symbols which serve to structure identity.

Under a close examination, there is a difference among these theories, but it can only be readily perceived as existent at the individual level of analysis. It is highly probable that Luckmann and Berger attached a significant point to individual identity when they posited the notions that the structure of

See also Radcliffe-Brown, A.R. 1939 TABOO (Cambridge University Press, p. 29-35).

society penetrates to the level of individual consciousness. According to them this resulted in what they call the privatization of traditional religion. However, there has been a persistent extension of Christian values throughout the South African social formation. In our view, this represents a further extension of the spirit of Protestantism with its endorsement of secular life with a new order of religious legitimation as a field of "Christian opportunity". In specific terms, it is "the dynamic exploitation of opportunity to change social life in the direction of conformity with religiously grounded ideals." 53

2.2 Methodology and the Interpretative Hypothesis

Despite the good efforts of the missionary movement in the areas of health and African education, the traditional methods employed in the interpretation of Christianity and in the doing of theology entangled the mission of the Church with the policy of Apartheid and thus with one of the most horrendous social policies the world has ever known. 54 There is, of course, a high degree of continuity between the earlier policy of segregation and the apartheid social policy inaugurated in 1948. However


54. See Chapter Three.
difficult it is to accept the traditional methods of doing theology, one is impelled to write affectionately about the missionary endeavours, for the missionaries brought the Church, School and University to the tribal settings of South Africa. To be able to teach a person how to read and write is one of the greatest achievements for which, whoever has benefitted from such lessons, is always grateful as he has seen the world being opened in front of him. Some of the best Black schools in South Africa were established by missionary agencies. The first Black University College at Alice, Fort Hare, was founded by the Churches in 1916. It has been until recently the pride of Africa because most of its alumni occupy influential positions in Government, the Church and Industry. The history of the African National Congress (ANC) itself indicates that it is composed of comrades who went through the hands of Missionary education.


This was an effort to liberate the human potential in the indigenous tribes of South Africa. Consideration of the missionary movement has raised critical issues in a forceful and rigorous way and demands the critical attention of anyone who is serious about theology and its pastoral implications in the modern World. To argue against the missionary methodology of doing theology would be to argue that it failed in South Africa to emancipate the whole man, by which we here refer to the spiritual, socio-economic and political aspects of the human condition. Here the difficulty is not so much that the traditional methods were only concerned with the "hereafter", though in some instances that is true, but that very little attention at all was given to the analysis of class and race with the intention of proclaiming the whole gospel for the whole man.

It is our submission that there is a different method of doing theology which is more appropriate and less abstract than the traditional one, which if it had been employed in the era of segregation and Apartheid in South Africa could have resisted the entanglement of Christianity with capitalist and racist social policies. The traditional method employed was self-defeating because, on the one hand, it denied the theologian a conceptual framework adequate for the descriptive and prescriptive tasks which give meaning to the historical liberating praxis, and on the other hand, it denied the possibility of a Christian point of insertion into historical praxis. Both the causal factors involved in the rise of the Black Independent Church Movements in
Africa south of the Sahara and the historical, social critique of English and Dutch Christian Missions in South Africa call the traditional methods of doing theology into question. The unsuitability of the traditional methodology is reflected in the works of Sundkler, Bishop Sundkler constructed a theory which indicates that the rise of the Independent Church Movement in South Africa was due to the socio-political situation which denied freedom to the Black people. Consequently colour bar was maintained even in the Church of Christ. The desire of the "disinherited" to own land gives rise to a particular type of leadership, namely, a Moses figure who will lead his followers to the "promised land" where a Church colony will then be established. Scholars such as Barrett describes the fundamental cause of the Independent Church movement as a failure in sensitivity. The Christian Missions at


one small point failed to demonstrate consistently the fullness of the biblical concept of love and sensitive understanding towards others as equals. 62 The failure to understand African society, religion and psychology, was due to a less than appropriate methodology. Hastings in a concise essay in Mission and Ministry (1971) 63 suggested ten main causes for the rise of these movements, the most prominent of which was colour bar in the community reflected in the Church. The relationship between Black and White is undoubtedly a factor in the rise of the Independent Churches. This cause has been mentioned several times by Missiologists. The thesis, however, that this factor was operative only in South Africa is unsustainable on the grounds that throughout the Continent of Africa colonialism was an essential factor in this process and wherever there was colonialism there was, by definition, a difference in status between Black and White. For instance residential segregation was a fact in all the cities and large towns of Africa before Independence. To a greater or lesser extent the whole spectrum of Black vis-a-vis White relations played a major part in the formation of Independent movements. South Africa occupies a special position in that, comparatively speaking, there were more

Whites in South Africa than anywhere in Africa. The bulk of the country's area of occupation, that is, 87% of land came into the White hands and the Blacks were regarded as aliens and sojourners in "White" South Africa. Factors such as job reservation and the scant opportunity for advancement were more critical than anywhere on the Continent.

We are also arguing that the unsuitability of the traditional Methodology is reflected as well in the social theories of both Dutch and English Missionary Movement. Both of these theories imply that priority must be given to Methodology as one of the important points of departure. The stress on Methodology may be surprising, yet it is nonetheless necessary for our thought and action as Christians. The acquiescence of the Missionary Movement in the status quo in South Africa is attributable to a rigid and even dogmatic methodology which imposed past solutions onto new problems and in our view, ignored God's new Word to His people. Furthermore, we believe that God has a new word always for His people. Basically it is a call of man by God to have fellowship with one another and with Him in Jesus Christ. If Christianity functioned ideologically, as we show in chapter four, the proclamation of the Christian message becomes attenuated. It is indeed impossible for the Church to hear God's word and to maintain her true identity as she aligned herself with distorting structures in society.
There is a conception of sin which is properly understood as social, not only individualistic and abstract.\(^6\) This does mean that structures in society can be the embodiment of sin. They regulate the lives of people and make it virtually impossible for one to enjoy his full human identity. The South African social structures are illustrative of this in many ways, one of which is that the Government in pursuit of its racist ideology and even at the expense of economic rationality, introduced a series of racist measures which extended racist discrimination to its limits.\(^5\) The effect of this was to produce widespread opposition which the government met, acting in pursuit of a totalitarian ideology by a drastic curtailment of political rights and an elaborate system of security.\(^6\) This, as Harold Wolpe argues, set in train a vicious cycle of resistance and repression which led in due course, also to international condemnation of, and pressure on, South Africa.\(^7\) The alignment of Christianity with these structures has made the mission of the

---

64. Hunter, M. 1961 Reaction to Conquest. Effects of Contact with Europeans on the Pondo of South Africa, pp. 15-51; 227-266.


Church to become blurred and pale in the course of her entanglement with the apartheid structures of which it too has become a reflection.

Heuristically speaking, in the interpretation of Christianity in South Africa we propose to employ the Segundian methodology. Our proposal does not imply that the methodology proposed is totally free from any weaknesses. It has its own weaknesses and strengths just like the traditional approach to theology which starts with what we believe about God from the Word and then offers an interpretation of the world view which is followed by application praxis. The above arguments against the traditional methodology as reflected in both the African Independent Movement and the Missionary Movement in South Africa have indicated clearly that theology can be found guilty, to use the expression of Neuhaus, of "an attempt to take Christ Captive" and to use him wrongfully to support specific ideological schemes of racial domination intertwined with colonialism and imperialism. Frankly speaking, there is no perfect methodology, nevertheless we prepare to apply a particular form of social analysis to the South African situation, possibly for the first time.

In *The Liberation of Theology* (1976), Professor Segundo examines the methodology of theology and suggests that it "must keep going back to its book and reinterpreting it." 68 For the process of

---

coming from the Bible and going back to society, Segundo employs the expression, "hermeneutic circle". With a line of argument that reflects the dialectical cast of his mind, Segundo insists that the hermeneutic circle is, "the continuing change in our interpretation of the Bible which is dictated by the continuing changes in our present day reality, both individual and societal." 69 However, present scholarship shows that the word hermeneutics, derived from the Greek verb, (hermenēuein), which means, "to interpret" and refers to a reflective not necessarily intellectual discipline concerned with the nature and presuppositions of the interpretation of human expression. 70 The issue of hermeneutics is also raised by Martin Heidegger in Being and Time 1962. In his analysis Heidegger says that human beings already find themselves in a world made intelligible to them by virtue of what he called, "the forestructure" of understanding, that is, the assumptions, expectations, and categories that we pre-reflectively project on experience and that constitutes the "horizon" of any particular act of understanding.

An analysis of our "everydayness", reveals that what we regard as problematic, or even as intelligible, becomes so only against the

backdrop of the tacit, pre-reflective understanding we already possess. In all explanations one discovers, as it were, an understanding that one cannot understand, which is to say, every interpretation is already shaped by a set of assumptions and presuppositions about the whole experience. Heidegger calls this the hermeneutical situation. He means that human existence itself has a hermeneutical structure that underlies all our regional interpretations. Heidegger's thought has been influential in several directions, two of which in my view, are important for the study of Systematic Theology.

First, Rudolf Bultmann's (1884-1976) New Testament studies are heavily influenced by Heidegger. Bultmann saw in Heidegger's analysis of human existence the conceptual basis for an exegesis of the New Testament whereby its basic religious insights could be extracted from the mythical thought-forms of the first century in which it was originally expressed. To the complaint that this exegesis employed modern presuppositions, Bultmann replied that all exegesis is determined by certain philosophical presuppositions. Heidegger had shown that genuine historical understanding requires the encounter with past expressions of

---

human self-understanding that can modify our own. Second, Hans-Georg Gadamer in *Truth and Method*, (1975) has assumed a context of intelligibility and that the presuppositions and assumptions are beliefs and not necessarily barriers to understanding but preconditions to it. The quest for a presuppositionless understanding is futile. Every object is interpreted from some standpoint in a tradition that constitutes the horizon within which anything becomes intelligible. So, in my view, Segundo seems to have been influenced by the three above-mentioned scholars but not determined by them. He has begun his analysis of the hermeneutic circle by setting forth two interrelated prerequisites. Firstly, fundamental, enriching and disturbing questions must be raised about the concrete situation in which we live. Secondly, the scriptures must be approached in a spirit of expectancy with the hope that these texts, even though they belong to the ancient World, can speak afresh to man in contemporary society. Given these two questions a vital link between the present social context and the biblical texts should be established. They can both create a dynamic process of relationship in which each continually feeds off the other. From his point of view four stages in "the hermeneutic circle" are necessary.

---

(1) We must begin with sufficient prior understanding which may lie in certain existential experience. It may be a knowledge of a particular history or particular cultural and literary tradition. The epistemology in terms of the Christian faith starts with social reality, that is, with things as we see them. Because things are what they are we become suspicious. This is what is called "an ideological suspicion" which according to Segundo calls for an adoption of a critical stance by the theologian. With this argument there has to be a clear socio-economic, political and theological critique of society that has "a partiality which is consciously accepted." The fundamental commitment to a particular stance about which he argues is what provides the premise for a critical theological examination of the present socio-political order.

(2) The second stage is that of critical reflection from the perspective of commitment to human liberation. This stage calls for a sociological and structural reading of reality. It is here where Marxist concepts of analysis become a useful tool as the theologian reflects upon the reality.

(3) Application of the critical stance to the word of God. This is a theological interpretation that leads us to the suspicion that "the prevailing interpretation of the Bible has not taken important pieces of data into account." 73

Finally, Segundo argues that we should create a new hermeneutic. This is a new and relevant way of theological interpretation that springs from the perspective of a commitment to the liberation of the poor. The key word at this stage is praxeology. By commitment to action we know the truth.

This exploration of the hermeneutic circle is indicative of the significance of two primary words, namely, context and commitment. The former in this thesis refers to the South African social formation which in turn is used to refer to both urban and rural South Africa which includes Black and White residents in the urban areas and the African homelands. In this way, we should be seen to be treating South Africa as a whole. Because we do not do theology in a vacuum, we should define the problem with its complexity and uniqueness in relation to a particular social context. In order to do this well, we should break down the social formation into categories. The Black oral tradition and literature written by Blacks themselves as well as anthropological and sociological literature would be used to illuminate our analysis of identity and culture.74 The latter refers to a commitment to the freedom of the whole man, that is, the spiritual, physical and political conditions of man. Since Black people are denied freedom in South Africa, commitment is

74. See The Primary and Secondary Sources.
specifically to the fulfilment of their identity. On a note of clarification, the term "Black" is not used here merely to refer to the colour of the skin but also to all those who live under the suffocating burdens of oppression, exploitation and racial discrimination in South Africa. This is a commitment to a holistic vision of the liberation of black people which implies two things. First, a tacit acceptance of the inevitability of majority rule. This is the positive attitude which should be adopted. The second implication of this is that South African Whites need to be helped to be free and enjoy their full freedom. Granting freedom to Blacks completes the freedom of both Blacks and Whites. But as things stand now, the White population is divided. On the one hand, there are those who could be described as suffering from a form of extreme social psychosis. They are concerned about the freedom of both Black and White but are paralysed by fear. Afraid that should Blacks gain their freedom then there might be retaliation which would lead to some of them being incarcerated. Contrary to that group are those Whites who suffer from a Laager mentality.75 Our argument here should be seen as stressing both the social context and commitment to the freedom of the whole of man. However, the context should not be allowed to determine the gospel. There has to be a

contextualisation of the Word of God in such a way that it is realistically appropriated in a given context. On the contrary, it may be argued that it is not necessary to take such a risk. But I maintain the view that, because the social contexts are different, in a situation of conflict and political domination, the Church in her mission involves taking risks. In the words of Karl Rahner, it is,

"A risk that must be taken if the Church is not to be seen to be pedantic, to be living in a world of pure theory, remote from life, making pronouncements that do not touch the stubborn concreteness of real life".76

This is a commitment which allows a sociological use of some of the analytical concepts derived from the social sciences as tools for the reading of society. As we have indicated there has to be a dialectic between Christianity and Marxism in view of the nature of class-conflicts in society. Given this view such acceptance can go with a rejection of Marxism's atheism and materialism. Of course, there has to be a theological reflection which leads to the formation of a new relevant hermeneutic for the situation. This implies a social location of the theologian.

76. See Karl Rahner 1974 The Shape of the Church to Come, p. 79. (Oates & Barnes).
The above methodology is compelling. However, we need a hypothesis with which to test the identity of the Church and its social and political mission in South African society.

This hypothesis is conceived in the following terms. Since the social aspect of the doctrine of the Trinity reflects God as a relational identity in which the Father, Son and Holy Spirit completes and fulfils the supremacy of the Father in love and fellowship, the Church in mission, like her founder must identify with God and with the oppressed and discriminated against in society. She must struggle against oppression, injustices and alienation. In this way, we argue, she would be seeking to embody the signs of the Kingdom of God in the here and now. She will only discover her true identity in the service of the Kingdom of God which has come in Jesus Christ. It is a given reality and yet it is still to come in the fulfilment of all things in Christ. It seems to me that she exists in the present history to bear witness to that which has been given and to that which is coming. The Church is an anticipatory sign of the Kingdom. Goba\textsuperscript{77} and Boesak\textsuperscript{78} for example, argue that the


\textsuperscript{78} Boesak, A.A. 1977 Farewell to Innocence. A Social-ethical Study of Black Theology and Black Power, p. 68. (Johannesburg : Raven Press).
mission of the Church is to preach the gospel as it relates to the total meaning of history revealed in Christ. The recovery of the mission of the Church requires a concern for identification with the peoples who are involved in the revolutionary struggle to change existing power structures. This presupposes that the work of Christ and his Kingdom is discernible in the social, and political revolutions of our time and that the Church's function is to discern it and to witness to it and to participate in God's work in changing the world. To argue in this way implies that religious commitment entails superordinated values and loyalties by which the individual can criticise and judge the values and loyalties operative in other segments of modern society.

Others reach similar conclusions from somewhat different theoretical bases. Numerous students of systematic theology, ethics and missiology maintain that the need for love and equality, justice with peace on a larger scale in modern societies requires a reappraisal of our methodologies for doing theology. Old and enslaving traditional ways must be put aside in order to give way to contextual methodologies of involvement and engagement with society. It is most probable that the two

above mentioned South African black theologians and Bishop Tutu in particular would welcome these views warmly. 80

By contrast, E.R. Norman in his 1978 Reith Lectures reasons somewhat differently. He argues that in the history of Europe from the conversion of Constantine there was no separation initially of the religious from the secular. Faith and ideologies intermingled. Consequently, the ministers of the gospel were not as critical of society as those of today simply because the former operated within the political structure while the latter critiques the structure from without. 81 He is of the view, however, that Christianity stresses the vertical personal identity of man to God for as he puts it,

"at his baptism in the River Jordan, Jesus initiated a ministry that was characterised by a call to personal redemption, to the renunciation of sin, and a departure from the world's values." 82

We may agree with Norman in saying that there is a personal dimension of redemption in the ministry of Jesus Christ. But we should register the view that there is also a social dimension


82. Norman, E. 1979 Christianity and the World Order, pp. 77-78.
which should be seen as something that is concerned with restoring the wholeness of the identity of man. Wholeness could be seen from the life-praxis of Jesus Christ in which he identified with the Father and other selves in a social context such as the outcast and downtrodden in society. The understanding of redemption in the life of Jesus Christ requires a re-examination of praxis which is a term that is intended to convey more than just practice, but in fact a mode of practice. It is practice that transforms history. It is the point where people recreate their world and come to know reality and discover their own selves.

Finally, based on the foregoing arguments, my working hypothesis is stated as follows:

The mission of the Church in relation to the South African Society will be better interpreted with the methodology of engagement which conceives of Mission as the realization of the Kingdom of God in the here and now. The implication of which is the putting up of the signs of the Kingdom that are justice, love and brotherhood among men, thereby bringing about the transformation of Society.

On the basis of this theological hypothesis our study of the mission of the Church begins from an analysis of the social reality of South Africa and then returns to the theological and sociological in terms of the methodology implicit in the hermeneutical circle. In the light of this method we now proceed to the cultural analysis of identity in traditional African society.
PART II
An Analysis of Culture, Land and Social Control in South Africa

CHAPTER THREE
IDENTITY AND CULTURE IN AFRICAN SOCIETY

This chapter is developed in two sections. The first section examines identity formations within the context of the rites of passage in traditional African society. We concentrate on the three rites of passage, namely, child birth, initiation and marriage in which, in our attempt to contextualize the term 'identity, particular Xhosa words will be used to clarify each concept. These words are listed in the Glossary included at the end of this thesis. The second section contains an analysis of the family and in particular the role of women in South African society.

3.1 The Rites of Passage

In Black African thought self-understanding is inextricably bound up with the very fabric of individual and social existence.¹ To

be black presupposes the fundamental question, "Who am I". Until I have understood who I am, I can not in any way be certain of what I am becoming. Given the search for identity, the periodization of individual biography is significant in that it is the way in which identity is anchored and given meaning.² The rites of passage must be understood within the context of the periodization of biography and are thus significant in identity formation.³ A rite refers to a formal act that constitutes a religious observance.⁴ It should be understood as usually involving characteristics amongst which sacrifice is often dominant. Rites are divided into categories, the most significant of which are those of separation, transition and incorporation. These three usually designated as rites of passage and are highly significant for our thesis. As we have indicated a rite may be in a form of sacrifice in the course of which something is forfeited. Tylor, in Primitive Culture (1913), asserts that sacrifice is a gift offered to supernatural beings to secure their favour and minimize their hostility.⁵

---

Africa south of the Sahara the conception of sacrifice as a gift to the deity is generally known and accepted. It is based on the custom of leaving food and drink at the graves of the dead. First, it was believed that when the Ancestors rose to divine rank the food put there would develop into sacrifices. The whole burnt-offering that plays a significant part in the sacrificial system of the Priestly narrative in the Old Testament may be regarded as an offering of the gift of food to the deity. Second, this type of sacrifice evolved from the original sacramental meal by the discontinuance of totemic conceptions and the recourse to human victims to renew the bond between the Worshippers and the Worshipped. Finally, the fundamental objective of sacrifice should be perceived as that which establishes a bond between the sacred and the human being. The relationship may be one of communion by which strength is conceived to be imparted to man. To understand why the rites of passage could be such an important factor in the development of identity it is necessary to distinguish periods through which every person has to go in life. We now examine each rite of passage in detail.

8. RSV Genesis 4:3; Leviticus Chapter 2.
(i) Childbirth

To argue that the Rites of Passage should be understood within the context of the periodization of one's life is at least to imply that there are things which happen to any human being as he grows up in Society. Growing up in a traditional society recalls to memory two things that happen to an expectant mother. First, she has to observe the taboos and wear special amulets. The taboos involve the prohibition of sexual intercourse for two years before the child is weaned while the amulets are worn to protect the mother and the unborn baby from illnesses caused by witchcraft. Second, if the mother-to-be is carrying her first child then she has to return to her parental home in order to give birth there.

In traditional African society the midwifery of younger women is in most cases entrusted to elderly mothers. Elderly in the sense of having gone passed the menstruation age. It is an age


during which they are regarded as "pure" in the sense of being free from impurity (Umlaza). However, it does not mean that they could handle any delivery difficulties that might arise but what it does indicate is that they are mature and seasoned enough to have a good assessment of the situation and therefore would be in a better position to know which herbalist should be called in if delivery complications arise. During the ten days of the rite of separation before the cord drops off the infant, the husband would not be allowed to visit his wife. But the elderly women to whom we referred earlier were allowed to visit the mother and the infant simply because they were ritually "pure". Of particular interest is the way in which the mother and infant were later incorporated into the group and community.

The ritual of reincorporation of the mother and the infant into the kinship group and community symbolises the nature of passage and the continuity of personal identity. The (Amaxhosa) ethnic group, in particular the (Amampondo) tribal group, usually arrange a reincorporation ritual called the (Imbeleko) in which a goat is slaughtered. Etymologically, the term (Imbeleko) is derived from the verb, (Ukubeleka) which means to carry a child on the back. This ritual safeguards identity by controlling and


guiding necessary changes from one phase of identity to another. We said earlier that a goat is slaughtered for this ritual, it is usually provided by the Father of the child and the hide of which is used as a blanket for carrying the baby. The African conception of the reincorporation of the mother and the baby into their group by the (Imbeleko) ritual directly reflects the African religious philosophy in several ways. Firstly, as the child is primarily and formally introduced to the kinship group through which he is received into the community and presented to the divinity, the ritual signifies that he is accountable to his Ancestors. Secondly, the eating together of the (Imbeleko) meal is a reinforcement of solidarity and identity. Furthermore, it is a form of fellowship, (koinonia), which defines the existing status of the child. Finally, as the child is received into the fellowship of the community, "baptism" here assumes as it were, a social dimension.

In the next subsection we will examine initiation as one of the stages of transition. Here it suffices to note that the (Imbeleko) ritual moves a person from one way of being to another through a culturally recognized ritual which indicates and redraws boundaries in life.

(ii) Initiation

In chapter two of this thesis we argued that identity is transitive in that the individual passes from one stage of life into another. In African society it is the passage from boyhood, (ubukhwenkwe), to manhood, (ubudoda), that characterises one's identity. There are two interrelated but distinguishable elements with which this rite of passage is associated. They are circumcision and the tribal initiation school. Both circumcision and the tribal schools of initiation have been in the past a target of severe criticism by governments and missionaries as both heathen and unhealthy. Given the situation of initiation which takes place away from home in the bush at a lodge in the open Veld, the initiates might be eaten by wild cats, (Impaka). They might also violate the taboos such as the prohibition of physical contact with women during the initiation period. Given a situation of war, as the initiates would be away from the strong and healthy group environment at home they could become easy targets for hostile warriors. Critics, some of whom were African chiefs, underlined the view that deformity and illhealth also constituted an impediment to initiation and its physical rigours.

On the basis of these introductory comments we shall now analyze the rite of circumcision, (ukwaluka),\(^{19}\) by which is meant the removal of the foreskin of the penis of the male. With a looser connotation it also refers to the operation performed on the genitals of the female which is technically called clitoridectomy. The latter is not common among the Xhosa of the Eastern Cape in South Africa while the former is still practised generally with minor exceptions here and there. In order to understand circumcision per se requires of us that we get deep into its underpinnings and to explore those terms which construct and give meaning to the rite.

In Xhosa society the request to circumcise comes from either the boy or his father who suggests that the time for the boy to be circumcised has come.\(^{20}\) Many participants in circumcision are involved but they should be distinguished: first, the surgeon, (ingcibi) who is usually the member of the kinship group.\(^{21}\) Here

---


kinship refers to recognized ritual ties of relationships that form the basis of social and cultural organization. The second character is the male nurse, (ikhankatha). The former performs the operation. The latter bandages the circumcised boys with the healing leaves with which each boy had provided himself. Before these two are met by those to be circumcised, a preparatory procedure has to be followed which involves the boys in the fetching of white clay, (ifutha), and the bandages of leaves, (izichwe). Because the sorcerers and the witches are able to cause illness to the boys they must hide these essentials themselves. There must also be two strips of sheep skin, (amaggesha). One of these is used as a girdle to be tied around the waist and its end is used for holding the penis in a horizontal position. The other strip, called (ityeba), is used for binding the leaf bandages around the circumcised wound.

The available unpublished evidence indicates that in the (Emazizini) areas of the Peddie district in the eastern Cape of

---


South Africa, there could be a festive ceremony, (umguyo), on the evening before the boys were initiated.\textsuperscript{26} This ritual ceremony would involve the shaving of the heads and the pubes of the boys to be initiated. There would be dancing and drinking beer, (utywala). During the same evening there should be the killing of the goat for the boys. Of the goat's meat the boys would only eat the half roasted foreleg. In this way a ritual called (ukushwama) is performed.\textsuperscript{27} In the above discussion, we referred to two participants, namely, the surgeon and the male nurse. It is important to note that the surgeon could not begin the operation without the boys having undergone a ritual purification bath.\textsuperscript{28} They must be properly handed over to him by men who should have frightened them previously in order to see if they were courageous enough to withstand the pains of the operation. During the circumcision process, the surgeon, (ingcibi) would want the boy to say, "I am a man", (Ndiyindoda).\textsuperscript{29} The initiate being circumcised must show manliness by not crying while the operation is done. As we have said earlier that the boys provide the male nurse with the healing leaves the evening before

\textsuperscript{26} Cassette No. 1007, "Initiation in the Peddie District of the Ciskei", (Emazizini Areas) South Africa (1987).

\textsuperscript{27} Ibid, Cassette No. 1007 (1987).

\textsuperscript{28} Hunter, M. 1961 Reaction to Conquest, p. 528.

\textsuperscript{29} Cassette No. 1008 "Initiation in the Peddie district of the Ciskei", (Emazizini Areas) South Africa (1987).
circumcision. Each would then be given a piece of antheap, (Isiduli), to suck and swallow. The objective of the antheap is two-fold. First, swallowing it prevents the initiate from collapsing and fainting. Second, the piece of which has been made into a mud paste should be used to smear the face and the body of the initiate. Furthermore, it is in the antheap where the foreskin given to the owner after the circumcision operation was performed is secretly buried. The initiate takes the foreskin out of the corner of his blanket to which it was tied and puts it into the antheap so that it can be devoured by the ants. May we stress that the antheap and the bandages of leaves are applied as healing and protective medicines.

There are, however, serious deficiencies in this practice arising mainly from the way in which the operation is carried out. First, the utensils used for the operation are usually not sterilized, the consequence of which are that the circumcised wound becomes septic. Some of the initiates have had to be referred to hospitals in order to be attended to by medical men. Second, because the location of the place in which the operation takes place is outside in the bush and not entirely sanitary and

32. Cassette No. 1009 "Initiation in the Peddie district of the Ciskei" (Emazizini areas), South Africa (1987).
therapeutic in purpose, this practice is bound to have deleterious effects on health. Contrary to the above critical arguments, circumcision must be performed because it is a symbolic act which gives one a sense of identity. When an individual looks back at his past it must make sense and link in well with the present. Theologically, we note that though St. Paul himself had been circumcised and had under Jewish pressure performed the rite on Timothy, and although he was far from deprecating it, he decided that it was unnecessary in the case of Gentile converts. Indeed he ultimately regarded the practice of circumcision as of lesser importance since the only true circumcision was spiritual. However, non-theological considerations affirm that circumcision is necessary because it prevents masturbation. Furthermore, it helps to keep neat and clean especially in desert and dusty climates where the foreskin could store dust and sand which might cause the penile cancer. Implicit in the circumcision rite is a religious dimension. The blood that flows from the initiate into the ground is as it were

33. R & V Ph. 3:5; Acts 16:3.
34. Romans 3:1.
36. Romans 3:30; 4:9; Icor 7:18; Gal, 5:6, 6:12; Col 3:11
Romans 2:25; Ph. 3:3; Col, 2:11.
a covenant blood which links the initiates both with one another and the Ancestors and with the ground.\textsuperscript{38} The youth who is being circumcised must allow his blood to drop to the ground. In this way he restores part of his life to the source from which it came. Furthermore, the period of seclusion from the community in the Lodge, (ibhoma), symbolises a dying to the old ways of youth and a new birth as a new member of the tribe given a new name.\textsuperscript{39}

So far in this section, we have been examining critically the circumcision rite. Underlying it is the significance of ritual which reinforces identity. However, we should look at the tribal initiation school which as we said earlier enjoys a mutual function with circumcision.

After the initiates have been circumcised they would then be led to the Lodge, (ibhoma). It is in the Lodge, where initiates smear themselves daily with white clay, (ifutha). This has to be done in such a way that the skin should not show through the white clay. If it does, then it is explained as, ("ukuxhosa").\textsuperscript{40}

\begin{flushleft}


\textsuperscript{40} Part two of Cassette No. 1009, "Initiation in the Peddie district of the Ciskei" (Emazizini Areas), South Africa (1987).
\end{flushleft}
In this argument we have maintained the view that initiation as a ritual of passage is an explanation of the transitive character of identity. The initiate dies from childhood to be transformed into a recognized politico-socio adulthood. May we say the rituals of separation and incorporation should be perceived as something that point to the past, present and future. The notion of separation is one of the characteristic features of initiation.

"The boys should be physically separated from the rest of the community for at least some part of the duration of the school".  

As the citation indicates in order to make a mark in one's identity, the environment composed of friends and relatives has to be left behind. To mark this separation, a ceremony in which beer, (utywala), is brewed and drunk is held. There are two things to be said with regard to the beer and ceremony. First, the drinking of beer in African society is basically associated with ancestor veneration. For example, if a woman repeatedly miscarries or is unable to conceive, one of the first instincts


42. Cassette No. 10010, "Initiation in the Peddie district of the Ciskei" (Emazizini Areas), South Africa (1987).
of the African Kinship is to brew beer and have a sacrifice to
the ancestor. Secondly, the boys have to be weaned from their
social infancy to social maturity. Because women mother the boys
they have to assist in the separating process by brewing beer,
(utywala), in order to surrender their sons into the masculine
world. Thirdly, the bloodied leaves with which the initiated is
tied, represent, "killing" and "death" and "blood" and confer on
the initiate the power to kill animals and even men.43
Furthermore, the necklace bead, (ubulunga), worn in the Lodge,
(ibhoma), by the initiate prevents illness, (ukukhathaza), of the
circumcised caused by sorcerers. They have to tie around their
heads a roll of sheepskin and a roll of hareskin. Finally, these
are symbols of courage. For example, the hareskin and
bird feathers symbolize that one has had a successful hunting
expedition.44

Both the Fingo and Xhosa initiates are given a stick to which a
set of black bags is attached.45 There are normally three such
bags (ibonsaka), to a set. The bags are used for a few personal

43. See V.W. Turner, "Three Symbols of Passage in Ndembu
Circumcision Ritual", p. 124 in Essays of Social
44. Hunter, M. 1961 Reaction to Conquest : Effects of Contact
with Europeans on the Pondo of South Africa.
45. Cassette No. 10011, "Initiation in the Peddie district of
the Ciskei" (Emazizini Areas), South Africa (1987).
effects such as pipe, tobacco, matches, hand mirror and white powdered clay. Their bodies should be painted white and this has a two-fold symbolism. First, it symbolises the death through which the initiate goes and his identification with the lineage of the living dead. Second, whiteness in African philosophy symbolises the experience one has. Third, if a person is possessed by the Ancestor spirit he would be regarded as white. We have seen why the initiates carry the sticks and bags and why, as we have indicated, they suddenly have a white pigmentation. Of the most significant features of separation is the Lodge, (ibhoma).

The Lodge is central to the life of the initiate because it is a place of learning, healing and growth. As a classroom it is where the mysteries of manhood are taught, characteristic of which is the (hlonipha), the language of respect. For example, a stick, normally called (intonga), would be called (ikrali), or a fowl, (inkuku), would be (isifombo). The Xhosa initiates are taught the basics of sex education while among the (Bomvana) tribe of the Transkei, "there is no curriculum of learning." In some other tribes the initiates may be taught songs and useful

46. Part two of Cassette No. 10011, "Initiation in the Peddie district of the Ciskei" (Emazizini Area), South Africa (1987).

pass-words which could be used in establishing "one's identity as
an initiated tribesman when travelling among strangers." The
songs are accompanied by dancing, (ukuxhentsa), whose rhythm
links one with the dead fathers and grandfathers, ancestors and
the tribe.

The above exposition has been an attempt to present and analyse
that which is constitutive of the rite of separation and what
happens at the initiation school. However, a complete analysis
of the rite of separation would require consideration of the
purificatory rite as part of the whole initiation process. In
what follows we concentrate on the ritual of washing at the
stream.

The male nurse (ikhankatha), who has been tending the initiates
at the Lodge informs the village that they are now ready to
return to the community. But before they do so they have to
undergo a purificatory rite in which they are instructed to run
down to the stream. But they should not jump into the water
until ordered to do so. As soon as they have arrived at the
stream, they line up along the edges of the water. The male
nurse, (ikhankatha), instructs them to put the right foot and

48. See V. Van der Vliet, p. 230 in The Bantu-speaking
Peoples of Southern Africa (ed) W.D. Hammond-Tooke
(1974).

49. Cassette No. 10012, "Initiation in the Peddie district of
the Ciskei" (Emazizini Areas), South Africa (1987).
then the left foot into the water after which they wash off the clay from their bodies. In this purificatory ritual they have to use soap and mud for scrapping and washing off the white clay from their bodies. They could then return to the Lodge where their bodies would be anointed with cream and new penis sheaths put on. The initiate is then covered with a new blanket which should have a small opening that enables him to see. He is then given a black stick, (umngayi), in his right hand. There are two important concepts in this purification process. They are water and the stream. The former indicates that water is a symbol of cleansing and the latter indicates that childhood has been washed away in the stream. In other words they have been purified and must now go home. From the Lodge they are led back to the village. The anointer follows behind the initiates. During the procession back to the village, the Lodge, (ibhoma), in which they were schooled should be set on fire with all its paraphernalia. While the Lodge is burning down the initiates must not look at it. They have been living in it, but now they are cut off from it and reincorporated into their original home environment.

51. Cassette No. 10013, "Initiation in the Peddie district of the Ciskei" (Emazizini Areas), South Africa (1987).
The incorporation ritual ceremony normally takes place at the (Sosuthu's) homestead. (Sosutho) is the Kraalhead appointed to be the "father" of the ceremony. The initiates are first led to his kraal where a brand new mat upon which they are to sit is spread in the courtyard. When they have taken their places, the male nurse, (ikhankatha), sits on the left and the anointer on their right. They are then each given a handful of boiled mealies, (inkobe), by the (ikhankatha), of which he and his anointer colleague partake. From the exhortation speeches delivered to the newly circumcised men, three theological and ethical interpretations of initiation may be derived which we now outline.

(1) We may liken initiation to baptism, (ubaptizo), in that the initiate is separated off and later into the world of dead spirits in the bush and as he is cut off from the comfort and joy of his home environment, it is as though he were going through death, a death in which the old state of infancy is obliterated so that the new may emerge.

(2) The presentation of gifts is made to the circumcised, (ukusoka), such as bead head-dress, (ingqaza), a black doek, (iqhiya), a bead necklace, (umkhinxo), bead earrings, (amajikazi), bead anklets, (amanqashela), tobacco bags,

Furthermore, the presentation is made to each initiate of a spear, (*umkhonto*), in the form of an accolade in which the head of the initiate is tapped with the flat blade of the spear followed by a tap on the palm of the right hand; this is symbolic of the pain and suffering through which the circumcised man has gone. He suffered but has emerged as it were from the grave victoriously and is crowned with the gifts.

(3) Coming from the courtyard, (*inkundla*), the sisters of the initiates prepare red ochre, (*imbhola*), for the circumcised to smear on their faces. To be smeared with red ochre marks the new stage of life (*ubukrwala*) into which one is entering. The term, (*ikrwala*), means a fruit which is about "to be ripe". To refer to the initiates as (*amakrwala*) (plural of (*ikrwala*)) signifies an initial stage in the identity of manhood, (*ubudoda*), with all its responsibilities.

To have been circumcised implies, inter alia, that the new initiates are free to sit among men by the cattle kraal and hear the cases of dispute, (*amatyala*), being discussed and they may also eat from the same bowl as the elders. They are no longer uncircumcised boys and thus impure; they now belong to the masculine politico-religious sphere. Their identity has been publicly marked and they should be ready to enter the world of sex and marriage.
It has been my concern in the foregoing pages to show the transitive character of identity, that is, the stage of puberty in which the African boy undergoes circumcision. The rites of separation and incorporation, as we have argued, serve to mark stages through which one has to journey from childhood to a socially recognized adulthood with its mysteries and tasks. Identity involves both suffering and joy. As initiates they are ready for the next rite of passage, that of marriage.

(iii) Marriage

"There is no trace of this sentimental socialism in primitive society... Marriage is between individuals and is an individualistic act." 54

The above misleading citation indicates that in Crawley's mind marriage in traditional society should be taken to convey something individualistic. Consequently there are serious limitations in this and other earlier analyses of African society. The first limitation is embodied in the use of the word "primitive". This conveys the stigma of contempt. To say that other races are "lower" and "primitive", although it is a descriptive historical concept is to pass a judgement which implies that one's culture should be perceived as higher than the

races which are the subject of analysis. From an anthropological perspective there is nothing like an inferior culture as implied in Crawley's use of the term "primitive"; all cultures are relatively equal in the sense that they contain values and norms which could be classified as good. Second, in traditional African society, marriage is not just a matter between individuals and is not an "individualistic act" as such. It is different from a cultural situation in which marriage is primarily an agreement between two persons after which they contract a legal relationship which may be connected in some special way with religion. In Western society if both parties are of age they may normally enter into marriage even without the consent of their nearest relations. Contrastingly, in African society it is a matter between two kin groups, namely, that of the bridegroom on the one hand and of the bride on the other. The obligation undertaken by the two groups towards each other brings about a re-arrangement of social relationships. The bride ceremonially takes leave of her own group with which her relationship becomes less intimate and is linked to her husband's group in accordance with the patrilineal principle. Third, we


are uncomfortable with Crawley's views which seem to have been influenced by Frazer and Tylor, who, according to Gluckman, did not understand the nature of society well enough to be of use in analyzing traditional societies. 58 Traditional societies have a stronger group consciousness than the capitalist technologically-advanced Western cultures in which, generally speaking, the emphasis is always on the nuclear family. This view stems directly from society's emphasis on the individual. 59

So far insights have been drawn from Crawley's analysis of marriage. In disagreeing with him we have registered the view that marriage is basically social in traditional African societies. Here social means that it is a bond not only between the spouses but also and necessarily between two kinship groups. Furthermore, we are arguing that it is a rite of passage which involves the transfer of the man and woman from the group of the unmarried to that of the married. Here, there is an unbroken continuity and sameness of identity as the person moves from a stage of a circumcised man in to a married status. 60 The whole transfer involves a change of status in society. This change


60. Hoernlé, A.W. 1925 "The importance of the sib in the Marriage Ceremonies of the S.E. Bantu", in South of Journal of Science (1925) 1 April, p. 483.
reflects again the significance of a ritual and a myth which, as we indicated earlier in this thesis, underlay birth and circumcision. Although it is not always possible in African culture to establish the precise relationship between a particular myth and a specific rite, there is nevertheless behind any ritual action always a myth. The problem that blurs this relationship is that myth and rite are always separated from one another. Accurately speaking, the rite assumes a colourful independent action while on the other hand, the myth tends to grow so dim that it is erased from the minds of the community. However, the myth may retain its force when the rite has not survived. It may be expressed in words and transmitted simply through the rite that symbolises it. People do not merely hear the "truth", they also see it dramatised before their eyes. It should be said here that myth is the content and the message of the ritual action. If the myth disappeared, the rite would ultimately be left empty of its content.

We said earlier that marriage as a rite of passage maintains an unbroken continuity and sameness through the transition stages


in one's life. Basically, ritual and myth underpins and symbolizes the character by which one moves from one way of being to another. Let us demonstrate how ritual and myth symbolize identity in marriage and exemplify the transitive nature of identity. Ritual in traditional African society's marriages could be referred to as bondship which denotes an act of connecting together different people. It implies fullness and wholeness of identity. Fullness refers to the unity of two groups of kin that of the bridgroom and that of the bride. Wholeness is a sense of completion of the bondship process which is finalised at the point where the woman is allowed "to drink milk", (ukudliswa amasi). The bondship process begins with the brewing of copious supplies of beer, (utywala) at the home of the bride and the bridegroom. This is done to ensure that the ancestor spirits are favourably disposed towards the marriage. Among the (Amabhaca), bondship begins by washing the body of the bride with foam made from a plant dug up from the veld, (ubulawu). This is a ritual purificatory act which cleanses the woman from the uncleanness of girlhood and thereby introduces her to married life. After the ritual washing she changes her traditional attire from that of girlhood to that of a married woman and leads the procession, (icece), to the groom's homestead

(umzi), where the party is given a hut to stay. The following morning, they present themselves to the groom's kin. After this presentation, a goat (umathula'ntabeni) will be killed. It is referred to as a "mat", that is to say in the traditional phrase: "to lay the marriage mat, (ukwandlela). In performing this ritual of bondship the elderly women would take the raw liver, rectum and gallbladder of the slaughtered goat and put them on a grass eating-mat (isithebe), and bring these to the bride for her to sip the gall. 67 However, a clear distinction between the Xhosa of the Ciskei and the Bhaca of the Transkei should be made concerning the way in which each group performs its bondship rite. The (Bhaca) would ask the bride to sip the gall but the (Xhosa) would pour the gall, (inyongo), on the head, arms and feet of the bride. After this a special piece of meat from the right foreleg of the goat, (intsonyama), is given to the bride. 68

However, the most significant feature of the ritual is the shedding of the blood and the use of the gall which can be symbolised in theological terms as a covenant relationship that is being entered into between the groom and the bride and their respective groups. On the wedding day, they have to present themselves to the assembled congregation at the Courtyard. The

bridegroom marches with his bride up and down the courtyard almost as if they were marching up the aisle in a church. The couple have to present themselves to the assembled people in this way three times. The repetition of this ritual commits identity to the memory and establishes a bond relationship by enforcing symbolically the identity.

Implicit in the ritual of marriage which involves, as we have indicated earlier, the killing of the goat, the spilling of its blood and the sharing together of a meal by the groom and the bride's group is a religious concept of sacrament. The concept of sacrament inferred from the ritual of marriage places the focus on the symbolic salience of sacrament for the individual. It would be particularly so if the concept of sacrament is defined as,

"a ritual that enacts, focusses, and concentrates the distinctive beliefs, attitudes and actions of any religious tradition."^{69}

If we define sacrament in accordance with the principle of ex opere operato, that is what the action signifies, it also accomplishes, then any ritual thought by its practitioners to be efficacious will be included.^{70} The blood of the goat in the

---

70. Ibid, p. 504.
ritual of traditional marriage should be perceived as uniting the two kin groups and the ancestral spirits, for the blood is the drink of gods which can be shared with the living.

Because man cannot bind together anything without the aid of the deity, the blood has to be spilled in order to invoke those we may call the "living dead". In this form of African thought the significance of the deity is threefold. In the first place, it is in the names by which the deity is known. He is (umvelingqanqi), (umdali), maker or creator, or (umenzi) which signifies "worker". When the latter word is used in the sacred sense it refers to that Being by whom the great works of nature were produced. 71 Secondly, he is the one who binds all things together to each other like a thread. The conception of creation as a whole, both the cosmic order and the man's place within it is the product of putting together of separate parts. Thirdly, in African oral tradition the conception of the creator, (umenzi), as a spider is of one who weaves the Universe just as a normal spider weaves its web. Finally, under God, man is capable of making it whole. He is capable of putting it together by loosening the entangling problems of his existence. Hastings has said that marriage is capable of crossing the frontiers of tribe and clan. The available evidence in this thesis also affirms and supports the view that marriage can bring together

that which has hitherto been separated by man-made divisions of "class" and "race". Marriage creates and weaves a universe of "fellowship of human kind whose foundations are on recognizing our common humanity in Christ."^72

In the next section we will examine the concept of the family as the focus of identity. During the course of our exploration in this section insights have been drawn from Van Gennep's theory of the rites of passage. The transitions from one stage to another were explained with reference to birth, initiation and marriage. This threefold theory could be infused with a general theory of religion in which the reinforcement of identity is important. As we have indicated above, the rites of passage give structure to identity particularly the ritual performed during the time of crisis and change.

3.2 The Family

The notion of the family is a problematic and elusive one about which we could argue at great length. 73 In addition, the state


policy of South Africa has placed it at the heart of South African social formation. The fundamental conditions affecting the lives of African families, particularly women and children, is the migratory labour system which ensures that Black cheap labour force is drawn from the African Reserves in order to maintain the economy of "White" South Africa.

This section is based on several presuppositions, the most basic of which we have already referred to, namely, that the migratory labour system has had devastating effects on the family. Therefore the family should be studied within the context of the South African Apartheid ideology. A second assumption is that the notion of the family presupposes the focus of identity on the Homestead, (umzi). The Homestead may be conceptualized as a small plot of land on which a house is built and the owner and the surviving spouse and minor children live.


77. Hunter, M. 1961 Reaction to Conquest, pp. 16-47.
In African philosophy it is where cattle, fields, and ancestral spirits reside. The real life of an African begins in the (umzi). The concept of migration, by which we mean a movement of a group of people from one area to another could illuminate our discussion of (umzi) as it reflects the significance of this concept. 78

Migration may be permanent or temporary. Permanent migration may also be called emigration which is the one-way movement of the migrants that involves a permanent relocation of their residence. By contrast, temporary migration involves the return of the migrants after some period of absence to (umzi). Furthermore, there is what is called "oscillating" migration which may be perceived as a continuing, repeating pattern of temporary migration where the migrants continually return to the same "home" area.

From 1948-1984, most labour migration in South Africa was oscillating. In fact this had been so long before the apartheid policy was introduced. The available evidence indicates that as early as 1942 the Smit Committee, the Social and Economic Planning Council of 1946, as well as the Fagan Commission expressed the view that, "the permanent movement from country to

town had a background of economic necessity and migrant labour was a system which in the long run, cannot be maintained otherwise than on a limited scale". However, when the Nationalist Party came into power in 1948 they ignored the recommendations of the Commissions. Instead they reaffirmed the recommendations of the 1922 Stallard Commission which said "that permanent residence in the towns was the exclusive right of whites". One of the most important consequences of this action was the tightening up of the influx control regulations for the Black people. Black workers were then channelled through Government Labour Bureaux and Mining Recruiting Organizations from the villages to the work places. More importantly, the urban residence rights of all Black women and children not employed were curtailed. They were endorsed out of the White urban areas to the economically unviable "homelands." This meant that most Black children were brought up in the "homelands" with the exception of those, of course, who had rights to be in the urban areas.


80. Ibid, p. 17.


82. Mayer, P. 1971 Townsmen or Tribesmen, pp. 270-73. (Cape Town, Oxford University Press).
Things became worse after World War II with 635,000 South African Blacks being classified as migrants. In 1960 there were 887,000 such people which rose to 1,295,000 in 1970. In fact by 1970 over half of the Blacks productively employed in "White" areas of South Africa were oscillating migrants. The South African migrant labour system has produced a situation in which husband and wife are separated from one another. Of course, this does not apply to other racial groups. It is applicable to the Blacks only.

However, there are moral and theological bases on which to criticise this system. First, the migrant labour system in South Africa has led to the breakdown of family life and has increased promiscuity and homosexuality. We said earlier that men leave their (imizi) for work in distant places. It is there where they resort to (masihlalisane), literally "let us live together with all the privileges of married life without its bonds." Supporting (umasihlalisane), that is, the woman with whom the man lives for the time being, reduces remittances to their legitimate wives and children back at their (imizi) or homestead. This has


caused a lot of suffering in Black society, the most serious of which is the malnourishment of illegitimate children. There is a high correlation between illegitimacy and malnutrition in Black society. Second, on a theological consideration, the separation of husband from wife disregards the sacredness of the marriage bond. The Christian doctrine of marriage has taught that marriage is a sacred union for life of one man and one woman and that it should be treated with reverence. The Church has insisted that marriage is an image of the union between Christ and his Church. Third, the marriage ceremony joins the bride and groom into one spirit in union with Christ and God. Finally, relating generally speaking to these three points, is that (masihlalisane) weakens the importance of paying (lobola), dowry which is fundamental to the cementing of kinship relationships in African society.

In the above critical analysis we suggest that the migrant labour system is not only evil but is also immoral and wrong. This psychological issue has produced from the South African social


86. See Xhosa Methodist Hymn Book: The Book of Worship and Services. (Cape Town, 1926).

formation (abelunga abamnyama), Black-White men, who have remained caught up in identity crisis in the Cities. Contrast those who reject White values in order to better focus on the values and ideas attached to (umzi). The former, whilst rejecting White racism and Black subjugation, identify with some of the White values and norms. The latter oscillate between rural and urban South Africa with such frequency that a double-consciousness and double-lens through which they look at South African Society has developed. The double-consciousness and double-lens indicate a group of human beings who perceive themselves as people present in the City for productive work but not of the city. With this double-consciousness the Blacks have no alternative yet, but to focus on the (umzi). In Chapter two of this thesis, we saw how this was evident among the "Red people" in the Black Communities. Of this, Mayer has written,

"the ideology impressed on the Red man that his working life outside the community was not "real"; it taught the paramountcy of his life in the Umzi, with its cattle and fields, and of the home community where the spirits as well as family and neighbours reside." 88

In the oscillation of the Black person between the urban and rural environments, \textit{(umzi)} has been a focal point of satisfaction and identity. In frustration, injustices and powerlessness the concept of \textit{(umzi)}, we maintain, gave the Black man hope and inspiration. In the early part of 1948-1984 period, a strong emphasis was placed on,

"Saving money for investment in the Umzi. Invariably, building and repairing the huts were first priorities. Cattle, especially a team of oxen for ploughing came next. Shop-clothes were not important.... Furniture invariably came last."

Therefore we are arguing that, underlying the strong focus on \textit{(umzi)} were two related concepts. First, familiism which refers to a strong emphasis on the family as a primary unit in one's community. In the case of migrant labourers it is accompanied by a sense of wishing to be with one's own family at the \textit{(umzi)}. Second, filiopiety which indicates a strong feeling related to the excessive veneration of the ancestors. With a sense of the family, the black migrant as we have already indicated is impelled to be with his wife and children and community. For him to be with his family gives a sense of fulfilment and dignity without which the community as a whole finds it easy to exist.

\begin{flushright}
89. Ibid, pp. 54-55.
\end{flushright}
The community is the basis of the above arguments for it is the community that produces a person and makes him to be what he is, that is, a person. In this argument, as we have already said in Chapter two, there is a sense in which the individual is hardly any more than a link in the chain binding him "horizontally" to his living fellow tribesmen and "vertically" to the deceased ancestors. 90

In fairness we should point out that ancestors in African communities are not worshipped but they are venerated. For ancestor veneration we should use the term filiopiety. In the (Xhosa) language the word we use for praying is (thandaza). This is never used when referring to ancestors, instead the term, (khumbula), is used which means to remember. To put it more succinctly, we would say that we have high regard of an ancestor because of his intermediary role between us and the Supreme Being. In the terms of filiopiety the migrant labourer focuses on (umzi) because it is the place in which the ancestors reside. Returning to (umzi) should be understood to mean returning to your ancestors who are no longer just "people" but intermediaries.

The notion of mediation is of vital importance in the black worldview in that it is normal for someone to approach a senior

90. See Chapter Two "The Community".
through the mediation of others. In this argument the ancestors are regarded as bilingual in that they can speak the languages of both men and the gods. They are capable of communicating the wishes of the people to a Supreme Being. Of them Mbiti has said, "they are more abreast of things than the living." 91 He objects to the use of the European word "Ancestor" or "the Spirit of the departed" in favour of the term "the living dead." 92 The living-dead are different from the personalities of living men and they have special authority. In most traditional societies moral authority and status are a function of age. The sociological investigation of the religious factor in identity formation indicates that as soon as the individual, usually the male matures, he is regarded as capable of exercising authority for upholding lineage and group values. 93 So, this sociological perspective supports my basic claims that the living-dead are those who occupied a position of authority in a recognised social scheme. To argue in the way in which we have done implies that in a patriarchal system the person concerned is survived by sons grown to manhood while in a matriarchal society by sons of his sister. Finally, the significance of (umzi) is in famialism and

filioiety. The former induces modes of authority and transmits values and beliefs calculated to maintain a certain level of humane-ness, (ubuntu). The latter in one sense is a logical extension of the authoritarian relationships existing in the World. 94

In the above arguments insights have been drawn from the concepts of migration, the homestead (umzi), familialism and filioiety. But it should be made more explicit now that the Apartheid ideology has not only distorted and fragmented the family society, but it has also specifically legitimated the oppression of the Black family in order to provide a supply of cheap Black labour from the reserves. This is a negation of the African point of view that the family is a relationally constituted unit, one which takes the African cultural heritage with its communalist patterns of living as a basis for the creation of an egalitarian society. Egalitarianism refers to a belief in human equality which implies, inter alia, that all people are entitled to equal access to the rights and privileges of South African society. 95 The fundamental basis of egalitarianism is the family and community which recognizes the values of equality, love and


justice. However, due to the impact of industrialisation and urbanization on South African society especially after World War II, the African family as an institution saw radical changes in its structure. 96 There was a discernible move from that which was regarded as normal, let us say, in the pre-industrial era, namely the polygamous type of family to the models based on the extended family. 97 There were exceptions, however, particularly in the African reserves, those who felt that polygamy was still necessary in view of the African tradition. Given the South African social formation in the period from 1948-1984, we may classify and analyse the family types as follows.

First, the extended family which is normally composed of father and mother, young and grown up children, grandfather, grandmother, uncle and aunt. 98 Second, the polygamous family which consists of two or more nuclear families unified by a common spouse. Polygamy could take two forms, namely polygamy in


98. Pauw, B.A. 1975 Christianity and Xhosa Tradition, p. 43 and also Monica Hunter, 1961 Reaction to Conquest, p. 15.
which one man is married to two wives, and polyandry where one woman is married to two husbands. The former could only be found among the Red people and Chiefs. The latter seems not to have existed among the (Xhosa). Third, there is the levirate family where a man marries his brother's widow. This would refer to the (Amampondo) custom of (ukungena) which is based on the assumption that marriage is contracted between two kinship groups, not between individuals. Therefore a widow should continue her marriage by a kinsman of her deceased husband usually a younger brother. The children conceived under such an arrangement belong to the deceased. Although such a brother continues to support the widow he cannot contract a marriage with her. But could only continue his brother's marriage with all the responsibilities it entailed.

To appreciate the family and its types in African society requires a deep understanding of marriage with which we have been concerned in the previous section of this work. Marriage appeared to have ontological implications in traditional African society. It is something which can be identified with the process of procreation without which life cannot be said to be fulfilling. If it is taken to mean the exchange of identity with the basic intention of love and procreation, then marriage should

be perceived as the promotion of growth and prosperity of the extended family which integrates the kinship group. In our view marriage then assumes a communal dimension whose significance may be underpinned by the importance of polygamous families in African society. Of this, Hillman has said, "in other words polygamy is significant as a means of ensuring solidarity within the extended family, the clan and the tribal or ethnic community."\(^{100}\) Considered on a theological level, the communal dimension of African family life and the related assumptions of parenthood as a purpose in marriage locate the family in the context of the Christian call to faithful love. It is a love that is underscored by strong commitments to shared values of justice and equality that Christian faith has lifted up as features of a Christian community.

Articulating the communal dimension in African family life, President Julius Nyerere of Tanzania and Dr. Kenneth Kaunda of Zambia\(^ {101}\) spoke of marriage in terms of African socialism, by which is referred to an economic system in which the factors of production are not privately but collectively owned and


controlled, in which economic activity is planned and where the results of the productive process are shared as equally as possible. 102 Although this definition of socialism sounds Western, after the decolonisation process had taken off in the early sixties the term was redefined to suit the indigenous cultural identity of Africa. So, African socialism refers to indigenization. 103 To argue that something is indigenous is to affirm that it has been produced naturally in a country. Theologically, we could speak of indigenization as incarnation which would mean creating a truly African expression of Christianity.

So far the above arguments indicate that Nyerere and Kaunda saw that the sense of community and the communalist patterns of African living could be incorporated in socialism. We can learn from them some aspects of an African social philosophy. The most striking and compelling aspect is that,

"All men were brothers and members of the extended family. This is what is called, "Ujamaa" or "familyhood" which describes African socialism. It is opposed to capitalism, which seeks to build a happy

society on the basis of exploitation of man by man; and it is equally opposed to doctrinaire socialism which seeks to build its happy society on a philosophy of inevitable conflict between man and man ... We in Africa, have no more need of being "converted" to Socialism than we have of being taught democracy. Both are rooted in our own past."104

For Nyerere, socialism is an "attitude of mind", and not adherence to a designed political programme that is essential to help the people so that they should help themselves. However, we may criticise African socialism by going to the theoretical underpinnings of its philosophy. First, we would contend that African socialism is oriented towards tradition which needs itself to be tested by going through a painstaking process of a new synthesis. Any tradition, in our view, should be torn apart in order that it might be rebuilt. For African socialism to be "rooted" in the communalist "past" it needs to be examined in the light of theology and the World. Theologically, communalism is one of the basic concepts of New Testament theology which refers to a system of social organization in which there is collective ownership and use of property. It is underpinned by familyhood and by a strong sense of belonging together irrespective of sex, colour, status and language. So, it is Christian. Second,

considering it from the perspective of the modern world, African socialism would be out of step with the world's emphasis on individual achievement and its utilitarian view of nature. Third, the socialist principle of developing rural areas, and not urban-industrial and commercial areas, is in our view, a self-defeating exercise because people are gradually moving to the cities where there are better facilities of existence. Finally, because colonialism with capitalism benefitted from the wealth of the world, we should think of a particular kind of socialism which would embrace Christian values such as justice and equality and the sharing of economic and political power. In our view that would be one of the negations of the past from which we have inherited ideological legacies, characteristic of which are the racial inequalities which are statutory in modern South Africa.

Theologically and ethically the inequalities of human beings may be debated. The word of God is instructive when it asserts that we should love one another for we are made in the image of God. Therefore we are equal in His sight. Ethically, even though all men are not of equal ability in the public domain, all human

beings are entitled to equal treatment. Although there are a number of grounds on which inequality of treatments may be justified, for example, age, mental incapacity, we should say that inequality of treatment based on the irrational grounds of class, race and gender should be rejected. However, it is difficult to suggest that the equality of income is an attainable social goal. Difficult as it might be, there is much truth in the view that wide gaps in income are inimical to political and social stability especially if those gaps in income have been calculated to convey racial inequalities in society. As we have indicated in our previous discussion on Nyerere and Kaunda, equality in the sense of treating one another as brothers and sisters of the same family belongs to the African tradition. This is the sense in which the principle of equality is used. It may have to be qualified though in situations where the notions of the family have always been used to discriminate against people of a different colour or language. It should be emphasised that the minimisation of inherited privileges of class, race and gender is required in accordance with genuine equality. Dr. A.B. Xuma, at the unveiling of a tombstone of Sek


Mqhayi, the Praisesinger of the Xhosa Nation, Imbongi Yama Xhosa, articulated the African tradition of familyhood when he said,

"as a great Christian, Mqhayi had been able to look ahead to a future where there must be neither white nor non-white, but a citizenship - a united South African Nation." 109

This is a tradition in which there is no legalised distinction of class, race and clan, and where privileged access to education is abolished. Of equality, R.H. Tawney said,

"To criticise inequality and to desire equality is not, as is sometimes suggested, to cherish the romantic illusion that men are equal in character and intelligence. It is to assert that while their natural endowments differ profoundly, it is the mark of a civilized society to eliminate them..." 110

The above analysis has shown that equality is a difficult notion to clarify. Difficult as it appears to be, the doctrine of atonement has taught us that Christ has brought us together into a new familyhood that ought to be visible expressed by the Church in which differences of race, class and gender are transcended.

110. Tawney, R.H. 1952 Equality, p. 49.
Therefore the legitimation of inequality in treatment based on class, race and gender as a vehicle of exploitation and oppression is a blatant denial of the image in which God has made man.

3.3 The Role of Women

We have not yet dealt with the categorization of women's work although we referred to the curtailment of women's rights to live with their husbands in order to constitute a full family. The people who have been most deeply hurt by the Apartheid system are Black women who are relegated to an inferior position in society simply because they are black and woman.\footnote{Deborah Gaitskell, et al "Class, Race and Gender : Domestic Workers in South Africa", pp. 86-88 in Review of African Political Economy - Special Issue - Sudan, No. 26, July, 1983.} Black women in South Africa are different from the women in the rest of the free Western World.

Typologically, they may be divided into two categories.\footnote{Deborah Gaitskell, et al "Class, Race and Gender", in Review of African Political Economy, July (1983).} First, the house wife, (umnikazi mzi), who works at home, taking care of children. Second, the domestic servant who is always away from the homestead (umzi) on work in a white household, (kwamlungu), in town for a meagre wage. The housewife tends to
be entirely on her own as African men are migrant labourers, working away in the "white" South Africa. The effects of which have already been considered in this thesis under the migratory labour system. However, it suffices at this point to note that the woman assumes a double role in the running of the home, that is of both masculine and feminine gender. In fact that entails a heavy and oppressive responsibility on her which might otherwise have been avoided if she had been allowed to live with her husband at the place of employment. This, we should argue, constitutes one of the fundamental contradictions underlying the political structure of the South African society. It is a contradiction in the sense that Blacks are not citizens of South Africa and yet they must come and work for the Whites in the cities but must leave their families in the Reserves. Hence the striking characteristic of a traditional African family has since World War II been a move towards matriarchy, by which we mean a focus on the mother. Undoubtedly, this has created a chronic dependency on the man who is the sole breadwinner who earns his living by working and remitting his wages to the family at the (umzi) in the reserves. We have already indicated that some of the Black women work in white households in towns. In what follows, we should concentrate on those who are classified as domestic servants, (Onokhitshi).

The domestic servant has been defined here as primarily a servant who performs domestic labour in a White household for a meagre wage. The number of these domestic servants varies. The following classification may throw some light on them. First, in
most South African White homes there may be three of such
domestic servants, one of whom would be designated a cook
(umpheki), whose job description involves, among other things,
the setting of the table for meals. Second, the child minder,
(ineni). Third, the washer, (umvasikazi), whose responsibility
could be the washing of family clothes and ironing them for her
white employer. Finally, the garden boy, that is, an adult man
whose task is to trim the hedge and cut the grass. One of the
domestic servants mentioned in this analysis would be expected to
get up early in the morning and travel from the Black township to
the White residential area in order to make the six o'clock
morning coffee for her employer. In fairness not all whites in
South Africa have this kind of luxury. But the present research
done by White South Africans themselves indicates that most South
African Whites enjoy the abovementioned comforts.113

Domestic work tends to have a gender bias in the sense that it is
most often done by women. There are two reasons to support this
claim. First, the division of labour which can be found
throughout the world especially in countries where there is a
high rate of unemployment, child-rearing, cooking and cleaning

(Raven Press, Johannesburg); and also
C. Van Onselen, "The Witches of Suburbia: Domestic
Service on the Witwatersrand, 1890-1914", in Studies in
the Social and Economic History of the Witwatersrand
1886-1914, Vol. 2.
are generally assumed to be women's work. The United States of America may, however, be an exception in that in some States women have jobs and tend to exchange roles with their husbands. Second, the tasks performed in the house underpin the ideology of woman as a wife. Third, cleaning, cooking and minding children are jobs which are generally regarded as "socially inferior" hence they are done by those the political system classifies as "ethnic minority" or as Black. Finally, the available evidence shows that from the turn of the century domestic work in South Africa has been, above all, a Black institution compatible with structures of Black domination.

It has been our concern in this section to show the family as a focus of identity. However, there were logically pre-existing factors in our arguments. The most basic was that the Black family structure should be studied within the context of South Africa and be necessarily differentiated from the pre-industrial family types. There have been radical changes in South African society which were due to the transformative processes of industrialisation and urbanisation. These changes particularly after World War II affected the African family structure.


Although the family is a basis from which the cultural communalist patterns of living are transmitted to the wider society, the old family structures are crumbling due to some of the reasons already mentioned above which are, in our view, inherent to capitalism. Here it is accurate to perceive the African family as in a state of transition. Given the South African Apartheid ideology and the migrant labour system, the family, particularly women, have been the most vulnerable in society. The ideological structures have legitimated the fragmentation of the traditional African family identity through the migratory labour system and has in turn brought about the matriarchal tendencies in contemporary African family life.

In the next chapter we will focus on the religious ideologies of identity with special attention to the social theories of both Dutch and English European settlers in South Africa. This is undertaken in order to understand how traditional society was further fragmented by alien ideologies legitimated by Christianity and its tendency to mystify social relationships and ethnic divisions.

CHAPTER 4
THE RELIGIOUS IDEOLOGIES OF IDENTITY IN SOUTH AFRICA

To argue that Christianity as a religion of life has not been conducive to the emancipation of the indigenous tribes in South Africa is at least to imply that an ideology designed to undergird the missionary movement in its alignment with the status quo was in existence. Here, the religious ideologies of identity should be contextualised in order to understand the situation. In an attempt to contextualise them we turn in this chapter to their examination in two separate sections. Section one concentrates on the examination of Dutch social theories in relation to the South African religio-political situation. Section two explores the English social theories.

4.1 The Problem of Ideology

Beginning from a different starting point and concentrating largely on the examination of the term ideology rather than social theories, two meanings of ideology may be distinguished. The most common use of the term is defined as follows in Webster's Third International Dictionary, "the integrative assertions, theories, and aims that constitute a socio-political programme." But from the South African point of view ideology

1. See Chapter Two of this Thesis.
may be defined as something that is used for selected and distorted ideas in defence of a social system.\textsuperscript{2} Here there is a problem. The definitions tend to be stipulative. It would seem that we are provided with either an exclusive and restricted definition which is so inclusive that it is difficult to distinguish between what is and what is not ideological. We would suggest that to avoid these problems we should provide an account of the main interrelated features of a political ideology.\textsuperscript{3}

A political ideology is often distinguished from the mere possession of values and principles on the following grounds. First, it involves a distinct relationship between ideas and action and secondly these ideas are systematic and coherently interrelated.\textsuperscript{4} We may say here, a systematization of ideas "ceases to be an intellectual abstraction and becomes an active social agent or ideology when it is applied to concrete situations and became a guide for action."\textsuperscript{5} I further believe

\begin{itemize}
\item[4.] The Guardian Newspaper (1949).
\end{itemize}
that, the theological contextualization of such a term is dependent upon the validity of our understanding of the faith-ideology dialectic. In the words of Segundo, faith and ideology are inextricably intermingled. It is a temptation to treat them in isolation from each other, or to confuse them with each other. Succumbing to the former temptation usually results in confining the discussion to a level of abstraction which is practically meaningless, while succumbing to the latter temptation may, depending on the nature of the case, lead to a vehement legitimation of the status quo. Let us examine the problem of legitimation within the South African social context in terms of the basic claims made by the missionary movement. We understand legitimation in this argument as a process in which new situations in society are sought and justified through reference to shared values of tradition, ethnic identity and moral values.  

We should argue that the process of legitimation is discernible in the Evangelical Missionary Movement in three shared values which were used as points of reference. They were: first, the sacredness of tradition which refers to something that has been carried on from father to son in one's own community. The sense in which the concept of community is used here to indicate people who were born and raised in the same land and who shared identical values and norms. The Evangelical Revival Movement

---

was motivated by a tradition of loyalty to the imperial power. This is the point of view which is supported by missionaries themselves. The Rev. William Shaw who was a Wesleyan missionary to South Africa appointed as a Government supported Chaplain of the 1820 British Settlers Sephton Party wrote a letter to his empirical Authority and said;

"... I know that it cannot but give pleasure to you as you so carefully instruct your Missionaries to encourage sentiments of loyalty to governors; and you will not contradict me when I say, that religion of the Bible is never received, where rulers are disobeyed, and the good order of society is disturbed." 7

The attachment to the apron strings of an imperial tradition as we have shown in the above citation implied three things: first, the maintenance of the Empire and the opening of new areas for further expansion; second, the suppression of the slave trade; and third, the development of commerce and missionary enterprise. 8 Above all, this was a tradition which honoured his Majesty the King, and was expected to shun political parties and disputes. However, disputes caused by divergent ideological world views concerning the issue of land were not to be avoided. This meant that they should be quite willing to take


sides and the side with which they were familiar was that of the colonial power. To be on the side of the colonial power should be perceived as an act of loyalty to a tradition, which in our view superseded their commitment to the indigenous tribes to whom God had sent them. The Sixth Frontier war (1834-5) indicates such loyalty to a tradition. Sir Benjamin Durban, Governor of the Cape, had provoked aggression of Xhosas by annexing the territory from the Fish to the Kei Rivers. During that period the Reverend W.B. Boyce, a Wesleyan Missionary, and Dr. John Philip of the London Missionary Society, were missionaries among the indigenous tribes in the Eastern Cape. The former was more sympathetic to, and colluded with, Sir Benjamin Durban's views on annexation. The latter felt that the attack on the colony had not been provoked, but the territory should be retained for African occupation under the Crown. Although they had different personalities and approaches to the Native problem, they had both a tradition of loyalty to the Crown as a principle which underlined their Ministry.

The foregoing arguments show that a tradition tied to, and in favour of, the Crown was used as a legitimating reference by the


missionaries. It was a tradition, we further argue, that was linked to a particular class of people in society. The examination of missionaries' social background can throw light on the notion of class. Class refers to a group of people in society who have economic and political similarities in their ways of life. Sociological studies show that in their countries of origin they were part of an emerging artisan class in society. This class was composed of people who did not have the privilege of a secondary education. These were men gathered from pious congregations of artisans and tradesmen. Of them Gunson writes:

"The mechanic class had like the Puritans, separated itself from among its brethren. It was an artificial class in that it was distinguished largely by its way of life and not by economic difference. This need for a lower class was part of the psychology of evangelical missionaries who substituted the 'poor heathen' for the 'lower class'."

In the early tribal settings of South Africa a class such as this was bound to feel higher than the tribal communities who had different foci of identity such as the ones explained in the Rites of Passage. It should be remembered that they came from countries which were already advanced in capitalism.

Furthermore, in their eyes the indigenous tribes represented the lower classes in the countries from which they came. However, the legitimating process whose point of inspiration and reference was the tradition of class served to blur their understanding of the psychology of tribes to which they had come to evangelize and this rendered the missionization process a failure in many ways. One of the main causal factors of such a failure was the missionary insistence that the African marriage customs central to the solidarity and cohesion of the community as well as the circumcision rituals which were all connected with the periodization of one's identity should be renounced.\textsuperscript{12}

There were requirements for entry into the Christian Community. The list of things forbidden was much longer than the things which were allowed. Of the things which the Christian Community mainly consisted were, bible reading, church attendance, prayer and hymn singing. There was little attempt to show people that one's daily work was also a form of worship. Sin was defined exclusively in terms of sex, pleasure and carnal indulgence. In the eyes of the indigenous tribes the failure of the missionaries to understand the societal psychology of the people to whom God

had sent them was attributable to a lack of the identificational approach without which a missionary remained an apostle of affluence, not sacrifice, cultural superiority, not Christian humility, technological efficiency, not human identification, white supremacy, not human liberation and community. Of course, some of them could read and write the native language but those who could do so without the aid of interpretation were but a small section of the missionary movement. This justified the indictment that there was at that time a crude preaching by foreigners with no proper appreciation of either the language or culture of the people.

As has already been shown, the concept of legitimation seems most useful as an interpretative insight of a movement whose point of reference was tradition. But it is furthermore argued that it was not only the tradition which was used as a point of reference, but also ethnic identity and moral values. These issues played a major role in the legitimating process.

Concentrating on ethnic identity we need to say that it was used as a reference point of legitimation. It is usually related to "race identity", that is, people who share common traits that

actually derive from common descent. Of course, race creates a "group" when it is subjectively perceived as a common trait. However, the concept of group directly reflects the notion of ethnocentrism which usually bifurcates into positive and negative forms of ethnocentrism. Ethnic identity in particular stresses that in the midst of divergent racial values my identity which is ethnically expressed is significant for me and those with whom I share a common ethnicity. The language and colour of our skin may become unifying factors in ethnic identity. For instance, there was no statutory racial discrimination at the Cape during the early years of the Dutch East India Company. However, a strong sense of ethnic identity prevailed in that there were white and non-white ethnic groups. The former were rich and enjoyed a higher status in society. The latter which was composed of manumitted slaves was, comparatively-speaking, poorer and lower in status. To argue in this way does not support the claims that there were no poor Whites; although there were poor Whites they did not form a single class. Furthermore, the poor Whites tended to identify with the rich white strata which


readily accepted them into the government, but not the non-white group. In seeking a legitimating reference skin colour and ethnic identity seemed the most obvious particularly that, 'all dark skinned people were in fact "heathens" and traditionally, darkness was identical with sin and evil in the Christian World view.' \textsuperscript{16} Ethnic identity in the process of legitimation underscored many forms of black exploitation which were justified in terms of racist ideologies. This was more pronounced during the colonial expansion into the hinterland of South Africa after the 1880's and it brought the colonists into conflict with various pre-Capitalist societies. For the great part of its missionization so far, the missionary movement has in the main used tradition and ethnic identity as legitimating references. But also moral values were used as references and in what follows we concentrate upon these factors.

Civilization was a basis of moral values which was used by the missionary movement as a legitimating reference. The concept directly reflects two interpretations, all of which originated from Europe. First, there is an understanding of civilization which is derived from the Enlightenment philosophers who saw civilization as something to do essentially with the way

societies are organised.\textsuperscript{17} Second, the Scottish humanists who saw civilization, relatively, as something which had to do with the economic organization of a society that determined whether it is civilized or not.\textsuperscript{18} It seems that particular forms of political organisation always accompany "particular forms" of economic organisation. It seems that the missionary movement reacted against the rationalisation of the enlightenment and saw civilization as a reference to moral values in the process of legitimation. We may consider the following quotation:

\begin{quote}
I regard Christianity as the parent of Civilization, and I am persuaded that true civilization cannot be produced without it ... when I moreover remember that in Rome there were no hospitals, no asylums for the deaf and dumb and blind, in short none of those humane and charitable institutions which adorn our own Christian land, I cannot conclude that the civilization of the classic heathen was anything better than a splendid barbarism."\textsuperscript{19}
\end{quote}

The above citation illustrates one of the effective ways of using civilization as a reference in the process of legitimation. Two

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{18} Ferguson, A. 1767 An Essay on The History of Civil Society. (Edinburgh).
\item \textsuperscript{19} See An Extract of the 1837 Missionary Committee cited by Kate Crehan in Centre for Southern African Studies, York University edited by A.V. Akeroyd and C.R. Hill (1978), Seminar Papers 4 and 6.
\end{itemize}
presuppositions are basic to the term civilization. First, there is the stage of savage existence which is associated with hunting. Here there is no concept of private property and no political organisation beyond that of the family unit. Second, there is the stage which is associated with agriculture. This stage has the beginnings of private property and political organisation is on the basis of the tribe. This stage can be further sub-divided into a lower nomadic pastoral stage and a higher stage of settled cultivation. The above concepts were used as references in the legitimating process by the missionary movement. To the movement "true civilization" was considered to mean social institutions associated with capitalist society. In fact, once wealth had been discovered under the soil of Africa the alien forces were left with two choices, either to return home or transform these societies. The latter was preferred to the former because of several reasons. The most important of which was that:

"Africa has most of the World's diamonds. More than half the World's gold and copper, iron, chrome, zinc, aluminium, uranium are found in Africa."


By a process of transformation schools and churches were introduced in order to "civilize races emerging from barbarism" by turning them into a "settled and industrious peasantry" to work their lands and that of the Europeans. 23

In the above arguments, it has been our concern to show how the religious ideologies that were underscored by shared values of ethnic identity, tradition and moral values inspired the missionary movement which was composed of "inner-directed" men who were receptive to what they regarded as absolute values of reference. 24 Succumbing to these values resulted in the mystification of Christianity in South Africa which had evolved from the spirituality of Protestantism that was representative of the Christian Missions. 25

Returning to our basic proposition, we should submit that in the process of the transformation of the South African society and legitimation of values and mystification of Christianity, an


ideology was used to safeguard and maintain the status quo. In the development of this argument, we use two distinguishable social theories of Dutch and English. Let us first develop the argument from the Dutch Reformed tradition. This is certainly the correct move historically and missiologically. Historically, it was Jan Van Riebeeck who in April, 1652, with three ships, the Goede Hoop, the Drommedaris and the Reiger anchored in Table Bay in order to begin the history of the Cape Colony. He had been sent by the Directors of the Dutch East India Company in Holland to come and establish a Refreshment station. This was something comparable in a sense with modern weather stations established in remote and not very habitable islands. MacCrone says that Jan Van Riebeeck arrived at the Cape knowing perfectly well that if he could work well with the indigenous tribes there, God would bless the company's work as He had done at Tayouan and Formosa. It would be a blessing which could bring many souls to God and to the Reformed Religion. On the other hand, the available literature in the history of missions indicates that from 1652 to


1665 there was no permanent minister of religion at the Cape. Missiologically, a gap of thirteen years without any spiritual ministrations in any area is usually a cause for a great concern. The question with which we are faced at this point of the argument is who served the settlers spiritually during the abovementioned gap of thirteen years. We are now faced with not only a difficult question to answer but also a very difficult problem to solve. We suggest that the settlers were served by a "sick-comforter." In Methodist terminology he would be a man whose job description might be less than that of a Probationary Minister; he might presumably be the equivalent of a modern Black Evangelist. But certainly he could be distinguished from the above modern terminology, in that a "Sick-Comforter" could not of course conduct a funeral service, administer the sacraments or take up a preaching appointment except by reading the sermon of an ordained man. There were two interrelated reasons for this practice which were both due to the teachings of Calvin and the Synod of Dort in 1618. First, Calvin had taught that it was wrong for a layman to baptize even in an emergency because that was a usurpation of a ministerial function and


31. Ibid, p. 46.
secondly, the idea that baptism was necessary for salvation was rejected. The only true Sacrament was infant baptism which should be administered to children of Christian parents. As we have shown in the above arguments, it is a sustainable thesis to say that the early Settlers at the Cape were served by "Sick Comforters" till 1665 when the first Minister of Religion was appointed at the Cape. He was Dominee Johan Van Arckel who formed a Consistory at the Cape that was amenable to the Amsterdam Presbytery. However, it violated the decisions taken at the Synod of Dort in that it felt it necessary to baptize the children of slaves on condition that their guardians were prepared to bring them up in the Christian faith.

We have clearly seen in the above arguments from both the historical and missiological points of view that, the analysis of these forms of Christianity should, to start with, be developed further from the Dutch tradition especially in that they arrived in South Africa before the English Settlers. In what follows we propose to concentrate on them.

4.2 Dutch Ideology and Identity

The pietist spirit of Dutch Protestantism in South Africa was based on the Kuyperian theory of the "Social Spheres" which


originated in Holland. This is the theory formulated by Abraham Kuyper who was a conservative man religiously. He postulated that the family, religion, business and science are social spheres which do not owe their existence to the state. These are independent and autonomous spheres that are ruled by the grace of God. He said that the character of government is not organic but mechanical for since sin abolished the original order of God's perfect Kingdom an external order had to be composed. Kuyper was of the view that the Government,

"is not a natural head, which organically grew from the body of the people, but a mechanical head which from without has been placed upon the trunk of the nation, .... a stick placed beside the plant to hold it up, since without it, by reason of its inherent weakness, it would fall to the ground."36

To understand how the Kuyperian theory of social spheres spread to South Africa it is necessary first to explore the Enlightenment Movement which affected the Church in Holland.

35. Ibid Lectures on Calvinism, p. 88-100.
36. Lectures on Calvinism, p. 119. (Amsterdam).
The Enlightenment (Aufklärung) indicates the first of the two periods through which modern thought has passed.37 This period can be dated from Hobbes (1588-1679) whose cultural philosophy belongs to the Renaissance. But a more critical view of the period is that the Enlightenment did not include the great works of philosophy which appeared contemporaneously with it. Although Locke (1632-1704) was connected with the movement, it was not by means of the Essay Concerning Human Understanding (1690), but it was through minor works on "rights and religion", that his relation with the movement was maintained.38 If we looked at Spinoza (1632-1677) particularly his Ethica (1677), with its Cartesian foundation, it is possible to discover that he was innocent of the movement, but in his theologico-political writings, inspired as they were by Hobbes, he takes up some of the peculiar problems. Even Hume for that matter avoided the rationalism of the Enlightenment whose principles he criticized in Dialogues Concerning Natural Religion (1777). Furthermore, Immanuel Kant's relation to the movement can be seen in his minor works on natural rights.39 According to Shaw the Enlightenment


possessed a regressive spirit according to which the age tried to return to the fundamentals. With Descartes (1596-1650) there were tendencies which revealed themselves in the desire to premise a first principle of all thinking, the *cogito, ergo sum* - I think therefore I am.

In a manner perhaps less consistent the Enlightenment insisted upon "nature" and "reason", without precisely stipulating what these ideas should denote. It should be noted that the movement contrasted things established by authority and tradition with those created through freedom and reason. Before we go on to expand the effects of this movement in Holland let us make one crucial point. This is that the consequences of contrasting authority and tradition vis-a-vis freedom and reason created two things. First an opposition to history and secondly, it instilled a belief in the eternity of the 18th century ideals. Liberating itself from the past and feeling no need for the future, the Enlightenment firmly believed that human reason was


able to solve all the problems of human kind.\textsuperscript{42} As we have already indicated, we must turn aside to consider the consequences of this movement in Holland, one of which was due to the replacement of the Calvinist orthodoxy in the teaching of theology at higher places of learning. The replacement of Calvinist orthodoxy led to a breakaway from the Reformed Church that was led by Henrick de Cock to form the separated Christian congregations, (\textit{Die Christelike Algescheide Gemeentes}) and another breakaway church was the Reformed Church under the Cross, (\textit{Die Gereformeerde Kerken Onder het Kruis}). From these two churches, the Christian Reformed Church, (\textit{Die Christelike Gereformeerde Kerken}) in Holland was born.\textsuperscript{43} Very briefly, it was this church which decided at Leiden in 1857 to send Dominee Dirk Postma to South Africa to assist the church in the Transvaal and to foster missions there.\textsuperscript{44} Deeply impressed by this appointment to the Transvaal Republic he sailed to South Africa. After his arrival in the Transvaal he immediately made contacts with the Doppers who had already become a group with their own identity in the religious life of South Africa. We will later


return to the concept of Dopperdom. Meanwhile, in the course of our exploration, we should say that the abovementioned Church secessions were not the only response to the rationalist tendencies.

According to Moodie, the pietistic Reveil emerged within the Methodist tradition. It was more concerned with the religious warmth than with the purity of doctrine. In Holland the Reveil spirit captured some intellectuals such as the Jurist Groen Van Prinsterer and the poet Nicolaas Beets. However, under the leadership of Groen Van Prinsterer and later of Abraham Kuyper who was a (Hervormde Kerk) Minister the movement shifted its religious focus from the expression of spiritual warmth to theological matters of doctrine which called for reforms within the body of the church. Of this point, Moodie says that in the new inaugural oath required of all ordinands, the synod of 1882 deliberately omitted any mention of scripture and confession. Consequently, the church lost Abraham Kuyper and his disciples to the (Gereformeerde Kerken) which became a fruitful base for Kuyper's political activities.

Kuyper, as we have indicated above, was a conservative person religiously. The Synod of Dort (1618-1619) which condemned the

46. Ibid, p. 53.
teachings of Arminius (1560-1609) had a profound theological impact upon him. He maintained that whereas "true Christianity" made the individual's salvation depend entirely upon the sovereign will of God, the Arminians made man the ultimate author of salvation and by that, he argued, minimized the glory of God. In his views about justice in society there is a discernible design that was meant to prevent each group from dominating another. He based his arguments about democracy on the doctrine of popular sovereignty which was later replaced with the Calvinistic theory of "sphere sovereignty of God" to which we have already referred in the above arguments. Especially important for us is to say how the Kuyperian social theory was transplanted to the South African culture. Three things emerge particularly clearly. Firstly, South African academics who trained at the Free University of Amsterdam transplanted the Kuyperian theory to South Africa. Very briefly, we should remember that the Free University of Amsterdam had been founded by Abraham Kuyper in 1880 on Reformed principles. From Free University, the doctrine of sovereignty in your own sphere was discernible at Potchefstroom University in South Africa. Here, J.D. du Toit, J.A. du Plessis (Theology), L.J. du Plessis (Political Science) and J.H. Van der Walt (History), to mention a few, were regarded as exponents of the South African

Kuyperianism. Secondly, the Afrikaner interpretations of the Covenant to which we will briefly refer in chapter eight is significant here particularly the concept of dopperdom to which we have already alluded in the above arguments. Dopperdom is derived from the Dutch word ("domper") which refers to something used to extinguish a candle. Dopperdom was conceptualised as something used to extinguish the new light of the Enlightenment which was a threat to Afrikanerdom. The Doppers were a conservative element of the Afrikaans community which believed that in isolation was their strength. They saw themselves as a chosen people of God. They interpreted the doctrine of election too simply that they were elected by God to establish the Kingdom of God. They used the notion of the Kingdom as a basis for the formulation of policies of racial discrimination and segregation in South Africa. The Kingdom of God was likened to the triumph of Afrikanerdom and the Blacks were not part of it. Finally and as a consequence of this interpretation, history was given a divine meaning.

The available research material indicates that the period between 1806 and the execution of Jopie Fourie for treason in 1914 is

52. Ibid, pp. 30-47.
interpreted as "a period of revelation" in Afrikaner history.\(^{53}\) The significance of this period lies in the fact that all the historical events that took place between the hereabove mentioned dates are commemorated at each National Assembly. Among those which are remembered are the Great Trek (1836) and the Battle of Blood River (1838). Of the Great Trek, Marquard has written,

"On 2nd February 1837, the year in which Queen Victoria ascended the thrown, the Grahamstown Journal published a document signed by Piet Retief, leader of one of the groups of Trekboers from the Cape Colony."\(^{54}\)

Reflecting on the above Manifesto as a whole, it simple shows that the Afrikaaner community has always been more interested in self-preservation and political power than in the liberation of all ethnic groups. True, though, that a deprived people is more conscious of its group identity.

"The Manifesto complained about the severe losses that arose from slave liberation and the lack of protection against "Caffres" in the frontier districts. It also complained about the "unjustifiable odium" which had been cast on Boers by "interested and dishonest persons under the cloak of religion."\(^{55}\)

---


Marquard's statement shows how the trekboers perceived the British Colonists in South Africa. These perceptions reproduced a theology which as we have indicated above adopted the biblical images of Israel as the basis of self-perception and identity. They fled from the English in the Cape as the Israelites had escaped from Pharaoh in Egypt. Here their biblical hermeneutic reveals that the encounter with the indigenous tribes involved a similar self-perception. They looked upon these inhabitants as unbelieving Canaanites and regarded themselves as entering into the promised land as did Israel before them. They understood themselves to be, "instruments in God's hand to put an end to plunder, murder and violence among them (the heathen)... and promote the extension of Christian civilization among thousands whose existence hitherto had been rooted in darkness." 

Alongside the above views, the defeat of a mighty Zulu Army of about 10,000 men has dominated recent discussion regarding the significance of the Afrikaner interpretations of the Covenant. It should be pointed out that the defeat of the Zulus occurred even though they were only 470 trekboers because they had prior to the encounter at the battlefield sworn a Vow to God. In spite


of some attempts by intellectuals and academics to attribute this victory to superior weapons popular Afrikaner belief still has it that God intervened that day on behalf of his Chosen People.\(^{58}\)

The belief in a God-given mission with biblical references to the Israel of Old has reinforced the Afrikaner ethnic identity with concomitant forms of exploitation and subjugation of the indigenous tribes. This was later to be justified in terms of a rigid Apartheid ideology that forbids any equality between Black and White in church and state. Here it suffices to note that although we have analysed the South African social formation in terms of its basic Reformed traditional social theory, the English tradition needs analysis as well in order to complete our understanding of the impact of colonisation.

4.3 English Ideology and Identity

The mystification of Christianity in South Africa directly reflects the divisions and contradictions of South African society. The process of mystification is grounded in three words coined in the cultural context of Europe. They are imperialism, capitalism and colonialism. These three concepts became wittingly and unwittingly points of reference for missionary legitimisation in society. They served the missionary movement in

the propagation of its identity and ideology which was inseparably bound up with the country in which the missionary agents were born and socialised. Here we should argue that this is what constitutes the English social theory. Consequently, Christian thought and practice were fragmented into contradictory actions which, as we have already indicated in this chapter, made the missionary's appearance in the eyes of the people there as one who was more in solidarity with the white colonial administration than with the Black indigenous tribes. In this way Christianity functioned ideologically in support of the dominant classes. Obsessed with his own white cultural identity and economic success, the missionary's interpretation of Christianity was relegated to a personal sphere thereby denying its relevance insofar as the fulfilment of black identity economically and politically was concerned. It could not have been otherwise for the missionary was tied to the apron of the imperial power.

Historically the word imperialism denotes a partisan of the one-time Napoleonic empire. It soon developed into a term of abuse to castigate the caesaristic pretensions of Louis Napoleon. Subsequently it was used by French opponents of Napoleon III and by the British adversaries of French rule and expansionism.

However, the term is identified here with British writers and politicians who used the term to indicate the policy of establishing a "Greater Britain" through the expansion of England into an "imperial federation" of Britain with its overseas settlements. The acquisition of a large colonial empire in Africa was associated with the belief that it was the White man's responsibility to civilize the dark Continent of Africa. In fact the white man was there to open up the territories for the economic benefits of the World. Consequently, the term imperialism was identified with British Colonialism which was often argued in economic terms by British advocates of colonial expansion who saw in an enlarged Empire a means of preserving markets in an increasingly protectionist world. We should also note that the European Continent ascribed Britain's wealth to the possession of Colonies.

We have already indicated in this chapter that Africa is rich in mineral wealth. This necessitated the emigration of British

60. Dilke, C.W. 1885 Greater Britain : Record of Travel in English-Speaking Countries During 1866 and 1867. (London : Macmillan, 1868).


subjects to South Africa particularly the casualties of the Industrial Revolution which resulted in many redundancies in Europe. As British Settlers to South Africa were accompanied by missionary Chaplains, imperialism provided an insertion of missionary agencies to the South African socio-economic culture. In fairness to the Missionary movement their objective was known to be that of saving perishing souls. However, it was nevertheless underpinned by class and race as sources of identity. The argument as it stands now persuade us to note that imperialism is also a stage of capitalism. In other words we cannot speak of South African Capitalism without the question of the imperialist stage of Capitalism.63 The World context in which capitalism developed and expanded to South Africa where it visibly expressed itself under the cloak of Christian religion and class rule is important.

The outward expansion of the capitalist mode of production from the society within which it has taken root and established its dominance always marks the imperialist stage of capitalism.64

Very briefly, this outward expansion has two forms, the export of commodities and the export of capital. The conceptual stress on the dominance of the latter in this twofold process is what identifies the Leninist theory of imperialism in which the economic aspect of imperialism is regarded as the monopoly stage of capitalism. On the basis of the contradictory fusion of banking and industrial capital to form finance capital, monopoly capital comes to dominate but not to abolish free competition. We say that the export of Capital dominates without eliminating the export of commodities from the monopoly capitalist countries. Concomitant with that in the first phase of imperialism was the political partition of the World into colonies such as South Africa as sources of raw materials for the great imperialist powers. This, as we have said, provided missionary insertion into the colonised country.

It has been our concern in the above arguments to establish how Christianity in South Africa functioned ideologically to legitimate the oppression of the dominated classes in society. It is true that the early Missionaries were dedicated servants of God whose object was to save souls. Yet, the forces of imperialism, colonialism and the traditional values, class and ethnic identity to which they referred in order to legitimate

65. Ibid, pp. 5-17.

themselves in society served to mystify the liberating character of Christianity. Consequently, in the eyes of the indigenous people, Christianity was representative of the oppressive and discriminative beliefs of the dominant classes. Furthermore, the typological analysis of the South African Church will reflect the mystification of Christianity. Whereas Jesus Christ the founder of Christianity and the head of the Church was committed to the fulfilment of human identity and liberation, this mystified form of Christianity postulated an imaginary divinity in its interpretation of human relationships.

In Dutch Reformed Christianity the tenet of original sin is the basis of the Christian principle of equality. This is paradoxically in harmony with the faith of the slave and of the oppressed. Yet, both Dutch and English social theories, by acquiescence in the status quo, reflect notions of racial exclusivity and inequality in work and worship situations. In the period 1948-1984 the English-speaking Church's life has been more segregated on a Sunday morning than during the course of the week in factories. On the other hand, the entire religious order in the White Dutch Reformed Churches has been strengthened by the Afrikaner Covenant theology. Basically, however, it suffered from a theological limitation. The Covenant order established in Israel through Moses was an embodiment of obedience to God and freedom to all tribes and Nations. It is superseded by the new Covenant order established by the death of Jesus Christ through whose creative
act of love we are all reconciled to God. Here there is the liberation of the whole identity in union with God through Jesus Christ.

In the above arguments we have examined the problem of religious ideologies of identity in South Africa. However, in the following chapter we intend to focus on land and see whether it was of any significance in the self-perceptions of both Black and White identities during the early years of encounter in the tribal settings of South Africa.
CHAPTER FIVE
LAND AND THE DENUDATION OF AFRICAN IDENTITY

Oral tradition reaffirms the importance of Land to the indigenous Black tribes in South Africa.¹ Land is defined as a space and surface upon which the natural environment, which includes access to forests, plains, hills, rock valleys, mountains, sunlight, rainfall, wind, soil and so on. In fact it is a space and surface upon which the whole natural vegetation takes place. The land may have different climates ranging from hot to cold, humid to dry. Furthermore, it is a factor of production in economic process comparable to labour and capital.² Land directly reflects the divisions and contradictions of the South African Society in two related processes, namely, the Religious Communal Land process and the Religious Capitalist Land Process. We intend to show how these processes reflected the importance of land as an issue around which all other issues converge. The proposition is that the conflicts between Black and White over land in South Africa should be examined in the context of the ideologies of communalism and capitalism. There was a clash of

1. See Cassette Number 1001.
two ideological conceptions over the question of land. Yet, there is in theological terms a conception of God which when properly understood by faith, views the land as that which belongs to God alone. Sometimes this conception reflects itself in ideologies as something which transcends them.

The indigenous Black people of South Africa, in particular the Xhosa, perceived land as something sacred and identifiable with the ancestors. The analytical study of Gods and divinities and their relationship to the Supreme Being indicates that God is the first Ancestor who owns the lands. The Xhosa could not distinguish between the sacred and the secular. Their religious view of the world was monistic. On the basis of this conception of reality land was communally-owned and inalienable. Communalism which refers to sharing of what one has received from the land was the characteristic feature of the life of the indigenous tribes. It ensured unity and solidarity of the clan and tribe; hence sacrifices to the ancestral spirits were important in the life of an individual and the community as a whole.

However the ideological imperatives of capitalism largely but not completely eroded the communal structure of the African Tribal society. By a process of what we shall call "denudation" the Black tribes were stripped of their land. This process reached a peak in the enactment of the 1913 and 1936 Land Acts which demarcated South Africa into "black" and "white". The process of
denudation was carried out in stages designed to meet the needs of three successive modes of production: first, slavery which was abolished in the nineteenth century South Africa; second, feudalism which took the form of "squatting" and "labour tenancy" by blacks on white farms; third, capitalism which evolved a centre-periphery structure in order to keep the wealth in White hands. These three modes of production encouraged the emergence of ideologies of "racial" difference and promoted the development of institutions based on racial discrimination. First, let us examine the communal land process which was the indigenous state of traditional African society.

5.1 The Religious Communal Land Process

The religious communal land process may be understood as that in which land is communally-owned - and not alienable in order to ensure unity and solidarity of the group. Basically land is conceived as that which belongs to the ancestors.³ The land constitutes the wholeness of one's being; without it identity is depleted and depersonalized.

There are two concepts which underpin our understanding of land. These are sacred and unity. The former refers to that which is worthy of religious veneration and whose violation constitutes a sacrilege. The latter refers to the state of being one in spirit and commitment with the family and community. We have said that the African tradition perceives the land as sacred as it belongs to the ancestors and the family. But we may here critique the notion of the sacredness of the land which derives from the ancestors by saying that the ancestors are not God, by which we mean a Supreme Being whom people worship as creator and ruler of the universe. In God: Ancestor or Creator (1970), Harry Sawyerr concludes that the African does regard God as his first ancestor. This theory is supported by the fact that among many people the name used for God is essentially the same as that used for ancestor. This is a conception of God, which when properly understood, conceives God as the first ancestor as well as a supra-human deity and the collective noun for the abode of the spirits. The ancestors are intermediaries between God and man. If the land belongs to the ancestral spirits we may then say that it belongs to God who is the first ancestor. It is difficult to define the ancestral spirits. Difficult as it may be the "gods" and "divinities" may give us a clue as to what is meant by spiritual beings. There are two categories of spiritual beings.

In the first place, there is the group which comprises those who used to be people on Earth and, secondly, those who were created from the beginning as spirit beings. It has been observed that in traditional religions of Southern Africa and Central Africa there is little mention of gods while in West Africa there are extensive pantheons and to a lesser extent this is true of East Africa.\(^5\) On the other hand, the largest concentration of divinities is to be found among the Yoruba who have more than 1700 of them. But we should point out that they have a far less developed ancestor cult. The reason for this may well be that the spirit world of the Yoruba and Ewe is already overpopulated with divine beings so that there is little room for an extensive ancestor-cult.\(^6\)

The most difficult thing to establish analytically is the precise relationship and connection between these divinities and the Supreme Being. Some appear as his wives.\(^7\) In our view many others might be regarded as bifurcations of the Supreme Being, each with a special area designated as its sphere of activity. They may also be regarded as the mouthpiece of the Supreme Being who acts as intermediary between the creator and his creation.


It should be maintained that their existence derives from God himself. They have no authority in their own right. However, they may constitute a threat to the Supreme Being's position and his absolute sovereignty. The more an emphasis is laid on their activities, the further into the background the high God is relegated until He becomes a deus otiosus, a passive God. This religious attitude may create a situation where the majority of sacrifices can be offered to the divinities instead of God. However, the African affirms the omnipresence of God who owns the land and the family in two related ways.

First, he does this by associating his name with the place where the spirits live. The African tradition believes that the spirit world operates under the surface of the Earth and consequently God must be located there. For example, the (Kamba) name for God, (Mulungu), has a locative form which is (Mulunguni), which means, "the place of God". Secondly, in addition to the


and also, Concepts of God in Africa, p. 16.

idea of God located in the underworld, there is the belief that he also lives above the Earth. For example, when the (Xhosa) prays for the rain he would say, (Thixo ophezu komhlaba), God above the Earth, give us rain, (Kwabaphezu Komhlaba), to those above the Earth. Traditionally the (Xhosa) perceived God as a god of nature, that is, a monistic, immediate world-affirming Supreme Being who encompassed both the sacred and secular making a holistic approach to life. Therefore land is both sacred and ordinary. But in the holistic approach to life, the sacredness of land transcends that which is ordinary. The transcendental notion of land derives from the fact that land is the abode of the spirits. As Barrett put it,

"The recently-deceased family ancestors are regarded as still inhabiting the family land. They exercise control over the living; all life exists under their surveillance."

This analysis is based on several presuppositions, the most basic of which we have already referred to, namely, that the conflicts between Black and White over land in the South African context should be examined in the context of ideologies of communalism.

and capitalism. For an African to say that the land belongs to the ancestors and has therefore assumed a sacred character reveals an ideological system of beliefs which when tempered with depletes identity. The belief is that land ensures the continuity of the past with the present and future, of the known and unknown. Ideologically, the land does not belong to an individual; it stands for my identity in a communal sense. It is the place in which the bones of my kin group and ancestors are buried. The Xhosa refer to them as, (abaphantsi), those who are underneath.\(^{14}\) The second presupposition in the religious conception of land is the notion of unity and solidarity which is basically related to the sacred in the sense that it is the ancestors who effect the unity of the family and community through sacrifices. In chapter two, we said that the blood that flows into the ground at circumcision is regarded as a libation for the ancestors. It unites the initiate with the soil and his ancestors. We also showed the importance of sacrifices. Therefore, it is our view that Blacks can effect contact with the ancestral Spirits who inhabit the land through sacrifices. This can be seen in the practices of sacrifice in which the officiating priest at the Ceremony of sacrifice is usually the head of the family and in those occasions when the tribe as a whole is involved he will be a Chief, (Inkosi).\(^{15}\) The sacrifice

\(^{14}\) See The Glossary of words used in the text.

\(^{15}\) See The Glossary of words used in the text.
is at once an offering to the ancestral spirits and a communal meal with them. The meat is placed on the ground for them and beer, (utywala), poured out as a libation.\textsuperscript{16} The spirits desire to be remembered. They want their names to survive. They wish to be informed of planned journeys and household affairs.\textsuperscript{17} The Chief, (inkosi), as the head of the tribe, acts as a priest at the communal sacrificial ceremony. The importance of the chief lies in the allocation of land to the members of the community through the male lineage according to patterns of kinship relations. Kinship is understood here not in any strict biological sense but rather in terms of a pattern of social genealogy.\textsuperscript{18}

In the South African social formation between 1948 and 1984, the religious communal land process that emphasised the significance of African culture was a feature of the life of the Homelands. Cattle were the value which drew into a unified value cluster such elements as, economic, political and patrilineal inheritance rules. The value included ideas about the nutritive value of milk, blood, beef and the bride-wealth in marriage.\textsuperscript{19} But above all, the value of cattle was identified with the significance of

\textsuperscript{16} See The Glossary of words used in the text.

\textsuperscript{17} Mbiti, J.S. Concepts of God in Africa.

\textsuperscript{18} Barry Hindess and Paul Q. Hirst, Pre-Capitalist Modes of Production, (Boston, Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1975), pp. 73-74.

\textsuperscript{19} See Chapter Three on Marriage and Family.
land in that cattle were used for tilling the lands which were communally owned and not alienable.

"The rights of tribesmen over the land are ... usufructuary and are not absolute. This stems from the tradition that the Chief holds all tribal land in trust for those who owe political allegiance to him." 20

The allocation of such lands within the Kinship relations was also determined by marriage, for land applications were accepted on condition that the young man was married.

"Each tribesman ordinarily received from the Chief at marriage a homestead allotment for his residence and an arable allotment for cultivation, polygamous obtaining additional allotments for each wife." 21

Although there was division of labour at an African homestead, Sansom observed that both men and women produced crafts. 22

---


and sorghum were planted in the fields by simple agricultural methods. There was time for the cultivation of lands. The new arable land was cleared by burning techniques, usually by men. The main agricultural tool was the hoe, (igaba), though the plough, (ikhuba), was used for tilling such lands in some districts. There was also land set aside as a commonage for grazing the cattle. It was from this common pasturage where cow dung, (ubulongwe), wood, (inkuni), for fuel and building the homestead were collected.

There was a group identity which was held together by participation and the helping of one another. There was a spirit of unity and concord in the sense that,

"Anybody with a big task on hand with which he and his household alone cannot cope, or which he wishes to complete reasonably soon, will invite his neighbours and friends to help him. He brews a large quantity of beer, or slaughters an animal, and makes it known that with these he will entertain all those coming to work with him on a certain day. Anybody wishing to do so can take part and receive his share in the feast." 27

24. Hunter, M. 1961 Reaction to Conquest, p. 73.
25. Ibid, p. 73; and also the Glossary of Xhosa Words; See also Sansom, "Traditional Economic Systems", p.169.
These were work parties, (*amalima*), which were convened for planting and hut-building, hoeing and reaping. They generally assumed reciprocity, that is, "if I attend your work party, I expect you to attend mine." The allocation of the land which was determined by marriage along Kinship lines was a bond which united the members of the group to each other. The members perceived each other as being possessed by the sacredness inherent in the land. The practice of team work served to exert a cohesive influence upon, and solidified the group identity.

The above analysis has shown a natural development from the conception of land as a possession of the ancestors who pass it onto the chiefs for distribution to the community according to the kinship lineage. This development is marked by a series of gradual changes that succeed one another in a relatively fixed way that lead to a fulfilment of one's identity in a communal sense. We see this as a religious action which sought fellowship by the intensification of the existing social fabric of family and kinship relations.

---

28. The Glossary of Words used in the text.

However, this religious communal land process was by 1984 largely, but not completely eroded in the South African homelands. It went through a painstaking process of denudation. Denudation is used here to refer to the stripping of all covering by taking away that which is fundamental and significant in one's identity. In fact, there is a discernible transformation trend of denudation that runs like a thread of corruption through the South African culture. This goes back to the time when the white alien forces encountered the indigenous tribes of South Africa and reached its peak in the 1913 and 1936 Land Acts. In what follows, we wish to concentrate on the above mentioned Acts by explaining the way in which they denuded black identity.

They established the principle of racial segregation in regard to the ownership of the land within the South African social formation. They both set aside only 13% of land to be occupied by the Blacks, leaving 87% to be occupied by the Whites exclusively. The 1913 Land Act in particular demarcated certain areas to be "reserves" for the Black people and forbade the


transfer to or lease of land by other races within the reserves. Although the Blacks dominated South Africa numerically they were squeezed into the reserves and prohibited from acquiring land elsewhere. The process of denudation marked a turning point in the relation between Black and White on the question of land.32 Three things underpinned the process of denudation. First, the process was designed to serve the interests of the white race in consolidating white possession of land. Secondly, it was designed to reduce to a proletarian status the emerging Black independent peasantry whose identity was inextricably bound up with land in order that they should serve the needs of white labour in the mining industry.33 The government imposed taxes on the head of each African homestead, (umzi).34 The consequences of this were that he would send his sons out to work in order to earn money to pay the hut-tax. As this was collected from all the males of a certain age it forced more family members to go out in search of work. The African people were weaned from the Kraal economy where all resources were controlled by the family head. This then destroyed the economic independence of the African peasantry and further depleted their identity. Finally, the consequences of the 1913 Native Land Act frustrated the early development of an African "Kulak" class which was evolving

32. Ibid, p. 127.
33. Ibid, p. 129.
34. See The Glossary of Words used in the text.
its own identity in the "white" rural areas of South Africa.\textsuperscript{35} The 1913 process of denudation maintained a degree of continuity with the 1936 Land Act which further consolidated the land laws. The degree of continuity was maintained in that the 1936 Land Act was devised to "settle once and for all" the racial land division of 1913. It forbade Africans in the Cape from acquiring land outside the thirteen percent set aside for their occupation in the reserves. The law empowered the local native commissioners to reduce the number of land tenants resident on any white-owned farm to "the estimated labour requirements of that farm". The continuative Native Land Act of 1936 was enforced by the ideology of Apartheid. Between 1948 and 1984 the Land Act had devastating effects on Black identity. The most severe of these was the removal of Black people from their old established residential areas to be relocated on lands adjoining the homelands.\textsuperscript{36} The areas from which they came were declared "black spots" which constituted a violation of racial territorial residential separation of South Africa.\textsuperscript{37}


\textsuperscript{37} Ibid, pp. 60-80.
To be detached from the lands in which your fathers and ancestors are buried is tantamount to a depletion of personal identity by severing connection with the dead. This depersonalization was twofold in that some of those uprooted were then dumped in areas where there was no accessible pasturage while others were relocated to areas accessible to arable lands. In view of great numbers some had access to unsuitable lands only whose annual crop yields always proved to be a disaster. With the declining of the poor lands and crops, many people left the reserves to seek work in "white" South Africa. Consequently, the migratory labour system continued to gather momentum while the denudation process was eroding African identity in the reserves.

There was also limitation placed upon livestock which was a result of the reduction of grazing commonages. It had three effects on African identity. First, it made it virtually impossible for young men to pay dowry, (lobola), by means of cattle. Instead money was used for paying (lobola). However,


39. Muriel Horrell, 1973 The Africa Homelands of South Africa. (Johannesburg, South African Institute of Race Relations), pp. 84-99; and also Govan Mbeki, the Peasant's Revolt, p. 68.

40. See Chapter Two of this work.

41. See The Glossary of Words used in the text.
this was foreign to African identity. In the eyes of the African people it was not only an assault on their culture but it also served to disfigure their identity which had always been rooted in family unity underscored by the (lobola) custom. Secondly, it legitimized "the let us live together for a while" types of marriages, (masihlalisane), as some homesteads had neither cattle nor sufficient money with which to pay lobola for their sons. Thirdly, the denudation of African identity also brought about a radical change in the role of Chiefs and Headmen in the reserves. In the first place the state government appointed ethnologists who determined who belonged to the "royal house" and who should be the next Chief. Of course, this had a profound effect on the indigenous social determination of the royal genealogy which had ensured the responsibility of the chief to the tribe and clan. However, they still allocated lands to the community but no longer on the basis of kinship relations but by a government-approved scheme. In this way African identity was further eroded. Furthermore, the state introduced programmes which were not only designed to limit the stock but also to make fundamental changes in the distribution of land. Given the importance of cattle for ploughing and (lobola), Black people were told to reduce their cattle to a mere handful. Given also

the declining pasturage, there was overstocking which caused soil erosion. Furthermore, the state imposed limits on stock ownership, particularly by Africans relocated in Settlement Areas. They were prohibited from rearing cattle. The denudation of African identity in the way in which we have explained above increased the supply of a cheap Black labour force in South Africa in two ways. On the one hand, it increased the supply of black labour force in the mining industry by enforcing the migratory labour system. On the other hand, Black women had to leave their homestead, (imizi), to work on White farms and households in the cities. In this way the social institution of Black domestic work, (ukusebenza emakhishini), in South Africa was strengthened.

All in all, when considering the religious communal land process, we have argued that the focus of African identity on land can be best understood as an ideology of communalism underscored by the concepts of the sacred and tribal unity. However, we maintained the view that the sacredness of land transcends that which is


44. Govan Mbeki, The Peasants Revolt, p. 97.

45. See The Glossary.

46. See The Glossary.
mundane in that the land belonged to the ancestral spirits whose responsibility was to maintain the solidarity and cohesion of African communities. We said that the land in African tradition was communally-owned and not alienable. The Chiefs had authority to allocate areas of land to the community through male lineage patterns of kinship relations. We have suggested that from 1948 to 1984 this was the constitutional aspect of the African homelands which are an integral part of the South African social formation. Regrettably, the government policy of labour and land management seriously eroded the fundamental religious and economic unity of the tribe thereby depleting African identity.

Within this conceptual framework, denudation can be seen to function as a critical principle which locates the fundamental social nexus between Black and White in South Africa. As a critical principle, the concept of denudation enables us to perform the task of prophetic denunciation demanded of a people in pilgrimage. The denudation of Black identity in South Africa has been largely due to the religious capitalist land process upon which we now propose to concentrate.

5.2 The Religious Capitalist Land Process

The religious capitalist land process may be conceptualized as that which believes in private ownership of land as a means of production. It enforces the individualizing tendencies promoted by capitalism and motivated by an ethical and religious drive to succeed as a visible proof of the benefits of Christianity. It
is difficult to give an explanation of the rise of capitalism. Difficult as it seems to be two arguments have been used as historical explanations.

First, the Marxian contribution has been the analysis of the social and economic transformations that took place in the passage from the Middle Ages to the modern era. 47  This argument has contributed to the understanding of the breakdown of the feudal closed society and the growth of the urban centres. This process has created free labour and when coupled with the new technological breakthroughs and with the discovery of the rich overseas has produced favourable conditions for a capitalist economy on a large scale. Secondly, the Weberian arguments assert that these transformations could not explain the typical capitalist mentality that emerged as a dominant characteristic of the bourgeoisie as the class sustaining the new activity. For a mentality of devoted and morally purposive hard work, wealth producing for the sake of economic aggrandizement could not be explained as a natural outcome of either traditional greedy capitalism or of new economic developments reflected in the minds of the people. 48 The traditional dominant orientation towards work, according to Weber, has been characterised by the few to

47. Weber, M. 1930  The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism, Chapter 1, p. 75.

attempt to accumulate wealth in order to spend luxuriously. It would seem that modern capitalism involved an ethical spirit, and ideal typical set of orientations, that gave to the capitalist activity moral purpose and this may be contrasted with the values of traditionalism.

The above arguments indicate that capitalism is basically associated with industrialisation and transformations in the mode of production. In the South African religious capitalist land process, we may draw parallels between Western social and economic factors and their Marxist interpretation by analysing three concepts. First, slavery on the basis of which the religious capitalist land process further developed its understanding of possession and economy. Slaves are people who are owned and utilised like animals to provide the labour needed for others to develop higher forms of culture and standards of living. In South Africa slaves produced wine and grain. With the abolition of slavery in the nineteenth century there arose a rural proletariat of slaves who had received manumission. Secondly, feudalism refers to a system in which society is divided into the aristocracy, mainly landlords who own large

areas of land, and peasants who occupy and work land paying a rent in cash or kind. They live on the land on a contract basis. Third, capitalism believes in private ownership of the means of production. Here there is free enterprise and free competition on the basis of the market mechanism. These three modes of production encouraged the rise of "racial" ideologies and evolved institutions based on statutory racial discrimination.

The constitutive aspects of white farms between 1948-1984 in South Africa depleted black identity and were "feudal" in ideology. The conditions of existence on the land were those of squatting and labour tenancy. Squatters were Africans who lived on white farms, cultivated crops and grazed cattle on a plot of land and paid rent in cash or kind to white farmers. They occupied the land but had no rights to the lands or to security of tenure. These squatters may be regarded as feudal peasants from whom feudal labour was extracted in the form of rent in kind by white feudal lords who could only own land outside the reserves. In some cases squatting also took the form of


share-cropping. The African squatters not only produced maize and wheat on their plots but also grazed cattle. In view of the fact that they were only allowed to keep a few cattle on the lands there was always a struggle between them and their landlords.

Labour tenants were Africans resident on white farms who did labour services for the white farmers.

"Labour tenants occupy white farms or portions thereof, and are given land for grazing and or ploughing, in return for which they and members of their families are obliged to work for the landlord for a certain number of days annually .... The period of obligatory labour could be anything from three to nine months. Like squatters, labour tenants have no security of tenure on the land that they farm and occupy it at the will of the landlord farmer."

The above citation indicates that African labour tenants may also be regarded as feudal peasants whose rent took the form of corvee labour. The distribution of land in South Africa was determined by the 1913 Native Land Act and the Native Trust and Land Act of 1936. We have indicated earlier that these Acts demarcated South Africa into "white" South Africa and the African reserves later

57. See H. Joffe, "Rural Resettlement", p. 16.
referred to as "homelands". Because the land allocated to Africans was inadequate to support the Black population resident there, Africans had in effect to become feudal peasants in order to gain access to land on which to grow crops and graze cattle. Whereas the land owned in "White" South Africa was privately owned and alienable, it was also feudal property insofar as Africans could not obtain access by buying it. Rather they had to become feudal peasants in order to obtain access.

The laws governing both squatting and labour tenancy depersonalized and depleted Black identity in several ways. The most important of these was that the South African feudal system extracted its excess income from the peasants. The law stated that white farmers should register squatters by paying a registration fee. Once registered as a squatter on a white farm, an African was bound like a serf to that farm and was not permitted to go elsewhere without the consent of the farmer. This served to prohibit squatters from moving from farm to farm in search of lower rents. This seems to have been the normal practice in South Africa, the Native Servant Contract Act of 1932 states that: (1) the peasant was obliged to perform an annual 180 days of work for the farmer. The farmer was entitled to refuse

him leave to earn wages in the town if the farmer found it profitable to do so. (2) No one was entitled to hire a peasant if he lacked a pass certifying that he had leave from the farmer, or if his pass had expired (3) Should a farmer sell his land, the peasant would pass to the new owner along with that land (4) The peasant might be punished by being caned for infringing this law, impudence towards his master, or for negligence towards his work. 60

The state maintained this feudal system in as much as the squatter and tenant registration fees mentioned above were transferred to the State. 61 This system was later largely, but not completely, eroded as a constitutive aspect of White farming in South Africa. First, urbanisation after the Second World War tended to attenuate squatting and labour tenancy in South Africa in that there was then a demand for a larger supply of Black labour in capitalist agriculture. 62 Secondly, urbanisation necessitated steps to be taken by the State to reduce squatting and tenancy. This was done by amending the Native Trust and Land


Act in 1952 and by putting a fifteen year limit on squatting.63 Registration fees for both squatters and labour tenants were increased. Furthermore, the enactment of the Bantu Laws Amendment Act in 1964 forbade any new labour tenants on farms. It set up Labour Tenant Control Boards to monitor the number of tenant contacts each farm could have.64 Thousands of squatters and tenants were removed to the homelands where they registered and were classified as "farm workers" which meant that they were not entitled to higher wage in any employment in South Africa.65 However, in my view, the partial erosion of this system helped to increase the supply of cheap Black labour in the mines of South Africa as the migratory labour system gained in momentum during the period under review.66 Although there are still White farmers in South Africa who may be classified as feudal lords, the demands for labour power brought about a gradual change from these feudal modes of production to the capitalist modes of production.


In the South African socio-economic context during the 1948-1984 period, a centre-periphery model is applicable. The terms "centre" and "periphery" are derived from geometry. They are the two main dimensions of a circle. The geometrical concept of the centre is just a point while that of the periphery is a line. We use the concept of centre to refer to a group of people who have a high concentration of economic power and periphery is referred to a group of people who lack power relatively speaking. Our argument is that what has made the centre different from the periphery in South African socioeconomic terms is the distribution of land and economic wealth between the two. In this thesis we looked at the 1913 and 1936 Native Land Acts which demarcated the whole of South Africa into "white" and "black". As a consequence of this demarcation the principle that "white" is the centre of wealth in the sense that the wealth should remain permanently in their hands was entrenched. Furthermore the discovery of diamonds and gold concentrated the centre of wealth in that in the gold mining industry there arose a management class which was largely white and of immigrant origin whose beliefs were that South Africa should remain white-controlled.

In order for it to remain white-controlled, a centre of economic wealth was brought into being by Cecil Rhodes who established the

67. See Oxford Dictionary of the English Language.
De Beers Company with the capital participation of Rothschild in order to monopolise diamond mining. This Centre could never have been completed without gold whose production was shared among eight mining houses to promote common interest in the Chamber of Mines with Consolidated Gold Fields (Rhodes) and Wernher-Eckstein (Corner House). Frankel in *Capital Investment in South Africa* (1938) has said that during the 1887 and 1913 period, some £125 million was invested from abroad in gold-mining alone from Britain and Europe. The mining industry was not only the central point of the dominance of the capitalist mode of production but was also a place at which workers could put pressure on the management to change the conditions under which they worked. The mining industry as a central focus of economic power was safeguarded by the state in its social policy. This was the case before World War I and after World War II, and particularly during the era of Apartheid which represents a high degree of continuity with the earlier policy of segregation. The Land Acts and their consequent denudation reduced the independent status of the Black people so that they be of greater service to the centre. Consequently the demand for labour power in the Centre rose during the 1950's and 1960's as a result of the transition from a feudal mode of production to the capitalist process.

The transition was accompanied by large-scale migration of the peasants from the Periphery to the Centre. The peripheral groups such as Blacks either on the farms or reserves were reduced to the status of cheap labour for the centre in three ways. First, "colour bars" and "job reservations" put constraints on what kind of productive employment they could undertake. Second, the Physical Planning and Resources Act of 1967 provided for the delineation of "controlled" areas wherein employers had to obtain ministerial approval for the addition of their labour force after 1968. Furthermore, it specified that any new or additional employment of wage labourers had to follow a certain racial quota which meant that no more than five Blacks for every two White employers. The centre embodied the state's repressive apparatus of police, army, prisons, courts, which coerced cheap and unskilled Black workers to come to the centre for employment. Laws which perpetuated capitalism were enacted. For example, the Industrial Conciliation Act of 1924, the Masters and Servants Act, the Native Labour Settlement


Disputes Act of 1911. Basically, these Acts were enacted to maintain a Centre-Periphery Model.  

We have drawn insights from our centre-periphery model which indicate that the development of capitalism in South Africa has always been bound up with a centre of white economic concentration of wealth and land with concomitant erosion of the economic independence of the communal societies. In this way we can understand Apartheid as a system for maintaining a cheap and controlled Black labour force. However, the ideology of the centre maintained by the state has the consequence that the periphery in South Africa is stagnant and inferior to the Centre in economic terms. The centre "underestimates the degree of commercialization which is possible in rural areas as well as the degree of accumulation in peasant enterprise." In what we have is a situation in which all forms of extra-economic coercion are employed in order to transform the periphery into a cheap labour force beneficial to capital at the centre.

It has been our concern in this chapter to show that the legal, central and management of land in South Africa directly reflects


two ideologies, namely, Communalism and Capitalism. The two interpretative insights of the religious communal land process (R.C.L.P.) and the religious capitalist land process (R.C.L.P.) underlines in our view the significance of value systems in the creation of ideologies of identity. The racial conflicts of the ideologies of identity over the question of Land were necessitated by the divergent value system to which each racial group was attached. There emerged what is referred to in sociological terms as "group conflicts" which arise as a result of each group having developed its identity consciousness. The values in the process of socialization follow a logical pattern and form a system. We may speak of a society's dominant value system which refers to the values adopted and practised by the majority in a particular system. The value system plays a major role in the maintenance of identity by legitimating the more particularized norms of behaviour. 73

Identity is legitimated on a transcendental level such as we have seen in the case of land. Therefore, religion is related to the question of land and has sought to satisfy the quest for the meaning of life by reference to a transcendental order so as furthermore to provide answers to the question of why people adhere to certain life-styles. 74 In the process of

internalization values are taken up into the human consciousness to become part of identity. Values do not exist apart from norms. They are inseparable as are the two sides of a coin. It is through norms that values are put into action.  

Granted the above analysis of land and the denudation of traditional African identity which led to the creation of a centre periphery structure in South Africa, it would appear that something underscores the South African social structure. At this juncture, however, it is difficult to pinpoint that which can be regarded as a fundamental variable. Difficult as it appears to be we intend in the next chapter to review the South African social structure in order to find its underpinnings.

We turn in this chapter to the investigation of what lies beneath the South African social structure. Should Apartheid be explained with reference to either race or class or to a combination of both. This chapter is developed in two sections. The first section concentrates on the variables of race and class. The second section examines the concepts of education in relation to the social structures.

6.1 The Unmasking of Social Structures

The Xhosa oral tradition, which has been handed down from father to son, tells of time immemorial when Black and White lived together as brothers and sisters in a society in which the colour of the skin was of no significance at all. However, it is difficult to specify the exact dates in South African historiography in which this was the practice in view of the present prevailing racial climate which serves to obscure in many respects the true picture of those days of peaceful co-existence. We may agree with the above tradition, but we cannot do this without at least unmasking South African social structures in

1. See unpublished information: No. 1002 CASSETTE.
order to search out and possibly identify that which fundamentally constitutes them through an examination of two opposing views, the first of which characterizes South Africa as basically racist and the second as suffering fundamentally from class consciousness.

For the context we may consider the following citations:

(1) "The main principle of social distinctions is not economic but ... racial. It would be absurd for instance not to realize that in South Africa racial differences determine the entire organization of Society."  

According to the above citation, the variable of race is what underpins the South African social structure. Therefore race should be perceived as a starting point in political and historical formulations. We utilize race to determine a person's identity and how we should relate to him. The utilization of race as a fundamental variable in South African historical analysis has given rise to problems in studying South Africa. However, there has been some opposing arguments such as that advanced by Johnstone:

(2) "... this racial system may be most adequately explained as a class system

- as a system of class instruments ... generated, and determined in its specific nature and functions, by the specific system of production and class structure of which it formed part; and that these historical developments may most adequately be explained in terms of this explanation, and tend to confirm, as historical manifestation, the class nature of this system and thus the validity of this explanation."

While the latter citation merits further explication, the former constitutes an objection to the position we want to defend, namely, that underlying the South African structure, there is a discernible functional congruity and dependance between the political and economic systems. Apartheid can be best explained with reference to class constituted in part along racial lines. Of course, race cannot be ruled out as part of the explanation because it has been used to justify Black subordination and oppression. But, in view of the fact that race is only a special case of more general social facts and moreover, the general theory of race is non-existent, it is my contention that class must be given primacy over race. Furthermore, we contend that race relations should be examined within the whole institutional and cultural context of society. The foregoing arguments


indicate our uneasiness about race as a fundamental variable of explanation. However, certain scholars would dispute this thesis by explaining South African social structure exclusively with reference to race. As in the case of Adam, the explanation offered has not provided "an entirely satisfactory or agreed new conceptual framework." 5

Whilst we challenge that the race thesis is unsustainable, it appears that it can nevertheless provide us with insight into race relationships in the years of Black and White encounter at the Cape. The mode of thought at the original Refreshment station at the Cape in South Africa was European insofar as the attitudes of Whites towards non-Whites were concerned. The European settlers believed that there was a divisive wall between a heathen and a Christian. 6 The specific embodiment of this thought was reflected in the idea that the Blacks were either "lost souls", in which case it was the Christian duty to rescue them, or were "savages and pagans", in which case they were probably born to be slaves. The distinction between Black and


White was basically religious. Baptism was the essential requirement for entry into the white community.\(^7\)

For our thesis the religious distinction is highly significant as MacCrone points out. For MacCrone, however, with the passage of time and because race attitudes are the products of the internalised values and norms of a particular group, the centre of gravity of influence on social behaviour moved. Each of these moves intensified racial prejudice, so much that, a wall of prejudice between Black and White became gradually stronger. Consequently race relations were placed on a different footing with tendencies that were in favour of the White at the expense of the indigenous tribes.\(^8\) These arguments do not suffice to rule out the possibility of a class explanation. True, they seem to have the force to persuade us that race is an important factor in the analysis of the South African social structure, but this is not the same as saying that one must indulge in the more total reductionism advocated, among many others, by Adam which perceives race as an independent variable of explanation.

However, the Xhosa oral tradition to which we referred earlier in this thesis is underlined by MacCrone's views that in the early white settlement at the Cape the skin pigmentation was of no

---

significance at all. But Jordan has argued that the racial situation in the Cape at the time can be better understood with reference to England and other Protestant and Anglo-Saxon settings.

"the concept embodied in the word Christian embraced so much more meaning than was contained in the specific doctrinal affirmations that it is scarcely possible to assume on the basis of this linguistic contrast that the Colonists set the Negroes apart because they were heathen ... From the first, then .... to be Christian was to be civilized rather than barbarous, English rather than Africa, white rather than black." 9

Genovese, who has identified racism in the slavery modes of production, holds that wherever slaveholding classes were of bourgeois rather than seigneurial origins, a general tendency towards more intense racism was found. Historically, Protestantism and Capitalism first emerged in the Anglo-Saxon World in which the somatic norm of image was distanced from black. However, we do not deny some validity to the assertion of a biological and aesthetic dimension to racism. 10 We are of the view that the South African way of life had transmitted greater inherent tendencies towards rigid racial definition than in the

Catholic Latin American situations. The two-class conception of man in Calvinism was the worst form of this. Of those interested in this area of study, Loubser has done more than most in pointing out that the situations in which Calvinists were confronted with a large population of different cultural background (who were defined as less civilized, and where two-class categorization was prevalent) were not categorised in terms of skin pigmentation.11

In South Africa racism has been explained in a variety of ways. Missiologically, there is the often made reference of "the Children of Ham" which is used as a justification of Black inequality. Studying this reference within the context of Negro blackness, two points should be made. First, that there is a detectable indication of it in early Jewish texts with casual references in St. Jerome and St. Augustine. Subsequently, it re-emerged in the Christian writings of overseas exploration in the first century. Second, the "Curse of Ham" could be linked with slavery and with Dutch literature of the seventeenth century.12 Van Jaarsveld makes it clear that the reference was made by the Church Council of Drakenstein when it wrote to the


Convocation of Amsterdam in 1703. In that documentation it is stated that they wished to convert the Khoi, "so that the children of Ham would no longer be the servants of bondsmen."
The convocation approved of the reference and said that, "one day God would lift the curse from the generation of Ham." Though Jordan may have overstated his case that the research of the reference has been neglected, he is right to say that,

"The old idea of Ham's curse floated ethereally about the colonies without anyone's seeming to attach great importance to it; one Anglican Minister asserted that Negroes were indeed descended from Ham ... but much more often the idea was mentioned by antislavery advocates for purposes of refutation."

The Afrikaner ideas, derived originally from the Great Chain of Being, regard the Khoi as a "Schepsel" that is a heathen regarded as less than human, but not falling under the category of animals. He is a creature not as yet known elsewhere. It is obviously questionable to assert that human beings who have different cultures and colours are less human than those who have a white skin pigmentation, especially if, as the available evidence seems to suggest, the primary purpose is subjugation.

Creation from the inanimate things through forms of life to man and thence to the myriad ranks of heavenly creatures, was conceived as a ranking, but one without gaps, so that the gradations between ranks were merely subtle attractions. Man himself could be ranked on this scale though there were confusions. But, inevitably, one method came to be racial. Historians themselves have, however, included a "race factor" as an essential ingredient in their analysis, as the following extract from Petty's research illustrates:

"there be others more considerable, that is, between the Guiny Negroes and the Middle Europeans; and of the Negroes between those of Guiny and those who live about the Cape of Good Hope, which last are the most beastlike of all the souls of man with whom our travellers are well acquainted."16

Of course the lowest "men" on the scale were separated from the uppermost "beasts" by only the most subtle gradation, an argument which leads to the above-mentioned concept of "Schepsel", the inferior, intermediate being.

Implicit in the foregoing arguments is a concept of group which as we argued in Chapter two, implied the community of selves. In the process of socialization the individual behaviour is always

affected by the social environment without which no learning can take place. The internalisation of values acquired in the process locates one into a group. The group-consciousness underscored by values and norms, as we indicated also in Chapter Five, implies greater resistance in thought and principle to those who are outside the group. But greater resistance fosters greater group consciousness. It may be argued that the encounter between Black and White led to the formation of a group-identity, which during the course of time, hardened into a racial ideology. Because religion was more significant than the colour of the skin in the attitudes of white European Settlers towards the indigenous tribes, it suffices to note that group identity tended to include and exclude. 17 The latter tendency reflects the social structure of modern South Africa in many ways:

(1) The ideology of Apartheid determined between 1948 and 1984 the political, economic and social rights of any human being by the race to which he belongs. This is contained in the central statutes on race classification called Population Registration Act of 1950 which is the cornerstone of the whole system of Apartheid. 18


The notion of exclusion brought about confusion in the definition of race. The major problem lay with the Statutes which are divided into two categories. First, those that divide the population into four racial groups, namely, Bantu, White, Coloured and Asiatics. Second, those which distinguish between White, Bantu and Coloured. For example, the Immorality Act of 1957 which allows sexual relations between "White persons" and "Coloured persons", distinguishes only between a "White person", whom it defines as "any person who in appearance obviously is or who by general acceptance and repute is a white person", and a "coloured person" who is defined as "any person other than a white person". But the Group Areas Act, (Act 36 of 1966) distinguishes among three groups, namely, White, Bantu and Coloured (Section 12). In addition the Act allows the State President to define "any ethnic, linguistic, cultural or other group of persons" who belong to the Bantu or Coloured groups and to treat each as a separate group for the purposes of the Act. The consequence of this, argued Dugard, has made Indians, Chinese and Malays to be declared sub-groups of the Coloured group.

The exclusion process has meant that the Coloured group should be divided into seven sub-groups. They are: (a) the Cape Coloured (b) the Cape Malay (c) the Griqua (d) the Chinese (e) the Indian (f) the "Other Asiatic" (g) the "Other Coloured" groups. There has been a difficulty in finding a definition that will "defy" an attempt to cross the colour line. The definitions of "White", "coloured" and "Bantu" have frequently been amended. The current definitions which are based on the criteria of appearance, social acceptance and descent are as follows: firstly, a white person is one who in appearance obviously is a white person and who is not generally accepted as a coloured person, or is generally accepted as a White person and is not in appearance obviously not a white person, provided that, "a person shall not be classified as a White person if one of his natural parents has been classified as a coloured person or a bantu". Secondly, a Bantu is a person who is generally accepted as a member of any aboriginal race of Africa. Thirdly, a Coloured person is one who is not a white person or a bantu. Finally, it should be said that a person should not be accepted as white unless he is so accepted in the place where he resides, works and mixes socially.

(4) The notion of exclusion has caused much suffering in that families have been torn apart when their husband and wives were classified differently. Given the lack of uniformity in race classification, it implies that the same person may fall into different racial categories for different purposes. Given the racial classification of Whites and Coloured, it means that they may not enter an African reserve or township without permission. Given the classification of the blacks, it means that in general the African should require some form of permission for any journey he intends to undertake within South Africa. The law of the land regards him as having true freedom of movement only within the circumscribed limits of his own immediate domicile.

(5) The process of exclusion means that the movement of the black people throughout South Africa should be controlled. This has been effected by the "pass system". A pass is a "document required for lawful movement into, out of, or within a specified area," which must be produced on demand.

of a specific person, failure of production constitutes an offence.\textsuperscript{23} This is not new. It could be traced back to Earl Caledon, who in 1809 as Governor of the Cape, enacted a legislation in terms of which the Hottentots [Coloureds] were to carry a Certificate issued by the landrodt and known as a "pass". The legislation fixed the status of the coloured people as a group at the level of labour.\textsuperscript{24}

So far the foregoing arguments have been an exploration of race and class. In appearance the arguments have been an elevation of race to primacy. Do not such references to race take us back to the type of criticism we directed against Adam and the Liberal School of thought? We think not, because although the social structure reflects racism, we have only discussed racism as a reflection of the South African society in time and space, not as a fundamental variable. As we have indicated, we are uncomfortable with the concept of race on the following grounds. First, our objection has to do with the very concept of race. Race is an almost meaningless term as far as scientific knowledge is concerned. Pope suggests the use of the phrase "common


stock", as in his mind is more preferable than race. 25 Visser t'Hooft, likewise, admits his difficulty in using the term. He sees "the race problem", as being not so much a biological as a sociological problem in which theological, cultural and psychological factors all play their part. However, race should be understood as usually involving characteristics among which colour is dominant. 26 Objecting to race as a primary variable of explanation of the South African social structure does not imply that we have underestimated the racial polarisation there, but it is to argue, as the available evidence shows, that in fact the early white settlers did distinguish between Black and White but only on the basis of religion rather than the colour of the skin. It is highly probable as the Xhosa oral tradition informs us that race was not a major significant factor in race relationships. However, this objection may not be entirely convincing in view of the racial conflicts that took place there. Rebutting that argument, we should say, as our analysis of land in Chapter five shows, that the early racial conflicts were over the questions of land rather than skin pigmentation. If the relationship between Black and White was based on the colour of the skin, Nqgika, one


of the most powerful chiefs of the Xhosa, should have been an enemy of the white people. He was not. The available evidence shows that he lived with Louis Trigard for many years before the Great Trek in 1836 and the relationship between (Ngqika) and Trigard who was white were amicable. The view that immediately the white Europeans saw the dark and yellow faces at the Cape, inborn racist instincts showed and caused them to react against the non-white is unsustainable. Instead subsistence played a major part in the racial contact. As Harrinck has said that before the European expansion into the inland, the Khoi communities acted as middlemen in the circulation of goods between the original refreshment station and indigenous black communities. The conflicts between Black and White were motivated by unfair practices of trade particularly that the latter deprived the former of communal commonage. Secondly, we think it is not wise to equate the early wars and maltreatment of the economically deprived groups as racism. The wars that are mentioned at the beginning of the South African history were not only over the question of land but they were also over Cattle and hunting. We should differentiate between the violence of the


wars and that within the master-servant relationships and from "the intensity of racism per se." 29

Thirdly, drawing from the insights of Genovese, we should argue then that, if race relations are at bottom a class question into which the race question intrudes and gives a special force but does not constitute its essence then a similar argument must be stretched out to the post-slavery age. In a situation where slavery was ended "too soon", that is, before access to the means of industrial production, it was replaced by various arrangements of forced labour. Economically, 30 this factor is related to the World Capitalist economy which was characterised at the colonial level by monopoly. Finally, to bring this discussion back down to earth, all we are talking about is the interplay between economics and politics. To refer back to some of the economic factors involving land which we have already analysed we can think of statements such as:

".... there is no purely 'native' problem at all, and ... the really pressing


problem is one of National Production and the economic status of the Union."

In a more specific way, Francis Wilson's work in the Oxford History of South Africa, testifies most clearly that, "the political pressure for the passing of the Native Land Act in 1913 came, almost entirely it seems, from those who wished to ensure a cheap supply of labour."32

The interfusion of economics and politics render South Africa a very difficult society to analyse academically. Difficult as it appears to be, we should get to the core of the societal reasoning and attitudes adopted by a particular group of people and trace the logic of the constitutive and regulative rules embedded in such reasoning. In this respect the materialist explanation could shed some light upon the South African social structure. From the materialist point of view capitalism is usually identified in its growth and origins with a historical process of accumulation. As Mosala has written,

"the mode of production of material life conditions the social, political,


and intellectual life process in general. It is not the consciousness of men that determines their being, but, on the contrary, their social being that determines their consciousness. 33

Mosala indicates that there are other intellectual routes from which to travel therefore we should guard against the monodirectionism of interpretation of facts. Granting him that, it would seem that there is indeed a variety of ways by which an academic inquiry can be made. Probably, that is why we have two equally important explanations of the South African social formation, one stressing the variable of race while another argues that the variable of class should be given primary over race in the analytical study of South Africa. While not returning directly to the "race arguments", we submit that there are two ways in which to explicate the theoretical roots of an academic investigation in Western terms. First, there are two philosophical directions of the thought, namely, idealism and empiricism. The former denotes a view of human life in which utilitarianism and eudaemonistic considerations are subordinated to objective ideals of culture, such as attitudes, ideas, beliefs, values and ideology, and in which the mind asserts its superiority in the face of all determinism and materialism. Of course, this is due to Hegelian philosophy which tried to fuse

the cultural component of Kant's empirical epistemology by developing a unified idealistic metaphysics of the "objective spirit". The latter refers primarily to the scientific investigation of the World which we experience through our senses and attempts to understand and explain by describing it as we see it. These two philosophical directions are theoretically interrelated. As we have indicated in this argument, the idealist reflects itself in the conventional preoccupation with attitudes, ideology and with prejudice while the empiricist is inclined to offer an essentially descriptive explanation of the social reality. Both of these two approaches are weak. The fundamental problem with the idealist philosophical direction of thought is that, it does not recognize enough the material determination of the social reality. The empiricist direction of thought is weak in the basic respect that the specific nature of any given social reality is not always really and necessarily what it appears to be. However, they are both valuable for academic investigation. Second, there is a conception of class, economically generated, which is properly understood as that which relates to relations of production which constitutes the position and role of each member of the working class. This is


the situation where membership of the workforce is defined according to the common lack of either ownership or of the control of the means of production and the consequent necessity of selling labour-power in exchange for a wage. It should be remembered that the theoretical foundation of Marxist philosophy is to be found in dialectical materialism and thus in the system of production in any given social formation and in its specific historical systems and developments.

Given the Marxist philosophy, class analysis would be different from, let us say, idealist class analysis wherein class is explained with reference to status. In the Marxist conception of class, it is easy to see the perpetuation of economic inequality between the working class and bourgeoisie. These inequalities are not simply a reflection of individual limitations, but more importantly, they are reflective of the objective economic pressures placed upon the workers for accumulating capital.

The race explanation of the South African social structure fails in my mind to incorporate an analysis of the structural


37. Ibid, pp. 8-16.

constraints which are placed on the large members of the Black working class. The failure to take class into account is to have mislocated a fundamental variable in the South African social analysis. Class as a variable of analysis, as we have indicated in my previous chapter, is crucial because the economic dynamics of South Africa have created and maintained a Centre-Periphery structure in which the White section of the population has become the economic centre and the Blacks the periphery and reservoir of cheap labour. The sociological investigation of the class factor in South African society has progressed towards increased contextualization of concepts and definitions of capitalism. Most of the earlier studies on South Africa, as we have already argued in this thesis, approached the South African social formation from the intricacies of race relations. However, the work of Herbert Frankel identified the economic factor and consequently stressed class rather than race. But in our view this never received the good follow up it deserved. More recently the work of Wolpe, Johnstone and Legassick declared that to explain


the South African situation it is useless to describe it as a plural society and look for illumination only in the intricacies of race relations. For them the clues lie in the exploitation of Black labour by White capital and in its attendant contradictions.

There were inherent contradictions in the mining industry especially between 1911 and 1924. There emerged apparently a situation in which one side only was satisfied at the cost of the other. These contradictions were grounded in the structural contradictions of capitalism which were evident between capital and the organized struggle of the working class. Furthermore, the divisions and contradictions of the mining industry directly reflected the economic issue, which is the material basis of society, and the social policy which was used to entrench the Capitalists in the economy and thereby maintain the important base of the South African social structure. In fact the divisions and contradictions established the validity of the argument that capital is not a thing as such, but rather a definite social production, belonging to a specific historical formation of society which is manifested in economic phenomena and gives them their social character. These arguments maintain that the big capitalists who had earlier made their money in the diamond industry were "quick to buy up, and amalgamate claims, to float companies, and to invest in gold mining" which symbolised the rosy dawn of the era of capitalist production in South Africa. Johnstone's work does make a distinction between the period of the discovery of diamond in 1867 in Kimberly and the
Goldfields discovered on the Witwatersand in 1886. The market conditions of gold with specific reference to the relationship between price and output determined a less monopolistic structure than that of diamond industry. It should be remembered that the price of diamond was determined by supply which led to the most powerful group of capitalists (Cecil Rhodes) to establish complete control of production and output through the monopolisation of ownership so as to control price and profit. According to Johnstone the goldfields did not need this control because the price of gold was internationally fixed. Greater precision and subtlety have characterised the approach of Martin Legassick who identified structures of labour control as increasingly functional to capital. The class forces which instituted them served the interests of capital growth in South African society. While they have made a significant contribution to the study of the variable of class, we may criticise them for economic reductionism which places capital and class at the centre of analysis. However, their contribution represents the best kind of reductionism, for we should move beyond the race factor to what actually underpins the South African social structure, namely, class in which a group of people at a particular time in history evolved not only particular economic relationships between each other but also political relationships.

In fairness it should be observed that the various explanations of the South African social structure, beginning with Johnstone and Legassick have included the consequential dimension of the role of a group. The gold mining fields provided South Africa with a highly organised modern industry, whose ownership was distributed among large corporations which were basically under the hegemony of a Group. In order to avoid competition between companies, the group carried out concerns of common interest and rationalise the process of production. The locus of power was indeed in the groups which controlled the mining company. The mining companies themselves were comprised of "fifty productive enterprises" which were owned by shareholders but effectively controlled by the groups through majority shareholding. These groups which were six in number, were companies, "formed for the purpose of financing, directing and controlling mining companies". In Chapter two of this thesis we saw the significance of group activity without reverting to that argument, it is interesting to notice that the goldfield's operation was based on the concept of groups which provided and established both capital and investment. There were two sources from which capital investment came. First, it came from the working profit secured from the operation of the gold mines. Second, it also came from outside the mining industry. The groups were influential in providing the industry with a source

43. Ibid, pp. 15-22.
of capital which, while drawing on foreign capital markets, was not dependent on them, but was able to ensure "continuity" of investment especially for development work during World War I as foreign capital was meagre. It is important to know how the group was system constituted. The group system was the embodiment of the Transvaal Chamber of Mines formed in 1887 and other labour recruiting agencies such as the Witwatersrand Native Labour Association (W.N.L.A.) formed in 1896 and the Native Recruiting Corporation (N.R.C.) founded in 1912. The core of the groups was the specific forms of the economic relationships which were grounded on a common economic philosophy, namely, the private and exclusive ownership of the means of production. The system of ownership, per se, was partly determined by political and ideological beliefs found in South African society generally. Under a close critical examination, the available evidence indicates that, the owners of the means of production in the South African gold mining industry were people of light skin colour, that is, they were white while the rest of the working class were dark, that is, were Black. In this way we should argue that the goldfields developed class domination along racial lines. Exploitation occurred here as the working classes who were Black produced a surplus in which they had no share.

45. Ibid, pp. 22-23.
Undoubtedly, a class conflict situation characterised by exploitation based upon the mode of production which extracted the surplus value at the expense of the workers arose.

It has been our concern in this section to find out the theoretical underpinnings of the South African social structure. The earlier line of research development which approached the South African social structure from the intricacies of race relations is unsustainable. While Van der Berghe, Adam and Kuper, to mention a few, who are representatives of the above line of research have made a significant contribution to the field of learning by offering the "race variable" as a source of explanation, however, provided no specific results relevant to my own research since they have given race a primacy over class in their works. Our position has been maintained throughout the section by stressing class as a fundamental variable which underpins Apartheid. It is class that has brought about divisions and contradictions in South African society. Two poles have been created, namely, those in control of the means of production and the working classes. The negation of this


47. Adam, H. 1971 *Modernising Racial Domination.* Berkeley, University of California.

economic situation gave rise to the 1922 Mine strike on the Rand.\textsuperscript{49} This was nothing else but the rise of the proletariat in which they wished to push the historical forces to the next stage where the means of production would be in their hands. Furthermore, this was a lesson to the owners of the means of production that they dare not ever again try to replace highly paid white miners with poorly paid black workers.

Finally, when the factors of race and class are put together with an open mind towards the dynamics of the World capitalist economy and examined critically, it becomes abundantly clear that class is what underpins the South African social structure. Therefore it is quite plausible to explain Apartheid with reference to the theory of class and this shows that Christianity was assimilated into these structures and was to function ideologically in largely uncritical support of the dominant classes in society.

6.2 Education and Social Control

In the preceding section we saw how South Africa is fundamentally structured. With this structure in mind, the purpose of this section is to explore the theoretical basis of the South African educational system as it is articulated in various historical research materials. Here, our thesis is that education in South Africa is, and has been used as an extension of the means of social control. Education has been made one of the tools for keeping the white dominant group in power. There is no cross-fertilization of ideas in the South African system of education because racial separation is maintained at all levels of education. The desirable inclusiveness expected of an educational institution in a multi-cultural society does not exist. Consequently universities and schools have become tribalised places of learning.

At this stage, for heuristic purposes at least, it is also useful to assume a series of stages in our analysis which may be regarded as crystallizations of the complexity of the system. We

1. Horrell, M. 1964 A Decade of Bantu Education. (Johannesburg, South African Institute of Race Relations); and also

   Pells, E.G. 1956 Three Hundred Years of Education in South Africa. (Juta and Co. Ltd.)
will use three levels of primary school, secondary school, and university. These three levels reflect the ways in which the South African education system operates both as regards the Black and White population. Before turning to primary education, let us first go back into the history of education in South Africa in order to clarify the role of education in society.

Historical investigations of the South African form of European education has traced its origins to two possible sources.² One line of development has explained the origins of education with reference to the early missionaries, particularly of the Glasgow Missionary Society in 1821.³ The other line of historical research places the early beginnings of education before 1821.⁴ Indeed it seems that learning began earlier than 1821 especially if the history of religious instruction is regarded to be a legitimate form of education. According to a diary entry of Jan Van Riebeeck who arrived at the Cape in 1652, the manager of the

---

2. Pells, E.G. 1956 Three Hundred Years of Education in South Africa, p. 40.


Dutch East India company and the leader of the first settler group,

"began holding school for the young slaves... to stimulate the slaves to attention while at school and to induce them to learn the Christian prayer." 5

Dube, Pells, Horrell have said that formal education in South Africa was missionary in character synonymous with the teachings of the church particularly the Dutch Reformed tradition. The available evidence indicates that the earliest form of education was primarily simple psalm singing, bible reading and a little simple arithmetic. 6 This was a form of education whose purpose was directed towards gaining church membership rather than toward a secular type of learning as found in Europe and North America. For example, the first school, which was established in 1799 by the Rev. Dr. Johannes T. Van der Kemp, was basically missionary in intention, directed mainly towards the conversion of the chiefs. 7 A small School in Chief Nqika's territory was set up by Dr. Van der Kemp before he returned to Bethesdorp where he


6. Pells, E.G. 1956 Three Hundred Years of Education in South Africa, pp. 10-16.

established a mission station for the Hottentots to which sons of African chiefs were sent for education. As well as this type of schooling there were other forms of education mostly directed towards artisanship which were introduced later.

After the end of the six "Kaffir war" hostilities in 1834, missionaries who had been driven away from the black communities returned in order to make a contribution once more to the education of the Black person. They established the Lovedale Mission station on the land which was given to them by Chief Tyhali, son of Ngqika. Combined with mission activities was an elementary school which had been set up in 1839 and began with one hundred and thirty nine pupils. There was no Principal or head teacher responsible for the training of Black students until 1841 when the Rev. William Govan from Scotland arrived in South Africa to train African teachers. This happened even before the colonial government had made such facilities available for Whites. Lovedale Institution opened with only twenty students, nine of whom were sons of White missionaries and the remaining eleven, were Black from the soil of South Africa.

While the Lovedale institution was founded on the Presbyterian tradition by the early missionaries from Scotland there were other missionary agencies and societies in South Africa at the time who played an equally important role in African education. These were Methodists and Anglicans both of whom came from England. The former founded Healdtown Institution in 1855 near Fort Beaufort, Lesseyton near Queenstown, Salem near Grahamstown, D'Urban near Peddie. The available records indicate that they were committed to the training of the Black child in order that he should take his place in society as Court Interpreter, Teacher and Evangelist. The latter established mission stations and schools in the Ciskei and Transkei, such as St. Mathews at Keiskamahoek on the land granted by Chief Socishe, and St. Luke's, St. Mark's and All Saints. St. Cuthbert (Engcolosi) was founded later by the Rev. Bishop Bransby L. Key of the Church of the Province of South Africa (Anglican). In 1877 Blythswood was opened having been built with funds raised by the Fingo people there. Mqikela, the Paramount Chief of Pondoland granted land to Bishop Callaway to establish the Holy Cross Mission in 1873.

In the foregoing pages of this section we saw the early beginnings of Lovedale Mission. However, during the outbreak of the Seventh Kaffir War (1846) Lovedale was closed and the building was entrusted to Colonel Hare who was the then Lieutenant-Governor of the Eastern Province in order for him to use it as a military barracks. The closure of the Mission station made it possible for Dr. Govan to return, temporarily, to Scotland with four pupils one of them was a Black man called Tiyo Soga who was to become the first ordained black Minister of religion in South Africa. By 1863, the Lovedale Institution had trained more than twenty African teachers, five carpenters, three masons, six wagon-makers and four blacksmiths. In that academic year they had an enrolment of forty two African pupils and forty five white scholars which gave them a total of eighty seven scholars of whom thirty were black boarders and fifteen were white boarders. We have already said that the 1846 war brought the Lovedale Missionary Institution to a standstill. The war had devastating effects on the mission work pioneered by the


Rev. W. Shaw, a Wesleyan missionary, who had come to South Africa with the Sephton party of the 1820 British Settlers.\textsuperscript{15}

The Methodists as we have already indicated were missionary pioneers in the field of African education in South Africa. They established a mission station on the site of the Rev. Joseph William near Fort Beaufort which was later called Healdtown named after a Mr. Heald of Manchester in England who had generously contributed a substantial amount of money in order that a mission station be established.\textsuperscript{16} Consequently, a mission station was established under the pastoral charge of the Rev. John Ayliff. With the arrival of the Rev. William Shaw many mission stations were founded. The most important of which were Wesleyville in the territory of Chief Pato of the AmaGqunukwebe tribe founded in 1824.\textsuperscript{17} Chief Ndlambe of the AmaRarabe tribe permitted Methodists to establish the Mount Coke Mission in the same year during which Wesleyville was founded. Chief Hintsa of the AmaGcaleka made land available for the building and starting of the Butterworth Mission station. In 1830 Clarkebury named after Dr. Adam Clarke was established among the Thembu people and Buntingville under the pastoral charge of the Rev. W.B. Boyce,


\textsuperscript{16} Horrell, M. 1963 African Education, p. 4.

\textsuperscript{17} Horrell, M. 1963 African Education, p. 5.
who compiled the first Xhosa grammar, was founded. Subsequently, the Shawbury Methodist Mission among the Bhaca tribe was established. Faku the Chief of the Pondo tribe asked the missionaries to establish a mission station near his great place. In 1845 before the 1846 war, Palmerton was founded and named after the Rev. Samuel Palmer. In 1862 the Rev. Thomas Jenkins who had the pastoral charge of Palmerton at the time started another mission station called Emfundisweni. Bensonville was founded in 1861 and thereafter many more mission stations were established. The following statement by E.P. Lekhela indicates how conversion and education were integral aspects of the comprehensive process of missionisation.

".... conversion and education of the Bantu were synonymous. The two were interdependent. Whatever attempts were made by the Church at conversion implied some measure of education, and whatever attempts were made at education presupposed conversion .... Education was Christianity and Christianity was education."18

Lekhela's statement makes it clear that it is not only the spiritual that is important in evangelization but also the mind hence the mission of the Church should be concerned with the

widening of the nation's mental horizon's through the process of education. Marizell established in 1899 by the Catholic Trappists from Marianhill in Natal was founded to provide education as well. The Tigerkloof Institution founded in 1904 by the Rev. W.G. Willoughby of the London Missionary Society was to train teachers, ministers and craftsmen, while Zonnebloem training school established earlier in 1858 by the first Anglican Bishop Dr. Robert Gray was to educate the African children.¹⁹

The above historical analysis indicates two things. First that the European form of education was introduced in South Africa by the early missionaries from Europe. Second, that its admission policies were different from the present education policies in that they were not based on the colour of the skin. This was a multi-racial experiment in learning.²⁰ We may conclude that conversion and education were two aspects of the same process of missionization. Furthermore, historical investigation reveals that by 1911 schools which had been founded on the principles of mixed learning had shifted from that which can be regarded as integrationist to a policy of segregation. The Appelate Division of the Supreme Court was called upon to express its views on

segregation in a case in which the Keimoes School Committee had excluded children whose father was white but whose mother was of mixed descent. Prior to this case, the law in the Cape under which this action was taken did not provide for school segregation based on colour but on origin. Of those commenting upon this case, John Dugard has said: that it would have been quite possible for the Court to have disapproved the decision of the Keimoes School Committee on the concept of school segregation at least between whites and children of mixed descent by contending that the law did not provide for the exclusion of children on the basis of colour but only on the basis of European extraction or parentage. Dugard is furthermore of the view that in deciding whether the children were of European extraction in contemporary terms the court should have applied a "preponderance of blood test" and rule in favour of the children as three of their grandparents were of European descent. South Africa has long had a tradition in which education for the dominant White classes was separated from the oppressed dominated Black classes. Professor Hunter has observed, in the study of education in the South African context, that, "the rich and the powerful are able to provide better educational opportunities for their children, and these opportunities help in ensuring that the next generation

in these families are rich and powerful too, relative to the rest of the population.\textsuperscript{22} Hunter has rightly and explicitly said that in particular cultural situations education is used by the rich and political powerful to maintain their own position in society and to educate their offsprings to do likewise. In this argument the concept of hegemony is implicit. From the insights of Antonio Gramsci, hegemony should be distinguished from Karl Marx's conception of ideology.\textsuperscript{23} Ideology is thus understood as the set of formal ideas and beliefs promoted by the ruling class for the purposes of preserving their privileged position in society.\textsuperscript{24} Gramsci develops ideology into the concept of hegemony. Hegemony is the set of formal ideas and beliefs and informal modes of behaviour, habits, manners, sensibilities, and outlooks that support and sanction the existing order.\textsuperscript{25}


our arguments on the above historical facts, segregation that was maintained during the era of colonialism and maintained with a high degree of continuity through Apartheid education policies was used to support the status quo and function thus of a hegemony.

Given the South African history of education in which, according to Horrell, the Government discouraged whites from sending their children to multiracial mission schools, it is clear that the ruling classes defined education as a process of communicating knowledge as a means of socialization in which hegemony had to be maintained at all costs. To argue for the maintenance of hegemony implies racial segregation in the education admission policies. This directly reflects the contradictions of South African society. Such contradictions in my view are those between the dominant and dominated groups and the struggle of the masses to counteract the cultural hegemony. These educational contradictions are grounded in the structural contradictions of capitalism. As we have indicated, for the White man, academic education is there to equip him for leadership in all branches of the country's work. Likewise, the Blacks aspire to the privileges and positions of the white people. Consequently, Black people are keen to prove themselves equally able to make a success of traditional academic education rejecting the claim that their cultural and social background calls for a different system of education; on the contrary they wish to be involved in the technological and economic control and management of the modern world.
The historical analysis of the degradation of Black education began with the introduction of "Native Education" in 1920 which was the logical route to follow in a society that had committed itself to the maintenance of a White hegemony. Its purpose was to introduce inferior syllabuses for Black education as a whole. As Pell argues the Cape Parliament as far back as 1894 said that the system of education was so divorced from,

"... the native policy in general that the European primary school syllabus was imposed upon Native schools without any account being taken of the needs and possibilities of Native life, still less of the new demands which the provisions of the Glen Grey Act were to make upon the Natives."26

Following Pells it is clear that the basic deficiency in Black education has always been associated with poor basic facilities. Teachers are inadequately trained. Inadequate and poor facilities cannot produce both quality and quantity in education. Quality refers to the relative excellence of the instruction offered. It connotes also the degree to which such education is articulated in order to provide for the needs of individuals who

differ in gifts and intelligence. School libraries, laboratories and well trained staff are some of the ways with which education can be facilitated. Quantity does not merely indicate the number of scholars enrolled but it also indicates how the pupils have managed to climb up the educational ladder. Those who hold university degrees are like a tiny drop of water in the ocean in a population of over 23 million Blacks. The majority of the scholars are not in a position to earn a university entrance qualification. The major problem in the South African educational system is that it is ideologically designed as an extension of the means of social control so that the white hegemony is kept intact. If South Africa were a democracy and education were to be used as a means of liberating human potential then we would have to have an open schooling system whose admission policies were not based on the colour of the skin but rather on intellectual abilities and gifts. This is an ideal to be attained in many countries, not least in the West.

(i) The Structure of Primary Education

The primary school is divided into two parts, namely, lower and higher primary. Lower primary indicates a level which caters for

pupils from sub-standard A to standard two, while higher primary school caters for pupils from standard three to six.\textsuperscript{28} There is automatic promotion which ends at standard two level. There are clear distinctions between Black and White systems of schooling particularly with regard to facilities. As regards our argument this is indeed a highly significant distinction which the Institute of Race Relations admits in their annual survey of education.\textsuperscript{29} For the Institute, however, educational facilities for the Blacks are seen to have slightly improved from what they used to be, but there is still a great distinction in the per capita expenditure on the education of Black and White children. In 1974-1975 the estimated per capita expenditure on Black primary and secondary schools was thirty nine rands and fifty three cents compared with the amount of about six hundred and five rands spent on each white child.\textsuperscript{30} With such a great discrepancy in expenditure it is unavoidable that Black educational facilities are inferior to those of Whites. A further major distinction is that while education is compulsory up to the age of sixteen years for White children, it is not compulsory for Black children.\textsuperscript{31} Although major steps have been

\textsuperscript{28} Horrell, M. 1964 \textit{A Decade of Bantu Education}, pp. 59-60. (Johannesburg : S.A.I.R.R.).

\textsuperscript{29} See \textit{The Survey of the Institute of Race Relations} edited by Murriell Horrell (1975), p. 220.


\textsuperscript{31} See \textit{The Survey of the Institute of Race Relations} edited by Murriell Horrell (1973), pp. 310, 315.
taken in the direction of compulsory education for Indians and Coloureds, only about seventy-five percent of the African children of school-going age attend school. Furthermore, even when government commissions were appointed, they tended to emphasise those distinctions with a concomitant stress that education for the Blacks should, by implication, be designed to be inferior in order for the White hegemony to survive. Hence, as we have indicated, education is used as a means of the extension of social control. Finally, these inequalities have been entrenched in the education system deliberately so that we should have less and less educated Blacks and more and more educated Whites in order to preserve White supremacy and facilitate the White hegemony.

In order to facilitate the promotion of the white hegemony, a commission on Native Education under Dr. W.W.M. Eiselen was appointed in 1949. Its terms of reference were:

"(a) The formulation of the principles and aims of education for the Natives as an independent race, in which their past and present, their inherent racial qualities, their distinctive characteristics and aptitude, and their needs under ever changing social conditions are taken into consideration.  
(b) The extent to which the existing, primary, secondary, and vocational education system for Natives and the training of Native teachers should be modified in respect of the content and form of syllabus, in order to conform to the proposed principles and aims, and to prepare Natives more effectively for their future occupations."32

We note that the Commission acknowledged, almost in passing, that the Natives should be prepared for future occupations presumably in their own communities because there was no place for them in the white community "above the level of certain forms of labour". In consequence, they should be prepared educationally for a particular social setting, that is Bantu society.

Introducing the Bantu Education Act of 1953, H.F. Verwoerd then Minister of Native Affairs, argued that education must be in accordance with those opportunities which were available to a particular people. In other words, it is essential that the White hegemony, characteristic of the South African society, should not permit Black and White children to be given equal educational opportunities, for to do so would be to give false expectations to the former while implying that the latter were standing on a shifting political sand. The very emphasis on segregation in education in an age of urbanization and industrialization allows for the superordination of the white hegemony sometimes in conflict with the demands of the economy. For if the principle of "open schools" were to be accepted and equal opportunity in education was applied, a counter-hegemonic


culture which represented a genuine opposition to white supremacy would have been allowed to emerge and challenge the whole social order.

(ii) The Structure of Secondary Education

When we turn to consider the structure of the Secondary level of education as proposed by the Eiselen Commission which was implemented by Dr. Verwoerd, a somewhat different problem is encountered. Here the difficulty is not so much that education has remained segregated but that the education Authorities expressed unhappiness about English as a medium of instruction in black schools. Instead Afrikaans was suggested as a medium of instruction in spite of the fact that English as a medium of teaching is part of the South African tradition of education. The eventual consequences of the imminent imposition of Afrikaans led to the school riots of 1976 which began in Soweto and spread over to other institutions of higher learning like wild fire. 36

Between the early 1950 and 1976, the following was the approved structure for African Secondary schools.\textsuperscript{37} In this structure, after leaving primary school at the end of standard six, the Black child enters into a five-year programme of secondary education. The first part of the secondary school is a three-year post-standard six course which takes a Black child a year longer to complete than it does a White, Coloured or Indian child if normal progress is made. The syllabus offered to pupils is divided into two parts. In the first place, there are non-examination subjects such as religious studies, physical education and music. In the second place, there are also examination subjects which the pupils are required to take. These are the child's home language, English, Afrikaans and in addition to the languages he has to take general science, arithmetic, history and geography. Latin and mathematics may be offered by a particular school if the Principal so desires.\textsuperscript{38} The three-year Secondary course is further divided into two streams, academic and commercial. The academic course includes the three languages, that is, Xhosa, English and Afrikaans, besides physical science, biology, agriculture, Latin, mathematics, homecraft and woodwork. On the other hand, the commercial course is composed of the three languages, commercial

\textsuperscript{37} Horrell, M. 1964 \textit{A Decade of Bantu Education}, p. 75.
\textsuperscript{38} Horrell, M. 1964 \textit{A Decade of Bantu Education}, p. 77.
arithmetic and a selection of only two subjects from the following, bookkeeping, commerce, typewriting, shorthand or a natural science. After passing the Junior Level the pupil must take two extra years in order to complete his secondary education. After two extra years the Black child may take the National Senior Certificate Examinations or the Joint Matriculation Board examinations which are the requirements of University entrance. However, we should point out that many changes have recently been made in the structure and content of education in South Africa. For example, the phasing out of the Joint Matriculation Board Examinations and, the changing of the name 'Bantu Education' to the Department of Education and Training. As in other education departments, a four-phase system is in operation, but unlike the white system, the lower primary phase extends over four years.

While we acknowledge the above changes, it should be stressed that education for White children is free until the end of secondary school. Books and stationery are also free. By contrast Blacks are obliged to pay for the education of their children from primary to secondary school and this means that it is financially difficult to keep a Black child longer at school.

Hence there are a lot of Black school drop outs. Yet, Sir Harry Oppenheimer addressing the Anglo American Corporation has said:

"... the gap between black and white education remains the most serious obstacle to economic growth and better race relations in South Africa."41

Whilst we agree to a considerable extent with Oppenheimer's argument that economic growth is dependent upon lessening the gap between Black and White education and thus upon the modernisation of the whole educational system, there is a serious conflict between this and the preservation of Black African identity for which we have argued. The cultural adaptation theory expressed in the following statement:

"Whenever it is possible to do so, the Native should be kept in his tribal state and should be educated and developed as far as possible in accordance with his customs, culture and tradition."42

implies denial of the economic and social realities of the modern world which demand the assimilation of the western technological techniques and presuppose a good educational foundation that is


not culturally bound and static but dynamic and enriching yet lead to an acute problem for the preservation of African identity. Education should be more enriching in a racially-mixed place of learning rather than in a tribal Kraal environment where there are no educational facilities yet it is there that African identity of the traditional kind is best preserved.

Insights in the above arguments have been drawn from Horrell's analysis of the structure of African Secondary schools. However, our work does not require a detailed comparative study of secondary school system. As we indicated earlier, the structure of education is as important as the language through which that education is expressed. Before we discuss the medium of instruction, that is language, we should stress that there has been very little progress concerning educational facilities in black schools. Of the appalling conditions in black education, Dr. O.D. Wollheim has written,

"Native Education has been in appalling condition ... Buildings in most cases consist of tin shanties or wattle daub huts into which are crammed two or three times the number of pupils which the room should hold. The equipment is correspondingly pitiful ... The salaries paid to teachers are likewise appalling ...

The teachers are seriously overloaded, and one teacher will occasionally be found to be teaching from eighty to one hundred pupils in two or three different standards all in the same room.45

Implicit in Wollheim's words is the fact that Education in South Africa is underpinned by economic as well as strictly political objectives of social control. Schools have been made inadequate both in quality and quantity as a result of deliberate policy.

The medium of instruction in black secondary schools is English. This has a long history which goes back to the period of colonization and the missionary approach to education. Here it suffices to note that this was a situation in which a black child could be expected to write a three-hour examination paper in good English. There have, as we have indicated, been attempts to replace English with Afrikaans as a medium of instruction. But that never materialised. The enforcement of Afrikaans gave rise to what is referred to as The 1976 Soweto Students' Riots.46 In that situation there was an intense resistance which linked educational reforms to some of the political issues. Consequently the 1979 Education and Training Act was a response

---


to the education crisis.\footnote{Survey of Race Relations in South Africa compiled by Loraine Gordon et al. (1978), pp. 402-403.} The Human and Science Research Council produced a documentation on black education which provided coherent official thinking on the whole subject of education.\footnote{1979 Survey of Race Relations in South Africa edited by Loraine Gordon, pp. 488-490.}

As we have already acknowledged although there were educational reforms in South Africa, especially after the 1976 Student's uprisings, it is accurate to say that even before the de Lange Commission had reported, there was a general feeling that there ought to be a move towards a unitary system of education for all the racial groups in South Africa. As Educamus,\footnote{See Educamus, A Newsletter published by the Department of Foreign Affairs, October (1980), p. 4.} an information Newsletter published by the Department of Foreign Affairs, indicates, when the South African Government education Authorities referred to reforms in education they had in mind things such as curriculum, examinations, teacher's pay and buildings. They did not think in terms of removing the fundamental tenets of Apartheid embodied in education. In our view that is what should be removed in order to provide equal education for all.

So far in this section insights have been drawn from the history of education in South Africa. We emphasise that the origin of
education in South Africa can be traced back to the efforts of the early benign white missionaries from Europe whose admission policies were based on intellectual gifts rather than skin pigmentation. However, with the passage of time Apartheid education policies were enforced, particularly by the malign Nationalist Government which took office in 1948. From 1948 to 1984, Apartheid in education was reflected in both Primary and Secondary School levels of education.

(iii) University Education and Racial Policy

Before 1959 most universities were separated, but the "open" University of Cape Town and the University of the Witwatersrand admitted students on academic merit alone with no regard to race. The term "open" indicates that, "as far as possible they admit students on the basis of academic qualifications only and in all academic matters treat non-white students on a footing of equality and without separation from white students". 50 There is another category of white Universities which are not "open" in this sense even though they may admit Blacks for courses which are not available in their ethnic universities. These are Natal, Rhodes, Stellenbooch, Pretoria, Rand, Orange Free State and Port Elizabeth universities. 51 The third category is that of black


51. Ibid, p. 103.
universities. They are Fort Hare, which was founded by the Churches in 1916 in the course of its historical existence has been affiliated to either Rhodes University in Grahamstown or on to the University of South Africa in Pretoria. But now it is an independent ethnic University within the Ciskei Homeland. There are other universities which have since been brought into being as a result of the policy of Apartheid. Following the logic of separate development most of them are situated in the Homelands. They are the University of Zululand (Ngoye), Transkei, North (Turfloop), Durban Westville, BophutaTswana, Natal Wentworth Medical School and Medunsa in Pretoria.

The Separate University Education Bill incorporated three principles which are alien to the concept of the university as derived from the Western democratic nations, particularly from the English tradition which has so far generally followed in South Africa. First, the Bill empowers the Minister of Education to decide who shall be a University student at these institutions. This clause is intended to curtail the measure of autonomy which some of the universities such as Fort Hare had enjoyed prior the University Bill. The second provision of the clause removes the administration of the admission policy from

the hands of the Senate and the Council. This has been severely
criticised by enlightened academics. The third provision is to
make each University serve the ethnic group of its area.
Concerning the administration of black universities the Senate
and Council are to consist of appointees of the Minister of
Education and training.

An examination of education in South Africa reveals from our
perspectives several limitations. This policy culminates in the
Separate University Bill which in our view has sacrificed
four academic freedoms: first, it has lost the academic freedom
to determine by itself who may teach; secondly, what may be
taught; thirdly, how shall it be taught; and fourthly, who may
be admitted to study. 54

The above arguments underline the thesis that education in South
Africa is used as an extension of the means of social control.

54. Raum, O.F. "Problems of Freedom in University Education in
426-427.
PART III
A Sociological and Theological Analysis of Social Activism

CHAPTER SEVEN
THE RISE OF SOUTH AFRICAN SOCIAL ACTIVISM

In the preceding chapters we have developed our analysis of African traditional identity, theories of identity and the question of land and education and their legal and social control successively. Thus in terms of our hermeneutic and methodology we have moved from an initial theoretical hypothesis informed by liberation Theology and in particular the insights of J.L. Segundo through an analysis of social reality. We are now in a position to engage with the major critical indigenous response to the social and political conditions of the Black African population most prominently represented in the history of the African National Congress. This chapter is developed in two sections. In the first section we discuss the rise of social activism within the context of the origins of the South African National Congress and its struggle for freedom and unity. The second section employs certain Marxist concepts for the analysis of the South African social formation which amplifies the critique initially developed by the ANC. As we indicated in chapter two, Marxist analysis is an analytical tool useful for exposing and analysing societies, especially where the Church in its mission and teaching experiences class conflict. While accepting particular Marxist modes of analysis, we reject the total embracing of Marxism as contrary to the Christian faith.
Thus we should adopt these concepts critically. But they are necessary in view of the fundamental variables of class which, as we argued in chapter six, characterise the South African social structure. Second, both the Marxist categories and the African National Congress' approach to the unity and involvement of all races in political decision-making processes are necessary. Particularly in that the latter, although not a Christian organization, is nevertheless composed of many mission-educated Christian members. Furthermore, we argued in chapters four and five that the methodology employed in theology in the eras of segregation and Apartheid was not committed to a total liberation of man as it was bound up not only with imperialism but also with colonialism and capitalism which were integrally related to the formation of classes and the sharpening of racial differentiation in South African society. We may note, at this point, more by implication than by direct statement that liberation understood solely in political and economic terms is woefully inadequate and reductionistic. The spiritual dimension of liberation also needs careful attention and thus the theological analysis offered in the following chapter may be helpful for any Christian holding a vision of the positive and holistic transformation of society under God.
7.1 The ANC in the Context of South African Social Activism: Identity and the Struggle for Unity

In order to set the developments in their proper historical context, we should begin with a quotation from Lodge.

"On 8 January 1912 there assembled in Bloemfontein, several hundred of South Africa's most prominent African citizens: professional men, Chieftains, Ministers, teachers, clerks, interpreters, landholders, businessmen, journalists, estate agents, builders, contractors and labour agents. These men, after singing Tiyo Soga's Xhosa hymn, "Fulfil thy promise, God of faith," unanimously resolved to form The South African Native National Congress."¹

Lodge has identified five reasons for the formation of this black middle class and non-violent organization. First, because there was a strong sense of commitment to the principle of political participation of all races in the decision-making processes the Blacks felt that it was necessary to set up an organization which would be the mouthpiece of all the oppressed people of South Africa. Second, in order to accelerate black political advancement in the Cape where Blacks with the required property and educational qualifications could vote and stand for office, votes should be used to influence the election of men who would

be sympathetic to Black aspirations. Third, the meeting of Black leaders in Bloemfontein in 1912 was motivated by the aftermath of the Anglo-Boer War of 1899-1902 after which it was thought that there would be less racial discrimination in South Africa, particularly in that the South African Blacks had been loyal to the British Empire and from which they therefore expected a good hearing. Four, it was hoped that the non-racial Cape Franchise would be extended to the whole of South African society. Five, the statutory employment colour bars introduced in the mining industry provided that certain jobs were to be restricted to people who were in possession of a certificate of competence. These regulations were appended to the 1911 Mines and Works Act which specifically laid down that no "Coloured person" could acquire a certificate of competency in the Transvaal or Orange Free State. Although this colour bar provision was ruled invalid by the courts in 1923, the year after the 1922 strike, these measures were restored in 1926.² The formation of the African National Congress marked the ascendency in middle class Black circles of the contention that African interests could be promoted "not through sympathetic intermediaries but rather by action of Africans themselves."³ With the insights and identity


theories of chapter two in mind, we have argued that the definition of self-identity in relation to social location and to other selves in a similar historical context may culminate in the formation of an all-embracing organization as in the case of the ANC. 4 This inclusiveness of identity may be achieved through identification with one another and with some of the transcendent and prophetic moral components of religion, in this case the Christian tradition. Based on a moral vision, the ANC was concerned with human rights, particularly the freedom of the Black people. Fired with outrage, they attacked the White Government of South Africa because of its racist laws. We may regard the coming together of Zulu, Xhosa, Sotho, Tswana, Pedi, Coloured, Indian and White ethnic identities to form a super-tribal organization as an extension of individual and parochial sources of identity and security. This was the expression of the transitive character of identity in relation to a wider society in which a new locus of authority with a new source of personal identity could be found. The arguments of chapter two indicated that identity could not survive in solitude and fragmentation. In the identity-forming process the self would relate to the other selves in order to promote political and social consensus. Furthermore, the bearers of this new identity believed in the mobilization of the efforts of the people. The mobilization of which in the case of ANC culminated

in the election of an effective leadership. The Rev. John Dube, who was headmaster of the Ohlange Institute in Natal, became its first president, its Secretary was Sol Plaatjie, one-time Court interpreter and editor of a Kimberly Newspaper, and its treasurer was Pixley Ka Izaka Seme, a London-trained advocate. They formed the first strong Executive of the ANC with the Rev. E.J. Mqoboli an ordained Methodist minister as Chaplain-in-Chief of the Congress and Rev. H.R. Ngcayiya, President of the Ethiopian Church as his assistant. We have already indicated that the opening hymn of the Congress was, Lizalis' idinga lakho, Thixo, Nkosi Yenyaniso, Fulfil Thy Promise, God of truth. But why did these leaders choose this particular hymn? Whilst there are always liturgical reasons for picking a particular hymn for a particular service, here we suggest that the reasons for the selection of this hymn might have lain in the very concept of African nationalism which presupposes the social and psychological functions of religion. Apter, who has developed the concept of "political religion", can illuminate our discussion. Emergent nations, he argues, face the problems


involved in creating new overarching loyalties in place of the old parochial ones which have to be transcended. A new locus of authority is needed in these circumstances along with a new source of personal identity. In face of the concomitant acquiescence of Christianity in the status quo, political religion offers "to fill those spiritual lacunae that, arising from the basic needs of individuals to find immortality, define identity, and determine their fate, can no longer be satisfied in more ordinary ways." To fill the spiritual lacunae it was required of the Congress that it should pick one of the hymns composed by Tiyo Soga, the first Black Minister to be ordained in South Africa.

The written account of Tiyo Soga's life indicates that he was born about 1829 on the Tutura, Somerville, near Butterworth in the Transkei. His parents were outstanding members of the Black community there. Nosuthu, his mother was a Christian who belonged to the Amantinde under Jan Tshatshu and his father was one of the most influential counsellors of the Ngqika tribe. We indicated earlier that Tiyo Soga was one of the students who accompanied Dr. Govan to Scotland. It was at the Theological Faculty of the Presbyterian Church in Edinburgh where he trained for the Christian ministry and he married a Scotswoman Janet Burnside in 1857. Shortly afterwards he returned to South

Africa to be one of the best missionaries the country has ever known. The Rev. Tiyo Soga was a translator of the Bible. In African hymnology Tiyo Soga's hymn, "Fulfil Thy Promise, God of truth," is comparable with "Nkosi Sikelel'i Afrika", composed by Enoch Sothonga. The former is likely to be sung in Church Assemblies while the latter is the National Anthem. Placing these songs within the context of our argument we can say that they reinforce identity. They would not be different from praise singing insofar as the reinforcement of identity is concerned. When a gifted Black praise-singer such as Mqhayi, Yako or Jolobe rises up to make an open-air demonstration by singing praises to an African leader, identity is integrated, reinforced and given meaning.

However, in the above arguments we have said that the identity of the ANC was based, among other things, on the transcendent moral components of the Christian tradition. In brief, morality played a prominent role in its identity and this was profoundly influenced by religious, political and ideological factors. Beginning with the religious factor, we should record that the leadership of the ANC was composed of mission-educated Black men who believed in civilization by mingling and integration. They are

black men who believed in civilization by mingling. They were the indirect products of the Protestant spirituality of the eighteenth century which maintained that religion should be understood and experienced as a feeling of absolute dependence upon God. This influence was indirect because they were taught by agents of the missionary movement which was itself rooted in Pietism. Basically, this influence left an indelible mark on them which was directly reflected in their approach to the ethical issue of violence. This provided a moral ambience upon which Mahatma Gandhi had also left his mark. As Dr. Njongwe put it,

"With the historical example of Gandhi before us, we turned to Passive resistance largely because it secured results without creating bitterness between the Contenders."

But Carter does not agree with the prevalent view that the adoption of non-violent means of social change was necessarily a subscription to the doctrine of (Satyagraha). True, there was a belief in the tradition of resistance, but this does not simply imply that Black and Indian leaders acknowledged a doctrinal attachment to (Satyagraha). What this does imply is that most leaders believed in a flexible form of resistance essentially

similar to that of Nehru and the Indian National Congress. We have seen in the foregoing pages of this section that the ANC was composed of men who had been educated at Missionary Institutions. Thus, for example, in the history of education which started at Lovedale as early as 1844, outstanding pupils such as the Rev. Tiyo Soga were produced. During the 1870's Lovedale had produced Black leaders who could articulate the needs of their respective communities such as Pambani Mzimba, Elijah Makiwane and John Bokwe. Concurrently, Healdtown Methodist Institution had produced a journalist such as John Tengo Jabavu and ministers of religion like James Dwane and Charles Pamla who were followed there before the end of the decade by Nehemiah Tile. Likewise, the other missionary institutions which we reviewed in chapter six produced leaders who later became members of the ANC. These men represented an extension of the true spirit of Christianity with its endorsement of the social dimension of religion. It is, however, an extension which occurred largely through the individual internalization of religiously derived value-commitments, not through direct social intervention exercised by the Churches. In tracing the major line of the moral development of the ANC, we may point out that although its identity expressed itself in terms of religious faith, it in fact negated the role of Christianity as represented by Christian

12. Ibid, Carter, D. The Defiance Campaign.

Missions. Walshe points out that the charismatic Clements Kadalie and other activists of the Industrial and Commercial Workers' Union were outspokenly critical of the Christian Missions. They had a burning desire for a better world, free from the "exploitation, rapacity, materialism and economic strangulation" of the Black people. Commenting upon the excoriating attacks made by these activists on White racism and power, Dr. D.D.T. Jabavu said, "they were typical of the new generation of educated leaders." 14

These political attacks on the Christian Missions reveal both continuity and discontinuity in religious morality. Here, continuity represented the integrating function of Christianity which depends on love as a flexible criterion applicable to every concrete situation. 15 But there was on the other hand, a latent discontinuity which existed in a hidden, dormant form capable of being brought to light under changing circumstances. Continuity as represented in the integrating function of religion gave meaning to the identity of the African National Congress and particularly to that of some of its leaders who attended international Christian conferences. Dube, Mahabane and Jabavu attended the conference on the Christian mission in Africa at Le


Zoute, Belgium in 1926 with other South Africans including Dr. Loram and Professor Macmillan. In 1928, Jabavu and Yergan attended the World Missionary Conference which assembled at the Mount of Olives in Jerusalem. When Jabavu was interviewed in London on his way back to South Africa, he said Jerusalem 1928 would encourage racial co-operation in South Africa. We may, however, distinguish Jerusalem 1928 from Edinburgh 1910 as regards their theological interpretation and view of the world. Two things emerged particularly clearly. First, the Cross in Jerusalem was understood as a symbol of service, responsibility and sacrifice while Edinburgh had referred to the Cross as a symbol of conquest in Constantinian terms.

In the second place, the purpose of mission in Jerusalem was understood differently from Edinburgh where mission was perceived as the realisation of the Kingdom of God. In other words, mission was understood as the Kingdom's servant in the world. It was a world which God did not love in terms of a mystical contemplation in Heaven but in the concrete, terrifying events of Egypt, Jericho, Jerusalem and Golgotha. Finally, the crossfertilization of

ideas at international conferences served to strengthen identity. Through these men "the Christian message continued to arouse a more widespread claim to non-racial social justice among those who were not necessarily regular churchgoers". 

Furthermore, even when the super-ordinate claims of Black Africans identity were proclaimed by the ANC they still showed both religious and political influences. The Rev. J.A. Calata addressing the Cape African National Congress said that,

"the same people who say that Missionaries must teach the Native the principles of the Christian religion, also say that there can be no equality between the black and white in church and state."

During the Defiance Campaign in 1952 frequent use of biblical references was made. The Rev. J. Skomolo, senior Chaplain of the African National Congress conceived of the struggle for justice and equality as a holy war in which all Christians had a duty to participate in opposition to the injustices of the oppressor.


These leaders made sonorous appeals for justice arguing with reason and resolution. The main thrust of their argument was that overt and covert racism must be abolished in South African society thereby ushering in a new age of equality and political participation of all races in the political decision-making processes. Dr. Walter Rubusana who was the only black man ever to be elected to the Cape Provincial Council and who led a delegation in 1909 to petition the British Parliament to remove discriminatory provisions of the South African Act\textsuperscript{23} said that Christians who insisted on a racialist approach were hypocrites. If race feeling was not attacked "Christianity was all bumkum, it was empty."\textsuperscript{24} As we have indicated above the African Nationalist Congress's call for unity was influenced by politics. Although they maintained a strong sense of identity, they did not prevent the Hertzog's disenfranchisement Bill from taking the Black Africans off the common voter's roll in the Cape. However, the transformed structures of white economic and political hegemony after the 1936 Land Act did lead to a growing nationalist consciousness among the Blacks. The attack on the Cape Franchise provided an important stimulus for the development of black


political elite which had a set of shared values. It is significant to note that the disappearance of an identifiable White liberal tradition coincided with the abolition of the Cape African franchise and this meant that the black political leadership was capable of being affected by an indigenous political ideology in the form of Africanism.

The ideological differences had a disintegrating effect on Black identity. There were "tribal" and regional divisions amongst the Black elite itself. For example, after the 1913 Land Act there were divisions between the Transvaal and Natal branches of the ANC after the Rev. Dr. John L. Dube had resigned as president over the issue of land segregation. Similarly, in the Cape in the 1920's, James Thaele had espoused a version of Caribbean Garveyist ideology as president of the Cape African National Congress whilst at the same time editing a paper called The African World. This political shift towards Garveyism had included some questionable land business. Thaele had sought to establish a land company in partnership with Bennett Ncwana.

After this had failed Thaele disappeared from the political scene with the funds of the Cape branch of the ANC which had been raised from the sale of the Congress hall in Cape Town.  

The Umteteleli Wabantu newspaper indicates the contemporary impact of ideological divisions upon the identity of the African National Congress. There was a severe ideological dispute between Josiah Gumede, the 1928 National President of the Congress and Selby Msimang. The latter felt that there was nothing being done to counteract the four Native Bills, except for pious resolutions passed at meetings here and there." There was a great need, he argued, to mobilise the whole Black nation to protest against the provisions of the Bills.  

The former tried to draw the movement closer to the Industrial Commercial Worker's Union (I.C.U.) after his return from Brussels where he had attended the meeting of the League Against Imperialism in 1928. From there he had a trip to the Soviet Union. At that time there is a sense in which the new search for identity may be seen to have brought about a discontinuity in identity as it became necessary to break off ties with those elements of the past which were inimical to the demands of the present. However,

29. Umteteleli Wa Bantu Newspaper, January 7, 1928.
there is in identity-formation a tendency towards internal unity and integration of various parts in order to minimize friction and to maximize function. Thus the minimization of friction led to a unity of purpose between the All African Convention in the Cape and the African National Congress. Seen in theoretical terms in order to minimize friction within identity, Jabavu organized the Blacks on the basis of the Native Voter's Convention of the Cape. He wrote to Sir Walter Stanford and said, "It is now taking us all our time to preserve our old rights."

The process of minimization of friction brought together all organizations in the eastern Cape to present a united front of African demands. For example, in February 1926 a meeting was called in King Williamstown by the Rev. Dr. W.B. Rubusana together with D.D.T. Jabavu and B.B. Xiniwe as Secretary, to endorse the respective policy resolutions opposing the Franchise. These resolutions were from the Bantu Union, the Ciskei Native Voter's Convention and the Cape Native Voter's Convention.

---


In 1928 the Cape Native Voter's Convention passed the following resolution,

"Your petitioners humbly submit that the solid and undivided opinion of all thinking natives in the Union uncompromisingly opposes any tampering with the Cape Native Franchise".33

Yet, in order to revitalise Black identity, it was felt that Gumede who was president of the ANC should step down. Indeed in 1930 he was replaced by Pixley Seme who reorganized the ANC by strengthening the upper House of Chiefs. But the growing black leadership in the urban areas was dissatisfied with his efforts also.34 These issues played a significant role in the process of minimization of friction by integrating identity in order to resist attack by "an increasingly coercive State dominated by an alliance of mining capital and agriculture."35 Furthermore, Dr. D.D.T. Jabavu, President of the Cape Native Voter's Convention convened a meeting in Bloemfontein under the mayorship of T.M. Mapikela, to discuss the formation of the All African Convention.

33. Imvo Zabantsundu, January 3, 1928.
In 1935 the President of the African National Congress Pixley Seme was asked by Dr. Jabavu to preside at the All African Convention Conference.\textsuperscript{36} We have indicated above that there is a tendency in identity to move towards internal unity of purpose. When this occurs there is the maximization of function which comes as a result of the minimization of friction and this happened when the All African Convention and the ANC established a good working arrangement and this served in turn as internal regeneration of the Congress.

Here in our argument we postulate in theoretical terms a movement from the self towards other selves existing in a similar historical setting. We have applied this insight to the interpretation of the formation of the ANC and South African social formation in more general terms. Identity-formation is intimately related to the rise in South African social activism which we have examined with regard to the origins of the South African National Congress and its struggles for unity. We may also regard the convergence of several identities at Bloemfontein in 1912 as a symbolic integration of identities who had hitherto been divided politically along lines of particularistic loyalties to ethnic language, tribe and denomination. In effect they pass from the interpretation of the individual existential situation

\textsuperscript{36}. Walshe, P. 1970 \textit{The Rise of African Nationalism in South Africa}. 
to the processes involved in the formation of a supra-tribal organization which, influenced by religious, political and ideological factors questioned a social order that denied equality between Black and White. Emanating from this supra-tribal identity there came a rising crescendo of condemnation of the racism in South Africa which was ultimately perceived by the ANC as a negation of the image in which God had made man.

The location of the religious factor in national identity is essentially popular among sociologists who follow Durkheim's functional theory of religion and who, with him, see the symbolic integration of society as the primary function of religion. From this perspective the power and authority which reside in society itself vis-a-vis the individual are the source of that sense of awe and loyalty which is referred as "religious".37 Seen from a Durkheimian standpoint the integral relation based on morality, of religion and politics in the policy of the ANC formed the prophetic denunciation of the racist social policies of the Apartheid system. While the African National Congress struggle for the unity of races is indeed a significant contribution to the understanding of the rise of social activism and the mission of the church in South Africa, the focus of this all-inclusive

identity on the variable of race has been the object of considerable criticism. This approach is, in fact, especially problematic for use in the hermeneutic explanation of the mission of the church because it misidentified that which underpinned the South African social structure, that is, class. Focussing on the variable of race, the Rev. E.Z. Mahabane, one of the outstanding past presidents of the ANC, argued that the most fundamental issue was that of human rights which were denied in the principle of political segregation embodied in the Native Affairs Act of 1920. Stressing this variable on the occasion of the formation of the Christian Council of Churches in South Africa in 1937, Mahabane said,

"The Council had to take an interest in political affairs and speak out against recent legislation based on fear and against injustices of every kind, for only if these issues of the colour bar were investigated could Christians present a picture of Jesus Christ."39

These arguments indicate that the rise of South African social activism within the context of the origins of the ANC did not employ a materialist conception of history. This was made explicit by Nelson Mandela at the Rivonia Trial when he said that

ANC ideological creed was not to be identified with the Marxist economic view of social reality. The Marxist analysis emphasized class distinction while that of the African National Congress sought to harmonize them. If the ANC had believed in the Marxist social theory they would have begun from the proposition that the means of production was the basis of the South African social structure and from this point of view the thrust of their argument would have questioned the manner in which wealth was distributed and also the division of society into classes. However, because they belonged to a tradition which originated in integrationist missionary teaching and practice with its later anti-communist tendencies, they sought an answer to the problem in religion and idealistic philosophy rather than in economics.

Meanwhile, it suffices to observe at this juncture that from 1912 to 1960 the complexion of the identity of the African National Congress as an organization resembled in broad terms that of the Christian Citizenship department of the Methodist Church of South Africa. Thus with regard to both its descriptive and prescriptive tasks its activities were presented in the form of resolutions and sonorous appeals for justice. Seemingly, in this situation an emphasis on class-distinction would have served to blur the issue of the unity of race. In order to develop

critique of South African society we have conversely to employ elements of Marxist social theory, in particular that of alienation.

7.2 Alienation and Social Transformation

The preceding section has reviewed the rise of South African social activism within the context of the origins of the identity of the African National Congress. However, as we have indicated above our present concern is to apply the theory of alienation to South African society in order to disclose at a deeper level of analysis factors neglected in the philosophy of the ANC.

On the basis of Karl Marx's conception of history, we argue that the concept of alienation may expose the divisions and contradictions of the South African society. Whilst missionary Christianity tended to function ideologically in support of the dominant classes, it also postulated a reconciliation of the contradictions in which groups of people oppose each other as strangers and enemies in the form of a vertical, spiritual relation of man to God. However, the task of de-alienation

43. Ollman, B. 1971 Alienation: Marx's Conception of Man in Capitalist Society, p. 131. Cambridge At the University Press.

ought also to be a constitutive aspect in the critical interpretation of South African Christianity. Here alienation refers to a theory which has a long history in sociology but which has been recently singled out for extensive theoretical discussion. The modern origins of the theory are, as we have already indicated, to be found in the sociological writings of Marx.\textsuperscript{45} Contrastingly, de-alienation indicates that which provides the basis for the transformation of society in order to bring into being a form of society that should stimulate the development of justice and freedom.\textsuperscript{46}

According to Marx the source of class division is to be found in capitalism is expressed in the appropriation of the surplus value produced by the proletariat and exploited by the bourgeoisie.\textsuperscript{47} Two issues may illuminate our analysis of the Marxian thought. First there is the separation with concomitant polarization between the bourgeoisie and the proletariat. Here, a wedge is driven between classes in order to emphasize the intensity of


\textsuperscript{47} Marx, K. 1977 Economic and Philosphic Manuscripts of 1844, pp. 66-80. (Progress Publishers, Moscow).
their conflict. Second, there is nature and role of bourgeoisie in capitalist societies and how they have managed to use the state in order to become a dominant group in society. In this situation of conflict Marx argues that there is a possibility of the proletariat rising up and pushing the historical forces to the next stage where the means of production will be in their hands thereby ushering in a classless society. While our concern is not whether this has or will happen, we may here detect a pattern of thesis in conflict with antithesis giving rise to a synthesis. Explicit in the theory of alienation is the proposition that the individual in capitalist society has been estranged both from his labour and from himself. This concept is, however, distinguishable from the concept of anomie which was initially formulated by Emile Durkheim in 1899 who identified the anomic social system as something which is characterized by a relative failure of normative order, a lack of moral regulations over human strivings and passions. In seeking to explain these phenomena, he postulated that anomic societies produce certain psychological states in many of their individual members. So, while alienation indicates the psycho-social

49. Ibid, pp. 81-88.
50. Ibid, pp. 101, 120.
52. Ibid, pp. 247-276.
state of an individual or class characterised by feelings of estrangement, anomie refers to the relative normlessness of a social system.

This section of our thesis is based on several presuppositions, the most basic of which we have already referred to, namely, that mission Christianity has in some forms become a false resolution of the divisions and contradictions of the South African society. There are clearly some problems in applying Marx's insights in the African society because Marxism developed primarily in a European context and was applied to the analysis of relations in the means of production and class formation in capitalist industrial societies. Given the European context, the concepts of race and racial conflicts were given less attention. Although our thesis regards class as a prime variable in South African social structure, it is necessary to allow for references to race, particularly in the contextualization of alienation. The second problem is that Karl Marx was an atheist. Of course, we argued in the foregoing pages of this chapter that he would be used as a tool for analysis only. Finally, we need to point out that the whole concept of alienation, which involves, among other things, the taking away from us of the fruits of our own labour, the "using" of one person by another and the doctrine of the state itself, are in our view, all logically compatible with the idea of God. 53 Belief in God is important to the Christian's

whole conception of human society and of social justice. Very briefly, in a situation such as the one we have outlined above, it is virtually impossible for two groups of people to be related to one another as fellow human beings. The exploited looks upon the exploiter as an inhuman force controlling his basic humanity. In other words actual social division is so extreme that Christian endorsement of the state becomes in effect impossible and we turn to elsewhere for adequate explanation. Marxism is indispensable in limited sense.

The notion that religion as such constitutes the alienation of man from his true being belongs properly to Ludwig Feuerbach. From Feuerbach, Marx learnt how to interpret Hegel critically. Feuerbach in his critique of the philosophy of Hegel attached Hegel's view that nature is a self-alienated form of Absolute Mind and that man is in the process of seeking de-alienation. Feuerbach argued that God is self-alienated man. He is merely man's essence abstracted, absolutized and estranged from man. Thus man is alienated from himself when he puts above himself an imagined alien higher being and bows before him as a slave.

The de-alienation of man is the abolition of that estranged picture of man which is God. Without necessarily accepting Feuerbach's individualistic assumptions about alienation, Marx agreed with Feuerbach's criticism of religious alienation but emphasised that man does not only alienate a part of himself in the form of God but also alienates other products of his spiritual activity in the form of philosophy, economics, labour and the State itself. However, Marx followed the Feuerbachian interpretation in his own critical philosophy to the extent that he began with the critical analysis of religion. Very briefly, we should say that, although religion was not fundamental to Marx, it was important to him because it provided the model by which he could reveal the true nature of the false consciousness surrounding such institutions as the state, labour and private property. 57

We showed in Chapter four of this thesis how Christianity in South Africa tended to function ideologically. 58 The acquiescence of religion in Western forces such as colonialism, imperialism and capitalism served to legitimate the dominant

58. See Chapter Four of this Thesis.
classes. Of the attitudes of the dominant classes, Wilson and Perrot have written,

"According to our [native] estimation gentlemen, among Europeans are of two classes, gentlemen by birth and those who become gentlemen because they have money. The attitude of these two classes towards the native is very different. The one is for raising the native, the other, for repressing. The diamond and the goldfields especially the latter has produced a large number of "money gentlemen" whose influence was beginning to assert itself and to sour the native mind all over South Africa."

Wilson and Perrot's statement makes it clear that although class attitudes may be used for the improvement of certain natives in society, it also perpetuates the oppression of the dominated classes. As a fundamental variable in South African social formation class has often been maintained by religion, indeed the ideas of the Church were influenced by the ideas of the ruling class. The truth of the matter was expressed by the Ecumenical Dialogue of Third World theologians meeting held in Dar es


Salaam, Tanzania, in 1976. In a statement issued by this body an acknowledgement of the good work done by the missionaries was made, but it was pointed out that while engaged in the task of winning souls for the Kingdom of God, the missionaries believed that military expansion of the Western nations was a providential opportunity for the spread of the good news of the gospel. By a process of colonization, the putting together in a single package of commerce, civilization and Christianity validated the oppression of the dominated classes. On the basis of this statement the dedication of the missionaries to the spiritual welfare of humanity has an ambiguity which was resolved on the side of material wealth insofar as they embraced these Western forces. Demonstrating how the church in South Africa functioned ideologically in support of the ideas and beliefs of the ruling class Dr. A.A. Boesak said that the history of Christianity in South Africa, particularly as reflected in Dutch Reformed theology, has been a theological justification of the ideology of Apartheid. Thus the so-called Landman Report accepts Apartheid as sanctioned by the Word of God. Boesak's statement appears to affirm the Marxian notion that religion is the "Opiate of the


people". The vertical emphasis on the individual soul and God with a concomitant sanctioning of the immoral social power of the ruling class constitutes not only a mystification of the Word of God but also prevents human beings from becoming what they should be. Of this point of view, Dr. David Jenkins, the Bishop of Durham has said, "Christian identity cannot be fully discovered or completed until human identity is fully enjoyed."

Yet alienation has fragmented the social body into antagonistic classes in which the dominant classes have converted the dominated ones into "things" so that they could appear in the form of commodities on the market. As we have indicated, Christianity in South Africa has become a false resolution despite its efforts to cope critically with society's internal contradictions. These contradictions appear to be overcome through an illusory "reappropriation" of the "human essence" and a supersession of the state of alienation.\textsuperscript{64} The wholeness and integrity of the social body has not only been fragmented by Dutch Reformed theology and the Apartheid Government. In a partial duplication of the role of the dominant classes, the English multiracial churches have in many respects retained the

\textsuperscript{63} Jenkins, D.E. 1976 The Contradiction of Christianity, p. 23. (SCM Press Ltd.)

subtleties of the cultural superiority complex and racial arrogance in their reluctance to move towards the unity of Black and White which should be visibly expressed in mixed racial worship in the local chapel down the street.

The Marxist historical investigation of social change has, whilst emphasizing the concept of alienation, developed another line which is referred to as de-alienation. In South Africa a call for de-alienation has normally come from the assembled church which is used here to indicate a gathering of people in the name of God. Here, de-alienation has been primarily in terms of simple denunciations of the phenomena of alienation in society generally. Whether or not participation in an assembled church and religiously based friendships are really indicators of religious commitment is open to question. We should, however, argue that commitment must be seen in terms of a wider praxis. Here praxis refers in general to action and self-creative activity through which man makes and changes his historical, human world and himself. Praxis should be perceived as a central concept of Marxism and Marxism as the philosophy of praxis. In the Economic and Philosophic Manuscripts of 1844, Marx suggests that theory should be regarded as one form of


praxis, but he reaffirms the opposition between theory and praxis and insists on the overall primacy of praxis. We shall return to the theological conception of praxis in the following chapter.

We have claimed that in South African Christianity there have been calls from the assembled church for de-alienation. Here we argue that de-alienation can be reduced to the problem of social transformation and in turn the problem of social transformation be equated with the abolition of private property. The de-alienation of society and individuals are complementary but are distinguishable in particular political contexts. To argue for de-alienation is to call for a just society, as in the case of the South African Council of Churches, which endorsed the Freedom Charter originally adopted by the Congress of the People on 26 June, 1955. The Charter had, however, omitted any reference to the abolition of classes and the establishment of public ownership of the means of production. This is a highly significant point in our argument for we maintain the position that the abolition of the private property can be distinguished from the development of de-alienated individuals on the basis of the transformation of society, particularly in the African communalistic tradition.

The main demands of the Freedom Charter were as follows:

"The People Shall Govern
All National Groups have Equal Rights.
The People Shall Share in the Country's Wealth.
The Land Shall be Shared
Among those who work it
All Shall be Equal before the Law
All Shall Enjoy Equal Human Rights.
There shall be work and
Security for all
The Doors of Learning and Culture shall be opened.
There Shall be Houses, Security and Comfort
There shall be Peace and Friendship."68

Explicit in the Charter was the assertion that, "the mineral wealth beneath the soil, the banks and monopoly industry shall be transferred to the ownership of the people." Although we could refer to the South African Blacks as a "proletariat", when we take into consideration the impact of urbanization and industrialization on South Africa immediately after World War II, we can regard the Charter envisaged, however, a bourgeois democracy based on natural rights, liberalism and equality of opportunity for all.69 In terms of the Marxist conception of


69. The Treason Trial Record. The Original Copy is held by the Institute of Race Relations in Johannesburg, South Africa.
history the Freedom Charter was a non-Marxist document which omitted the "abolition of classes" and the transfer of all the means of production to state ownership.

The Charter called for transformation of South African society in its affirmation that South Africa belonged to all its inhabitants. The signatories envisaged a non-racial, democratic system of government, equal protection for all racial groups before the law. This was a revolutionary document in the sense that it was then inconceivable that these ideas could be realised without recourse to violence. The distribution of land, the removal of restrictions on domestic and family life and equal work and educational opportunities for all were some of the issues with which the Church was concerned in order that a climate of justice and racial tolerance should be created.

Although the South African religious experience representative of the church tended to make calls for de-alienative transformation, it failed to demystify the ideological distortions and unmask the fundamental problems of the social structure of South Africa. The failure to provide the necessary insights with which to unmask aspects of society was partly due to Christianity's alignment with the Western forces of colonialism, imperialism and capitalism. Consequently the Church as an institution appeared

to embody a false resolution of the divisions and contradictions of South African society and this necessitated the rise of the Black Theology of liberation\(^71\) which was a vehement and corrective critique of both Christianity and racist practices in South African society.\(^72\)

7.3 The Rise of Black Theology

In basic terms Black theology in South Africa has been used to address Black conditions in the light of God's revelation in Jesus Christ so that Black communities could see the Word of God as having a common purpose with the search for Black identity and humanity. Given this presupposition, Black theology referred to a distinct-awareness of "blackness".\(^73\) Here nevertheless there is a bipolar affirmation of both Black and White humanity yet the former affirms its humanity through its emancipation from White racism. The Black negation of White oppression emancipates the humanity of the White person, for oppression dehumanises both the oppressor and oppressed. There are two corollaries of the South African interpretation of Black theology. First, the White

---


Church in its use of Christianity as a source of consolation and as a justification of the oppression of Blacks has blurred the fundamental imperatives of the mission of the Church of Jesus Christ. Thus, second, it reaffirms the message of liberation which is the revelation of God in the incarnation of Jesus Christ. Here the conception of freedom properly understood is the gospel and Jesus is the liberator.

The position of Black theology in South Africa may be traced to the works of James Cone, Professor of Systematic Theology at Union Theological Seminary in New York, United States of America. Dr. Basil Moore, a South African Methodist minister and Director of the University Christian Movement (U.C.M.) was so profoundly influenced by Cone that in 1971 he introduced Black theology to the South African religious experience. The initial stages of Black theology were developed by Moore together with other colleagues, among whom were Mokgethi Motlhabi and Sabelo Ntwasa. Motlhabi was responsible for the publication of the volume Essays in Black Theology which was immediately banned.


by the South African government together with Ntwasá who was then a student at the Federal Theological Seminary of Southern Africa in Alice, South Africa. Subsequently the Essays appeared overseas under a different title in a volume in which three essays on black consciousness were also included. Black theology and Black consciousness were dynamic forces which expressed contextually the needs and urgency of Black empowerment. Black theology emerged from Black consciousness and strove to give credibility to the Word of God to the latter movement and to the nation generally. Given a Christianity functioning as a representation of the contradictions of South African society, Black theology claimed that Black people in South Africa were discriminated against and thus alienated on the basis of the colour of their skin. With the dehumanising racist South African social structures in mind, Black theology asserts that theology must be contextual. Contextualization should be distinguished from indigenization. The former denotes a theology that is directed to the situation from which it arises. It thus springs out of the religious experience of a distinct group of people in a particular situation. Although it may engage in dialogue with other theologies in the world it maintains its own

76. Ibid, p. 223.


particularity and takes seriously the struggle for justice and humaneness. The latter process of indigenization is based on the African cultural dimension with its emphasis on the past rather than present and the future.\(^79\) Black theology is a corrective of White Christianity in that it does not deal with the question of theodicy abstractly with reference to the speculative origins of evil, but it strongly asserts that God takes the side of the oppressed and suffers with them and inspires them to engage with the dehumanizing forces of white racism in order to bring about their own liberation.\(^80\) The Bible is read in and from the Black situation. A Black theologian recognizes his own situation in dialogue with biblical text in the presence of God: "It is a critical theology, coming from people of faith, who suffer and from a position of weakness struggle to realise the human image of God in which they are created."\(^81\) Finally, in calling for a de-denominationalization of the Black people, Black theology corrects White christianity, for it was the early missionaries who denominationized African society with labels such as


"Methodist", "Anglican", "Roman Catholic", "Presbyterian", and so on. All these labels are but divisive to say the least. Black people are Black before they are Christian.

The above arguments indicate that Black theology is concerned in fundamental terms with racism. Very briefly, we may say that it draws attention to racist practices in South African society which constitute a most vicious form of oppression and alienation. Racism disfigures our basic human identity. In Black theology we are provided with a cogent critical argument and a judgement upon the ways in which the South African social structure has failed to make us whole as human beings.

Against Black theology it can be argued that it is insufficiently thorough in its critique of the South African social structure. There is the absence of a synthesis between indigenization and contextualization in African theology which is reflected in turn in the Black theology of liberation. Black theology appears to be exclusively concerned with the struggle for political liberation with an implicit negation of the cultural contribution made by African indigenous theology. There should somehow be a symbiotic relationship between the two for we ought to be liberated from oppression in order to become what we were meant

to be, namely, liberated Black human beings. Therefore our culture should be equally significant in the theological understanding of the struggle for liberation. We also object to the fact that in Black theology race constitutes the fundamental variable in its understanding of the South African social structure. It is true, however, that the unity of race and class constitutes a distinctive feature of the South African social structure. Although Black theology recognises that racism intensifies the degree of alienation among the black people, it has no socio-economic theory. Thus Black theology has not dealt adequately with the source of enrichment which is Gold. The virtual entombment of Black people in the Goldfields for the primary purpose of digging something up over which they have no control has been omitted from Black theological analysis. In other words Black theology should grapple with the dynamics of capitalism because the moneyed group of people in society play a decisive role politically and religiously. This would require a radical shift from Black theologies of racial inclusion to a theology of liberation which recognises more fully the primacy of the economic factors and their social consequences.

In this chapter we have reviewed two approaches which have confronted the South African situation, namely, the African National Congress's struggle for Unity and the Black theology related to Black consciousness. Both tend to see race as the fundamental problem of the South African social structure. We have indicated in the above arguments that the African National Congress was manned by mission-educated Blacks who inherited the prophetic dimension of the mission of the Church expressed in the descriptive and prescriptive tasks expected of a people in pilgrimage. Although the movements in the rise of social activism which we have analysed in this chapter seem not to have employed Marxist social theory, the concepts of alienation and de-alienation have served to throw some light on the underlying socio-economic structures of South Africa. Whereas Marxism unmasks that which buttresses the mode of production, Black theology of liberation as a critique of the South African social formation called simply for the transition of society from racism to justice and equality. Having examined these strands of political theological protest against racism in South Africa in their social and cultural context, we now move in accordance with our Segundian theory of interpretation onto an enhanced level of theological analysis. In this we recognise the full reality of the socio-economic position of Christianity and attempt to bring together the successive stages of our analysis.
CHAPTER EIGHT
ORGANISED RELIGION AND THE DENUNCIATORY INHERITANCE OF MISSION

In the preceeding Chapter we reflected theoretically on the social activist movements of the African National Congress and Black Theology. The task that now confronts us is to reflect once more theologically upon the total situation exposed by the appraisal of the cultural, social and political dimensions of the problem of the identity of the Church in South Africa. We begin with a survey of the relevant general theological factors that should inform our understanding of the role of theology in relation to the question of religious identity, we then provide a typology of the Churches in South Africa formulated according to these basic principles we have outlined. In the final section of this Chapter we put forward two theological models which may function as a means of developing the identity of the Church in the context of its sacramental life and of compensating for some of the denominational weaknesses isolated earlier.

8.1 General Theological Factors

According to our unpublished research raw material,¹ it would seem that the religious identity of the church reflects itself in

---

¹ Unpublished Research material on Cassette No. 10015 (A).
the social and political dimension which constitute social reality. However, there is a confusion as to how this intersection takes place. It is a confusion from which two contrasting views emerge, one insists on the religious distinctiveness of the identity of the Church, and the other, holds the view that the Church in her identity must engage with society particularly in situations of political conflict. Here we contend that the religious identity of the Church in relation to its social and political mission is the realization of the Kingdom of God in the here and now. Jesus Christ's conception of the Kingdom of God was grounded in eschatology which refers to the teaching concerning "the last things". In the teaching of Jesus Christ the Kingdom of God was essentially an eschatological event and its coming was conceived to be immanent, that is, affirming and emphasizing the indwelling presence of God in the World. Immanence is distinguishable from transcendence, which

2. Research material on Cassette No. 10015 (B).
3. Ibid, Research Material Cassette No. 10015 (B).
epistemologically indicates God's incomprehensibility and this sometimes seems to be equivalent to total unknowability in certain types of mysticism but it may be combined with the doctrine of revelation which holds that it is the believer in Christ who is truly aware of how incomprehensible God is. According to Barth\(^7\) God's transcendence actualizes itself in love and his being expresses itself in the event of his action in Jesus Christ, crucified and risen. But in our view eschatology should be marked by a radical transformation of the present order and the inauguration of the New Age in which the rule of God would be fully manifest. We distinguish this, however, from Apocalypse which denotes the destruction of the forces of evil in a cosmic cataclysm and conflict.

There is a "correlation" between the mission of the Church and Jesus Christ in traditional fundamental theology.\(^8\) It is a correlation which is underscored by "intention" and "ontology".\(^9\) Very briefly, intention is indicative of the view that Jesus Christ founded the Church for a specific purpose. Ontology denotes that the very being of the Church is grounded in grace.

\(^7\) Barth, K. *Church Dogmatics*, 11/1, 1957, pp. (vi), 28-31.


and salvation found in Jesus Christ. We may dispute this principle of intention by arguing that the eschatological consciousness of Jesus is in fact a negation of the formation of the institutional Church and that this has been overlooked by traditional fundamental theology. Nevertheless traditional fundamental theology has made a clear distinction between nature and supernature.

Nature refers to the physical world including human beings and institutions. Traditional fundamental theology claims that nature has its own goal which is antithetical to that of the Church. We may detect this view in both the thirteenth century Roman Catholic Church orders and in the Renaissance. Very briefly, it was the Renaissance which promoted the philosophy of Nature. The idea that nature speaks to us of God was defined. As we have indicated above, there were opposing tendencies in the Roman Catholic Church during the thirteenth century. On the one hand, the Franciscans showed an interest in all things in the World, and, on the other hand, the Dominicans whose spirit derived from Aristotle represented by Thomas Aquinas elaborated a


philosophy that theology tended towards abstraction. We will return to this point in our discussion of supernature. The Franciscans, particularly those of the Chartres and Oxford Schools did not go as far as the Jewish Qabbalah which was more concerned with a theosophy of the relationships between God and man. Theosophy stressed the possibility of knowing God by knowing nature and this influenced Christian theology. The Durkheimian school of thought may throw some light on how the religious interlocks with nature. The Durkheimians claim that religious utterances are best interpreted as symbolic assertions about society. The actual object of religious worship is the social group and thus religious behaviour can be fully explained in a systematic science of society.13

The Durkheimians are proponents of what is called the functional theory of religion which may be distinguished from the substantive content understudy of the sociology of religion. In our view there is no ultimate contradiction between the functional and substantive definitions of religion. However, the substantive content of religion is a focus of traditional fundamental theology in that the supernature of the Church is distinguished from nature and made determinative of the mission of the church in the World.

The term "supernature" is used here to refer to belief in and an emphasis on the supernatural as defined by Thomas Aquinas and the Scholastics. According to Despland the notion of the supernatural has antecedents in the works of the Hellenistic thinkers and Church Fathers. He argues that the Neoplatonists referred to heaven as a divine sphere beyond both this World and human beings. In Christian tradition the divine realm is identical with the presence of God as a being who is above nature and eternally self-subsistent. God is a being who, to use Spiro’s word, "interacts" with human beings. The consequences of such interaction were expressed for us in the redemptive acts of God through Jesus Christ who brought benefits that were beyond the capacity of human beings and here there is a link between grace and the supernatural. This, as we have alluded to above, was articulated in scholastic theology. Briefly, Thomas Aquinas taught that in the Fall man was hurt in his very identity and the consequences of this were that he lost his supernatural gifts, especially access to the vision of God. God in his grace, according to Thomistic theology, restores and heals the wounds of man by opening the ways of communion with God. Here there is an


15. Ibid, p. 159.

articulation of a theological thought which reflects the antithesis between the natural and supernatural. In the passage of time God in Christ has reconciled nature and supernature, the sacred and the profane, the particular and general, the personal and social. Yet the traditional fundamental Theology as we have demonstrated in the foregoing pages of the thesis makes the Church distinct and its mission primarily oriented towards a supernatural goal which becomes an abstraction when it is removed from what can be referred to as "nature" as in the pursuit of the beatific vision. The notion of the beatific vision refers to a state of utter benignity with the complete happiness of saved souls in Heaven. 17

The beatific vision as the goal of the mission of the Church is, on the one hand, a negation of Enlightenment teachings and on the other hand, an affirmation of both the Thomistic distinction of nature and grace and the nineteenth century Lutheran Theology of the two Kingdoms. Here we argue that because the Enlightenment rejected supernatural revelation in Christianity, it also rejected the beatific vision of the Church.

Although there were theological shifts during the post-Enlightenment period, it would seem to us that in overall terms the Thomistic Theology lay behind what we call here the beatific vision of the Church. The following was the basis of Thomistic theology in that,

"God so created nature and so ordered that, even though the supernatural goal is what nature cannot achieve by itself, the supernatural is still that to which nature tends." 18

The above citation indicates that these views served to distinguish the religious identity of the Church from the social and political imperatives of the Gospel. The Kingdom of God was perceived as the reign of God in the hearts of men. Here there is a dichotomy between the "spiritual" and the "worldly" realm of life. This view was well articulated by Martin Luther who was a medieval man and believed in natural law with natural order in society with legitimate rulers of their own areas. 19 This, according to Luther, provided a structure conducive to an orderly and just society to be obeyed. The biblical basis for such


obedience was Romans thirteen. With this background, he postulated the doctrine of the two Kingdoms upon which, as indicated above, the beatific vision of the Mission of the Church is based.

Paul Althaus in The Ethics of Martin Luther (1972) asserts that Luther's understanding of the love of God is expressed in two related ways. First, the love of God is within the realm of the Kingdom of God, that is, the Regnum Christi, where God rules with his right hand. Second, there is the realm of the World where God rules with his left hand. The former is distinguished from the latter in that the love of God rules within the hearts and minds of Christians who are under grace and live according to the gospel rather than the law. But, in the latter God rules indirectly through the so called orders of creation, such as, Government, school, home, judges, and so on. These orders are said to have been instituted by God to resist chaos in the World after the Fall of creation.

Luther argued that the realm of politics is essentially secular in the sense that rational political analysis should be left to the rulers who cannot be expected to implement biblical laws in a specific and explicit manner. This political "secular" rule in

Luther's mind is ordained and sanctioned by God.\textsuperscript{21} However, the task of a Christian in such a situation is to use the opportunities of involvement in society and government to create a more just society.\textsuperscript{22} The traditional fundamental theology according to Fiorenza refers to the Lutheran doctrine of the two kingdoms and emphasizes, "the distinction between the gospel and law."\textsuperscript{23} The "Law-Gospel debate"\textsuperscript{24} reflects a dialectic between the religious identity of the Church and its social and political mission in this World. Does this dialectic imply that we should distinguish the religious identity of the Church from the social imperatives of the Gospel? Of course, as we have indicated, the exponents of the beatific vision would agree on the basis of either classical Thomism or the Lutheran interpretation of the two kingdoms. In disputing such a thesis as unsustainable we should say that recent research would lead to the view that the Thomistic distinction between nature and grace was not intended as the separation of the two spheres. It rather emphasised the

\begin{itemize}
\item 23. Fiorenza, F.S. 1984 Foundation Theology : Jesus and the Church, p. 201.
\end{itemize}
perceptible yet inseparable dimensions of social reality. The doctrine of the two Kingdoms to which the beatific notion is related has itself several limitations. First, to separate the religious from the spiritual realm is a limitation of the mission of the Church. It implies that our faith is a private affair which excludes Christ from our daily experience of reality and our dealings with the World. That interpretation is a distortion of Luther's views. He did not mean to say that, otherwise he could not have spoken of the rule of God on the left hand. The engagement of Christians with the world in the name of God who revealed himself in Christ does not mean that they are serving autonomous spheres but God. Second, to argue that in Christ we are free and the will of God is in our hearts and that therefore there is no need for rules and regulations is again a distortion of Luther's position. Here the gospel is both the end and the fulfillment of the law at the same time. If you want to know what you should do as a Christian, then go into the World and you will see the needs of your neighbour and the world. The love of God will teach you what is expected of you in such a situation. As we have indicated above, the separation of the spiritual from the worldly realm may mean to some spiritually-focussed


27. Ibid, pp. 192-267.
Christians that obedience is something that springs up from us through the Holy Spirit without the external preached Word of God. Yet, we contend, Luther did not say that but that the Holy Spirit always works with the preached Word. In Pauline theology the indicative of the gospel message is followed by the imperative of the exhortation. This exhortation is very concrete and specific.

Correspondingly, in Lutheran theology the exhortation is not the law but it is part of the gospel. It is not a demand which we have to fulfill so that we may earn salvation. The exhortation is the creative Word of God which has social implications in obedience to God's love revealed to us in Jesus Christ in a concrete situation. Finally, the doctrine of the two kingdoms with which the traditional fundamental theology argued to support its claims of the beatific vision as the mission of the Church seems to have been more rational, less rigid and more pragmatic in its approach to the establishment of a more just society than might first appear. Here the worldly realm is in constant interaction with the spiritual realm. The above insights show that regarding the Church in its mission as having been completed is incorrect because when we speak of God and salvation we are in fact referring to incomplete experiences.

Assuming the inseparability of the religious from the mundane as presented in the above arguments the basic question of the nature of that which is religious is raised. Here, we argue that the religious is not an isolated experience but a dimension of human experience interpretable in sociological terms. Of religion Durkheim has written,

"A religion is a unified system of beliefs and practices relative to Sacred things, that is to say, things set apart and forbidden—beliefs are practices which unite into one single moral community called a Church all those who adhere to it." 29

Durkheim's statement shows that even totemic rites could be classified as religious because these rites have reference to sacred beings and objects. Thus rites of birth and circumcision which were discussed in Chapter Three of this thesis could be classified as religious. They are religious because they refer to the spiritual Ancestral beings. Although Hammond-Tooke has not provided a religious interpretation of totemism in South Africa, he admits that the (Amampondomise) tribe have a totem called, (umajola-inyoka yasekhaya), the snake of the home. 30 The (Amahlubi) clan regard the Crab, (unonkala), as sacred and its

31. See Chapter Three of this Thesis.
appearance in the house is perceived as the ancestral visitation. As we have said in the above arguments the circumcision ceremony as a rite when properly understood implies a religious conception of the place of man in the Universe. Ritual serves to express the unity, solidarity and identity of the group as we argued earlier.

Basically, it would appear that there are three elements which unite religious adherents into a "single moral community called a Church." The first element consists in rituals which are prescribed acts that are sacred. They give a regulated expression to certain human feelings and sentiments and keep these sentiments alive and active. Second, there are beliefs and shared ideas that explain the nature of things that are defined as sacred. Finally, symbols, objects, images and words represent the beliefs and rituals by giving meanings of their own and they become sacred in their own right. These factors underscore our contention that the religious dimension is not an isolated experience but a dimension of human experience.

Furthermore, our claims are supported by the Roman Catholic Church tradition of the Mass. The term Mass refers to a ritual in which the priest and people re-enact the events of the Last

Supper. In our view this illustrates how beliefs, rituals and symbols operate. This ceremony involves a belief concerning the bread and wine which at a certain moment in the ritual are believed to become transubstantiated into the actual body and blood of Christ. The wafer and wine symbolize the body and blood of Christ and are the objects of awe and reverence. Of course, there is a move away from expressing this doctrine in this way to a doctrine of transignification.\textsuperscript{34} Transignification implies that the fundamental transformation in the Eucharist is not that of the physical entities of bread and wine, but of their deeper reality which is their relationship to God and man. The power of bread and wine to nourish the body and to symbolize natural table-fellowship is transformed into the symbol and the means by which Christ gives himself to his disciples, forming them into his people of the new Covenant and offering them with himself to his father. Very briefly, we should stress that the bread used in the symbolic table-fellowship of the Mass is a secular commodity, that is, something which has been bought from the local general dealer and is given a sacred meaning by religion. For that matter, even water could be given a sacred meaning particularly in the Sacrament of Baptism.

Here the notion of the sacred is always surrounded by mystery. The sacred is something "spiritual" but associated with a particular "representation", to use Pickering's term. The type of representation we have in mind is that of values, sentiment, symbols and myth. These things arise from and are part of the social reality and of peoples' experiences. On this basis it would seem that it is impossible for a person to relate, for example, to bread as a symbol without retaining an idea of natural form. In order for man to relate to bread he should have internalized this conception of it. In other words it must exist in him as a prior representation. From a phenomenological consideration we may use Husserl's term "appresentation". He used this term to explain how a human subject can perceive the ego of another subject only when the body of the other is perceived, not the ego its otherness as mere ego. Because the sacred relates to the notion of representation, it may be impossible to separate the religious from the social. However, the sacred has something that conveys a "transcendent reality" which may be communicated religiously in the process of appresentation, of which Husserl said it involves the following


dynamics. First, an apperceptive transfer takes place because the body of the other resembles my own body. Second, through an associative presentation the other is appresented as the other. Finally, appresentation seems to be an empathetic and imaginative process which is not different from the way in which we objectify the sacred. However, the sacred is beyond the rational. It could be similar to what Otto called the "numinous" experience which gives rise to systems that express the attributes of the numinous such as majesty, awefulness and transcendence. 38

Transcendence is one of the most significant referents which serves to explain a cultural phenomenon as religious. 39 Most scholars place experience at the very centre of the religious. 40 Although this is also theological there is no solid argument to sustain the thesis that the religious identity of the Church should be separated from the social implications of the gospel simply because when we speak of God we imply an incomplete experience. So, to over-stress the religious experience may not be a convincing argument in that we may have "a sense of beauty without believing in Beauty itself". 41

It has been our concern in this chapter to show that what is religious cannot be separated from the social and political components of social reality. The historical and sociological analysis of beliefs, rituals and symbols in church and society indicates that the religious is not an isolated experience but it is a dimension of human experience with a transcendent referent. To bring about the transformation of society requires a radical reappraisal of the present approach to the doing of theology and from this there should be a move towards what could be called, "A cutting edge that integrates religion with the issues of the day." The Church in her entanglement with the world should rediscover the radicalness of the Kingdom of God. In Theology and the Kingdom of God (1969), Segundo asserts that it is the impact of the Kingdom of God upon all dimensions of social reality with which the Church in her mission is concerned. Here, mission is defined as the restoration of a dialectical relationship between the grace of God and the world, thereby bringing about the transformation of Society. This, as we said earlier in this section, presupposes the idea of God. Before we examine the idea of God we should clarify what we mean by faith in God. Very briefly, faith in God means trusting Him and believing in a being that reflects itself in three modes of

fellowship, namely, God the Father, Son and Holy Spirit. There is substantive content to faith, yet faith in the being of God involves a process of learning. 43

Faith as a process of learning cannot be reduced exhaustively to the process. If we did this, the figure of Jesus Christ would be reduced to that of a teacher who merely identifies and orients the believer to the process of learning. 44 God, however, acts in history. In His action He reveals Himself and however partial that self-revelation may be, it is towards that self-revelation that faith is directed and from that self-revelation that faith initiates a response to the exigencies of history. In learning to learn, we argue against Segundo that one is not solely concerned with the process but that in the process something is learnt and that something is not identifiable with the process itself. 45 What is learnt through faith is not only how to learn, but the ways of God with persons.


44. Ibid, pp. 364-365.

There is a conception of God which is the content of faith. There is some degree of continuity between the conception of God given by the experience of faith and God himself. "The idea of a liberating God cannot be separated from historical situations and actions ... because no liberating God is revealed outside of such historical situations." Although it is true that, "no liberating God is revealed outside of historical situations", the idea of God revealed in a given historical situation is an idea which may transcend the situation itself and become available for new situations.

"The political option in favour of liberating change is an intrinsic element of faith ... We can only have an authentic faith, in other words when we have committed ourselves to an authentic struggle".

The context of learning is crucial. Faith generates a content which cannot be reduced to ideology but which is shared with ideology. Given the above arguments that faith produces a conception of God as a "liberating God", then we believe that a commitment to the completion of identity as we have explained it in Chapter Three, is mandatory. Such a commitment opens one, at once and the same time, both to God's future and to a provisional and relative future which is dialectically related to God's

47. Ibid, p. 97.
future. That is to say, faith generates a hope which simultaneously gives shape to the present and the future. It is also true, that faith is the unity of knowing and doing. ⁴⁸

So far as the significance of faith is concerned it could of course be argued that believing in the God who revealed Himself in Jesus Christ incorporates a long history of self-revelation that God directed to his people. History is the undisputed locus of God's activity in the universe. The idea of God we have is of the one who appeared in history.⁴⁹ Here history is not dichotomised into "human" and "divine". Our conception of history is that it "is only one human destiny irreversibly assumed by Christ, the Lord of history."⁵⁰ Moltmann argues plausibly that history is all that happens between God's "promise" and its fulfillment.⁵¹ We will return to the metaphor of promise later in this section.

---

⁴⁸. Gutierrez, G. "Liberation Praxis and Christian Faith", in Frontiers of Latin American Theology, edited by Rosina Gibellini, p. 79. (MaryKnoll, N.Y. Orbis Books 1979); See also his Theology of Liberation, p. 268.


Especially worthy of comment in this regard is *Heilsgeschichte*, salvation history. Briefly, O'Neill offers the following interpretation of the term salvation history. First, as a historian could derive from the circumstances of a period all the preceding facts responsible for that situation, the theologian finds in the fact of his own conversion the whole sacred history. Secondly, God's "inner-trinitarian" decision to commit Himself to historical self-fulfilment in the appearance of Jesus Christ set in motion the history of salvation. Here Israel is understood to have been called by God to play a part in salvation history in order to set a stage for the disclosure of God in Jesus Christ and the beginning of His Church. Finally, according to this view, the content of salvation history from "the inner-trinitarian decision to Virgin birth, the death, resurrection, ascension and return of Christ" presupposes a personal spiritual encounter and relation with God through Christ. Here there is a profound unity between God acting in history and on the other hand, human beings searching in history for a liberative society. Most important for us is that this


interpretation of history reaffirms Christ as the Lord of history through whom nations and tribes have met God whose encounter with us involves a process of recognition.

In the above argument it is perhaps worth stressing that we are indeed part of a struggle in history for overcoming the obstacles which prevent us from being fully human. To follow Jesus Christ is to be part of history. As we have indicated above, God holds the nations in his hand and chose Israel out of nations to be His people and the instrument of His purposes. So, decisive battles have been and are fought in history. We may perhaps emphasise that underlying the pilgrimage of Israel is God's providence. Very briefly, providence refers to God's prior knowledge of and provision for the World. The term indicates both God's foreknowledge and God's government of man and history. He is a God who makes His name known when He chooses His people in history. "I am, that is who I am." God is an identity which exists by its very essence, whose essence is to exist fully and completely. His identity is known as person and as liberty.

According to the Elohist tradition in Genesis, He did not wholly reveal His identity to human beings because He is basically "the


God of the Covenant". In other words, he is a God whose identity will become known in history through the involvement of person with person in the struggle for liberty.\textsuperscript{58}

Theologically, the election of Israel was part of a comprehensive plan for all men and indeed the whole world. The South African White argument particularly that of the Afrikaners which asserts that Election and Covenant were concepts which were applicable to the Afrikaner Volk only, because they were the chosen few of God in Africa who should break and rule the Black tribes thereby falls to the ground.\textsuperscript{59} Rightly understood election is the negation of the subjugation and exploitation of other races: it means responsibility and freedom of all nations. Here there is a strong forward-looking expectation towards the fulfillment which has come with the incarnation and resurrection of Jesus Christ.\textsuperscript{60}

Three interrelated points emerge from the above arguments. First, that the identity of God cannot be fully expressed in human language because He seems to be hidden although He revealed


\textsuperscript{59} Baai, G.S. 1985 "Civil Religion and Political Cohesion in South Africa". S.T.M. Degree, Drew University, pp. 97-98.

\textsuperscript{60} Ibid, p. 99
himself in Christ. This is a prevailing view in situations of alienation, domination and sin which is, from the African point of view, social. It involves the structures of society. Secondly, as difficult as it may be to know God, Jesus Christ has given us a clue about Him. Finally, in the Johannine tradition Jesus Christ said that he and God were one. This introduces for us the Logos of God which signified the revelation assumed by Jesus Christ.

Professor J.D.G. Dunn in Christology in the making (1980) gives a clear and concise analysis of the concept of Logos. Logos may refer to a significant statement of argument and for Greek philosophers it implied a rational account of the World and human life as opposed to mere story-telling. According to St. John's gospel Christ is the incarnate Son of God who existed with him in glory before the world was made. The title Logos, that is to say the "Word", connects the Old Testament tradition of the Word as God's revealing utterance with a philosophical tradition akin to that of Philo. However, systematic theology has returned to the title of Logos and reaffirmed it as the Word revealed in Christ who is the content of proclamation. Dunn argues plausibly that the New Testament literature reflects,

"a development from the concept of the Word as the word of preaching, where Christ is the sum and substance of the Message proclaimed, to the concept of the Word as Christ himself, Christ the incarnation of God's word uttered from the beginning of time in creative and redemptive power. Not that the latter assertion supersedes the former, the conception of the word of God as the
effective proclamation of the good news of Christ is consistent throughout of the NT.

Dunn's statement implies that there is a symbiotic relationship between the proclaimed word and Jesus Christ himself. The word enfleshed in Christ signifies that God has come to live with and among us. In African idiomatic expression it means that God in Christ drinks from the same well as we do; He is one of us as we walk down the dusty paths of Africa. He enjoys laughter and lives under the same heat of the sun just like us. He has linked his own identity to our own history. He is a being who is conditioned by the coordinates of time, space and culture. He communicates his being through the Word; He is the Word.

God in and among us attuned to the rhythm of history makes everything new in the continuity of the presence of the Word of God. This is done in a creative way in that the Spirit take hold of divergent identities and creates a community of "selves", where although not of the same personality, they become unified under him in whom the diversity of the selves is not annulled but sanctified. In short, talk of believing in God, the Father,


Son and the Holy Spirit goes beyond mere talking. It gives us an idea of a God who reveals Himself through Himself. The Father is assigned to the "I", the Son to the "Self", and the Spirit to the identity of the divine "I-Self". Here there is a dynamic fellowship and freedom underscored by love which fulfils the interdependence of the beings. The identity of the Son is to be understood as that of the Father and the Holy Spirit. In this way God reveals himself in the historical reality of the person of Jesus Christ without whom the Holy Spirit would not have come.

The above arguments have given us an idea of the Trinity in history. It is obviously important for us to inquire into how Jesus Christ manifested the identity of God to us. Fundamentally, we must ask what underscored such manifestation. We have already noted above that love completes the trinitarian identity. Does Jesus Christ's manifestation intend to reclaim the whole-ness of our depleted human identity. Very briefly, we may say, to use Gustavo Gutierrez's term, Jesus Christ has a specific interest in "liberation". The interest in liberation is of God, for, as we have indicated above, Christ and God are one which means that his identity is constituted by his relation to

God the Father and his other fellow human beings. To proclaim Jesus Christ as Logos correlates with the religious identity of the Church and its political and social mission for the religious identity of the Church is the realization of the Kingdom of God. To support our claim that Jesus Christ's manifestation is bound up with liberation which is inseparably associated with the mission of the church we base our arguments upon the principle of prolepsis. 64

Prolepsis refers to real anticipation which goes back both to the Old Testament history of divine promises and human hope and to the apocalyptic eschatology of the New Testament. 65 The risen Christ as, "the first fruits of those who have fallen asleep" actually anticipates that final state when God will be "everything to everyone." 66 Baptism and the Eucharist now represent in advance what will be experienced in the ultimate and universal future. 67 We should point out that Moltmann in Theology of Hope (1964) and the Crucified God (1972) differs from Pannenbergs appeal to the principle of prolepsis. Moltmann


66. RSV ICor, 15:20, 28.

67. RSV Romans 6:3-8, ICor 11:26.
insists not only more on a real anticipation of the new Kingdom which is coming to us but also that such an anticipation takes place in a history of divine promise and human hope. Pannenberg characteristically has thought in terms of universal history and has had relatively little to say so far about evil and suffering and its overcoming. This distinction is highly significant in our thesis because we are endeavouring to express the identity of God through Christ with man in situations of deprivation and alienation. Here our use of the concept of prolepsis is similar to Moltmann's use and the various exponents of the theology of hope, political and liberation theologies who use the term to indicate the event of the Christ as a real anticipation of the future of history in the midst of history.

On this basis we suggest that we may interpret prolepsis within the context of organised religion as well. This expression organised religion is used here to refer to the South African Churches individually and collectively. We are arguing that the Church in South Africa reflects inconsistencies in her Mission. The inheritance of prophetic protest in mission has been inconsistent with regard to its commitment to Black liberation. Basically, this inconsistency has been generated by the churches

themselves as they reflect the society in which they are rooted. Consequently they have failed in their life to be the conscience of the nation. Instead they have reflected at this point the invasion of the Church of Christ by the principles of class and race with which we have dealt in this thesis. The church in her mission has found convenient ambiguities in ideologies which are a violation of the principle of brotherhood. This is a sharp indictment of the class and racial ideologies of identity in both church and society. However, before we propose particular principles by which to criticise and evaluate what we believe to have been the mission of the Church in South Africa we shall propose a typology which will enable us to examine the nature of Organised religion in South Africa.

8.2 Church Typology

Typologically the Christian Church in South Africa is divided into two major groups namely the Afrikaans Reformed Churches and the member churches of the South African Council of Churches which are examined in turn.

(i) The Afrikaans Reformed Churches

There are three Afrikaans Churches in South Africa. First, the Dutch Reformed Church (NGK) which is the largest among the Afrikaans Reformed Churches. Three offshoot churches have sprung out of the above Church. They are (1) the (Sendingkerk), Mission Church, for the coloured people which was established in 1881. (2) the Dutch Reformed Church in Africa, founded in 1951 for the Bantoe. (3) the Reformed Church in Africa for the Indians, founded in 1968. These three churches are autonomous and independent of the White Dutch Reformed Church. The second Afrikaans Reformed Church is the Doppers (Gereformeerde kerk), which had their first ordained man in 1910 and by 1958 they had five White and nine indigenous missionaries. The third group of Afrikaans Churches is the (Hervormde Kerk) which had its first missionary in 1916.

The missionary policy of the Dutch Reformed Church which has given rise to the formation of the three separate ethnic churches identified above, is one of racial separation with concomitant acquiescence of the church in the status quo. In fairness to

71. Ibid, p. 45.
them, however, they have been members of the World Alliance of Reformed Churches which opposes the Apartheid ideology and some of their theologians and church leaders have been outspokenly critical of the ideology of Apartheid and of the Dutch Reformed tradition in South Africa.\(^73\) Granted this, they have been so inconsistent in their proclamation of the mission of the Church of Jesus Christ in South Africa that they have been expelled from the above World Church Organization, of which Dr. Allan Boesak was president.\(^74\) The *Human Relations in the Light of Scripture*, which is the Dutch Reformed Church report, reflects a disastrous exegesis and theological inconsistency in their biblical interpretation.\(^75\) Thus in the interpretation of Genesis 1:28, 11:1-9; Deuteronomy 32:8-9; Acts 2:5-11 and Acts 17:26 there is eisegesis which is formulated intentionally to reject justice and equality among humans in support of the ideology of Apartheid. Furthermore, the response to the Tomlinson Commission which posed a choice between either "integration" or "separation" between Black and White in South Africa reflects this inconsistency.\(^76\)

---


The Afrikaner Volkskongress which was organised by the Dutch Reformed Church in 1956 with the financial backing from the South African Bureau of Racial Affairs examined the Tomlinson Commission report and rejected integration in South Africa. In contrast, the Black interdenominational African Minister's Federation (IDAMF) which convened at Bloemfontein in 1956 under the presidency of the Rev. Z.R. Mahabane contended that the country should move in the direction of integration rather than separation as advocated by the Volkskongress of the Dutch Reformed Church. The spirit and tone of the papers delivered there by Dr. Xuma, Rev. J. Calata, Professor Z.K. Mathews, R.H. Godlo, S. Ngcobo, Dr. D.G.S. Mtimkulu, O.R. Tambo, G.M. Pitje and Duma Nokwe, were according to A.L. Mncube, the General Secretary, of the view that the concept of separate ethnic homelands such as the Transkei and Kwazulu and would eventually lead to Blacks losing their South African citizenship.

On the basis of this inconsistency there had grown a theological concept of the immutable exclusiveness of all ethnic nationalities and a notion of the organic solidarity of the "divinely created" Afrikaner Volk elected by God to fulfil a "unique calling in Africa". As we have indicated above, the

77. Ibid, p. 76.
78. Ibid, p. 78.
invasion of the Church by the principle of class drove the Church in her mission to justify Afrikaner capitalism in biblical parables such as,

"Christ loved the wealthy youth who was a capitalist... Service was the great stipulation the master laid down for Capital". 80

The inconsistency in the prophetic inheritance of mission may be related as an argument to the identity theories of this thesis. As we have argued earlier that language is significant in the social aspect of identity, so it has indeed become a unifying factor among members of the Dutch Reformed Church. They speak Afrikaans as their mother-tongue through which they conduct their church services. The composition of church membership, by and large, consists of people who may trace their ancestral origins back to Holland.

From these arguments we should be able to comprehend the significance of ethnic identity. However, the second group of churches in our typology are those churches which are referred to as the "English-speaking" churches. They may be classified as The South African Council of Churches member-Churches. 81


(ii) The South African Council of Churches Member Churches

They are; First, The Methodist Church of Southern Africa; Second, The Church of the Province of South Africa (Anglican). Third, The Presbyterian Churches. Fourth, The Lutheran Churches. Fifth, The Congregational Church. The Roman Catholic Church has an observer status. Other movements such as the Interdenominational African Ministers Association of South Africa, the Black Independent Churches and Societies are affiliated to the South African Council of Churches. We have said above that these Churches are referred to as the "English-speaking" Churches. Very briefly, this epithet is indicative of a shared common source of identity which unites these churches. First, most of them originated in Great Britain and they still maintain a reciprocal relationship with their mother church in Britain to which they annually send fraternal greetings. The Methodist "World Church" programme in Great Britain in which missionaries are from time to time called from the Southern Hemisphere to come up to England in order to take up the pastoral charge of churches there is nothing else but the maintenance of identity which experienced a traumatic disintegration in the process of decolonization.² Of course, the identity of Christianity which does not imply uniformity in worship but diversity in unity is

---

² See The 1986 Minutes of The Methodist Conference in South Africa: "The World Church in Britain".
visibly expressed by retaining membership on World-wide ecumenical and Christian Councils. Here it suffices to note that the missionary sending and receiving programmes are meant to emphasize identity. Secondly, the bureaucratization of these churches is underscored by the effective use of the English language as a powerful tool for uniting linguistically and ethnically different identities. Of course, Blacks dominate these churches numerically. The actual racial composition would seem to lead to the eventual rejection of the above epithet "English-speaking Churches" in favour of something like a United Church of Southern Africa which should better serve to express our identity.

Fundamental to our argument is the presupposition to which we have referred, namely, that there is inconsistency in the proclamation of the mission of the Church of Jesus Christ in South Africa. The Methodist Church in South Africa with over a million Blacks in 1951 only passed strongly worded statements of denunciation of Apartheid. We declared our opposition to the ideology of Apartheid as incompatible with the principles for which "the Church stands." So, the Anglican Church of the Province of South Africa did the same and it has a good record of protest against discriminatory legislation. Both of these

84. Horrell, M. 1964 *A Decade of Bantu Education*.
churches have declared their denominational stand in that they were "one in commitment and in spirit". However, they have failed to express the declared "oneness" at parish and circuit level for in Sunday worship the chapels still reflect racial segregation. Here lies an inconsistency. This is the critical issue.

In fairness to the above mentioned churches we may say that they have protested against the political social order by affirming universal human rights. The Bishop Trevor Huddleston, C.R. who directed Adult Education classes on Church and Society exposed the suffering of black people in Sophiatown. Those who were imprisoned for pass violations in Sophiatown know that, "He would come down to the jails and announce to the police, 'I'm taking with me that man and that one and that one'."

The outstanding ministries of many colleagues, to mention a few, such as Theo Kotze, Brian Brown, Beyers Naude, Cedric Mayson, Alan Boesak, Ambrose Geoffrey Reeves, Clayton and many others known and unknown are a living testimony of individual Christians who engage in the prophetic denunciation of the social order. However, a critical issue is that these denunciations have not

---

86. Huddleston, T. 1956 *Naught for Your Comfort.*

been backed up with clear actions and commitment. Consequently the Church appeared as an institution which had been assimilated into the Apartheid way of life. The mission of the Church should have openly declared that it was for the eradication of injustices and the ushering in of Black liberation which would have led to majority rule with minority rights.

The Church has submerged and compromised its mission in the process of the Apartheidization of South African society. This is directly reflected in the Lutheran and Presbyterian Churches. During World War II, the Lutherans who were of German extraction were badly treated by certain elements of the British community in South Africa. This caused them to adopt Afrikaner attitudes towards the English-speaking population. The consequences of this were that some of their younger men who wished to take up Holy Orders became ordained Ministers of the Dutch Reformed Church. The prophetic denunciation of Apartheid from this Church is as weak as that of the Baptist and Pentecostal Churches which have sunk into silence. As we have indicated above the Presbyterian Church in South Africa has proclaimed an attenuated gospel partly because it has suffered many divisions, losses and secessions. Certainly prophetic denunciation on racial policy

has been less frequent and forceful than that of the Catholics, Anglicans, Congregationalists and Methodists. This Presbyterian lack of denunciational forcefulness may be attributed to the fact that they belong to the Reformed tradition and therefore would not like to take critical issue with the Dutch Reformed Church although it supports racial discrimination and segregation in South Africa. Contrastingly, the Congregational Church which grew out of the London Missionary Society and the American Board issued this statement in 1955,

"Any policy that seeks deliberately to limit the full and free development of human personality, or discriminates against individuals because of the group to which they belong is morally indefensible and wrong."

The above statement indicates clearly that the prophetic inheritance of mission has not in fact been efficacious in changing the social order in South Africa when such a declaration of intention is seen in the context of history.

However, the conclusion which seems to emerge from our typological analysis thus far is that the Church in South Africa has failed to move beyond the Synod and Assembly resolutions,


90. Ibid, p. 54.
which have been calculated to denounce the Apartheid regime to a committed Christian action which could have brought about the transformation of the South African society. In other words, organised religion has manifested a lack of revolutionary power from within which would have been generated by a deeper sense of the metanoia which would denote a radical change of the very personality of the Christian Church. The prophetic inheritance of mission has exhibited an inconsistency with the basic premise of the mission of Jesus Christ which is preeminently to bring about liberty to the oppressed.

Granted the above conclusion, we are now in a position to develop some of the principles which we left on one side at the beginning of these arguments. As we demonstrated in our analysis of social reality in the first stage in our theory of interpretation, ideologies underscore the South African social structure, we now argue for the replacement of the very term ideology with the term spirituality. Spirituality goes beyond the term ideology in the sense that it embodies "an analysis of the situation and


offers a strategy of action" whose primary object is always to change the situation. Very briefly, spirituality poses contextual questions under God, such as what is here and what ought to be here. Here the is and ought are always put together in a creative tension. In other words, "spirituality is a concrete manner, inspired by the Spirit of living the Gospel."93 This spirituality has both provisional and non-provisional goals, and to that extent goes beyond ideology. It shares the content of faith inasmuch as its non-provisional goals are derived from it, and its provisional goals are dialectically related to it. In less technical terms, "while liberation is implemented in historical events, it also denounces their limitations and ambiguities, proclaims their fulfilment and impels them effectively toward total communion."94

We have argued in this section that faith as a process of learning produces a conception of a liberating God and this should be understood as, "the acceptance of the Father's love and a response to it."95 In this way theology becomes the "critical

94. Ibid, p. 177.
reflection on historical praxis, flowing out of that praxis and a confrontation with the Lord that is accepted and lived by faith."96

Within this conceptual framework, it is now necessary for us to return to our critical principle of "promise" which indicates that which is known through faith. According to Gutierrez, "the Bible is the book of the Promise, the Promise made by God to man which is the efficacious revelation of his love and his self communication."97 The promise appropriated in various unique historical situations, is, in the context of new situations, "a gift accepted in faith". It is then made available to illuminate the new situation and the ongoing process. It is argued that "the Promise illuminates and fructifies the future of humanity and leads it through incipient realizations towards its fullness."98 Incipient realizations of the promise are bound by historical contexts. May we say the promise, illuminated by its past and partial realizations, is re-experienced and restated. The process of reappropriating it and expanding our knowledge of it in ever-changing situations goes on. It seems that the concept of promise functions as a critical principle which locates the point of convergence between Church and World. As a

96. Ibid, p. 22.
critical principle, it enables the Church to undertake the task of denunciation and annunciation demanded of a people in pilgrimage. We have indicated that this prophetic denunciation is not merely verbal, but it necessarily takes place in the creative tension of is and ought, word and action, in solidarity with the oppressed struggling for the whole-ness of their identity and liberation, a liberation which is correlative to, but not identified with ultimate salvation, the gratuitous gift of Christ's love which gives meaning and shape to penultimate hope.

The above insights are important for us particularly in that they indicate two basic concepts which should be used in the interpretation of the mission of the church in South Africa. First, the concept of spirituality which moves beyond ideology. Here the point is made with emphasis that it imposes a critique upon what is, and offers a strategy for action to bring about necessary change. Second, the concept of promise is not merely to bring about something pleasing, not merely a declaration that one will do or refrain from doing something specified, but is a critical principle which locates the social nexus between church and world. Finally, the above two concepts can be related theologically back to land and identity and to class and race. We are arguing then, that the religious identity of the church and its social and political mission is the realization of the Kingdom of God in the here and now. This does not preclude the relative and partial status of the products of human reason. It is to say, however, that responding to the structure of promise,
the church in its mission should risk its life by putting up the
signs of the Kingdom which are freedom, justice and equality
among humans. To argue in this way implies that the church in
its mission must take the following two celebrations seriously.
These are the Jubilee and mission.

Before we analyse the Jubilee and mission models, it is necessary
at this point to define the Church. Here, the concept of Church
refers to any gathering of two or three people in the name of
God, the Father of our Lord Jesus Christ. The dynamism of the
Word of God could get hold of people anywhere such as, for
example, in a church building, hut, bush or by the cattle-kraal.
It is a context within which acts of whole-ness and the
completion of individual identity take place. With this
understanding of the Church, we claim that the Jubilee
celebration could be implemented. The Jubilee celebration
belongs to both the Old and New Testament traditions. Very
briefly, the notion refers to a situation in which after fifty
years the land in Israel was returned to its original owners.\textsuperscript{99}
Here the notion is used to indicate that the land is a gift from
God and that it should be shared equally among races and
individuals.

\textsuperscript{99} RSV \textit{Leviticus} 25:10-24.
In this thesis we have demonstrated that the South African social structure is structured by class. It is a situation in which the indigenous tribes were fraudulently deprived of their lands by the white alien forces. There is no theological justification for class, the promotion of division or the deprivation of people of their land. Reflecting on previous chapters, the division of land in South Africa is indefensible. It is a situation in which Blacks, who are over twenty-two million, are assigned to only thirteen percent of land. The rest of the remaining land has become the possession of the White people who are less than six million. Although we do not hate the Whites we reject class and racism on theological and scientific grounds. Verkuyl in Break Down the Walls (1968) has said that scholars have reached a consensus that humanity is one. All men belong to the same species called Homo Sapiens. It is highly probable that all people have a common origin. The differences among various groups of the human race come about as a result of evolutionary factors such as isolation. Biologically, the human species consists of a number of racial groups that differ from one another according to the absence or presence of certain genes. Such genes which cause inherited differences among people are limited in number compared with the large number of genes that people possess in common irrespective of the ethnic group to which they belong. This means that what men have in common is far greater than their differences. Theologically, God is creating an order of racial unity and equality in the midst of diversity.
There is a given order of equality-in-diversity. All human beings are created equal since man is made in the image of God: "He hath created of one blood all men to dwell on the face of the earth" (Acts 17:26). However, it seems that the variety of the order of creation is given as the unity. That is why unity has never meant sameness or identity, but a community of diverse selves who stand on common ground of creatureliness. The Jubilee celebration model transcends the White conception of land as a possession. The argument that land should be possessed collapses on the following theological grounds. First, land is a place in which God has put his people so that they might fulfil their identity. It is the gift from God and life to man. Secondly, God's gift of land could be placed within the context of the gift of freedom and life. We have indicated above that the Jubilee was a time at which the land was returned to its owners. It was also the time during which the slaves were granted freedom. Finally, the Jubilee celebration interrelates with freedom and redemption.

So, on the basis of the Jubilee Celebration, the Church should call for economic sharing and redistribution of land in South Africa because God demands now economic justice among his people.

Here God appears as a Judge who confronts man and accuses him of dispossessing the poor and oppressed of their land. He judges selfishness and racial arrogance through the response of the Black people who denounced the 1913 Land Act. Returning what is not yours to its owner, introduces the element of reconciliation with God which is a precondition for the fulfilling of the identity of the self with other selves in a similar historical setting. God in Christ has ordained equalizing means such as the year of Jubilee in order to complete our identity.

The above presentation of the significance of the Jubilee Celebration brings us to the second proposition which is referred to as Mission Celebration model. This model is based on Luke 4:18-19. Whether this outline of Jesus' mission refers to the year of the Jubilee, the picture of which we have given above, is not quite clear. Dunn says that it is probable that Luke used Isaiahic words to proclaim the ministry of Jesus Christ but that it is Jesus who speaks about the "liberty of God's Kingdom". Yoder's investigation suggests that for Jesus to have cited Isaiah 61:1-2 as an outline of his mission may refer to the year of the Jubilee. The same word, however, is used in both Isaiah


61:1 and Leviticus 25:10. If Yoder is right then we can say that Jesus had the year of Jubilee in mind. Basing our claims on this argument, we are saying that the Church in its mission should proclaim the mission of Jesus Christ as a liberative one. The liberative mission of Jesus Christ has three interconnected levels of meaning. First, the economic, social and political freedom of those who are oppressed. Secondly, their assuming of conscious responsibility for their freedom. Finally, the mission model should emphasise the setting free of people from their sin so as to complete their identity and freedom in Jesus Christ.

These levels of meaning are interdependent, for there is a link between the three factors of social analysis and action, the human response and God's saving action. Although political liberation is not the same as salvation, it is salvific work because it leads to liberation from sin and thereby to communion with God. Furthermore, just as liberation has a social and political aspect, so also has sin. We said earlier in this

section, that from the African point of view, sin is social. It is the evil which I do to my neighbour. From this view therefore, we are arguing that sin can assume a collective form when embodied in social structures which oppress people through institutionalised exploitation and domination. In the celebration of mission the Church must stress that sin is not just a private, individual reality but that it is, to use Gutierrez's expression, "a social, historical fact, the absence of brotherhood and love in relationships among men." 107 Salvation is not merely "spiritual" and other worldly, for it is a full and integral liberation of humanity. The World to come will be the transformation and fulfilment of this life. The building of a just and human society now must be seen as God's saving action and not merely as a preparation for preaching the Gospel.

We have examined carefully the kind of the signs of the Kingdom of God that the people of God in their identity must put up in the modern World. Although mission is not only based on the two models of Jubilee Celebration which should involve, among other things, the beating of drums and prayer, singing and the shaking of hands, which in their own right, reinforce individual and group identity, but these models also seem to represent something which could go beyond the present ways of proclaiming the Kingdom

of God. In celebrating Mission and Jubilee, the Church of God must be quite prepared to demonstrate its opposition to oppression and exploitation of any kind. Furthermore, we must be quite prepared to suffer the consequences of our stand in obedience to God's promises revealed in Christ. The promises of God seem to refer to two modes of God's redemptive activity in Christ, namely, the economic and political redemption of Israel from oppression and alienation, and there is also a conception of the spiritual redemption of all men. This ties up with the notion of the Covenant which Israel made with God. The promises of God stress that the concept of redemption is comprehensive and that redemption must not be dichotomised into "spiritual" and "social" dimensions. But it should be seen as an all-embracing process that is ultimately redemptive.

Throughout history God is engaged with restoration and recreation of life. Therefore, we are driven to say that creation, Judgement and redemption should be conceived as belonging together. When human beings have been freed from the bondage of racial arrogance and class-consciousness their identity is made whole under God. They experience a spontaneous, free relations and integrated community of mutual respect that was originally intended in creation. On this basis we may now consider the realm of commitment and praxis, and with this problem of violence. Our discussion will culminate in a brief reflection on the sacraments.
CHAPTER NINE
COMMITMENT AND THE FULFILMENT OF IDENTITY

It would appear that in order to fulfil the religious identity of the Church there has to be commitment to the completion of human identity and hence to the struggle for liberation. In this chapter we intend to examine nature of commitment and the problem of violence and suggest a limited resolution of the problem in terms of an exposition of the meaning of the sacraments.

Beginning with commitment, we need to say that it is a mechanism by which the self is fulfilled in the proleptical announcement of the Kingdom of God. This means that commitment reinforces the meaning of the Kingdom of God insofar as the Kingdom of God is not just a mere future event but is an event of fulfilling love for us here and now. When ordinary people who do ordinary things and are also not merely churchgoers but committed Christians who proclaim Jesus Christ as Lord and Saviour it is a human being with whom they identify, whose identity can be concretely described. Commitment in this sense is not abstract but concrete. There are three constitutive aspects of commitment. Very briefly, faith which is synonymous with commitment is one of the significant components of commitment in as much as it is the unity of knowing and doing and is part of learning about the ways of God. Secondly, commitment presupposes metanoia which, as we said earlier, involves a revolutionary power from within. Metanoia is the mechanism by means of which a new insight is
assimilated and anchored in personality. It is the reintegration of the self around a new focus of identity. Christianity as a religion accomplishes its integrating work by means of metanoia. If metanoia has any specific effects at all it manifests itself in what we call here commitment. We contend that Christian commitment in South Africa is to the fulfillment of Black identity which has been depleted in the course of history. If commitment is to the fulfilment of Black identity in South Africa as it is argued, then commitment is to the liberation of the Black people. Granted the liberation of the Black people, it must complete the identity of both Black and White insofar as liberation of identity is concerned. The above claim is supported by the view that White identity was also depleted in the process of legislating for a system which denied human rights to the Black population.1 By refusing to fulfill Black identity they reduced the fullness of their own freedom. Granted the reduction of liberty to complete Black and White identity, commitment to the liberation of the former fulfills the identity of the latter. Finally, as faith is the unity of knowing and doing, we should locate ourselves in the context. Here theology does not merely reflect upon the context or merely dialogues with the context, but it is contextual and takes praxis seriously.

Praxis refers to action, a creative and self-creative activity through which man creates, produces and changes his historical and human world.² This term has passed by through the Critical Theory of the Frankfurt School into modern Theology.³ Marcuse in his Contribution to a Phenomenology of Historical Materialism (1928) identifies praxis with doing. However, theologically, insofar as Christianity is about discipleship it is centrally concerned with praxis. It is the encounter with God in worship which illuminates and signifies the whole pattern of Christian praxis.⁴ Here, we should say, praxis and theory interact dialectically. Discipleship is praxis insofar as truth about discipleship is encountered and shown in praxis, and it is praxis which strengthens theology.⁵ Theology properly conceived is thought in action and through that action. In this sense theology is done.

Contextually, commitment reflected in praxis is a negation of sin and an affirmation of the wholeness of individual and group identity. We have already referred to the African view of sin in the preceding chapter. However, we stress that there is a

reciprocal relationship between personal sin and social factors and the sinful structure of society. We must, therefore, have a broad view of sin by looking at both sides of the question. Of sin Gutierrez says that it is a "half truth" to suppose that it will do little or no good to alter social structures if the hearts of human beings do not undergo any change, because this ignores the fact that hearts can also be transformed by altering socio-cultural structures. But he admits that they will not be automatically changed and this applies to both ways,

"The view that a structural transformation will automatically produce different human beings, is no more and no less 'mechanistic' than the view that a 'personal change of heart' will automatically lead to a transformation of society. Any such mechanistic views are naive and unrealistic ... Both aspects are interdependent and complementary." 124

Few indeed would dispute Gutierrez's claim that personal and social redemption are two sides of the same coin.

Given the situation of structural violence in South Africa in which this commitment is to be made and enacted it is imperative that we discuss violence. Here our argument is that because violence renders the frame of identity weak and fragmentary, we

should perceive the non-violent means for social change as not only having a better chance of bringing about political change but also as a means of identity fulfilment. Of course, many liberation theologians would dispute our thesis. They would say that there is already a situation of institutionalized violence which has already depleted our human identity and that this situation can only be altered by the use of "counter violence". It would appear that liberation theology sees the violence of liberation movements as "second violence", a violent reaction unavoidably evoked by the "first violence" of oppressive and inhuman governments. However, our argument goes beyond this to the consideration of whether violence or non-violence has a better chance of fulfilling human identity. The explication of this problem is placed within three contexts, namely the Just War discussion, the history of violence in the history of Black


protest up until the decisive turning-point of 1960 and the recent theological thought of the Church in the context of contemporary violence in South Africa.

9.1 Violence and the Just War Theory

Violence is not just an ethical problem but a massive and increasing menace to civilized life which sharpens the factors surrounding the discussion of the "Just War" and "justified" violence. In a penetrating and excellent analysis, Yoder examines Karl Barth's theological thought on War setting it within the tradition of the Just War. From this argument basic conditions for the taking up arms emerge. In the first place the notion of the "just means" must be employed in order to restrain violence. The immediate problem here would be that violence has the concomitants of suffering and the loss of life. Those who use it for a "just" cause very often lose sight of the objective for which it was applied and then it becomes counter-productive. In the second place, the war must be declared as a last resort. The third general approach is located in the Just


Revolution tradition. Theologically John Calvin supported this tradition when he said that God should be obeyed because God is before all above all men. Next to him we are subject to those men who are in authority over us, but only in Him.

In recent theological thought there has been a shift away from the Just War theory to the Just Revolution theory. The explanation may be given with reference to Western Nations which experienced historically the evil forces of Nazism and Fascism. Very briefly, Western societies before World War I perceived themselves as just societies which should be protected against unjust aggression. After World War II, there has again been a discernible shift towards a new consciousness of the plight of the oppressed and disinherited nations within countries. The natural consequences of this new consciousness was a further move away from the preservation of the status quo to a concern for those who are excluded from political and economic power structures. So, the Just War theory should be seen within the views of "first" and "second" violence to which we referred above. Here it suffices to note three things about violence which are a negation of the fulfilment of human identity. First,

the violent seizure of power has dehumanizing and devastating consequences for identity for "every revolutionary is destined to become either a victim or an executioner." [13] Secondly, violent revolutions very often result in the disintegration of community life which is a source of identity. They seldom truly benefit those whose identity has in the course of history been damaged and depleted. Finally, if it were possible to control and direct violence specifically towards the establishment of a just society, the arguments in support of violence might be sustainable, but it is difficult to control it. Therefore, the argument to support it has distinct limitations. Our argument is thus founded primarily on political and social considerations rather than theological principles as such.

In considering the problem theologically we need to review the problem of violence within the context of the South African Church. However, before we do that we must analyse the history of violence in Black protest in South Africa. Consequently our analysis at this point should necessarily evaluate violence with special reference to Umkonto Wesizwe (The Spear of the Nation). Why did the African National Congress turn to violence and why did the Spear of the Nation fail?

9.2 The History of Violence in the History of Black Protest in South Africa

In South Africa the state is maintained by violence and this has had inevitable consequences for history of Black protest in South Africa which is linked with the formation of the African National Congress. In the *Spiral of Violence* (1971) Dom Helder Camara formulated a theory in which he saw governments as prime source of violence. First, with the violence of the injustice of the state which, he argues, begins as the egoism of some privileged groups which drives other human beings into subhuman conditions, the spiral begins. Secondly, the violence of those human beings who have been relegated into the condition of sub-humanity reacts to the primary violence embodied in governmental structures. Finally, this leads to a reciprocally violent situation. The African National Congress was for forty eight years a non-violent organisation up until it reached a turning point in 1960 when Black resistance shifted from non-violence to a violent struggle against the Apartheid State.

Of the change of position Nelson Mandela at the Rivonia Trial said,

"It was only when all else had failed, when all channels of peaceful protest had been barred to us that the decision was made to embark on violent forms of political struggle and to form Umkonto
Wesizwe. We did so not because we desired such a course, but solely because the government had left us with no other choice."

Nelson Mandela's statement indicates that violence, *per se*, was perceived to be morally repugnant but had to be embraced as there was no other alternative available to alter a dehumanising political system. People who have been dehumanised through the process of oppression can use any means, even if their identity is further depersonalised, as long as the means are directed towards the achievement of liberty. Being aware that violence weakens and destroys human identity, the ANC introduced a period of sabotage by Umkonto Wesizwe (Spear of the Nation) which would spare life. But should sabotage fail guerrilla warfare might be the next stage into which the ANC intended to move.

Of course, Mandela played a decisive role in the formation of these violent strategies. In December, 1961, he visited Port Elizabeth where he said,

"A new wing of the ANC would embark on sabotage at all the major centres of South Africa. The targets, they were told, were to be symbols of Apartheid - particularly offices from which the

government's policies were executed. In addition power liges and transport were to be attacked.

As we said earlier the above citation underlines that, although the strategy adopted was violent, it was directed towards the minimisation of loss of life. But to appreciate this requires of us to make a distinction between the organizational structure and the actual activities of the Spear of the Nation. The former indicates the examination of the structure and training of the members of Umkonto Wesizwe. Activity refers to the review of the violent acts committed.

The organised violence of MK, which is used here to abbreviate the Xhosa words, (Umkonto Wesizwe), was similar to the M-Plan which Mandela drew up in the early fifties. From the analysis of the M-Plan four points emerge. First, we see here the formation of a tight net of cells, branches, districts, regional councils and a Secretariat. They were answerable to the National Executive.

Second, South Africa was divided into four provinces, namely Cape, Natal, Transvaal and the Orange Free State which were in turn divided into regions. Of course, Natal had more regions

than other provinces. Third, each region consisted of seven members appointed by the National Executive Committee. The seven members of a region were to divide their region into branches. Each branch would have its own committee which subdivided the zones by streets and blocks. The streets and blocks would be under the pastoral oversight of zone leaders who were designated "chief stewards". Finally, the "chief steward" and the branch secretary would appoint cell leaders whose designation was that of cell stewards. 16

Sociologically, the above picture resembles the structure of a Methodist local circuit in South Africa which operates by means of circuit and society stewards and class leaders who have pastoral charge of people who are grouped into small units of twelve or less members. 17 Granted that the Methodist Church in South Africa has one of the best structures insofar as the involvement of all members at the local level is concerned it is possible that Mandela might have thought that the best way was to introduce a system with which most church-going Blacks were

17. See Laws and Discipline Methodist Church of Southern Africa. (Cape Town, 1974).
already familiar. It is likely he adopted this system of operation because it is the one with which he himself was familiar, particularly in that he is a Methodist and went to Methodist Mission schools. Here, however, three things emerge clearly. First, ordinary people were drawn into the fabric of a democratic process. Secondly, it seems that to bring about change in society requires mutual dependence and cooperation based on trust and commitment. Finally, the second point is reflected in the decentralization of the responsibility of members who, while developing a strategy for social change, maintained loyalty and commitment and accountability to one another and to the National Executive Committee. 18

Underlying the organisational structure of MK was the military unit which consisted of a "volunteer-in-chief" who had his followers in each locality to form an instant "cadre". So, the volunteer-in-chief was a contact person in a given locality who played a major role insofar as liaison between the grass roots members and the hierarchy was concerned. From the grassroots through the contact person instructions were passed on to the volunteer-in-chief who was obligated to obey. As we indicated above, below the volunteer-in-chief were the ordinary grassroots

---

people whose business, to borrow Mussolini's slogan, was to "believe, obey, fight". 19

The words of the oath taken were,

"I am a soldier of Umkonto, I promise to obey without question. As a soldier I promise to serve our people and my country with my life, to uphold the policies of the National Liberation Movement led by the African National Congress." 20

This oath was followed up by a programme of training and a brief account of this gives us insight into the nature of organised violence in South Africa.

The training programme was divided into five committees 21:
first, the technical committee in charge of training saboteurs;
second, the transport committee whose responsibility was to smuggle young men out of South Africa for training overseas;
third, the intelligence committee whose task was to obtain information on military, police plans and installations; fourth, the logistics committee which was responsible for the supply of explosives and equipment; and fifth, Operation Mayibuye which was

a master plan that provided men with basic military and political training in South Africa and overseas. Three things should be said about the Mayibuye Operation Committee which was accepted by the Communist Party that controlled MK: first, guerrillas were to rely mainly on the enemy for their supplies; second, they would place in the field men who were trained in the arts of war and who would act as a nucleus of organizers and commanders of guerrilla operations; and finally, the building up of this nucleus was the responsibility of the National High Command. 22

The above analysis gives us a picture of Organised Violence. However, we need to go deeper than the organisational structure into the analysis of the activity. According to Edward Feit, the nature of this violence can be depicted on the basis of the list of indictments of the National High Command leaders. The indictment reflects two acts of violence: firstly, those which included such things as arson, that is, setting fire to letter boxes and the cutting of electric cables; and secondly, those which involved bomb attacks, mainly on public buildings, dynamite and attempts to destroy railway signal systems and electrical installation systems. All the major cities were affected by the above violent activities. 23


The above analysis of the organizational structure and activity of violence reflects a well-thought-out strategy to bring about political and social change in South Africa. Of the armed struggle Slovo had this to say,

"to abandon the armed tactic is to abandon the people to forces willing to settle for the scraps of power and not its substance.... It is unthinkable for South African revolutionaries to return to the struggle for reforms only within the white framework." 24

Both Slovo's statement and the MK's strategy indicate clearly that there is a great need now for political change in South Africa. However, Slovo has overstated his case and overlooked the fact that human identity and dignity is often violated and destroyed by violence itself. Taking up arms in order to kill other people is a dehumanising exercise of human identity. We wonder if it could be viewed as prudent for an organization such as MK with a membership deprived of opportunities to learn the modern skills of warfare, to fight against the ruthless security forces of the Apartheid State, 25 It might have been wise to


propose that mandatory and comprehensive economic sanctions must be imposed against the Apartheid regime. While campaigning for economic sanctions, the internal activists and opponents of Apartheid at home should try to maintain some revolutionary presence on industrial organisations in order to bring about a paralysis of the economy. We have indicated above that the revolutionary sabotage of MK was manned by inexperienced soldiers, consequently the military activities failed to overthrow the state. Very briefly, we should say that MK was infiltrated by state informers which led to the arrest of the Executive High Command and as a result of that the organisational structure and activity of MK was dismantled. Furthermore, the inappropriateness of violence as a means of bringing about change is due in addition to the geographical position of South Africa whereby there are no suitable bases for guerrilla warfare. Finally, we have no friendly border states for a base from which to launch attacks on South Africa.

The above arguments show why the African National Congress changed its original position of non-violence to that of violence. Having drawn insights from the military activities of MK and the geographical position of South Africa, we can only conclude that it seems unwise to recommend violent means of political change, particularly when the context is not favourable to such acts. Furthermore, violence from the point of view of identity, dehumanises individual and group identity. The centrality of human identity is love which may be violated in violent acts of social change. Because love has already been
violated alternative means of the humanisation of identity within the context of the struggles for liberation should be tried. We suggest that non-violence is a lesser evil with possibilities of fulfilling human identity.

While we express the view that violence is not in itself a fulfilment of human identity, we maintain our position that non-violence does not merely fulfil human identity, but it can grapple creatively with the fundamental variable of class which underscores the South African social structure. Grappling with the fundamental problem in its organised activity, non-violence may bring about a paralysis in the economy thereby creating a climate in which dialogue between the oppressor and oppressed could take place. But the argument for the violent destruction of the economy is unsustainable in that, in fact, we would be destroying that which is for sustaining our lives and generations to come. These arguments are tacitly supported by the non-violent attitude of the Black Consciousness Movement towards the Apartheid State. The Black Consciousness Movement was born out of the experience of being Black in South Africa. This refers to a Black movement formed in that country in 1969 and whose father was Steve Biko who died in 1977 in a South African security prison. Reverting to the former non-violent position of

26. Steve Biko, 1987 I Write What I Like selected and edited by Aelred Stubbs, CR.
the ANC before the Sharpeville Massacre in 1960, Black Consciousness affirmed Black identity. But it had no social analysis with which to bring about change in South African society. Three things which we regard as ways in which identity could be achieved emerge from the Black Consciousness Movement.

First, the Black Consciousness Movement taught that the self should be asserted and defined by the self and not the other. In other words, the self-identity definitions could serve to liberate the Black person from the psychological oppression of self by self through an inferiority complex.27 Second, the self-definition of identity does not only inculcate Black sufficiency and pride, it is also relational in that the perceptions of its identity are in relation to other selves in a similar historical situation. Of course, this implies a state of mind which expresses itself in harmony with its own being and also with the values and norms of Black culture.28 Thirdly, both Black and White constitute the South African social identity. However, Blacks should be left alone to work out their own self-definition without the White folk. The White forces may at

a later stage rejoin the Black forces in order to reconstitute a genuine South African identity. We have indicated above that the Black Consciousness Movement was non-violent by conviction and practice. It might be possible that this is one of the reasons why the Movement was admired by White liberals. The political complexion of the Movement resembled that of the African National Congress Youth League which was constituted in 1944. 29 Anton Mziwakhe Lembede a lawyer and President of the league stressed the nationalistic feelings of being African, irrespective of tribal, educational and economic class. The principles upon which the League was based were reflected in both the Pan African Congress and the Black Consciousness Movement. 30 The former was a breakaway group from the ANC in opposition, amongst other things, to the Freedom Charter. It was led by Potlako Lebello, A.P. Mda and Robert Sobukwe. The liberation of the Black person with which they were concerned was based on the perception of the need to bring about a "mental revolution" among the Black population which would help to liberate them from their "slave mentality". 31 The latter echoed some of these principles with


concomitant stress on the significance of the concept of "Azania" that is a truly liberated Black South African which was also used by the former. Here Black identity was expressed in drama and Black poetry,

I
am the liberator
No
white man can
liberate me
Only
A black man can
free himself.
Tame a mamba
Set it to work and starve it.
Teach it your language
And when it speaks, lock it in.

Tame a mamba
Teach it your culture
And mock it
Restrict its movements
Find it outside at night,
Arrest it
And when it hibernates
Search for it and send it to jail

Tame a mamba
But when it resists
And begins to hiss
Send it to the gallows. 32

The above Black poem expresses the meaning of being Black in South Africa and the struggle for the emancipation of the Black selves from the chains of White oppression in what is considered to be a Black man's country.

32. See The Primary Sources in this Thesis.
9.3 The Theological Thought of the Church in the Context of Violence in South Africa

The conscientization of Black identity is now over. There is no more need for this educational exercise. From a theological point of view there is, however, a need for a social analysis which should not merely engage in discussions about violent and non-violent means to bring about social change but which should engage in effective non-violent activities to bring about the completion of human identity. From 1948-1984 the Church in South Africa adopted the non-violent means of social change. Although we underline non-violence as a mechanism of social and political change in South Africa, the non-violent activities must be made to happen very often. Here, lies the importance of the Cottesloe Consultation\textsuperscript{33} and the Christian Institute of Southern Africa.\textsuperscript{34} In the history of South African Christianity, Cottesloe played an important role in that after the events of the killing of the non-violent demonstrators at Sharpeville in 1960, the World Council of Churches in consultation with the South African Church convened a Consultation at Cottesloe to review the situation of


\textsuperscript{34} Walshe, P. 1983 Church Versus State in South Africa: The Case of the Christian Institute.
race relations in South Africa. The Consultation in a statement declared that,

"the right to own land wherever he is domiciled, and to participate in the government of his country, is part of the dignity of the adult man, and for this reason a policy which permanently denies to non-white people the right of collaboration in the government of the country of which they are citizens cannot be justified."35

Implicit in the above statement was the view that the non-violent way was still the best way to bring about changes in the South African society with the minimization of bloodshed. This view about non-violence was used later by the Christian Institute of Southern Africa when it affirmed that passive resistance was the tool to fight against injustices and had a double effect of liberating both the oppressor and oppressed from bitterness and hatred. The non-violent stance of Cottesloe was followed eight years later by the Message to the People of South Africa36 which is comparable to the Barmen Declaration insofar as the demands of

Christian discipleship are concerned. In other words, both the Cottesloe Consultation and the Christian Institute were important insofar as non-violence is concerned.

However, with regard to the Message to the People of South Africa and the Barmen Declaration we should make distinctions. First, we need to say that while the Church in Nazi Germany spoke on behalf of the Jewish non-Christian minority, the Church in South Africa addresses the problems related to the liberation of a Black majority which constitute a large portion of the identity of the Christian Church in South Africa. Secondly, to confess Christ in the South African social context would only make sense when the Word of God speaks to the Black experience of economic exploitation and racism. Finally, granted the two abovementioned points, it would seem that the confession of the identity of Christ cannot be credible unless the Church in her mission moves beyond class and race to the acceptance of the liberative message of Jesus Christ which transcends and overcomes the ideologies of race and class. Furthermore to confess Christ implies the proclamation of the completion of Black identity which should lead to the fulfilment of both White and Black identities.

The above arguments indicate that the Church must have a social analysis and move beyond the mere conscientisation of Black identity, which, given the history of the rise of the Black Consciousness Movement, has fulfilled its primary purpose to non-violent activities of human fulfilment and social change. As
we have seen the non-violent approach was embodied in the Cottesloe Consultation, the Christian Institute and the South African Council of Churches which issued The Message to the People of South Africa. The non-violent means to bring about social change in South African society have not yet all been exhausted. Thus we are of the view that they are also radical approaches which seek to complete human identity by bringing about fundamental changes in society. However, the violence and non-violence arguments should be examined ethically as well.

Thielieke has said that in borderline situations God commands that His law be broken in order that He might be obeyed. 37 Seemingly, we might speak of the theological suspension of the ethical, by which is meant that God's ethical norms such as "Thou shalt not kill" are eternal and absolute norms but at certain undefined, unanticipated moments of history, God who is telos of history suspends them and in that moment, God alone is to be obeyed. According to Søren Kierkegaard Abraham's story contains such a teleological suspension of the ethical. 38

The relation between Abraham and Isaac is that the father shall love the son more than himself. Here the notion of obedience is introduced in that in obedience to God, the father, decides to give his son as a sacrifice.

"When the Soothsayer carries out his sad task and announces that the deity demands a young life as sacrifice, then the father must heroically bring this sacrifice."

rightness or wrongness of a decision that had to be taken ultimately by those who actually live under violent governmental structures would be unfair and unjustified in his conclusions. We have already indicated in the arguments of this section why there are hesitations about pressing directly for the use of violence as a means of bringing about change in society. There is no guarantee that violence will be more successful than non-violence in redressing the ills of society. Here naturally non-violence is perceived as an act of the fulfilment of human identity but also we register the view that violence as opposed to non-violence may under certain circumstances cause more suffering than relief.

9.4 The Sacraments

The preceding arguments claimed that commitment could express itself in the form of non-violent activities which should be seen as acts of identity fulfilment. Yet in Chapter Two, we defined identity as that which referred to selfhood, (ubumna), defined in its own terms in relation to other selves in a similar historical context. To define identity in this way implies that the self cannot be the full self without other selves. So, if it desires to complete itself it has to integrate others within itself. Here we have a conceptualisation of identity which is marked by an extreme freedom in the sense that one can pass easily and almost unnoticeably from the individual to the communal and vice versa. Very briefly, we have a dynamic dialectic which stresses the individual integration of self in and with the community.
In the course of our exploration, we have claimed that the notion of commitment can express itself in sacraments insofar as these are conceived as means of the fulfilment of individual and group identity. Here, the fundamental proposition is that sacraments complete and fulfil that identity. Ecclesiologically, they maintain the reintegration of ecclesial theory and practice.

Although the term sacrament is not a biblical term it has legitimately formed a theological concept. The word (sacramentum) in Latin is used to translate the Greek word (mysterion), that is to say, mystery. The Apostle Paul has said that mystery refers to the fulfilment and manifestation of the salvific plan. The conception of mystery implies that the gospel delivered to the saints was something hidden but that God in Jesus Christ unfolded it. Jesus Christ has unfolded the mystery of the Gospel in communion with his Father in order to call all nations to enter into a communal fellowship with God our Father. Here the notion of community to which we referred above in the context of African thought comes up again. But here it is God now who takes the initiative, rather than the individual, to call human beings into a living community with Him and with one another.

However, the word sacrament in relation to its dominical origin refers in concrete terms to the rites of Baptism and the Eucharist. On the other hand, mystery is also used to indicate the doctrinal statements concerning the activities of God in Jesus Christ our Lord. There are three ways of explaining the sacraments which were instituted by Jesus Christ our Lord according to their "substance" over which therefore the Church has no power. First, they should be understood to mean the "visible" signs or symbols of "invisible" grace which are composed of "matter" (element) and "form" (words). Second, they are means of grace because they are "powers of sanctification" or "instrumental causes" signifying and "containing" the grace proper to them in such a way that they mediate and produce it ex opere operato, in other words, not by virtue of the personal merits of the minister of religion or recipient. Finally, as we indicated above, they are signs of sacral mediation of a divine reality.

If we now draw together the various elements of our argument we can see, for example, that the bonding of the bride and groom in African marriage ceremonies and the shedding of a goat's blood

43. Sacramentum Mundi: An Encyclopedia of Theology, Volume Five, Philosophy to Salvation, pp. 380-381.
and the sipping of the gall which form a meal of fellowship involves the conception of the supernatural being. It seems to us, therefore, that the sacramental actions of Church life correspond to particular forms of identity ceremonies associated with birth, initiation and marriage in African traditional life. Here the common factor is the embodiment of "the other". The "other" is alien to me yet he is the only instance of absolute and wholly integrative unity because his existence includes mine. Theologically, this word of the "other" reaches me in the varied tribal and familial situations we can understand as of an incarnate existence of Christ. He speaks to a unifying point of reference but integrates all the members of the human race.

The Sacrament as a meal of fellowship fulfils identity in the sense that alienation and domination in history have depleted individual and group identity. Racism is institutionalized in South Africa with its concomitant structural violence which have hitherto depleted individual and group identity. However, in the sacramental meal as we kneel together around the communion rail, the communion which presupposes a non-racial table fellowship in which my identity completes and is completed in communion with the Lord and other selves fulfils identity.

44. Ibid, p. 382.
The interpretation of the sacramental meal as a means of human fulfilment directly reflects the conception of a meal in African society and the Eucharist in history. Gustavo Gutierrez in his interpretation of the Last Supper points out that it is presented against the background of the Jewish Passover which was a celebration of the liberation of the Israelites from Egypt and their Sinai Covenant. Interestingly enough, he argues that the Christian Passover takes on and unfolds the full meaning of the Jewish Passover. We note that according to him the Eucharist was instituted during a meal: "For the Jews a meal in common was a sign of brotherhood." However, the African conception of a meal has some striking common features with the Jewish conception of a meal. One of the most striking is the notion of brotherhood. But in African thought it goes beyond brotherhood to acceptance. To be invited to a common meal in African philosophy is always a way of saying "we have accepted you as one of us." Since you have become one of the members of the extended family, take off your coat and be at home in fellowship with us. Of course, this has pastoral implications insofar as mixed congregations are concerned. Here, it suffices to note that in this way a meal could unite two strange people. It could unite Black and White, male and female, two different clans, villages and cities.

In the above arguments we have been trying to discover as far as possible whether commitment can be placed within the context of

human identity. Contextually, theory and action should be held together in a creative tension as the basis of the transformation of society in order to bring about freedom and justice for the down-trodden in society. Here sacraments are the premise from which the two models of Jubilee celebration already analysed emerge. They were meant to stress that the Church in South Africa must engage with the Apartheid ideology in order to bring about the transformation of the South African social structure whose fundamental variable is Class. The conception of these celebrations when properly understood is that they are means of the demystification of South African Christianity. Of course, they are also a negation of the Apartheid ideology which is a distortion of human identity and liberty. Everything that dehumanises identity ought to arouse an indignant opposition from Christianity and everything that humanises must be supported enthusiastically; to use Bonino's words, "love demands efficacy. It is not content to express and demonstrate, it intends to accomplish". 46

Basically, the trinitarian community of God in the Eucharist is grounded in love therefore it does not annul our ethnic identities but it sanctifies and fulfils them irrespective of class and race, tribe and clan. Here, the life, death and

resurrection of Jesus Christ our Lord expresses love for us in the here and now. In other words God's eschatological act in Jesus Christ, who became one of us in history becomes a premise from which our salvation and hope is translated into reality. When the officiating Minister of Religion says, "draw near in faith", he invites the celebrants to partake of a meal of fulfilment in order that we be made whole. From the Eucharist table the Church rises and returns to the world endowed with a revolutionary power from within to announce metanoia, that is, a revolutionary change of attitude towards the self and other selves and indeed the World.

Because the Church has been called out of the World to be in the World, she announces in the World that there is "the love of the Father which calls all men in Christ and through the action of the spirit to union among themselves and communion with him." In this way the Kingdom of God is already anticipated in solidarity with the exploited and depersonalised of society. These are signs of the future Kingdom which the Church in South Africa must proclaim. They presuppose not merely the amelioration of oppression, exploitation and racial prejudice, but the annihilation of all forms of oppression in society for we are related to each other in the inner being of a common humanity.

In this thesis we have sought to develop a historical and theological analysis of the identity of the Church and its social and political mission in South Africa. The concept of identity is both human and religious. Human because identity is selfhood, (ubumna), in a particular context of socialization. However, the expression of selfhood assumes a religious character in that for man to integrate himself requires a transcendental reference to a deity. We have argued that expressing identity in theological terms implies the analysis of human identity. In other words there is no identity of Christianity without the inclusion of the identity of humanity. Human identity fulfills Christian identity.

10.1 Summary

The theory of interpretation inferring this thesis begins with an analysis of social reality. First and foremost, we had to encounter our past expressions of human identity in the investigation and interpretation of the African oral and literary tradition. However, the proper subject of our inquiry is not merely the Xhosa Oral tradition, but Christianity as a religion of life interlocked within a particular society and political pattern of domination. From the review of the hermeneutics of identity in Chapter Two, identity was defined as selfhood,
(ubumna), in relation to other selves in the related historical situation. Here the notion of person is significant insofar as it is self-relative and relational. Identity is self-relative insofar as it relates to itself; it has a symmetrical relationship. It is also relational insofar as it is constituted through interaction with other selves. Here, culture which is underpinned by values and norms facilitates the intersubjective relations of identity.

The concept of externalization was defined as something that takes a form of communal quest rather than an individual one. Externalization acquires objectification, it was argued, in the sense of acting upon identity of the individual. Self-identity is mediated through the symbolic system of culture which includes such things as the use of language and symbols such as colour. The Afrikaans language was used here to support these claims. We note that the need for identity is more pronounced among people who consider themselves as deprived politically and socio-economically. To say, "Black is beautiful" is to use a symbol which situates you in society. The expression of self-identity is structured in the attainment of socio-linguistic competence. In other words, we use language as a tool of self-communication and self-development.

We argued in Chapter Two, that the typological distinction between the Red people and School people served to emphasise that identity involves the capacity of thinking and speaking and the location of the self within a social group in order to secure the
continuity of life process in the community. Although Mol objects to Marxist theories of deprivation he admits that individual, group and social dimension of identity are interdependent. Durkheim maintains that there is a harmony between individual and social identity. Radcliffe-Brown and Malinowsky emphasised the social aspect of identity within the group and individual. However, we must stress that identity is apparent both at the individual level and at the level of role interaction. With the above arguments in mind, we formulated our hypothesis and in the course of developing this hypothesis it was argued that since the trinitarian teaching reflects God as a relational being in which the Father, Son and Holy Spirit fulfil the supremacy of the Father in love and fellowship, Jesus Christ should be interpreted as one whose identity showed solidarity with the Father and the oppressed in the proclamation of the Kingdom of God. The solidarity with the downtrodden of society constitutes his self-identity. Specifically, the following hypothesis was proposed.

"The mission of the Church in relation to the South African society will be better interpreted with the methodology of engagement which conceives of mission as the realization of the Kingdom of God in the here and now. The implication of which is the putting up of the signs of the Kingdom that are justice, love and brotherhood among men, thereby bringing about the transformation of society."

In Chapters 3, 4, 5 and 6 we sought to provide an analysis of South African social reality. In Chapter 3, we explicated at
length the notion of identity, placed within the context of traditional African thought. Van Gennep's theory of the rites of passage illuminated our conceptions of Church and Society. Here, we related identity to three rites of passage in Xhosa Society, namely, childbirth, initiation and marriage. The concept of rite in our arguments was defined as that which constitutes a bond between the sacred and the secular and in particular it was conceived as focussed in sacrifice during which something was offered to the deity. The (imbeleko) initiation and marriage ceremonies on this hand and the Christian sacraments on one other, are underpinned by the common factor of the presence of the Other.

Basically, identity understood in complete terms underlies the sacraments. Human beings experience the fragmentation of their self-identity and consequently they search for integration. In order to maintain the integration of identity man periodizes his life by the recognition of phases which become elements of his own social existence. He focuses on the identity of the family, and consequently guards against anything that threatens to fragment the unity of this identity. The Apartheid ideology with its concomitants has affected not only women and children but also the roots of marriage which are regarded as a sacred bond for the completion of human identity.

Two fundamental concepts about the homestead (umzi) as a focus of identity were identified from the current discussion of permanent and temporary labour migration. Permanent migration was defined
as a movement of a group of people from one area to another. This involves a permanent relocation of their residence. Temporary migration, on the other hand, involves the return of the migrants after a period of absence from (umzi). The oscillating migrant labour system in South Africa, it was argued, has led to the breakdown of family identity. Very briefly, the migrants far away from home in the cities resort to acts of promiscuity and homosexuality. The separation of husband and wife disregards the sacredness of marriage as a bond of identity fulfilment.

The migrant labour system in South Africa has therefore created a Black identity crisis. The urban Blacks reject White racism and incorporate in their identity some of the White values and norms. The rural Blacks on the other hand, suffer from a double-consciousness. They look at the South African urban society as it were with a double-lens in that they see themselves as people working in the city but not of the city. Here, it was argued that the temporary labour migration system has brought to the fore two significant concepts in identity analysis. They were familialism and filiopiety. Familialism was defined as a driving force which urges one's identity to be reunited with the identity of the family at the (umzi). Filiopiety was used to indicate the excessive veneration of the ancestors. Here it was pointed out that ancestors in Xhosa society are not worshipped but venerated. Ancestor veneration is nothing other than the
positive way of maintaining the unity of identity. It suffices to note that the relation with the living and the dead involves constant revision and modification of self-image.

In Chapter 4, we sought to establish that Christianity in South Africa functioned ideologically, the consequences of which constituted a fragmentation of identity from at least the historical point of view. Here the Dutch and English ideologies of social theories gave insight into acquiescence of Christianity in the status quo. This acquiescence attenuated the proclamation of the liberative Kingdom of God. Consequently, an idealised and purely theoretical interpretation of the work of Christ in the world tended to mystify Christianity.

This was partly due to the application of the Kuyperian theory of social spheres to the socio-economic conditions of South Africa. This was supported by the Dutch Reformed Church tradition in South Africa, particularly in their theological interpretation of the Covenant in which they saw the Blacks as the drawers of water and hewers of wood. They, on the other hand, were chosen few of God whose divine mission was to rule not only South Africa but the whole Continent. The Afrikaner interpretation of their ethnic identity as the Israel of Africa is unsustainable. Theologically, God called Israel to be preeminently the embodiment of responsibility, freedom and accountability. The demise of freedom in South Africa is a negation of God's Covenant. When Israel failed to be obedient to God prophets rose up and condemned her of unfaithfulness to God.
Legitimation was identified as a process in which both Dutch and English Missionaries participated. Here, it was argued that the English Missionary Movement had three shared points of reference. First, the sacredness of their tradition was linked to the preconceptions of the artisanal class in their countries of origin, by virtue of which they perceived their identity as higher than that of the indigenous tribes. Second, ethnic identity reflected itself in both language and skin pigmentation. Finally, values reflected strange perceptions of the indigenous tribes particularly in their definition of the concept of civilization. These three points of legitimation in our argument were complementary to the definitions of particular words such as imperialism, colonialism and capitalism which were coined in the European cultural context from which missionaries came.

Imperialism was thus defined as a theoretical term to indicate forms of aggressive behaviour on the part of certain states against others. The term was later applied to the policy of establishing a Greater Britain through the expansion of England into an imperial federation overseas. To talk of imperialism implies the insertion of missionary agencies into colonised countries in order to spread the Christian message and the particular dominant political creeds of commerce and so-called civilization. So, imperialism provided a point of missionary insertion into the imperial order which was identified with British colonialism. However, the need for colonies was often argued in economic terms, particularly by the British who saw in an enlarged Empire a means of preserving markets in a
protectionist World. Leninist interpretations of imperialism, maintain that the economic aspect of imperialism is the monopoly stage of capitalism. How did South Africa become a capitalist society? This is a question pertaining to World capitalism in which we saw the first phase of imperialism as the political partition of the World into colonies which were basically meant to be sources of raw materials for the great imperialist powers. The imperialist stage of capitalism was marked by the outward expansion of the capitalist mode of production for which the missionary movement had no counteracting social theory with which to engage in prophetic denunciation and thus announce economic justice and sharing among humans.

From the review of land literature in Chapter 5, identity values and norms emerged as that which underlaid the conception of land in society. Through the process of internalization values are taken up into human consciousness to become part of identity. In seeking to satisfy the quest for the meaning of identity these values are legitimated on a transcendental level. The legitimation of values was apparent in the distinctions made between the religious communal land process and the religious capitalist land process. The religious communal land process was defined as that in which land is communally owned and not alienable. Here land is something that is related to the integration of identity. It is something that clarifies and revises a relation that exists between the person and the sacred. Because identity needs to unite itself, it seeks unity in the integration of the secular and the sacred, that is, land and
ancestors. Given integration, identity maintains its unity, cohesion and solidarity with the clan and tribe. The religious capitalist land process, on the other hand, was defined as that which maintains private ownership of land as a means of production. Here there is no sense of communality. But individual and group values are justified on a transcendental level as being motivated by an ethical and religious drive to succeed as a visible proof of the benefits of Christianity. This brings to the fore the self-relativity of identity which reflects itself in Christianity, particularly the Western mode which cannot express itself well within a multiracial communal context of sharing. The examination of three modes of production, namely, slavery, feudalism and the capitalist mode, emphasises the ethic of individual success at the expense of a communal sense of identity. Also in Chapter 5, two fundamental concepts about the land process were identified from the current discussions of the impact of the modes of production upon identity. They were squatting and labour tenancy. Squatters were Blacks who lived on White farms but had no right to the land. They may be conceptualised as feudal peasants from whom feudal labour was extracted in the form of rent. Labour tenants, on the other hand, were Africans resident on White farms but who performed labour services for the White farmers. The consequences of these values were associated with a centre-periphery structure in South Africa. In order to establish the distinction of the centre from the periphery a process of the denudation of Black identity was carried out.
"Denudation" was used to indicate a process of stripping away all covering by the removal of that which is fundamental and significant in identity formation. The 1913 Native Land Act was analysed to show how Black identity was seriously eroded. Here values and norms even though justified on a transcendental level were seen to be incompatible with the Christian values of love and economic sharing. In Chapter 6 we sought to identify that which underpinned South African social structure and control. It was argued that class fundamentally underpins the South African social structure. Therefore the ideology of Apartheid must be explained mainly with reference to the economy. It is an economic rather than merely a race factor.

Adam and Kuper, on the other hand, hold that the fundamental problem of South Africa is racial. They recognize the class problem in society. But they reason that race is utilized in South African society to determine a person's identity and how others should relate to him, thus South Africa is seen as institutionalized race rule. However, from a historical point of view, this argument has collapsed. Not merely on the grounds that the concept of race has no scientific justification as such but that available research literature on the first encounter between Black and White at the original Refreshment Station in South Africa has indicated that the only original social distinctions between them were religious rather than racial. This situation reflected the specifically European mode of thought that drew a distinction between the Heathen and a Christian in the first place.
In accord with the arguments of Johnstone, Legassick and McCrone, and contrary to the statements of Adam and Kuper, it was argued that Apartheid should be explained with reference to class. The conception of class, economically generated, is that which relates to the relations of production. The racial divisions at the gold fields on the Witwatersrand reflect clearly the economic issue which is the material basis of South African society. Here the social policy was used to entrench capitalist power in the economy. Interestingly enough, the arguments indicated that all the laws which are the cornerstone of Apartheid are used to maintain the economic base of the South African social structure. Here education is used to keep the White dominant classes in social and economic power. Hegemony structures the South African system of education. Hegemony is complimentary to, but distinguishable from, Karl Marx's conception of ideology. Thus the struggle to counteract hegemony in education is grounded in the structural contradictions of capitalism.

Chapters 7 and 8 contained a sociological and theological analysis of the South African social formation. Here insights from liberation theology, the African National Congress and the Marxist social theory of alienation were used. In Chapter 7, it was hypothesized that identity will express its relational character by seeking a new locus of authority and identity. The new overarching loyalties transcend the old tribal and parochial ones. Lodge, Washe and Apter concur with our views that the formation of the African National Congress in 1912 transcended ethnic and tribal identities. This supra-tribal identity
legitimated itself with reference to a transcendental level. From 1912 to 1960 the identity complexion of the Congress resembled that of a church with regard to its descriptive and prescriptive tasks which were presented in resolution form to the South African Government in terms of sonorous appeals for justice and political inclusion. Here there was no materialist conception of history, for just like Black Theology it drew attention to the racist practices in the South African society but had no fundamental social theory of analysis adequate to the situation.

Yet the concept of alienation, it was argued, is a powerful tool of exposing the ills of society. Alienation refers to a situation in which the self is estranged both from his labour and himself. However, it is distinguished from anomie which refers to a relative normlessness of a social system. Further exploration of South African society with reference to Christianity, was undertaken with the use of a Church typology. It was found that the Church in South Africa functioned ideologically in support of the dominant classes. The Church has submerged and compromised its mission in the process of the Apartheidization of South African society. The Church postulated the reconciliation of contradictions in the form of a vertical spiritual relationship of man to God without adequate commitment to the fulfilment of Black identity. Consequently Christianity was disturbed.
Also in Chapter 7, we argued that the Church should bring about de-alienation in society. De-alienation refers to that which provides the basis for the transformation of society in order to bring into being a non-alienated society that should stimulate the development of justice and freedom. The Church appears to have been afraid to stress de-alienation in Marxist terms for that would have reduced the problem of social transformation to the problem of the abolition of the private property. Yes, the Church endorses the demands of the Freedom Charter. But those demands are far less than what is required by full de-alienation because the Charter has omitted consideration of the full consequences of class division in society.

Chapter 8 and 9 contain a theological analysis of the material assembled in the preceding chapters in which it was argued that the religious identity of the Church should be the commitment of Christianity to the fulfilment of Black identity and this in turn should bring about a completion of white identity and the transformation of society. Here the concept of Prolepsis was significant in that the Kingdom of God must be proclaimed in such a way as to stress the event of Christ as a real anticipation of the future of history in the midst of history. The concept of Church is defined as a base in the world in which two or three people meet to fulfil their identity in the name of the Lord. Here the notion of the religious is inseparably bound with the world since the religious is not an isolated experience but a dimension of human experience. Where is God here? We met him as a relational being in Jesus Christ whose identity is constituted
by his relation to God and his fellowmen. Jesus Christ manifested the identity of God to us by intentionally expressing solidarity with the oppressed and exploited in order to fulfil their human identity. Here mission was defined as the restoration of a dialectical relationship between the grace of God and the World thereby bringing about the transformation of society. Faith was defined as a process of learning how to have faith in God. It presupposes the unity of knowing and acting. The principle of Promise functions as a critical concept which locates the point of convergence between church and world. It enables the church to perform the prophetic task of denunciation and annunciation expected of people in pilgrimage.

Furthermore, it was argued that the church should use the term spirituality. A true spirituality goes beyond the term ideology in that it embodies an analysis of the situation and offers a strategy of action whose primary object is to change the situation. Violence was rejected as a means of social change in South Africa. However, non-violence was seen as a legitimate means of human fulfilment and liberation. On the basis of two models, namely, the Jubilee and Mission Celebration the Church could express its commitment to the fulfilment of black identity. Here the sacraments were given special significance as means of identity fulfilment.
10.2 The Implications of this Study

Several implications for further research may here be inferred from our study. However, the immediate purpose of the thesis was to produce neither policy for the Church in South Africa nor guidelines for preparing our men for the ordained ministry. It is nevertheless evident that the issues upon which the study has focussed are of significance for faith and action of the Church in South Africa. Further investigation of the impact of cultural values upon Christianity is needed. If the Church is one in commitment and spirit why does it not, for example, express its visible unity by bringing into being circuits the boundaries of which are defined geographically rather than racially? The dialectic between racial ideologies and Christianity must be investigated further. What is the meaning of Christian commitment in a situation of oppression and exploitation? Is it the reversal of prejudice and economic exploitation? Presumably these issues imply the re-examination and possibly the restructuring of theological training in South Africa. Theology should be taught as reflection from "below" in relation to the context of experience that speaks to Black oppression and economic alienation. Of course, this is not a negation of White experience as such but it is a necessary embodiment of it. Faculties of divinity in South Africa should be racially-mixed with scholars on the staff who would not be frightened and embarassed by such theological analysis from below but who will welcome it.
On a more profound and problematic level our argument exposes a dilemma. On the one hand, we have argued for the retention of Black African identity and this involves the investigation and interpretation of traditional cultural practices. Indeed, we have argued that these practices are parallel in important respects with Christianity, thus Christianity rightly understood and applied might serve as the bearer of African identity, despite its failure to do this in the major missionary denominations. However, on the other hand, Black Liberation demands modernisation and this latter inevitably constitutes an assault on traditional African identity and places an immense strain upon the theological interpretation of the problem of Black identity in South Africa. How this dilemma could be resolved and positive progress attained which combined political liberation with the preservation of identity will constitute the major task of the Church in South Africa once liberation is attained.

This problem came to the fore in the analysis of education in South Africa and also in our investigation of the history of social activism and in particular the African National Congress. The problem of continuity and discontinuity in the identity development as embodied in religion and theology in relation to politics and industrial and economic change contains conflicting demands between tradition and modernity which indicate the crucial role of the future of the Church in South Africa and the ultimate universality of the problems that it faces.
GLOSSARY OF AFRIKAANS AND XHOSA WORDS

RETAINED IN THE TEXT

Abamnyama, the Blacks
Abaphantsi, refers to the ancestral spirits underneath
Abelungu, Whites
Afrikaner Volk, the Afrikaner racial/ethnic group
Afrikaner, one of the White tribes of South Africa who speak Afrikaans
Amabhaca, a tribe in the Transkei
Amagqesha, two strips of sheep skin used in circumcision
Amahlubi, a fingo clan in South Africa
Amalima, work-party (ukulima, to plough)
Amajikazi, bead earrings
Amampondo, a tribe mainly found in the Transkei in South Africa
Amampondomise, one of the tribal groups of the Xhosa people
Amanqashela, bead anklets
Amaxhosa, one of the indigenous Black ethnic groups in South Africa
Bomvana, a tribe in the Transkei
Broederbond, a secret Afrikaner organisation which formulates and puts into practice the Apartheid laws in South Africa. A League of brothers
Doek, iqhiya
Domper, refers to something used to extinguish a candle
Dominee, a pastor
Dopper, an Afrikaner religious grouping, a word derived from the Dutch "Domper" referring to something used to extinguish candles
Emazizini, a tribal residential area in the Peddie Magisterial district of the Ciskei in the Eastern Cape of South Africa

Gereformeerde Kerk, Reformed Church

Heilsgeschichte, divine history - revelatory history

Hlonipha, to respect

Ibonsaka, a bag

Ibhoma, the Lodge

Ibomvu, red clay

Icece, a procession to the groom's homestead

Ifutha, white clay

Igaba, a hoe

Ikhankatha, is a male nurse who bandages the circumcised boys with the healing leaves

Ikhuba, a plough

Ikrali, is another word for a stick in hlonipha language

Ikrwala, signifies an initial stage of manhood. The term ikrwala, may refer to a fruit which is about to be ripe

Imbeleko, a ritual ceremony for a baby in traditional Xhosa society

Imbhola, the Ochre used in initiation

Imbongi YamaXhosa, the praise-singer of the Xhosa

Impaka, a wild cat

Ineni, a baby minder

Ingcibi, the surgeon who performs the circumcision operation

Ingqaza, a bead head-dress

Inkobe, boiled mealies

Inkosi, a chief

Inkuku, a fowl

InKundla, the space between the huts and Kraal of an umzi
Inkuni, firewood
Inxhili, tobacco bags
Intonga, a stick
Intsonyama, the special piece of meat from the right foreleg, eaten by a person for whom a ritual killing is made
Inyongo, the gall
Isifombo, that is another word for a fowl in the hlonipha language
Isiduli, the antheap
Isithebe, a grass eating-mat
Ityeba, a strip used for binding the leaf bandages around the circumcised wound
Ityala, a case
Izichwe, the bandages of leaves used in circumcision
Kaffir, one who does not believe in the teachings of Mohammed, but in South Africa is used to refer to the Blacks and it conveys a stigma of contempt
Koolie, refers to the Indians of South Africa
Khumbula, to remember
Kwabaphezu Komhlaba, literally refers to those above the Earth, ie, those living on the earth
Kwamlungu, refers to the white people's place of residence. Specifically it means kitchen as a place of work
Laager, literally, it refers to the Afrikaner's traditional, narrow and conservative mentality which excludes those who differ from themselves politically. Historically, it is the putting together of wagons to form a circle in which to hide from enemies
Lizalis idinga lakho, Thixo Nkosi Yenyaniso, Fulfil Thy Promise, God of Truth
Lobola, to give cattle to the family of a girl taken in marriage
Mayibuye i Afrika, let Africa return to Africans
Mna, thina, I, we
Ndiyindoda, I am a man
Nkosi Sikelel' i Afrika, God bless Africa
Onokhitshi, Black women who work in White households in towns, villages, cities or farms of South Africa
Predikant, a pastor or a minister of religion
Satyagraha, non-violence, love, active resistance
Sendingkerk, Missionary Church
Sosuthu, the male head of the Kraal appointed to be the "father" of the ritual ceremony of incorporation
Thandaza, to pray
Thixo, God
Thixo Ophezu Komhlaba, God who dwells on Earth
Ubaptizo, baptism
Ubudoda, manhood
Ubukhwenkwe, boyhood
Ubulawu, a foam of a plant which is dug up from the veld and used for washing the body
Ubulingwe, cow dung
Ubulungu, a necklace bead
Ubuntu, humaneness
Ubumna, selfhood
Umathula 'Ntabeni, a goat which is killed in traditional marriage ceremonies as an act of binding together the bride and the groom's kinship groups
Umajola inyoka Yasekhaya, the name of a snake which is regarded as a totem among the Amampondomise tribe. It is regarded as a snake of the home
Umasihlalisane, let us live together without the marriage bond but with all privileges of marriage
Umdali, creator
Umenzi, maker
Umguoyo, a ritual, festive ceremony that takes place on the evening before the boys undergo tribal initiation

Umhlaba, Land

Umkhinxo, a head necklace

Umkonto, the spear

Umkonto Wesizwe, the spear of the nation

Umlaza, ritual impurity

Umnikazi Mzi, is the female head of a home, or a Kraal

Umntu Ngumntu Ngabantu, a person is a person through other people

Umntu, a person, or people

Umnqayi, a black stick used in the circumcision rite

Umteteli Wabantu, the name of a newspaper, literally "the defender of the people"

Umpheki, a cook

Umvasikazi, one who washes clothes

Umvelingqangi, the Supreme Being, literally "the one who brought everything into existence"

Umzi, local kinship group, and the huts in which they live, a homestead

Ukubeleka, to carry a child on the back or to give birth

Ukudliswa Amasi, to make to drink sour milk; the ritual killing made before a woman drinks milk of her husband's cattle

Ukukhathaza, to give trouble, or to be a nuisance; to be sick

Ukwaluka, to circumcise

Ukungena, to take your deceased elder brother's wife as your wife. This is common among the Amampondo tribe

Ukusebenza emakhishini, domestic work in South Africa

Ukusoka, the presentation of gifts to the circumcised

Ukushwama, a ritual for the boys to be circumcised

Ukutshata, to marry or to get married
Ukuxhentsa okanye Ukugiya, to dance

Ukuxhosa, if the white clay with which the initiates have smeared themselves shows the skin, that is explained as "Ukuxhosa"

Ukwandla lela, to lay the marriage mat

Unguye, he is himself

Unonkala, a crab

Utywala, beer
SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

A Primary Sources

(i) Tape-recorded & Documentary Sources. Tape-recorded Interviews from the Emazizini Area in Peddie, South Africa Cassette Number, 1001, 1002, 1003, 1004, 1005, 1006, 1007, 1008, 1009, 10010, 10011, 10012, 10013, 10014, 10015. [Translation into English is mine].


(iv) Newspapers and Journals


Daily News (London) 30th April, 1928.


Imvo Zabantsundu, January 3, (1928).


Racism in Theology and Theology Against Racism (Report of a Consultation Organized by the Commission on Faith and Order and the Programme to Combat Racism), Geneva, 1975.


The Guardian Newspaper (1949).


The Treason Trial Record. The Original Copy is held by the Institute of Race Relations in Johannesburg, South Africa.


Ukpong, J.S. African Theologies Now - A Profile, in Spearhead No. 80 (Gaba Publications, AMECEA Pastoral Institute, P.O. Box 908, Eldoret, Kenya, 1984).

Umteteleli Wa Bantu Newspaper, January 7, (1928).


B Secondary Sources


Mzimba, L.N. 1923 Pambani Jeremiah Mzimba. (Lovedale).


C General Bibliography


Althus, P. 1972 The Ethics of Martin Luther. (Fortress Press, Philadelphia).


Barnes, J. 1972 The Ontological Argument (MacMillan).


Barry Hindess and Paul Q. Hirst, 1975 Pre-Capitalist Modes of Production. (Boston, Routledge & Kegan Paul).

Barth, K. 1957 Church Dogmatics II. (T. Clarke & Clark).

Barth, K. 1972 Protestant Theology in the Nineteenth Century: Its Background & History. (SCM Press Ltd.).


Berger, P.L. 1969 The Sacred Canopy. (Garden City N.Y.: Doubleday & Co.).

Berglund, A-I. 1976 Zulu Thought-Patterns and Symbolism. (Uppsala, Swedish Institute of Missionary Research, Cape Town).


Biddle, B.J. 1979 Role Theory: Expectations, identities

Blac, C.E. 1966 The Dynamics of Modernization (N.Y.: Harper
& Row).


Block, N. (ed) 1980 Readings in the Philosophy of
Psychology, Vol. 1. (Methuen).

Block, N. (ed) 1981 Readings in the Philosophy of
Psychology, Vol. 2. (Methuen).

Communism. (New York, Frederick A. Praeger
Publishers).


Bonacich, E. "Capitalism and Race Relations in S.A.: A
Split Labor Market Analysis" in Maurice Zeitlin (ed),
(1981) Political Power and Social Theory, (Greenwood,
Connalist).

Bonner, H. 1959 Group Dynamics: Principles and

Bosch, D.J. 1980 Witness to the World: The Christian
Mission in Theological Perspective. (John Knox Press,
Atlanta).

Bosworth, W. 1982 Catholicism and Christ in Modern France

(Basil Blackwell: Oxford).

(Basil Blackwell Ltd.).

Brockway, F. 1973 The Colonial Revolution. (Hart-Davis,
MacGibbon. London).

Brookes, E.H. and Macaulay, J.B. (eds) 1958 Civil Liberty
in South Africa. (Cape Town, Oxford University Press,

Brookes, E.H. 1924 The History of Native Policy in South
Africa from 1830 to the present day. (Cape Town).

Brotz, H. 1977 The Politics of South Africa: Democracy and
University Press).


Bryant, A.T. 1949 The Zulu People. (Pietermaritzburg Shuter and Shooter).


Callinicos, A. 1981 Southern Africa after Zimbambwe (Pluto Press Ltd.).

Calpin, G.H. 1949 Indians in South Africa (Pietermaritzburg Shuter & Shooter).

Campbell, R.H. & Skinner A.S. 1982 The Origins and Nature of the Scottish Enlightenment (John Donald Publishers Ltd.).


Chisholm, R.M., 1957 Perceiving : A Philosophical Study (Cornell U.R).


Chomsky, N. 1972 Language & Mind (Harcourt, Brace, Javanovich).

Chomsky, N. 1966 Cartesian Linguistics (Harper & Row)


Clemen, C. 1931 Religions of the World : Their Nature and their History. (George G. Harrap Ltd London)


Cock, J. 1980 - Maids and Madams, (Raven Press Johannesburg)


  " " " Vol. II 1820 - 1834
  " " " Vol. III 1834 - 1838
  " " " Vol. IV 1838 - 1846
  " " " Vol. V 1847 - 185 (Struck, Cape Town).


Cottingham, I. et al (Eds.) The Philosophical Writings of Descartes (2 Vols) (Cambridge U.P.).


Dancy, J., 1985 Introduction to Contemporary Epistemology (Blackwell).


Davidson, D. 1984 Inquiries into Truth and Interpretation (Oxford U.P.).


Dennett, D.C. 1984 Elbow Room: The Varieties of Free Will Worth Wanting (Oxford).


Descartes, R. 1965 Correspondence VI (Paris).


Dilke, C.W. 1885 Greater Britain : Record of Travel in English-speaking Countries during 1866 and 1867. (London : Macmillan, 1868).


Doxey, G.V. 1961 The Industrial Colour Bar in South Africa (Cape Town).


Durkheim, E. 1952 Suicide: A Study in Sociology (Routledge and Kegan Paul Ltd.).

Dussel, E. 1976 History and the Theology of Liberation. (Trans. J. Drury, N.Y.)


Educanus, A. Newsletter published by the Department of Foreign Affairs, October (1980).


Ellis, A.B. 1890 The Ewe Speaking Peoples of the Slave Coast of West Africa. (London).

Ellmann, R. 1940 The Identity of Yeats. (Faber and Faber Ltd., 24 Russell Square, London).


Evans-Pritchard, E.E. 1965 Theories of Primitive Religion. (Oxford University at the C.Iarendond Press).


Fetter, Bruce (ed) 1979 Colonial Rule in Africa. (The University of Wisconsin Press).


Finegan, Jack 1952 The Archaeology of World Religions. (Princeton University Press).


Fiorenza, F.S. 1984 Foundational Theology: Jesus and the Church. (Crossroad, New York).


Flew, A. 1961 Hume's Philosophy of Belief. (RKP).

Fodor, J.A. 1976 The Language of Thought. (Harvester).


Geertz, C. 1973 *The Interpretation of Culture.* (N.Y. Basic).


Giliomeee, H., Schiemmer Lawrence (eds) 1985 *Up Against the Fences: Poverty, Passes and Privilege in South Africa.* (David Phillip, Cape Town & Johannesburg).


Hall, R., 1978 50 Years of Hume Scholarship: A Bibliographical Guide. (Edinburgh U.P.)

Hall, R. & Woolhouse, R.S., 1983 80 Years of Locke Scholarship. (Edinburgh U.P.)


Hanson, A.T. "Eschatology" in New Dictionary of Christian Theology edited by Alan Richardson and John Bowden (1983)


Hartshorne, C. 1965 Anselm's Discovery. (Open Court).


Hastings, A. 1967 Church and Mission in Modern Africa. (Fordham University Press).


Herder, J.G. 1791 Outlines of a Philosophy of the History of Man (London).

Herskovits, M.J. 1957 Anthropology and Culture Change in Africa, (Communications of the University of South Africa, Pretoria).


Hooker, M. ed. 1978 *Descartes: Critical and Interpretive Essays.* (Johns Hopkins U.P.)


Horrell, M. 1964 *A Decade of Bantu Education.* [Johannesburg: S.A. Institute of Race Relations].


Huddleston, T. 1956 *Naught for Your Comfort.* (Wm. Collins Sons & Co. Ltd.)


James, W. 1902 The Varieties of Religious Experience. (Modern Library, N.Y.).


Jenkins, D.E. 1976 The Contradiction of Christianity. (SCM Press Ltd.)


Kemp Smith, N. 1941 The Philosophy of David Hume. (MacMillan).


Kripke, S. 1980 Naming and Necessity. (Blackwell).


Kuyper, A. 1879 Lectures on Calvinism. (Amsterdam).


Laws and Discipline 1974 The Methodist Church of Southern Africa. (Cape Town).


Lenman, B. 1981 Integration, Enlightenment, and Industrialization Scotland 1746-1832. (Edward Arnold Publishers Ltd.).


Little, D. & Twiss, B.S. (eds) 1973 "Basic Terms in the Study of Religious Ethics", in Religion and Morality (ed) Gene Outka and John P. Reeder (Garden City, N.Y. Double Day).


Lovejoy, A. 1936 The Great Chain of Being. (Cambridge).

Luce, A.A. 1945 Berkeley's Immaterialism. (Nelson).

Luckhoff, A.H. 1978 Cottesloe. (Cape Town).


Malcolm, N. 1963 Knowledge and Certainty. (Cornell U.P.)

Malcolm, N. 1977 Thought and Knowledge. (Cornell U.P.)


Malcolm, N. 1963 Knowledge and Certainty. (Cornell U.P.)


Mandela, N. 1965 No Easy Walk to Freedom. (Heinemann Educational).


Marquard, L. 1963 The Story of South Africa. (Faber and Faber Ltd., London).


Mayer, P. 1971 Townsmen or Tribesmen. (Cape Town, Oxford University Press).


Moltmann, J. 1981 The Trinity and the Kingdom of God: The Doctrine of God. (SCM Press Ltd.)


Niebuhr, R. 1959 Essays in Applied Christianity. (Meridian Books, Inc.).


O'Hear, A. 1984 Experience, Explanation and Faith. (RKP).

Okot p'Bitek 1971 African Religions in Western Scholarship. (Nairobi).


O'Neill, J.C. 1983 "Heilgeschichte" in a New Dictionary of Christian Theology edited by Alan Richardson and John Bowden. (SCM Press Ltd.)


Passmore, J. 1968 Hume's Intentions (Duckworth).


Peart-Binns, J.S. 1973 Ambrose Reeves (London: Victor Gollancz Ltd)


Pells, E.G. 1956 Three Hundred Years of Education in South Africa (Johannesburg : Jutas).


Perry, J.A. and Seider, M.B. 1975 Contemporary Society: An Introduction to Social Science (San Francisco : Canfield).


Pope, L. 1957 The Kingdom Beyond Caste (New York).

Popkin, R.H. 1979 The History of Scepticism from Erasmus to Spinoza. (California).

Postma, W. 1918 Doppers (Bloemfontein).


Rahner, K. 1974 The Shape of the Church to Come (Burns & Oates).


Reader, D.H. 1966 Zulu Tribe in transition (Cape Town, Oxford University Press).


Richardson, A. 1983 "Beatific Vision", in A New Dictionary of Christian Theology edited by Alan Richardson and John Bowden. (SCM Press Ltd.)


Schall, J.V. 1981 *Liberation Theology in Latin America*. (San Francisco).


Setiloane, G.M. 1976 The Image of God Among the Sotho-Tswana. (Rotterdam; Balkema).

Setiloane, G.M. 1976 "I am an African", in Anderson and Stransky (eds), Mission Trends, No. 3.


Setiloane, G.M. 1979 "Where are we in African Theology?" in Appiah kubi & Torres (eds), Theology en route.


Sharpe, R.J. 1971 50 Key Words : Comparative Religion. (London : Lutterworth Press).


Spencer, H. 1885 Principles of Sociology. (London).


St. Anselm 1962 Basic Writings. (Open Court).


Strawson, P.F. 1959 Individuals. (Methuen).


Taylor, J.V. 1963 The Primal Vision. (SCM Press Ltd.).


The 1986 Minutes of the Methodist Conference in South Africa, "The World Church in Britain".


Thompson, L.M. 1966 Politics in the Republic of South Africa. (Boston and Toronto, Little, Brown & Co.).


Troup, F. 1972 South Africa : An Historical Introduction. (Eyre Methuen Ltd.).


Van Den Berghe, P. 1967 Race and Racism (Wiley).


Visser't Hooft, W.A. 1971 A Responsible University in A Responsible Society Memorial Lecture, (University of Cape Town).


Von Rad, G. Old Testament Theology. (Harper Brothers 1962).


Wagner, P. 1970 Latin American Theology: Radical or Evangelical (Grand Rapids : Eerdmans).


Weinstein, M.A. 1971 Identity, Power, and Change. (Scott, Foresman and Co.).


Wilson, M. 1971 Religion and Transformation of Society: A Study in Social Change in Africa. [Cambridge at the University Press].


Wilson, D. 1978 Descartes. (RKP).


Woolhouse, R.S. 1983 Locke. (Harvester).

Woolhouse, R.S. 1971 Locke's Philosophy of Science and Knowledge. (Blackwell).

World Council of Churches: From the Bible to the Modern World. (Geneva: W.C.C. (1949)).


Zizioulas, J.D. 1985 Being as Communion. [Darton, Longman and Todd Ltd., London].