

# **Durham E-Theses**

# Multiple Masculinities: an exploration of urban Mapuche youth identities in Chile

GARSIDE, GRACE, ELLEN

#### How to cite:

GARSIDE, GRACE, ELLEN (2016) Multiple Masculinities: an exploration of urban Mapuche youth identities in Chile, Durham theses, Durham University. Available at Durham E-Theses Online: http://etheses.dur.ac.uk/11971/

#### Use policy

The full-text may be used and/or reproduced, and given to third parties in any format or medium, without prior permission or charge, for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes provided that:

- a full bibliographic reference is made to the original source
- a link is made to the metadata record in Durham E-Theses
- the full-text is not changed in any way

The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

Please consult the full Durham E-Theses policy for further details.

#### **Abstract**

# Multiple Masculinities: an exploration of urban Mapuche youth identities in Chile Grace Garside

This thesis explores the multiple masculinities performed by urban Mapuche youth. Current understandings of indigenous masculinity are limited to distinctions between urban and rural, hegemonic and marginalised, and authentic and modern. This explanation essentialises indigenous masculinities by reducing them to limiting dichotomies. This research challenges such essentialisms by exploring the multiple ways in which young urban Mapuche men perform their masculinities and challenge ways in which they are represented. It argues that their masculinities are formed out of complex relationships with Mapuche identity and cannot be dismissed as inauthentic. The thesis draws on qualitative research undertaken during a onemonth period between the cities of Santiago and Temuco in Chile, including interviews, focus groups and photo voice with men of Mapuche ethnicity between the ages of 16 and 31. The results show that young Mapuche men experience and express their masculinities in varied and distinct ways. In Santiago, those who identify as 'Mapurbe' (a Mapuche urban youth political movement) understand their masculinity within the traditional Mapuche role system. However, whilst the Mapurbe are often taken to represent Mapuche urban youth more broadly in popular and academic discourses, the research findings suggest that multiple urban youth masculinities exist in Chile. In Temuco, young Mapuche students identify as both Mapuche and Chilean, combining everyday Chilean masculinities with what they believe to be Mapuche expressions of masculinity through displays of aggression. Meanwhile, young professional Mapuche men express their masculinity through understandings of men as providers, actively rejecting a Mapuche masculine identity. The thesis suggests that these complexities in Mapuche masculinities need to be understood through an intersectional approach that takes account of both place and class, which is important in both challenging popular stereotypes and creating a richer understanding of diverse expressions of modern indigeneity.

# Multiple Masculinities: an exploration of urban Mapuche youth identities in Chile

# **Grace Garside**

Thesis submitted for the degree of Master of Arts by Research

**Department of Geography** 

**Durham University** 

October 2016

## **Table of Contents**

Abstract	1
List of Figures List of Tables	
Declaration	6
Acknowledgements	7
Chapter 1. Introduction	Q
Introduction	
Masculinities and the Mapuche	
Aims and Research Questions	
Thesis Structure	10
Chapter 2. Understanding Indigenous Masculinities through an Intersectional I	Lens 12
Theorising Men and Masculinities	
Intersectionality	
Masculinities in Latin America	24
Indigenous Masculinities	27
Indigenous Identities	30
Multiple Mapuche Masculinities	35
Geographies of Hybridity	40
Conclusions	43
Chapter 3. Methodologies	44
The Central Methodological Challenge in Researching Urban Mapuche Youth	
Field Research with Mapuche Youth in Chile	
Ethical Considerations	
Positionality	63
Conclusion	66
Chapter 4. Urban Mapuche Youth Masculinities: Performances and Representa	
Mapurbe Masculinities: Traditions and Roles	
Representations of Idealised Mapurbe Masculinities	
Boarding School Students: Blood Ties and Land Based Masculinities	
Representations of Idealised Boarding School Student Mapuche Masculinities	
Young Mapuche Professional Masculinities	
Representations of Idealised Young Mapuche Masculinities	
Conclusions	
Chapter 5. Mapuche Youth in Place: Urban and Rural Masculinities	101
Introduction	
Place and Mapuche Identities	
Mapuche Migration and Experiences of Urban Space	
Urban Mapuche Identities Within Temuco	
Rural Influences on Mapuche Masculinities	
Conclusions	122
Chapter 6. Class, Ethnicity and Mapuche Masculinities	125
Introduction	
The Chilean Class System	

The Mapuche within the Chilean Class System	130
Class, Ethnicity and the Lived Experiences of Mapuche Youth	132
The Role of Education in Shaping Mapuche Masculinities	136
Mapuche Youth Engagement in Politics	
Conclusions	
Chapter 7. Conclusions	150
The Multiplicity and Variation of Mapuche Masculinities	
Hybrid Mapuche Masculinities	
Intersectional Mapuche Masculinities	
Limitations of the Research	
Implications of the Research	
Bibliography	158
Appendix	181
Participant Information	
Interview Format	
Extract from an Interview Transcript	
Translations of Key Words	

## List of Figures

Figure 1: Photograph of Mapuche poet David Aniñir (Ruben, 24)78
Figure 2 Image taken from the internet of Mapuche poet David Aniñir (Franco, 29)
Figure 3: Image taken from the internet of Mapuche rap artist Waikil (Fernando, 16)79
Figure 4: Photograph of Mapuche rap artist Waikil (Diego, 25)79
Figure 5: Photograph of a friend in traditional Mapuche dress (Hector, 16)79
Figure 6: Photograph taken "Wentru Singing" (Franco, 29)
Figure 7: A belt weaved in the traditional fashion worn by Franco (Source: Author) 80
Figure 8: Image of a Statue of Lautaro (Carlos, Focus Group 4)
Figure 9: Painting of Lautaro (Pablo, Focus Group 2)90
Figure 10: Photograph of a Statue of Caupolican (Vincente, Focus Group 2)90
Figure 11: Photograph of Caupolican Avenue (Alejandro, Focus Group 1)90
Figure 12: This image is another representation of Lautaro. Many of the representations of
Lautaro were based on this same painting, painted by the Chilean painter Pedro
Subercaseaux, entitled "El Joven Lautaro" (The Young Lautaro). It is one of the most
famous representations of Lautaro (Francisco, 23)
Figure 13: This image is a banner from a protest in Santiago after the killing of Matias
Catrileo, it reads "Matias Catrileo, Warrior of the Mapuche Nation" (Wilson, 30) 98
Figure 14: Marcelo Salas in the 1998 world cup playing for Chile (Alexis, 29)99
Figure 15: The proposed ceremonial centre in Santiago (source: CEBRA)108
Figure 16: The proposed ceremonial centre in Santiago (source: CEBRA)108
Figure 17: Photograph of the bride and groom, taken at the Mapurbe wedding (Source:
author)
Figure 18: The sharing of slaughtered horse, a traditional practice at Mapuche weddings
(Source: Author)
Figure 19: Map marking Wall Mapu, the original Mapuche territories. (Source: Author) 120
Figure 20: Map marking Wall Mapu, the original Mapuche territories. (Source: Author) 120
List of Tables
Table 1: Research Questions and the Corresponding Methodology
Table 2: Participant Information Table

**Declaration** 

I confirm that no part of the material presented in this thesis has previously been submitted by

me or any other person for a degree in this or any other university. In all cases, where it is

relevant, material from the work of others has been acknowledged.

The copyright of this thesis rests with the author. No quotation from it should be published

without the author's prior written consent and all information should be acknowledged

appropriately.

Grace Garside

October 2016

6

#### **Acknowledgements**

There are many people I need to thank, without who this piece of work would not have been possible. Firstly, I would like to thank Professor Cheryl McEwan for agreeing to be my supervisor and Dr. Sydney Calkin for joining last minute as my additional supervisor. Both have given me incredible support and guidance throughout this year. Thank you, Sydney, for your continual advice on how to approach this thesis and how to improve my writing style. Thank you, Cheryl, for your constant critical engagement with the thesis and for helping me to challenge my own views and understandings of the thesis. Thank you to both of you for being free for a chat and for making time to read over my work, it made this process thoroughly enjoyable. Secondly I would like to thank my family and friends, my parents who believed in me and supported me through this thesis and to the St Johns community who were always willing to listen and give advice. Particularly I would like to thank my friends in Temuco who were always supportive, Ivor, Sibila, Daniel, Alejandra and Pablo. Finally, I would like to thank my research participants and gatekeepers. Thank you for being so keen to help, giving up your time and always providing suggestions and ideas for the research. Thank you to the Mapuche community for its kindness and willingness to participate in this research and to teach me about their culture and language. Chraeltu.

#### **Chapter 1. Introduction**

#### Introduction

This thesis is an exploration of urban Mapuche youth masculinities. The research project seeks to contribute to discussions concerning the concept of multiple masculinities within the framework of indigenous urban youth groups. The thesis argues that masculinities are multiple and intersectional and the research looks at the ways in which place, class, ethnicity and gender all intersect to influence Mapuche masculinities.

The Mapuche are the largest indigenous group within Chile, with over 1,000,000 people identifying as Mapuche. Prior to the Spanish invasion the Mapuche people lived in the central and southern parts of Chile, from the Aconcagua River in the North to Chiloe in the south. The Spanish were unable to conquer the Mapuche peoples and consequently a colonial agreement was made between the two peoples in which the Spanish accepted the independence of the Mapuche peoples. However, when the Chilean state gained independence they began the "pacification of Araucania" and the Mapuche people were finally defeated by the Chilean army at the end of the nineteenth century. The Mapuche people were subsumed under the Chilean state and the indigenous territory was greatly reduced with many Mapuche being sent to live on reservations. The dictatorship finally put an end to the reservation system, by declaring that the lands and the people on them were no longer indigenous but Chilean. Despite this attempted deconstruction, the Mapuche people still exist within Chilean society and "the homo indigenous has not been replaced by the homo economicus the neo-liberal dictatorship had dreamed of" (Boccara, 2002). In 1993, the Chilean government created an indigenous law that recognizes the presence of the Mapuche people and other indigenous cultures within Chile and a new state institution was created: "the National Indigenous Development Corporation (CONADI). However, the Mapuche people remain a marginalized group within the Chilean state. Eurocentrism remains prevalent within Chile, and the increasing popularity of the indigenous movement and the push for Mapuche land reclamation has resulted in the creation of the anti-terrorist law by the Concertacion government. Against this backdrop, this thesis questions typical representations of Mapuche masculinities by both the Chilean state and by academics. It does so by exploring the complexities of Mapuche youth identities in urban areas.

#### Masculinities and the Mapuche

Masculinities are a key aspect of Mapuche urban youth identities, contributing to how Mapuche youth self-define and understand their indigeneity. However, current explorations of masculinities tend to be essentialist and limited in scope. Connell's influential conceptualisation, which he terms hegemonic masculinity reduces the complexity and nuances of everyday masculinities by subsuming masculinity within categories. By contrast, this research challenges the notion of hegemonic masculinities by exploring the intersectionalities of Mapuche masculinities.

Mapuche masculinities have often been explored through contradictory terms. From the early independence period the Araucanian warrior has been heralded as an exemplar of manhood, associated with characteristics such as "strength, virility and culture" (Crow, 2014; 75). This contrasts, however, with Chilean state discourse that promote the Mapuche as violent terrorists. Mapuche struggles for land reclamation have resulted in the creation of an anti-terrorist law that has been largely used to suppress the Mapuche people. Finally, Mapuche masculinities have been represented by scholars through the exploration of the Mapurbe subculture, who are framed as a resistant urban youth group promoting the reclamation of Mapuche culture and territory through hybrid masculinities. This thesis deconstructs the image of the Mapuche as hyper-masculine, proposing that within this indigenous group there are multiple masculinities that emerge from varying intersections of culture, place, ethnicity and class.

This research is framed within a wider discussion of intersectionality. It acknowledges that masculinities are socially created and explores the way place, class and ethnicity intersect to form multiple Mapuche masculinities. It tackles understandings of indigenous identity, questioning the utility of traditional definitions of indigeneity, promoting a more open discussion of what it means to be indigenous and considering multiple, intersecting identities as influencing indigeneity. The research explores the ways in which understandings of gender and sex differ within indigenous cultures. The research argues that the dynamism and complexity of Mapuche masculinities should be discussed through the lens of a hybrid identity, arguing that the colonial encounter, globalisation and indigenous culture all shape the multiple Mapuche masculinities.

#### Aims and Research Questions

The aim of this research is to explore multiple Mapuche masculinities. The objective is to understand how masculinities are performed and represented, but also to understand the ways in which these masculinities are refracted through different identity markers, such as place, ethnicity and class. The research aims to investigate the following:

- 1. The ways in which young Mapuche men negotiate masculinities.
- 2. How young Mapuche men perform their masculinities on an everyday basis.
- 3. The ways in which Mapuche masculinities are expressed and performed in response to popular opinion and government policy.
- 4. The ways in which Mapuche masculinities are shaped by class, ethnicity, gender and place.

#### Thesis Structure

This thesis takes an intersectional approach to the discussion of Mapuche masculinities. It first explores the performances and representations of various Mapuche masculinities and then goes on to investigate the reasons for the emergence of Mapuche masculinities, focusing particularly on place, class and ethnicity.

Chapter 2 provides a context for the research project by first challenging ideas about Masculinity formation and arguing that masculinities are always multiple and varied, even within social groups. The chapter then frames this argument within the research on Latin American and indigenous masculinities, focusing on an intersectional approach to identity formation. Chapter 3 outlines the multiple methodologies that were used in this research and situates the project within wider attempts to decolonise methodologies. The chapter then discusses the positionality of the researcher and discusses challenges and ethical considerations associated with the research. Chapter 4 explores the various Mapuche masculinities as expressed by different groups of men: the Mapurbe in Santiago, boarding school students in Temuco and young professionals in Temuco. The chapter explores the ways in which these different groups perform and represent their masculinities through self-identification, pastimes and photovoice. Chapter 5 explores some of the factors that shape diverse Mapuche masculinities, focusing on the significance of place, specifically political and environmental influences. It explores the differences between Santiago and Temuco and discusses varying Mapuche connections with traditional Mapuche lands to suggest some reasons why different

expressions of masculinity have emerged among young Mapuche men. Chapter 6 focuses on the intersections of class with ethnicity in shaping Mapuche masculinities. It discusses the differences between middle class and working class Mapuche masculinities and explores how ethnic and class cleavages promote varying expressions of Mapuche masculinities. This thesis concludes with a summary of the key findings and their relevance to other studies and provides some suggestions for future research.

#### **Chapter 2. Understanding Indigenous Masculinities through an Intersectional Lens**

The following chapter provides a theoretical framework for researching masculinities, and in doing so reviews literature that is important to understanding masculinities, intersectionality and indigeneities. Section one explores theories of masculinities and men and argues that masculinities should be understood as multiple and disassociated from the body. The second section argues that the best way of understanding masculinities is through an intersectional lens, looking at the ways in which class and ethnicity influence the formation of masculinities. This section also argues that in order to embrace a fully intersectional approach the concept of place must be regarded as having an equal influence on identity formation. The chapter goes on to discuss work on masculinities in Latin America and specifically Chile and then explores the way these hegemonic masculinities differ from indigenous masculinities. The chapter concludes by looking at current work on Mapuche masculinities and suggests that this work may be expanded by looking at Mapuche masculinities through a hybrid, intersectional lens.

#### Theorising Men and Masculinities

Over the last three decades there has been an increasing interest within the social sciences on studies of masculinities. Since the 1980s there has been a marked acceleration of work published on the subject, with researchers providing new concepts for theorizing men and masculinities (Brod and Kaufman, 1994; Connell, Hearn and Kimmel, 2004; Connell, 1995; Cornwall and Lindisfarne, 2003; Flood, 2002; Hearn, 1996; Mac an Ghail, 1996). This interest in masculinity contradicts ideas that present the dominant gender categories of men and masculinities as unmarked, normative and thus degendered (Flood, 2002).

The field of gender studies was developed within feminism, by women, to discuss questions about women. However, the need to discuss men "as men" (Gutmann, 2003; 18) has arisen from large scale social and political changes since the end of the twentieth century (Flood, 2002). The configuration of gender within men's lives has been disrupted by the cumulative effects of the globalization of capital and communication systems, the changing nature of labour processes and new work technologies, the collapse of manufacturing and the accompanying suggested feminisation of local labour markets, changing family forms and an increasing range of contradictory representations of men and masculinity (Mac an Ghail, 1996; 3).

As such, in the last three decades, representations of men's identities and masculinities have begun to be interrogated as constructed, political and problematic. Work within the social sciences has variously been located under men's studies or critical studies of men (Hearn, 1996). This work has focused on descriptions of multiple masculine identities (Mac and Ghail, 1994; Messner, 1992; Segal, 1997), boys' education (Lunard and Douglas, 1999), gender equity and the changing positions of women (Lundberg, 2001) and unemployment, domestic violence and family breakdown (Gutmann, 2003; Gutmann and Viveros Vigoya, 2004). It is important to embrace this expansion on studies of masculinities and men in order to acknowledge the imbrications of masculinities with relationships of power and control, over both women and other men, as well as their role in promoting gender equality (Connell, Hearn and Kimmel, 2004; Gutmann, 2003).

The categories of both men and masculinities have, until recently, often been taken for granted, not only within everyday life, but also within many gender analyses. The most recurring issue arises when male (or female) as sex is conflated with men (or women) as gender. There is no natural connection between sex and gender, however verbal associations between men and male are commonplace, for example through phrases such as "boys will be boys" or "man up" (see Cornwall and Lindisfarne, 2003). Through such metaphorical language use, men become naturalised and given authority through associations with biology and links to the body. Given the reality that most people identifying as males are also men the two categories are often used interchangeably. Whilst the sex-gender distinction is important in studies of masculinities, Kaufman argues that "even those feminists who accept the sex-gender distinction often use the term gender when what is meant is sex" (1994; 161). These theoretical problems can be related to traditional dichotomies of male/female and men/women, which construct sex and gender as opposing binaries. However, such a constructionist positioning fails to note the ways in which masculinities and femininities intersect and correspond (Cornwall and Lindisfarne, 1994). Whilst Foucault is in many ways himself a constructionist, he argues that the body is not a biological given, rather bodies are rendered social through material processes which inscribe power onto them. As Stoller (1976; 293) suggests "anatomy is not really destiny: destiny comes from what people make of anatomy". Thus, sex cannot be equated to gender and whilst in some ways a conditional relationship between gendered identities and sexed bodies exists, this is not a fixed relationship. In fact, in her study of gender politics and the construction of sexualities, Fausto Sterling (2000) suggests that there are at least five biological sexes (Hermaphrodites,

Male Pseudohermaphrodites, Female Pseudohermaphrodites, Females and Males), which cannot be mapped evenly onto multiple gendered constructions (for example man, woman, third gender, Hearn, 1996).

Masculinity is a key concept in the recent work on men and gender and its pervasive use within the scholarship reveals its significant explanatory power. However, the concept of masculinity eludes an easy definition. As Berger et al. (1995; 2) note, masculinity is "a vexed term, variously inflected, multiply defined, not limited to straightforward descriptions of maleness". In essence, masculinity is used as a descriptor for a wide range of social phenomena. Gutmann (2003; 3) explains there are four ways in which masculinity has been defined and used by social scientists:

The first concept of masculinity argues that it is anything that men say, think and do. If men are involved, then so too must be masculinity. The second concept holds that masculinity is what men think, say and do to distinguish themselves as men. Accordingly, men may achieve (or strive to achieve) masculinity some times more than others. Third, masculinity is seen by some as a quality that certain men have more of than other men, either because they were born that way or because of some personal kind of achievement. Finally, other scholars of men and masculinities have sought to emphasize the overriding significance of women to the negotiation of masculinities for most, if not all men, at most, if not all times in their lives.

Many academics constantly switch between these definitions, making masculinity an abstract and fragile concept. Hearn has expressed deep concerns about the way in which masculinity has begun to be used "as a shorthand for a very wide range of social phenomena, and in particular those that are connected with men and males, but which appear to be located in the individual" (1996, 203). He argues that the cultural constructionist uses of masculinity posit that all men are subject to the control of gender. Thus, he argues that masculinity can put social limits on men. Hearn posits that the term masculinity has become an "explanatory cliché" as it "holds sway over men, just as sex roles did in earlier formations" (Hearn, 1996; 207). As Kaufman (1994; 144) argues, one of the key problems within studies on masculinities is that

Discourses on gender have had a hard time shaking off the handy, but limited notion of sex roles. Certainly, roles, expectations and ideas about proper behaviour do exist. But the central thing about gender is not the prescription of certain roles and the proscription

of others – after all, the range of possible roles is wide and changing and, what is more, are rarely adopted in a nonconflictual way. Rather, the key thing about gender is that it is a description of actual social relations of power between males and females and the internalisation of these relations of power.

Hearn's (1996) solution to this problem is to replace the category of masculinities with men. However, masculinity and masculinities remain useful categories, as long as one acknowledges that there is no "natural or necessary" (Gutmann, 2003; 37) connection between men and masculinity. If masculinity is understood to be a set of attitudes, behaviours and traits then women are as likely to be affected by masculinity as men, thus masculinity can go together with a female body (Connell, 1985; Clatterbaugh; Cornwall and Lindisfarne, 2003). As such, masculinity exists in a plurality of forms, as Carrigan, Connell and Lee (1985) highlight, there is no one "male sex role".

The concept of "hegemonic masculinity" has been used to emphasise the idea that many deviations of masculinity exist between and within societies, thus challenging the idea that gender is "a fixed set of social norms that are passively internalised and enacted" (Demetriou, 2001; 340). It is proposed that gender is made through peer structures within neighbourhoods, schools and home spaces and is dictated by "dating patterns, homophobic speech and harassment" (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005). Connell's concept of hegemonic masculinity purports that the emphasis on gender should be placed "on what people actually do, not on what is expected or imagined" (1996, 39). Connell, borrowing the term from Gramsci's analysis of class relations, removes certain constructions from the "deviant" category and reframes them as distinct forms of masculinity, thus acknowledging the plurality of gender and the power relations involved in this. However, Connell goes on to argue that despite the plurality of gender, within specific social formations, certain typified ways of being male prevail. She suggests that a 'hegemonic masculinity' has been formed from within the ruling elite that is distinguishable and placed above all other masculinities. Hegemonic masculinity refers to a set of cultural dynamics that allow particular groups of men to inhabit positions of power and wealth, through particular displays of behaviour such as ambition, strength and selfreliance. Hegemonic masculinity is not only about the domination of women but also about domination over other groups of men - for example homosexual men - and the suggestion that this will contribute to social advancement. However, it is important to highlight that Connell does not assume that Hegemonic Masculinity is the norm, rather it is a cultural ideal that only

a minority of men enact. However, Connell argues that there is always a degree of overlap between hegemonic and 'complicit masculinities'. Thus, "a large number of men who do not act in the way prescribed by the hegemonic model but still (passively) sustain it and thus realise the patriarchal dividend, are said to "have" a form of masculinity that Connell calls 'complicit'" (Demetriou, 2001, 342). As such Connell emphasises that masculinities are multiple; "masculinity represents not a certain type of man, but, rather, a way that men position themselves through discursive practices" (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005; 841). However, the concept of hegemonic masculinity is limited by its fixed characteristics, which exclude the complexity of different and competing forms of masculinity. Moller (2007) argues that even though Connell attempts to map plural relationships of masculinity and power her "exhaustive conceptual system tends to reduce the complexity and nuances of what men actually do" (Kins and Noble, 2009; 813).

Whilst the concept of hegemonic masculinity has been useful, in order to acknowledge the open-endedness and fluidity of masculinity through sociohistorical spaces, this thesis refers to the term "masculinities" where grammatically applicable in order to describe the socially constructed processes of masculinity. The idea of plural masculinities is now well-established within social science disciplines, with many academics now writing about multiple masculinities, for example within workplaces (Collinson and Hearn, 1996), as fathers (Engle, 1997) and within schools (Imms, 2000; Pascoe, 2003). The concept of multiple masculinities is also widely accepted within geography (Jackson, 1991; Berg and Longhurst, 2003; Longhurst, 2000). By utilising masculinities as a loose and flexible concept, an understanding of masculinities as a gendered form which is given different expressions in different cultures is promoted:

"Thus, this formulation suggests two levels or aspects of culture; first a generalized form of culture that is transcultural and second a specific form of culture that is distinct within and between cultures. To put this slightly differently there are many masculinities that are expressions of masculinity, singular. Thus, in this view, masculinity is both a generalizable, cultural phenomenon and a variety of culturally specific expressions of gender and possible gender identities. In other words, the generalizable cultural form of masculinity may be assumed to pre-exist the culturally specific" (Hearn, 1996; 205).

Strathern (1988) argues that this gender difference is constructed through considering various local discourses of agency and causation. Strathern suggests that just as masculinity is not necessarily about men "it is not necessarily just about relations between the sexes either" (1988, 65). Rather, masculinities are part of a larger system for producing difference and thus must be interrogated at the intersection with other social divisions. Thus, this thesis does not give all arbitrary explanatory power to masculinities, rather the multiplicity of masculinities deems that an intersectional approach is necessary in order to understand the ways in which masculinities are formed. As Cornwall and Lindisfare (2003) succinctly explain:

"Men and masculinities are not formed by gender alone. Men are not simply men or simply about gender and the same applies to masculinities. Men and masculinities are shaped by differences of age, by class situation, by ethnicity and racialization and so on. The gendering of men only exists in the intersections with other social divisions and social differences. Indeed, paradoxically, it might be argued that as studies of men and masculinities continue to deconstruct the gendering of men and masculinities and assumptions about them, other social divisions, such as age, class and disability, come more to the fore and are seen as more important. In this sense, part of the long term trajectory of gendered studies of men could, paradoxically be the deconstruction of gender" (3).

Lorber argues that gender is a major social status that "is cross cut by other major social statuses (racial ethnic, social class, religion, sexual orientation etc.) and so gender is actually not a binary status, even though it is treated as such legally, socially and in most social science research" (Lorber, 2000; 82). As such, Lorber (2000) argues that gender equality is not a high enough aspiration and that we should use gender to undo gender. Lorber argues that on the level of discourse research questions need to be framed in ways that reject the dichotomies of men/women and male/female. She argues that by engaging with other differences the continuous loop back to the social construction of gender will be broken. She suggests that

"At the very least, we can start with the work already done by multicultural feminists on the intersections of gender, social class and racial ethnic categories, by researchers of multiple masculinities, and by the ongoing studies of sexualities and transgenders" (Lorber, 2000; 88).

#### Intersectionality

Historically, gender and race constituted separate fields of inquiry, however by studying each field in isolation, studies marginalised major parts of the communities they claimed to represent. Intersectionality is a theory that arose from feminist critiques, which suggested that western feminists had promoted women and gender as "unitary and homogenous categories, reflecting the common essence of all women" (Valentine, 2007; 11). Thus, black feminists (e.g. bell hooks, 1982), postcolonial critics (Spivak, 1988; Talpade Mohnaty, 1991) and gay and queer scholarship (Craig, 1999; Fuss, 1990; Herdt, 1992; Kimmel, 1998; Sedgwick, 1990; Simpson, 1994 and Week, 1986) challenged feminist theory to ensure that differences between women - for example, those who were not white and middle class - were brought into the discussion, deconstructing the presumptions associated with "the whiteness of women, the maleness of people of colour, and the heterosexuality of everyone" (Risman, 2004; 442). Intersectionality became part of a movement to include the voices of the dispossessed, for example:

"In the political struggle for women's right to control their own bodies, freely available contraception and abortion was a key demand, whereas many women of colour argued that for them, often sterilized against their will, the right to be fertile and to give birth was more important. Similarly, lesbians pointed to the implicit heterosexuality of a great deal of feminist writing and scholarship and demanded that questions about "alternative" sexualities were put on the agenda" (McDowell, 2013; 3).

Discussing race and gender in unison gave rise to an "additive model" (Glenn,1999; 3) in which women of colour were described as suffering from "double" the discrimination. However, women of colour expressed dissatisfaction with this model, claiming that it did not correspond to experiences of African American, Latina, Asian American and native American women: "These women did not experience race and gender as separate or additive, but as simultaneous and linked" (Glenn, 1999; 3). Therefore, intersectionality developed as a concept to express this simultaneity (Crenshaw, 1989, 1992; Harris, 1990; Collins, 1990; Glenn, 1992) and refers to the interconnected structure of social categories such as "race", gender and class, which create interdependent systems of both disadvantage and opportunity.

Intersectionality is a useful concept when discussing the formation of masculine identities since there are a range of vectors that determine masculinity in different places and times (Hearn, 2009; Hurtado and Sinha, 2008; Ozgane and Coleman 1998). By acknowledging the multiplicities of masculinities and through mapping the plurality of relations of masculinity and power, the complexity and nuances of men's masculinities can be expressed, thus breaking down sex-gender binaries. Intersectionality as a method does not prioritise gender above other identities, and thus unpacks the hidden processes through which different masculinities are created through different social divisions (class, "race", ethnicity, age, ability.) Furthermore, as Bilge (2009: 17) points out:

"intersectionality shows that not all masculinities are invisible, being associated to majority; some masculinities are highly visible and pathologised/stigmatized: black youth masculinities in "inner cities", Muslim migrant masculinities etc. intersectionality can inform not only about processes of stigmatizing and pathologising of certain masculinities but also processes making invisible those masculinities associated to dominant groups".

In the United States and Britain, feminist theorising proposed that in order to adequately deal with the issues they were trying to understand feminists could not only be concerned with gender but also class and "race"/ethnicity. Thus, third world theorists (Mohanty, 1999) and feminists of colour (Collins, 1999) began to identify gender, class and race as social constructions that were intrinsic to each other, each expressing hierarchical organisation and inequalities of power. Class, "race" and gender "became the triple oppressions that must be theorised" (Acker, 1999; 45). As such, class must be seen as formed through gender and race across time and space, just as gender and race are formed through class.

"For example, a woman who is black, (white), Spanish (English) speaking and a doctor (waitress) does not experience herself in disjointed segments of gender, race, ethnicity and class, rather all these elements are produced and reproduced within the same everyday experiencing of her life" (Acker, 1999; 50).

These interrelationships have been discussed widely within the literature by economists (Amott and Matthaei, 1996) and African American, Asian American and Chicana sociologists (Baca Zinn and Dill, 1994: Dill, 1988; Collins, 1990; Glenn, 1986; Chow, 1994 and Romero, 1992). Morgan (2004) argues that men and masculinities are heavily implicated in class analysis. He argues that it was not a simple accident that led to men being presented as the key class actors,

rather he suggests that there is something particularly masculine about the idea of class. He suggests that "put simply, class is gendered, and men have assumed, or have been allocated, the role of class agents" (Morgan, 2004;168). When using Weberian models of class, one can find distinct connections between property, class and masculinities, with property ownership and inheritance typically passing through the male line in western societies. Furthermore, occupational titles and boundaries became indicators of social class and also of masculinities. Drawing together these points, the idea of the "bread winner" and "the family wage" emerged in the early 19<sup>th</sup> century, in which the man was the head of the household and provided for his wife and children:

"In practice, the reality was much more complicated, but the idea of the man as "provider" remains remarkably persistent in a wide range of modern cultures, right up to the present day. It can be argued in fact, that the idea of the provider is a major element in the construction of masculine identity; it is a moral as well as an economic category. Hence the devastating personal effects of unemployment that have been documented by many researchers over many years" (Morgan, 2004; 168).

Class did give rise to different masculine identities, for example, working class masculinities were portrayed as physical and embodied, whilst middle class masculinities were individual, rational and comparatively disembodied. However, each masculinity found commonality within the public sphere and the moral responsibility of providing for ones' family. More recently, the analysis of class within formations of gender has regained priority as questions emerge on "how far was this apparent erosion – or at least transformation – of class analysis linked to shifts in the gender order and the possible erosion of patriarchal structures?" (Morgan, 2004; 166).

Class and gendered identities are also mutually constituted with "racial" and ethnic identities. "Race", gender and class are not predetermined but are the result of specific moments and particular circumstances. An understanding of class and gender requires an examination of how dominant groups impose particular racial meanings and also how subordinate groups contest these meanings and construct alternative meanings. Studies of the categories of "race", class and gender have burgeoned (Mesner, 1992; Staples, 1982). For example, work by feminist historians has shown how white men's suffrage was gendered as well as racialized, with their independence being premised on the subordination of women and people of colour (Rose,

1986; Seccombe, 1986). Discussions have also emerged on the restriction of women and women of colour more specifically to certain positions within the labour force. For example,

"Women of colour are disproportionately assigned to the dirty work as nurses' aides in hospitals, kitchen workers in restaurants and cafeterias, maids in hotels, and cleaners in office buildings. In these same institutional settings, white women are disproportionately employed as supervisors, professionals and administrative support staff" (Glenn, 1999; 19).

Prior research on Mapuche identity has tended to focus on ethnicity as the key constitutor of Mapuche identity (e.g. Oteiza and Merino, 2012; Ortiz, 2009; Briones, 2007; Richards, 2010), without considering how these identities are also refracted through understandings of gender and class. An intersectional approach that focuses on ethnicity, gender and class would contribute to the study of heterogeneity by examining differences in masculinities within the Mapuche community. As Glenn (1999: 31) argues:

"For example, rather than assuming a monolithic "Asian" gender system that can be contrasted with an "America' or white gender system, researchers need to do more work to document gender in specific social and historical contexts. Class, ethnicity, generation, and other axes of difference interact to shape heterogeneous genders".

However, studies that claim to use an intersectional approach often fall short of this aim. Academics are often guilty of listing intersectional vectors, such as gender, class and ethnicity, and ending the list with "etc." (e.g. Blige, 2009; Glenn, 1999; Acker, 1999) without really considering what those other vectors might be. In response, geographers have argued that in order to understand the shifting structure of masculinities, academics must engage in empirical studies of situated men in actual places (e.g. Nayak, 2006). Similarly, Hopkins and Noble (2009; 813) argue that masculinity, "rather than being a simple and straightforward set of meanings, is constituted by an amalgam of practices, values and meanings and realised in particular places and contexts". As such, it is necessary to consider place as an influencing factor when discussing intersectional identities and particular masculinities, and yet very few scholars have acknowledged place within their intersectional frameworks, beyond an "etc.". Hopkins and Noble (2009; 814) are among the few authors who suggest that "it is the peculiar domain of geography to explore not simply how masculinities are played out in different

spaces, but how those spaces shape the very nature of the experience of masculinity and how it articulates with other key dimensions of social relations".

Feminist geographers have been a key influence on these more nuanced understandings of masculinity. Massey (2001), for example, argues that geography matters to gender in a variety of ways, whilst McDowell (2013) posits that feminist geographers should not be concerned solely with gender, rather they discuss all differences along an axis of power, with no difference gaining exclusivity or dominance over the other. McDowell (*ibid: 10*) thus encourages feminist geographers (see Mackenzie and Rose, 1983; McDowell, 1992a, 1992b; Massey 1994; Rose, 1993 and the Women and Geography Study Group, 1984; 1997) to engage with "an ambitious task, tearing down and re-erecting the structures of our discipline, the very ways in which we theorise and make connections between people and places". Thus, one of the key aims of feminist geography should be to investigate and challenge the relationships and apparent naturalness between gender and spatial divisions. There is a clear geography to gendered identities because"

"there are enormous variations between and within nations in the extent of women's subordination and relative autonomy, and correspondingly in male power and domination, there is as well an evident multiplicity in the social construction of gender, in gender divisions and in the symbolic meanings associated with femininity and masculinity" (McDowell, 2013; 10).

However, gender relations are also intertwined with geography because of the way in which spatial divisions themselves play a constructive role in gender divisions. The idea that women and men have particular places within society is the basis for the organisation of western society and spaces within this society, "from the shopping mall to political institutions" (McDowell, 2013; 10). For example, Massey (2001; 179) has demonstrated how in the West spatial distinctions between public and private have been constructed with relation to gender. She argues that "the attempt to confine women to the domestic sphere was both a specifically spatial control and through that a social control on identity". Thus, in western understandings of place and gender identities of the woman and the home space became intimately tied up with one another. In opposition to this, Massey concludes that over time women in the city space became "less and less easy to contain in heterosexuality and in the domestic sphere. Metropolitan life itself seemed to throw up such a threat to patriarchal control" (2001; 179).

Gender distinctions do not only vary on a global scale but also are significant on the local scale. Whilst it has been assumed that the increasing scale of global interconnectedness has dampened the significance of the local, McDowell (2013; 2) argues that "for many people in the world, everyday life continues to take place within a restricted locale". Anthropologist Judith Oakley has argued that "different groups inhabiting the same spaces can create and shift boundaries by subtle means" (Oakely, 1996; 3) and means that are less subtle, such as force and legal exclusion. Thus, the relationship between place and gender cannot simply be understood as the product of the nature of capital accumulation and the associated "global sense of place and flexible sexism" (Massey, 2001; 182). Gender is not simply constructed within abstract spaces of modernity, rather as Lefebvre analyses "the geometric, the optical and the phallic" content of space is "differently formulated from one society to another" (quoted in Massey, 2001; 183). Thus, the hegemonic spaces and places that we inhabit today are not simply products of economic organization but "reflect back at us also – and in the process reinforce – other characteristics of social relations, among them, those of gender" (Massey, 2001; 183).

Work within the discipline has focused on regional identities and the cultural historical processes associated with specific regions (Brace, 1999; Crang, 1999; Oakes, 2000; Yorgason 2000; Alvarez, 2002), within urban and rural contexts (Haartsen et al, 2000; Van Houtum 2001; Van Langevelde and Pallenbarg, 2002), regionalism (Casey, 2002) and spatial divisions of labour (Aleen et al, 1998). However, discussions on the ways in which identities and differences are actualized by and on place are lacking (Paasi, 2003). It is posited here that place is a key identity vector that constructs and is constructed by masculinities and other identity constructions and thus should be included in theories of intersectionality. However, place is a particularly important construct when considering Latin American masculinities due to their, at once, regional and local variations. Radcliffe and Westwood (1996) describe how within Latin America the:

"social and spatial boundaries between the local and the national are dynamic, contested and multi-faceted, also due to the mediated relations between official and popular identities, the boundaries drawn by popular citizens are not infinitely malleable, varying with "race" gender and class positioning" (108).

The need to study place within identity formation is particularly important within Latin America as places are contradictory sites in identity creation. Within Latin America, identities are formed within a complex relationship between local places and the nation, identity is not simply a reproduction of place in which those identities are located, rather in Latin America identity is articulated, expressed and remade through relationships to the local and the global. Within Latin America the complex relationships between indigenous and Hispanic legacies "is an enduring question in discourses about identity, making the name and the nature of the region highly contested and political" (Radcliffe and Westwood, 1996; 12), that has endured since the independence leader Simon Bolivar made this highly contested statement about Latin American place identities:

We are not Europeans, we are not Indians, but a middle group between the indigenous and Spanish. Americans by birth and European by right (Simon Bolivar, independence leader in the early nineteenth century quoted in Radcliffe and Westwood, 1996).

This complex relationship to place has an effect on the formation of multiple masculinities within Latin America.

#### Masculinities in Latin America

Prior research on masculinities in Latin America tended to reduce masculinity to a singular mestizo macho male, which implies that there are no distinctions between men regionally or locally and ignores women as active participants in the creation of masculinities. The impact of such gender stereotypes has meant that within the literature other men and masculinities, such as black, indigenous and men who have sex with other men, have largely been misrepresented or completely ignored. However, since the 1980s, studies on men as engendered beings in Latin America have been growing in number and scope. The growing interest in men and masculinities reflects Latin American shifts in gender relations as economic, social and cultural changes, particularly the inclusion of women in the labour market, have an impact "on daily life, sexual roles and traditional dynamics in the family" (Viveros Vigoya, 2001; 238). Such research provided an opportunity to discuss gender relations, identities and inequalities within a part of the world in which little is known about men as men (Gutmann and Viveros Vigoya, 2004) and where various social classes, ethnicities and sociocultural contexts exist.

The terms macho and machismo have come to represent a uniform masculinity across Latin America. They express a desire to define a "ubiquitous, virulent and "typically Latin" machismo among men from these areas" (Gutmann, 2003). Machismo has largely come to represent the cult of male virility and its associated sexism. However, as Melhuss and Stollen (1996,14) argue, machismo had received little critical analysis as "macho is such an ordinary concept, used by every – or any – man and woman to characterise a true man, and in part by a more general assumption that everyone knows what a macho is, so there is little need for an explanation". Gutmann (1996) argues that in studies on Mexican men "widely accepted generalizations about male gender identities often seemed egregious stereotypes about machismo, the supposed culture trait of Mexican men that is at once so famous and yet so thoroughly unknown" (12). In short, machismo became a flagship word for studies on masculinities in Latin America and yet the term received little critique.

In response, since the 1980s research by social scientists has been challenging stereotypical conceptions of Latin American men and revealing the diversities of masculine identities that exist within the region. The idea of promoting research that embraces multiple Latin American identities is expressed by Viveros Vigoya (2001; 243) who argues that:

"One must avoid asserting the existence of a black, gaucho, or working class masculinity in Latin America. It is important to recognize multiple masculinities, but one must also understand the relationships that exist between them and note that gender identities and class or ethnic racial identities are acquired simultaneously and generate social practices marked by these multiple identities".

One of the most promising areas of research that has been developed on Latin American masculinities raises questions on family divisions of labour, parenting and housework (Bastos, 1998; Acevedo, 1999; Nolasco, 1998; Henao, 1997; Gutmann, 1996; Cardoso, 1998). This work explores the contradictions of contemporary fatherhood, discussing the changing interfamilial relations affected by socioeconomic changes and the growing importance of fatherhood as a masculine identity. Authors have discussed the variation in fatherhood roles based on socioeconomic and ethnic positions, generation and personal experiences. Other research has discussed homosocial relations within Latin America (Gastaldo, 1995; Guzmann and Portocarrero, 1992; Viveros, 2002). These studies discuss the importance that men attribute to homosocial relations, exploring the competitiveness between young men and also the

transition of spaces such as cafes, bars and factories from masculine spaces into gender neutral spaces, increasing the public encounters between the sexes, thus challenging ideas of hegemonic masculinity. Men's role in reproduction and reproductive sexualities have also come under the spotlight in recent studies (Lerner, 1998; Tolbert, Morris and Romero, 1994; Figueroa, 1998; Salcedo, 1995; Viveros and Gomez, 1998; Caceres and Serrano, 1994; Parker, 1999). These works have challenged definitions of active and passive roles, exploring men's actual sexual behaviour and the sociocultural conditions in which this arises. They reveal that the relationship between sexuality and gender within Latin America is extremely complex and that men challenge local gender binaries. This research has suggested that local and global gender and sexuality classifications, such as homosexuality and heterosexuality do not reflect the diversity of the lived experiences of Latin American men. It has also challenged stereotypes associated with machismo in Latin America (Barbieri, 1990; Parker, 1991; Lancaster, 1998; Limon, 1994, Bruso, 1995; Carrier, 1995; Gutmann, 1996; Mirande, 1997; Fuller 1998 and Ramirrez, 1993).

Whilst no singular Latin American masculinity exists, and it is essentialising to generalize beyond narrowly defined populations, it is still appropriate to discuss masculinities within the region of Latin America. Gutmann (2003; 16) argues that

"despite differences in class, ethnic group, region and generation, it was not just in the popular imagination that Latin America was seen as constituting in some palpable sense a coherent area of historical and cultural commonalities with respect to certain aspects of gender and sexuality. Despite the real and unanimous acknowledgement of the profound impact of globalization on sexualities, throughout Latin America, there was simultaneously the deep seated sense that these global influences were still filtered through a particular local, Latin American context. For this reason, in order to understand men and masculinities in the region, we were compelled to seek more simply the Latin versions of global trends and transformations".

A few studies have extended these discussions to look specifically at Chilean masculinities, the two key theorists on this subject being Martensson (2012) and Olavarria (2003). In her discussion of "Sweet Women and Tough Men" (2012), Martensson discusses hegemonic Chilean masculinities. According to her research, Chilean society dictates that a good man is obliged to be "responsible, committed, intelligent, reliable, pleasant, and generous. He should

have a high level of education and be a good employee. Having a well-paid job is important. A sought after profession (e.g. architect, engineer, or doctor) is even better" (Martensson, 2012; 28). However, Olavarria (2003) explains that economic adjustment policies and the values of modernity have generated profound changes in Chilean masculinities. Olavarria explains these changes in terms of fatherhood arguing that whilst some men aim to hold onto learned values of fatherhood, this has become difficult to maintain. Olavarria describes new fatherhood practices that promote greater levels of intimacy with partners and children. In a more generalized study Valdes and Olavarria (1998) propose that within Santiago, it is impossible to talk of one solitary, unitary masculinity. Rather they have suggested that masculinities within Chile are multifaceted, despite Chile's relative cultural homogeneity. Through the discussion of life histories from men within the upper middle and lower classes in three distinct age brackets the authors affirm that "the hegemonic model of masculinity is fairly generalised among men in Santiago, regardless of their social situation. This model is reproduced from one generation to another through various spheres of socialisation, and it is reinforced daily in different spaces of homosociality" (Viveros Vigoya, 2001, 241). However, they conclude that faith in hegemonic masculinity is dominant in the lives of older men and those in the working class sectors, whilst those from the middle classes and the younger men are more critical of the hegemonic model and are distancing themselves from it.

Whilst studies on Chilean masculinities are increasing in number these studies do not represent the true plurality of masculinities, as indigenous masculinities are neglected as an area of study within the discipline. Within studies of Chilean masculinities, indigenous masculinities are overlooked for more nationalized mestizo masculinities (see Bacigalupo 2004a, 2004b as an exception). In particular, the influence of place and class in creating diverse Mapuche masculinities has tended to be overlooked. This research expands the field of indigenous masculinities by exploring various expressions of Mapuche masculinities between place, class and ethnic boundaries. In order to achieve this, first it is necessary to understand the historical context from which the social structures of indigenous masculinities have arisen.

#### **Indigenous Masculinities**

Indigenous masculinities are disproportionately affected by colonial and post-colonial masculine imaginaries. The large scale relocation of bodies since the fifteenth century, associated with colonial empires, created the opportunity for the hybridisation of gender,

gender imagery, sexuality and other forms of gendered practice. Colonialism promoted a binary sex role theory that encouraged violence, domination and a calculative egocentrism. Masculinity was one of the key imageries associated with empire. Kanitkar (1994) identifies two discourses that promote the colonial masculinity. First, "of white men as chaste "imperial cadets" operating in a homosocial world" (Beynon, 2002; 33) and second, the representation of the indigenous male as a sexual threat with animalistic sexual desires.

Research has investigated how these colonial legacies are affecting indigenous societies. Whilst the process of de-colonisation did indeed disrupt the hegemonic masculinities put in place by the colonial order, these hierarchies have in no way disappeared. Postcolonial societies are still shaped by the legacy of imperial masculinity. Men continue to focus on strength and virility as key representations of masculinities, stemming from colonial depictions of idealised masculinity, with the heroes of the colonial landscape being "the explorer, the hunter and the soldier" (Driver, 1992). Hokowhitu (2004) examines the effect of such colonial masculinities on modern-day Maori masculinities. He argues that the colonial system required a "regime of truth" (Bhabha, 1994; 71) around minority groups, denying them self-determination and thus justifying colonial rule. The dominant representations of Maori men cast the Pakeha (white) man as normal, whilst the Maori man was cast as abnormal. Maori men were integrated into colonial hegemonic masculinities through sport. On the rugby pitch Maori men were shown to have skills in things Pakeha men were also proud of. However, it was because of their supposed savage nature that Maori men were, and still are, portrayed as skilled at rugby. Whilst the only masculine role models for Maori boys are sportsmen, the power relationship between "the intelligent/civilized colonizer and the inherently physical/savage colonized" (Hokowhitu, 2004; 274) continues to be reinvented. Mckegney (2014) distinguishes three postcolonial stereotypes that have been particularly harmful to indigenous men: the noble savage, the bloodthirsty warrior and the drunken absentee. However, whilst some studies (Hokowhitu, 2004; Tengan, 2008; Denetdale, 2006) have demonstrated how indigenous men seemingly unknowingly perpetuate stereotypes of themselves, in other contexts some young indigenous men are using their masculinities to offer resistance against hegemonic postcolonial masculinities shaping their societies.

One such study is that of Antone (2015), who describes how colonialism has continued to influence the path of indigenous men as they struggle to find their place. He explains how: "the first death among our people from the diseases, the invasion, and the murder of families by the

colonial armies, the distribution of alcohol to gain signatures on fake treaties, the loss of home and homelands, having to escape and find a safe place to live and rebuild a culture" (*Ibid.*; 6) all contributed to the pent up political and spiritual anger and frustration present in indigenous men today. However, he argues that the family circle can only become complete with the inclusion of the male spirit and as such indigenous men must heal within their communities and "rebuild a sense of manhood" (*ibid.*; 13) in order to decolonize and let go of the circle of violence.

Combining indigenous gender based theories has allowed for an active indigenous movement towards decolonization. Indigenous men are not passive in their marginalization and by destabilizing binary gender ideologies they are exploring new ways to promote indigenous empowerment. A union between native and queer studies (Sneider, 2015; Antone, 2015) has provided a platform for the reemergence of an interest in indigenous gender ideologies. By examining the physical embodiments, performances and applications of gender, Sneider (2015) has explored the differences between Euro-western and historical indigenous constructions of gender. Whilst, as discussed above, Euro-western ideologies enforce binaries between nature and culture and man and woman, indigenous ideologies were more complementary. Bell explains that:

"even though gender is central to the organization of indigenous nations as distinct social and cultural systems it is often not closely related to power or biology. There is, however, no universal or necessary correlation between male and female descent and gendered positions of power and authority. Nor are gender and sex defined necessarily as culturally equivalent categories" (quoted in Innes and Anderson, 2015; 25).

Thus, instead of strict gender binaries, indigenous societies in general were centred around what Anderson (2015; 7) describes as "recognition of being". Men and women were not separated by roles or public and private spaces, nor were women subjected to male dominance. Rather indigenous societies were based on obligation and responsibility to each other and the community as a whole, the division was more dependent on balance and reciprocity than segregation and hierarchy. Complementarity can be understood through Souza's simple definition in which "the contribution of both male and female are necessary to create the whole and thus, accorded both men and women important relationships and responsibilities in the household and the community" (quoted in Innes and Anderson, 2015; 26). Recent indigenous

feminist scholars have attempted to give voice to these ideologies and challenge the damage that the imposition of patriarchy has done to these societies (Bell, 2007; Smith, 2005). Whilst the focus of indigenous feminism has largely remained on indigenous women, "it relies upon stories and histories by and about indigenous men as complementary participants in the history of colonialism and patriarchy" (Sneider, 2015; 3). A decolonization of indigenous gender ideologies requires a complementary relationship between indigenous feminism and indigenous masculinities studies. By decolonizing indigenous ideologies on gender, indigenous scholars are rejecting the idea that indigenous masculinities have been subsumed into colonial concepts of masculinity.

Despite this, acknowledging shared indigenous gender ideologies does not equate to acknowledging one indigenous identity. Kobayashi and De Leew (2010) argue that creating hardened categories of identification leads to the essentialisation of indigenous peoples. Indigenous identities should be regarded as flexible, "they are a social construction, not a biological essence, but a result of discursive and thoroughly material – and human – social process (hereby) the material and the ideological are not separate, nor are they alternative, but rather two dimensions of human action, ontologically inseparable" (Kobayashi and Peake, 2000; 194). Thus, it is important to define indigeneity and indigeneities.

#### **Indigenous Identities**

It is important to define indigeneity for the purpose of this research, but also in order to create appropriate policies, laws and human rights for indigenous peoples. However, due to the plurality of indigenous peoples across the globe, a clear definition has been lacking within both policy and scholarship. Achieving a definition of indigenous identity that encompasses over 5000 indigenous groups and 350 million indigenous peoples throughout the world is a difficult task. The concept of indigeneity arose as a response to colonialism, as people began to define themselves in relation to what they were not. Some theorists (Wilmer, 1993; Ananya, 2004; Gurr, 1993; Boccara, 2003) have, as such, defined indigeneity based on exclusion by colonial powers. For example, Wilmer (1993) argues that indigenous peoples are those who were politically autonomous before their colonisation and who in the aftermath of this colonisation continue an attempt to preserve their tradition based culture, economic self-sufficiency and political independence. Anaya (2004) expands on this definition by arguing that indigenous communities are those who are still suffering from domination by a colonizer. She describes indigenous peoples as "the living descendants of pre-invasion inhabitants of lands now

dominated by others" (Anaya, 2004; 3). However, these definitions fail to incorporate the cultural and religious aspects of being indigenous.

Many definitions of indigeneity (Kobayashi and De Leew, 2010; Anaya, 2003) encompass the distinct ways of knowing and being held by indigenous peoples, focusing on traditions and continuity of place and culture. These ways of knowing and being can manifest themselves in unique "languages, cultural representations, spiritual practices and social structures" (Kobayashi and De Leew, 2010; 8) or indeed as an affinity with nature and ecology. Anaya explains "they are *indigenous* because their ancestral roots are imbedded in the lands in which they live, or would like to live, much more deeply than the roots of more powerful sectors of society... Furthermore, they are *peoples* to the extent they comprise distinct communities with a continuity of existence and identity that links them to communities, tribes or nations of their ancestral past" (in Corntassel, 2003; 78). However, according to Ranger (1983, 212), definitions based around tradition are colonial in nature. Ranger argues that Europeans held respect for "traditions", thus disposing them to favourably look upon what they believed to be indigenous tradition. Ranger argues that colonisers were guilty of inventing traditions within colonies in order to create connections between political, social and legal systems in order to better subjugate the colonised. Thus, through the codification and promulgation of these invented traditions flexible customs became hard prescriptions. This focus on invented traditions has been explored by Hanson (1989) who, through a case study of Maori indigeneity, argues that anthropologists have been important in the invention of cultures through ethnographic research, raising fundamental questions about the nature of indigenous cultural realities. Hansen argues that these "distortions" have been taken on by Maoris as authentic parts of their heritage and are passed on through storytelling, oratory and other Maori contexts. Thus, definitions based on traditions have been critiqued by instrumentalists (for example, Lindstorm, 1982) as promoting ethnonationalist movements that serve contemporary purposes, in an attempt "to read the present in terms of the past by writing the past in terms of the present" (Lindstorm, 1982; 317).

While traditions may be "invented" this does not mean they are inauthentic. "Rather, all traditions – western and indigenous – are invented, in that they are symbolically constructed in the present and reflect contemporary concerns and purposes rather than a passively inherited legacy" (Linnekin, 1991; 45). Thus, it follows on that the task by academics is not to reject

invented sections of a culture as inauthentic, but to understand that culture is a process, through which traditions acquire authenticity. As Hanson (1989; 898) has argued,

"Not one bit of behaviour can be said to have ultimate authenticity, to be the absolute and eternal "right way" of which all the others are representations. All of their bits of behaviours are models: models of previous bits and models for subsequent ones".

While the instrumentalist approach may have merits "it does not accurately depict indigenous nations who have existed for 10,000 years or more on their homelands" (Handler, 1984, 55). However, what can be gained from Hansen's assessment is the necessity of ethnographers to challenge our authority to define indigenous cultures. Richard Handel (1985) has called for a destructive analysis of "un-reflexive or romanticised dialogues in anthropology" and a reduction in the hegemonic control of western academics over this literature.

In general, the way in which academics have defined indigenous cultures has been flawed, with many traditional ethnographies being prone to cultural objectification (see Cohn, 1987 and Handler, 1984 for critiques on this). Many years ago, Whorf (1956; 134) observed the general problem associated with European grammars, that divide the world into nouns and verbs, each focusing on "things" that lead us to "objectify" reality. Objectification has led cultures to be viewed as a "thing" or a whole entity.

What had previously been embedded in a whole matrix of custom, ritual, religious symbol, a textually transmitted tradition, has now become something different. What had been unconscious now to some extent becomes conscious. Aspects of the tradition can be selected, polished and reformulated for conscious ends" (Cohn, 1987; 228).

However, objectification of cultures is selective, meaning some aspects of culture are promoted at the expense of others. Many ethnographers have mistakenly reified tradition and change as absolute qualities, themselves "segregated and pristine" (Handler, 1984; 55), when instead they are interpretive constructs. However, indigenous identities are prone to what Handler calls "sociocultural continuity" (1984, 55). "Sociocultures persist through time with constantly reaffirmed identities, while also undergoing continuous change" (Ibid 56). These changes may occur due to deliberate or unwilling adaptation, including due to ecological pressures, human error or forgetfulness and the uniqueness of each context and event. Thus, it becomes apparent

that traditional ethnographies into indigenous societies have been limited in their understandings of indigenous identities and in many cases the cultural phenomena described are inextricably connected to the understandings that cultural actors have of them. In order to get a more practical and accurate definition of indigeneity it is necessary to move towards self-definition.

In the 21<sup>st</sup> century there has been a popular resurgence in indigenous rights movements and there is now a general rejection of the idea that indigenous communities are precariously balanced on the border of extinction. Despite this, contemporary colonialists have moved from an attempt at eradicating bodies to an eradication of their existence as peoples, with many state definitions (particularly in former settler colonies) of "indigeneity" considered an assault on indigenous peoples. A process of regeneration and a focus of decolonisation by indigenous communities, demands "thinking, speaking and acting" with the conscious intent of regenerating one's indigeneity (Alfred and Corntassel, 2005; 614). As such, indigenous scholars (Alfred, 2005; Anaya, 2003, Corntassel; 2003; Alfred and Corntassel, 2005) advocate inclusive definitions that rely on a broad framework to emphasize the variation across time and place between groups. For example:

- 1. They are descended from the original inhabitants of the geographic areas they continue to occupy, hence, they are aboriginal;
- 2. They wish to live in conformity with their continuous evolving cultural traditions;
- 3. They do not control their political destiny and consequently, are frequently subjected to policies arising from the cultural hegemony originally imposed by an outside force (Corntassel, 2003; 78).

This is the definition through which this thesis discusses indigenous masculinities, whilst acknowledging that defining a Mapuche indigenous identity is more difficult. A direct translation of Mapuche is "the people of the land" (Mapu = land, Che = people). However, such a place based definition is difficult to promote since the Mapuche have been reduced to 6% of their original land. Whilst the state definition of Mapuche as poor peasants lacking land is based upon dictatorship ideologies, the Mapuche people are beginning to redefine themselves as a people whose territorial sovereignty and social organization has been supplanted by the Chilean administration.

The pluralities of Mapuche identity mean forming a concrete definition is impossible. However, in a colonial and postcolonial framework the Mapudzungun language frames Mapuche people in opposition to what they are not: Chilean. From the colonial period the Mapuche have been subjected to invasion by others, including the Spanish, the republic of Chile, Pinochet's military government, transnational corporations and the contemporary Chilean state. Thus, a collective Mapuche identity could be constructed in opposition to a non-Mapuche other. "In mapuzungun the concept of winka, meaning non man or non Mapuche, was a vital categorisation of difference of the early ethnic groups residing in this territory who referred to themselves as reche, meaning "true man" (Webb, 2013; 2060). Therefore, Jenkins suggested "what it means to be Mapuche is in part a consequence of what the Spanish or the Chileans have *made* it to mean" (1997; 72). Defining the Mapuche in opposition to the Chilean state involves defining them in opposition to "western civilisation" or what Royal (1998) has defined as a cultural base that is linked to Eurocentrism. For many the west represents principles of justice, fairness and liberty, however, from an indigenous framework the west has been widely associated with racism, slavery, imperialism, sexism and environmental destruction (Royal, 1998).

What is necessary in the study of indigenous identity and particularly within the Chilean case, is a more developed understanding of the heterogeneous realities of identity formation. The Mapuche people have begun to accept this diversity within the ethnic group; however, this is missing from academic portrayals. Dichotomies of tradition and change must be rejected and in its place an acceptance of individual diversity must grow. Individual choice holds a key position in self-definition. Mihesuah (1999) describes how individuals move through different identity positions of indigeneity:

"not all individuals claiming to be Indian "look Indian" nor were many born into tribal environments... while others who have lived most of their lives as non-Indians decide to "become Indians" at a later age. Some individuals are Indian by virtue of biological connection but know little about their cultural mores either because of lack of interest; because there was no one to teach them; or because it was not socially or economically profitable to pursue an Indian identity due to the time period, location and degree of racism, prejudice and stereotypes" (Mihesuah, 1999; 13).

Crow (2013) has shown how the Mapuche have recognised their own diversity. For example, Jaime Huenun published the bilingual anthology "20 contemporary Mapuche poets", which he described as "collective book that made visible both the diversity of the individual poetic ventures and the correlation between a group of writers who have undertaken an intensive investigation of their peoples' linguistic, historical and ritual core." Furthermore, Crow (2013) describes the Mapuche museum of Canete, which has made a push to represent multiple voices conceived within living spaces. The museum reinforces the fact that reconstruction and reinterpretation of the past is a flexible process. Crow argues that the museum "not only offers an alternative historical truth, but it also connects the past to the present and encourages a continued dialogue between the two" (2013, 210). Whilst Crow's discussion of the various voices contained within a Mapuche identity is commendable, further discussion of how these various voices arise is required.

#### Multiple Mapuche Masculinities

Studies that focus on multiple Mapuche masculinities are few within the literature (Bacigalupo, 2004), but Mapuche masculinities have been discussed within wider contexts. Mapuche gender ideologies and masculinities in particular were discussed widely within original colonial accounts and ethnographies (Lenz y de Auguasta, 1903; Guevara, 1904; 1908, 1911; Latcham, 1913). Within such accounts it is suggested that traditional Mapuche constructions of gender contrasted greatly with hegemonic constructions of Latin American masculinity, so much so that the colonialist Francisco Nunez de Pieda y Bascuan (1673) perceived the Mapuche constructions of gender to be against Thomas Aquinas' natural, God given law. This, however, has been challenged by Ana Mariella Bacigalupo (2004), who argues that within traditional Mapuche society gender norms were not so dissimilar to those of the Spanish, in that political power was masculine and traced through the male line, "it was associated with warring, hunting, cattle herding" (Bacigalupo, 2004; 496). In contrast, spiritual power, associated with healing and horticulture, although also traced through the male line, was considered to be feminine. However, Bacigalupo, in her vast anthropology of work on Mapuche gender, also explores the ways in which traditional Mapuche gender ideologies diverged from Spanish understandings. Bacigalupo discusses the way in which Mapuche shamans (Machi Weye) unbalanced this gender power system by combining both feminine spiritual power and masculine political power through their co-gendered construction. Machi Weye were not male gender inverts, as the colonisers believed, but "cogendered male practitioners ... who oscillated between embodying femininity and masculinity in varying degrees" (Bacigalupo, 2004; 490). Thus, Bacigalupo argues that the Mapuche held a specific understanding of gender and sexuality as performed, not as something that flowed naturally from anatomy. The Mapuche-Spanish dictionary of 1606 points to several terms that suggest cogendered identities: "The terms cheelen (to be made a man), cacudueltun (to disguise oneself by using a dress) and jureyen (to use as a woman) all point to the fact that gender was made, performed and enacted rather than determined by sex or sexual identity" (Bacigalupo, 2004; 513). However, Bacigalupo argues that these traditional gender ideologies have been infiltrated by Spanish, Catholic constructions of gender, she argues that the Mapuche shift between "traditional Mapuche notions of gender during rituals but assume the gender identities of the dominant culture in their everyday lives" (2004, 440).

Studies by Crow (2014) and Hale and Millaman (2006) have explored how representations of Mapuche masculinities in the 21<sup>st</sup> century are influenced by the Chilean state. Crow (2014) explores the warrior trope that the Chilean state has associated with Mapuche men. She argues that since the early independence period the Aruacanian warrior has been heralded as an exemplar of manhood, associated with displays of "strength, virility and culture" (Crow, 2014; 75). Such representations can be seen in colonial descriptions of Mapuche warriors, for example in Marin's (1827) proclamation: "who are the demi gods of old, next to our Araucanians? Hercules of the Greeks in all points of comparison is nobly inferior to Caupolican of the Chileans". However, Crow argues that these representations of Mapuche as warriors continue in the present day, with depictions of the Mapuche warriors, Caupolican and Lautaro being present within the "country's urban landscape: streets, squares, and parks are named after them; mural paintings (on the Santiago underground, for example) depict their epic struggles; monuments and statues have been erected in their honour" (Crow, 2014; 75). This warrior trope has been used by the state to promote a deracialised Chilean society, a blending of the Spanish and Indigenous qualities of manhood.

A long history of indigenous repression has been explored within Chile (Carter, 2010; Richards, 2010; Haughney, 2012). The literature exposes attempts by the Chilean government to de-racialise their nation through the integration of all cultural groups into mainstream Chilean society. According to folk lore the "Chilean 'race' was born from the (violent) encounter between Spaniards and indigenous groups, from which arose a more or less ethnically homogenous mestizo nation" (Carter, 2010; 59-62). According to this construction

the Mapuche are part of the Chilean race and yet they have been "excluded symbolically and materially" from Chilean society (Richards, 2010; 63). Whilst the Concertation government promotes a system of "diversity within one nation", all programs focusing on indigenous development are limited to poverty alleviation, rather than a discussion of land claims. Despite the promises of the Concertation government to work with Mapuche communities to return lands:

Mapuche communities found their collective interests shunted aside and recalibrated as sets of individual interests of less political significance that those of the nation as a whole. Political elites and corporate power benefited disproportionately from these projects and determined not only the outcome of specific struggles but also the very meaning of "development" and national policy priorities to achieve it (Haughney, 2012; 213).

Indigenous masculinities have been marginalized within Chile's "foundational fiction" (Sommer, 1993), as they are "perceived as a threat to the "white" (criollo) establishment and existing neo colonial power relations" (Crow, 2014; 75). Under the Bachelet government in Chile some forms of Mapuche masculinity have been accepted over others. Hale and Millaman (2006) describe the creation of a Mapuche "Indio Permitido". The term Indio Permitido "refers to the identity category that results when neoliberal regimes actively recognise and open space for collective indigenous presence, even agency" (Hale and Millaman, 2006; 284). The term was first used by Rivera Cusicanqui, but Hale and Millaman have extended it, referring to the dichotomy between the Latin American Indigenous labourer, docile in quality and the rebellious Indian, treacherous in nature. They describe the Chilean state as providing clear boundaries on Mapucheness in order to encourage effective governance, as such Mapuche cultural affirmations must fit with the demands of the governing body. Those who fit within these boundaries are granted respect and cultural sensibility from the dominant culture, as an authentic and pure culture. Within Chile, the Indio Permitido constitute those Mapuche who accept the state's multicultural policy and thus promote their folkloric history whilst also assimilating into society. However, those Mapuche who live outside the limits of the Indio Permitido are constructed as delinquents and even terrorists. As Hale argues, "governance proactively creates and rewards the Indio Permitido, while condemning its Other to the racialized spaces of poverty and social exclusion". Hale calls this "other" the "insurrectionary Indian" (Hale in Richards, 2010; 71) and within Chile these constitute those Mapuche who are

supporting autonomist efforts and land reclamation. The Bachelet government has "grappled with Mapuche political activists as if they were unruly, troublesome children, despite their pledges to promote indigenous rights and to engage in an intercultural dialogue with indigenous peoples" (Crow, 2014; 92). Thus, Mapuche warrior masculinities are promoted within Chile when it suits the development of a mestizo hegemonic masculinity. However, those Mapuche who fight for indigenous rights are labelled as dangerous and subversive.

Crow (2014) and Hale and Millaman's (2006) work on the Mapuche and the state would suggest that the Mapuche are part of a marginalized masculinity that is scaled as subordinate on the hierarchy of masculinities in comparison with hegemonic Eurocentric, mestizo masculinities. However, Mapuche men have not been passive in their marginalization, rather, several authors (Rekdal, 2014; Kropff, 2004; Briones et al., 2007) have explored the ways in which young Mapuche men have been resisting state narratives of Mapuche masculinity. The Mapurbe are an urban group with roots in poetry and music that are offering new forms of resistance against the Chilean state. In the early 2000s, many young Mapuche who had migrated to the city began a process of increasing indigenous self-awareness. This was accompanied by attempts to rebuild family histories, as well as a reconnection with rural life, specifically with the ceremonial aspects of rural living. Briones et al. (2007; 270) argue that the Mapurbe emerged as a group in opposition to the idea that some spaces were "naturally" Mapuche, such as ceremonial and rural spaces. The young, self-styled Mapurbe see these traditional places as a flat starting point, but also as a floor from which they can raise the legitimation of new spaces as Mapuche everyday places. The Mapurbe have created ceremonial spaces within urban places, with Mapurbe music performances and festivals attracting more people (Rekdal, 2014). Mapurbe have also adapted traditional Mapuche ceremonies, such as the Kamarikun, a ritual that was traditionally used to strengthen the Mapuche connection to the land, however the Mapurbe now use this ritual as a neophyte rite of passage, a realisation of a true Mapurbe identity.

Mapurbe masculinity bypasses the assertion of indigenous rurality and promotes the possibility that Mapuche can combine features of the rural and urban. These suburban youths also adapted to their surroundings, challenging the stigma associated with being an urban Mapuche and questioning the ideological structure that sustains the hegemonic hierarchy within Chile (Kropff, 2004). They achieved this by creating the Mapurbe identity using "aesthetic ideologies" (Kropff, 2004, 2) such as the musical styles of "punk" and "heavy" to negotiate

their identity. However, work on the Mapurbe has tended to focus on links to music and cultural resistance (Collins, 2004; Rekdal, 2014), positioning the Mapurbe as a subcultural masculinity. Collins suggests that the Mapurbe express subcultural expressions of resistance through the "illusion of the permanent threat of violence... and the spontaneous explosion of rage and obscenities, reminiscent of punk or anti poetry" (Collins, 2014; 32). However, naming the Mapurbe as a subculture limits the potential power that this group has. It restricts the Mapurbe masculinity to style, music and resistance and ignores the multiple masculinities of the Mapurbe. Furthermore, naming the Mapurbe as a subculture creates a dichotomy between the Chilean and the Mapurbe masculinity. It positions these two identities as actively in conflict with one another and thus rejects the idea that there could be movement between the two groups, or indeed alternative Mapuche identities. Focusing too intently on the Mapurbe as a musical subculture ignores the greater aims of traditionalism and mobility of the Mapurbe. The Mapurbe are part of a social movement that stands in opposition to hegemonic western Chilean society without conforming to the rigidity of a subculture. The Mapurbe are not constantly activists, but rather activists, students, sons, friends, urban, and each identity varies in importance. Members of the self-proclaimed independent and autonomous Mapurbes claim that it produces a "language through which to discuss rebellion" (Briones, 2007; 103). In fact, during the last 20 years, it is the youths who have been at the forefront of Mapuche activism. Under Bachelet's government, three youths have been shot and several more have been arrested and held without charge. Thus, for the Mapurbe music is a tool to express dissent and encourage popular protest. However, the literature has failed to explore the gendered nature of Mapurbe representations. Representations of Mapurbe masculinities created through music and poetry discuss Mapuche culture and lands as destroyed by colonial male warriors, who disregarded Mapuche women and children. This is clearly expressed in the lyrics to Wenu Mapu, a popular Mapuche rap song:

With the cross, the bible and the sword
The lands become usurped
Out of deception and from assassination
And the women and the children wrenched
From communities to live on reservations
While foreigners and colonists
Profiting on the lands that from the hands
Of our brothers have been snatched.

The relations of the Mapurbe with gendered identities need to be more fully explored. This thesis expands work on Mapuche masculinities by exploring the ways in which multiple Mapuche masculine identities are formed through the intersections of gender, class, place and ethnicity, investigating the ways in which Mapuche masculinities are plural and expressed through representations and performances.

# Geographies of Hybridity

Hybridity is a useful theoretical starting point to discuss the intersectionality, dynamism and complexity of Mapuche masculinities within a postcolonial world. Hybridity is a concept that emerged in the 1990s (Bhabha, 1994; Garcia Canclini, 1990; Hall, 1992; Gilroy, 1993) and can be understood as a space where new forms of intercultural practices are negotiated through the merging of cultures and interactions of differential power (Knox and Pinch, 2000), beginning at the point of the colonial encounter when "self and other are inseparable from mutual contamination" (Wolf, 2000; 133). Hybridity is a useful concept in a globalizing and postcolonial world in which identities have become more fluid, as Hall argues "global post modernism has, as it were, destroyed the identities of specific places, and absorbed them into this postmodern flux of diversity" (Hall, 1991, 35). As explored above, (Carter, 2010; Richards, 2010; Haughney, 2012) the Chilean government has glossed over differences in order to create a utopic project that suggests a multi-voiced cosmopolitanism is the new state identity, in which all can participate in a liberating equal form of citizenship. However, the way the Chilean government promotes the Chilean state as ethnically neutral is in fact a racist hegemony in which one homogenous fictive ethnicity is used to undermine difference in a society where "hybridity is the norm and exclusive ethnicities are archaic" (Radcliffe and Westwood, 1996; 31).

Hybridity has been explored as a tool of resistance (Kriady, 2002; Werbner, 1997; Anzaldua, 2007; Bhabha, 1994; Wolf, 2000) against such state enforced racist ideologies. Homi Bhabha understands hybrid cultures to have a form of double vision, hybrid cultures are at once looking forward to the future and looking backwards to the past. In this "double vision" the marginalised are able to transcend social binaries of race, nation, and gender, through their complex, hybrid perspective. Hybridity, he argues, is not simply a third form of culture that contrasts with that of the oppressor and the oppressed, rather it is a process that helps to undermine the authoritative voice of the colonial power when silencing the voice of native

traditions. He views this inbetweeness as a "third space" in which other positions emerge that are "inherently critical of essentialism and conceptualisations of original or originary culture" (Mitchell, 1997b; 257). Within this fluid third space cultural differentiation is no longer a source of conflict but a source of power, that has been born of discriminatory practices and yet speaks against these practices. This third space (Bhabha, 1998) is both similar yet different to its originary cultures.

The power of hybridity in Latin American contexts has been explored by Anzaldua (2007), who argues that through the mixing of ethnicities and the "racial, ideological, cultural and biological cross-pollinisation, an "alien" consciousness, is presently in the making – a new mestiza consciousness... It is the consciousness of the borderlands" (Anzaldua, 2007; 99). The idea of a New Mestiza comes from the Aztec word, which means "torn between ways" (100). Anzaldua argues that this is a space for multiple opportunities. She argues that through flexible identities one is able to incorporate flexible thinking "characterised by movement away from set patterns and goals and toward a more whole perspective, one that includes rather than excludes" (2007; 101). Anzaldua believes that the future belongs to la mestiza, who is able to break down paradigms and create a new and inclusive consciousness. Her New Mestiza project rejects the cosmopolitanism of the Chilean government, she directly challenges the pan hybridity of all cultures, by suggesting the need to embrace and acknowledge all cultural difference. "I am visible ... yet I am invisible. ... But I exist. We exist. They'd like to think I have melted in the pot. But I haven't, we haven't" (2007; 107). While focused on women and rooted in specifically feminist politics, Anzaldua's New Mestiza is still a useful theoretical lens informing studies of Mapuche masculinities because it challenges government hegemony, explores hybridity as resistance and also investigates the internal hybridities within communities, where much work on hybridity has been restricted to international hybridities. As Mitchell points out, whilst in the past "the invocation of hybridity has related most specifically to the situation of people living outside of their traditional homelands" now it must come to "signify a more general sense of displacement, as well as a challenge to the limits of existing boundaries" (1997b, 259).

Within indigenous cultures hybridity can be an important tool for resistance and reconstruction. Estrada describes the contemporary Mapuche within Chile as a hybrid identity:

Our culture isn't immobilised or fixed in books, quite the contrary, its alive in those of us who are alive today... as we engage in cultural contact with other human communities, we acquire new tools that we can incorporate without losing our Mapuche identity. (Estrada, in Rekdal 2014)

Whilst indigenous communities may not be migrants in the sense that they have moved from one space to another, there is still an intense feeling of dislocation within many indigenous groups; marginality has been imposed through the proximity to the colonial subject, who in the Chilean case, never left. Meredith (1998) argues that understanding indigenous hybridities can help to break down constructions of a false sense of traditionalism that has been created by the objectification of indigenous cultures and make room for a heterogeneous sense of indigenous identity that is continually reconstructed and changing temporally and spatially. Understanding indigenous hybridities helps to resolve the tension between hybrid cultures by rejecting the binary separations and exploring where the affinities and the contrasts occur. This reinforces Garcia Canclini's (1989) call for an inter-contextual theory of hybridity, in which the limited vertical confrontations of power are challenged:

Power would not function if it were exercised only by bourgeoisie over proletarians, whites over indigenous people, parents over children, or the media over receivers. Since all these relations are interwoven with each other, each one achieves an effectiveness that it would never be able to by itself (259).

Embracing indigenous hybridities is a tool that can counteract the promotion of self-made indigenous essentialism as "part of oppressed people's struggle for empowerment has involved using strategies of building pride in belonging to a cultural group in opposition to the dominant other" (Dudgeon and Fielder, 2006; 405); embracing the third space means rejecting any culture as homogenous. The Mapuche case study is vitally important in a hybrid discussion of cultural identity, as it engages with the critical points of difference within the Mapuche people. This thesis encourages the recognition of internal group diversity and expands on the work by Imilan Ojeda (2008), which has already begun to explore Mapuche hybridities. Discussing the Mapuche as a hybrid group "enables the acknowledging of the experience of ruptures and discontinuities within the group" (Hall, 1991; 225).

### Conclusions

This chapter has set out the theoretical framework necessary to understand Mapuche masculinities. It engages with the growing body of work on men and masculinities and argues that masculinity is a social construct. The chapter rejects traditional gender-sex binaries and instead defines masculinity as a complex and fluid set of attitudes, behaviours and traits that must be understood as separate from sexed bodies. The chapter challenges the concept of hegemonic masculinities, arguing that it reduces masculinities to bounded categories. In contrast the chapter promotes the existence of multiple masculinities, that are always fluid and at once hegemonic, marginalised and complicit. Through an understanding of masculinities as fluid, the chapter rejects stereotypical understandings of Latin American masculinities. It engages with the growing literatures that examine multiple Latin American masculinities, challenging the concept of one macho Latin American man. However, the chapter suggests that more research must now take place in order to deconstruct indigenous masculinities. It explores the work by indigenous scholars that critiques the influence of colonialism on indigenous masculinities and calls for a re-emergence of indigenous gender ideologies. However, the chapter suggests that currently within geographical literature, stereotypes of Mapuche masculinities remain unchallenged. The chapter shows that within the literature Mapuche masculinities are often objectified and essentialised, with Mapuche men either reduced to warrior based, rural masculinities or an urban, violent subculture. As such, this research will challenge these essentialist representations of Mapuche masculinities, exploring instead the multiplicities and fluidity of Mapuche masculinities. The chapter shows that in order to understand masculinities research must adopt an intersectional lens that encompasses class, gender, ethnicity and importantly, place. It argues that previous intersectional studies have ignored place as a factor within identity formation; however, in order to understand multiple Mapuche masculinities it is necessary to explore the ways in which the rural and the urban, and the local and the national intersect. Furthermore, it suggests that Mapuche masculinities must be understood as hybrid. Hybridity counteracts essentialism and can be a tool for agency and resistance. Adopting an intersectional and hybrid approach to Mapuche masculinities requires ethnographical research methods and also sensitivity to research ethics. The methodologies used to achieve this are discussed in the next chapter.

### **Chapter 3. Methodologies**

The following chapter discusses the methodology that was employed in the research. The first section explores the central methodological challenge that faces this study: how to research young Mapuche men in a way that is ethical and allows them to speak for themselves, without creating false representations or presuming to speak for them. The second section critically discusses the multiple methods chosen for this research and the ways in which these methods promote an ethical research project. The final section discusses the ethics of this research project and issues concerning my own positionality in relation to the project.

# The Central Methodological Challenge in Researching Urban Mapuche Youth

The central methodological challenge when researching urban Mapuche youth was how to create a research framework that was ethical and allowed the "subaltern to speak" (Spivak, 1988). According to Smith, "research' is probably one of the dirtiest words in the indigenous world's vocabulary" (2012; 1). Geographical research techniques have been inherently linked to colonial ideals (Hudson, 1977; Driver, 1992; Farmer, 1983), particularly within the third world or indigenous societies, where power relationships between the researcher and the researched were profoundly unequal and contradictory. Sidaway describes the typical research project within human geography overseas as consisting of:

data mining by the sojourning social scientist. He (sic) came to the host country, gathered his data and went home to complete his analysis. This "safari" research expedition left no lasting imprint on the host country's research capability. If anything, the visitor left disappointed hosts who expected useful research results, correction of social problems or even joint publications (1992; 404).

This form of research created hierarchies of knowledge and power, in which the researcher was placed above the researched (Said, 1978). Often original data was published in the researcher's language and country, without any dissemination in the researched society. Said (1978) argues that the knowledge created around colonized peoples was limited in terms of vocabulary and imagination in order to prop up colonialism. The attitude and experience surrounding colonies was restricted to a self-contained, self-reinforcing version of western created knowledge "in

which objects are what they are *because* they are what they are, for once, for all time, for ontological reasons that no empirical material can either dislodge or alter" (Said, 1978; 70). Chakrabarty argues that a practice of prioritizing European intellectual traditions continues today in social science departments in most modern universities, whilst Indigenous traditions are treated as historic (2009). He describes a tendency to believe in a "first in the West and then elsewhere" (Chakrabarty 2002; 6) understanding of knowledge creation.

Indigenous scholars Gegeo and Watson Gegeo (2001) have critiqued contemporary geographical accounts of indigenous cultures. They argue that whilst these accounts may involve indigenous people in their knowledge creation and may draw on indigenous cultural knowledge, research based on interviews, ethnographies and other forms of participant observation or collaborative research is "imagined, conceptualised and carried out within the theoretical and methodological frameworks of Anglo European forms of research, reasoning and interpreting" (2001, 58). Smith (2012, 118) argues that these traditional research methods have presumed that indigenous peoples are the "natural objects" of research. Indigenous academics have condemned these research practices as disempowering. Furthermore, Smith has condemned legal and ethical codes of conduct for research and researchers for failing indigenous groups, as indigenous rights and beliefs about knowledge and property are often not recognized or respected:

"Indigenous groups argue that legal definitions of ethics are framed in ways which contain the western sense of the individual and of individualised property – for example, the right of an individual to give his or her own knowledge, or the right to give informed consent. The social "good" against which ethical standards are determined is based on the same beliefs about the individual and individualised property" (Smith, 1999, 118).

In response to the colonial history of research, indigenous scholars have begun to create an indigenous research agenda. This research agenda has grown out of the rejection of a westernized research style. This indigenous methodology is similar in some ways to western science but it also includes key terms that one would not expect to find within research terminology, such as healing, decolonisation and spiritual recovery (Smith, 2012). An indigenous method of research would seem in traditional terms "much too politically interested rather than neutral and objective" (Smith, 2012; 117). However, where western science has

failed to fulfil the promised benefits to indigenous societies, it is appropriate that they should create their own research protocol.

Pulani (2007) has created a set of indigenous methodologies as an alternative way of thinking about the research process that ensures "indigenous issues are accomplished in a more sympathetic, respectful and ethically correct fashion from an indigenous perspective" (Pulani, 2007; 133). He argues that indigenous research methods should be fluid approaches that work through cyclical perspectives. This can be achieved by including four principles: relational accountability, respectful representation, reciprocal appropriation and rights and regulations. Relational accountability is the shared concept within indigenous groups of dependence on everything and everyone, implying that all parts of the research process are related "from inspiration to expiration, and that the researcher is not just responsible for nurturing and maintaining this relationship but is also accountable to "all your relations" (Pulani, 2007; 133). Respectful (re)presentation requires that the researcher considers "how you represent yourself, your research and the people, events, phenomena you are researching" (Absolon and Willett, 2004; 15), through humility and patience. Reciprocal appropriation describes the appropriations in which man (sic) invests himself in the landscape, and at the same time incorporates the landscape in his own most fundamental experience" (Momaday, 1976; 80). It thus acknowledges that all research is appropriation and benefits must be experienced by both the researcher and the researched. Rights and regulations ensure that the research process is not purely extractive, recognising that it is the "indigenous peoples' intellectual property rights to "own" the knowledge they share with the researcher and to maintain control over all publications and reporting of that knowledge. It demands that the entire research process be a collaboration and any publication or announcement of findings must be written and receive the endorsement of the indigenous community" (Pulani, 2007; 133).

These useful indigenous methodologies as proposed by Smith (2012) and Pulani (2007) are written for indigenous researchers. Thus, the question remains as to whether non-indigenous scholars can correctly be involved in indigenous research. As Farmer (1973; 13) asked many years ago, "cannot India it be argued be left to the Indians?". This implies that British geographers should be limiting their research to the interest of Britain. Such critiques often resulted in a "disabling angst" (Simon, 2006; 15) for western researchers. Smith (2012) provides limited answers to the questions of whether and how western researchers should involve themselves in indigenous research. She states that non-indigenous researchers must

expect mistrust and caution from their participants, questioning in whose interest the research is being done, who owns it and the impacts this will have. This may be cause for many to disengage from such research. However, as Overton (2013; 598) suggests, "it would be a shame indeed if all research were to devolve into silos where no one crossed what are, after all often permeable and contested, ethnic boundaries."

There are still many benefits to overseas research. It has been argued that to assume that insiders "automatically have a more sophisticated and appropriate approach to understand social reality in "their" society is to fall into the fallacy of third worldism and a potentially reactionary relativism (Halliday, 1987). As Farmer (1973) argues, it is anti-intellectual to deliberately avoid areas that have remained uncultivated in the academic field. Sidaway (1992; 406) suggests that:

It is not the case that indigenous studies should be limited to indigenous researchers. Whilst the number of indigenous researchers is growing, research in "other" cultures is still considered worthwhile, particularly as it "offers a counter to universalistic and ethnocentric views. It is the enemy of parochialism and essential to the vitality of geography. However, this would no doubt be advanced if indigenous researchers came in large numbers to conduct research of "exotic" and "different" European and North American societies" (Sidaway, 1992; 405).

McEwan (2009) argues that "fieldwork brings us most directly into contact with the everyday lives and material realities of others and through a democratic impulse has considerable potential for developing a dialogic version of research whose outcomes are also accountable". This signals the appropriateness of being involved in collaborative or mutually cooperative research within the researched community or, where this is not possible, making every effort to decolonize methodologies, conduct research ethically and with the necessary culturally sensitivities.

Postcolonial scholars have acknowledged the problematic nature of academics from the global North doing research within global South countries and communities (Mohan, 1999; Nagar and Ali, 2003; Chambers, 2005; Rose, 197; Tembo, 2003; Reid-Henry, 2003). However, Briggs and Sharp (2004; 673) argue that "rather than abandon fieldwork it is perhaps now more than ever necessary to decentralize western centrism". Postcolonial scholars have presented a

range of decolonizing methodologies in order for western scholars to practice fieldwork ethically. These methodologies consist mainly of participatory methods, which McEwan suggests are a way of creating meaningful connections with researchers in the south, by engaging with local researchers at each stage of the process, thus ensuring that the fieldwork is collaborative. Achieving these collaborative, decolonizing methodologies makes it possible to imagine another "world picturing" (Sidaway, 2000). However, while meaningful connections might be forged, there are still challenges that emerge concerning the politics of representation, as postcolonial scholars have demonstrated.

Spivak (1988) critiques attempts to understand the subaltern as destructive, describing this as epistemic violence. Spivak's essay "Can the subaltern speak" (1988) critiques representation, which she argues silences subalterns through the epistemic violence of "speaking about" (describing) and "speaking for" (representing politically), which she argues silences subalterns. She argues that the unequal power relations within academic institutions places western intellectuals as evident in the recreation of imperialism. Within the regime of representation voices of the subaltern are crowded out by those who speak about and for them, and they remain unheard because they are not listened to. However, Spivak argues that academics can decolonize their mind through "an examination of the intersection of a theory of representation and the political economy of global capitalism" (1988, 275). Spivak's work suggests that despite being constantly influenced by power relations, there are steps that can be taken by western academics in attempting to listen to the subaltern and to achieve a more ethical encounter. She argues that western scholars must critique themselves, acknowledge their privilege, acknowledge that their privilege may actually prevent them from seeing and understanding the lifeworlds of others, and also acknowledge their complicity in discursive regimes of power. Only then can they attempt to unlearn the prejudices associated with such privilege. Spivak argues that in order to learn from the subaltern, one must first learn to learn from below. As Kapoor (2004; 41) writes, "I have to clear the way for both me and the subaltern before I can learn from her/him"; fundamental to this is establishing an ethical basis for the encounter.

Drawing on these ideas, Raghuram and Madge (2006) have set forward a three step methodology in order to achieve a postcolonial method. The first step is to question why the research is being conducted in the first place. "If a postcolonial approach involves critical recognition of the material and discursive legacies of colonialism, then a postcolonial method

has no option but to be a politically engaged method that forefronts the ethical issues of who gains from this research, and why" (Raghuram and Madge, 2006; 8). The researcher needs to be clear about the power relations involved in their research and committed to challenging these relations. Raghuram and Madge (2006) argue that postcolonial methods must engage with the researched from the beginning of the process, meaning that the research questions are produced in dialogue, ensuring that "project beginnings are embedded within and take account of the priorities of the researched and not delimited by the concerns of the northern "experts"" (Raghuram and Madge, 2006; 10; see also Escobar, 1995). Secondly, Raghuram and Madge argue that theorization should also be part of the research method, that academics must recognize and reconfigure methods of theorization and also that theory should be contextualized. In this way, they argue that the power of northern theories can be destabilized and theorization becomes more accountable. Raghurman and Madge's final reframing of a postcolonial method is a recognition of the multiple investments involved in the research, and asking who gains from the research and why? By following these methods they believe that western academics can show a commitment to collaborative research and a motivation to challenge current power hierarchies.

Similarly, McEwan (2009) has suggested a variety of methodologies that encourage a collaborative research process. She describes the use of testimonials such as "novels, art, images, films and photography" (274) as participatory techniques that can prioritize the agency and knowledge of subaltern peoples. She suggests that these resources are a tool for understanding the complex lives and agency of subaltern peoples. Such methodologies are the most appropriate ways to decolonize methodologies and ensure the subaltern speak. The methods adopted in this research are influenced by such concerns. However, whilst this research aims to produce a dialogue with Mapuche men, constraints and limitations prohibited engagement with a fully collaborative research process. This research was limited to a onemonth period and there was insufficient resource (time, funding) to support a research visit through which to build partnership and co-design the research questions and methods. While my research participants were identified through Mapuche International Link, it was undertaken without the formal participation of a Mapuche organization, which meant that a deep participatory methodology was impossible to achieve. However, the research does attempt to engage in dialogue in the most ethical way possible given the limitations of the research (Barnett, 2011; Mitchell and Draper, 1982; Smith, 2000; Smith, 2001). There are

many codes of ethics for geographers to follow, but Smith (2001) summarizes ethical practice as:

"one of moral responsibility: to other persons in places less fortunate than ours. We owe distant persons, including professional colleagues, far more than we give them. We may reject the notion of universal responsibility to the whole of human kind, as both a moral and practical proposition, but we should at least consider the possibility, in our personal scholarly practice of contributing to the wider good of the potential "world community" of professional geography" (105).

The following section outlines the methods that were chosen in order to make this research, which aims to problematise and challenge representations of Mapuche young men by revealing their own understanding of Mapuche identities, as ethical as possible, while recognizing the limitations and constraints.

### Field Research with Mapuche Youth in Chile

The field research took place over a one-month period during March and April 2016 and was split between two sites, the cities of Temuco and Santiago. Temuco is situated in southern Chile and is the capital city of the Araucania region, the centre of the traditional Mapuche homelands or Wall Mapu. One third of the region's population is ethnically Mapuche, the largest percentage of any region in Chile, and 13% of Temuco's population are Mapuche, (out of a total population of 264,642 people) the largest percentage of any city in Chile. Its central location within the region has made it an ideal location for Mapuche migrants looking to move to an urban area. However, Araucania is also the poorest region within Chile in terms of GDP per capita (Asociacion Chilena de Municipaldades, 2016), and is the centre of the Mapuche conflict with the state for land reclamation. These characteristics of Temuco are reflected in the fact that despite being an urban centre Temuco has a rural feel, with rural style markets and horses used as a means of transportation. In comparison Santiago is the capital city of Chile and has a much more metropolitan feel, with a population of 5.128 million people. It is located in central Chile at the edge of traditional Mapuche territory. Despite the fact that only around 1.5% of the Santiago population is ethnically Mapuche, this accounts for over half of the Chilean Mapuche population, many of whom have migrated there to find work. Most of the Mapuche people within Santiago live in poorer neighbourhoods on the outskirts of the city.

These two cities were chosen as research sites because of their large Mapuche populations, but also their differing urban characteristics.

This research used a mixed methods approach and triangulation in order to carry out ethical research with young Mapuche urban men. Like many indigenous cultures, the Mapuche culture is centred on oral and aural traditions. Thus, whilst this thesis is a written document the methodologies used were primarily oral. This research encompassed 11 'emplaced interviews' (see below), 5 of which took place in Santiago and 6 in Temuco. Additionally, there were 5 'go-along' interviews, 2 in Santiago and 3 in Temuco. The research also included 5 focus groups: 4 focus groups took place in Temuco between 2 public schools and 1 focus group was held in a private school in Santiago. The participants of these groups came from the same school friendship groups. The participants at the time of the research were aged between 16 and 31.

The aims of this research necessitated that a variety of participants were involved in the research process. In order to gain a wide cross section of young Mapuche participants, access to participants was achieved through a variety of means. Firstly, contact with some participants was made through associations with the Mapuche International Link<sup>1</sup> (MIL). These participants were well educated and interested in the struggles of the Mapuche people internationally. Other participants were contacted through the Facebook Group "Pueblo Mapuche<sup>2</sup>". The participants contacted through the Facebook Group were very diverse, although all lived in the city of Temuco and many were interested in the Mapuche struggle to return indigenous lands. Finally, participants who tended to be young professionals were contacted through pre-existing social links within both Santiago and Temuco. The rest of the participants were then accessed through snowball sampling as participants provided contacts for interviews with their friends, relatives and colleagues. The focus groups in Temuco were arranged by one of the interviewees, Cristian, who was also a drama teacher in two public schools. Cristian acted as a gatekeeper for the focus groups. The focus group in Santiago was organized by Jaime, another interviewee

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The aim of MIL is to promote the interests of the Mapuche Nation and to highlight in general the issues of all American indigenous peoples and other indigenous people worldwide.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> This Facebook group has 5,860 members and advertises itself as a space in which people are "invited to comment and share information and knowledge about our Mapuche Nation

and teacher, who also acted as a gatekeeper. More information can be found about the participants within the Participant Table located in the appendix.

Indigeneity is a difficult category to define, particularly regarding the urban indigenous and thus choosing research participants was difficult. Government regulation on native identity has created a "complex array of categories of nativeness that have been reflected in the very distinct sets of experiences" (Lawrence, 2004; 227). However, this research prioritized self-identification as a Mapuche as the key requirement for participation. There were two other criteria in order to participate within this research: firstly participants had to be urban residents and, secondly, they had to be aged between 16 and 32. The requirements were kept to a minimum as "indigenous identity is a truly complex and somewhat controversial topic. There is little agreement on precisely what constitutes an indigenous identity, how to measure it and who truly has it" (Weaver, 2001, 240).

Once participants had been identified meetings were held in public spaces. The proceedings were audiotaped, which allowed me to focus on the interactions rather than attempting to write down everything that was said. Directly following the interviews, I documented what I interpreted to be the tone of the interviews, the key themes that emerged through the interviews and any important or surprising interactions. The interviews were not transcribed until I returned to the UK in order to create some distance from the research before engaging with the key themes.

The interviews were originally undertaken in Spanish and then translated upon return to the UK. The decision was made to conduct these interviews in Spanish rather than the Mapuche language, Mapudungun, for practical reasons. All Mapuche youth speak Spanish, all Chilean education is in the Spanish language and the cities of Temuco and Santiago operate within Spanish. Thus, for all participants Spanish was a first language. Those who could speak Mapudungun often had a basic grasp of the language or they spoke it as a second language. Spanish was the mutual language between the researcher and the participants. If I was not sure if I had understood the participants' answers correctly I asked for clarification on their meaning. If I was still unsure I asked the question in an alternative way to compare the answers.

The translation of research forms part of the process of knowledge production. There are power relationships involved in translation, given that no translation ever comes from a neutral

position. Furthermore, language not only describes the social world, but constructs it. Spivak (1992) argues that the key to translation is not "synonym, syntax and local colour". Rather, she sees language as "rhetoric and silence and the relationship between these" (Spivak in Temple and Young, 2004; 165). Thus, when translating interviews, it was important to understand the ways in which language is related to local realities and changing identities. I translated the interview research myself. Whilst not a native speaker, I have a high level of Spanish and I am particularly familiar with the Chilean dialect and culture having previously lived in Chile. I decided to act as both researcher and translator for two reasons. First, the:

"researcher/translator role offers the researcher significant opportunities for close attention to cross cultural meanings and interpretations and potentially brings the researcher up close to the problems of meaning equivalence within the research process" (Temple and Young, 2004; 167).

Second, to employ a translator with the same level of immersion within the research, so as to contribute more than just a tokenistic involvement, would be prohibitively expensive.

### Emplaced Interviews and Go Alongs

Despite the impossibility of creating a fully participatory methodology, the research methods chosen were centred around allowing the participants an opportunity to speak (cf. Spivak, 1988). A semi structured interview has been defined by Longhurst (2003; 117) as a "verbal interchange where one person, the interviewer, attempts to elicit information from another person by asking questions". This method was chosen because it is useful for investigating "complex behaviours, opinions and emotions and for collecting a diversity of experiences" (Longhurst, 2003; 128). Whilst semi structured interviews, like any other method, do not reveal "the truth", they do offer partial insights into participants' behaviours and thoughts. As I was unable to formulate the research questions with the participants as Raghuram and Madge (2006) propose, I came with a list of pre-prepared questions which, as Raju (2002; 176) suggests, could be considered to be influenced by my own presuppositions and "the flavours of the month". However, the use of these research questions was not rigid, rather the interview was left to develop in a conversational manner, giving the participants the chance to explore the issues they believed to be important and to dictate the direction of the interview. Thus, in many cases the research questions were challenged and new questions were formulated from these ideas.

These semi-structured interviews were conducted as 'emplaced interviews'. Participants were asked to select the sites for their interviews, with the only criteria being that the interviews were held in public. Emplaced interviews rose out of links between phenomenology — "a form of philosophy that attempts to give a direct description of first person experience" (Casey, 2001; 683) - and geography. In the past, identity-based methodologies did not engage with experiences of place. "Place figured only as a parameter of the sheer physical being of something that lacks consciousness altogether" (Casey, 2001; 693). However, geographers focus on place as experienced by people and as such they have argued that there is "no place without self and no self without place" (Casey, 2001; 684). Far from being removed from the phenomenological effects of place, the interview site is a material space for enacting identities. Furthermore, interview sites are influenced by the power dynamics between the interviewer and the interviewee. Most instructional texts base the interview location on convenience for the participants and researchers, suggesting a quiet and easily accessible location. However, "by glossing over issues of power and place, the instructional texts provide minimal guidance for understanding the significance of the social and political dynamics of different spaces for interviews, research data and analysis" (Elwood, 2000; 650). Thus, this research takes into account the microgeographies of the interview location and the ways in which:

"each location constructs or represents particular microgeographies of sociospacial relations, such that, in different locations, participants are situated differently with respect to identities and roles that structure their experiences and actions. Consequently, interview participants may offer different kinds of information, depending on where they are interviewed" (Elwood, 2000; 650).

In some cases, the everyday sites that the participants chose were not static. In these cases, a "go along" interview took place, in which I accompanied informants on their "natural" outings and "through asking questions, listening and observing" I actively explored the participants' "stream of experiences and practices as they move through, and interact with, their physical and social environment" (Kusenbach, 2003; 463). This allowed me to assess the participant's spatial practices in situ, whilst also assessing their experiences and interpretations. Go alongs are more than interviews, in that they emplace the knowledge shared by the participant. However, they were much shorter in length than immersive participatory methods such as participant observation, which, due to the limitations of this fieldwork, was not a

methodological option. Go alongs and Emplaced Interviews are complementary methods. The combination of these methodological tools ensured that the data collected encompassed in depth discussion and a broad range of topics. Emplaced interviews are an excellent phenomenological tool as they can "provide unique access to informants' biographies and future plans, to their subjective interpretations of others and social interaction" (Kusenbach, 2003; 462). Whilst go alongs promote themes that may have been overlooked in a sit down interview, such as "the pre-reflective knowledge and practices of the body, or the most trivial details of day to day environmental experience" (Kusenbach, 2003; 462).

The site that the participants chose for their interview often revealed more about the participant, particularly in the way they wanted to perform their identities. Butler argues that identity is not fixed, rather it is performed: "The body becomes its gender through a series of acts which are renewed, revised and consolidated through time" (Butler, 1988; 527). The body and performativity are linked together through "mundane, everyday practices, that shape the conduct of human beings towards others and themselves in particular sites" (Thrift, 1997; 126). Emplaced interviews and go-alongs are methods that allowed me to explore "practices that cannot adequately be spoken of, that words cannot capture, that texts cannot convey – on forms of experience and movement that are not only or never cognitive" (Nash, 2000; 655).

Most participants chose cafes or bars as the locations for their interviews, but the locations of these varied. Within Santiago emplaced interviews took place mainly within the Bella Vista or Lastarria areas of the city. These two locations are expensive gastronomic centres of the city and tend to be considered as young people's hangouts or "hipster" spaces. Bella Vista and Lastarria are not traditionally considered Mapuche spaces and thus the participants that chose to be interviewed here were performing a certain type of identity that will be discussed more in the following chapter. The participants in Temuco who chose to be interviewed in cafes surprisingly all chose the same one. This may be because Temuco is a much smaller city than Santiago and the options are limited, but it may also be because this café is popular with young people and is again considered to be very "hipster". I began to reflect at this point on how the participants were selecting their interview locations and whether or not this was also based on my own identity as a young British woman; perhaps they believed this may be somewhere I would like or feel comfortable, being the most metropolitan café that Temuco has to offer. Other participants chose to host the interview in their office spaces where they were able to perform a young professional identity. Most of the go along interviews were also undertaken

during work hours and the participants involved me in their work schedules. This was particularly the case for those who worked within the Mapuche community and who wanted to show me more of the Mapuche life-world. More information can be found about interview styles and sites within the Participant Table in the appendix.

# Focus Groups

The focus groups were undertaken along the same principles as the interviews. I acted as a moderator within the focus group to keep the group on topic but the focus group was "non directive, allowing the group to explore the subject from as many angles as they please" (Longhurst, 2003; 119). Whilst the focus group developed in marketing research it has been widely used in social science and Merton finds it a "generic technique, that could and would be applied in every sphere of human behaviour and experience, rather than largely confined to matters of interest in marketing research" (1987; 551). There has been criticism of the ability of focus groups to give the subaltern a voice. Problems arise within focus groups when one or two dominant members in the group influence the discussion. Power relations are present within focus groups and weaker members in the group can become silenced. As such, a consensus can emerge within the group producing inaccuracy in the data (Crang and Cook, 1995). This was the case, particularly in Focus groups 1 and 4 where one or two members largely dictated the flow of the conversation. In these cases, I utilized the techniques for moderators suggested by Crang and Cook (1995) in order to try and limit the complex power relations created within the focus groups and promote a more inclusive discussion. However, when analyzing this data, it is important to recognize the power relations through which it was produced. Within the context of young friendship groups focus groups can also be an opportunity for a performance in front of class mates, leading participants to describe things that they do not actually do or believe. Whilst focus groups can lead to inaccuracies in the data and complex power relations, they were the most appropriate methodology for interviewing Mapuche school students.

Whilst the Mapuche students were all above the age of 16, within the school context I felt it was appropriate to conduct the research within the context of a focus group. As McDowell (2001; 91) has argued when conducting research with young men "the moral responsibility remains and in my own work ... I would not undertake one to one interviews in a private space". There were also other benefits to Focus Groups as an ethical research methodology. Firstly, focus group discussion can provide a valuable insight into social relations, as truth does

not exist independent of social context. As Crang and Cook (1995; 56) argue, "it is important to understand how people work out their thoughts and feelings about certain matters on the basis of interactions with others whom they/we learn from, react to, misunderstand and resist". Indeed, whilst there are issues of power between the researcher and participants within interviews, "the focus group incorporates the research subject as a participant in a collaborative project that the researcher never fully controls ...and it gives voice to those who do not speak, enabling them in dialogue with others to make their own discoveries about their condition" (Goss, 1996; 115). This allows for the creation of both analytical and critical knowledge, developed within research for the participants, as opposed to knowledge that is appropriated from those participants. Furthermore, the use of focus groups allows the researcher and the research subjects to gain knowledge during the research process, allowing the informants to benefit from the process. As of yet there are few discussions that advocate the use of focus groups when studying indigenous groups or indeed within developing country contexts, but in the context of indigenous groups in Chile there are many benefits to focus groups as "they are social synergistic, reflexive, liminal and potentially empowering" (Goss, 1996; 117).

#### Photo Voice

Prior to the emplaced interviews, go-alongs and also focus groups the participants were asked to take a photo on their camera phones that represented, in their eyes, Mapuche masculinity. Whilst not all of the participants engaged in this task, I received 11 images. However, due to time constraints within their own lives most of the participants downloaded the images off the internet rather than actually taking the pictures. Each participant was asked to give the photograph a title and to write a short description of the photo, along with a short explanation of the thoughts and feelings they felt when taking or viewing the photo/image. At the beginning of the interview or focus group the participant was given time to explain their choice of image and how it represented their understanding of Mapuche masculinity. Following this, the photos/images were then used as a stimulus for the discussion.

This choice of method is based on Lavallee's (2009) application of an indigenous research framework where she utilised "anishnaabe", a form of symbol-based reflection. Anishnaabe encourages indigenous participants in research to bring symbols to focus groups and then reflect on the way these symbols represent how they felt during their participation in the research. Photo voice is a participatory research method where people identify, represent and enhance their community through photography (Lavallee, 2009). The visual method was

chosen to support the oral methods as it provides for more active participation within the research by participants. Participants take pictures that help to tell their story regarding a particular concern. The individual's story accompanied this picture to promote an effective, participatory means of sharing expertise. Furthermore, this method was used to provide thick description in a world that is increasingly occularcentric. As images saturate everyday life it is through the universal process of viewing images that people begin to see reality as it is for them. It is for this reason that some writers (Fyfe and Law, 1988; Berger, 1972) see the visual as the most important of the senses. Within the discussion of Mapuche masculinities, the discussion of images is important as it illustrates the construction of social categories. As Fyfe and Law (1988; 1) argue, "a depiction is never just an illustration... it is the site of the construction and depiction of social difference". Feminist and postcolonial writers have made headway into studying the ways in which femininity and blackness are visualised (Gilroy, 1987) and this research adds to this by studying the ways in which indigenous men visualise their masculinity.

### Discourse Analysis

The research engages not only with the performances of multiple Mapuche masculinities, but also with their various representations. As identities are constructed both internally and externally, "social identity appears as a function of representations themselves" (Duveen 2001). As the world is full of representations identities are both influenced by and have an influence on, representations. This thesis engages with representations of multiple Mapuche masculinities through discourse analysis. It is important to engage with discourse analysis within this research as discourses can be viewed as a social construction of reality (Johnstone, 2007). Texts are "communicative units which are embedded in social and cultural practices" (Paltridge, 2012; 7). Discourses, such as poetry both shape and are shaped by the world. Thus, examining the patterns of language across texts can reveal much about the social and cultural context within which it was created, in this context the Mapuche masculinities that both created and engage with the discourses.

Discourse analysis was particularly important to one group of Mapuche men that are discussed in the research, the Mapurbe. The Mapurbe have created many representations of their masculinity through music styles such as Mapunky and Mapuheavy and poetry. In fact, the Mapurbe identity rose out of poetry written by David Aniñir. This thesis discusses his poetry and particularly his poetry anthology "Mapurbe: veganza a raiz" (2009). As an urban Mapuche

poet, Aniñir describes his anthology as connecting the history of the Mapuche struggle to the social problems which the Mapuche people are currently facing. He argues that Mapurbe is "a poetic concept of identity" which harbours "revenge against everything" (Aniñir, 2011). Mapurbe rap music is also analysed as a hybrid form of music. The research particularly focused on music by the Mapurbe rapper Waikil as multiple participants discussed his music in their interviews. The discourse analysis followed a course of analysis set out by Doel (2010). Firstly, the analysis engaged in the more general questions, for example how, why and for whom has it been constructed? After this I selected a few poems and songs based on discussions with participants. I analysed the structuring devices, along with the included and repressed material, and as such the power relationships, values and identities that are created through these devices.

# Field Notes and Diary

Throughout the research process I kept field notes. These described my observations and descriptions of the research sites, other places, people and their actions. These field notes included accompanying analysis of the meanings of these observations, including links to the wider literature and the relevant theories and also links to the research questions. I also kept a field diary throughout the process. This was different to the field notes in that it was a description of my feelings throughout the research process, including difficulties or issues that emerged within the field and a description of the relationship with participants. The field diary was a useful tool as "fear, self-doubt and feelings of failure can haunt us throughout our entire stay in the field. It is important to acknowledge these feelings" (Hume and Mulcock, 2004, xxiii). Recording these emotions allowed a place to scrutinize my emotions and challenges and to reflect more deeply on my positionality. After returning from the field these notes were typed directly onto a laptop; during this process the concerns within the diary were reflected on, drawing out any key themes, and often reshaped the field questions.

### Secondary Research Analysis

The research also involved some analysis of secondary data. The key sources that were used included newspaper articles, radio broadcasts and photographs. These were used for two reasons. Firstly, some secondary data was used as background research and to provide a context to the primary data I collected. Secondly, newspaper articles from national newspapers, such as El Mercurio, were used to understand representations of the Mapuche within national media.

Government published documents were used to reveal state representations of the Mapuche. Secondary research analysis was used only to supplement primary data and when it was impossible to collect comparable primary data.

### Non-Participant Observations

On the mornings and afternoons when no interviews were planned I spent some hours of the day within the city centre. This part of the research had two aims. First, I wanted to view and experience the urban spaces, mainly focusing on the politicised graffiti, street names and statues that were prominent in Temuco and Santiago. Secondly, I wanted to view the way different urban youths behaved and reacted within urban spaces. This immersion within the city space involved spending time within cafes, squares or other centres of urban behaviour.

This immersion within the city space is important because there is a "constitutive coingredience" (Casey, 2000) of people and place. Through deliberate immersion in the urban environment I was able to observe the "everyday rhythms and routines" of the city (Cook, 2003; 127). Immersion within the city space recognises the idea that "we can no longer distinguish neatly between physical and personal identity... place is regarded as constitutive of one's sense of self" (Casey, 2001; 684). Thus, through spending time in the city centres, observing and walking around, I was able to engage more actively with the life world and ongoing experiences of youth within the city and to experience the "orchestration of habitus" (Bourdieu, 1977; 80) that makes up this life world. The following table illustrates the ways in which the discussed methodologies map onto the projects' research questions:

*Table 1: Research Questions and the Corresponding Methodology* 

Research Questions	Methodology	Type of Data Provided
What are the multiple	Emplaced Interviews	Emplaced interviews were a valuable
masculinities of	and Go Along	tool that allowed participants to
Mapuche urban youth	Interviews	discuss what they believe important
and how do they differ?		aspects of Mapuche masculinities and
		identities to be.

	Focus Groups	Focus groups provided participants to
	1	discuss within friendship groups their
		own and group masculinities and
		understandings of Mapuche identity.
		They allowed participants to challenge
		each other and their own identities.
	Di4- V-:	
	Photo Voice	Photo voice was an opportunity for
		participants to discuss Mapuche
		masculinities outside of their own
		identity, by providing images of
		Mapuche men that they believed
		epitomized a Mapuche masculinity.
How do Mapuche urban	Emplaced Interviews	Emplaced interviews provided
youth perform these	and Go Along	participants with an opportunity to
masculinities?	Interviews	discuss their everyday lives and habits,
		and also for the interviewer to begin to
		understand how participants expressed
		themselves and wanted to be
		understood. It also revealed how the
		participants dressed and performed
		their identities.
	Discourse Analysis of	Lyrics to Mapurbe rap music were
	Music	analysed to give more understanding to
		the Mapurbe subculture.
	Discourse Analysis of	Poetry by David Aninir was analysed
	Poetry	to provide explanations of the history
		of the Mapurbe subculture.
	Focus Groups	Focus groups allowed participants to
		express themselves in a group
		dynamic, and were an opportunity for
		the researcher to spend time with
		groups of friends and understand social
		performances.
		performances.

How are urban	Emplaced Interviews	Mapuche participants chose places that
Mapuche youth	and Go Along	were important to their identities for
masculinities influenced	Interviews	emplaced interviews and go alongs
by Social Class and		often revealed everyday social class
Place?		structures.
	Focus Groups	Participants discussed within
		friendship groups their social class
		status, their experiences within the
		capitalist system and their experiences
		of urban and rural Mapuche identities.

#### **Ethical Considerations**

The research was subjected to ethical review and was conducted in accordance with Durham University ethical procedures. Participant consent was received orally from each participant. The participants were read a participant consent document, prepared in advance, in Spanish, before the research began and on each meeting subsequently. This statement can be found in the appendix. The aims of the project were expressed and it was highlighted that participation was voluntary and thus participants were free to withdraw at any time. It was made clear to the respondents that they could withdraw consent without penalty, and the data that had been provided by them would remain confidential and be returned to them. However, as consent is a continual process throughout the research, I was also aware that if the participant felt awkward or lacked motivation to answer some questions this could represent a withdrawal of consent. In these cases, I asked the interviewee whether they wanted to continue with the process and reiterated their ability to withdraw at any time.

To ensure the confidentiality of the participants of this research was assured, pseudonyms were used for all participants, and no information was included about any individuals that would make it possible to identify the participant. However, the research site was not anonymised as the individuality of the location chosen for this research impacts on the study significantly. There is a strong argument (see Grinyer, 2002) to include participants' identities in research to ensure their ownership of their contribution. However, I decided that it would be inappropriate to reveal the identity of the participants during this research as the themes are highly political,

and with Mapuche resistance being defined as an act of terrorism within Chile, it would be a potential risk to reveal the participants' identities. Thus, other methods were used to ensure the participants were given a voice.

# **Positionality**

As a researcher in Chile I am what what Merriam et al. (2001; 412) have termed an "external outsider; socialised within a community different from the one in which he or she is doing research". I am a young, British, white woman, whilst my participants were young, (Chilean) Mapuche men. However, I have worked in Chile previously so I am aware of acute cultural sensitivities. My British identity undoubtedly influenced the research process. I was positioned by the participants as an outsider as they described how "winka" like me had come before to talk to them. My association with other winka occasionally made the research process more difficult as these winka were associated with charity or money handouts, which was not the aim of this research. My British identity was occasionally prohibitive in that some participants believed I may have more political sway and that my research would reposition the British government's position towards the Mapuche struggle. During these conversations it was important for me to remind participants of the aims of the research and to re-read them the participant consent statement. I made it very clear that my British identity did not put me in a position where I could help them economically or politically. The participants were often surprised by my use of Chilean regional dialect and this surprise occasionally led me to be positioned more as a Chilean, being included as an insider and thus aware of more stereotypical Chilean behaviour. However, I was always positioned in opposition to "Mapucheness" by participants, who enjoyed explaining to me their knowledge of Mapuche traditions and culture. In a way the participants enjoyed telling me about these aspects of their life most, as it gave them an opportunity to reverse the perceived power balance, displaying themselves as more knowledgeable than me. The ways in which the participants positioned me most certainly had an effect on the knowledge that was created. Whilst the participants perhaps did not share as much information than they would have with a Mapuche "insider" researcher, they shared more than they would have with a Chilean, since Chileans are positioned as having greater links with the Chilean government and less sympathy with the Mapuche people than a western researcher.

As Rose (1997) has argued the type of knowledge created depends on who is creating that knowledge. Haraway (1991) believes that all knowledge is effected by its origins and attempting to disregard these origins is to "to make false claims to universally applicable knowledge which subjugate other knowledges and their producers" (Rose, 1997; 306). Thus, Haraway argues knowledges are limited and specific to particular contexts. She believes that the best knowledges come when they are created by different actants, that is by both the researcher and the researched and thus are hybrid in their origins. These are knowledges concerned with "elaborate specificity and difference and the loving care people might take to learn how to see faithfully from another's point of view" (Haraway, 1991; 190). However, as explored above, this research was not fully participatory, whilst certain methodologies were chosen in order to give Mapuche youths (who in the context of Chile might be considered subaltern as a consequence of their indigeneity and the long history of colonial and state oppression) a voice, it is important to note power inequalities remained in the construction of this research.

When western researchers, such as myself, enter the developing world and indigenous research settings, they cannot evade the power relations that exist between themselves and the research society. "Western researchers are in a position of power by virtue of their ability to name the categories, control information about the research agenda, define interventions and come and go as research scientists" (Rose, 1997; 307). This power imbalance means that to some extent, as Spivak (1988) argues, researchers are always speaking for participants, because they are always representing others through their work. However, Alcoff (1995) argues that as long as speaking for others is tackled in ethical and empowering ways and in ways that challenge false representations, then what Spivak terms as "epistemic violence" (1988) can be avoided. Throughout the research I attempted to limit the power relations by using methodologies that allowed the participants to dictate the path of the conversations. I also attempted to ensure that the interviewees felt they had control of the interviews. When seated I always sat next to the participant, rather than opposite and when walking the participant led. Furthermore, following McDowell's (2001) advice I tried to maintain a relationship with the participants that was neither too formal nor overly friendly, but was built on mutual respect. During the writing up it was important that the participants were given a voice, albeit one mediated through my writing. Thus, the analysis includes as many quotations as possible, so that the research is told through the participants' dialogue. Furthermore, it was important that not only findings considered to be exceptional were included but also "representatives of less spectacular youth"

(McDowell, 2001; 89), to reveal the complex realities of multiple Mapuche masculinities. It is acknowledged here that "research and selves are interactive texts" (Miles and Crush, 1993), not conscious agents simply waiting to be reflected in a research project (Rose, 1997). The research, researcher and researched are key in constructing each other. As such this research must be taken as a performance of certain identities, of certain participants at a certain time; these performances are always profoundly uncertain and do not predate this research.

As Winchester (2007) suggests, "the relationship between interviewer and interviewee can be very unequal", but this power relation does not always put the researcher at an advantage. There are some situations in which the power balances are reversed, "that is where the inequalities of power and prestige favour the research subjects, it is the researcher who is vulnerable and open to exploitation" (Blunt and Rose, 1994; 8). There are challenges associated with being a young woman interviewing men. Firstly, there were situations in which patriarchal gender relations were reiterated by participants. As Winchester (2007) describes "interviews become a problem when interviewees make sexist and offensive remarks, and where the supportive non argumentative stance of the interviewer provides tacit assent and reinforcement". In these situations, I assumed an interested manner in the participants' opinions but did not divulge my own; however, this occasionally felt restrictive. Furthermore, Blunt and Rose question if it is ethical to engage with participants "while disguising our purpose from others whom we know would refuse to speak to us if they could read our minds" (1984; 8). However, I made every effort to maintain the ethical integrity of the research by acknowledging my own position and the limitations of my knowledge. Patai argues that in some circumstances "feminist researchers are unconsciously seductive towards their research subjects, raising their expectations and inducing dependency" (1991; 143). Whilst I kept my behaviour neutral towards the participants throughout the research there were occasions when participants propositioned me for meetings beyond the research or asked me for my private phone number. In these circumstances I politely declined the offer, although often it made me feel uncomfortable. On one occasion a participant became visibly upset and aggressive towards me after I declined. In this case I deleted the recording of the interview and have not used any of the data he provided so that the participant did not feel he had lost control of his data. Whilst I was aware of my own gendered positionality throughout the research practice, as Stuart Hall argues "enunciation comes from somewhere. It cannot be unplaced, it cannot be unpositioned, it is always positioned in a discourse" (1991; 36). Therefore, no idealized equality was possible during this research and acknowledging my own positionality was the only way to reflect on these power imbalances.

# Conclusion

This chapter has set out the methodologies used within this research. Whilst this research, due to time limitations, did not engage with a fully postcolonial and participatory approach, the constant aim of the research was to engage with ethical research methodologies. As such, the research engaged with a wide range of methodologies that explored the performances and representations of multiple Mapuche masculinities. The following chapter discusses how participants expressed their own understandings of multiple Mapuche masculinities through various performances and representations.

# **Chapter 4. Urban Mapuche Youth Masculinities: Performances and Representations**

# <u>Introduction</u>

This chapter is concerned with how different groups of urban Mapuche youth understand, perform and represent their masculinities. As early as 1989 Brittan argued that "since masculinity is socially constructed and historically and culturally located, it is spurious to talk of masculinity and in fact the study should be recognized as the study of masculinities" (14). Since then, this understanding of masculinities as multiple has become axiomatic within geography. However, the research findings indicate that a simplistic deployment of a "multiple masculinities" model overlooks the complex ways masculinity is discursively manipulated amongst urban Mapuche youth.

Drawing on empirical findings this chapter challenges work on masculinities by Connell (2005). The research shows that while Connell's hierarchical rankings of masculinity into hegemonic, subordinate, complicit and marginalized masculinities may be useful on a generic level, this explanation fails to take into account the complexities of Mapuche masculinities in terms of lived identities and experiences. Connell's theory, whilst acknowledging the existence of multiple masculinities, simply regroups masculinities into these essentialising and limiting categories. This chapter reveals that everyday masculinities do not fit within bounded categories, rather they are fluid and porous. Prior research on Mapuche identity has acknowledged multiple identities, but has restricted these identities to rural and urban distinctions. Urban Mapuche have been reduced within academic work to the subculture of "Mapurbe" and their masculinities have been categorised within Connell's framework as resistant to hegemonic Chilean masculinities and marginalised in comparison with essentialised rural Mapuche masculinities. Martin (1998) criticizes such a focus on dominant masculinities as leading to inconsistent applications of the term. This chapter, however, will show that the young urban Mapuche have experienced constant processes of negotiation, translation and reconfiguration of their masculinity in order to adapt to circumstance and context.

The research reveals that even within the context of urban Mapuche there are multiple identities, which each display distinct understandings of masculinities that at times are

interwoven and linked to each other, all of which are in some ways hegemonic, complicit, marginalised and counter-hegemonic. In what follows I discuss the Mapurbe, revealing an identity based on traditionalism with a corresponding masculinity that promotes traditional Mapuche gender roles. The chapter continues by investigating contrasting Mapuche masculinities that have formed within groups of young Mapuche professionals and Mapuche students. The chapter reveals that young students are also interested in representing traditional forms of Mapuche masculinity; however, they interpret a traditional Mapuche masculinity very differently to the Mapurbe subculture. Their interpretation is focused on strength and aggression. The young professionals interviewed identified more with a Chilean form of masculinity; however, their identity also revealed aspects of a uniquely Mapuche masculinity. Whilst there are internal differences that represent multiple Mapuche masculinities, each of the groups is attempting some form of resistance to the Chilean state through the manifestation of their masculinities and thus there are similarities that promote certain Mapuche masculinity signifiers. This chapter also focuses on the way participants represent their masculinities, using photo elicitation as a technique to express their understanding of Mapuche masculinities. These masculinities are not positioned as 'sub' cultures, in the sense that they have defined boundaries that are in constant opposition to the 'dominant' Chilean culture, but are seen as flexible and hybrid identifications, with porous boundaries. The masculinities are at once contradictory and comparable, and resistant and passive in the face of the Chilean culture. The chapter concludes that there are multiple Mapuche masculinities that are internally diversified and hybrid in nature, making them both dynamic and flexible. Through the case study of Mapuche masculinities it is clear that masculinities are "experiencing constant hybridisation through the appropriation of "diverse elements from various masculinities" (Demetriou, 2001; 347).

### Mapurbe Masculinities: Traditions and Roles

The Mapurbe participants were 16 to 32 year old men from the capital city of Santiago. The term Mapurbe was coined by the Mapuche poet David Aniñir (2009) to identify "a socio political category of second or third generation Mapuche living in the poblaciones (poor neighbourhoods on the outskirts of Santiago) who express their marginal condition in hybrid forms of cultural production" (Collins, 2014; 25). Mapurbe first appeared as an identity in Aniñir's (2005; 75) poem of the same name:

We are concrete Mapuche below the asphalt sleeps our mother exploited by a bastard

We are born in the shitopolis

by the fault of the parasite cantor
we are born in bakeries
so that the damnation will eat us

We are the cleaners, bakers,

market vendors and ambulant vendors

we are those who remain in few places

(Translated by Luco, 2014).

According to Aniñir the Mapurbe subject is poor and deprived citizen, excluded from Chilean society. The Mapurbe struggles to survive in the "shitopolis" that is Santiago, working in low wage jobs, while Mother Earth is suffocated by the Chilean nation. Aniñir represents the "concrete Mapuche" or the Mapurbe as having little choice but to embrace their fate, they are part of the city and as such there is no way out for them. Thus, for Aniñir, Mapurbe is both an ethnic and social identity. A poor Mapuche at the same time living within, but also oppressed by, the city. Whilst there are women who identify as Mapurbe, this research only discusses the masculinities of young Mapurbe men.

Within this study, the Mapurbe were the only group to name themselves, with all the participants describing themselves as Mapurbe. For example:

"I grew up in Santiago, but my roots, they are Mapuche. I'm a Mapurbe, an urban Mapuche." (Sebastian, 25)

"On both sides, yes I am Mapuche, I am Mapurbe". (Diego, 25)

Anthias (2002; 496) argues that "encoding of the self may implicate a sense of human value and worth ... and may counter the construction of otherness – ascribed or internalised".

However, as we see with Diego, this naming of identity need not be a unitary or stable sense of self. The Mapurbe may define themselves as Mapurbe, but throughout the interview process other named identities were mentioned, such as Mapuche, Chilean and Santiaguinos (person from Santiago de Chile). Mapurbe is just one of many flexible ways of identifying these urban Mapuche youth.

Due to the porous boundaries of the Mapurbe, the identity has been greatly reformulated since Aniñir's initial definition. Rather than embracing hybridity (as defined by Kropff, 2004 and Rekdal, 2014), the Mapurbe participants expressed an ultimate aim of living as traditionally as possible. As Jorge describes:

In Santiago the Mapuches live in the most traditional way possible. I have friends whose identity is very clear. They even speak Mapudungun. But, for reasons of employment, they live in the city. She works in an office every day and he works in a construction agency, they live in a normal house, not in a ruka. But they have traditional values, beliefs from their roots. They speak Mapudungun and they teach this and their history to their children, the history of the Mapuche people. She goes to work each day dressed like a Chilean, but there is a special way of being, of being among each other. When you meet with other Mapurbe you have another attitude, you ask other things, the conversation forms itself in a different way. It's a code that we have among ourselves. (*Jorge*, 28).

To the Mapurbe a traditional identity is linked with the past and rurality. The Mapurbe have recreated traditional social structures, engage in ceremonies within the city, are learning Mapudungun and attend Machis for healing. However, drawing on Ranger (1983) it is likely that many of the Mapurbe traditions are invented in order to promote certain modes of command or feelings of ethnic nationalism. Within a multicultural metropolis dominated by Chilean culture it is inevitable that the Mapurbe will in some way experience hybridity. However, this does not mean that the Mapurbe identity is inauthentic, rather it is simply a response to the current needs of the Mapurbe community. One participant describes how they are attempting to recreate traditions:

We have made a type of community in the suburbs. In my community we are trying to conserve traditions. Especially the traditions relating to authority and organisation. And

the old people know it. They know the culture and everything. I've learnt a lot, but I still have a lot to learn. (Sebastian 25).

For the Mapurbe these traditions are real, they guard their identity as authentic and thus they actively try to avoid mixing the Mapuche and Chilean cultures. As one participant makes clear:

You have to try and not mix too much, that is to say, try not to mix with the Chileans. I suppose in my special case I have a lot of Chilean friends. But my best friends are Mapuche. (Sebastian, 25).

This desire for separation stems from the belief by many Mapurbe that they are actively different from the Chileans. They argue that they cannot maintain relationships with those who stole their lands from them and those who hold different values and traditions. Thus, whilst some academics (Cárcamo-Huechante, 2010; Collins, 2014; Rekedal, 2014) promote the Mapurbe as a Chilean-Mapuche hybrid, the reality is that most Mapurbe see themselves as separate from Chileans. Christian argues:

With the Chileans I'm more reserved. You can't talk with them about everything. I'm not like those people who walk among two cultures. I prefer to be with my people, my friends, my family, in my sector. The rest of them have nothing to do with it. I don't mix with them. I know it's not going to work. (*Cristian, 27*).

Thus, Mapurbe identity is borne out of the marginalisation of the city, but has driven them to (re)invent Mapuche cultural traditions.

Evidence from conversations with young Mapurbe men in Santiago suggest that the Mapurbe movement and its return to a traditional identity also encompasses a return to traditional masculinity. The Mapurbe interviewed are attempting to recreate the role system that they believe was present in pre-colonial Mapuche social structure. They reject the notion that Mapurbe masculinity is centred around a culturally rooted warrior identity (see Alfred, 2005). Rather, they believe that roles need to be filled within Mapuche society, but these roles are not divided by gender.

The interviewees suggested that the warrior trope arose after the Mapuche were invaded by Spanish colonialists and were forced to fill the warrior role for the needs of their society:

The Mapuche were never warriors. They used war as a defensive strategy, that's all. So I don't believe in these stories that say the Mapuche are warriors and all that. There were warriors, but there were also shamans, priest, doctors, astrologists. Like in every society there was a bit of everything. (*Sebastian*, 25)

The participants argue that many Mapuche have themselves adopted this identity, but that this is a hangover from the colonial period in which the Mapuche were forced to defend their territories. They argue within traditional Mapuche understandings there is no distinct segregation between man and woman, rather the Mapuche held a complementary set of gender ideologies (See Sneider, 2015; Antone, 2015 for discussions of complementarity and Bacigalupo for discussions on traditional Mapuche gender structures). As such, in their explorations of Mapuche masculinities the Mapurbe discussed women and their roles and positions within societies. Their discussions contrasted with other understandings of the hierarchical structure of Mapuche society that offers no equality for women (see below). Rather they explored women and roles as equal constructors in Mapurbe masculinities, thus rejecting sex-gender binaries. One participant argues:

Before, selling daughters into matrimony didn't exist. If a man was a machi, he could have a female attitude, it wasn't questioned. His body belonged to the spirits. It's the same thing you can see in the language, when one says "Bandurria" (bird) or "Trewa" (dog), you're not specifying whether it's a man or a woman. There's no gender. It's a machi, at the end of the day. The role is machi. Not wentru (man) or domo (woman). You're a machi or a lonko. There were also female lonkos. In the war, the men went to fight, so the women were ready to fill in their roles. Although, there were also women who went to war. Just like there were male weavers. This all happened before. There was no "oh, you're a woman this is your job". That came from colonialism. (*Diego*, 23).

The participants are looking to retrieve this network of roles and recreate the Mapuche social structure. They argue that Mapuche society is not a gendered hierarchy but a flat structure where roles are filled when needed by whoever is most capable:

There was everything, farmers, midwives. They existed. Every role must be filled. Fishermen. Powerful people who had money. And the Mapuches, we have always held a very rigid structure. Very hierarchical. But not a hierarchy in the way that you understand it. It is a hierarchy of respect. It's not "I'm in charge", no, it's a hierarchy of negotiation. But right now, all the roles aren't being filled. Not all the roles exist within the community, so we have to fill those roles. (Simon, 24)

The Mapurbe interviewed believe that the roles that most need filling are those of creator and teacher. A creator should produce cultural works that share the message and the plight of the Mapuche peoples and an educator should spread knowledge about this Mapuche culture and struggle to the younger generations. The Mapurbe participants had chosen to reject Chilean gender norms and fill the roles they believed were most necessary, choosing creative jobs or hobbies and helping to conserve their culture by passing traditions on to the youth, regardless of the gendered and sex biases associated with these tasks. As Diego explains:

It's not enough to just be part of the city. You can come here to work, to study, but it's not enough. You have to be creative. You have to become powerful in this way. Your own creativity is what will help you face all of this. And if you can't, you aren't filling the role your people need from you. We need creativity. It's the only way to educate the youth (*Diego*, 25.)

Each of the Mapurbe participants had taken on this role in a different way, though each engaged with their creativity in order to teach younger generations of Mapuche. Cristian is a drama teacher and also a playwright, he currently teaches young impoverished and disenfranchised Mapuche students. He describes work he has written that they are performing:

This work, it's my take on Romeo and Juliet. One family is from this side of the river; one family is from the other side. One family is Mapuche. The other is Chilean. (*Cristian*, 27)

Other Mapurbe have taken on roles that actively defy traditional understandings of hegemonic masculinity (Connell, 1996) and also the idea of gender roles (Buchbinder, 1994). Franco is a potter and whilst this has been seen recently as a woman's job, he has the appropriate skills to

fulfil this traditional role. Now he not only makes pottery, but teaches pottery classes to local children:

I do ceramics, I learned when I was living in Italy for five years. When I returned to Chile, I began to make a fusion between the Italian techniques, and a fusion with the style of the Mapuche culture. So I began to make new forms, they grew from the traditional but they were more, I incorporated new colours, but always with a profound loyalty to the Mapuche culture. It's to do with the Mapuche culture, or with my interpretation of that culture, with my lived experiences. (*Franco*, 29).

Other participants were also engaging in roles seen typically as women's roles, such as Diego, who in his part time is part of a traditional weaving group.

Weaving is part of the tradition, there's a group of 5 people, and we do the traditional initiation process. Others were learning and it caught my attention. I think it's necessary that you assume a role, the Mapuches have roles. Its wasn't authoritarian, no, each person had a role, so in this case I have taken up the role of weaving. It's a bridge between the past and the present. We only began last year, so right now the group isn't of such a high quality, but we hope to be teaching in the future. Men and women can weave. All Mapuche have the capacity and the knowledge. There is no problem. They tried to make a separation of knowledge, saying this job is for men and this job is for women. But if you go to the countryside you will see lots of women working, looking after the animals. (*Diego*, 25)

In fact, young Mapurbe men are themselves becoming engaged in feminism and rejecting the traditional patriarchal gender roles that had been imposed by colonialism and have been maintained by the Chilean state. Two of the participants are part of a feminist discussion group, attempting to design a system of Mapuche feminism.

Mapuche feminism is growing. Right now there aren't any organisations. So we are creating it, inventing a Mapuche feminism. Before nothing was written on Mapuche feminism. So we are writing it. (Simon, 24)

However, the Mapurbe do not believe that because they challenge hegemonic views of masculinity that they are marginalised. Rather, (re)constructing Mapuche masculinities is a form of resistance for the Mapurbe that allows them to protect their culture and ethnicity in the face of attempted assimilation by the state. However, within the literature resistance has often been reinterpreted as violence (see for example Collins, 2014 and Briones, 2007). A framing of the Mapurbe as a subculture associates their resistance with delinquency, with traditional views on subcultures understanding them as a "potential menace to social and racial welfare" (Lewis, 1933; 302). A focus on the Mapurbe as a resistant subculture has also led to academics ignoring the wider importance of role filling in order to focus on music and style. Rekedal (2014; 17) believes Mapurbe use hip hop to express their struggle, "when we talk about mapuchifying hip hop and poetry, we mean incorporating them into the culture. Through both these art forms they bring to light personal and collective struggles".

There are Mapurbe who engage with Western music styles such as rap and hip hop, but this is part of the wider role system. Several of the research participants have chosen the creative role of musician. Whilst this role may at first appear to be a contradiction of Mapurbe ideals as it is a "non-traditional" style of music, Mapurbe rap fulfils the role of education and creativity as it attracts the attention of young Mapuche and uses Mapudungun to educate them on Mapuche themes. Ruben, a Mapurbe rapper, explains:

Rap wasn't too important for my personal growth. I suppose it helped me become less introverted. I was introverted from all the bullying I received at school. But what is important is the way it touches other people. When people hear me rapping in Mapudungun it touches them as well. And they become interested in the cause. Lots of people have come to me after concerts and told me that its great what I am doing, because they have felt like that in the past too. (*Ruben, 24*)

Mapuche rap uses the same themes as other roles to promote education and creativity. Whilst it is non-traditional, the Mapurbe argue that in this case it is more important to use rap as a tool to attract youth to the cause, where traditional music cannot achieve this. As Franco puts it:

Its rap, but in Mapudungun. And they do this to get the attention of the children. They want to listen to reggaeton<sup>3</sup> and for them Mapuche music is boring because they don't understand it in its spiritual context. So we began to use our language in rap music. And from there we saw changes. They can enjoy this music but it also places them within our culture and language (*Franco*, 29)

Rap music was also Ruben's way into the Mapurbe movement. He heard a Mapuche rap song, realised that he too was a Mapuche and if he joined these people it could help him to discover his identity.

Rap is important to me. It's about oppression. It's about discrimination. Rap has its roots in discrimination. And discrimination is what most Mapuche have felt. You can link it to the cause and the sounds mix with the Mapuche culture. It's a form of rebellion (Ruben, 24)

Academics have often understood rap as a form of marginalised masculinity (Connell, 1996; Archer and Yamashita, 2010), showing resistance through aggression. When looking at the lyrics of Ruben's song "Without Dams" it would appear at first glance that they are encouraging violence:

If you want to destroy our land, then lets fight

The bio bio, Pehenche are in agony,

Patagonia is suffering,

Dams and Pylons,

Under the protection of the state, the private companies are making their invasion,

Brothers unite and don't allow them

To continue destroying the place where we live.

To keep fighting is our task.

(*My translation*)

However, Ruben argues that his lyrics are not encouraging violence, rather they are an attempt to rewrite history, to question the history that was written by the colonialists and to educate the

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Style of Latin Music

youth on themes surrounding the environment. In general, the Mapurbe are keen to emphasise that resistance is not related to violence, rather their resistance is passive.

You know they say the Mapuche are aggressive and all that, like warriors. In our community it's not like that. What we have first of all is respect for each other and value for the community. Mapuche don't have any reason to fight with each other. So, if you are fighting, something has happened to your identity. You are creating an image that you think is Mapuche, but it's not like that. It's a lack of information. (*Franco*, 29)

Within the interviews young Mapurbe men promote a masculinity centred on complementarity, thus positioning masculine and feminine roles as equal. However, within Mapurbe representations sex-gender binaries appear more pronounced. For example, in the above lyrics it is the "brothers" who are called to action against the crimes of the state and their action is likened to warrior behaviour through aggression. In comparison, in David Aniñir's poem, Mapurbe (quoted above) "mother" earth is described as sleeping passively and in need of protection by presumably male Mapurbe. Similarly, in Wenu Mapu (the rap song quoted in Chapter 2) the women and children are described as passively "wrenched" from the land, whilst the "brothers" are again called to arms. As such, whilst the Mapurbe are focused on (re)creating traditional Mapuche masculinities, it is clear that alternative forms of gender ideologies influence Mapurbe masculinities and as such Mapurbe masculinities are always hybrid.

#### Representations of Idealised Mapurbe Masculinities

Just as the Mapurbe were the only group to name themselves, during the photo elicitation they were the only group who used photographs of their own members to represent their concept of idealized Mapuche masculinities. The Mapurbe were also some of the only men to use photos of living Mapuche.

The most represented figure within the photo elicitation was poet David Aniñir, with six Mapurbe participants (*Ruben, Franco, Simon, Jaime, Roberto and Emilio*) choosing Aniñir to represent Mapuche masculinity. This is perhaps unsurprising as he started the Mapurbe movement. Other Mapurbe who have been key in the movement were also selected by participants. For example, two participants (*Diego and Fernando*) selected the Mapurbe rapper Waikil as a representation of Mapuche masculinity. The reasons given for such selections were

centred around their cultural creation, rather than any hyper-masculine qualities. For example, Ruben argues:

David (Aniñir) created this, he created the (*Mapurbe*) movement. Started this whole thing and now it's spreading to the youth. That's what we should be doing. That's what we should all be aiming to do. (*Ruben, 24*)



Figure 1: Photograph of Mapuche poet David Aniñir (Ruben, 24)



Figure 2 Image taken from the internet of Mapuche poet David Aniñir (Franco, 29)

# Diego argues that:

Waikil always raps in Mapudungun. He spreads that love and knowledge to the youth. He's the one who's getting our cause out there. That's what Mapuche men must do. (Diego, 25)

Other participants (*Hector and Sebastian*) used images of themselves or their friends in traditional situations or dress to represent Mapuche masculinity.



Figure 3: Image taken from the internet of Mapuche rap artist Waikil (Fernando, 16)



Figure 4: Photograph of Mapuche rap artist Waikil (Diego, 25)



Figure 5: Photograph of a friend in traditional Mapuche dress (Hector, 16)

Franco chose a more abstract image of his own pottery, to represent Mapuche masculinity, then uses this to expand on more generalised ideas surrounding masculinities:

He has his arms open, he is supposed to be singing. But now I see, he can be a real Mapuche man. He has his arms open, helping. For example, recently it was time to harvest wheat and in this time the whole community comes to help. First comes a

neighbour, a cousin comes to help. We all go to help and then they would come and help you. (Franco, 29).



Figure 6: Photograph taken "Wentru Singing" (Franco, 29)



Figure 7: A belt weaved in the traditional fashion worn by Franco (Source: Author)

Therefore, the Mapurbe interviewed represent an idealised Mapuche masculinity through ideas of creativity, education and other traditional traits such as helpfulness, challenging hegemonic representations of their masculinity. The Mapurbe also try and promote this traditional identity in the way they represent themselves. Whilst the Mapurbe are not a subculture they do have an identifiable style. Within their Mapuche communities on the outskirts of Santiago or when participating in Mapuche cultural activities, they wear traditional Mapuche attire. The women wear a chamal - a typical Mapuche dress - whilst the men wear trousers and a poncho. Even in day to day life, the Mapurbe are keen to express their identity through a particular style. Whilst all of the men wore western style clothing to our interviews, there was still an attempt to 'ethnicize' their clothing. Every participant wore some item of weaved Mapuche clothing, usually a belt. Beyond this, the Mapurbe interviewed also wear what the fashion industry defines as "ethnic print" clothing, briefly summarised as loose fitting, brightly coloured

clothing, with a repetitive 'tribal' pattern. This is a deliberate attempt to reinforce an indigenous identity through a bohemian style associated with environmental respect.

Thus, the Mapurbe express masculinities that promote traditionalist gender ideals of role filling and complementarity. However, these masculinities are hybrid in that they are still influenced within representations by concepts of sex-gender binaries that position women as passive and men as active. Defining the Mapurbe as a subculture has led to a limited focus on style and music and an interpretation of the Mapurbe as intent on violent resistance. However, the Mapurbe participants' rejection of traditional gender norms means they cannot be reduced to any of Connell's categories of masculinity. Their Mapurbe masculinities are focused on creativity and education and rebalancing traditional gender ideals that contradict western gender norms. These roles are promoted for both political and cultural reasons; the Mapurbe use creative and educative roles in order to resist the violence of (neo)colonialism and to express their cultural identities. The focus by academics on the Mapurbe as a subculture has led to other groups, who do not fit such extreme or essentialist identities being neglected by researchers. The reality is that there are multiple Mapuche masculinities that are practised by various Mapuche youths that diverge and intersect with each other at varying points.

## Boarding School Students: Blood Ties and Land Based Masculinities

An alternative set of masculinities was identified during the research within a group of Mapuche boarding school students in Temuco. Frequently in Temuco young Mapuche are sent from their rural homes to urban boarding schools in order to study. This phenomenon has been discussed by Radcliffe and Webb (2015, 2016) but this work has been framed mostly in terms of civic identity. Within Chilean discourse, urban Mapuche from Temuco are usually subsumed within the rural Mapuche, due to Temuco's proximity to the countryside, or they are understood as marginalized urban citizens with an eroded ethnicity. However, my research suggests that these young men can also be understood as having their own complex and nuanced masculinities that differ from those of the Mapurbe or the rural Mapuche.

Unlike the Mapurbe, the students did not self-identify as Mapuche or Chilean in a consistent way. Instead they flipped between describing themselves as Mapuche and as Chilean depending on the context. This relates to a much more conflictual identification than was

present within the Mapurbe. The students see their identity as a complex mix between Mapuche and Chilean, indigenous and western and urban and rural. Each of the focus groups revealed that they feel an equal amount of connection to the Mapuche and the Chilean identity. However, having such a mixed identity is not an unusual or complex thing, rather it is the way they have always felt and they are surrounded by peers who have the same mixed experience:

Felipe: We're a mix.

Vincente, Pablo and Javier nod in agreement.

*Interviewer:* Do you feel different because of this?

Pablo: No, it's normal, all of us here are a mix

Vincente: Here we are all Mapuche (an explanation that everyone in the boarding house

shares a Mapuche heritage)

Javier: it's always been very easy

*Pablo:* Here its common, it's the majority. It's like all the roots come from there (*the Mapuche*). But we're different. I, for example, don't know anyone in my class who isn't Mapuche. But most of them, they listen to rap, hip hop, reggaeton, rock, all that. (*Focus Group 2*)

The students are between the ages of 16 and 19 and have come to the city to receive an education. They are the first generation of their families to leave the countryside and most of them only moved to the city as teenagers. Within the city they stay in publicly-funded boarding schools from Monday to Friday. However, despite having spent a large part of their youth in the countryside the students have limited interest in the Mapuche culture; in fact, they see it as dying (discussed below). This contrasts with the Mapurbe who believe that the culture is still living and that they are playing a key part in rejuvenating it.

For the students the Mapudungun language is a marker of Mapuche culture and its loss has a great implication for Mapuche society:

*Felipe:* For example, when I was younger my grandparents told me stories. And in our school, as well, they taught us things about the Mapuche, like Mapudungun. But Mapudungun is getting lost. Naturally they teach more English here. So obviously the culture cannot survive without the language. Everything will be lost. (*Focus Group 2*)

However, the students do not show any particularly strong feelings about what they perceive

to be the loss of the Mapuche culture. To them culture is intrinsically linked to the "traditional"

understandings of Mapuche culture and these are bound to be lost in modern Chilean society.

I feel between the two, but the Mapuche culture is getting lost. I don't feel sad about it.

I mean, it's interesting I guess. Well, it's pretty when you can speak Mapudungun. But

the older generations don't teach it to their grandchildren anymore. I guess it's bad,

they should teach it to them. But Chile is finished with the Mapuche. (Luis, 17).

Both the Mapurbe and the students believe a 'true' Mapuche culture is bound up with traditions

such as palin (the Mapuche sport), wentri pantu (Mapuche new year), flakutun, (transmission

of paternal grandfather's name to the grandson) and the nguilltun (agrarian rites). However,

unlike the Mapurbe, who try to protect them, these traditions do not represent the students'

own identity and they claim they will not be sad if these cultures are lost. Furthermore, whilst

the students spent much of their childhood in the countryside, their knowledge of traditional

Mapuche culture is very limited, as the discussion in Focus Group 1 illustrates:

*Interviewer:* Are you interested in the spiritual side of the Mapuche culture?

Matias: No

David: The Mapuche ceremonies?

*Aejandro:* We do do them

*Matias:* We do Wentripantu (*Mapuche New Year*)

*Tomas:* Yes, we celebrate that in the school here.

*Alejandro*: We also play that traditional game (referring to Palin)

*Tomas:* Hey, what's that ceremony called, the one where you exchange things?

David: ummm?

Tomas: (Laughing) No, it has another name. You have to bring something and

somebody else brings something and you have to swap it with the other person

David: Yeah.

Tomas: What's that called?

David: Interchange of things!

Tomas: Yeah. (Focus Group 1)

ጸጓ

The fact that these students have attended such ceremonies and are thus linked to Mapuche 'traditions' means that they are often identified as the 'true' rural Mapuche, even though their knowledge is limited (Briones, 2007), whilst the Mapurbe are limited to an urban subculture. Willis argues that there

"has not been a vigorous analysis of the status of the culture a subculture is supposed to be 'sub' to. The notion implies a relative positioning which seems to give an altogether misleading sense of absoluteness and dominance of the main culture" (1972; xiv).

The Mapuche have been essentialised by some academics (Aravena, Gissi, and Toledo, 2005; Arce et al, 2002) by describing students as "more" Mapuche than the Mapurbe because of their location in the Mapu territories and participation in ceremonies. This disregards the fact that many students do not understand the ceremonies they are participating in, whilst the Mapurbe have a good understanding of the traditional Mapuche culture. However, occasionally the students did attempt to show their knowledge of Mapuche traditions, despite its limits:

Camilo: This culture is dying out, completely.

Marcos: But in the countryside it's not dying, a lot of people celebrate it.

Camilo: They do still do it, but only a few of them, not the majority.

*Marcos:* Not a lot of people go to Nguillatun.

Camilo tries to correct his pronunciation

Bruno: It's a Mapuche ceremony.

Marcos: Nguillatun is Mapuche New Year (he has confused this with Wentripantu,

*Nguillatun is a fertility ritual).* 

(Focus group 5)

However, whilst the students believe that these cultural traditions may be dying, they believe that the true markers associated with being Mapuche are blood and ties to the land, in contrast to the Mapurbe who identify through cultural traditions. Thus, these young students still identify as Mapuche despite their lack of cultural knowledge. For example, in Focus Group 4 participants discussed their pride in their Mapuche surnames:

*Mauricio:* I'm Chilean and Mapuche. Both. I have Mapuche blood. I come from the land.

Interviewer: What does it mean to have Mapuche blood?

*Mauricio:* That you carry the name, the name of your family. That you're from a Mapuche family.

*Interviewer:* Is the Mapuche culture being lost?

*Hector:* No, because we have the surname.

Claudio: We're proud of that.

*Mauricio:* Do you know what my name means? It means four snakes.

*Gabriel:* Mine is a name that means something like warrior, like from an army. They told me a lot of stories about it, but now I've forgotten.

(Focus Group 4)

Those who don't have a Mapuche surname felt the need to emphasise their Mapucheness through other means.

*Pablo:* We don't have a very Mapuche surname, but I swear our great-grandmother was a machi. Our grandparents were also Mapuches. (Focus Group 2)

Thus, the students and the Mapurbe express Mapuche identity differently. Mapuche membership since the early 1990s no longer fits traditional categories formed by ethnographers (for example Bengoa, 1985), (tradition, pristine, rural), rather Mapucheness is a process of sociocultural creation. Identification as Mapuche is a relational and dynamic process and the categories are constructed within distinct social groups. The Mapuche students' understanding of masculinity contrasts with the Mapurbe. Whilst the Mapurbe believe Mapuche masculinity is related to preserving the culture, the students believe that a Mapuche masculinity comes not from actions but from their ethnic ties. They have a sense of Mapuche masculinity that differs from the Mapurbe in being closer to stereotypical representations of associations with strength and violence. For example, they associate 'coming from the land' with strength:

Interviewer: What does it mean to come from the land?

Camilo: Pure work.

Rodrigo: Pure work with strength. Strength. (Focus Group 5)

The students, unlike the Mapurbe are very interested in fighting; and believe it is within the Mapuche nature to fight. Fighting is another trait associated with "coming from the land" and is something they actively sought out. The boys in Focus Group 4 spent much of their interview discussing their love of fighting:

*Carlos*: Here in Chile there aren't many real men. They are all faggots. If you hit a woman you're a faggot. In the land there are real men. Here in the school, if someone pisses me off, they'll go flying at the wall.

Mauricio: We are made to fight.

Carlos: Are there fleites<sup>4</sup> in England?

*Mauricio*: Here there are loads of fleites, but they're all mouth. In the end they won't do anything.

Carlos: I dunno, there are some scary ones. Some of them they're dangerous. Its ok though, in Temuco they're scared if you have Mapuche blood. In Temuco, one time, some bastards came over, and we were in a group and the bastards were drunk, and they arrived shouting like "ahhh". But I'm Mapuche. I come from the land. And I was without anything, I was just in trainers and shorts. But one of them had Jordan branded trainers. And we began to fight, and I was born in the land, and I'm Mapuche. I was like "seriously, you want to fight with me? A pleasure. It's a pleasure to fight with you." And they looked at me like this (scared). And I told him give me your Jordan trainers. And he did. And then he went running. And I'm Mapuche. I'm from the land. So I take off my shoes to fight. And off they went. Mapuches are stronger you see. We are from the land. (Focus Group 4)

Thus, while the students claimed the Mapuche culture was being lost through the rejection of traditions, their sense of Mapuche identity remains strong through their blood ties and Mapuche surnames. The students centred their conversations around violence and suggested that being a fighter was a natural identity that comes with the Mapuche surname. Whether these young men actually practised fighting or engaged with violence within their daily lives is questionable. Beyond there descriptions there is no evidence to suggest each of the young men did or did not partake in violence. Whilst violence may not be an activity these young men regularly participate in it was an important performance of masculinity they chose to enact in

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> A derogatory term for members of the working class, similar to current usage of "Chav" in English.

front of their peers and myself, as such it was a masculinity they wanted to perform. The young students believed this was a traditional Mapuche masculinity. In contrast they rejected other cultural performances that the Mapurbe support in place of individual characteristics, such as strength and the ability to fight, despite whether they actually portrayed these characteristics in their everyday lives. The young students' lack of interest in learning Mapuche traditions was linked to their suggestion that they need not actively seek out a Mapuche identity as a "fighters" identity was naturally present within all Mapuche. They associate fighting with traditional Mapuche masculinities and enjoy performing this stereotype when discussing their Mapuche identities. One explanation for this difference in understanding may be the difference in age between these two groups. The Mapurbe are on average slightly older than the students and so may be less prone to act 'hard' in front of their friends and perform a certain violent masculinity. The Mapurbe, believe that this idea stems from colonialism. It could be that the idea comes from both Western understandings of hegemonic masculinity and essentialist ideas of what it means to be Mapuche. In a popular westernised culture exemplars of hegemonic masculinity can be found in the form of the hero, associated with strength, represented in "sagas, ballads, westerns, thrillers, in books, films, television and in sporting events" (Donaldson, 1993; 646). Some Mapurbe (Franco, Jorge and Sebastian) saw practicing violence as subscribing to the Chilean government's construction of the Mapuche as violent terrorists, guilty of arson and crimes against the state (Richards, 2010). In contrast, the students explain their behaviour as traditional because it was also behaviour exhibited by their grandparents:

*Alejandro:* We still keep our weapons in the house, just in case. The Mapuches were always like this. If a stranger enters your house, you're going to kill them. The Mapuches guard their houses. If someone if robbing your house, you kill them.

David: Yeah, but not now.

*Alejandro:* Its difficult, my grandparents are a completely different thing. Defending their house. It was another kind of life. It's gone.

David: Now we're more Chilean (Focus group 1)

However, despite David's claim they are now more Chilean, the students argue that when they return to the countryside, or 'the land' on the weekend, their nights out are centred around fighting.

*Interviewee:* Are there parties at the weekend?

Carlos: In the countryside, oh yeah!

Mauricio: Clandestinos! (Underground)

Carlos: There is (sings and mocks dancing)

Participant 2: Just pure parties, everywhere, with your friends. And its certain that there

will be a mosch.

Interviewer: What's a mosch?

*Gabriel*: Fights!

Mauricio: We always go for the fights. In the countryside we are more brutish.

Gabriel: We are pure brutes.

Carlos: And we dance, but we dance pure reggaeton, doggy style. (Focus Group 4)

Whilst the students have strong opinions on what it means to be a Mapuche man, their understandings are for the most part internalised in ethnic identities of blood and surname, which can be related to the mythologizing of the warrior trope. In contrast, their everyday attire reflected their individual styles, adapted from Western Subcultures.

*Emilio:* I like darker things, I like to dress gothic, but in makeup, no.

Roberto: Me too, I like dark clothes, but I don't like the makeup either.

Fernando: I like electronic music, rock as well, classic English rock.

Emilio: I like rock too, and reggaeaton.

Roberto: I like rock as well, and there are a lot of good rap groups.

Hector: Green day.

Emilio: Arctic Monkeys.

Fernando: I like the Artic Monkeys as well. And Imagine Dragons (Focus Group 3)

In comparison with the Mapurbe, the student's everyday style disguised their Mapuche identity. Their language and speech patterns were similar to the Chilean working class. Whilst David Aniñir also uses these patterns as a form of resistance within his poetry describing is as Fleitedungun<sup>5</sup>, within the student groups it was difficult to see this as anything other than an expression of working class Chileaness, due to their lack of knowledge about the Mapurbe and Aniñir's poetry. The boarding school students' understandings of Mapuche masculinity as

<sup>5</sup> A play on the term Fleite and Mapudungun, Aniñir mixes the Mapudungun and Fleite languguages to create new words.

influenced by ethnicity through ties to blood and land is revealed through their chosen representations of Mapuche masculinities.

Representations of Idealised Boarding School Student Mapuche Masculinities

The students' representations of masculine identity differ greatly from the Mapurbe representations. Their representations are based on dead warriors as opposed to living Mapuche. Every photograph provided by the students was a representation of either Caupolican (3 images: Vincente, Alejandro, Matias) or Lautaro (15 images: Tomas, David, Felipe, Pablo, Javier, Gabriel, Mauricio, Carlos, Claudio, Marcos, Camilo, Bruno and Rodrigo). Caupolican was the Mapuche military leader who led the first uprising against the conquistadors between 1553 and 1555. He was elected as leader after he held up a tree trunk for three consecutive days and nights and led successful campaigns until he was impaled by the Spaniards in 1558. Caupolican fits the students' understandings of masculinity because he was from the land and showed a strength and desire to fight. Similarly, Lautaro is revered for his resistance against the Spanish conquistadors and is considered the first Mapuche general. He learnt Spanish military ways whilst serving Pedro de Valdivia and then used this to lead the Mapuche to many victories in battle. However, whilst the students revered these Mapuche heroes, again their knowledge of details is limited:

*Carlos:* Lautaro is my hero. Apart from Pinilla<sup>6</sup> (*laughs*). He was a warrior. I know that he sent the Spanish running.

*Mauricio:* He conquered the Spanish, shooting arrows. They were the ones who conquered the lands, here in the ninth region, but Lautaro was one of the leaders. And he won.

Carlos: There was a war here, did you know that? (Focus Group 4)

The students use the stories of Lautaro and Caupolican to support their own association of Mapuche masculinity with force and fighting. For example:

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Professional Chilean Football Player

*Vincente*: I remember when I was young, I read a lot of stories about Lautauro, about I dunno, Caupolican. I found them amazing, for example, the wars between the Mapuche and the Spanish. These warriors were never defeated. I find them admirable.

*Pablo*: They defended their lands, even though the Spanish had advanced weapons. I think that yes, we do have warrior blood.

*Vincente:* I think so. Because a person with Mapuche roots, I think is much better than a person from the city. They are braver. *(Focus Group 2)*.



Figure 8: Image of a Statue of Lautaro (Carlos, Focus Group 4)



Figure 9: Painting of Lautaro (Pablo, Focus Group 2)



Figure 10: Photograph of a Statue of Caupolican (Vincente, Focus Group 2)



Figure 11: Photograph of Caupolican Avenue (Alejandro, Focus Group 1)

Thus, the students and the Mapurbe have two conflicting ideas on what it means to be a Mapuche man. Both are centred around what they believe to be traditional understandings of Mapuche masculinity, however one is focused on culture and one is focused on ethnicity. Although, among the young students there is a distinction between performance and every day practice of masculinities. This shows how much masculinity can vary, even within one ethnic group. This reality becomes even more stark when looking at other social groups who reject Mapuche 'traditional' masculinities altogether.

## Young Mapuche Professional Masculinities

Young Mapuche professionals rarely feature in academic studies (cf. Park and Richards, 2007). It could be assumed that this absence is related to the cultural objectification and fetishisation that has occurred, where academics prefer to view indigenous cultures as exotic and inherently different from Western cultures (see Whorf, 1956 and Cohn, 1987). Mapuche who have immersed themselves in everyday Chilean life are often rejected by other Mapuche as 'Awinkado'. The term Winka means 'untrue man' and is reserved for European men or foreigners. Winka initially was a derogatory term, if you are not Mapuche or 'true man' then you must be an 'untrue man', thus, to be Awinkado, meant to be 'contaminated' by the dominant culture or to abandon traditions (Collins, 2014). However, this research shows that young Mapuche professionals in Temuco express hybrid masculinities that are at once Chilean and Mapuche, but are experienced differently to those of the Mapurbe and of the young students.

Like the students, the young professionals identify as mixed, with the majority of the young professionals having been raised in the countryside. As Nicolas describes:

Well, I'm a Mapuche, but really I'm mestiza. I have a Mapuche surname. My father is the Lonko of my community. I was born in the community and I lived all my childhood there. I was very integrated in the community; my father is in charge of the nguillatuns. (Nicolas, 26)

However, unlike the Mapurbe and the students, the young professionals prioritise their Chilean identity above their Mapuche identity, in order to actively participate fully in Chilean life:

But now I work and so I am really integrated into Chilean life. From a young age, when you travel to school, just like everyone else, the Mapuche get converted. From studying, one begins to relate more with the Chileans. We share everything with the Chileans, there is no difference between us. So I'm more Chilean. And this is how it is, because the tradition is lost. (*Nicolas*, 26)

Whilst the young professionals recognise that they have Mapuche roots, they believe there is no inherent difference between the Mapuche and Chileans. These young professionals represent a direct contrast to Anzaldua's (2007; 100) New Mestiza, those who are "torn between ways". Anzaldua argues that hybrid cultures are faced with the problem of which part of their culture to listen to, complicated by multiple opposing messages. However, the young professionals see their Chilean and Mapuche identity as one, not in conflict with each other. As Francisco suggests:

In reality I'm a mix. I'm a Mapuche, but there's no difference between Mapuche and Chilean. There are no different qualities. (Francisco, 23)

However, this reality often leads young Mapuche men to be ignored by both the Chilean government and academics. The Concertacion government view Chile's indigenous "primarily as a marginal sector of the Chilean nation with distinctive cultural traditions, not as separate distinctive peoples with collective rights" (Haughney, 2012; 201). They aim to bring marginalized sectors of the population into the Chilean version of the globalized economy and with such young professionals, this aim has been to some extent successful.

Many professional participants refer to Chilean culture as 'normal', essentially museumising the Mapuche culture as something extraordinary. It was also common for these men to describe the Mapuche in the third person and to differentiate themselves. For example:

Every two years there is a nguillatun, but regularly it's just like a *normal* life. It's like Chilean, you have to buy things in the supermarket. I think its lost because we are too *civilized.* (Francisco, 23, my emphasis)

The young professionals, like the students, believe that the only thing remaining signifying a Mapuche identity is the surname. Just as with the students, they believe the loss of

Mapudungun has had a lasting damaging effect on the Mapuche people. However, unlike the students they do not believe that any inherent characteristics remain based on attachments to blood and land; rather, they believe the differences between the Mapuche and the Chileans have been erased. For example, Miguel suggests:

Now when we talk of the culture, there isn't really much point. When you speak about culture you speak about what you carry inside. Imagine that all of Araucania belonged to the Mapuche people. What culture do they have? Chilean. If you speak about the Mapuche, what are you really speaking about, what values? Nobody speaks Mapudungun. There are the surnames, but the culture is lost. The fight for the land might go on longer. But that fight is just for the land. Not for the culture. There's a phrase, it's like Palestinian, they don't have any land, so it's a crazy phase, I find it really beautiful "Palestine is carried on the soul of your shoes", it means that it doesn't matter where you are, you still have your culture. This isn't the Mapuche way. Our culture is dead. (Miguel, 26)

The young professionals often blamed this loss of culture on the Chilean capitalist system. Many believe that the Mapuche culture cannot survive alongside capitalism when the ideologies are so conflicting. For example, Pietro describes how the belief the Mapuche are lazy arose from conflicts with capitalism:

They call the Mapuche lazy, because it's a western way of looking at it, they worked, but they didn't spend all day working, this isn't being lazy. But in the capitalist system not working all hours of the day for your whole life is considered lazy. They fed themselves, they didn't have a bigger dream, but you can't be like that in the capitalist system. Think about it, loads of Mapuche get sick, even though they have a Machi living close, there are illnesses that the Mapuche can't cure. Because those illnesses don't come from the Mapuche culture. Illnesses like cancer and depression don't come from the Mapuche culture. They are illnesses that the Mapuche didn't have. (*Pietro*, 25)

However, despite the prominent belief that the Mapuche culture is dead, the young professionals have knowledge about Mapuche culture. Many were raised in the countryside and when they were younger actively participated in this culture. Unlike the students, the

professionals can explain the ceremonies as well as the everyday activities of what anthropologists believe to be traditional Mapuche culture. Francisco explains the Mapuche ceremonies in detail:

There is wentripantu, that's Mapuche new year. Here its normally the first of January, but we begin a new circle around the 23<sup>rd</sup> or 24<sup>th</sup> of June, that's our new year. It's the most important festival for us. Nguillatun is a special ceremony, it's to make rain, to improve fertility. I used to go, its every two years, but we divided it between two communities so every four years it was our turn (*Francisco*, 25)

Whilst these young professionals know much about Mapuche culture they have actively chosen to promote Chilean culture above it. One participant, in contrast with Mapurbe ideals of complementarity, argued that the Mapuche culture is inherently sexist, disagreeing with the Mapurbe belief that the culture is gender neutral:

There are people, myself included, who feel that the Mapuche culture is too structured. It's too conservative. It's a people with a very rigid social structure. There is a structure from top to bottom. It's a social pyramid. There are a lot of people who have a bad time, because of machismo, because of aggressive fathers. And there are many cases where the children get fed up, they begin to hate the culture. They take their stuff and they leave, they've spent their whole childhood hating the countryside, so they go and they don't want to live like Mapuche anymore... I literally hate it. I like my life more in the city. (Alexis, 29)

Perhaps for this reason some young Mapuche professionals do not seem concerned by the loss of culture, in the same way the Mapurbe are.

The young professionals have actively embraced the Chilean lifestyle and see true masculinity as fulfilling the role of provider, mediated by cash derived from participation in the capitalist labour force (Bernard, 1981). Hegemonic Chilean masculinity is based around the idea of machismo, in which the male is the provider for his dependents, being the main breadwinner within the family. As Mumby (1998) argues: "In this context work is defined as a means to an end, rather than as an end in itself. Working class masculinity is thus constructed as hegemonic through a presentation of self as head of a stable, tranquil and natural family life. Such

responsibility is a defining feature of manhood" (Mumby, 1998, 176). Francisco describes the pursuit of salaried labour:

Before, indigenous people never left the countryside. They were born there, they stayed there and they never left. They grew potatoes. But now we want a salary. Nowadays there is education, so the young people leave, they leave the community to move forward, because in the countryside there is no way to move forward, you have to accept the world of the city to move forward. You can get a good salary in the city. You have to do that for your family. Now we are united with the winka. There is no difference. (*Fransisco*, 23).

The young professionals do not necessarily disagree that previously there was a traditional Mapuche masculinity, but they believe that this has died with the increasing interest in material possessions. However, they don't necessarily see this as a negative thing. Rather, they believe that performing Chilean masculinities is more suited to 21<sup>st</sup> century realities, whilst performances of Mapuche masculinities are more suited to the past. The young professionals believe that a Chilean masculinity is more beneficial economically than a Mapuche masculinity, as they believe it gives them more access to material goods that benefit their lives. The young professionals identify as modern men and as such being Mapuche is less relevant to them. As Patricio suggests:

In the past people just needed to get their bread for the day, you grew potatoes to get you through the year. That's all your family needed from you. We never thought about commercialising products. There wasn't much competence. Until the west brought tractors and chemicals. Now you can make more money and you can build a house, you can buy a car, you can buy your family a computer. You can make a better life for them. (*Patricio*, 31)

However, many young professionals also saw their engagement within the Chilean labour system as a form of resistance against the Chilean state and the state's perpetuation of Mapuche stereotypes. Park and Richards (2007; 1319) argue that that "Mapuche workers possess a hybrid subjectivity that leads them to engage in both resistance and consent in their daily work lives. They use state resources strategically for what they feel is movement gain, and are often reflexive about the possibilities of co-optation". The Mapuche professionals interviewed here

believe they are resisting because of their continual survival and their economic progress within the state system. This allows them to contest stereotypes of Mapuche men as poor, drunk and violent. These men take pride in being successful in a system that has historically disadvantaged them. As Nicolas argues:

The Mapuche came from the bottom. Nothing was easy. We didn't come from a high socioeconomic position. We come from the lowest of the low. But we have the capacity of being strong. Slowly we are entering in spaces. 20 years ago you wouldn't see a single Mapuche in any office. Mapuche have finished technical courses, university, masters, PhDs. You have to be an example to future generations. (*Nicolas*, 26).

These young professionals believe it is inevitable that the Mapuche will adapt to the Chilean state and move out of poverty:

I believe that they adapt. It's just like the conflict in Araucania. Before we were very badly treated. In every aspect there was discrimination. I'm not complaining about what happened, it's just what happened. So there were a lot of invasions. But they adapted and now we have educated people. And you see people of every type, engineers, every kind of Mapuche professional. So I will tell you the Mapuche are capable of living in whatever system you put in front of them. (*Alexis*, 29)

Thus, these participants have assimilated and adapted to mainstream views about the role of men as providers in a capitalist economy. The representations the young professionals used to represent an idealised Mapuche masculinity are more traditional than their performance of their masculinities, however they argue that these images are representations of past masculinities.

### Representations of Idealised Young Mapuche Masculinities

When discussing Mapuche masculinities the young professional participants, like the students, focus on representations from the past. However, unlike the students, these men are not upheld as idols, who one would aspire to be like, but rather almost mythological heroes from a past that had limited relevance to how one should live today. Whilst the same tone of awe is used, the young professionals used Lautaro as a means to criticise the laziness of today's Mapuche, whilst the young students focused on similarities such as strength. Five people (*Francisco*,

Patricio, Pietro, Nicolas and Miguel) use similar images of Lautaro to the students. Francisco explains his choice of Lautaro:

Lautaro is one of the most important characters in Mapuche history. He led the Mapuche people and was a true warrior. He represented the Mapuche values in the olden days. He was strong and brave. Even though the Spaniards had armour and everything, Lautaro fought and won with just basic weapons. If there were warriors like him now, we might have got our lands back. But now people are just too lazy to fight really. (*Francisco*, 23).



Figure 12: This image is another representation of Lautaro. Many of the representations of Lautaro were based on this same painting, painted by the Chilean painter Pedro Subercaseaux, entitled "El Joven Lautaro" (The Young Lautaro). It is one of the most famous representations of Lautaro (Francisco, 23)

When asked about modern exemplars of Mapuche masculinity it was argued that these did not exist.

People are made famous when they die. So now there are none. You know Matias Catrileo<sup>7</sup>, the young guy they killed, well if he was still alive he wouldn't be anybody. So I think you have to die to be a hero. And only then will you be inspirational. The

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Matias Catrileo was a Mapuche student who was shot by the Chilean police during a violent protest n Santiago in defense of Mapuche prisoners.

future will make you a leader. So right now no Mapuche heroes exist. I guess Matias Catrileo for some people. Not me though. (Wilson, 30)



Figure 13: This image is a banner from a protest in Santiago after the killing of Matias Catrileo, it reads "Matias Catrileo, Warrior of the Mapuche Nation" (Wilson, 30)

Only one interviewee provided an image of a living Mapuche who they felt represented their Mapuche masculinity. The image Alexis chose is that of Marcelo Salas:

We have a footballer, Marcelo Salas. He was a Mapuche footballer, he played in the world cup and he played in England, he was really well known. When he scored a goal, everyone said, he's Mapuche, he has the blood of the Araucania, the strength of the Araucania, so in those days everyone in Araucania identified with him, not just the Mapuche. He really showed that the Mapuche could do anything. (*Alexis*, 29)

Alexis celebrates Marcelo Salas as a hero not just for the Mapuche but for all the people of Araucania. He is celebrated not because of his skills of strength, but because Marcelo Salas gained fame and respect. Salas transcended his Mapuche identity to become a Chilean hero, which was important for Alexis. Marcelo Salas is similar to the young professionals, having Mapuche roots but also being Chilean, so much so that he played for the Chilean national team in the world cup, becoming a national hero.



Figure 14: Marcelo Salas in the 1998 world cup playing for Chile (Alexis, 29)

### Conclusions

This chapter has argued that even between urban Mapuche youth understandings of masculinity differ widely. The Mapurbe interviewed in this research understand Mapuche masculinity as a non-gendered attempt at a return to a traditional culture. They reject gender-sex binaries and perform roles based on education and creativity that they believe are necessary within their community. Masculinity is positioned as complementary to femininity. Young Mapuche students also perform traditional concepts of masculinity but they relate more to a masculinity associated with ethnic concepts of roots. This performance focuses on displays of strength which are described as naturally linked to the land. However, whilst the young students were keen to perform these identities, it is questionable as to whether they were part of everyday practices. The young Mapuche professionals reject traditional Mapuche concepts of masculinity, rather their performed masculinities are based upon the man as a provider. They argue that Mapuche men must adapt in order to economically advance within society and provide for their families. However, these masculinities, whilst distinct, are also porous, with each group having some similarities that come as a reaction to hegemonic Chilean culture.

Rather than defining these masculinities within the boundaries provided by Connell, as a fixed masculinity belonging to a fixed subgroup, it is more apt to view these masculinities as flexible and hybrid, through which men can move depending on different times and states, and as intrinsically linked to each other. Fineman (2013) argues that these flexible masculinities are the result of intersecting identities. He dismisses the category of men as too essentialising and argues that

"Individual men should not only be seen as men, but also seen as situated along axes of interacting hierarchies of race and class in particular and perhaps also differences in ability, ethnicity age, or religion. Therefore, it is as important to distinguish among men and look at the ways in which different men are both differently subordinated and differently privileged within dominant cultural, legal and socially imposed understandings of masculinity through those hierarchies."

The next two chapters will set forward two reasons why these hybrid masculinities have developed. The research will explore how ethnicity, class and place have all intersected and influenced young urban Mapuche men in different ways, resulting in the performance and representation of a variety of Mapuche masculinities.

## **Chapter 5. Mapuche Youth in Place: Urban and Rural Masculinities**

### Introduction

Today it is estimated that out of a Mapuche population of 1 million, 70% live in urban conglomerations. Of this 1 million people, 44% live in Santiago, with only 15% of all Mapuche living in Chile's 9<sup>th</sup> region, identified as the traditional Mapuche heartland. Despite this urban migration there still remains an assumption within Chilean state policy that the Mapuche are a rural people (see Aylwin, 1998; and Morton, 2004). This belief stems from traditional understandings of Mapuche as the people of the land and the idea that indigeneity is incongruous with modern, urban life (Bengoa, 1985; Boccara, 2002). The Mapuche have also been seen by some academics as a rural indigenous people (for example, MacDonald, 2014 and Skjaevestad, 2008). As discussed previously, Mapuche folklore defines the Mapuche as "the people" who are inextricably bound to the land, with their name meaning 'people of the land' and the Mapudungun language understood as the language of the land. Land is understood by the Mapuche not just in terms of soil, but in terms of the Mapuche territory in a broader sense. However, this view of Mapuche identity risks essentialism and ignores the complexities of contemporary Mapuche ethnicity. It has also led to internal discrimination among Mapuche people that has juxtaposed 'pure' and ethnic identities with urban and 'impure' identities, positioning urban indigenous lifeways as less legitimate (see Imilan Ojeda, 2008 and Redekal 2014).

The Mapurbe youth interviewed in this research demonstrate that urban areas can be spaces of indigenous resilience and cultural innovation. They reject the idea that urban migration means assimilation and instead build communities and reformulate both western and indigenous institutions and practices that support their indigenous identities. Mapuche indigeneity survives, adapts and innovates in modern cities. The Mapurbe youth are experiencing what Sahlins calls the "indigenisation of modernity" (1999; ii) by creating their own space in the world cultural order within Santiago. This in some way explains the culturally defined masculinities explored in the previous chapter. However, this does not mean that Mapuche masculinity can be reduced to a generalised urban indigenous masculinity. The young students interviewed in Temuco, whilst also living in an urban centre, have very different understandings of Mapuche masculinity. This is not based on urban culture, given the fact that they view Temuco as a city empty of cultural identity. Rather, their masculinity is formed by

their proximity to rural culture and their ability to return to their familial lands, which the Mapurbe have lost. Their Mapuche identity stems from this association with rurality and the Mapuche warrior culture that they believe accompanies it.

This research suggests that Mapuche masculinities are inextricably bound with both the rural and the urban. The participants are influenced both by their rural roots and their urban lifeworld. Mapuche people can be considered to have a strong notion of place-identity (Proshansky et al., 1983), meaning their identity is shaped by place as much as it is by social constructions. As such, different urban Mapuche masculinities have formed because of varying levels of urban multiculturalism and different relationships with rural Mapuche lands, for example, the Mapurbe youth who understand Mapuche masculinity to be centred on a rolebased culture and the young students who believe in a land and blood based masculinity. This research demonstrates that masculinities also vary between cities due to diverse cultures, spaces and lived experiences within these cities. However, some Mapuche have actively rejected any association with rural Wallmapu<sup>8</sup>, for example the young Mapuche professionals, revealing that there are other forces at play and that urban Mapuche masculinity is much more complex than a simple association with place. This chapter will dispel the claim by Ray (2007; 30) that Mapuche men have a limited concern for the homeland, nature and traditional culture, while illustrating the ways in which Mapuche masculinities are also deeply imbricated with place-identities, both urban and rural.

### Place and Mapuche Identities

This chapter draws on Doreen Massey's explanation of place in order to understand the ways in which urban-rural dynamics influence Mapuche youth masculinities. Massey views place not as static formation upon which everyday life is enacted, but as comprised of layers of social activity, which themselves influence the reality of places. Massey contradicts the argument that place is a "slice through time", devoid of dynamics. Instead she argues that place is imbued with the temporal; "space is a dynamic simultaneity and that is quite different from a stasis" (Massey, 2012; xi). Social activity constantly shapes place and is in turn acted upon by place; thus place is constantly made and remade. Place is not a surface, but a "simultaneity of stories so far" (Massey, 2012; x). Place is thus not a "geographical metaphor", in which layers of

\_

 $<sup>^{8}</sup>$  Wallmapu are the traditional Mapuche territories from the Limari river in the north to the Chiloe archipelago in the south

history are simply superimposed over one another and obscuring or erasing stories that went before. Rather, "stories shoot out of the soil" (Massey, 2012; xi) and speak to today. Going beyond the idea of place as process, Massey challenges the notion of place as oneness. Drawing on this conceptualisation of place, this chapter discusses the effect of place on Mapuche masculinities. It argues that urban Mapuche are influenced by a strong sense of place-identity. Place-identity is defined as "those dimensions of self that define the individual's personal identity in relation to the physical environment by means of a complex pattern of conscious and unconscious ideas, feelings, values, goals, preferences, skills, and behavioral tendencies relevant to a specific environment" (Proshansky, 1978; 22). However, placeidentity is neither a simple nor static formation, continuing throughout the lifecycle as the person and environment change over time. This concept is particularly important when discussing urban Mapuche identities. The land (Mapu) continues to function as a central ethnic marker within identity formation for the Mapuche; however, some academic research has presented an overly static and romanticized depiction of the Mapuche connection to the land (Barrera-Hernandez, 2005; di Giminiani, 2015; Mallon, 2005). This fails to effectively portray the life experiences of many urban Mapuche. This chapter examines the strong emotional connections that urban Mapuche have with both urban and rural places, which is given meaning by their interactions with these sites. Place-identity is affective and often cannot be easily expressed, but it is clear from the research discussed below that place is one factor that can serve to define who a person is and how they behave. However, like all other structures of selfidentity, place-identities are measures for expressing individual identity, they vary within groups and identities are always influenced by other factors, such as age, occupation, social class and education.

### Mapuche Migration and Experiences of Urban Space

Mapuche migration is a contemporary process involving national migration to urban areas in order to become a part of a wage labour economy. In the aftermath of the Chilean military occupation of the Araucania region, the Mapuche saw their land reduced to just 6.2 hectares per person (Imilan Ojeda, 2008; 118) through appropriation by the ruling powers. Such reduction of lands led to a low surplus production, restructuring the Mapuche as a subsistence economy, thus limiting the possibility for development. Migration thus became the logical conclusion to reducing the pressure on scarce land. Mapuche migration to urban centres began

to grow steadily from the 1960s, stabilising at the end of the 1980s, with 440,000 Mapuche now living in Santiago.

In explaining reasons for this pattern of migration, participants from across the groups interviewed describe work or education as the principal motivations, both for them and their predecessors. As one participant explains:

I was born in Santiago. My grandparents for work and economical motives moved to the city. My sector was 29km from Temuco, next to a river. First, my grandparents went to Valdivia, but during the dictatorship it became very difficult to be a proletariat and on top of that to be a Mapuche. So they migrated to Santiago. They went to work in the jobs that Mapuche usually do in the city, he was a baker, she was a nanny. (*Franco*, 29)

Similar explanations were provided by most respondents, but Mapuche migration into the city has not resulted in a detribalisation of Mapuche identity and an absorption of the Mapuche into a singular urban 'type'.

It has been suggested that cities are unique physical systems which create characteristic behaviours and experiences for urban residents. Hernandez et al. (2007) suggest that urban dwellers have typical identity characteristics such as adaptability and openness. They argue that the city experience of sounds, lights, buildings, cars, crowds all socialize the urban dweller to create an urban place-identity that is aimed at surviving within the city. However, cities also create diverse and hybrid identities and masculinities. Social imaginings within the city allow residents to experience positive feelings of disorientation, crossing lines of time and space in all directions and allowing urbanites to explore new forms of masculinity. The displacement of immigration and the associated dislocation of identity has allowed urban residents to experience a pluralistic form of identity through exposure to other cultures. This process causes dislocation from mainstream ideas surrounding gendered social practice. Moffat (2011; 1) has shown that complex urban environments have allowed men to "escape from the confines of mainstream expression of culture that has been reified historically in both thought and practice". Cities allow local practices of gender within the context of a global influence meaning that local oppositions can work inside, but also against, the context of social standardisation set by globalisation. These new approaches to identity run counter to

fundamentalism, nationalism, consumerism and global mass culture. According to Bourriaud, (2009) contemporary multicultural urban nodes are defined by the residents' wish to escape from reified notions of nation and identity. Rudrum and Stavris advance this, suggesting "there are no longer cultural roots to sustain forms, no exact cultural base to serve as a benchmark for variations, no nucleus, no boundaries for artistic language" (2015; 12). The social hybridity of cities, with their complex mix of ethnicities, class and sexualities has led to a multitude of masculinities, challenging the notion of a single hegemonic masculinity.

For indigenous people, this process of urbanization has generally been linked with a process of detribalization. Early studies commented that the process of urbanization resulted in a reduced association between ethnicity and kinship that is common within rural indigenous communities (Schildkrout, 2014; UNESCO 1964). Urban Mapuche are, therefore, more often associated with generalized Latin American urban masculinities, often portrayed as violent, aggressive and womanizing machos (Willis, 2005). Horschelmann and Van Hoven have shown that Latin American men are stereotyped as macho, presumed to be involved in "aggression and violence towards each other, as well as towards female partners and children, drunkenness, womanising and fathering many children" (2005; 92). Indigenous men are also faced with distinct gender biases, with their minority masculinity interpreted as threatening and deviant, used in part as a justification for the appropriation of indigenous lands and resources. However, it is a mistake to assume that masculinity is the result of a single line of socio-historical change. Rather, masculinity is expressed following unique historical and spatial frameworks. The reality is that within Latin American cities the multiplicity of different spaces enables the performance of a range of male identities. A man's identity is not fixed and, as Horschelmann and Van Hoven argue, public and private masculinities vary within the city spaces. Urban identities are thus complex associations between the self and the urban environment. The urban is a highly differentiated system, it is both a single entity and home to many different places and placeidentities. The research findings contradict the idea that there is one urban 'type', arguing that men experience the urban in different ways and it is for this reason that behaviours and characteristics vary. Mapuche masculinities are influenced by urban space, but also vary across urban place, revealing that multiple masculinities can exist within urban spaces and that placeidentity is more complex than simple urban-rural distinctions.

Urban Mapuche masculinities have often been reduced to discussions of Mapuche in Santiago and are frequently centred around the Mapurbe (see Redekal 2014 and Collins, 2014). The

multicultural reality of the city of Santiago has allowed the Mapurbe to break down hegemonic perceptions of masculinity, resulting in a rejection of more stereotypical understandings of Latin American urban masculinities (Horschelmann and Van Hoven, 2005). The Mapurbe are second or third generation migrants, whose parents or grandparents migrated to the city to find paid employment because they lost their lands in the pacification and reduction of the Araucania. Many of these migrations occurred during Pinochet's rule, when the Mapuche lands were reduced from 10 million hectares to 400,000 hectares (MacDonald, 2014). The Mapurbe argue that the migration to Santiago was not a peaceful migration, rather it was forced. As one respondent puts it:

We have always said it was a forced migration of our grandparents. They had to leave their communities to come here. To work. To find labour. In the south there was no work for them. They didn't leave because of the culture, because they didn't like it. They left because they had to. Because they were forced to. (*Ruben, 24*)

Thus, to the Mapurbe migrating to the city was never an active choice and it was certainly not a choice to abandon Mapuche culture. As discussed in the previous chapter, because of this, the Mapurbe have actively maintained a strong connection with traditional Mapuche culture. However, maintaining a connection with the land in an urban built environment has necessitated some adaptations:

Most of the Mapuche live in the urban sectors, the poblaciones, so they all get together there. That has become the new Mapuche context, the new space. So within this context we began to use the tools around us, and began to rescue and create this new identity that you see. We've always had to deal with the conflict, when you're an urban Mapuche you can't participate in any kind of ceremony, not when you're in Santiago. But despite this, we've begun to find ceremonial spaces. So we've found spaces for wentri pantu, for nguillatun and we're trying to rescue what we can. (*Franco*, 29)

However, the fact that Mapurbe people are adapting to urban settings does not mean they reject more traditional understandings of Mapuche masculinity. Mapuche identities have always been influenced by impervious external circumstances and to reject all aspects of the modern world as part of Mapuche culture is to misunderstand the lessons of Mapuche history. Mapuche culture was changing even before contact with Europeans and since then elements have been

introduced that have become indispensable, such as certain domesticated animals and vegetables. Now the kultrun<sup>9</sup> and the laptop are used equally as communication tools.

Clifford (2007; 213) recognises that many indigenous people, like the urban Mapuche, no longer live in their ancestral territories. He argues that indigenous people who live within urban centres reproduce the characteristics of their homeland within these urban spaces:

the tribal home – its animals, plants, social gatherings, shared foods, ancestors and spiritual powers – is not imagined from a distance. It is activated, "practiced" … made meaningful in a range of sites by seasoned rituals, social gatherings, visits and subsistence activities.

Mapurbe men have created their own urban spaces within the city where they can practice their culture. For example, the NGO, CEBRA, has been working with the Mapuche people in Santiago to create a ceremonial centre within the city, which will contain a Ruka, Machi medical centre, space for growing vegetables, a cultural centre for the arts and space to celebrate ceremonies (see figures 15 and 16). Thus, the source of the Mapuche identity, culture and social networks in the city is, according to Clifford, still the non-urban homeland. However, the Mapurbe have created a translocal identity, reflecting the "movement of place specific culture, institutions, people, knowledge and resources within several local sites" (Stephen, 2007; 65). This allows the Mapuche of Santiago to reproduce a way of living in the city that was common in the rural south, as well as the political hierarchies and rituals that come with it. The spaces are focused on traditional uses and yet they are hybrid spaces, at once rural and urban, Mapuche and Chilean.

Many Mapurbe men interviewed argue that living in the capital has actually made the Mapuche identity stronger for them. Within Santiago the Lafquenches, Picunches and Huilliches<sup>10</sup> are able to interact with one another, allowing their identities to be much more expansive and integrated. As one respondent argues:

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Traditional Mapuche drum, used by Machi to contact spirits

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> These names refer to different groups of Mapuche. These groups are differentiated by region rather than ethnicity.

What is better about Santiago is that in the South if you go to the cordillera for example, you only meet people from there. If you go to the coast, you only meet people from there. But if you come to a poblacion in Santiago, you meet all kinds of Mapuche. (Ruben, 24).



Figure 15: The proposed ceremonial centre in Santiago (source: CEBRA)



Figure 16: The proposed ceremonial centre in Santiago (source: CEBRA)

Many Mapurbe respondents also celebrate the fact that they avoided being sent to boarding schools in Temuco away from their communities like many young Mapuche. This allowed them the opportunity to remain within their created urban community and to be educated within this about Mapuche culture. As one respondent explains:

I don't put any blame on my mother for what happened. She had to keep us in Santiago to be able to feed us. In fact, I thank her for it. We've grown up independent from the territories. She didn't want us to be interned to study. We would have lost our culture. That's what they do down there, they take them away to study, and then they say Mapuches who don't live in the community aren't Mapuche anymore. And they've lost it all. But now they can't rob our culture. Because it's independent of the land. (Franco, 29).

Franco feels feel liberated by his separation from the countryside. His separation from traditional homelands has helped him to explore his Mapuche identity in new ways, focusing on culture rather than lands. It would appear that ceremonies and everyday cultural activities have overtaken the importance of ancestral lands as Mapuche markers. Many respondents argue that, in the post-dictatorship period, Mapuche expressions of identity within Santiago serve as a larger, unified act of resistance against the government, which they see as the perpetrators of forced migration to the city. Moreover, their distance from the "red zone<sup>11</sup>" in La Araucania has allowed them to "arm<sup>12</sup>" (*Franco, 29*) themselves in their resistance. The Mapurbe, unlike the Southern Mapuche, no longer own their familial lands and so have become very interested in the fight to regain Las Tierras:

Being Mapuche here is fashionable. There's no discussion of the conflict in the south. So we can arm ourselves and nobody knows. They just think it's cool. The real resistance is here in Santiago and nobody knows. (Sebastian, 25).

Thus, distance from the tribal homeland has arguably allowed the Mapurbe youths of Santiago to develop the strong sense of Mapuche masculinity discussed in the previous chapter. They are able to maintain what they view as a 'traditional identity' through immersion within the reimagined urban Mapuche communities. This allows them a space within which to explore

<sup>12</sup> In this case the term "arm" can be translated as a metaphor for cultural education rather than actually taking up arms

109

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> The red zone is a term used in Chile to describe the rural Araucania region where the government claims Mapuche are engaging in 'terrorist' activities, such as burning trucks and logging companies. The red zone is often associated with communist links and local media outlets have claimed this region has links to the Colombian FARC.

traditional Mapuche roles, associated with complementary understandings of gender. Furthermore, they can be more vocal in Mapuche political struggles due to their distance from the red zone.

In effect, Mapurbe youths have taken control over certain urban spaces, allowing the indigenisation of modernity (Sahlins, 1999) within Santiago. Traditional Mapuche cultures and identities have flourished within Santiago as the Mapurbe diversify the city through indigenous adaptations of urban everyday realities. Within Santiago global homogeneity and local differentiation have developed together, the latter as a response to Mapuche autonomy. As Hannerz put it, "there is now a world culture, but we had better make sure we understand what this means. It is marked by an organisation of diversity rather than a replication of uniformity" (1990; 237). Mapurbe youths have remapped Santiago as a third space (Soja, 1996), rejecting the fixing essentialist discourse that suggests Mapuche are a rural people, by mapping Mapuche reality within the local and national context (Bengoa, 1985; Boccara, 2002). They have broken down a borderised Mapuche identity by creating a translocal and plural identity. Unfixing the Mapuche identity threatens hegemonic masculine discourse by a refusal to be trapped within historic spaces; rather, they are engaging within the globalised spaces of the city by creating their own cultural version of modernity. However, this cannot be reduced to a singular urban Mapuche 'type'. The reality in Temuco is very different to Santiago and diverse Mapuche masculine identities are found there, in turn revealing the significance of place in shaping Mapuche masculinities.

#### Urban Mapuche Identities Within Temuco

The political reality of Temuco is very different to that of Santiago. The current mayor of Santiago is Carolina Toha, from the Centre-Leftist Party for Democracy (PDP), elected with an overall majority and representing a party that stands for democratic socialism and liberal progressivism. Furthermore, whilst there were problems with the Chilean census<sup>13</sup>, it is safe to say Santiago is becoming a more multicultural city, with multicultural festivals and a growing immigrant population. Whilst the Mapurbe face political marginalisation in Santiago, the situation is arguably much worse in Temuco. Temuco was founded in 1881 during the pacification of Araucania and is situated in the centre of Wallmapu. The current mayor of

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> The 2012 Chilean census only surveyed 9% of the Chilean population

Temuco is Miguel Becker, from the right wing party Renovacion Nacional. The local elite within Temuco are descended from European immigrants, who arrived in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century after the pacification of the Araucania and were given large portions of the Mapuche lands. Temuco is also home to Paz en la Araucania (Peace in the Araucania) movement, made up of wealthy landowners, usually of European descent. On its Facebook page Paz en La Araucania claims to be a "citizen movement that seeks to raise awareness for Peace in Araucania"; however, many consider this movement to be a neo-Nazi group, who encourage violent action towards Mapuche and actively dispute indigenous land claims. In reality, Temuco is in the centre of the war in the Araucania, which continues through small scale political resistance, which the Chilean government have defined as terrorism. As one respondent explains:

This war's been going on 400 years. And it's not over (Alexis, 29).

Thus, the Mapuche in Temuco must deal with political marginalisation and are often reluctant to promote their Mapuche culture within the cityscape, in contrast to Santiago where such a culture is considered "cool". Furthermore, Temuco is a city with severe environmental problems that dispel any romanticised ideas of a pristine indigenous heartland. Many Mapurbe people from Santiago have dreams of returning to their homelands in Wallmapu and for those that are able to return, Temuco is the obvious option. However, those Mapurbe youths who have returned to the indigenous heartland have found the reality in Temuco very different to that which they expected and many went back to Santiago. Franco is one of several young men who moved to Temuco, but now would like to return to Santiago:

My heart doesn't feel so happy when I'm urbanised. I felt really connected culturally when I lived in Santiago, but I feel so much connection spiritually with the trees and with the sea. But Santiago doesn't have that, so I began to get sick a lot. So when I made the decision to come and live in Temuco it was for the natural spaces, I thought Araucania would be a natural space. I didn't know that it would be contaminated. That the space was lost and the identity was getting lost too (*Franco*, 29).

Temuco is the fourth most polluted city in the country, with the burning of firewood causing soot pollution to be 150 percent higher than the national average and four times the World Health Organisation's recommended limit. Furthermore, much of the land around Temuco was given over to forestry and timber companies during the Pinochet regime creating environmental

degradation within the region. The Mapurbe youths of Santiago who have visited or lived in Temuco believe the Mapuche identity to be as degraded as the environment within Temuco:

When I went to Temuco last summer, I was so happy, because I was going to be in the place of my heart, I was close to my land, and I was going to feel healthier. I thought that I would be able to speak Mapudungun to people, I would always be able to be dressed up in traditional clothing. But when I got here I realised the identity was lost. Really lost. I realised that lots of people were embarrassed and said they weren't Mapuche. And that people were really active in the church, especially the Evangelical church. And the Evangelical church destroys your identity. They say the Mapuche spirituality is the devil. They have no idea here. We are at completely different levels in Santiago. We know so much more. (Sebastian, 25).

For the most part, the urban Mapuche youths in Temuco agree that Temuco is a city in which Mapuche culture has been degraded. They explain that the promotion of Mapuche culture is not a priority for the local government.

There is no Ruka<sup>14</sup> in Temuco. It's a city without culture. A Ruka is not a priority for the government (Wilson, 30).

The lack of Ruka within the city means that the Mapuche do not have a place to gather, heal or to celebrate. The students I interviewed believe that the local government is focused on European culture as a model they aspire to copy and that European colonialist culture is positioned much higher than Mapuche culture. For example, one respondent explains:

Chile has a mission that is totally obsessed with Europe. They don't look within South America, internally. We want to do what they are doing there. You can understand that within the Araucania. Because here there were a lot of colonisers, French, German, and a lot of colonial communities still exist, that also have their own identity and don't want to lose it. But the Mapuche culture is something they don't recognise. (*Wilson, 30*)

Temuco has become a city that actively celebrates its colonial identity, rather than its mixed heritage. As another respondent explains:

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Traditional Mapuche house.

There's a poet here, he's called Elicura Chihuailaf, he's talked about the White City. You can see that Temuco is a white city, and the mestizo have to live in the poblaciones, the centre is just for white people. Even though this is a Mapuche region, almost everyone tries to find a European past. Even though from the colour of their skin it's obvious they're Mapuche. (Sebastian, 25)

The "White City" has begun to express itself in the urban landscape of Temuco:

They put the names of the conquistadores next to the Mapuche warriors on streets here. That's bad, really bad. You can realise when you look around this sector, [Avenida Alemania] you won't see anything Mapuche. This sector has nothing to do with the Mapuche culture, there are German, French restaurants. There's no Mapuche restaurant. There's no identity point that says this is a touristic place, nothing that people can visualise to show them this is a Mapuche place. (Alexis, 29)

For many Southern Mapuche youths the urban realities of Temuco are not associated with their Mapuche identities. As we have seen in the previous chapter, it is their connection to land that defines their identity, rather than their connection to culture. Such differences in location have led to a "Mapuche Hierarchy", where the Mapurbe are often ranked as "less Mapuche" by the Southern Mapuche. As one participant explains:

We don't know if they're Mapuche or Chilean. Their protocol has been different. Their respect for people is different. Ok, so they might arrive in the countryside and be able to speak Mapudungun, they might even know lots of things. But the way they are, it's different to us. They've changed. They don't have anything to do with it [Mapuche culture]. (Alexis, 29)

Within the Mapuche population a hierarchy has developed of "Mapucheness" and this hierarchy has been largely based around place. As one respondent in Santiago explains:

Before the Mapuche system was horizontal, based around Lof<sup>15</sup>. But now it has changed. And you are judged on how Mapuche you are. It annoys me when other Mapuche say, "hey, but you're not Mapuche because you don't come from the countryside". You don't know my story. You don't know why my Mum had to leave. It makes me laugh, there's this thing it's called the Mapuchemetre and it's like a parody of what they do. Do you live in the communities? Yes. Do you speak Mapudungun? Yes. Do you participate in cultural activities? Yes. Ok. Then you are a Mapuche. Do you live in a community? No. Do you speak Mapudungun. Yes, a bit. Do you participate in cultural activities? Yes. Oh, well you aren't Mapuche because you don't live in a community. You don't qualify. (*Diego*, *25*)

Often it is assumed by those in the South that the Mapurbe 'traditional' culture is a fake attempt at being Mapuche, that it is an appropriation of certain elements of traditional culture and an overcompensation, when in reality they have lost their culture. This was expressed at a Mapurbe wedding, where the bride and groom had chosen to get married in the traditional way in the Mapuche territory (see Images 17 and 18). One Mapurbe attendee describes the wedding as follows:

It's the old style. There's no alcohol, but a lot of meat. They have been finding out what happened at ancient Mapuche weddings. But really ancient. Without excesses. They are doing everything with the correct protocol. It's incredible. They are 22 and 24 and they wanted to marry in this ancient way. They could have gone to the civil register, but no. They wanted to return to the ancient culture. (*Jorge*, 28)

However, one attendee from Temuco believed the wedding was an overcompensation for their embarrassment at the lack of Mapuche culture:

We don't do it like this. This is fake. This isn't real Mapuche culture. (Luis, 17)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> The basic social structure of traditional Mapuche, a familial clan.

Thus, even amongst the Mapuche a hierarchy has evolved that privileges ancestral homelands as a marker of indigenous identity. Mapuche youths often reinforce dominant visions of indigenous peoples as authentic only if they live in remote areas. However, in comparison to essentialist understandings of indigenous cultures, many Southern Mapuche people do not privilege "traditional" lifestyles. For the young students I interviewed, association with place is much more important in making them Mapuche, despite how much traditional knowledge they have. Innovations that emerge from interactions with non-indigenous societies are not excluded; however, Mapucheness is homogenised by a relationship to ancestral lands (often conflated with rural areas), thus rejecting the Mapurbe as non-Mapuche because their connection to tribal homelands is sporadic, may not continue to exist, or may never have existed.



Figure 17: Photograph of the bride and groom, taken at the Mapurbe wedding (Source: author)



Figure 18: The sharing of slaughtered horse, a traditional practice at Mapuche weddings (Source: Author)

In contrast, the Mapurbe believe that this hierarchy should be removed, believing it to be a model imported from the colonialists to replace the Lof organisational system and that it has been used to divide and rule the Mapuche people. Such a preoccupation with an indigenous relationship to land has deflected attention away from ways the Mapurbe have begun to express their masculinities in Santiago. The fact that the Mapurbe are unable to use traditional attachment to lands as an identity marker means that they have used other resources, such as the traditional gender and age role system and other activities to express their identity. Furthermore, this hierarchizing rests on a particular geography that assumes the dichotomy of urban sites and traditional homelands. However, as Ruben argues:

There is a hierarchy within the Mapuche. Some Mapuche treat others as if they were not as Mapuche as them because of where they come from, Santiago or South, urban or rural. But what we have to remember is that the first battle against the Spanish was fought in Santiago. (Ruben, 24).

Ruben is arguing that cities can also be located on sites traditionally used by indigenous peoples (see images 19 and 20). As Andersen (2013: 7) argues:

The creation of indigenous "homelands" outside of cities is in itself a colonial invention. Moreover, for many indigenous peoples, ancestral homelands are not contained by the small parcels of land found in reserves, reservations and rural aboriginal settlements, rather, they are larger territories that include contemporary urban settlements" (Andersen, 2013; 7).

What is emerging between the Mapuche in Santiago and the Mapuche in the south of Chile is contestation over what it means to be Mapuche based on Tierra vs. Cultura (Land vs. Culture). Whilst the Southern Mapuche believe the Mapurbe are less authentic because they overemphasise their cultural identity due to their lack of connection with the land, the Mapurbe believe the southern groups are less authentic because of their lack of culture, and they blame this on the erosion of culture in the city of Temuco.

#### Rural Influences on Mapuche Masculinities

As argued in the previous chapter, Mapuche living in Temuco believe a Mapuche masculinity is strongly linked with a feeling of connectedness to the homeland and kin. This identification with the homeland was expressed by Wearne (1996; 11), who argued that:

the (American) continent's indigenous peoples define themselves primarily through their relationship to the land. Whereas the names they give themselves ... often mean simply "people", the names they give their territories usually translate simply as "land". The two are inseparable. The land is identity – past, present and future. As the world council of indigenous peoples ... noted in 1985 "next to shooting indigenous peoples, the surest way to kill us is to separate us from our part of the earth".

As we saw in the previous chapter the boarding school students interviewed tend to believe the Mapuche identity is based on a connection to the land. For example, one respondent claims:

You can see that the Mapuche are stronger than the Winka. Countryside. They worked in the countryside. And they lived in the countryside. The Chileans didn't. So they're more delicate (*Nicolas*, 26).

However, beyond ideals of indigenous peoples as the stewards of the land, notions of rurality are also important in constituting notions of masculinity. For these young men the idea of the rural conjures up sentiments of being a 'real man'; rurality brings an air of the natural to images of masculinity, legitimating their masculinity as deeper than the social, born from their intimate connection with nature. There are, of course, multiple rural masculinities, mobilised discursively by rural men, affected by localness and local history. However, it is clear that these young students are influenced by notions of 'appropriate' masculinity and the idea that a true man is marked by hard work and sweat of the brow.

For the residents of a Temuco boarding school, a return to the countryside for family gatherings, ceremonial events, subsistence activities and so forth is made possible by their proximity to the countryside. As the maps below show (Images 19 and 20), Temuco is in the heart of Wallmapu, the Mapuche territories. Their proximity and in many cases close links with the homeland means the students are able to participate in circular migration between urban Temuco and the rural homelands. Such circular mobility between urban and rural locations has created a complex borderland between urban and indigenous masculinities. However, rather than creating a counterhegemonic rural cosmopolitanism as is present in Santiago, the

proximity to the countryside allows these young men to perform different aspects of their identity when in different places. As one participant describes:

It's impossible to have the Mapuche culture in the city. I've seen it. I've seen them try and do Wentripantu in the city. They tried to do it in the poblaciones. But it doesn't have the same relationship in the city. People get up at 5am and they go out to make sure the sun rises. How can you do that in the city when there's smog. They can try and do the ceremonies, they can make it like a festival. But you can't have the connection with nature. You can only get that in the community. (Alexis, 29).

To men like Alexis the lack of culture in Temuco is irrelevant as Mapuche culture can only be performed within rural spaces. Within the city the students perform an identity that allows them to integrate with dominant Chilean cultures. However, within the countryside they perform a more exceptional identity:

I have participated (in rural Mapuche life). Every 2 or 4 years, I might go to Nguillatun. But each weekend I go home to the countryside to speak with my mum. To speak with the people there. There I can think more about being Mapuche. (*Rodrigo*, 18).

This rural connection exists for the participants, not only because of Temuco's proximity to the rural homeland, but also because most of the student's families still own their traditional lands

*Interviewer:* Are you interested in the fight for the lands?

Carlos: Well, it's just that I have lands. My family have lands. And I am going to go and work there.

*Mauricio*: It's that you have the vision that we are burning trucks against the government. But that's not right. Those people aren't....

*Carlos:* They're another thing. For other reasons. They protest because of the forest companies, because they chop down lots of trees. Those are the people who don't have lands anymore. So they complain about that.

Claudio: But our families have land. So we don't mind. (Focus Group 4).

This is not to say that these young men have not been affected by their separation from their rural homeland. Many students describe feelings of estrangement from their families and their lands because of their forced migration to the city:

David: We all live in the countryside. We arrive here on Mondays and we leave on Fridays.

*Tomas:* I don't like doing this.

David: The reality is that neither do I. I want to be at home.

*Alejandro:* I just want to be with my family

Matias: There's a separation between us now, with the distance. (Focus Group 1)

However, unlike the Mapurbe, many of the student participants have the option to return to their native lands and live in the countryside. And, indeed, many of them do intend to do this:

*Interviewer:* In the future where do you want to live?

*Alejandro:* In the countryside. There's more liberty

Matias: Its more tranquil. Here in the city there's a lot of noise.

Alejandro: It stresses you out.

*Matias:* Yeah, but I'm a bit scared of the devil and all those Mapuche myths. You can be very alone in the countryside.

*David:* Yeah but there's more to do. You can play football with your cousins. Listen to music. There aren't so many rules.

Tomas: There's an affinity (Focus Group 1).

Whilst the students have limited knowledge of the Mapuche traditions because of their Chilean education (discussed in Chapter 6), they believe that the inherent Mapuche connection with the lands and their true masculinity means they could return to this lifestyle whenever they wanted.

I don't know much about it. But I'm a Mapuche and the Mapuche just know things. Like before, they just knew that when you work the land you work it one year and they you leave it. And my question is, who taught them this? Nobody. They just knew and they always knew. The religious ceremonies have a lot to do with it. With nature. It's not about what men know. It's the sun, rain, energy. So if I went back I could probably just do it. Because I'm a Mapuche. Its natural. (*Felipe, 17*)



Figure 19: Map marking Wall Mapu, the original Mapuche territories. (Source: Author)



Figure 20: Map marking Wall Mapu, the original Mapuche territories. (Source: Author)

Thus, unlike the Mapurbe, the students believe they can return to their land and indeed that they will do so someday. In this respect their identity is more associated with land than with culture. They believe that to be a Mapuche requires not being separated from the land. In their eyes there is a difference between them and the Mapurbe who have lost their connection with the land:

In Temuco we're always going to be tangled with the countryside. We live in the city but it's to study. Home will always be the countryside. The Mapuche in Santiago, they are urban. We're not urban. We're rural. We just live it the city. But it's not our home. (Vincente, 18)

The young professional Mapuche men also live in the Mapuche heartland of Wallmapu. However, unlike the students, they have no interest in returning to their traditional lands. The families of the young professionals also still own their family lands and they believe the Mapurbe should stop complaining:

They just want conflict, those Mapuche. They are trying to continue the war. I don't know why because the government is busy returning the lands. In reality they've already given back loads. (Nicolas, 26)

The young professionals I interviewed, who tend to identify more with Chilean identities, tend to believe that while these lands may have traditionally belonged to the Mapuche they no longer deserve them:

The Mapuches were born here, and they are their lands but it's just that they don't work those lands. They just leave them for nothing. So even if they gave them back they would just leave them and they would become worthless. It's better to give the lands to someone who will make something out of them. Make a business. Make money. (*Patricio*, 31)

The young professionals and the boarding school students have similar urban and rural proximities and histories. Thus, the differences between expressed above reveal that other identity vectors, beyond space, intersect to influence urban Mapuche youth masculinities.

Despite expressing urban identities based on rural practices, Mapurbe youths rarely return to the Mapuche heartland of Wallmapu because of the absence of family lands. However, they are politically engaged with the idea of returning to these lands and are more engaged with the political struggle for the return of their lands than many of the Southern Mapuche. The vision of rural areas for many Mapurbe interviewees is of a battleground for an unresolved Mapuche conflict. Within Santiago, Mapurbe youths are involved in political activism, which has given rise to social protests, such as marches, road blocks and other forms of civil disobedience. The Mapurbe movement has been a form of coordination for this protest, with many Mapurbe arming themselves from within this group. As one respondent explained:

Recently, we've begun to get coordinated. And recently this has begun to focus on the theme of getting our lands back. We've began to arm ourselves seriously in Santiago. To get our southern lands back. (Franco, 29)

In comparison with the young boarding school students, the Mapurbe no longer have access to their traditional family lands, many of which have been converted into big forestry and hydroelectric enterprises and their connection with the rural is influenced by this fact.

#### Conclusions

The Mapuche have a complex relationship with place. The essentialist arguments that stem from equating ideals of indigeneity with rurality need to be deconstructed. Academics such as Ray (2007; 20) have argued that away from rural areas Mapuche people:

"find themselves deracinated. It is the rural communities, that hand down the stories and songs, that provide the social structure and ceremonies that give a sense of Mapuche identity. Rootless in the city, they are more vulnerable, prey to racism and exploitation".

Many writers consider movement to the city as synonymous with assimilation and those who are not perfectly assimilated nor "wildly savage", such as the Mapuche discussed in this research, are often considered "imperfect creatures, the degraded or reservation Indian" (Berkhofer, 2011; 29). However, such thinking places indigenous cultures within an "anachronistic space... prehistoric, atavistic and irrational, inherently out of place in the

historical time of modernity" (McClintock, 2013; 40). These rudimentary essentialisms need to be challenged.

This research suggests that the reality for Mapuche youths is that there is no objective entity named 'urban masculinity' can be separated from a parallel object named 'rural masculinity'. Many Mapuche youths have a strong urban identity through living in an urban environment whilst simultaneously invoking a rural, indigenous Mapuche identity. However, diverse understandings of masculinity arise based on the different life experiences. Mapurbe youths live in a multicultural metropolis far from their rural homelands. For this reason, they have indigenised their modernity, adapting to their local surroundings by (re)inventing certain aspects of rural Mapuche culture within the urban setting. The Mapurbe no longer own their own lands within Wallmapu, so when Mapurbe youths focus on the rural sphere as a separate entity, they consider it as a site of struggle for their rural homeland. In comparison, the young boarding school students interviewed in Temuco live in a city that they define as culturally barren. There is, therefore, no one urban 'type' that can be identified between these two cities; rather each place has given rise to different masculine identities. Within Temuco the students have little way to express their cultural Mapuche identity and so they express their identity through connection with the land. Temuco's location within the Wallmapu heartland means they can return often to their rural heritage and their masculinities are thus shaped by identification with rurality and the "land". It can be seen, therefore, that different associations with place have given rise to distinct Mapuche masculinities. However, despite differences, both identities are at once both rural and urban. In comparison the young professionals express their identity by being fully engaged in a modern, Chilean urban lifestyle.

It is clear that the construction of different places, both urban and rural, enables the performance of a range of different Mapuche masculinities. Masculinities are not fixed and indigenous masculinities can vary across urban and rural space, but also between cities. Despite this, contemporary formulations of what it means to be an indigenous person continue to focus on rural experiences, rejecting urban indigenous experiences and masculinities. However, this research has shown that indigenous identity cannot simply be defined through a relationship with ancestral territories (see for example, Kobayashi and De Leew, 2010). This chapter has shown that defining indigenous peoples as solely rural is counterproductive and indigenous masculinities are much more complicated than an attachment to territory or land or culture. However, Massey (2012) argues that differences in identity construction cannot be based solely

on regional differentiations. Rather, she argues that spatial differentiation is also the result of a changing relationship between other social factors. Massey argues that "rather than that dwelling-saturated question of our belonging to a place, we should be asking the question of to whom this place belongs. Who owns it?" (Massey, 2012; iii). With this in mind, the next chapter discusses the ways class and ethnic identities influence Mapuche masculinities.

## Chapter 6. Class, Ethnicity and Mapuche Masculinities

#### Introduction

Identities are constructed at the crossroads between different social categories, for example race, gender, sexuality and so on (Valentine, 2007). The cultural, demographic, environmental and social differences expressed in the previous chapter between Santiago and Temuco, along with the contrasts between urbanity and rurality, provided an explanation for some of the differences between Mapuche masculinities. However, Mapuche lived experiences are influenced by the intersectionality of masculinities with multiple identities. Whilst there are many other factors that shape Mapuche youth masculinities, including age and sexuality, class and its interconnections with Mapuche ethnicity are frequently mentioned by participants as a key element of identity formation. Thus, this chapter will advance arguments in the previous chapter by suggesting that in cases where place differences are less influential in identity formation, class and its relationship to ethnicity become important.

Class is a hierarchical organization that relies on certain inequalities of power. However, the definition of social class is elusive, varying by place and through time. In contrast to previous Marxist constructions class is now understood as a cultural as well as a socioeconomic problem. People in different social classes face different situational contingencies because of their participation in different activities and infrastructures (Bourdieu, 2003). Gabrenya (2003; 6) argues that social classes share different versions of cultural ideologies: "Classes differ in values and beliefs about the right way to live, practice different variants of the same religions and have different political and social attitudes". However, whilst class has proven itself to be an important identity marker for urban Mapuche youths, this chapter contradicts David Harvey's theory that class encompasses all other forms of social identification. Harvey focuses on the politics of class and class solidarity as the cause and solution of social tensions. His argument rests on the notion that class cuts across all forms of identification and thus encompasses those of various ethnicities, genders and sexual orientations. In contrast, this chapter explores through the Mapuche case study the intersections of masculinities with class and ethnicity.

Morgan (2004) argues that to understand class one cannot ignore the parallel hierarchy of gender and the patriarchy. He argues that these sets of differences have commonalities:

They are relational in that the various elements (working class, slave, women, black etc.) cannot be considered apart from other, usually opposed elements. They are structured in that they, to a greater or lesser extent, exist outside individuals and persist over time. And they are, again to varying degrees, seen as significant distinctions in the societies in which they exist (Morgan, 2004; 165).

Men and masculinity are heavily implicated in maintaining the class structure and can be identified as the key class actors. Morgan has gone as far as to say that the supposed 'erosion of class' can be linked to changes in the gender structure and the erosion of patriarchal structures. However, he argues that this connection is implied rather than implicit and as such the links between class and masculinity were previously invisible within academia. Whilst masculinities are multiple, this does not undermine the role hegemonic masculinity plays in the formation of class, with hegemonic characteristics, such as rationality, being associated with "the abstract logic of the market, the dominant principles of bureaucratic organization and the general conduct of private life" (Morgan, 2004; 170). Thus, there is a two-way relationship between class and masculinities. As Morgan argues:

"The connection between class and masculinity is an intimate one. When I see a middle class man, I do not see someone who is middle class and then someone who is a man, or vice versa. I see both at the same time." (2004; 170).

Masculinities and class identities are also inseparable from ethnic identities (Alcoff and Mendieta, 2003; Balibar and Wallerstein, 1991; McCall, 2005). Ethnic identities are constructed, represented as if they form a 'natural' community, "possessing of itself an identity of origins, culture and interests which transcends individuals and social conditions" (Balibar and Wallerstein, 1991; 96). Ethnicity and class identities intersect to form complex, hybrid masculinities. Class mobility is influenced by ethnicity, the myth of the 'melting pot' has not allowed for the assimilation of minority ethnic groups. This is particularly the case in Chile where the Mapuche are economically behind Chilean descendants of European colonizers. Espiritu (1994) has argued that the relationship between these two identity formations is complicated, with ethnic identification affected by class position and vice versa. Espiritu argues:

"class differentiation is important because members of the same ethnic population who experience different degrees of upward mobility tend to develop different common values and patterns of behaviours. Historically, ethnic groups that have remained on the economic margin, and thus have been more insulated from assimilating forces, have been relatively more successful at preserving their ethnic distinctiveness than those that have experienced widespread economic mobility. This is so because the structural conditions of middle class suburbia reduce ties to the original ethnic culture and increase associations with people from outside the ethnic group" (1994; 252)

However, this research contradicts Espiritu's arguments. The research does show a relationship between class and ethnic identity, however among the urban Mapuche participants upper class Mapuche identified more with their ethnic group, whilst working class Mapuche identified more along class lines. However, the relationship was too complex to be called an inverse relation as class and ethnic identities intersect and diverge through time and space between participants.

The participants in this research, whilst each sharing Mapuche ethnicity, occupy different positions in terms of social class. The Mapurbe from Santiago are all members of the Chilean middle class, having all attained a university level education and all work in creative or educative jobs. The participants in Temuco all have their roots in the working classes and particularly within the Chilean campesino class, which includes those who work for land owners whilst receiving low pay (Tinsman, 2002). However, there are differences between the class positioning of the boarding school students and the young professionals. Whilst the young professionals have familial roots in the campesino class, they have entered the middle class by attaining a university education and entering into white collar jobs, such as office or administrative work. The boarding school students are on the brink of entering the workplace and so still retain primarily working class identities.

This research explores the various identifications with class and ethnic identity among young Mapuche, urban men. It suggests that the Mapurbe participants who are from economically stable backgrounds are more able to engage in debates and struggles with ethnic identity, whilst the struggles of the working class urban Mapuche interviewed here are more in line with those of any other member of the Chilean underclass; "one of daily survival in the sprawling world of crime, drugs and delinquency" (Collins, 2014; 32). However, whilst these working class Mapuche youth can be associated with wider class identities, these are also played out on a

local scale and through an indigenous perspective. This chapter discusses how the differences between class and ethnic identification are represented through Mapuche masculinities. It begins by discussing the nature of the Chilean class system and how this shapes the lived experiences of Mapuche urban youth. The chapter then discusses the intersections of ethnicity and class with both working class and middle class Mapuche masculinities, focusing on education and engagement with politics. Finally, the chapter will discuss the Mapuche resistance to dominant discourse about Mapuche class based masculinities. The chapter suggests that class cannot be separated from ethnicity, nation or gender (Katz, 2004).

# The Chilean Class System

The class system in Chile does not correspond with the class system in more developed countries. Despite economic growth and a general reduction of poverty in the last two decades, "an important part of the middle class in Chile remains vulnerable and, contrary to popular belief, does not present a more favourable attitude towards democracy in comparison to other segments of society" (Barozet and Fierro, 2011; 12). Chile is continually ranked among the countries with the worst levels of inequality in the world, with the Gini coefficient<sup>16</sup> consistently at around 0.51 (OECD, 2013). Within Chile the richest 10 per cent of the population hold 45 per cent of the country's wealth, whilst the poorest ten percent only hold 1 per cent (Barozet and Fierro, 2011).

Since the dictatorship, the owners of large corporations have joined Chile's dominant classes, joining the landowners who have retained their class dominance. In comparison with other countries within the region, the size of the Chilean middle classes has remained fairly static, at between 30 and 49 per cent of the population (OECD, 2010). Barozet and Fierro, (2011) argue that the Chilean middle class can be associated with work in construction, transport and communications and are associated with transversal values including meritocracy and a value of access to culture. However, three quarters of Chileans identify as middle class, which has been associated with feelings of shame both from within the upper echelons of society and the lower classes (Barozet and Espinoza; 2011). This suggests that the middle classes within Chile have a low level of self-awareness or difficulties in self-identification, especially in a society that in the last thirty years has experienced high levels of social mobility. Within Chile, 40 per

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> The Gini coefficient Is a statistical representation of the income distribution of a nation's residents. It is on a scale of 0-1, with 0 being no inequality and 1 being total inequality.

cent of the population are affected by poverty, with the Chilean "economic miracle" (Diaz, 1993) being based upon a growth strategy of exports that require low wages, a flexible labour market with restrictions on unions and precarious employment through temporary contracts.

The nature of the Chilean class system can be inherently linked to social discourses concerning gender and masculinities. Melhuss and Stolen (1996; 1) argue that in Latin America the "differences between men and women can be made to stand for other forms of differences, or that differences invoked in one context can be used to reformulate differences relevant to another". Arguably, both class and gender can be reduced back to the notion of "el poder" or power, a notion inherent in Latin American cultures. In fact, Melhuss and Stolen (1996) argue that notions of power are gendered in as far as that they are seen as a male prerogative. Whilst machismo, an identity associated with hyper-masculinity such as self-reliance and strength, may appear to represent Chilean masculinity in its entirety, gendered identities within Chile vary with class. Machismo may be defined as: "the cult of virility, the chief characteristics of which are exaggerated aggressiveness and intransigence in male-to-male interpersonal relationships and arrogance and sexual aggression in male-to-female relations" (Stevens, 1973; 315). Tinsman (2002) argues that since the agrarian reform in Chile (1950-1973) and its associated reaffirmation of patriarchy, Chilean working class (campesino) masculinities are associated with male-headed households and the man as breadwinner, along with other machismo forms of identity that centre around work and vigour. Machismo identities are often reduced to the working class within Chile, where they are associated with violent tendencies (Ingoldsby, 1991). According to Ingoldsby (1991) machismo is restricted to the working classes because the lower the social class, the more authoritarian the family. He associates machismo with feelings of inferiority, which could stem from the lack of stable employment. Ingoldsby (1991) suggests machismo is the collapse of the ideal masculinity, "due to poverty and other stressors". In comparison, Gutmann argues that middle class men "attach less priority to vigour, ascribe greater importance to intellectual and expressive capacities, and invest heavily in their appearance" (2003; 140).

Despite the large inequalities within Chile, Roberts (2002) has argued that, where present, ethnic identities are always much stronger than class identities. He shows that over the past three decades of free market reform whilst social inequalities have deepened throughout Latin America, class cleavages have eroded in the political arena. "Class inequalities are more extreme in Latin America than in any other region of the world, yet class appears to have

diminishing political value as an organizing principle, a source of collective identity and an axis of partisan competition" (Roberts, 2002; 3). He argues that economic liberalization has in fact triggered ethnic cleavages in the form of indigenous mobilization, with people eschewing class identities to pursue cross-class strategies of political representation.

The politics of Chile has been fundamentally altered by the collapse of state development and the shift to a free market. The 1980s economic crises and subsequent market reforms caused a fragmentation within the social landscape "simultaneously exacerbating inequalities and inhibiting the political organization of workers. The result was an accentuation of elite political domination exercised through diffuse, multiclass forms of representation" (Roberts, 2002; 5). These social changes thus realigned the political organisation, accentuating patterns of a "classless inequality" that result in the political subordination of some sectors of society. In Chile structural adjustment was imposed by the Pinochet dictatorship and whilst one might expect this to result in a deepened class cleavage, public opinion surveys reveal that the influence of class identities has been declining since the 1990s. Roberts reveals the negative correlation between poverty and left wing votes that began in 1993, allowing conservative candidates to penetrate popular sectors, apparently confirming a dilution of Chile's class cleavage. Van de Berghe (1987) argues that if dominant groups do not resist acculturation then subordinate ethnicities will choose to assimilate in order to achieve upward class mobility, those who do not will find themselves in an increasingly marginal position in both ethnic and class structures. The research shows that participants from within the lower classes identify less with the Mapuche ethnicity than those in the upper classes.

## The Mapuche within the Chilean Class System

The Chilean class system intersects with ethnic identifications, such as those of the Mapuche. For people who identify or are identified as indigenous the likelihood of living in poverty is high (Patrinos 1994; Plant 1998; de Alcantara 2008). The reasons for this are complex, but often lie in the reduced access to human capital (Ray, 2007). Indigenous people in urban areas, for example, find themselves with fewer opportunities for education, employment, housing and healthcare. The urban Mapuche have been forced to compete in a capitalist society; however, discrimination and reduced human capital limits their ability to participate. Statistics show that approximately one-third of all Mapuche live below the poverty line with the average income per week around 43,712 CLP (£50.87) per capita in urban areas and 29,473 CLP (£34.30) in

rural areas. This may be unsurprising considering that less than 3% of the entire Mapuche population receives any further educational training beyond high school (UNPO, 2013).

Urban Mapuche are often represented within academic studies as locked in an indigenous poverty cycle (Berdegue, 2001; Coates, 2004; Ray, 2007; Mario, 2008 and Rojas, 2007); Ader (2009) for example, describes them as "economically destitute". This concept of the Mapuche as solely part of the Chilean working class has underpinned Chilean government policy, with the government continuing to see the Mapuche people as part of the rural poor, marginalized in terms of class rather than ethnicity (see Gallantine, 2008). This has had a specific effect on educational policy within Chile, with the government focusing on civic engagement and a national curriculum (see Radcliffe and Webb, 2016). This representation of the Mapuche as working class has also influenced representations of their masculinity. Young Mapuche men are often portrayed within popular and political discourse as hypermasculine and often violent; Richards (2010), for example, has shown how recent state discourse has depicted the Mapuche as terrorists, guilty of committing violence (in particular arson against the capitalist classes and the state), with Senator Alberto Espina arguing that the Mapuche threaten the physical integrity and way of life of other campesinos. Right-wing Chilean commentators represent Mapuche as dangerous, with Chilean print media supporting this representation; for example, some headlines refer to "Alert in Arauco, Fearing Wave of Mapuche Violence'; 'The Mapuche Intifada: The Indigenous Uprising Worsens', 'Mapuches Threaten' and 'Indigenous Communities on the War Path" (in Richards, 2010; 75).

Within Chile the Mapuche have been shown to suffer ethnic prejudice. According to Merino and Quilaqueo (2003), this is a reflection of the racist ideology of the Spanish conquistadors and the legacy that within Chilean society a hierarchy still places Europeans above indigenous peoples. They argue that "the combination of praising the Indians for their 'naturalness' with such attributions as 'barbarians' gave birth to the term savage" (Merino and Qullaqueo, 2003; 108). These complex understandings persist within the education system, and perpetuate racist understandings of Mapuche men. There is a strong belief in Chile that Mapuche men degrade and physically maltreat women, and that the Mapuche are lazy and incapable of maintaining their lands (see Merino et al. 2009). Furthermore, the stereotype persists that Mapuche are violent and aggressive. Thus, young Mapuche are used to hearing these stereotypes. In addition, within a state-funded school system they are taught that "All Chileans descend from a mixture of Spanish and Mapuche... Because this blending occurred in the distant past, today

'we are all Chileans'" (Merino and Qullaqeo, 2003; 111). The following section challenges essentialising understandings of Mapuche masculinities and explores the links between Mapuche class and ethnic identification.

# Class, Ethnicity and the Lived Experiences of Mapuche Youth

The Mapurbe interviewed are second or third generation immigrants to Santiago whose ancestors had moved for political or economic reasons. Many participants discuss the discrimination associated with being a Mapuche in Santiago during the dictatorship, when their grandparents chose to move:

It was a period of serious racism, political racism against the Mapuche people, so there were a lot of Mapuche in this period, who, to protect their descendants, decided not to teach the Mapuche language, to stop the bullying of their children in school. There was also labour discrimination. If you were a Mapuche it was less likely you would get a job. Social discrimination, including who you could get married to. And if you had a Mapuche surname, forget about it. The Mapuche had the same everyday Chilean poverty but it was much worse because you were a Mapuche. So in this period a lot of our people simply gave up their culture, so that they weren't discriminated against. At the end of the day, what they did was out of love, to protect us. We lost a bit of our identity. But we didn't get locked outside of the (capitalist) system. (Jorge, 28)

In this period, by disguising their indigenous identity many Mapurbe migrants were able to acquire education and jobs that gave them middle class status in Santiago. As a result, Agostini, Brown and Roman (2008) estimate from census data that 10% of urban Mapuche are middle class or belong to the petite bourgeoisie, working as businessmen, professionals or school teachers. Some Mapurbe participants had parents with white collar jobs. For example, Roberto, a 16-year-old from Santiago told me that his mother is a lawyer and his father is a social worker. Other participants also share similar experiences, for example, Sebastian, who is 25 and also from Santiago, explains that his family own a retail business.

Members of the Mapurbe movement do not believe that Mapuche need to hide their indigenous identity as their grandparents did. The Mapurbe movement began to emerge at the end of the military dictatorship, at which time the Mapurbe youth were able to reclaim their Mapuche

identity, as discrimination was lower and their social capital was now higher. As one participant explains:

When democracy arrived in Chile, at the end of the twentieth century, new Mapuche organizations began to emerge, they had kept silent during the period of the dictatorship. But now the young people began to get together and reclaim their Mapuche identity (*Jorge*, 28).

However, Mapurbe in Santiago still experience discrimination. Many of the Mapurbe interviewed claim to have experienced first-hand discrimination for being Mapuche, but explain that this has been important in the helping to shape them as Mapuche and encouraging them to fight for the cause:

I guess this school can be a bit discriminatory, a bit classist. There are people here who have a Mapuche surname and they hide it. But I've got the flag on my rucksack. To me my surname is really important. My name means reflection of the moon. But sometimes the teachers won't pronounce my name properly to make a point. To be honest they can say whatever, it just makes me more proud. (*Roberto, 16, Focus Group 3*)

Despite this evident pride for some young men, for other Mapurbe youth in Santiago guilt plays a key role in the formation of identity. Some participants explained that the first generation migrants suffered guilt and shame at the poverty they experienced and so hid their language and culture. However, the current generation suffers from guilt at the loss of their customs and are willing to assert their Mapuche identity even if this risks discrimination. For example, Jaime explains:

I feel sorry for my grandparents because I know they were embarrassed to be poor. That's why they worked so hard. It was the guilt of not being able to provide for us. I'm not mad at them for losing our customs, but sometimes when I speak with other Mapuche I feel guilty, because I'm not fluent in Mapudungun and there are things I still don't know. I'm trying to learn but it's a long way to go before I get the full culture back (*Jaime*, 26).

This guilt can be associated with what Horrocks (1994) terms as "masculinity in crisis" and the unachievable ideals that hegemonic, patriarchal masculinity places on men have led to feelings

of guilt when this cannot be achieved. In this case, many of the Mapurbe men interviewed have already achieved the mainstream masculine goal of becoming a successful provider for their family; and thus have become much more concerned with their ethnic masculinities. They are able to promote their Mapuche masculinity centred around traditional roles because of their disposable income. Thus, the Mapurbe interviewed in this research appear to be much more associated with their ethnic identity than their class identity. However, this research suggests that whilst the Mapurbe can afford to reject their class identity in search of their ethnic masculinity, class plays an important role in shaping identities of the working class Mapuche young men.

For the majority of urban Mapuche, poverty is a reality. Whilst the Mapurbe interviewed were positioned principally within the middle classes, the young, boarding school students were all from working class, usually campesino roots. It would appear that these young men are currently much more concerned with entering the work force and becoming successful than with their ethnic Mapuche identity. As one of their teachers explains:

The people who don't have any money are just fighting to survive within the system. So they don't worry about culture. They've got no choice but to carry on in this system, so they don't complain. To survive they have had to sell their soul to the devil. I work in two schools, the private English school and this boarding school. And you can see that this school is so much more bourgeoisie than there. They are so concerned with getting money, that they become competitive and selfish, it's a way of climbing the ladder. You don't see that at the private school. (Cristian, 27)

When asked about his interest in Mapuche culture one participant responds:

I've got other things on my mind right now. I just gotta get through school. Get a job. I haven't got time for culture. (David, 18, Focus Group 1)

Another student when asked about his plans for the future, is downcast about the reality of his prospects:

I don't have a plan. What's the point in having a plan if it will all go to shit anyway? Better not to have a plan. Have an open mind. Take whatever job they'll give you. It's not like they're going to let me be a fighter pilot anyway (Alejandro, 19, Focus Group 1)

Like the Mapurbe, young students at boarding schools in Temuco also suffer ethnic discrimination, but are less willing to accept it. One student states that there is no discrimination in their boarding school; however, later in the discussion he describes the presence of La Paz Araucania<sup>17</sup> in the school:

There's this thing called La Paz Araucania. There are a lot of people in the school who are part of this. Including this one bastard who is the son of one of the bosses. And they are the people who are most in conflict with the Mapuche. He was my classmate. But I think he felt more uncomfortable in my presence than I did in his. So we used to get in fights about that. He was fucking disgusting. But the thing is some of the teachers are in it too, so what can you do? (Carlos, 17, Focus Group 4)

Previous chapters discussed how young boarding school students reject Mapuche cultural identity, however they are interested in what they believe to be expressions of traditional masculine Mapuche characteristics, which include enjoying fighting or at least enjoying discussing fighting. For example, David argues:

Fighting is just what we do. It's the way you get respect from the other boys. No one's gonna respect you if you can't stand your ground. You aren't a Mapuche if you can't fight. (David, 18, Focus Group 1)

As Collins suggests young urban Mapuche men's masculinities are often positioned in contrast to rural Mapuche with one identity considered "localized and heroic, while the other is globalized, diluted, and too multi-faceted to really be counted as indigenous" (Collins, 2014; 32). Associating young boarding school students with "globalized" and "diluted" identities implies an association with a national working class subculture over indigenous identification. Chilean working class men are often described as macho, which is manifested through violence (Gutmann, 2003; Martensson, 2012). Chilean machismo and its association with the 'hard man'

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> La Paz Araucania is a group made up of rich landowners in the Araucania region, usually of European descent, who claim to promote peace in Araucania. However, this group has largely been associated with racism towards the Mapuche and are in conflict over land rights with indigenous people.

is described as stemming from the violence done to these men and the hardness of their lives (Melhuss and Stolen, 2006); working class boys are described as creating their own colourful, often violent lives, to cope with their own "empty futures" (Brake, 1974; 179). However, whilst these young Mapuche students are undoubtedly influenced by working class struggles, and localized understandings of machismo, these issues surrounding class are also accentuated by ethnic understandings of Mapuche male violence, especially as above David refers to violence as a particularly "Mapuche" characteristic. Furthermore, the young Mapuche professionals also come from a working class background but do not ascribe to or engage in ritualistic violence. Thus, whilst machismo may be associated with the Latin American region, masculinities are still filtered through particular local contexts.

The young Mapuche professionals, whilst being brought up within working class, campesino families, are now integrated into the middle classes, through their own employment, with many of the participants being employed in white collar jobs such as office or government work. As has been shown in previous chapters the young professionals often attempt to reject their Mapuche ethnic identity, which is often replaced by a strong class identification. For example, Francisco argues:

Some people never say they have a Mapuche surname. We're more Awinkado now. We like to be Chilean more than Mapuche. In the way we think, dress, we don't do the ceremonies. The Mapuche language doesn't interest me, just everything winka. I guess it's due to what happened in school and because of the shame of being Mapuche. The Mapuche people are poor. And I don't want to be poor. I would rather be Winka than poor. So because of this I guess I'm in favour of changing my surname. I don't really want much to do with the Mapuche (*Francisco*, 23)

Francisco wishes to reject his Mapuche identity because of its negative class associations, he is part of the middle class and does not want to be identified as Mapuche because of its working class connotations. The differences between class and ethnic cleavages and their influence on masculinity are represented vividly within the Chilean education system and the differences that are experienced between private and public schools in Santiago and Temuco.

# The Role of Education in Shaping Mapuche Masculinities

The concept of the education system as a tool for preparing youths to work within the capitalist system was first described by Arnett (2004) and this can be seen at all levels of the Chilean education system. However, it it is experienced differently across different levels of Mapuche society. Whilst the Mapurbe are being taught to think critically at the university level and are applying these tools in understanding and expressing their Mapuche identity, young Mapuche men in public boarding schools are being taught to reject their Mapuche identity in order to enter the blue collar work system. The education system in Araucania is divided along ethnic and class lines, as pupils are split between private schools and subsidized public schools. Private schools, which many Mapurbe interviewed attended, are able to "to galvanize financial resources and selective intakes to ensure quality education. By contrast, rural, private, non-profit, state-subsidized and municipal schools with fewer resources and facilities concentrate pupils from low income, and often rural indigenous, families" (Webb and Radcliffe, 2015; 218). The Mapuche interviewed, and the majority of the young Mapuche population in the Araucania region, are educated in urban boarding schools in which they live Monday to Friday and return to the countryside for the weekend.

The Mapurbe have a very different educational experience than most Mapuche. Even if they did not have parents with traditional white collar jobs, each of them has been educated in a private school environment. For example, as one respondent explains:

My mum went to work, in the kinds of jobs that Mapuches normally do in the capital, she went to work as a maid. So my upbringing was between her and her employers. She had to take me to work because she didn't have any place to leave me. And her bosses financed my education, they adopted me like a son. So I went to a private school in Santiago, that was very posh, very expensive. (*Franco*, 29)

This type of education provides Mapuche youths with more social capital than they would acquire at a state funded school and this may be one of the reasons the Mapurbe are interested in creativity and education. Their abilities as potters, teachers and actors may stem from the cultural capital gained through private education. For example, a 16-year-old private school student from Santiago describes his interest in the arts:

I'm very artistic. I like to play the violin. I like to do theatre. I would really love to study theatre. (Fernando, 16, Focus Group 3)

The boarding school students from Temuco (discussed below) do not have the same access to arts education and this may be a reason why they do not fill the creative roles deemed so important by the Mapurbe. This social and educational capital also allowed all the Mapurbe interviewed to attend university which has raised awareness of ethnic identity. One participant explains:

When I went to university, I was 20 years old, I came to Temuco and I rented a room. The thing was they put all the Mapuche together in this building, it was just on the corner from the University. And this space was truly like a tornado in my life. It was full of young Mapuche. People who came from the rural communities to study at University. So basically when young Mapuche came to university from rural areas there was nowhere for them to live, nowhere to eat, they were poor. And this place was empty, so they just took it. And then the police came and they really had to fight for it. It was a long time they were fighting for that space, but finally they converted it into a home for young Mapuches who came from all over. And in this space there were like 110 people. Men and women. And we all lived together in what was essentially a community. It was a community but in the urban context. And a lot of these young people came directly from the communities, so they brought with them their authentic identity, they had the culture. So people like me who arrived from Santiago, we had the surname but we didn't know anything. So they told us everything we needed to know. And from that day forward, I am what you see before you. A Mapuche. I went back to Santiago and I joined the Mapurbe. From that experience I wanted to work in the Mapuche world and so did a lot of other people. In the artistic world. It all became clear. (Jorge, 28)

Mapurbe who went to university in Santiago may not have had the same experience of information sharing with rural Mapuche as those who study in Temuco, but they also recall a time of awakening at university, mainly because of the critical ways in which they were taught to think:

I'm 25 and I think I realized my identity when I was around 18. At 18 I began to wake up a bit. I was always interested in knowing and understanding, so when I went to University and they began to teach me to be critical of the things around me I began to think about the national histories and I began to challenge them. (*Diego*, 25)

Diego also believes that there are some flaws within the Chilean education system, in that it does not promote or acknowledge Mapuche histories. However, with the tools it has provided, he was able to challenge this system himself:

So university provided us with the tools, but not with the literature. So with my friends we formed this post-colonial study group. This was in around 2013, 2014. The majority of us were Mapuche, there were others who weren't but who were aware of our conditions. So we formed this group and we began to study everyone, Fanon, Spivak, Said and others that I don't know how to pronounce. And others from Latin America, Camila Aura Cumes, who's a sociologist from Mexico and she's indigenous. Because in our lecture list there were no Latin American authors, so we started this group and we did it ourselves (*Diego*, *25*).

Diego also laments how Mapuche world-views are lacking from the Chilean University system:

It's a totally different outlook and they never mentioned that in geography. For example, when they are explaining volcanoes, they talk about tectonic plates, but the Mapuche have a completely different explanation. There's an explanation that the spirits are the owners of this place. But they don't want to teach any other way of thinking apart from the scientific way. They never incorporated other ways of thinking or other explanations. And I think to incorporate that would be really valuable. But to them it's not, they want to reproduce a certain type of thinking that is useful in their system. They want to make people who are going to go and work in their world. They want to reproduce the structure. This is why the Mapurbe have to teach other ways of knowing, thinking and living. We've got to break this structure (*Diego*, *25*).

Despite the high level of education of the Mapurbe, The World Bank (2002) has shown that, in general, the educational status of the Mapuche is particularly low, with less than 3% of the total population having any type of educational training beyond high school (World Bank 2002). Moreover, indigenous children fare poorly in school, testing at 0.3 - 0.5 standard deviations below the test scores of non-indigenous children (McEwan 2004). For Mapuche youths in Temuco there is no choice but to come to an internado<sup>18</sup> as due to the rurality of their

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Name for Boarding Houses for Mapuche children in the south of Chile

homes there are no accessible schools beyond primary level. The fact that these Mapuche students spend all hours within the Chilean education system means that it is not only their education that is influenced by the Chilean state but also their social lives and all aspects of their daily life. Several students described their daily life in the boarding schools as boring and controlled:

*Vincente*: There are rules, for example there's a timetable. They give you certain times when you can leave to get the things you need. Then you have to sleep at a certain time. You have to eat at a certain time. There's no independence. (Focus Group 2)

They also describe the effects of separation from their families because of their attendance at boarding school:

*Pablo*: I mean, it's tough. You have to be away from your parents. You get used to it, but then you go back and it's a bit, I guess it's a bit awkward. They do all this stuff and for them its normal, like working outside and sometimes they do ritual type stuff. It's nice and all that but sometimes it's a bit embarrassing if you don't know what's happening. So I'd rather just be here playing video games and stuff with my friends. (*Focus Group 2*)

Beyond the act of separation of boarding schools the classist curriculum and the Chile's assimilationist education policy has left Mapuche children behind in the public education system. The Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) shows that Chile's education system has created "a culture that accepted all too easily the tracking of Mapuche children into dead end educational options", and that the main role of schools "appeared to be preparing [Mapuche pupils] to assume subservient roles in society" (2004; 260–261). This situation has not changed in the last decade and the Chilean curriculum still does not include Mapuche studies, such as the language of Mapudungun, focusing instead on civic understanding and what the students deem to be more "useful" skills:

*Felipe:* No they don't teach us Mapudungun. I guess it's getting lost. But the thing is they teach us English, and English is much more useful for getting jobs and that, for travelling for business. You can't use Mapudugnun for that, so why bother.

*Vincente:* I would rather study English, to get a job. You've got to have a profession to survive. You need English to study Engineering. That's what I want to do.

*Felipe:* I want to be successful. Make loads of money. Then after that I can do what I want. After that I can open a relaxation centre, you know, in the mountains, with hot springs and all that. But first you gotta do the graft, make the money.

*Pablo:* I want to be a teacher or a tour guide and you definitely need English for that. I mean Mapudungun is nice and all, you know that's how they told the stories and all that and I guess that is getting lost, but English is English and I don't want to be a poor Mapuche farmer, so Mapudungun isn't gonna help me now. (Focus Group 2)

One teacher explains how placing Mapuche children in boarding schools was the biggest cause of a loss of cultural understanding and ethnic identity:

These schools have a really bad system of education, really bad conditions. The other teachers don't care, they aren't interested in the roots of these children, they don't care what the children learn, they're just doing their job like it says on the curriculum. They don't care about preserving culture and getting the children engaged with natural spaces. You go around these internados and you wouldn't know it was a Mapuche school. There's no plants, vegetable patch, animals, it has nothing like that. They're just like another urban school. It's about spreading these Chilean values. And at the heart of it to be a good Chilean is to have a lot of money. It's being successful. It's being a good capitalist. Totally. (*Cristian, 27*)

However, this does not mean that the boarding school education system fails all Mapuche. The young professional interviewees from Temuco have also been through this education system and they believe themselves to be very successful. They criticise the education experience and believe they have attained success due to their personal hard work. However, they measure their success levels in terms of economic achievement, the amount of money they earned and the respectability of their job. For example, as one participant explains:

I came to Temuco to study at age 14. And I went to primary school in a rural sector. The quality of the education was bad. So when I came to the city and I went to a stable institution the jump was really high. I had to give it everything. But I was automatically at a lower level, so I had to work really hard to get there. And I was bullied, but I had

to be able to laugh about it, it was a time when the indigenous topic was really precarious, so I laughed and I worked. Now they have it easier, there is no discrimination. But I worked and I got here, and now I have a job in the government. And that's down to my hard work. (*Patricio*, 31)

One participant explains that Mapuche people can only move forward through hard work and that the quality of the schooling is irrelevant if they work hard enough:

I used to walk 6km to go to school. In winter and in summer, that was in the countryside. And then I went to boarding school. And it was complicated, you had to pay to study. A lot. It's not like now when you have the indigenous grant, and they give the grant to all the Mapuches. I paid for my studies. I worked and I studied. And it wasn't free. But whatever it costs you have to get out of the poverty cycle. Getting educated changes everything. It's like culture evolves, first we lived in mud huts, then wood, then stone. Well first we weren't educated and then we were. That's the way it goes. (*Alexis*, 29)

Thus, these young Mapuche professionals see themselves as having 'made it' within the capitalist system and they do not contest the functioning of this system. Their desire to succeed within the education system stems largely from a desire to provide for their families. As Francisco suggests:

I had to become educated. Who else would provide for my family? I have a child and I'm getting married, so who else would provide for them if I didn't. I don't want them to grow up poor like I did. I don't want people to see them and say, oh that kid's a Mapuche, he must be from the communities. No. I want my kid to have the same as all the other kids have. The only way I can provide for him is by working hard. I'm not here for government handouts. (*Francisco*, 23)

The young Mapuche professionals base their masculinity on a class cleavage, understanding men to be the providers for their families (see previous chapters) and education as the tool to achieve the skills they see as necessary to be breadwinners. Thus, differing education systems can be said to have an effect on the formation of Mapuche masculinities. The different systems that are largely separated based on class have an effect on the ethnic education of Mapuche youth, with the private system allowing for a greater focus on cultural studies and an ability to

critique mainstream Chilean discourses that stereotype Mapuche men, whilst the public system

is more aimed towards creating homogenised Chilean citizens.

Mapuche Youth Engagement in Politics

Recent political geographies of youth suggest that young people are not silent in their

marginalisation, contesting their lack of civic status through everyday practices (Skelton,

2013). As Webb and Radcliffe argue, this is the case for young Mapuche in southern Chile:

"young Mapuche present themselves not only as future citizens, but as subjects with currently

valid opinions and demands for a fairer civil society" (2015; 226). However, while this may

be the case, the findings of this research suggest that the level of Mapuche political engagement

appears to vary between class groups.

The young students within the Temuco boarding school system have little knowledge of the

Mapuche conflict, partly because the curriculum does not cover this aspect of being Mapuche:

David: The conflict doesn't reach the school.

*Alejandro:* We don't hear about it.

David: And none of us are part of it. Obviously. (Focus Group 1)

Nevertheless, the young students are aware of the stereotypes about the Mapuche, however

participants and are keen to reject them. They challenge the idea that the Mapuche commit the

'terrorist' acts. According to one participant:

The Mapuche don't do bad things. People say the Mapuche are terrorists. That's such

a horrible word. It's like they're calling us Nazis. The Mapuche aren't really like that.

The Mapuche are helpful. So they say they're terrorists and whenever there's a problem

they blame the Mapuche. But I think it's other people who are to blame, I think there

are other people who use the benefits of being Mapuche to do bad things. For example,

you've come from England, and you're really interested in Mapuche culture, so people

who aren't Mapuche pretend to be and then ask for money, saying they're going to buy

the clothes, which cost like 2 million (pesos), but they're lying. There are people who

come from other countries who are able to pay this, and so they take advantage of it.

143

And then they use that money to cause trouble. That's what I think really happens, it has nothing to do with the Mapuche. (Alejandro, 19, Focus Group 1)

Alejandro rejects the depictions of Mapuche as terrorists, attributing this to the confusion of Mapuche with a few rogue people who use the indigenous 'benefits' for problematic ends. However, a social worker who works with these youths describes the reality of their unacknowledged persecution by the state:

The poor Mapuche are persecuted. The government want them to assimilate. They came to the house opposite looking for "terrorists". They took everybody outside, violently. Even the grandmother. They had them all handcuffed while they went through their house looking for weapons. They said they were working with FARC. Now I don't know anyone like that, maybe there are some, but I don't know them. There are people on the extreme left everywhere, it's not something to do with the Mapuche and they don't represent the true Mapuche. You know Nancy, well she is a singer-songwriter. They (the government) persecuted her, they smashed her car, they told her not to sing here. She came anyway and all the Mapuche made a circle of protection around her. We had a protest in the Cathedral and invited the press, none of them came, but when a policeman gets killed it's all over the news. It's all controlled by the government. (Wilson, 30).

The young, professional Mapuche also believe that it is not the Mapuche who are committing the acts of terrorism. However, they are more cynical towards the government and the press than the students, believing they are manipulating and controlling the situation for their benefit. For example, one respondent explains:

They omit lots of things from the press. It's better for the press that the Chileans or even the Americans come out looking better in the press. They want positive press for the government. And of course those who have lots of money. And when you think about it the government is full of people with lots of money. And the press is owned by the rich media moguls. So it's a game of money, they sort it out between themselves, it's easier for them to blame it on us. They go, burn a few trucks, put it on the news and everyone turns against the Mapuche. So then the rich people can keep the lands they took. And nobody cares, because the Mapuche are violent, right. So, the conflict is

pointless, it's a utopia. We will never get those lands back in this system. (Francisco, 23)

These young professionals are aware that the government manipulates the situation to make the Mapuche look bad and arguably that it is not in the government's interests to resolve the conflict. They suggest that the government attempts to divide the country along ethnic lines in order to avoid a class-based rebellion. However, these professionals, who are immersed within the capitalist system, believe that there is no way out of the system now that they are absorbed and thus participation in the Araucania conflict is futile. As one participant recalls:

My dad told me about when he used to work in the countryside on a farm. The farm belonged to a famous colonial family and in this time they set up an emporium. They sold fat, seeds, petrol, fertiliser, whatever you can imagine. So the Mapuche from that sector started to go and buy things, they'd go and buy a bit of salt, some extra vegetables, farm equipment. But in those days they didn't have any money, they just used a system of exchange, I give you something, you give me something in return. So, in the emporium they would go in and the guy would give them a bit of salt and say "oh you don't have the money to pay me... don't worry about it! Just give me a bit of your land. Give me one hectare, or two, or three hectares." Up until the point where they had given away thousands of hectares. And then they were left with nothing, so they had to go and work for the farmer to survive. This is on the other side of Vilcun. And there it's really a war zone, they've got soldiers stationed and everything. But what can you say? They can't have their lands back. They gave them away willingly. They entered the capitalist system. So now we stay in it. And those of us who work hard are doing well in it. (*Alexis*, *29*)

The Mapurbe participants, however, whilst tending to agree that the government use divide and rule tactics in order to encourage Mapuche assimilation, believe that there are alternatives to absorption into the capitalist system. They tend to promote ethnic association over civic ties. For example, as one participant argues:

They shake your hand with one hand and they stab you with the other. They want to keep us down. Keep us poor. They used us to win their war, they take out warriors' names. They named a regiment after Tupac. So we are literally being killed by a

regiment named after our own warrior. They are fucking us over. But what everybody else sees is the money they give us. They build a community centre and they give out a couple of indigenous grants and so everyone else in Chile who is poor thinks, why aren't we getting this? Why aren't we getting grants to go to university? So they divide us. They divide to rule. It's a strategy the government uses to stop the movement growing. So if we could just educate ourselves a bit more. If we could just study a bit more. Then we would all realise what was happening. And I think we would all think differently. It's not just about going to university. All you have to do is think. Show them that if you draw a circle and then you cut it in half, how can this circle survive. We just get what we're given right now. So we have to educate ourselves. (Sebastian, 25)

Many of the Mapurbe interviewed had at some point been involved in protests, over the return of their lands, in contrast with the idea put forward by the southern Mapuche that these conflicts do not involve any Mapuche. However, while the Mapurbe may have been involved in the past, they now encourage an involvement in the educative role of masculinity and peaceful opposition to the Chilean government. For example:

When I was younger, in my past, I was more political. I went to the protests. I got in trouble a few times. But now I'm more traditionalist. It's more important for me to listen to the elder's advice. Converse, drink mate, and listen to what they can teach you. With reference to getting the lands back I think there are things that you can do, peacefully. As I said now I'm more relaxed, before I had my hands in a lot of things. I still have friends who are armed, but like I said now it's all about peaceful actions. Education. But we still don't take anything from the state. It's a political stand against them. (*Diego*, 25)

Unlike the young professionals, many Mapurbe respondents believe that they can regain their lands and return to their precolonial, pre-capitalist lifestyle, which can only be achieved through education. Thus, they argue the new call to arms is for the Mapuche to educate themselves:

The idea is to get the lands back. I think first you have to educate yourself. Study. Read. A person who is easily influenced doesn't serve any purpose. You can say to them,

"hey, we're going to take this farm back". But they have to know why. There has to be a deeper meaning and level of thinking behind it all. We can get out of poverty and get our lands back if we study. But we have to know why we're studying. If not, it doesn't mean anything. You have to look behind, it's not just to increase your personal ego but you have to study to help, the community, your family. There are a lot of different Mapuches, there are loads of us. And we all have different ways of thinking. But as long as you know why you think that, then that's what counts. From there we can open debate. And we can get our lands back. Because that's what this is about. (Sebastian, 25).

The Mapurbe participants are interested in using their education to challenge the negative portrayals of the Mapuche by the Chilean government. The Mapurbe poet David Aniñir, the founding father of the Mapurbe neo-tribe, has challenged the representations of the Mapuche as violent through his poetry. In his poem *Non-Standardised Indian*, Aniñir both mocks and condemns the prejudice associated with descriptions in the Chilean media of Urban Mapuche:

According to the population census carried out in Chile

You consider yourself;

Lazy

Foul-smelling

Drunken

Lice-ridden

Flea-bitten

Aboriginal

Uncivilised

...

Illiterate

Barbarian

Uneducated

. . .

Definitions never uttered by Mapuche. What other disqualifiers

Or declassifications are left to name?

Racist Trinuke Fucked

Let's be clear about this

Take a little longer and say the word Mapuche Treat me with respect (Aniñir, 2011)

Academics such as Luco (2014) and Collins (2008) misread Aniñir's poetry by claiming it reveals the Mapurbe as marked by "the misery of urban poverty" (Luco, 2004). In contrast, Aniñir attempts to engage with Mapuche across class, masculinity and many other social formations. He challenges the stereotypes that the government promote about Mapuche men and shows that in reality Mapuche men can be educated and politically active.

The Mapurbe interviewed are interested in deconstructing negative representations of the Mapuche within popular media, they are also interested in reconstructing the gender role system and using education as a tool for land reclamation, whilst also rejecting help from the government. Thus, the Mapurbe identity could be said to reject class cleavages in favour of an ethnic based masculinity. In contrast, the working class Mapuche have little chance at becoming well educated and thus cannot afford to abandon government help, such as indigenous grants to attend university. They do not share the same views as the Mapurbe because their social capital is much lower. While they may understand the problems with the government, they are educated within a system that promotes civic political identities.

#### Conclusions

Mapuche masculinities are influenced by a complex intertwining of class and ethnicity. The Mapuche are situated within the deeply unequal Chilean class system. Within this system the Mapuche are largely categorized as part of the campesino working class and stereotyped as such. The Mapuche are represented as poor with violent, Machismo characteristics. However, this research contradicts some of these stereotypes, by highlighting the multiple class positions of Mapuche young men and how this shapes their masculinities.

The Mapurbe have achieved economic stability and so are interested in promoting their ethnic masculinities, continuing to perform an ethicized version of their masculinities despite discrimination. They are able to promote an ethnic masculinity because they are in an economically stable position where they can reject help from the government. The Mapurbe participants also have a high level of social and cultural capital because of their private school education, that has given them an ability to perform more cultured masculinities, with political

aims. In comparison, the participants from Temuco all have roots in the campesino working class. The young students are enrolled in a boarding school system that separates them from their ethnic roots and is engaged in creating Chilean citizens. The students express an ethnicised, class based identity through an interest in violence, which does not challenge stereotypes about Mapuche masculinities. Young Mapuche professionals, while also from working class roots reject violent Mapuche stereotypes. These participants are concerned with progressing economically and as such their masculine identities are shaped by their understanding of their economic role as the provider. It can be seen that, Mapuche masculinities are in constant formation and are influenced by complex intersections of gender, class and ethnicity.

# **Chapter 7. Conclusions**

This thesis has sought to contribute to knowledge on the formation of masculinities, particularly within urban indigenous youth groups. It engages with debates on men and masculinities, specifically Latin American and indigenous masculinities, intersectionality and hybridity. The aim is to promote an understanding of multiple and intersectional masculinities through a case study of Mapuche urban youth identities. The research attempted to understand the ways in which young Mapuche men negotiate masculinities, how young Mapuche men perform their masculinities on an everyday basis, the ways in which Mapuche masculinities are expressed and performed in response to popular opinion and government policy, and the ways in which Mapuche masculinities are shaped by class, ethnicity, gender and place. In what follows, I draw out the main conclusions from the findings.

## The Multiplicity and Variation of Mapuche Masculinities

This thesis contradicts the positioning of sex-gender binaries. It rejects the idea that sex can be equated to gender and instead argues that bodies are rendered as gendered through social processes (Foucault, 1975; Stoller, 1976). The research shows that masculinities are not a natural category and highlights that masculinities can occur in a plurality of forms. The research discusses three groups of young, urban Mapuche men, each of which perform distinct masculine identities. These masculinities are different and competing and yet at the same time they also express similarities. Thus, this thesis challenges the reliance of some scholars of masculinity on Connell's notion of 'hegemonic masculinity' by suggesting that masculinities can be at once hegemonic, complicit and marginalized. It argues that there is always overlap within and between masculinities and contradictions in the ways in which individual men identify as Mapuche.

The thesis discusses the performances of masculinities by young Mapurbe men, Mapuche boarding school students and young Mapuche professionals, all within an urban context. Mapurbe performances of masculinities centre on what they believe to be an engagement with traditional culture. Mapurbe young men have recreated traditional ceremonies and rituals within the urban context and aim to live a life as close to Mapuche traditions as possible. They associate Mapuche masculinities with traditional understandings of indigenous masculinities, which focus on complementarity (Innes and Anderson, 2015). The Mapurbe believe that both men and women contribute equally to society and community and with no gender divisions to

Mapuche life. By promoting complementarity, the Mapurbe perform what they believe to be a traditional role-based masculinity, in which each member of the community must fill specific roles that are necessary and for which they have the skills. Currently these roles are focused upon creativity and education, such as weaving and ceramics, despite these roles being typically imagined as those of women. By promoting traditional indigenous masculinities, Mapurbe men are rejecting the hegemonic masculinity that is present within Chile. They challenge the idea that men must be macho and are instead interested in promoting a new ideology that connects with Mapuche feminism. The Mapurbe view an idealised Mapuche masculinity as coming from within the Mapurbe group; they see Mapuche masculinities as very much alive and challenging both hegemonic Chilean masculinities and stereotypes of Mapuche masculinities.

In contrast, young Mapuche boarding school students perform masculinities that are often in some ways similar, but simultaneously quite different to Mapurbe masculinities. Unlike the Mapurbe they believe that cultural understandings of Mapuche masculinities have been eroded. However, the boarding school students are still interested in what they believe to be traditional Mapuche masculinities. They understand Mapuche masculinities as rooted in ethnic identifications, such as blood ties and surnames. They claim to be more "Mapuche" when they go home and express their masculinities through violence. Despite the fact one can question whether these participants actually engage in violence, since bravado may have played a part in the focus group discussion, by making such allusions they accept stereotypical representations of Mapuche men as violent. They also represented their idealised understanding of Mapuche masculinities through representations of Lautaro and Caupolican, Mapuche warriors who engaged in violent acts during the war with the Spanish. As with the students, Lautaro and Caupolican are also used as idealised representations of Mapuche masculinities by young Mapuche professionals. However, whilst they invoke similar representations of Mapuche masculinities, the young professionals engage with these masculinities as part of what they refer to as 'a dead culture'. They see masculinity through the idea of the man as a provider and believe that the man should be the main breadwinner within the household, providing for his family. The young Mapuche professionals thus simultaneously invoke and challenge hegemonic understandings of masculinity because they view themselves as rebelling against the state through their own survival and success within the Chilean economic system. By revealing the existence of multiple masculinities within one small group of urban Mapuche young men, the research challenges the idea that Latin American masculinities can be reduced

to the idea of a singular mestizo male (Viveros Vigoya, 2001). Moreover, the thesis challenges the idea that Mapuche men (and indigenous men more generally) can be reduced to violent, alcoholic stereotypes. By rejecting the sex-gender binary the research contributes to the deconstruction of gender as difference that Lorber (2000) began 17 years ago, when she argued that gender as a social category must be rejected.

### Hybrid Mapuche Masculinities

This research shows that Mapuche masculinities, whilst dynamic and various, are always hybrid. Mapuche masculinities are negotiated within a third space in which indigenous and Chilean masculinities are inseparable. Whilst the Chilean state promotes a utopian cosmopolitanism in which all citizens perform civic Chilean identities, the research shows that young Mapuche men perform a variety of hybrid identities that are at once complicit in and resistant to hegemonic Chilean masculinities.

Mapuche boarding school students perform mixed masculinities that are at once Chilean and Mapuche. Whilst the boarding students are interested in discussing violence and view this as a traditional performance of Mapuche masculinity, in their daily lives within the boarding school they also perform masculinities that they view as distinctly Chilean. The students dress in western style clothing and listen to western music. They are more interested in learning English than Mapudungun and see the benefits of entering the Chilean economic system. Many of the student participants see their lives as divided between performances of Chileaness in the city and Mapucheness in the countryside, but opinions are divided over where they wish to spend their futures. The young Mapuche students embrace a hybrid mix of Chilean and Mapuche identities.

Similarly, Mapurbe young men and young Mapuche professionals also perform hybrid masculinities. In the case of the Mapurbe, this is despite arguing that they are living a traditional Mapuche life. They have adapted certain rural traditions within the urban context and traditions have been updated to thrive within city spaces. Some Mapurbe roles have become hybridised in order to encourage the interest of young Mapuche and hybrid creations such as Mapuche rap have emerged as a kind of sub-culture. In the case of the young professional men, they have a wide knowledge of Mapuche culture and tradition and have spent much of their life living in the traditional rural communities, often attending traditional ceremonies. However, these

participants choose to perform what they view as a mainstream Chilean masculinity on a daily basis that encourages stereotypes of the man as provider. While these masculinities are not unproblematic, the research shows that their hybridity can be used as a tool for resistance as participants move forward economically and challenge government stereotypes of indigenous masculinities (Anzaldua, 2007).

### **Intersectional Mapuche Masculinities**

The thesis has explored Mapuche masculinities through an intersectional framework. The research promotes the argument that masculinities can only be explored through relations to other differences, demonstrating that, in the case of Mapuche men, class and ethnicity are gendered and vice versa. However, the research also extends explorations of intersectionality by promoting the idea that intersectionality must also incorporate considerations of the influence of place. The research findings suggest that different masculinities have arisen because of different relationships between place, both between cities and between urban and rural contexts. There are differences between Mapuche from the south, such as the boarding school students and the young professionals, and the Mapurbe from Santiago. The Mapurbe participants tend to believe that a connection to culture is more important, whilst the Southern Mapuche participants tend to believe that to be a Mapuche they must have a strong connection to traditional lands. The Mapurbe in Santiago have adapted to their urban environment by creating their own spaces, such as ceremonial centres, within the city. Santiago is a multicultural city and thus the Mapuche are much more accepted within the city and are able to express their identities and promote their own culture. The Mapurbe promote a Mapuche masculinity that is more focused on culture than lands, meaning that they have a strong knowledge of Mapuche traditions, including an apparent grasp of the Mapudungun language. In comparison, the city of Temuco is described by participants as a 'white city', in which the government is much more focused on Eurocentric ideals than promoting Mapuche culture. The Mapuche in Temuco are located within the centre of the Araucanian conflict and often face much more political and social repression than those in Santiago. Thus, Temuco is described by some participants as a 'city without culture'. However, the Mapuche living in Temuco also have a stronger connection to rural homelands than those in Santiago. Many Mapuche in Temuco were able to return to their traditional lands and their masculinities are much more centred on lands and ethnic ties than any singular notion of Mapuche culture. It is clear that the specifities of different places, both urban and rural, enables and gives rise to the performance

of a range of different Mapuche masculinities. Thus, it is apparent that masculinities are not fixed and indigenous masculinities in Chile vary across both urban and rural space and also between cities. However, place is not the sole factor that contributes to the diverse construction of Mapuche masculinities. Rather, place intersects with class and ethnicity in the performance of Mapuche masculinities.

The research reveals that Mapuche masculinities are influenced by both class and ethnic ties. The Mapurbe are a well-educated group, all having studied at university and having well paid jobs, mainly in education and the creative industries. The Mapurbe are more able to engage with their ethnicity because their education has promoted a form of critical thinking and often allows them to associate with wider Mapuche political movements. The fact that the Mapurbe have a relatively large amount of disposable income means that their lives are more stable: they can reject help offered by the government and (per)form their own ethnic identities. In their case, as class cleavages decline, ethnic identity grows. In comparison, the boarding school students are part of the Chilean campesino working class. They explain that their ethnic identity is not a focus for their lives when they have other important factors to consider, such as getting a job and making a living. The boarding school students are receiving a civic education within the Chilean system that does not promote ethnic diversity and this may be a factor in ensuring that their identities are expressed more as a means of surviving in economic terms. The young Mapuche professionals have experienced the same system of education, but they have moved from the working classes into the middle classes and are more interested in their provider roles as economic. The young Mapuche professionals tend to express their masculinity as a class identity and as a specific gender role, understanding men to be the providers for their families and education as the tool to achieve the skills they believe necessary to be the breadwinners. The different groups of Mapuche men had some level of political awareness, but the findings suggest that their disposable income and education level influences their political awareness and activism, which is in turn related to the different ways in which they identify as Mapuche men

The research reveals that an intersectional approach is vital to understanding diverse masculinities, particularly among indigenous groups. Gender is constructed through space on local and national scales, with different constructions being present in different cities as result of environmental and political differences. Gender performances are also different between rural and urban environments. However, place is just one factor that influences gender

performances and this thesis has explored the importance of discussing gender as refracted through class and ethnic lenses. By using an intersectional approach men are (re)gendered, challenging previous work that has represented men as genderless or neutral in gender performances. Furthermore, through using intersectionality this research encourages the understanding of gender, indigeneity and class as occurring simultaneously, with each performance influencing the other (Crenshaw, 1989).

### Limitations of the Research

The research was limited in its scope because of time restrictions. It was undertaken during a one-month period, meaning that the research was restricted to 16 interviews and 5 focus groups. This time restriction meant that the research did not engage with truly participatory methodologies. Whilst the methodologies chosen attempted to overcome this, the participants were not fully active agents in the creation of this research. Thus, whilst this research attempts to reduce the ways in which it speaks about participants, due to the time frame the participants' voices are not fully heard within the research and neither does the research fully follow an indigenous methodology. However, the methodologies that were chosen ensured the research was done in the most ethical way given the limitations. The time limitations of this research also meant that not all of the factors that influence identity formation could be discussed. The research focused on the intersections between place, ethnicity, class and gender, mainly because these were the factors that appeared most frequently within the research. In comparison, age and sexuality were not discussed. All Mapuche participants were considered to fit within the label 'youth', the age range was set at 16 to 32. However, there was no discussion of how age differences influenced masculinities and how the transition between education and work has an influence. Likewise, the influence of sexuality is not discussed and a discussion of men who have sex with men and homosexual masculinities is lacking in the discussion. Engaging with these factors would have made this research more intersectional. A final limitation of this research is its restriction to discussing men. The research shows that gender and masculinities are socially constructed and as such rejects the sex-gender binary. As masculinity is a set of performed characteristics, women too can perform these characteristics. This research does not take into account the performed masculinities of urban, Mapuche women.

### Implications of the Research

Understanding Mapuche masculinities as multiple and intersecting has some implications for the way in which indigenous masculinities and their geographies are understood. Firstly, the research challenges the concept of hegemonic masculinity (Connell, 1998; Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005). This remains a key concept for framing masculinities within geography, but this research suggests that masculinities do not fit within bounded categories and instead should be considered as fluid and porous. This research shows that masculinities cannot be placed within a hierarchy; instead they can be at once marginalized, complicit and hegemonic. Therefore, the rigid theories we use to understand masculinities should perhaps be deconstructed. Secondly, this research promotes an intersectional approach to studies of masculinity, arguing that no single identity can represent everyday realities. However, the research also illustrates that understandings of intersectionality need to be expanded in order to include place as a factor in identity formation. Research with young Mapuche men suggests that environmental and political factors that shape the nature of place also influence the identities and masculinities of those who have an attachment to these places. Intersectionality, in particular, is a valuable framework through which to study marginalized identities as it rejects the idea that marginalization is an additive effect and instead promotes the simultaneity of marginalization, where each identity performance is influenced by the other. Finally, this research questions some mainstream definitions and representations of indigeneity. Whilst it demonstrates that Mapuche masculinities are multiple, it also suggests that all indigenous identities are multiple. Within ethnic groups, identities are multiple and various, meaning that static definitions of indigeneity focusing on land association and culture do not incorporate people who identify as indigenous. Thus it can be argued that it is necessary to create a richer understanding of diverse expressions of modern indigeneity. Additionally, the research suggests that indigenous masculinities are also hybrid. The research engaged with a group of Mapuche men with the aim of challenging the fetishizing of indigenous people within scholarly studies that promote traditional essentialist understandings of indigenous people.

This research has shown that intersectionality and hybridity are important concepts for understanding masculinities as multiple and varied and in breaking down fetishized dichotomies surrounding indigenous men. It suggests that more research is required that uses an intersectional approach to explore indigenous masculinities as a means of challenging homogenizing representations and giving voice to men who identify as indigenous. I suggest that an exploration of the ways in which different masculinities engage both with each other and with femininities merits further research. This would play an important role in the

decolonisation of indigenous studies and help to reframe understandings of what it means to
be indigenous.

## **Bibliography**

Abrams, L. 2008. Constructing Masculinities in Juvenile Corrections, *Men and Masculinities*, 11(1), pp. 22-41

Absolon, K and Willett, C. 2004. Aboriginal Research: Berry Picking and Hunting in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century, *The First Peoples Child and Family Review*, 1(1)

Acevedo, O. F. 1999. Feminizacion de la pobreza y retroceso de la paternidad en sectores populares de Medellin, *Cuadernos Familia Cultura y Socedad*, 3(4) pp. 123-333

Acker, J. 1999. Rewriting Class, Race and Gender, Problems in Feminist rethinking, in Ferree, M. M. Lorber, J. Hess, B. B. (eds). 1999, *Revisioning Gender*, Rowman Altamira

Ader, D. 2009. People of the Land and Poverty: Mapuche Inequality after Decades of Economic Reforms in Chile, Unpublished PhD Thesis, Pennsylvania State University

Agonstini, C. Brown, P. and Roman, A. 2008. Estimating poverty for indigenous groups in Chile by matching census and survey data, William Davidson Institute, Working Paper Number 932

Aitken, S. C. 2001. *Geographies of Young People: The Morally Contested Spaces of Identity*, London: Routledge

Aitken, S. Ragnhild, L. and Kjorholt, A. 2007. Special issue on "Global Childhoods: Why Children's Geographies 5(1-2), pp. 1-187

Alcantara, C. H. 2008. Indigenous Peoples, Poverty and Human Development in Latin America, *Development and Change*, 39(1) pp. 189-191

Alcoff, L. 1995. The Problem of Speaking for Others, in Roof, J and Wiegman, R. (eds). *Who can Speak: authority and critical Identity*, University of Illinois Press

Alcoff, L. M. and Mendieta, E. 2003. *Identities: Race, Class, Gender and Nationality*, Blackwell, Malden

Alfred, T. and Corntassel, J. 2005. Being indigenous: resurgences against contemporary colonialism, *Politics of Identity*, IX

Alfred, T. and Lowe, L. 2006. 'Warrior societies in contemporary indigenous communities' Upping the Anti, *A Journal of Theory and Action* 1(2) pp 82–102.

Allen, J. Massey, D. and Cochrane, A. 1998, *Rethinking the region*, Routledge, London Alvarez, J. C. 2002. *Provincias, regions y comunidades autonomas,la formacion del mapa politico de Espana* Temas del Senado, Madrid

Anaya, S. J. 2004, *Indigenous peoples in international law*, Oxford University Press

Andersen, C. 2013. *Indigenous in the City: Contemporary identities and Cultural innovation*, UBC Press

Andersen, C. 2013. Urban Aboriginality as Distinctive Identity, in Twelve Parts, in Peters, E. and Andersen, C. *Indigenous in the City: Contemporary Identities and Cultural Innovation*, UBC Press

Anderson, K. 2000. Thinking "Postnationally: Dialogue across multicultural, indigenous and settler spaces, *Annals of the association of American geographers*, 90(2), pp. 381-391

Ang, I. and Stratton, J. 1995. The Singapore way of Multiculturalism: Western Concepts/ Asian Cultures, *Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia*, 10(1), pp. 65-89

Aniñir, D. 2009. Mapurbe: veganza a raiz, Pehuen

Anthias, F. 2002. Where do I belong: Narrating Collective identity and translocational positionality, *Ethnicities*, 2(4), pp. 491-514

Antone, B. 2015. Reconstructing Indigenous Masculine Thought in Innes, R. A. and Anderson, K. 2015. *Indigenous Men and Masculinities: Legacies Identities, Regeneration*, University of Manitoba Press.

Anzaldua, G. 2007. Borderlands/ La Frontera: the new Mestiza, Aunt Lute Books, San Francisco

Aravena, A. Gissi, N. and Toledo, G. Los Mapuches mas alla y mas aca de la fronters: identidad etnica en las ciudades de Concepcion y Temuco, *Sociedad Hoy*, 8(9) pp. 117-132

Arce, C. P. et al. 2002. La ciudad y el campo como referents de identidad en adolescents Mapuches de Temuco y Santiago, Universidad Catolica de Temuco

Archer, L. and Yamashita, H. 2003. Knowing their limits? Identities, inequalities and inner city school leavers, post 16 aspirations, *Journal of Education Policy*, 18(1) pp. 53-69

Arnett, J. K. 2004. *Emerging Adulthood: The Winding Road from Late Teens to Early Twenties* Oxford: Oxford University Press

Arnot, M. and Swartz, S. 2012. Youth citizenship and the politics of belonging: introducing contexts, voices, imaginaries, *Comparative Education*, 48(1), pp.1-10

Arnott, T. L. and Matthaei, J. A. 1996. Race, Gender and Work, South End Press

Asher, K. 2013. Latin American Decolonial Thought, or Making the subaltern speak, *Geography Compass*, 7(12), pp. 832-842

Aylwin, J. 1998. Indigenous People's Rights in Chile, *Canadian Association for Latin American and Carribean Studies*, 28<sup>th</sup> Congress, Vancouver

Baca Zinn, M. and Thornton Dill, B. 1993. *Women of Colour in US Society*, Temple University Press

Bacigalupo, A. M. 2004. The Mapuche man who became a woman shaman, *American ethnologist*, 31(3), pp. 440-457

Bacigalupo, A. M. 2004. The struggle for Mapuche shamans' masculinity: colonial politics of gender, sexuality and power in southern Chile, *Ethnohistroy*, 51(3), pp. 489-533

Balibar, E. and Wallerstein, I. 1991. Race, Nation, Class: Ambiguous Identities, Verso

Barnett, C .2011. Geography and Ethics: Justice Unbound, *Progress in Human Geography*, 35(2) pp. 246-255

Barozet, E. and Fierro, J. The middle class in Chile – the characteristics and Evolution 1990-2011, *International Reports*, 12

Barrera-Hernandez, L. 2005. Indigenous Peoples, Human Rights and Natural Resource Development: Chile's Mapuche Peoples and the Right to Water, *Annual Survey of International and Comparative Law*, 11(1)

Bastos, S. 1998, Desbordando patrones: El compoamiento domestic de los hombres, *La Ventana*, 7 pp.166-224

Bazoret, E. and Fierro, J. 2011. *The Middles Class In Chile: The Characteristics and Evolution 1990-2011*, Kas International Reports

Bell, B. 2007. For Aborigines? Rights and Reality, in Gillesepie, N (Ed.) *Reflections, 40 years on from the 1967 Referendum,* Aboriginal Legal Rights Movement, Adelaide

Bengoa, J. 1985. Historia del pueblo Mapuche, Ediciones Sur, Santiago

Bennet, A. 1999. Subcultures or neo-tribes? Rethinking the relationship between youth, style and musical taste, *Sociology*, 33(3), pp. 599-617

Bennet, D. and Bhabba, H. 1998. *Liberalism and minority culture: reflections on Cultures in Between in Multicultural states: rethinking difference and identity, London Routledge* 

Berdegue, J. 2001. Rural Nonfarm Employment and Incomes in Chile, *World Development*, 29(3) pp. 411-425

Berg, L. D. and Longhurst, R. 2003. Placing Masculinities and Geography, *Gender Place and Culture – A Journal of Feminist Geography*, 10(4) pp. 351-360

Berger, J. 1972. Ways of Seeing, Penguin, UK

Berger, M. Wallis, B and Watson, S. 1995. Constructing Masculinity, Routledge, New York

Berkhofer, R. F. 2011. *The White Man's Indian: Images of the American Indian from Columbus to the Present*, Knopf Doubleday Publishing Group

Bernard, J. 1981. The good provider role; its rise and fall, *American Psychologist* (36)1, pp. 1-12

Beynon, J. 2002. Masculinities and Culture, Open University Press, Baltimore

Bhabha, H. 1994. The Location of Culture, Routledge

Bhabha, H. 1998. Anxiety in the Midst of Difference, Political and Legal Anthropology Review, 21(1), pp. 123-137

Bilge, S. 2009. Smuggling Intersectionality into the Study of Masculinity: some methodological challenges, *Feminist Research Methods: An International Conference*, University of Stockholm, pp. 4-9

Blackman, S. 2005. Youth Subcultural Theory: a critical engagement with the concept, its origins and politics, from the Chicago school to postmodernism, *Journal of youth studies*, 8(1), pp. 1-20

Blackman, S. J. 2014. Subculture theory: an historical and contemporary assessment of the concept for understanding deviance, *Deviant Behaviour*, 35, pp. 496-512

Blunt. A and Rose, G. 1994. Writing women and space: colonial and postcolonial geographies, Guilford press

Boccara, G. 2002. The Mapuche people in post Dictatorship Chile, *Etudes Rurales*, 163(16), pp. 283-303

Bourdieu, P. 1997. Outline of a Theory of Practice, CUP, Cambridge

Bourdieu, P. 2003. Participant Objectivation, *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 9(2) pp. 281-294

Bourriaud, N. 2009. Altermodern, Tate

Brace, C. 1999. Finding England everywhere: regional identity and the consturciton of national identity, 189—1940, *Ecumene*, 6, pp. 90-109

Brake, M. 1974. The Skinheads: An English Working Class Subculture, *Youth and Society*, 6(2), pp. 179-200

Braverman, H. 1974. Labour and Monopoly Capital: The Degradation of Work in the Twentieth century, NYU Press

Briggs, J and Sharp, J. 2004. Indigenous knowledges and development: a postcolonial caution, *Third World Quartrly*, 25(4) pp. 661—76

Briones, C. 2007. "Our Struggle Has Just Begun" Experiences of Belonging and Mapuche Formations of Self, *Indigenous Experience Today*, Berg, New York

Brittan, A. 1989. Masculinity and Power, John Wiley and Sons

Brod, H. and Kaufman, M.1994. *Theorizing Masculinities*, Sage Publications

Buchbinder, D. 1994. Masculinities and Identities, Melbourne University Press

Bucholtz, M, 2002. Youth and Cultural Practice, *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 31, pp. 525-552

Butler, J. 1988. Performative Acts and Gender Constitution: an Essay in Phenomenology and Feminist Theory, *Theatre Journal*, 40 (4), pp. 519-531

Caceres, C. 1995, Bisexualidades masculinas en la Lima de los noventa: COnsideraciones de salud sexual, in *Kogan, L (ed)El amor y sus especies,* Pontifica Universidad Catolica del Peru, Lima

Campbell, H. 2000. The Question of Rural Masculinities, Rural Sociology, 65(4), pp. 532-546

Cárcamo-Huechante, L. E. 2010. Mapurbe Wixage anai! Mapuche voices on the air. *The New Centennial Review*, 10, pp. 155–168.

Cardoso, J. L. 1998. Paternidade adolescente: Da Investigacao a intervencao, in Arilha, M. Unebehaum, S and Medrado, B. (eds) *Homens e Masculinidades: Outras Palavras*, Ecos, Sao Paulo

Carrier, J. 1995. *De los Otros: Intimacy and Homosexuality among Mexican Men*, Colombian University Press, New York

Carrigan, T. Connell, B. and Lee, J. 1985. Toward a new sociology of masculinity, *Theory and Society*, 15(5), pp. 551-604

Carter, D. 2010. Chile's Other Histroy, Allende, Pinochet and Redemocratisationin Mapuche Perspective, *Studies in Ethnicity and Nationalism* 10(1)

Casey, E. 2000. Remembering. A phenomenological study, Indiana University Press, Bloomington

Casey, E. 2001. Between geography and philosophy: What does it mean to be in the place world? *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 91, pp. 683-693

Casey, T. 2002. Devolution and Social Capital in the British Regions, *Regional and Federal Studies*, 12, pp. 55-78

Chakrabarty, D. 2009. *Provinsicalising Europe: postcolonial thought and historical difference*, Princeton university press

Chow, E. N. 1994. Women, the family and policy, SUNY Press

Clatterbaugh, K. 1997. Contemporary Perspectives on Masculinity: Men, Women and Politics in Modern Society, Westview Press, Colorado

Clifford, J. 2007. Varieties of indigenous experience: diasporas, homelands sovereignties, in Experiences of Belonging and Mapuche Formations of Self, in *Indigenous Experience Today*, Berg, New York

Coates, K. S. 2004. *A Gloval History of Indigneous Peoples: Struggle and Survival*, Palgrave Macmillan, United Kingdom

Cohn, B. S. 1987. An Anthropologist among the historians and other essays, University of Michigan

Collins, P. H. 1990. Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness and the Politics of Empowerment, Hyman

Collins, S. 2014. Mapurbe: Spiritual decolonisation and the word in the Chilean mierdopolis, *Decolonisation: indigeneity, education and society*, 3(1), pp. 23-47

Connell, R. 1996. Teaching the boys:new research on masculinity and gender strategies for schools, *Teachers College Record*, 98(2) pp. 206-235

Connell, R. W. 1998. Masculinities and globalisation, *Men and Masculinities*, 1(1) pp. 3-23

Connell, R. W. and Messerschmidt. 2005. Hegemonic Masculinity: Rethinking the Concept, *Gender and Society*, pp. 829-859

Connell, R.W, Hearn, J. and Kimmel, M. S. 2004. *Handbook of Studies on Men and Masculinities*, Sage Publications.

Cook, I. 2003. Participant Observation in Clifford N. and Valentine G. (eds.) *Key Methods in Geography*, Sage, London

Cooper, D. 2001. Etiological Niches and Features of Urban and rural Mapuche and non Mapuche delinquency in Chile, University of Chile

Corntassel, J. J. 2003. Who is indigenous? "Peoplehood" and Ethnonationalist Approaches to rearticulating indigenous identity, *Nationalism and Ethnic Politics*, 9(1), pp 75-100

Cornwall, A. and Lindisfarne, N. 2003. *Dislocating Masculinity: Comparative Ethnographies*, Routledge

Cornwall, Edstrom, and Greig. 2011. *Men and Development: Politicizing Masculinities*, Zed Books, London

Course, M. 2011. Becoming Mapuche: Person and Ritual in Indigenous Chile, University of Illinois Press

Crang, M and Cook, I. 1995. *Doing Ethnographies*, Institute of British Geographers

Crang, M. 1999. Nation, region and homeland: history and tradition in Dalarna, Sweden, *Ecumene*, 6, pp. 447-470

Crenshaw, K. 1989. Demarginalising the Intersection of Race and Sex: A black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory and antiracist politics, *The University of Chicago Legal Forum*, 140, pp. 139-167

Crenshaw, K. 1995. Critical race theory: the key writings that formed the movement, The New Press

Crothers, C. 2014. Decolonising methodologies: research and indigenous peoples, *Ethnic and racial studies*, 37(5), pp. 878-880

Crow, J. 2008. Mapuche Poetry in Post Dictatorship Chile; Confronting the Dilemmas of Neoliberal Multiculturalism, *Journal of Latin American Cultural Studies*, 17 (2), pp. 221-240

Crow, J. 2013. The Mapuche in modern Chile: a cultural history, University press of Florida

Crow, J. 2014. From Araucanian warriors to Mapuche terrorists: contesting discourses of gender, race and nation in modern Chile (1810-2010), *Journal of Iberian and Latin American Studies*, 20(1), pp. 75-101

de Gruyter W. Holt, L. and Holloway S. 2006. "Editorial: Theorising Other Childhoods in a Globalised World", *Children's Geographies*, 4, pp.135-142

Demetriou, D. 2001. Connell's Concept of Hegemonic Masculinity: A Critique, *Theory and Society*, 30(3), pp. 337-361

Denetdale, J. N. 2006. Chairmen, Presidents, and Princesses: The Navajo Nation, Gender and the Politics of Tradition, *Wicazo Sa Review*, 21(1), pp. 9-28

Di Giminiani, P. 2015. The becoming of ancestral land: Place and property in Mapuche land claims, *American Ethnologist*, 42(3) pp. 490-503

Diaz, A. 1993. Restructuring and the new working class in Chile, United Nations Research Institute for Social Development

Doel, M. 2010. Analysing cultural texts in Clifford, N. French, S. and Valentine, G. (eds) *Key Methods in Geography*, Sage, London

Donaldson, M. 1993. What is hegemonic masculinity?, *Theory and Society*, 22, pp. 643-657

Driver, F. 1992. Geography's empire: histories of geographical knowledge, *Environment and Planning D; Society and Space*, 10(1) pp. 23-40

Dudgeon, P and Fielder, J. 2006. Third spaces within tertiary places: indigenous Australian studies, *Journal of Community and Applied Social Psychology*, 16(5) pp.396-409

Dudgeon, P. and Fielder, J. 2006, Third Spaces within Tertiary Places: indigenous Australian Studies, *Journal of Community and Applied Social Psychology*, 16, pp. 396-409

Duveen, G. 2001. Representations, ideas, resistance, in Deaux, K. and Phiilogene, G. *Representations of the Social*, Blackwells, Oxford.

Elwood, S. A. 2000. "Placing" Interviews: Location and Scales of Power in Qualitative Research, *The Professional Geographer*, 52(4) pp. 649-657

Engle, P. 1997. The role of men in families: achieving gender equity and supporting children, *Gender and Development*, 5(2), pp. 31-40

Erikson, E, 1968. Identity, youth and Crisis, New York, W W Norton Company

Espiritu, Y. L. 1994. The Intersection of race, ethnicity and class: The multiple identities of second generation Filipinos, *Identities Global Studies in Culture and Power* 1(2) pp. 249-273

Farmer, B. H. 1983, British Geographers overseas, 1933-1983, *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 8(1), pp. 70-79

Fausto-Sterling, A. 2000. Sexing the Body: Gender Politics and the Construction of Sexuality, Basic Books.

Field, L. W. 1994. Who are the Indians? Reconceptualising Indigenous Identity, resistance, and the role of social science in Latin America, *Latin American Research Review*, 2(3), pp. 237-248

Figueroa, J. G. 1998. Algunos elementos para interpreter la presencia de los varones en los procesos de salud reproductive, *Revista de Cadernos de Saude publica*, 14(1), pp. 187-196

Fineman, M. A. 2013. Feminis, Masculinities and Multiple Identities, *Nevada Law Journal*, 13(101) pp. 12-238

Fischer, K. 2009. The influence of neoliberals in Chile, before, during and after Pinochet, in Mirowski P and Plehwe D. (eds) 2009. *The road from month perlerin*, Harvard

Flood, M. 2002. Men and Masculinity: An Assessment of the Term Masculinity in Recent Scholarship on Men, in Pearce, S. and Muller, V. (eds). 2002. *Manning the next millennium, Studies in Masculinities*, Black Swan Press,

Foucault, M. 1975. Discipline and Punish, Vintage Books

Fuller, N. 1997. *Identidades masculinas: Varones de clase media en el Peru*, Pontifica Universidad Catolica del Peru, Lima

Funk, K. 2012. Today There Are No Indigenous People In Chile: Connecting the Mapuche Struggle to Anti Neoliberal Mobilisations in South America (Review Article), *Journal of Politics in Latin America*, 4(2), pp. 125-140

Fuss, D. 1991. Inside/out: Lesbian Theories, Gay Theories, Pscyhology Press

Fyfe, G. and Law, J. 1988. Picturing Power: Visual Depiction and Social Relations Routledge.

Gabrenya, W. K. 2003. Culture and Social Class, *Journal of Cross Cultural Psychology*, 44(6) pp. 874-899

Garcia Canclini, N. 1990. Culturas Hibridas, Lucaya Book Stores

Gastaldo, E. L. 1995. A for a de homem de ferro: a corporalidade nose sported de combate, in Fachel Leal, O. (ed) *Corpo e Significade*, Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul

Giddens, A. 1981. The Class Structure of the Advanced Societies, Hutchinson

Gilroy, P. 1987. There ain't no black in the Union Jack, Routledge

Gilroy, P. 1993. The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness, Verso, London

Glenn, E. N. 1999. The social construction and institutionalization of gender and race, in Ferree, M. M. Lorber, J. Hess, B. B. (eds). 1999, *Revisioning Gender*, Rowman Altamira

Goss, J. D. 1996. Focus Groups as Alternative Research Practice: experience with Transmigrants in Indonesia, *Area*, 28(2) pp. 115-123

Grinyer, A. 2002. The Anonymity of Research Participants: Assumptions, Ethics and Practices, *Social Research Update*, 36

Guevera, T. 1910. Los Araucanos en la revolucion de independencia, Imprenta Cervantes, Santiago

Gurr, T. R. 1993. Why minorities rebel: A global analysis of communal mobilization and conflict since 1945, *International Political Science Review*, 14(2) pp. 161-201

Gutmann, M. 2003. Changing men and masculinities in Latin America, Duke University Press

Gutmann, M. C and Viveros Vigoya, M. 2004. Masculinities in Latin America, in Kimmel, S. Hearn, J. and Connell, R. W. 2004. *Handbook of Studies on Men and Masculinities*, Sage

Gutmann, M. C. 1996, *The Meaning of Macho*, University of California Press

Gutmann, M.C. 2003. Discarding Manly Dichotomies in Latin America, in Gutmann, M. C. 2003. *Changing Men and Masculinities in Latin America*, Duke University Press

Guzman, V and Portocarrero, P 1992. Construyendo diferencias, Flora Tristan Ediciones, Lima

Haartsen, T. Groote, P and Huigen, P. P. P. 2000, *Claiming rural identities*, Assen, Van Gorgum

Hale, C. and Millaman, R. 2006. Cultural Agency and Political Struggle in the Era of the Indio Permitido, Sommer, D (ed.), in *Cultural Agency in the Americas*, Duke University Press

Hall, S. 1992. The question of cultural identity, in Hall. S. Held, D. McGrew. A (eds) *Modernity* and it's futures, Polity Press, Cambridge

Hancock, A. M. 2007. When Multiplication Doesn't Equal Quick Addition: Examining Intersectionality as a Research Paradigm, *Perspectives on Politics*, 5(1) pp. 63-79

Handler, R. et al. 1984. On Sociocultural Discontinuity: Nationalism and Cultural Objectification in Quebec, *Current Anthropology*, 25(1), pp. 55-71

Hannerz, U. 1990. Cosmopolitans and Locals in World Culture, *Theory, Culture and Society*, 7, pp. 237-251

Hanson, A. 1989. The Making of the Maori: Culture Invention and its logic, *American Anthropologist*, 91(4), pp. 890-902

Haraway, D. 1991. Simians, *Cyborgs and Women: The Reinvention of Nature*, Routlegde, New York

Harris, A. 1990. Race and Essentialism in Feminist Legal Theory, *Stanford Law Review*, 42, 581

Harvey, D. 1997. Justice, Nature and the Geography of Difference, Wiley

Haugh, A. L. 2007. Identity and place: a critical comparison of three identity theories, *Architectural Science Review*, 43(3), pp. 1-15

Haughney, D. 2012. Defending Territory, Demanding Participation, Mapuche Struggles in Chile, *Latin American Perspectives*, 39(4), pp. 201-217

Hearn, J. 1996, Is Masculinity Dead? A critical Account of the Concept of Masculinity/ Masculinities, in Mac an Ghaill, M. (ed). 1996. *Understanding Masculinities*, Open University Press, Philadelphia

Hearn, J. 2009. Patriarchies, transpatriarchies and intersectionalities, in Olesky, E. (ed.) *Intimate Citizenships: Gender, Sexualities, Politics, London, Routledge* 

Hearn, J. and Collinson, D. L. 1997, Men, Masculinities, Managements and Organisational Culture, *German Journal of Human Resource Management*, 12(2), pp. 210-222

Henao, H. 1994. El hombre finisecular en busca de identidad: reflexiones a partir dl caso antioqueno, Paper presented at the symposium on Sexualidad y Construccion de Identidad de Genero, VII Congrso de Antropologia en Colombia, Medellin, Universidad de Antioquia

Herdt, G. 1992. Gay Culture in America: Essays from the Field, Beacon, Boston

Hernandez, M. C. et al. 2007. Place attachment and place identity in natives and non-natives, *Journal of Environmental Pscyhology*, 27, pp. 310-319

Hesmondhalgh, D. 2005. Subcultures, Scenes or Tribes? None of the Above, *Journal of Youth Studies*, 8(1), pp. 21-40

Hokowhitu, B. 2004. Tackling Maori Masculinity: A colonial genealogy of savagery and sport, *The Contemporary Pacific*, 16(2), pp. 259-284

Holloman, R. E. and Arutiunov A. 1978. Perspectives on Ethnicity

Hopkins, P and Noble, G, 2009, Masculinities in place: situated identities, relations and intersectionality, Social and Cultural Geography, 10(8), pp. 811-819

Horak, R. 2003. Diaspora experience, music and hybrid cultures of young migrants in Vienna, in Muggleton, D, and Weinzierl, R. (eds.) *The post subcultures reader*, Berg

Horrocks, R. 1994. Masculinity in Crisis, Self and Society, 22(4), pp. 25-29

Horton, J. and Kraftl, P. 2005. For more than usefulness: six overlapping pints about Children's Geographies, *Children's Geographies* 3(2), pp. 131-143

Hudson, B. 1977. The New Geography and the New Imperialism: 1870-1918, *Antipode*, 9(2), pp. 12-19

Hume, L. and Mulcock, J. 2012. Anthropologists in the Field: Cases in Participant Observation, Columbia University Press

Imilan Ojeda, W. 2014. Experiencia Warriache: espacios, performances e identidades Mapuche en Santiago, *Poblaciones en movimiento*, Universidad Alberto Hurtado, pp. 254-278

Imilan Ojeda, W. A. 2008. Making Bread in the City in Urban Ethnicity in Santiago de Chile, in *Mapuche Migration and Urban Space*, University of Berlin

Imilan Ojeda, W. A. 2008. Urban Ethnicity in Santiago de Chile, in *Mapuche Migration and Urban Space*, University of Berlin

Imms, W. 2000. Multiple masculinities and the schooling of boys, *Canadian Journal of Education*, 25(2), pp. 152-165

Ingoldsby, B. B. 1991. The Latin American Family: Familism vs. Machismo, *Journal of Comaprative Family Studies*, 22(1), pp. 57-62

Jackson, P. 1991. The Cultural Politics of Masculinity: towards a social geography, *Transactions of the institute of British Geographers*, (16)2, pp. 199-213

Jeffrey, C. 2010. Timepass: Youth, class and time among unemployed young men in India, *American Ethnologist*, 37(3), pp. 465-481

Jeffrey, C. and Dyson, J. 2008. *Telling Young Lives, Portraits of global youth, Philidelphia, Temple University Press* 

Jenkins, R. 2008. Rethinking Ethnicity, SAGE publications

Johansson, S. 2013. Decolonising methodologies: research and indigenous peoples, *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 34(5), pp. 498-500

Johnstone, B. 2008. Discourse Analysis, Malden, Massachusetts

Kanitkar, H. 1994, Real, true boys, moulding the cadets of imperialism in Cornwall, A and Lindisfarne, N (eds.) *Dislocating Masculinity: comparative ethnographies*, Routledge, London.

Kapoor, I. 2004. Hyper self reflexive development? Spivak on representing the third world other, *Third World Quarterly*, 25(4), 627-47

Katz, C. 2004. *Growing Up Global: Economic Restructuring and Children's Everyday Lives,* University of Minnesota Press

Kharas, H. 2010. The emerging middle class in developing countries, OECD Development

Kimmel, M. 1992. Against the Tide: Pro-Feminist Men in the US, 1776-1990, Beacon Press, Boston

Kimmel, M. S and Messner, A. 1992. Men's Lives, Macmillan Publishing Co.

Kimmel, M. S. Hearn, J. and Connell, R. W. 2004, *Handbook of Studies on Men and Masculinities*, Sage Publications

Knox, P. and Pinch, S. 2000. Urban Social Geography: An introduction, Routlegde, New York

Kobayashi, A. and De Leeuw, S. 2010. Colonialism and the tensioned landscapes of indigeneity, in Smith, S. Pain, R. Marston, S. and Jones, J. P. (eds), 2010. *The SAGE handbook of social geographies*, SAGE Publications Ltd, London.

Kobayashi, A. and Peake, L. 2000. Racism out of Place: Thoughts on Whiteness and an Antiracist Geography in the New Millennium, *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 90(2) pp.392-403

Kopff, L. 2008. El waj, el bombo y la palabra. Acerca de la conciencia generacinal entre los jovenes Mapuche, IX Conrgeso Argentino de Antropologia Social, Universidad Nacional de Misiones, Posadas

Kowalcxyk, A. M. 2013. Indigenous Peoples and Modernity: Mapuche Mobilisations in Chile, *Latin American Perspectives*, 40(4), pp. 121-135

Kriady, M. 2002. Hybridity in Cultural Globalisation, *Communication Theory*, 12(3), pp. 316-339

Kropff, L. 2004. "Mapurbe": jóvenes mapuche urbanos, KAIROS, *Reivsta de Temas Sociales*, 8(14), pp. 1-10

Kusenbach, M. 2003. Street Phenomenology: The Go Along as an ethnographic rsearch tool, *Ethnography*, 4(3) pp. 455-485

Lancaster, R. 1998, Sexual Positions: Caveats and Second Thoughts on "Categories", *Americas*, 54(1), pp. 1-16

Latcham, R. E. 1924. La organizacion social y las creencias religiosas de los antiguos araucanos, Oficina del Libro, Santiago

Lavallee, L. F. 2009. Practical Application of an Indigenous Research Framework and Two Qualitative Indigenous Research Methods: Sharing Circles and Anishnaabe Symbol Based Reflection, *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 8(1) pp. 21-40

Lawrence, B. 2004. "Real" Indians and Others: mixed blood urban native peoples and indigenous nationhood, University of Nebraska press

Lenz, R. 1895. Estudios Araucanos, Los Anales de la Universdad de Chile

Lerner, S. 1998, Varones, sexualidad y reproduccion, El colegio de Mxco, Mexico City

Limon, J. 1994. Dancing with the Devil: Society and Culture Poetics in Mexica-American South Texas, Madison: University of Wisconsin Press

Lindstrom, L. 1982. Leftamap Kastom: the political history of tradition on Tanna (Vanuatu), *Mankind*, 13(4) pp. 316-329

Lingard, B. and Douglas, P.1999. *Men Engaging Feminisms: Pro-feminism, Backlashes and Schooling*, Open University Press, Buckingham

Linnekin, J. 1991. Cultural Invention and the Dilemma of Authenticity, *American Anthropologist*, 93(2), pp. 446-449

Longhurst, R. 2000. Geography and gender: masculinities, *Male identity and men*, Progress in Human Geography, 24(3), pp. 439-444

Longhurst, R. 2003. Semi-structured interviews and focus groups, in Clifford, N. and Valentine, G. (eds.) *Key Methods in Geography*, SAGE, London

Lorber, J. 2000. Using gender to undo gender: A feminist degendering movement, *Feminist Theory*, 1(1), pp. 79-95

Luco, S. 2014. Remapping the Shitopolis of Santiagony, David Aninir's proposal for a Borderised Mapuche Identity, *Journal of Literary Studies*, 25(1)

Lundberg, C. 2001. Mannen, *Fronesis*, 8(2), pp. 99-105

MacKenzie, S. and Rose, D. 1983. Industrial change, the domestic economy nad homelife, in Anderson, J. Duncan, S. and Hudson, R. (eds). *Redundant Spaces in Cites and Regions? Studies in industrial decline and social change*, Institute of British Geographers Special Publication 15 London Academic, pp. 155-199

Malbon, B. 1998. Clubbing: consumption, identity and the spatial practices of every nightlife in Skelton T and Valentine G (eds.), *Cool Places: Geographies of Youth Cultures*, Routledge, London

Mallon, F. E. 2005. Courage Tastes of Blood: The Mapuche Community of Nicolas Aillio and the Chilean State, 1906-2001, Duke University Press

Margulies Breitbart, M. 1998. Young People's designs for survival and change in the city in Skelton T and Valentine G (eds.) *Cool Places: Geographies of Youth Cultures*, Routledge, London

Mario, S. 2008. Neoliberal Economics, Democratic Transaition and Mapuche Demands for Rights in Chile, *The Hispanic American Historical Review*, 88(1) pp.150

Martensson, K. 2012. Sweet Women and Tough Men? Young Men's identities and attitudes towards masculinity in Chile, Lund University

Martin, P. Y. 1998. Why can't a man be more like a woman? Reflectionson Connell's masculinities, *Gender and Society*, 12(4) pp. 472-74

Martin, R. 2013. The politics of the voice: ethnographic feitshims and Australian literary studies, *Journal of the association for the study of Australian literature*, 13(2), p. 1.

Massey, D. 1979. In what sense a regional problem? Regional studies, 13(2), pp. 233-243

Massey, D. 2005. The spatial construction of youth cultures, in Skelton, T and Valentine G (eds), *Cool places: geographies of youth cultures*, Routledge

Massey, D. B. 2001. Space, place and gender, University of Minnesota Press, Minneapolis.

McCall, L. 2005. The Complexity of Intersectionality, *Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 30(3) 1771-1800

McClintock, A. 2013. *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest*, Routledge

McDonald, B. 2014, *The Mapuche: the people of the land and their struggle to maintain it,* Critic, 26

McDowell, L. 1992. Doing Gender: Feminism, Feminists and research methods in human geography, *Transactions of the institute of British geographers*, 17(4)

McDowell, L. 2001. Father and Ford Revisited: Gender, Class and Employment Change in the New Millenium, *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 26(4)

McDowell, L. 2007. Respect, deference, respectability and place: what is the problem with/ for working class boys?, *Geoforum*, 38, pp. 279-286

McDowell, L. 2013. Gender, Identity and Place: Understanding Feminist geographies, Wiley.

McEwan, C. 2009, Postcolonialism and Development, Routledge, Abingdon.

McEwan, P. J. 2004. The Indigenous Test Score Gap in Bolivia and Chile, *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, 53(1) pp. 157-90

McKegney, S. 2014. *Masculindians: Conversations about Indigenous Manhood*. Universty of Manitoba Press, Winnipeg

McNamee, S. 1998. Youth gender and video games: power and control in the home in Skelton T and Valentine G (eds.) *Cool Places: Geographies of Youth Cultures*, Routledge, London

Melhuss, M. and Stolen, K. A. 1996. *Machos, Mistresses, Madonnas; Contesting the power of Latin American gender imagery*, Verso, London

Meredith, P. 1998. *Hybridity in the Third Space: rethinking bi-cultural politics in Aotearoa/New Zealand,* Paper Presented to Te Oru Rangahu Maori Research and Development Conference, Massey University

Merino et al. 2009. Perceived discrimination amongst the indigenous Mapuche people in Chile: some comparisons with Australia, *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 32(5) pp. 802-822

Merino, M. E. and Quilaqueo, D. 2003. Ethnic prejudice against the Mapuche in Chilean society as a reflection of the racist ideology of the Spanish conquistadors, *American Indian Culture and Research Journal*, 27(4), pp. 105-116

Merriam, S.B et al. 2001. Power and Positionality: negotiating insider/outsider status within and across cultures, *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 20(5) pp. 405-416

Mihesuah, D. 1999. American Indian Identities: issue of individual choice and development in Chauysagne, D. 1999. *Contemporary Native American Cultural Issues*, Alta Mira Press, CA

Miles, M. and Crush, J. 1993. Personal Narratives as Interactive Texts: Collecting and Interpreting Migrant Life Histories, *The Professional Geographer*, 45(1) 83-94

Mirande, A. 1997. *Hombres y Machos: Masculinity and Latino Culture*, Westview, Colorado Mitchell K. 1997. Different Diasporas and the Hype of Hybridity, *Environment and Planning D: society and space*, 15, pp. 533-53

Mitchell, B. and Draper, D. 1982. Relevance and ethics in Geography, Longman

Moffat, K. 2011. Troubled Masculinities: Reimagining Urban Men, University of Toronto Press

Mohan, G. 1999. Not so distant, not so strange: the personal and the political in participatory research, *Philosophy and Geography*, 2(1) pp. 41-54

Mohanty, C. 1999. Women workers and capitalist scripts: Ideologies of Domiantion, Common Interests and the Politics of Solidarity, in Hesse-Biber, S. Gilmartin, C. Lydenberg, R. (eds). *Feminist Approaches to Theory and Methodology*, University Press, New York

Moller, M. 2007. Exploiting Patterns: A Critique of Hegemonic Masculinity, *Journal of Gender Studies*, 16(3), pp.263-276

Momaday, N. S. 1976. Native American attitudes to the environment, in Capps, WH (ed) 1976. *Seeing with a Native Eye,* Harper and Row, New York

Moreton-Robinson, A. 2003. I still call Australia home: indigenous belonging and place in a white postcolonising society, in Ahmed, M, Shelly and C Castelini (eds), *Uprootings/Regroundings*, London: Berg Publications

Morgan, 2004. Class and Masculinity, in Kimmel, M. S., Hearn, J and Connell, R. W. *Handbook of Studies on Men and Masculinities*, Sage Publications.

Morrell. R. and Swart, S. 2004. Men in the Third World, Postcolonial perspectives on masculinity, in Kimmel, S. Hearn, J. and Connell, R. W. 2004. *Handbook of Studies on Men and Masculinities*, Sage

Morton, 2014. In Defence of Rakgo Mapu: Building a case for Mapuche self determination, *A Journal of Indigenous Governance* (1)1

Mumby, D. K. 1998. Organising men: power, discourse and the social construction of masculinity(s) in the work place, *Communication theory*, 8(2), pp. 164-183

Nagar, R. and Ali. F. 2003. Collaboration across borders: moving beyond positionality, *Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography*, 24(3), pp. 356-72

Nash, C. 2000. Performativity in practice: some recent work in cultural geography, *Progress in Human Geography*, 24(4) pp. 653-664

Nash, C. 2002. Cultural geography: postcolonial cultural geographies, *Progress in Human Geography*, 26(2), pp. 219-230

Nayak, A. 2003. Last of the "real geordies"? White masculinities and the subcultural response to deindustrialisation, *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, 21, pp. 7-25

Nayak, A. 2006. Displaced Masculinities: Chavs, Youth and Class in the Post Industrial City, *Sociology*, 40(5), 813-831

Nolasco, S. 1993. Masculinidade: Reflexões Contemporâneas, Reflexões Líricas, 87(5), pp. 71-80.

Nolasco, S. 1995a, A Desconstrução do Masculino., Rocco, Rio de Janeiro

Nolasco, S. 1995b, O Mito da Masculinidade, Rocco, Rio de Janeiro

Nunez de Pineda y Bascunan, F. 1673. *Cautiverio feliz, y razon de las guerras dilatadas de Chile*, Biblioteca Nacional de Chile

Oakes, T. 2000. China's provincial identities: reviving regionalism and reinventing "Chineseness", *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 59, pp. 667-92

Okely, K. 1996. Own or Other Culture, Psychology Press

Olavarria, J. 2003. Men at Home? Child Rearing and Housekeeping among Chilean Working Class Fathers, in Gutmann, M. C. 2003. *Changing Men and Masculinities in Latin America*, Duke University Press

Ortiz, P. 2009. Indigenous Knowledge and Language: Decolonising Culturally Relevant Pedagogy in a Mapuche Intercultural Bilingual Education Program in Chile, *Canadian Journal of Native Education*, 32(1), pp 93-114

Oteiza, T and Merino, M. E. 2012. Am I a genuine mapuche? Tensions and contradictions in the construction of ethnic identity in Mapuche adolescents from Temuco and Santiago, *Discourse and Society*, 23(3), pp. 297-317

Overton, J. 2013. Decolonising Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples, *Development in Practice*, 23(4), pp. 598-599

Paasi, A. 2003. Region and place: regional identity in question, *Progress in Human Geography*, 27(4), pp. 475-485

Paltridge, B. 2012. Discourse Analysis: An Introduction, Bloomsbury Publishing

Park, Y. and Richards, P. 2007. Negotiating neoliberal multiculturalism: Mapuche workers in the Chilean state, *Social Forces*, 85(3), pp. 1319-1339

Parker, R. et al. 1995. AIDS Prevention and Gay Community Mobilisation in Brazil, *Development*, 2, pp. 49-53

Pascoe, C. J. 2003. Multiple Masculinities? Teenage boys talk about jocks and gender, *American Behavioural Scientist*, 46(10), pp. 1423-1438

Patai, D. 1991. Is Ethical Research Possible, in Ostrov Weissner, S. and Fleischner, J. (eds.) Feminist Nightmares: women at Odds: Feminism and the Problem of Sisterhood, NYU Press

Patrinos, H. A. 1994. The Costs of Ethnicity: An International Review, in Psacharopoulos, G and Patrinos, H. A. *Indigenous People and Poverty in Latin America: An Empirical Analysis*, The World Bank, Washington

Plant, R. 1998. *Issues in Indigenous Poverty and Development*, InterAmerican Development Bank, Washington DC.

Pole, C. Pilcher, J. and Williams J. (eds.) 2005. *Young People in Transition: becoming citizens?* New York: Palgrave, MacMillan

Proshansky, H. M. 1978. The City and Self Identity, *Environment and Behaviour*, 10(2)

Proshansky, H.M et al. 1983. Place identity: physical world socialization of the self, *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 3, pp.57-83

Prout, A.and James A. 1997. "A New Paradigm for the Sociology of Childhood? Provenance, Promise and Problems." In Prout, A.and James A. (eds.) *Constructing and Reconstruting Childhood*, London: Falmer Press

Pulani, R. P. 2007. Can you hear us now? Voices from the Margin: Using Indigenous Methodologies in Geographic Research, *Geographical Research*, 45(2), pp.130-139

Radcliffe, S. A. 2005. Development and geography: towards a postcolonial development geography?, *Progress in Human Geography*, 29(3), pp. 291-298

Radcliffe, S. and Webb. A. 2014. Mapuche youth between exclusion and the future: protest, civic society and participation in Chile, *Children's Geographies*, 14, pp.1-19

Radcliffe, S. and Westwood S. 1996. "Race": state and nation in *Remaking the nation: place, politics and identity in Latin America*, London: Routledge

Radcliffe, S. and Westwood, S. 1996. Remaking the Nation: Place, identity and politics in Latin America, Routledge, London

Raghuram, P. and Madge, C. 2006. Towards a method for postcolonial development geography? Possibilities and challenges, *Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography*, 27(3), pp. 270-288

Raju, S. 2002. We are different, but can we talk? Gender, Place and Culture, 9, pp.173-177

Ramirez, R. 1993. *Dime Capitan: reflexiones sobre la masculindad*, Ediciones Huracan, Rio Piedras

Ranger, T. 1983. The invention of tradition in colonial Africa, in Hobsbawm, T. and Ranger T. *The Invention of Tradition*, Cambridge University Press.

Ray, L. 2007. Language of the Land: The Mapuche in Argentina and Chile, IWGIA

Reid-Henry, S. 2003. Under the microscope. Fieldwork practice and Cuba's biotechnology industry: a reflexive affair? *Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography*, 24(2) pp.184-197

Rekedal, J. 2014. Hip-Hop Mapuche on the Araucanian Frontera, Alternativas, 2, pp. 1-35

Richards, P. 2010. Of Indians and Terrorists: how the state and local elites construct the Mapuche in neoliberal multicultural Chile, *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 42(1), pp. 59-90

Risman, B. 2004. Gender as a Social Structure, Theory Wrestling with Activism, *Gender and Society*, 18(4) pp.429-450

Roberts, K. M. 2002. Social Inequalities Without Class Cleavages in Latin America's Neoliberal Era, *Studies in Comparative International Development*, 36(4)

Robinson, J. 2003. Postcolonialising Geography: Tactics and Pitfalls, *Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography*, 24(3), pp. 273-289

Rojas, F. 2007. Poverty Determinants of Acute Respiratory infections among Mapuche indigenous peoples in Chile's Ninth Region of Araucania, using GIS and spatial statistics to identify health disparities, *International Journal of Health Geographics*, 6

Romero, M. 1992. Maid in the USA, Routledge

Rose, G. 1993. Feminism and Geography: The Limits of Geographical Knowledge, University of Minnesota Press

Rose, G. 1995. Place and identity: a sense of place, in Masser D. and Jess, P. (eds), *A place in the world? Places, cultures and Globalisation*, Oxford: the open University

Rose, G. 1997. Situating knowledges: positionality, reflexiities and other tactics, *Progress in Human Geography*, 21(3) pp.305-320

Royal, R. 1998. Who put the west in western civilization?, The intercollegiate review

Ruddick, S. 2003. "The Politics of Aging: Globalisation and the Politics of Youth and Childhood", *Antipode*, 35(2), pp.334-362

Rudrum, D. and Starvis, N. 2015. Supplanting the Postmodern, an anthology of writings on the arts and culture of the Early 21<sup>st</sup> century, Bloomsbury

Sahlins, M. 1999. What is anthropological enlightenment? Some lessons of the twentieth century, *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 28, pp. i-xxiii

Saledo, H. 1995. *El aborto en Colombia: Exploracion local de la experiencia masculina,* Bogota: Universidad Externado de Colombia

Schildkrout, E. 2014 Ethnicity among Urban Immigrants in Ghana, in Cohen, A. *Urban ethnicity*, Routledge

Seccombe, W. 1986, Patriarchy Stablised: the construction of the male breadwinner wage in Nineteenth Century Britain, *Social Hisory*, 11(1) pp.53-76

Sedgwick, E. K. 1990. Epistemology of the Closet, University of California Press.

Segal, L. 2007. Slow Motion: Changing Masculinities, Changing Men, Palgrave Macmillan

Serrano, J. F. 1994. Diversidad cultural y homosexualidades, Paper presented at Simposio Sexualidad y Construccion de Identitada de Genero, VII Congreso de Antropologia, Medellin Shields, S. A. 2008. Gender: An Intersectionality Perspective, *Sex Roles*, 59, pp. 301-311

Shildrick, T. and Macdonald, R. 2006. In Defence of Subculture: young people, Leisure ad Social divisions, *Journal of Youth Studies*, 9(2), pp. 125-140

Sidaway, J. D 1992. In other worlds: on the politics of research by First World gegraphers in the Third World, *Area*, 24 pp. 403-8

Sidaway, J. D. 2000. Postcolonial geographies: an exploratory essay, *Progress in Human Geography*, 24(4) pp. 591-612

Simon, D. 2006. Separated by common ground? Bringing (post)development and (post)colonialism together. *The Geographical Journal*, 172, pp.10-21

Simpson, M. 1994. Male Impersonators, Cassell, London

Skelton, T. 2013. Young People, Children, Politics and Space: A Decade of Youthful Political Geography Scholarship 2003-13, *Space and Polity*, 17(1) pp.123-136

Skelton, T. and Valentine, G. 1998. *Cool Places: Geographies of Youth Cultures*, Routledge, London (Ebook)

Skjaevestad, A. 2008. The Mapuche people's battle for indigenous land: litigation as a strategy to defend indigenous land rights, Bergen, Norway

Smith, A. 2005. Native Feminism, Sovereignty and Social Change, *Feminist Studies*, 31(1) p.116

Smith, D. M. 2000. *Moral Geographies. Ethics in a World of Difference*, Edinburgh University Press

Smith, D. M. 2001. Geography and ethics: progress or more of the same, *Progress in Human Geography*, 25(2), pp.261-268

Smith, F. 2004. Is there a place for children's geographies in the policy arena? *Children's geographies*, 2(1), pp. 157-161

Smith, L. T. 2012. *Decolonising Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples*, Zed Books

Sneider, L. 2015. Complementary relationships: a review of indigenous gender studies, in Innes, R. A. and Anderson, K. 2015. *Indigenous Men and Masculinities: Legacies Identities, Regeneration*, University of Manitoba Press.

Soja, E. *Thirdspace: Journeys to Los Angeles and Other Real and Imagined Places*, Blackwell, Oxford

Sommer, D. 1991. Foundational Fictions: The National Romances of Latin America, University of California Press

Spivak, 1992. Acting Bits/ Identity Talk, Critical Inquiry, 18(4) 70-803

Spivak, G. C. 1988. Can the subaltern speak? In Nelson and Grossberg (eds.), *Marxism and the Interpretation of culture*, University of Illinois Press

Staples, R. 1982. Black Masculinity, Black Scholar Press, San Francisco

Stephen, L. 2007. *Transborder Lives: indigenous Oaxacans in Mexico, California and Oregon,* Duke University Press

Stevens, E. 1973. Marianismo: the other face of Machismo in Latin America, in Pescatelo, A. *female and Male in Latin America: Essays*, University of Pittsburgh Press

Stoller, R. J. 1975. Sex and Gender, Vol II. The Transsexual Experiment, NewYork

Strathern, M. 1988. The Gender of the Gift: Problems with women and problems with society in Melanesia, University of California Press

Talpade Mohanty, C. Russo, A. and Torres, L. 1991. *Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism*, Indiana University Press.

Tembo, F. 2003. The multi-image development NGO: an agent of the new imperialism? *Development in Practice*, 13(5) pp.527-532

Temple, B. and Young, A. 2004. Qualitative Research and Translation Dilemmas, *Qualitative Research*, 4(2) pp.161-178

Tengan, K. 2008. *Native Men Remade: Gender and Nation in Contemporary Hawai'i*, Duke University Press, Durham

Thornton Dill, B. 1988. Our mothers' grief: Racial ethnic women and the maintenance of families, *Journal of Family history*, 13(1) pp.415-431

Thrift, N. 1997. The still Point, expressive embodiment and dance, in Pile, S. and Keith, M (eds.) *Geographies of Resistance*, Routledge

Tinsman, H. 2002. Partners in Conflict: The politics of Gender, Sexuality and Labour in the Chilean Agrarian Reform, 1950-1973, Duke University Press

Tolbert, K. Morris, K and Romero, M. 1994. Los hombres y el proceso de decision respeco al aborto: Hacia un modelo de relaciones de genero y el aborto, Paper presented at Encuentro de Investigadores sobre aborto inducido en America Latina y el Caribe, Bogota

Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organisation, 2013. UNPO Report Outlines Discrimination Suffered by Mapuche in Chile.

Valdivia, A. 2003. Radical Hybridity: Latinas/os as the paradigmatic Transnational Post subculture, in Muggleton, D. and Weinzierl, R. (eds.) *The Post Subcultures reader*, Berg

Valentine, G. 2007. Theorizing and Researching Intersectionality: a challenge for feminist geography, *The professional geographer*, 59(1), pp. 10-21

Van de Berghe, P. L. 1987. The Ethnic Phenomenon, Praeger

Van Hootum, H. and Lagendijk, A. 2001. Contextualising regional identity and imagination in the construction of polycentic urban regions: the cases of the Ruhr area and the Basque country, *urban studies*, 38, pp. 747-67

Van Langevelde, A. and Pallenbarg, A. 2001. What's in a Frisian business name? Regional identity in the Netherlands, *Tijdschrift voon Econmische en Sociale Geografie*, 92, pp.309-23

Villar Fuentes, E. 2004. "We Do Mapuche Stuff", Cultural Transmission and Ethnic Identity Among Mapuche Children, Uppsala University

Viveros Vigoya. M. 2001. Contemporary Latin American Perspectives on Masculinity, *Men and Masculinities*, 3, pp. 237-260

Viveros, M and Gomez, F. 1998. Las representaciones sociales sobre la esterilazacion masculine. El punto de vista de los orientadores del sevicio de vasectomia en la clinica del hombre en Bogota, Colombia, *Cad Saude Publ.* 11,pp. 97-103.

Viveros, M. 1997. Los estudios sobre lo masculine en America Latina: Una production teorica emergente, *Nomadas*, 6, pp.55-67

Watson-Gegeo, K. and Gegeo, D. W. 2011. "Divergent Discourses: The Epistemology of Healing in an American Medical Clinic and a Kwara'ae Village." *Anthropology of Consciousness* 22,2: pp.209-233.

Wearne, P. 1996. Return of the Indian: Conquest and Revival in the Americas, Cassell.

Weaver, H. N. 2001. Indigenous Identity: What is it and Who Really Has it? *American Indian Quarterly*, 25(2) pp. 240-255

Webb, A. 2013. Negotiating optimum distinctiveness: cognitive tendencies toward primordialism among Mapuche youth, *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 36(12), pp. 2055-2074

Webb, A. 2014. Articulating the Mapu: Land as a Form of Everyday Ethnicity among Mapuche Youth of Chile, *Latin American and Caribbean Ethnic Studies*, 9(3), pp. 222-246

Webb, A. and Radcliffe, S. 2015. Whitened Geographies and Education Inequalities in Southern Chile, *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 36(2), pp. 129-148

Webb, A. and Radcliffe, S. 2015. Indigenous citizens in the making, civic belonging and racialized schooling in Chile, *Space and Polity*, 19(3), pp. 215-230

Weeks, J. 1986. Sexuality, Routledge

Werbner, P and Modood, T. 1997. *The Politics of Multiculturalism in the New Europe: Racism, Identity and Community*, Palgrave Macmillan

Whorf, B. L. 1956. Language, Culture and Personality, MIT Technology Review.

Wienzierl, R. and Muggleton D. 2003. What is "post subcultural studies" anyway? In Wienzierl, R. and Muggleton D. (eds.) *The post Subcultures Reader*, Berg.

Willis, K. 2005. Latin American Urban Masculinities, in van Hoven, B. and Horschelmann, K. 2005. *Spaces of Masculinities*, Routledge, London.

Willis, P. 1972. *Pop music and youth groups*, Unpublished PhD thesis, Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies, University of Birmingham

Wilmer, 1993. The indigenous voice in world politics: since time immemorial, Sage publications

Winchester, H. P. M. 2007. Lobethal the Valley of Praise: inventing tradition for the purposes of place making in rural South Australia, in Shaw, B and Jones, R. (eds) *Geographies of Australian Heritages: Loving a Sunburnt Country?* Ashgate Publishing

Wolf, M. 2000. The Third Space in Post-Colonial Representation, in Simon, S. and St-Pierre, P. (eds.) 2000, *Changing the Terms: translating in the post-colonial era*, University of Ottawa Press

Women and Geography Study Group, 1984, Geography and Gender, in Hubbard, P. Kitchin, R. and Valentine, G. *Geography and Gender*, Sage

Yorgasn, E. 2002. Creating regional identity, moral orders and spatial contiguity: imagined landscapes of Mormn Americanisation, *Cultural Geographies*, 9, 448-466

Zeitilin, M. and Ratcliff, R.E. 2014. *Landlords and Capitalists: the dominant class of Chile*, Princeton University Press.

# **Appendix**

# Participant Information

Table 2: Participant Information Table

Interview	Interview	Name	Age	Region	Occupation	Interview Style/ Place
number 1	<b>Date</b> 16/04/16	Franco	29	Santiago	Student/ teacher/ runs a business teaching Mapuche culture within schools to young rural Mapuche children	Emplaced Interview: Café in Bella Vista
2	16/04/16	Jorge	28	Santiago	Potter	Go Along Interview: in Jorge's pottery studio where he was working
3	17/04/16	Diego	25	Santiago	Post Graduate Student/ Traditional Weaver	Emplaced Interview: Café in Lastarria
4	30/03/16	Luis	17	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Go Along Interview: Attended afterschool Mapuche drama group
5	31/03/16	Francisco	23	Temuco	Receptionist for a local government office	Emplaced Interview: Café in Temuco Centro (Espacio Mosqueta)
6	19/04/16	Sebastian	25	Santiago	Social worker	Emplaced Interview: Café in Lastarria
7	18/04/16	Ruben	24	Santiago	Mapuche Rapper	Go Along Interview: Attended a music event in a bar in Bella Vista
8	04/04/16	Alexis	29	Temuco	Office worker in HR department	Emplaced Interview: in his office
9	05/04/16	Patricio	31	Temuco	Office worker in local government department for the environment	Emplaced Interview: in his office
10	05/04/16	Nicolas	26	Temuco	Receptionist for a businessman	Emplaced Interview: Café in Temuco Centro (Espacio Mosqueta)
11	06/04/16	Cristian	27	Temuco	Actor/ Drama Teacher	Go Along Interview: Attended his after school drama class for Mapuche students, followed up by interview in Café in

							Temuco Centro (Espacio Mosqueta)
12	07/04/16		Wilson	30	Temuco	Rural Mapuche Social Worker	Go along interview: Attended morning group session with Mapuche people, follow up interview in a bar on Avenida Alemania
13	17	/04/16	Simon	24	Santiago	Post Graduate Student	Emplaced interview: Bar in Lastarria
14	07/04/16		Miguel	26	Temuco	Estate Agent	Emplaced Interview: in his office
15	01/04/16		Pietro	25	Temuco	Journalist	Emplaced Interview: Bar on Avenida Alemania
16	18	/04/16	Jaime	26	Santiago	Teacher	Emplaced Interview: Parque Bustamante
Focus Group 1	1	11/04/16	Tomas	16	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 1
Focus Group 1	2	11/04/16	David	18	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 1
Focus Group 1	3	11/04/16	Alejandro	19	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 1
Focus Group 1	4	11/04/16	Matias	18	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 1
Focus Group 2	1	12/04/16	Felipe	17	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 1
Focus Group 2	2	12/04/16	Vincente	18	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 1
Focus Group 2	3	12/04/16	Pablo	18	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 1
Focus Group 2	4	12/04/16	Javier	18	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 1
Focus Group 3	1	15/04/16	Roberto	16	Santiago	Private School Student	Focus Group that took place in class room of School 3
Focus Group 3	2	15/04/16	Emilio	16	Santiago	Private School Student	Focus Group that took place in class room of School 3

Focus Group 3	3	15/04/16	Fernando	16	Santiago	Private School Student	Focus Group that took place in class room of School 3
Focus Group 3	4	15/04/16	Hector	16	Santiago	Private School Student	Focus Group that took place in class room of School 3
Focus Group 4	1	13/04/16	Gabriel	18	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 2
Focus Group 4	2	13/04/16	Mauricio	19	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 2
Focus Group 4	3	13/04/16	Carlos	17	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 2
Focus Group 4	4	13/04/16	Claudio	17	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 2
Focus Group 5	1	13/04/16	Marcos	17	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 2
Focus Group 5	2	13/04/16	Camilo	17	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 2
Foucs Group 5	3	13/04/16	Bruno	18	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 2
Focus Group 5	4	13/04/16	Rodrigo	18	Temuco	Boarding School Student	Focus Group that took place in the boarding house of School 2

**Interview Format** 

*Introduction to the project, including ethical statement (in English)* 

To be read by me at the beginning of each meeting:

My name is Grace Garside, I am a research student at the University of Durham, England.

The aim of this project is to discover the ways in which urban Mapuche youth negotiate their masculinities, the way these masculinities are performed on an everyday basis and how these masculinities are represented by the Chilean state.

For this purpose, I am requesting a single interview with you, the interview will last approximately an hour to an hour and a half.

All information provided by you during this interview will be kept in confidence and all information provided will be anonymised. Any information used in the final document will be disclosed under a pseudonym. Thus, only the interviewer will know who provided the information and you will not be identifiable in the published material.

You are able to withdraw from this process at anytime without giving reason. There will be no negative consequences or prejudice for this action.

Do you have any questions about the above?

Do you give your consent?

Should you wish to contact me at a later date on the topic of this statement or any of the interview content my email address is provided.

*Introducción al proyecto, incluyendo la declaración ética (in Spanish)* 

Para ser leído por mí en el comienzo de cada sesión:

Mi nombre es Grace Garside, soy un estudiante de investigación en la Universidad de Durham,

Inglaterra.

El objetivo de este proyecto es descubrir las formas en que los jóvenes mapuche urbana

negociar sus masculinidades, la forma en que estas masculinidades se realizan sobre una base

diaria y cómo estas masculinidades están representados por el Estado chileno.

Con este fin, estoy solicitando una sola entrevista con usted, la entrevista tendrá una duración

de aproximadamente una hora a una hora y media.

Toda la información proporcionada por usted durante esta entrevista será manejada de manera

confidencial y toda la información proporcionada será anónima. Cualquier información que se

utiliza en el documento final será divulgada bajo seudónimo. Por lo tanto, sólo el entrevistador

sabrá que proporcionó la información y no será identificable en el material publicado.

Que son capaces de retirarse de este proceso en cualquier momento sin dar razón. No habrá

consecuencias negativas o perjuicio para esta acción.

¿Tiene alguna pregunta sobre lo anterior?

¿Le da su consentimiento?

Si desea ponerse en contacto conmigo en una fecha posterior sobre el tema de esta declaración

o cualquiera de los contenidos entrevista se proporciona mi dirección de correo electrónico.

Proposed Interview Questions

**General Ouestions:** 

What is your name?

How old are you?

Where are you from?

How long have you lived here?

What do you do/ do you work/ are you a student?

125

#### **Questions about Mapuche identities:**

Do you have Mapuche heritage/ Are members of your family Mapuche?

Did you learn much about the Mapuche culture through your family/ through school?

Do you/ have you ever participated in Mapuhce ceremonies?

Do you speak Mapudungun?

Do you/ members of your family/ friends participate in Mapuche culture/ traditions?

What are Mapuhce culture/ traditions?

#### **Background:**

Where are you from?

What do your parents/ grandparents do?

Where did you grow up?

Where/ what did you study?

#### Free time and personal life:

What do like to do with your free time?

What type of music do you like to listen to?

Do you listen to any Mapuche music? – traditional music/ modern music?

What do you like about this music?

What is your style of clothes?

Why do you like this style, how does it represent you?

What styles/ people are you influenced by?

Who do you spend time with/ what are your friends like?

Where do you like to go out?

Why do you like to go there?

What kind of people go there?

What do you do when you are there?

Are there any places that are specifically for Mapuche people?

Do you go there?

Why/ Why not?

#### City life:

Have you always lived in a city?

Why did you move to the city?

What do you like about (living in) the city?

What are the benefits of being a Mapuche living in the city, what are the negative aspects?

What are the benefits of being a young man living in the city, what are the negative aspects?

How would you describe this city?

Where is your communidad?

Do you return there often?

Do you miss your communidad?

What did you like/ dislike about your communidad?

Are there Mapuche ceremonies/ traditions/ activities within the city?

Do you know many Mapuche within the city?

How are the Mapuche treated within the city?

#### **Masculinities:**

What is it like to be a young man in Chile/ Temuco/ Santiago?

What is it like to be a young Mapuche man in Chile/ Temuco/ Santiago?

Do you think being a young Mapuche comes with negative connotations?

Do you think the general population of Chile have negative images of Mapuche men? Why/ why not?

What are some common words that people use to describe young Mapuche men? Could you explain these words?

Is there a stereotype of a young Mapuche man?

How does this make you feel?

How would you describe an ideal man?

Are Chilean ideal men different to Mapuche ideal men?

#### **Chilean State:**

What does the Chilean state think about Mapuche people?

Do you think this is right?

How does the Chilean state treat the Mapuche people?

What words do the state use when describing Mapuche people?

How are the Mapuche people represented in the news/ media?

What words are used to describe Mapuche people in the media?

How does this make you feel?

Do you agree with these words?

Do you think the Mapuche are an equal part of Chilean society?

#### **Extract from an Interview Transcript**

## Interview 1: Franco, 29, 16/04/16, Santiago, Student of Education/ Teacher

*Interviewer:* Can you tell me a bit about your childhood?

*Franco:* Well I was born in Santiago. My grandparents, for economic and labour reasons went to the city. My community is 29km from Temuco, its next to a river. But then my grandparents went to Valdivia, and afterwards, during the dictatorship it became really difficult, to be a proletariat and also to be a Mapuche, so they emigrated to Santiago. So my grandparents went to Santiago and my mum was grown up, like really grown up, she was doing her degree, so she went to work in one of those jobs that Mapuche normally do, in the city, in the capital, she went to work as a maid. So my youth was split between the bosses of my mum and my mum. Because she used to take me to work because you had nowhere to leave me. So I had an education that was financed by them, the bosses of my mum and they adopted me like a sun. And my mum was like my nanny. So between Monday to Saturday I was with them and only on Sundays was I with my family. So the school I went to in Santiago was posh, it was private. So I did live through a period of discrimination and this was important. Because first I wasn't Chilean, I was Mapuche and in this time they didn't recognise the Mapuche. They called us Indians. I had eyes and skin that were... I had dark hair. It wasn't blonde like my class mates. And I remember that they bothered me a lot. They used to call me German, because of my surname. They used to say, is your surname German? So that they wouldn't say my surname and to bully me because my surname is Mapuche. But within that period of discrimination in my child hood, I had a lot of strength from within my family. My family was always positioned as Mapuche. That is to say, my grandfather, independent of the fact he was in the city, always made sure we did Mapuche things. So there's a lot of things that I remember, for example, my grandfather, when we were born, he gave us a cup of water, so the first words we heard were words in Mapudungun. And they say they do that so that the ancestors help you to speak well, so that you're a person who is capable of speaking and communicating. It was just a secret. But he always used to talk to us about it. And my grandfather, he married a woman who wasn't Mapuche, she was Spanish, well descended from the Spanish. And she was a really important woman, because she made sure we were proud of it and that we weren't ashamed of being Mapuche, or the colour of our skin, or our names, or the colour of our hair, because we were handsome and we were precious. So she always brought us up a lot, around the theme of being Mapuche. So we felt the identity and we felt the culture. Because there had been something of us, around the culture that had been lost. Our language had been lost because our grandparents

were discriminated against, we were discriminated against in the school, they made everybody speak Spanish and not Mapudungun. So we still felt a protection, but we lost Mapudungun because we couldn't speak it directly, we spoke it in intimate situations but not outside of the house. Only inside the house. And when I grew up, in Santiago, I began to arm myself with Mapuche themes and I began to get together with more Mapuche people, with young Mapuche and older Mapuche. So we began to coordinate, and we began to talk about getting the lands back. People were talking about it, but only in Araucania, so we started to arm ourselves strongly in Santiago. So from one day we woke up and it was cool to be Mapuche. Oh you're a Mapuche, how cool! So there existed this conflict, because of the Mapuche state, it became fashionable. So obviously we began to participate, we began to arm ourselves as an association, we began to take classes. I always liked the language so I began to speak it, whereas before I could only understand it. My grandfather began to teach me a lot, and I think that the family grew a lot, we began to organise ourselves around the question of our culture.

### *Interviewer:* Puede contarme un poco sobre su niñez?

Franco: Yo nací en Santiago, los abuelos por temas de trabajo, y por temas económica fueron al ciudad. Mi sector queda 29 km de Temuco, al lado del rio, y después mis abuelos se fueron a Valdivia, y después en los tiempos del dictadura era muy difícil, ser gente de la fábrica, trabajador y luego ser mapuche, emigraron así a Santiago. Y en Santiago .... Entonces mi abuelo se fue a vivir en Santiago, y mi mama ya era grande, realmente grande, estaba haciendo la licencia, y ella se fue a trabajar en los trabajos que normalmente hacen los mapuches, en la ciudad, en la capital, y se fue a trabajar de nana. Entonces mi crianza era entre los patrones de mi mama, los jefes de mi mama que me lleva a trabajar porque no tuvo un lugar donde dejarme. Entonces yo tuve un educación que era financiados por ellos, los patrones de mi mama y me adoptaron como su hijo. Y mi mama era mi nana. Entonces yo tuve los días lunes a sábado con ellos y solo los domingos era en la casa de mi familia. Entonces estuve en colegios en Santiago que eran particulares, que eran pagados. Entonces viví una periodo de discriminación que era bastante importante. Porque primero era la que no era chilena, si no que era mapuche, en eso tiempo no se reconocieron como mapuche, si no nos llamaban indios. Tenía el piel y los ojos más... y el pelo oscuro. No era rubio como mis compañeras. Y me acuerdo mucho que me molestaban y me decían "alemana", por el apellido. Dijeron "y el apellido es alemán?" Para no decirte y para bullarse de tu apellido, que era mapuche. Pero dentro de todo estas características de discriminación de mi infancia, hay algo en mí que tiene mucho que ver con mi familia, que nosotros siempre era muy posicionado como mapuche. Ósea, mi abuelo que independiente que

fue al ciudad y que haya que tener a llevar a su familia de la ciudad siempre hace cosas mapuches para nosotros. Entonces hay hartas cosas que recuerdo, por ejemplo, mi abuelo cuando nosotros nacía el los daba una copita de agua y (alarm goes off, inaudible) entonces, las primeras palabras que nosotros recibieron eran palabras en Mapudungun. Y se dice que los hacen los antiguos para que usted recibes una buena hablar, que eras una persona buena para hablar y buena para comunicar. Era un secreto. Pero él siempre nos hablan de eso. Y mi abuelo igual se casa con una mujer que no era Mapuche, era española, era de descendencia española, castillo, ella. Y ella fuera una mujer importante, porque ella con nosotros, puso nosotros como mapuche de decir, que nosotros sentimos orgullosos, y no sentirnos avergonzados de ser mapuche. Y el color de nuestro piel, y como se llama, el color de nuestro pelo no teníamos, porque éramos hermosos, porque éramos preciosos. Entonces siempre nos elevó muchos, el tema de nosotros como mapuche. Sentimos la identidad más que en el tema de cultural. Porque había algo, sobre el tema que nosotros había perdido la lengua es porque nuestros abuelos fueron discriminados, nuestros abuelos eran muy discriminados en la escuela, los obligaron hablar español y no hablar mapudungun. Entonces se siente protección a nosotros, para ocultar el mapudungun y no para hablarlo directamente, entonces tuvieron algunos instrucciones en mapudungun pero en tema de familiares, en situaciones íntimos, no fuera de la casa. Si no, dentro del lugar. Cuando después me creci, en Santiago, me empieza a armarme en temas mapuche, y empezar a juntarme con más gente mapuche, con jóvenes mapuche y con personas mayores mapuche. Y empezamos, estaban recién empezando los cordinores, y estaba recién empezando la tema de recuperar las tierras. Que ya estaba pero estaba mas con la problema de la Araucania, pero a nosotros empezábamos a armarnos fuerte alla en Santiago. Entonces de una noche hasta una mañana empezábamos a hacer algo que ser mapuche era como de moda. Entonces en Santiago es moda ser mapuche. "ah eres mapuche, que bakan!" desde esta tema que existe del conflicto, llamado por el estado mapuche, existe como moda. Entonces, claramente nosotros empecemos a participar, empezamos a armar una asociación igual, empezamos a hacer clases. A mi siempre me gusto el tema de mi lengua entonces emepeze a hablar, antes solo pude entenderlo. Me abuelo me empeze a ensenarme mucho, y yo creo que de la familia mucho crece, empezamos a organizarnos sobre la cuestión de nuestra cultura.

### Translations of Key Words

#### Mapudungun to English

Caupolican: Mapuche warrior

Che: People

Domo: woman

Lautaro: Mapuche warrior

Machi: medium between the people and the world of the spirits, witch doctor

Mapu: Place/ Land

Mapuche: The people of the Land

Nguillatun, nillatun: pray, fertility ceremony

Palin: Sport, like hockey

Peñi: brother

Ruca/ Ruka: house

Wallmapu/ Wall Mapu: The Mapuche territories

Wentru: man

We Tripantu: Mapuche New Year Celebrations

#### Chilean to English

Fleite/ Flaite: Derrogatory term for working class style, similar to Chav in English

Communidades: Rural communities in which Mapuche people live

Internado: Boarding school which Mapuche children in the South of Chile attend