Turning to Teaching – The Commitment of Teachers with Previous Careers In Times of Teacher Work Intensification

SUGDEN, RICHARD

How to cite:
SUGDEN, RICHARD (2013) Turning to Teaching – The Commitment of Teachers with Previous Careers In Times of Teacher Work Intensification, Durham theses, Durham University. Available at Durham E-Theses Online: http://etheses.dur.ac.uk/10598/

Use policy
The full-text may be used and/or reproduced, and given to third parties in any format or medium, without prior permission or charge, for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes provided that:

- a full bibliographic reference is made to the original source
- a link is made to the metadata record in Durham E-Theses
- the full-text is not changed in any way

The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

Please consult the full Durham E-Theses policy for further details.
Turning to Teaching – The Commitment of Teachers with Previous Careers In Times of Teacher Work Intensification

Abstract

In the last twenty five years, primary schools in England have been the subject of widespread, well-documented reform, with issues of intensification affecting the working lives of teachers. This, along with other pressures, has led to concerns over issues of teacher retention and recruitment. As a response, there has been a rise in Alternative Certification Programmes (ACPs) which offer flexible methods of entry into teaching, attracting those with previous work experience. These are the so-called second career teachers. Previous studies have proposed that their commitment to their new profession may take a unique form. High levels of commitment are needed to meet the challenges of a rapidly changing educational environment.

The aim of this study is to examine the commitment of primary second career teachers in times of work intensification.

The study proposed research questions dealing with the work experiences and lives of the teachers, their definition of commitment, and the factors that affect it. A mixed-method approach was used with a survey administered to twenty-four second career teachers in one local education authority area in England. Twelve extended interviews were carried to examine commitment and intensification.

The primary second career teachers in the study were found to have a wide range of previous working experience with one-third being ex-teaching assistants. The study proposed a classification of the change-event of the second career teacher; this was found to be broadly linked to their definition of commitment. Proximal factors were found to affect commitment in a positive way, and government policy in a negative direction. Commitment was shown to be generally static and not affected by age, but by career stage, confirming previous research. Issues of intensification and its time-effects were noted in responses.

Keywords - second career teachers, career change, intensification, commitment, primary schools
Turning to Teaching – The Commitment of Teachers with Previous Careers in Times of Teacher Work Intensification

By Richard Paul Sugden

First Supervisor          Dr. Tony Harries
Second Supervisor         Mrs. Anji Rae

A Thesis Submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Education

School of Education
Durham University
2013
# Table of Contents

Chapter One – The Introduction to the Study ................................................................. 12
  1.1 Starting Points ........................................................................................................ 12
  1.2 The Background to the Study .............................................................................. 15
  1.2a The Rapid Reform of Work .............................................................................. 15
  1.2b Change in Education ......................................................................................... 15
  1.3a Change in Recruitment ...................................................................................... 20
  1.3b Who Would be a Teacher? .............................................................................. 21
  1.4 The Intensification Thesis .................................................................................. 24
  1.5 Second Career Teachers and Commitment – Defining the Study ...................... 26
      Conclusion............................................................................................................. 28

Chapter Two – The Reading Review ............................................................................. 29
  Introduction ............................................................................................................. 29
  2.1 Defining ‘The Intensification Thesis’ ................................................................. 29
  2.1a The Background to Intensification ................................................................... 29
  2.2 Intensification and Education ........................................................................... 30
  2.3 The Characteristics of Intensification ................................................................ 34
  2.4 The Effects of Intensification ............................................................................ 38
  2.5 The Challenges to Existing Practice .................................................................. 39
  2.5a Increased Workload ......................................................................................... 41
  2.5b Teachers Work, Life, and Identities ............................................................... 42
  2.6 Intensification ..................................................................................................... 43
  2.7 The Rise of the Second Career Teacher .............................................................. 45
  2.8 Proofed Against Change? .................................................................................. 51
  2.9 The Vitae Research ............................................................................................ 52
  2.10 Teachers’ Age or Teachers’ Stage .................................................................... 57
  2.11 Second Career Teachers and Commitment ..................................................... 58
  2.12 Examining Commitment .................................................................................. 59
2.13 Literature Review of Commitment .................................................................. 61
2.14 A Summary of Key Issues ............................................................................. 68
2.15 Emerging Model ............................................................................................ 69
2.16 Research Questions ....................................................................................... 69

Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 71

Chapter Three ........................................................................................................ 72
3.1 The Direction of the Research .......................................................................... 72
3.2 The Methods of Previous Research ................................................................... 72
3.3 Starting to Design the Study .............................................................................. 79
3.3a Early Designs .................................................................................................. 79
3.3b The Pilot Study ................................................................................................ 80
3.3c The Design of the Study ................................................................................. 80
3.3d Field Work ..................................................................................................... 84
3.3e The Final Form of the Study ........................................................................... 86
3.4 Summary of Methods of Analysis ................................................................. 91
3.5 Ethical Considerations ...................................................................................... 95
3.6 Timetable of the Study ..................................................................................... 95

Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 96

Chapter Four .......................................................................................................... 98
Introduction ........................................................................................................... 98
4.1 People and Places – The Teachers Taking part in the Study ......................... 98
4.1a Locations ....................................................................................................... 99
4.1b Mobility .......................................................................................................... 101
4.1c Age and length of Service ............................................................................ 101
4.1d Year of entry into Teaching ........................................................................... 103
4.1e Previous Careers ........................................................................................... 106
4.1f Complex Employment History ........................................................................ 110
List of Diagrams

Chapter One ..................................................................................................................................................

Chapter Two ..................................................................................................................................................

  2.1 Intensification- Main influences in Primary Schools 1988-2012 .................................................. 31
  2.2 The Effects of Change (Woods) ........................................................................................................... 42
  2.3 The Attractions of Teaching (Novak & Knowles) .............................................................................. 47
  2.4 Age and Professional Stage Models – Comparative Structure ......................................................... 56

Chapter Three ..............................................................................................................................................

  3.1 Question Themes ................................................................................................................................. 81
  3.2 Research Questions and Survey Questions ......................................................................................... 82
  3.3 The Initial Design of the Study ............................................................................................................ 85
  3.4 The Final design of the Study ............................................................................................................. 87
  3.5 The Survey Response from Schools ................................................................................................... 88
  3.6 Interview Prompts .............................................................................................................................. 90
  3.7 Field Work Structure .......................................................................................................................... 91
  3.8 Final Form of the Study and Timing ................................................................................................... 96

Chapter Four ...............................................................................................................................................

  4.1 Schools in the Study and Participant Teachers .................................................................................. 100
  4.2 Age and Length of Service ................................................................................................................ 102
  4.3 Participant Year of Entry into Teaching .............................................................................................. 105
  4.4 Newly Qualified Teachers by Age (DfE data) ................................................................................... 105
  4.5 Teacher Working History ................................................................................................................... 108
  4.6 Teacher Turner Categories ................................................................................................................ 115
  4.7 Dislocatory Turners ............................................................................................................................ 122
  4.8 Attractions to Teaching ....................................................................................................................... 124
  4.9 Career, Attraction to Teaching and Change Category ...................................................................... 130
  4.10 Factors Positively Affecting Commitment ......................................................................................... 132
  4.11 Positive Commitment and Attributions ........................................................................................... 140
  4.12 Negative Attributions ....................................................................................................................... 141
4.13 Participants’ Negative and Positive Commitment Attributions .......... 144
4.14 Commitment Trend and Attribution ........................................ 149
4.15 Participants and their Professional Life phase ............................. 152
4.16 Age and Commitment .............................................................. 157
4.17 Definition of Commitment ......................................................... 160
4.18 Turner Category ................................................................. 165

Chapter Five ......................................................................................

5.1 Turner Categories ........................................................................ 176
5.2 Second Career Teachers, Commitment & Intensification – The Research Environment ................................................................. 188
### List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACP</td>
<td>Alternative Certification Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BBC</td>
<td>British Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Ed</td>
<td>Bachelor of Education degree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA</td>
<td>Bachelor of Arts degree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSc</td>
<td>Bachelor of Science degree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPD</td>
<td>Continuing Professional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DES</td>
<td>Department for Education &amp; Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCSF</td>
<td>Department for Children, Schools &amp; Families</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DfE</td>
<td>Department for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFES</td>
<td>Department for Education and Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organization for Economic Co-operation &amp; Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OFSTED</td>
<td>Office for Standards in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTTP</td>
<td>Overseas Trained Teacher Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GTP</td>
<td>Graduate Teacher Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HLTA</td>
<td>Higher Level Teaching Assistant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITE</td>
<td>Initial Teacher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LA</td>
<td>Local Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NNEB</td>
<td>National Nursery Examination Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGCE</td>
<td>Postgraduate Certificate in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPA</td>
<td>Planning Preparation Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QIEU</td>
<td>Queensland Independent Education Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QTS</td>
<td>Qualified Teacher Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTP</td>
<td>Registered Teacher Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td>Socio Economic Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAT</td>
<td>Standard Attainment Test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TA</td>
<td>Teaching Assistant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TDA</td>
<td>Teacher Development Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTA</td>
<td>Teacher Training Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VITAE</td>
<td>Variations in Teachers’ Work, Lives and their Effects on Pupils</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Education Social and Cultural Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Declaration

This thesis is my own work and has not been offered previously in candidature at this or any other university.

Statement of Copyright

The copyright of this thesis rests with the author. No quotation from it should be published in any format, including electronic and the internet, without the author’s prior written consent.
I would like to thank the many people that have supported me with this study. Bernardette, for her many hours of proof reading, guidance and constructive suggestions. I am grateful to Anji Rae for her guidance during the programme, and my deepest gratitude to my supervisor Dr. Tony Harries for his invaluable comments, support and patience. I would like to give special thanks to the teachers who took part in the study, both in the pilot school and the other phases, by giving me their valuable time, and for the many kindnesses shown to me in the schools during my visits.
Chapter One - The Introduction to the Study

1.1 Starting Points

Primary school teachers are an important area of study because of their centrality to the education process. Their work in primary schools lays the foundation for their students’ future lives. The work of teachers is vital to any country that aims to develop a knowledge economy, in that they educate its future citizens. Teachers are central to the progress and attainment of children. Few educational reforms can be achieved without their involvement and commitment.

This introduction will first explain my personal motivation and how the study developed. It will then go on to explain the background to the study and the changing professional environment that has brought about an increase in the numbers of career-changers who have entered the teaching profession.

This study has arisen from an interest that developed during my early period of study in taught sessions. My initial interest was educational policies and their effect of reforms upon teachers in English primary schools. This was based on the reading of Peter Woods ‘Adaptation and Self-Determination in English Primary Schools’ (1994). Woods demonstrated how some teachers can cope with change and how some adapt, survive and thrive, whilst others have great difficulty in maintaining their professional identity and leave teaching. Woods affirms the professionalism of many teachers in dealing with change and suggests that change is a natural part of teachers’ working life, and adaption to changed circumstances is a key skill for anyone at work. They are also vital to the implementation of the many reforms that have taken place in education (Hargreaves, 2003). Hargreaves goes on to suggest that without their collaboration, often at great personal cost, very few would have taken place. That central role means that they are an important area of study. Hargreaves (1994) sums up their importance:

“It is what teachers think, what teachers believe and what teachers do at the level of the classroom that ultimately shapes the kind of learning that young people get”
(Hargreaves, 1994, p.ix)

Several years ago I was working in ‘schools of concern’ that had been placed in a category of notice to improve by government and local education authority inspectors.
At that time, I felt that primary schools were in the vanguard of change, and were attempting to cope with rapidly imposed reform. Turnover of staff was high, and I noted that an increasing number of my newer teaching colleagues were entering the profession after previous careers. These so called second career teachers seemed to be making a contribution to teaching, bringing maturity and life experience into schools. At a time of high staff turnover and teacher shortage they join a profession where an older generation of teachers find working in a period of work intensification difficult. For some of the teachers, the inability to cope with rapid change brought about premature end to their careers. This is a clear parallel with the work of Woods (1994) and Hargreaves (1994) on how teachers respond to imposed change.

Reading published research on the subject of the teaching profession and its response to change led to an awareness of the intensification thesis, proposed by Apple (1986). In essence this suggests that time demands and challenges to existing working practices create intense pressure on a teacher. The intensification thesis has been noted in several studies, and will be outlined in depth later. Further reading highlighted how intensification affected the working lives of teachers, and has an international dimension. Its effects also seemed to be linked to teacher turnover, as many members of the profession failed to respond to the pressures which are connected to change. Because of the high attrition of teaching staff, others were attracted to the role by changes in the entry process. Some had previous work experience and have switched careers. These are the so called second career teachers.

Put simply, the initial aim of this study was to find out if, even with their extended work experience, these teachers are proofed against intensification and further change. Will they stay committed to teaching? And what is the nature of that commitment?

The initial focus of the study was an attempt to answer this question. What seemed clear was that any study would have to examine the broader context of second career teachers and extend not only into the working lives of teachers, but also their previous careers and the complexities of their lives. During this phase of my reading, one of my tutors, Professor Barry Cooper suggested reading the work of Daniel Bertaux on artisanal bakers in France. Bertaux analysed the working lives and backgrounds of the bakers in great detail, drawing out background detail about their careers and the relationship with the rest of their lives. This examination of background detail was also
used by Goodson and Sikes, (2001), who in their work with teachers, suggest that one of the strengths of such a life history method is that:

“it explicitly recognizes that lives are not hermetically compartmentalized into, for example, the person we are at work ( the professional self) and who we are at home ( parent, child, partner, self ) and that, consequently, anything which happens to us in one area of our lives potentially impacts upon and has implications for other areas too”
(Goodson & Sikes, 2001, p.2)

Goodson and Sikes acknowledge the complexity of social lives and how difficult it can be to draw boundaries between the personal and the professional. The themes of Intensification, and the second career teacher, were the personal origins of this study, linked with an awareness of the complexity of working lives. Before defining the research problem in greater detail, it will be helpful to explore the background and context of some of the changes in the teaching profession. This will help to set the scene for the rest of the study.
1.2 The Background to the Study

The next section will briefly explore the policy background and context of some of the changes to the teaching profession that have occurred over the last twenty five years, and how they have affected the working lives of teachers.

1.2a The Rapid Reform of Work

In a rapidly evolving technological, social, political and economic climate, the nature of work has changed for many people. Teaching has not been immune from what has been seen by Williamson and Myhill (2008) as a general workplace trend. Green (2006) notes that tension and strain have increased both in the public and private sector. A combination of global and national factors, including a desire to maintain economic competitiveness, has led to rapid change in education. This process is widespread in many Western countries. It is important to note that at the start of the reforms, education policy in England and Wales was determined by the UK government in London. Since devolution, this has changed and the Welsh government has assumed responsibility for education policy. This study exclusively deals with conditions in English primary schools that often bore the brunt of rapid reform and where the change process has been sustained and consistent. In the last twenty five years a policy trajectory, embraced by most political parties, has seen a consistent pace of reform in English schools, with that change reaching into nearly every aspect of education. Successive governments have followed policies that have involved increased prescription, performativity and marketization (Ball, 1990).

1.2b Change in Education

Successive reforms have dealt with nearly every aspect of teaching. Whitty (2000) suggests that early reforms were designed to make schools more accountable to the market by devolving power to parents and schools. This quasi-market was established in measures affecting the local management of schools (Department of Education & Science [DES], 1988), the National Curriculum (DES, 1987), the Office for Standards in Education (Education (Schools) Act, 1992) (DES 1992a), and a range of other reforms. The New Labour government of 1997 claimed to place education at the centre of its agenda, and carried on with similar reforms that backed parental choice and central government accountability systems. Curriculum reforms in English and
Mathematics re-branded them as Literacy (Department for Education and Employment [DfEE], 1998) and Numeracy, (DfEE, 1999) with prescription of teaching content, style and even timing. Widespread reform in this period dealt with the re-structuring of the education workforce, introducing performance management, professional standards and regulation. The introduction of workforce remodelling introduced large numbers of Teaching Assistants into schools, who took over many tasks from teachers, and changed the professional environment in many primary schools. From 2010, the Coalition administration started to introduce employment reforms dealing with teacher competence, the primary curriculum, the introduction of performance related pay for teachers, and extended the academy programme into the primary phase, changing the employment criteria of teachers. By the time of writing, there were 265 primary academies (Department for Education [DfE], 2013b). It should be noted that many of these reforms were introduced with little consultation with the teaching profession, and in some cases scant evidence, with others being introduced at the same time as the start of any pilot programme.

Primary schools have therefore been in the vanguard of change during last twenty-five years. It is not the aim of this study to explore the detailed legislative agenda of the period, but to point out its range, depth and impact on the life of the primary school teacher. When examining the professional environment in 2008, the ‘Cambridge’ Primary National Review noted that change in government education policy has involved “ever shortening cycles of reform, multiple innovations, frequent policy shifts” (Jones, Pickard & Stronach, 2008). Hargreaves (1994) listed the National Curriculum and its stage by stage nature, detailed age-related attainment targets, the introduction of standardized testing, public examination systems and proposes that the mandated change is extreme in pace and sweeping in influence and power. Troman and Woods (2001) showed how the reforms rode roughshod over the lives and values of English child-centred teacher and how “the reforms resulted in stress, burnout and the exit of many from the profession” (Troman & Raggl, 2008, p 86). Coe (1994) seems to sum the pace of legislation:

“The trick is to keep doing outrageous things. There’s no point in passing some scandalous piece of legislation and then giving everyone time to get worked up about it. You have to go right in there and top it up with something even worse, before the public have even had a chance to work out what’s hit them.”

(Jonathan Coe, 1994, p.313)
As previously discussed, the Cambridge Primary National Review investigated the professional environment of primary school teachers and reported on the impact of reforms dealing with every part of a teachers work environment, and they conclude that:

“as a consequence of policy reform, teachers have experienced an intensification of workload with an emphasis on technical competence and performativity”

Cambridge Primary National Review (Jones, Pickard & Stronach, 2008, p. 2)

These reforms have had widespread effects on the working lives of teachers, and they have experienced greater responsibility for their work but often less control about the pace of it, and how that work was conducted. The final report of the review goes on to state that:

“Across the research literature there is a preponderance of studies that point to the de-skilling of the primary teacher. The National Curriculum decreased teacher autonomy in relation to content, the National Literacy Strategy and the National Numeracy Strategy likewise in relation to pedagogy. Teachers were reported to be ‘proletarianised’, de-professionalised, de-skilled, and sometimes demoralised.”

(Alexander, 2010, p.625)

The effect has been cumulative, with change following change, and little time for work patterns to be re-established. Kyriacou (1998) notes the effect of rapid and frequent change:

“the need to cope with change is a major source of stress. Indeed, in recent years, frequent changes have occurred in the content and methods of teaching in many countries, coupled with the introduction of greater accountability and public assessment of their performance. Often, such changes have occurred at short notice, and have not been linked with adequate programmes of in service training”

(Kyriacou,1998, p.8)

Kyriacou notes that both the content and method of teaching has been subject to rapid change. The international dimension to the problem is confirmed by the work of Galton
and MacBeath (2008) who studied the effects of change on the working lives of teachers and comment that:

“across the globe research indicates that the lives of teachers are more stressful and that the balance between their personal lives and work is more unacceptable to their families and their close friends”

(Galton & MacBeath, 2008, p.2)

Others, including Goodson and Hargreaves 1996; Woods 1996; and Nias (1999) have noted the effects of reforms on the lives of teachers, and their attempts to cope with a changed working environment. Day, Sammons, Stobart, Kington and Gu (2007), however, sound a note of caution:

“Much research related to the effects of centralized reform efforts has been produced by those who are critical of the reform efforts themselves, has tended to be small scale, and has focused upon particular groups of teachers for whom reform is difficult and perhaps unacceptable”

(Day et al., 2007, p.8)

The small scale research however, could seem to represent a larger picture. This was possibly demonstrated in the numbers of teachers who found the reforms difficult and unacceptable and exited the profession. On leaving teaching, many cited time factors, one of the key areas of intensification. Smithers and Robinson (2005) reported that of the reasons given by teachers for leaving the profession:

“Workload was the reason most frequently given. For many, there just seemed too much to do. Holding down the job seemed to take over the best part of the evenings and weekends. “Leaving to get a life” was how it was commonly explained to us.”

(Smithers & Robinson, 2005, p.39)

“Teachers also complained how their time at school was eaten into by covering for shortages and absences, so most of the work around teaching had to be done in the evenings and at weekends.”

Smithers & Robinson (2005, p.39)

They go on to examine why the teachers in their study left teaching, and are clear
about the origins of the problem:

“The government itself has generated much of this increased workload through its attempted reforms. Adjusting to changes takes time and effort so some transitional increase in workload could have been anticipated. But, in the view of the teachers we interviewed, too much has been attempted at once and a lot of what has been introduced has been ill-thought out and subject to continual modification. It is also true that the greater emphasis on accountability of itself increases the paperwork.”

(Smithers & Robinson, 2005, p.39)

The rapid change and accountability referred to by Smithers & Robinson has continued, and so has the turnover of teachers. This is the ‘revolving door’ effect noted by Ingersoll (2004) in the United States, where large numbers of qualified teachers leave their jobs before retirement age leading to teacher shortages and recruitment pressures. Retirement for the reason of ill-health by teachers in England and Wales rose from 2698 in the years 1986-87, to 6075 in 1994-95. (Robinson, 1997) This trend continued, despite the alteration of pension regulations by the government to make it more difficult to retire early. It has been coupled with a complex situation regarding teacher age, a ‘demographic exodus’ suggested by Goodson (2007), when the teachers born in the post-war baby boom retire. Even allowing for the positional nature of some research, or demographic issues, the numbers of early retirements from teaching increased after reforms were implemented. This was a pattern that was established early in the reform process, and continued. Smithers & Robinson (2001) noted:

“Our survey confirms the rising trend apparent in the Employers’ Organisation’s time course data which show 25,645 resignations from full-time permanent posts in 1998, 34,444 in 1999 and 43,890 in 2000 (private communication). The increase from 1998 (admittedly affected by the rush to retire in 1997) to 2000 is an astonishing 41.6 per cent. Our survey indicates that the level has now reached 52,100.”

(Smithers & Robinson, 2001, p.38)

Concerns were expressed early in the reforms about their effect on teachers, (BBC, 1998) with later predictions of teacher shortages, sometimes dubbed a crisis, widely
reported in the media (BBC 2000a) (BBC 2000b). Reports also highlight some of the measures taken, (BBC 1999) (BBC 2000c) but concerns about retention and recruitment were a common theme (BBC 2004) (Doward 2004), (Observer Newspaper).

Research by Ingersoll and Smith (2004) in the United States, suggested that attrition of serving teachers and migration from the profession were major influences on the rising trend. The connection with the situation in the United States is interesting: Hutchings (2011), states that only a quarter of teachers in England continue until retirement, and then goes on to report:

“It should be noted that in England, the number of teachers leaving the profession before they reach retirement age is higher than it is in France, Germany, The Netherlands, Portugal or Hong Kong. The USA has a pattern of attrition similar to that in England”
(Hutchings, 2011, p.3)

As well as high retirement rates, a linked issue in England and Wales has been the recruitment of new teachers, and concern about their standards. The recruitment of teachers has been subject to reform in this period linked to these two issues and will now be discussed in the next section.

1.3a Change in Recruitment
The previous section related the effects of reform on serving teachers. In the last twenty-five years there has also been a great deal of change affecting those who join the profession. Day et al. (2007) highlight the fact that successive reforms have:

“Dominated the contemporary realities of teachers. They have changed what it means to train and be educated for teaching, and once qualified, be a teacher”
(Day et al., 2007, p.4)

There are many forces at play in teacher recruitment and training, and the area is a complex one, with political, and economic drivers, but it is worthy of brief exploration because entry into the profession often has an impact on the identity of the new teacher, and consequently the nature of the future profession. Because of its relevance to second career teachers, and to this study, some of the major changes will now be outlined.
1.3b – Who would be a Teacher?

Reform dealing with prospective teachers has concerned those who would enter the profession and their training. The document ‘The Reform of Initial Teacher Training’ (DES 1983) set out changes to the then standard university or college-based B.Ed or PGCE process, suggesting that schools should play a larger role in teacher training, in a move to return to a more apprenticeship-based process. Later, a major re-organization of teacher training took place with new school-based alternative certification programme (ACP) routes into teaching being introduced in 1990 with the Articled, and Licensed Teaching Scheme. There were widespread reforms of Initial Teacher Training (ITT) that followed in the early 1990s, (DES, 1991), (DES b1992) with alternative means of entry into the profession as well as a further move away from university-based preparation. This echoed a move to develop ACP training in the United States. New Right commentators such as Lawlor et al. (2004) criticized the content of training courses, proposing higher standards and subject mastery. In apparent contrast, one proposal (DfE,1993), never implemented, was the so-called “Mum’s Army” of a one-year non-graduate school-based training course for teachers in Infant schools. This highlights the concern of many about maintaining, or improving teacher quality in a time of decreased supply of new entrants. There was some evidence in the UK (Chevalier et al. 2002) that teachers at the time had lower academic achievement than previously, although this must be placed in the context of a very complex supply and demand situation. Hutchings (2011) suggests that the wider economic situation has some impact on teacher supply, especially on the recruitment process, with the profession becoming more attractive to some in periods of economic downturn. This would allow selection criteria to be raised in an attempt to improve the quality of applicants to the profession. Coupled with these reforms in Initial Teacher Education, was the creation of the Teacher Training Agency (TTA), in the Education Act, 1994. In 2005 this became the Teacher Development Agency (TDA), with a changed remit. It imposed standards on training establishments and would-be teachers and these were raised several times during its life. It also took a role in attracting new entrants to the profession by the use of advertising campaigns, and from the year 2000 with increased funding, the introduction of training bursaries and financial incentives to attract would-be teachers.
The advertisement below is taken from the DfEE website (DfEE, 2000) and provides the detail:

**Graduates! Earn £150 a week while you train as a school teacher**

There has never been a better time to do teacher training. If you are a graduate, or if you will graduate this year, you may be eligible to receive an attractive package of support if you enrol on a Postgraduate Certificate in Education (PGCE) course.

This includes:
- no tuition fees to pay
- a training bursary of £6,000 - £150 a week tax-free if you train full-time - whatever subject you train in
- a further £4,000 "Golden Hello" if you train in and go on to teach maths, science, technology, modern languages or English in a maintained school or non-maintained special school in England
- a starting salary as a teacher of at least £18,105 a year
- a rewarding career, with good prospects and good pay - up to £33,150 a year, and more with management responsibilities.

(DfEE, 2000)

The offer of financial incentives to train was unprecedented, and applications to join the profession duly rose. Training options were entry into the profession with a B.Ed, BA or BSc with Qualified Teacher Status (QTS), postgraduate and employment-based options including the Graduate Teacher Programme (GTP), Registered Teacher Programme (RTP) Overseas Trained Teacher Programme (OTTP) and the Teach First programme. The latter was based on the Teach for America programme developed in the United States to combat concerns about teacher shortages.

“England has probably diversified its recruitment process the most, having developed more entry points into teaching than any other system in an attempt to maximise recruitment. By 2006 there were 32 different ways to enter the teaching profession in England”


Within those thirty-two ways of becoming a teacher, the trajectory was away from training that was college or university based, and towards preparation based in schools. On government websites, entry into teaching was talked about in terms of diversity and flexibility, with an acceptance that teaching was not a job for life, and that, for example, under the Teach First programme, it could even be a stepping stone to another career. This flexibility and diversity, coupled with wider changes in accessing higher education programmes created an environment where access to teaching was eased, and the opportunity to teach was widened.

Following growing concerns about pressures on teachers, a Government task force on standards commissioned a report from Price Waterhouse Coopers on the teaching workforce (2001). This suggested some ameliorative reforms; that the teaching workforce should be restructured; and that the wider introduction of support staff be linked to the introduction of non-contact time under the label of primary workforce re-modelling (DfES, 2003). These were originally tasked with supporting the teacher, but the role later (DfES, 2006) expanded with a hierarchical qualification structure in parallel to the teaching profession. The Education Secretary, Estelle Morris suggested that under the workload agreement, assistants “should play a bigger role in the classroom to allow teachers to spend less time on administrative duties”, and then went on to promise 10,000 new teachers and 20,000 support staff before the next election in 2005. (Independent: 3 April 2002). To allow the teacher to spend more time on administration, most of which was linked to reforms, the higher level of teaching assistants covered the class in the absence of the teacher. This was termed planning preparation and assessment (PPA) time. By 2013, in some state primary schools, there was one teaching assistant for every teacher (DfE, 2013b).
Galton & MacBeath (2008) report that these changes brought about changed conditions in primary schools, but no reduction in the long hours worked by teachers, suggesting that any time gained had been absorbed by further reforms, increased paperwork and management of support staff:

“The biggest change in the teachers’ working lives has come from the introduction of planning, preparation and assessment (PPA) time. While broadly welcomed there was ambivalence about the role of the teaching assistants (TAs) in covering teachers’ time out of the classroom. Nor did additional non-contact time necessarily appear to reduce teachers’ overall weekly workload, nor the amount of time spent during evenings and weekends”
(Galton & MacBeath, 2008, p.32)

In summary, the reforms created a changed work environment, with high turnover of staff, rising retirement rates and concerns about recruitment. Fuelled by media scares about teacher shortages, further reforms widened access to the profession by changes to teacher training and entry qualifications. During this period, reforms saw the number of Para-professionals in English primary schools rise, and under workforce re-modelling these have undertaken many of the tasks previously done by teachers. Professional standards were introduced for teachers as well as changed conditions of service. These have included changed competency regulations and altered employment conditions as schools leave local authority control. Having outlined some of the changes affecting the professional environment of teachers, the next section will define the intensification thesis, which was the original starting point of the study.

1.4 The Intensification Thesis

In the last twenty-five years, the working life of the primary school teacher has been transformed by the changes detailed previously. Teachers have had their work environment changed, and their work has intensified by the range of reforms that have taken place.

The concept of work intensification has its origin in the analysis of the labour process, and was proposed in the United States by Apple (1986), who based his work on that of Larson (1980). The features of intensification will be discussed in detail at the start of chapter two of this study, but in outline, Apple proposes that chronic and persistent
work overload robs the teacher of time. This lack of time extends the working day and
denies the teacher of the ability to relax, socialise with other teachers or keep up with
training. Apple goes on to suggest that the lack of time encourages de-
professionalisation and technicisation. Others have developed the thesis further, with
Densmore (1987) suggesting that it is misrecognised as professionalism. Hargreaves
(1991) in an analysis of Apple’s work, suggests that the intensification thesis defined by
Apple embodies important propositions about time and how it affects teaching and
teachers. He goes on to suggest that intensification may be mediated, and infers that
reactions to it may be complex and differentiated. Day (2002), when discussing
intensification, suggest that its origins are in changes designed to raise standards and
somehow improve economic competitiveness. Day goes on to suggest that they also
address concern in governments about a fragmentation of personal and social values in
society. They have a unifying factor in that:

- They challenge teacher’s existing practices
- They result in increased workload for teachers
- They do not pay attention to teacher’s work, lives and identities, arguably central to motivation, efficacy, commitment, job satisfaction and effectiveness

(Day, 2002, p.679)

The last point is a telling one. Mention was made earlier of how political reforms have
often not involved the teaching profession in their development, and yet it is the
teachers who would put the reforms into practice and are responsible for their
implementation. Galton & Macbeath (2008) make the point that there is a sense that
policy makers no longer trust the judgement of teachers, and that reforms are mandated
rather than trialled or introduced. The mandated reforms are often disconnected from the
teaching profession.

Several research studies have shown evidence for intensification in the work of teachers
(Apple, 1986; Campbell and Neil, 1994; Easthope and Easthope, 2000; Hargreaves,
1992, 1994; Troman 1996; Woods, 1994, 1999; Troman and Woods, 2001), with most noting a general negative effect on teachers. It was proposed by Apple that
intensification had a multiple effect on teachers. It has had a primary effect in that it has
affected their working practices, their motivation to teach, their lives at work and by
connection, their personal lives, and often the lives of their families and those who live
around them.
Because of the extended evidence of its existence, dating from its definition in the nineteen eighties, extending to further later attempts at re-definition, and frequent studies referencing its existence, intensification is now a condition rather than a phenomena.

It was suggested earlier in this introduction that it also had a secondary effect, in that the work intensification has brought early retirement for some teachers, adding to demographic issues that have increased retirement rates. As previously outlined, this forced a teacher supply crisis, as would-be teachers were simultaneously discouraged from joining the profession, at a time when alternative employment was an attractive alternative. The measures used to solve this crisis led to the widening and diversification of teacher recruitment, encouraging amongst others, those with previous careers to become teachers, not only through encouragement by advertising and bursaries, but also eased by diverse entry methods into the profession.

1.5 Second Career Teachers and Commitment - Defining the Study

This study aims to examine the teachers who were attracted to the profession from previous employment, the second career teachers. They are a group that is worthy of study, as to some extent, as they have always existed in teaching, but have been increasingly attracted to the profession by the wider social, economic and educational change, including the intensification of their work.

There is a range of previous studies into second career teachers, although many focus on initial motivation and entry into the profession and are related to the progress of alternative certification programmes (ACPs). Additional complexity is added, as most are cross-phase, dealing with both secondary and primary school teachers. Many deal with second career student teachers, Brindley & Parker,(2010); Etherington,(2009); Freidus, (1994); Powell, (1994) concentrating on attraction to teaching. Others deal with second career teachers as they start their careers, such as Bullough, &, Knowles, (1990); Powell., (1997); and Powers, (2002); Tan, (2012). Much, but not all of this research is based in the United States, where second career teachers have been in evidence for some time. Tigelhaar et al (2002, 2008) in the Netherlands, and Chong and Goh (2007) in Singapore are among the exceptions. In the United Kingdom, notably Day et al (2007), and Troman (2008) in studies of teacher commitment have identified the existence of second career teachers who have extended careers. The Troman study
found that 42% of the 37 teachers and 5 head teachers in their sample were second career teachers. There are few studies of them as long established teachers. A further examination of the literature concerning second career teachers follows in the second chapter of this study.

It is intended that this study will contribute to knowledge in this area as it is exclusively of established second career teachers in English primary schools. Second career teachers are an important area for study as they bring life experience and skills developed in their previous careers into the teaching profession, and make up a proportion of the teacher workforce. These second career teachers have made the switch to a new profession, which is a major life-change. One of the questions this study intends to answer is, that as career switchers, just how committed they are to their new career. Tichelaar et al. (2008), when talking of Alternative Certification Programmes (ACPs) suggests that:

“Even if ACPs generate an influx of new teachers, an important question is whether they stay in the profession.”

(Tichelaar, 2008, p.1530)

It is, of course, as possible that they show as little attachment to teaching as they did their last career. Ingersoll (1997,2001a) termed this the revolving door effect, as career switchers, like many other new entrants to the profession keep on the move. Will they stay committed? Chapman (1982) sees commitment as the degree of psychological attachment to teaching. Will the second career teachers lose that attachment and move on? Intensification still continues and may still affect them, as well as their first-career colleagues. As previously indicated, the profession is not seen as a job for life, even by the Teacher Development Agency. This study of second career teachers hopes to discover if they will stay in their new profession, especially considering on-going intensification, social and other wider changes affecting teaching. As working teachers, they have skills and attitudes that may assist them that they gained in their first career.
The second career teacher can compare and contrast teaching with their previous work experience, and in view of that, the last words in this section are those of the poet and writer T.S. Eliot:

“I have never worked in a coal mine, or a uranium mine, or in a herring trawler; but I know from experience that working in a bank from 9.15 to 5.30, and once in four weeks the whole of Saturday, with two weeks holiday a year, was a rest cure compared to teaching in a school”
(TS Eliot 1950, p.76)

Conclusion
This chapter introduced the broad direction of the study and the personal motivations behind it. It explained the background of on-going reform and its effects on the professional environment, relating this to the intensification thesis. The effects of the reform process on the teaching profession were outlined, and how they created issues of supply and demand with an altered training environment and admission criteria. The introduction of alternative certification programmes (ACPs) that created the environment for the second career teacher was explained. The final section broadly outlined the study as an enquiry into the commitment of career changers.

A closer examination of literature connected to the intensification thesis follows in the Second Chapter. Its origins are outlined and its definition in relation to education is explored. The chapter then will go on to examine literature on the subject of second career teacher, and finally that of commitment. It will highlight the relationship between commitment, age, and career stage of the teacher, with implications for those who come late into the profession. After discussion, a series of research questions are proposed. The Third Chapter will outline the methods of enquiry available to resolve the research questions, and examine how previous studies have employed them. The chapter will then go on to identify the relevant methodology used in the study and provide detail on how data was collected and analysed to answer the research questions. Chapter Four focuses on the emerging findings of the study, and explores the careers of the teachers and their school context, linking it to their commitment and some previous research. The final chapter, the Fifth, will discuss the links between the findings and the review of literature in Chapter Two. It will outline the implications of the findings and possible directions for further research.
Chapter Two – The Reading Review

Introduction
The previous chapter outlined the personal motivation behind the study and went on to explore how education reforms had changed the professional environment. As the work of teachers intensified, this led to a crisis in recruitment and the rise of alternative routes into teaching. Some of those taking the alternative routes were those with previous experience of work, the so called second career teachers. The chapter then suggested that in a time of intensification it is possible that these teachers could be just as vulnerable as their traditional colleagues. It then went on to define the trajectory of the study as one of exploring the commitment of these teachers.

This chapter will now go on to examine literature in a series of themes. It will first deal with the literature on the theme of intensification and then explore the theme of second career teachers. It will examine literature concerning the theme of commitment of teachers. After discussion, it will finally refine a series of research questions.

2.1 Defining ‘The Intensification Thesis’

This section will examine literature available on the theme of intensification. It will explore its background in theory and then its relevance to teaching. It will then outline the intensification thesis proposed by Apple (1986) and how this has been developed by others.

2.1a The Background to Intensification

Before going on to explore intensification in education, it will be useful to explore the background in other areas. The concept of work intensification has its origin in the analysis of the labour process. Modern economies, seeking to advance their productivity and maintain their advantage, encourage high performance working, where workers are spurred on to increase productivity. This can develop higher commitment, and involvement from the worker, and in turn, greater production. Sparham & Sung (2006) suggest that this is possibly a win-win situation, where employer and employee can benefit. They note however, that the greater commitment demanded can lead to work intensification, where the pace of work is quickened with low involvement and reduced
job security. This theme of quickened pace of working and lower involvement has been developed by others. Allen (1997) and Burchell (2002) see intensification as a quickening of work rate with largely negative effects, such as stress, psychological tension and family effects, its links to job insecurity, and suggest that intensification is the negative aspect of high performance working. Burchell (2002) defines intensification as ‘the effort that employees put into their jobs during the time they are working’ and notes the lack of research into intensification. Allan (1997) notes:

“The issue of work intensification is as much a feature of private sector employment as it is of the public sector. The profit motive is a strong incentive for private firms to intensify labour.”

(Allan, 1997, p.3)

Green (2002) notes that work intensification is stimulated by the use of high-commitment human resource policies, and that there is an impression throughout work places in the U.K. that tension and strain have increased, both in the public and private sector, and this supported by evidence of intensification at work (Burchell, 2002). There are a range of studies in the public sector that examine intensification, notably in health (Allan, 1998), and education; Hargreaves, 1994; and Troman, 2000).

### 2.2 Intensification and Education

In the field of education, the concept of intensification was first defined by Apple (1986) who drew on critical theories of labour, and based his work on that of Larson (1980) on the proletarianization of educated labour. Larson comments that ‘intensification represents one of the most tangible ways in which the work privileges of educated workers are eroded’. Apple developed the concept of erosion outlined by Larson, and transferred it to the area of education. Others, such as Densmore (1987), Hargreaves (1992) and Woods (1994) have continued to develop the concept in their research. Their work links the rapid change process in schools briefly outlined in the previous chapter, and links that change to intensification in the work of teachers. Diagram 2.1 (below) indicates some of the main policy changes and other influences that have driven the intensification process in state primary schools. It should be noted that many of these drivers have had a sustained and cumulative effect.
### Diagram 2.1 Intensification – Main Influences in Primary schools 1988-2012

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Policy Influence</th>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>Education Reform Act</td>
<td>Introduction of National Curriculum, new designation of Key Stages, introduction of levels of attainment, and new Primary subjects such as Design and Technology</td>
<td>Impact far-reaching, re-structures primary schools and causes increased workload</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>Introduction of Testing</td>
<td>Introduction of standardised tests for English, Mathematics and Science to be phased in by 1992 (KS1) and 1995 (KS2), with other subjects to follow. Changes to tests follow original pilot scheme and tests are modified.</td>
<td>The tests create a performative environment, increased workload, as do the associated assessments and constant modifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>1993 Education Act</td>
<td>Introduction of ‘special measures’ for schools that fail inspections.</td>
<td>Increases pressure and workload on teachers as teachers prepare for inspection process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>Dearing Report</td>
<td>Review of National Curriculum leads to changes in structure.</td>
<td>Increased workload due to changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Excellence for All</td>
<td>Reform of Special Educational Needs</td>
<td>Increased workload as teachers cope with changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>National Literacy Strategy</td>
<td>Based on Barber report, a re-branding of the teaching of English, recommended teaching styles, re-training programme for all primary teachers.</td>
<td>Rapid change brings about pressure on teachers to modify teaching of English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>School Standards and Framework Act</td>
<td>Closure process of schools that fail inspections, and Ofsted changes</td>
<td>Increased performativity pressures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>Literacy Targets</td>
<td>Introduction of LA Literacy Targets to expose ‘complacent’ primary schools</td>
<td>Increases pressure on schools to meet targets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Event</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>National Numeracy Strategy</td>
<td>Based on Moser report, re-branding of Mathematics teaching, directed lesson content and teaching, with re-training programme.</td>
<td>This and further constant modification brings change and increased workload. Literacy and Numeracy were later combined into ‘The National Strategy’ to assist target setting for schools, with constant minor modifications.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Performance Management</td>
<td>Performance Management of Teaching Staff Revised performance management arrangements came into effect for teachers, including head teachers. ‘Threshold Standards’ for teachers were introduced.</td>
<td>Formalises staff management, Increases performativity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>Modern Foreign Languages</td>
<td>Languages for Life. A Strategy for England (DfES, 2002) sets target that all children should have an entitlement by 2010. (By 2008, 92 per cent of schools were offering pupils in KS2 the opportunity to learn a language.</td>
<td>Brings a further subject into the primary curriculum. Some schools under pressure to bring in specialist teachers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Excellence and Enjoyment</td>
<td>Curriculum reforms ‘free up’ primary curriculum, school setting targets and assessment at KS1.</td>
<td>Makes time demands by revision of planning. Increasing numbers of specialist instructors used for curriculum areas such as Physical Education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Intensifying Support Programme</td>
<td>Intense support for primary schools with poor results using progress meetings, ‘improvement cycle’ of staff development including close examination of teacher performance including repeated lesson observations (re-named Improving Schools Programme 2008)</td>
<td>Brings additional pressure in participating schools and increased workload to meet performance targets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Event Description</td>
<td>Details</td>
<td>Impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Ofsted Changes 2005</td>
<td>‘Short notice’ inspections</td>
<td>Heightens pressure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Social and Emotional Aspects of Learning (SEAL)</td>
<td>Introduction of Social and Emotional Aspects of Learning (SEAL) as a subject.</td>
<td>Increased workload</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Pupil Premium</td>
<td>Introduction of Pupil Premium funding – used to target funding brings administrative changes</td>
<td>Increased workload as individual children are tracked</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Modern Foreign Languages</td>
<td>Compulsory teaching of Modern Foreign Languages in primary schools.</td>
<td>Makes more time demands on teachers and some schools draft in specialist teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>National Curriculum</td>
<td>Review of National Curriculum in phases announced, with new curriculum to be enacted over next two years, compulsory by Sept 2014</td>
<td>Increases workload as teachers modify schemes of work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Performance Related Pay</td>
<td>Performance Related Pay to be implemented</td>
<td>Increased performativity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Williamson and Myhill (2008), commenting on the work of teachers, note that:

“This intensification, which is central to the changes in teachers’ work may well reflect more general workplace trends, from which the education sector is not immune, or protected”

(Williamson & Myhill, 2008, p.25)
Intensification in the work of teachers appears linked to larger, global changes in the world of work. Hargreaves (1991) suggests that the intensification thesis defined by Apple talks of the compression of time and its demands on teachers. This is taken up by Goodson, (1996) , who when discussing time proposes that:

“The compression of time and space leading to the intensification of teachers’ labour has resulted from a complex of factors. These include bigger classes, the addition of new managerial tasks at school level, new technology such as fax machines moving information in and out of the school, new information systems in the school which monitor student and map school performance….”

(Goodson, 1996, p.45)

The idea of compression of time and space is a useful description of intensification, hinting that work cannot be escaped from, and is pressured by time factors. This also chimes with the report by Galton and MacBeath (1998), referred to in the previous chapter. In their report on teacher workload, they found that administrative and workplace reforms designed to lower workload actually increased the number of hours worked by the teachers in their survey. These factors are best discussed in the context of the characteristics of intensification, which are discussed in the next section.
2.3 The Characteristics of Intensification

As previously indicated, the intensification thesis defined by Apple, is based on the work of Larson (1980), who suggested that the effects of intensification in educated labour include the narrowing of work processes, a greater dependence on bureaucracy, and the routinization of high-level tasks. Hargreaves (1991) summarizes Larson’s proposals that the characteristics of Intensification are:

- Reduced time for relaxation during the working day
- Lack of time to retool skills and keep up with training
- Chronic and persistent overload
- Reduction of the sociability on which association and community are founded
- Reductions in the quality of service
- Enforced diversification of expertise and responsibility
  (Hargreaves 1991, p.2)

Apple (1986) acknowledges the main points presented by Larson, and then adds two additional points, directly related to teaching:

- The implementation of simplified technological solutions to curriculum change, providing ‘ready-made’ solutions to lack of preparation time.

- The increasing technicization and intensification of the teaching act, misrecognized as a symbol of increased professionalism.

The intensification thesis defined by Apple became a starting point for a number of studies that discussed and expanded on his ideas. Hargreaves (1991) investigates and discusses the intensification thesis and suggests that it should not be perceived in a monolithic way, but should be a basis for discussion and possibly reconstruction.
He synthesises a model of intensification based on the work of Apple, Densmore and Larson:

- Intensification leads to reduced time for relaxation
- Intensification leads to lack of time to keep up with one’s field
- Intensification reduces opportunities for interaction with colleagues
- Intensification creates chronic work overload that fosters dependency on outside experts
- Intensification reduces the quality of service by encouraging ‘cutting of corners’
- Intensification leads to diversification of responsibility and, with it, heightened dependency on experts
- Intensification creates and reinforces scarcities of preparation time
- Intensification is voluntarily supported by many teachers and misrecognized as professionalism

(Hargreaves, 1991, p. 5)

The last point of ‘misrecognized professionalism’ is an important one. It can be linked to the work of Kelliher and Anderson (2010) who identify three means by which intensification may take place. They suggest that intensification may be imposed, for example where workloads increase after down-sizing. Secondly, intensification may be enabled, where flexible organization allows employees to work hard more easily. Finally intensification may be an act of exchange, where they suggest that enhanced employee commitment, can possibly lead to workers making increased efforts. This chimes with the last section of Hargreaves definition, where misrecognized professionalism can be a spur to increase pace, and where high commitment levels to the profession can lead to greater intensification. Hargreaves conducted a later study in 1994, and went on to suggest that intensification may not impact on all teachers in the same way, and that not all heightened professionalism can be explained by intensification, and there may be real signs of commitment as teachers respond to change. He concludes that this does not disconfirm the intensification thesis, but outline its complexity and its limits, and suggests further research.
In a wide-ranging study, Ballet, Kelchtermans and Loughran (2006) suggest that in the last two decades teachers in many countries have found themselves facing rapid change. They comment that Apple made a powerful attempt to explain and conceptualize the new demands that they face, and after reviewing other research in this area in depth they re-define Intensification as:

- Less ‘down time’ during the working day, resulting in less time to keep up with developments in subject areas and less time to reflect on and refine teaching skills.

- A chronic and persistent sense of work overload. ‘more and more has to be done; less and less time is available to do it’ (Apple & Jungck, 1996) This overload reduces teachers’ ‘areas of personal discretion, inhibits involvement in and control over long term planning and fosters dependency on externally produced materials and expertise’ (Hargreaves, 1992)

- Negative effects on the quality of results: ‘as corners are being cut to save time’ (Hargreaves, 1992) so that only that which is essential and immediately accomplishable is done, and isolation from colleagues increases as there is no time for feedback, collaboration or sharing of ideas.

- Diversification of expertise makes teachers more dependent on external specialists, creating doubts about one’s own competence

(Ballet, et al., 2006, p.210)

The study is a synthesis of the concepts developed by Apple, and Hargreaves and confirms the existence of intensification, its complex nature, and notes the negative effects on teachers.
Ballet et al. propose three refinements to the intensification thesis after studying a range of empirical research literature:

1. The experience of intensification is not only induced by changes at the macro level, but in fact multiple sources for intensification have to be recognised.

2. The intensification impact operates not in a direct and automatic way, but is mediated (and thus possibly changed).

3. The impact of intensification turns out to be differentiated among different teachers.

(Ballet, et al., 2006, p.212-218)

They go on to propose refinements to the ‘thesis’ and point to how intensification can be buffered, especially by good quality staff development, and how it can have positive qualities. There are parallels to the work of Hargreaves, acknowledging that teachers themselves may drive intensification. They also outline how some school contexts can mediate the process, by buffering its effects.

In summary, several research studies have shown evidence for intensification in the work of teachers (Apple, 1986; Apple and Neil, 1994; Campbell and Neil, 1994; Easthope and Easthope 2000; Hargreaves, 1992, 1994; Troman 1996; Troman and Woods, 2001; Woods, 1994; Woods, 1999 ), all note the general negative effect on teachers.


2.4 The Effects of Intensification

Because of the differentiated and often buffered nature of Intensification indicated by Hargreaves and Kelchertmans mentioned previously, it must be acknowledged that a clear picture of its effects seems unlikely to emerge, as it is related to context and the individual teacher and may be complex in nature. However, some common strands seem
to emerge. Day (2002) when discussing intensification, suggest that changes designed to raise standards and somehow improve economic competitiveness, have a unifying factor in that:

- They challenge teacher’s existing practices
- They result in increased workload for teachers
- They do not pay attention to teacher’s work, lives and identities, arguably central to motivation, efficacy

(Day, 2002, p.679)

These three factors provide a useful framework for a discussion of the effects of intensification, and the study will now explore each in turn.

2.5 The Challenge to Teacher’s Existing Practices

Intensification has a range of effects. Woods (1992) and others noted the increasing rate of teacher resignations that followed early pressures, as the role of the teacher changed, and a generational divide grew between older teachers and their rapidly changing schools. Troman and Woods (2001) demonstrated how reforms challenged the values of English child-centred teachers, and this lead to increased stress, burnout and the eventual departure from teaching. Smyth (2001) highlights intensification in several states, and argues that teachers are being damaged by:

1. the corrosion of the culture and character of teaching, with the shift to individual responsibility for delivering outcomes;

2. the intensification in leadership and management away from supporting the work of teaching to pursuing corporate visions; and;

3. the dislocation of teacher’s pedagogic and professional identities as educative space is eroded, with teachers having to lead increasingly divided lives.

(Smyth, 2001, p.10)
Smyth seems to highlight the cultural shift that takes place in schools. Troman (1996) proposes that intensification has led to a change in working practices, and that Apple creates an image of a teacher as a technician, who delivers the plans developed by others, hinting at de-skilling of teaching. The cultural shifts and changed working practices may have had an effect on teacher retention in many countries. Choi and Tang (2009) note that there is:

“much evidence presented at the UNESCO International Conference on Education in 1996 that recent reform policies in many countries have led to teacher attrition.”
(Choi & Tang, 2009, p.768)

The effects of reform policies have impacted on the working conditions of teachers. Ingersoll (2004) proposes that the answer to the problem may be in improved conditions:

“The data suggest that school staffing problems to a large extent are rooted in the way schools are organized and the way the teaching occupation is treated and that lasting improvements in the quality and quantity of the teaching workforce will require improvements in the quality of the teaching job”
(Ingersoll, 2004, p.13)

The intensification thesis then, was first proposed in 1986, and its existence confirmed by many studies. The continuing process of change has carried on, and the work of teachers has evolved in response. Goodson (1996) proposes that:

“the intensification of teachers’ work inevitably leads to the prioritizing of those activities which are rewarded over those which are not useful - This is only human.”
(Goodson,1996, p.45)

In contrast to earlier generation of teachers identified by Troman & Woods (2000), Goodson considers that teachers have a changed set of professional priorities, developing micropolitical literacy (Kelchermans, 2005) to recognize, understand and later influence issues of power and interests in schools, and have changed their practice, prioritizing the rewarded activities.
2.5a Increased Workload

Increased workload can take many forms ranging from larger classes, greater management responsibilities or increased time demands. The length of time at work, and the pace of work within that time are key issues in intensification. In a statement on its effects in schools, The Queensland Independent Education Union (QIEU) (2005) suggests that it:

“describes not simply increased work load, but the work context within which it occurs. Basically the term includes both working longer hours and working harder within each hour spent at the workplace”
(QIEU, 2005, p.1)

They go on to suggest that this workload has been absorbed into the working practices of teaching and that:

“The current reality of excessive workloads endured by school employees is so common that it is almost seen as intrinsic to one’s self identification as a professional, to the detriment of health, family, personal life and ultimately productivity.”
(QIEU, 2005, p.2)

This joins directly with the idea of misrecognized professionalism outlined previously by Densmore and extended by Hargreaves. The QIEU add that “the gifts of time staff have regularly made over long periods have now mutated into an expectation” (2005, p2), this summarizes in one sentence the way that intensification can be embedded into professional practice. The increased time devoted to school has to come from somewhere, and the factor of time has been identified as lack of relaxation, training, and lack of social time within the work day (Larson,1980 ), but also extends to a secondary effect on the teachers’ family and private life (Goodson, 1994).
2.5b Teachers Work, Lives and Identities

The continuing change process outlined in chapter one that has led to intensification, challenges the practice of teaching, subjecting that to change. Woods (1994) notes its effects on teachers, basing his suggestions on those of Osborne and Broadfoot (1992) who propose that teachers co-operate with, retreat from, resist or incorporate change. Woods synthesises these points into a more detailed model, his categories are:

Diagram 2.2 The Effects of Change – The Modes of Adaptation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effect Categories (Woods)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Resistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Appropriation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Resourcing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Enrichment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Relocation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(from Woods 1994 p. 388)

It is worth noting that the research was carried out in the early days of the National Curriculum in English primary schools, during the first wave of change, and with an earlier generation of teachers. Woods expresses concern about how creative teachers adapt to intensification, and it could be argued that the categories of enrichment and relocation, are in fact linked to the misrecognised professionalism identified by Densmore, and could build into further intensification. Woods also notes that intensification can be cathartic for the teacher’s sense of self, and may lead to some leaving the profession. As well as the physical effects of harder work, the time factor outlined previously affects the teacher in removing so-called down time and time to recover when not teaching. Goodson (2002) suggests that the working lives and personalities are interconnected and that intensification can lead to challenges to teacher identities. Woods (1999) proposes that intensification is not a singular deterministic development and may be complex, with a variety of actions which may lead to enhanced professionalism. Woods also notes how intensification not only affects the professional definition and working life of the teacher, but also their personal life, echoing the work of Goodson (1986) in the field of life history research. O’Brien and Down (2002, p.113), commenting on intensification and management practices claim that: “It is not surprising that radical reforms of this kind have a devastating impact on the lives and work of teachers” and then go on to suggest that “the current policy and practice emphasis on the ‘performing school’ has profound consequences for the
‘performance’ of the school’s performers: its pupils, teachers and leaders”. Easthope and Easthope (2000) drew directly on Hargreaves’ work of 1992 and examined the experience of how teachers in Tasmania dealt with the increasing pressures put upon them, and explored the concept that intensification could explain how the teachers viewed their work, and what other factors such as professional commitment came into play. The research used a combination of in depth interviews and focus groups, and generated grounded theory. The result of the research was that teachers felt their workload was both increased and extended, leading to a much more complex workplace. Complexity was also produced by teachers maintaining their professional practices while trying to adapt to the new policies. This complexity was also confirmed by Goodson (2002), and by Gil et al. (2006) who highlighted the differentiated nature of intensification, and differences across Spain’s seventeen regions.

2.6 Intensification

Intensification has led to the rise of what appear to be unattractive working conditions. This has led to teacher attrition, where, as Woods noted in 1992, teachers resign from the profession. A report by the Queensland Independent Teachers Union suggests that the inability of workers to participate in a full non-work life ultimately makes work an unsustainable part of their lives, and this echoes the work by Smithers and Robinson, previously mentioned in the introductory Chapter One, where large numbers of teachers left the profession in England, citing workload issues. They reported that “holding down the job seemed to take over the best part of the evenings and weekends. ‘Leaving to get a life’ was how it was commonly explained to us” (Smithers & Robinson, 2005, p.35), and this confirms the extension of work into the private lives of teachers. Intensification has other effects: Choi and Tang (2009) researched teacher commitment in Hong Kong during large scale teaching reforms. Acknowledging that commitment involves the interplay of a variety of factors, and that some teachers maintain deep commitment to teaching despite working contexts, and they went on to note that:

“work intensification was the common factor that all three cohorts found to have adverse effect on teacher commitment, though it played out differently for different teachers.”
(Choi & Tang, 2009, p.772)

when returns from individual teachers were analysed, lack of time, long working hours, and ‘work intensification due to increased administrative responsibilities’ were noted by
the researchers as lowering commitment levels. This is important as commitment is linked to retention and teacher efficacy (Day et al., 2002, 2006).

Hidden like a thread through the intensification thesis is how, in often complex ways, some teachers react to, and develop themselves, in relation to that change, not just through opposition or mediation, but through reflection and development. In his original research, Woods (1994, p.406) reported that for the moment:

“the teachers featuring in this paper are emerging stronger from the point of view of knowledge of self, than when they entered the ‘epiphany, whether they remained in the system or not”

Some of the teachers in the Wood’s study did survive, and some thrived, with Woods finding no alienation, or misrecognition. Some departed, unable to cope. Woods acknowledges that some are no longer in the profession. The phrase ‘for the moment’ is important, as it hints at Wood’s awareness of the likelihood of further change, and more importantly, further effects. As change and intensification continue, it seems likely that intensification will also continue to develop. There is also a degree of churn, as new teachers replace older ones. The education environment is dynamic and has been changed by the reform agenda. In a real sense, it is in evolution, and so are the reactions to the teachers within that environment. This study will return to the complex effects of intensification on individual teachers in a later section.
2.7 The Rise of the Second Career Teacher

As previously indicated in Chapter One, the high turnover rate in the teaching profession has been noted by the OECD (2001) and Ingersoll and Smith (2003). Others such as Woods (1992), and Troman & Woods (2001) have attributed increased teacher attrition to rapid change and factors associated with intensification. Hargreaves (2003), considers teaching is a profession that ‘more and more people want to leave, fewer and fewer want to join and very few are interested in leading’. In the United States, Ingersoll (2004) suggested that conventional wisdom proposed that teacher shortages are caused by increased student enrolments and increased teacher turnover due to a greying workforce. Ingersoll goes on to suggest that they are primarily caused by ‘the revolving door’ where teachers leave their jobs long before retirement age, prompting a recruitment crisis.

As outlined in Chapter One, concerns about teacher shortages brought about changes to entry requirements, professional qualifications and changes in teacher status, meaning that primary staff rooms became increasingly populated by teachers who had come into teaching through a variety of new routes. These new routes into teaching are often referred to as Alternative Certification Programmes (ACPs). The development of ACPs in England and Wales has been related previously. A wide variety of government initiatives have been launched in the past ten years in England, to attract the career-switchers. A variety of projects have been run by the Teacher Development Agency (TDA) the government body tasked with promoting teaching. One such project was Transition to Teaching, which attempted to recruit teachers from industry with the assistance of their employers. This was aided by an associated publicity campaign. The media have recently discussed the attractions of the profession to bankers (Tuck, 2008) (Shepherd, 2009), but earlier musings go back eight years (BBC, 2000). A variety of eye-catching initiatives have been proposed, ranging from recruiters from the TDA being sent to financial districts to attract bank staff (BBC, 2008), to Troops to Teachers (Burkard, 2008 for the Centre for Policy Studies), where it was proposed that ex-soldiers are re trained as class teachers, later adopted as government policy in 2012 (DfE, 2013c).

There is a body of research into second career teachers in the United States. This commenced during the 1990s, as participants in Alternative Certification Programmes (ACPs) started teacher training. Researchers attempted to define who the new entrants to the profession were, and what lay behind their career choice. The ACPs were a
response to teacher shortages across the US, and concerns about future staffing. It should be noted that these programmes were diverse as they were often tailored for individual states. Studies carried out on the programmes were often small in scale and concentrated on teachers in training, or the very early years of teaching.

Studies in the early 1990s investigated ‘the remarkable phenomenon of career switchers into teaching (Lee & Lamport, 2011) as increasing numbers of these non-traditional entrants entered training. A common theme in early research was that of attraction to teaching and motivations for career change (Crow, Levine & Nager 1990; Freidus & Krasnow, 1991; Serow, 1993).

Another common theme was that of the suitability of ACP training programmes and the induction process (Darling Hammond, 1990; Feiman-Nemser Parker 1990) and later as they started teaching, supervision and induction practice (Freidus, 1994; Freidus, 1992; Novak & Knowles, 1992). There are some comparative studies (Gonzales, Rodriuigez & Sjostrum, 1998; Powell, 1997), where their attitudes to teaching are contrasted with their traditional colleagues. Both of these studies were with first year teachers and found slight differences in pedagogical approach.

A study by Bullough & Knowles (1990) proposed that entry into the profession was difficult for the second career teacher, with issues about adjusting to the new work environment, confirmed by Madfes (1990) in a study of the early years of teaching. Mayotte (2003) suggested that these early years could be problematic due to lack of support from colleagues, who failed to support them because of their life experience and age.

Etherington (2009) found that previous life experiences were crucially important to the second career teacher, and some thought that they were more valid than “common learning theories, typical and atypical student characteristics, instruction practices and suggested class management techniques” and therefore affected their identity and practice as teachers. Similarly, Mayotte (2001) found indications that gender and previous life history affected the decision to become a teacher, and how they taught. Their previous career gave them a range of competencies, all now used in teaching. These were classified into know-why, know-how, and know-whom competencies, all linked to previous careers. The influence of previous careers on second career teacher identity is a common strand in much research.
The theme of attraction to the profession was explored by Novak & Knowles (1992). In their case study they also showed the influence of early life history and employment on attitude to teaching and practice. They also suggested that there were a variety of reasons attracting the second career teacher to the profession, based on the work of Merseth (1986) and suggested some groupings. They are shown below in Diagram 2.3 below, and were:

**Diagram 2.3 Attractions to Teaching (based on Novak & Knowles, 1992, p.7)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attractions to Teaching- (Novak &amp; Knowles)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teaching as a worthwhile activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service to others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal style</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Love of subject</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic benefits</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The love of subject category was an attraction for many secondary school teachers who had specialist subject skills and interest into their new career. It also highlights an issue with much second career teacher research, as the majority is cross-phase and combines teachers in secondary and primary schools, who may have radically different working experiences and attractions to teaching.

An early study by Crow, et al (1990) proposed that second-career teachers could be put into three groups, based on their attraction to the profession:

- Home Comers – who see teaching as the career they really wanted
- Converted – who see teaching as a possible career after a life changing event
- Unconverted – those who transfer from high status in their previous work, but can become disenchanted.

(Crow et al.,1990, p.202-215)

Other studies have concentrated on how biography affects career choice, with Freidus (1989),(1990), suggesting that gender has some limited influence, as well as the would-be teachers world view developed in earlier years having an influence on the choice to
become a teacher. This aligns with the work of Lortie (1975) on how childhood experiences can have long term effects on the teacher. Serow (1993) noted the altruism of second career teachers, and classified them into four groups. The Extenders who see teaching as an extension of their beliefs, the Subject-Oriented who were interested in one subject, the Practical, who were attracted to teaching because of an alignment with the tasks of the teacher, and Rectifiers, who change to correct a poor career decision. A desire to help students and to work with children was a common strand through all these attractions to teaching. Pryadharshini & Robinson-Pant (2003) examined second career teachers by examining their life history combined with their previous employment. They classified the career changers as:

- The Freelancer – with a portfolio career, attracted to the stability of teaching
- The Late Starter – looking for security after previous employment
- The Parent – mostly women who saw the attractions of teaching as it fits in with family commitments
- The Serial Careerist – who changed employment regularly, but sought security
- The Successful Careerist – who had done well in previous employment but needed a challenge
- The Young Career Changer – who changed employment regularly, and sought teaching as it matched their identity.

(Pryadharshini & Robinson-Pant, 2003,p.102)

There is a wide variety of classification systems of second career teachers, and most stress the influence of previous careers and balance them with the attractions of teaching. They have their strengths in that they can be a useful guide to initial attractions, but caution should be exercised as lives can be complex and infinitely variable. Many studies were carried out in the United States, and were related to the diverse, state-based ACP programmes, as related earlier.

In the United Kingdom, Troman, (2008), in a study of the commitment of forty-two primary teachers noted a cohort of eighteen second career teachers, and analysed their career change decision and proposes three categories, linked to the work of Strauss and Hodkinson and Sparkes (1997). Troman suggests defining the career change event in
terms of turning points, rather than attractions, to examine if choices were structural, self-initiated, or forced:

**Parent Turners**, who enter teaching because of its caring culture and its suitability to child care, time and other parental responsibilities

**Self-Initiated Turners**, who left often well-paid careers because they did not enjoy their previous professions

**Displaced Turners**, who enter teaching because of major changes in their previous employment, such as re-structuring or redundancy.

(Troman, 2008, p.629-70)

The above model has clear strengths, as it is simple and is based on the change-event, and yet acknowledges the inherent complexity, rather than the simple attractions of teaching. This degree of complexity is echoed by Tigchelaar, Brouwer, Korthagen (2008) in the Netherlands. They reported in two studies in the way that second career secondary teachers make the transition to teaching, dealing with the development of Dutch ACP courses. They go on to pose the question who are the real career changers, noting that some participants have previous experience of working in education and differ from those having recent work experience outside the profession. This again highlights the diverse and complex nature of previous careers and the effects that will shape the second career teacher. Powers (2002) also suggested that early life history and previous employment formed the second career teacher’s identity as a teacher. He went on to suggest (p.304) that they are “armed with a wide spectrum of work exposure and life experiences, these teachers are substantially different from their younger counterparts” Powers reports that second career teachers are older and more mature, and are attempting to make teaching a vocation rather than a job. He hints at further commitment, suggesting that the second career teachers intend to stay in the profession for some time.
Chambers (2002) found that second career teachers saw themselves as different in a subtle way to other teachers, importantly using their commitment to teaching to help their pupils apply knowledge to the real world. Lee & Lamport (2011) suggest that:

“Most confessed that the youthful idealism that caused many new teachers to burn out and leave the profession early does not apply to second-career teachers. They have already passed through this phase, if it is indeed a phase, when working in their previous profession”

(Lee & Lamport 2011, p.25)

Some studies find great sense of commitment among second career teachers (Crow at al., 1990 Freidus, 1992; Freidus and Krasnow, 1991; and Powers, 2002) and Crow goes on to propose that second career teachers:

“describe teaching as an occupational choice, in contrast to previous occupational decisions. The deliberateness of their decision should contribute to the strength of their commitment”

(Crow et al., 1990, p.210)

Crow et al. warn though, that there is a risk of disillusionment with their new careers when reality fails to live up to their expectations. Recent research by Weihe (2009) into the professional perceptions of second career teachers in their fifth year of teaching, seems to confirm this, and recommends that more research on the commitment and retention of second career teachers needs to be carried out.

Research into the second career teacher has shown that they are attracted to teaching for often altruistic reasons, but with many other complex factors also affecting choice of career. This may include major life events. Their attitudes to the profession, their practice, and teaching is affected by their life histories, previous careers and a variety of other factors. Their previous work history seems to have an extensive influence on their second career. In the early stages of their career they appear committed, but in general are older and more experienced than their traditional colleagues.
But one problem remains. Many of the studies that discuss commitment examine it as an aspiration, as the second career teachers commence their careers. There are few studies of commitment, or of retention. This should be coupled with the fact that the majority of studies take place in the very early stages of their new career. Commenting on ACPs Tigcehelaar, et al. (2008) comment:

“as these programmes proliferate, one may wonder what they actually contribute towards solving the problems of teacher shortages. Even if ACPs generate an influx of new teachers, an important question is whether they stay in the profession.”
(Tigcehelaar et al.,2008, p.1530)

Research in the United States by Ingersoll and Smith (2003) suggests that 40-50% of new entrants to teaching had left within five years, and this seems to echo the situation in England revealed by Kryiacou, (2000). This could include the second career teachers, who may be prey to the same early difficulties as their traditional-entry colleagues. There may also be other factors affecting their retention, and these will now be discussed.

2.8 Proofed Against Change?
The second career teachers who have joined the profession may be in the early phase of teaching, but as indicated in the previous section, can be advanced in years. It could, of course, be suggested that their experience has ‘proofed’ them against change, but one question that must be asked is if their commitment is linked to their age, and if it is, do they share the professional mortality of their peers. As their numbers rise, then this question is an important one. When discussing later entrants to the teaching profession in the VITAE research, Day et al. (2007) comment that:

“These older teachers (in terms of age) exhibited a similar professional outlook to that of their younger peers in the same professional life phase however, because of the age factor and its associated personal needs and concerns, they faced similar work – life tensions to those who were the same age but were in later professional life-phases.”
(Day et al., 2007, p.79)
This large scale research project explored age, life phase and the commitment of teachers, as well as other factors. It will now be explored in detail because of its relevance to the study.

### 2.9 The VITAE Research

The VITAE (Variations in Teacher’s Working Lives and Effectiveness) project was funded by the Department for Education and Skills (DfES, 2006) and the key aim of the research was to investigate factors contributing to variations in teacher’s effectiveness at different stages of their careers. Whilst accepting the complex nature of effectiveness and added complexity of the context of schools, the research attempted to take a multi-perspective view of variation and stability in teacher’s experiences, examining the moderating and mediating influences in their personal and professional lives and ultimately, their commitment and effectiveness. One feature of interest was the qualitative data gathered about response to change and professional life phases. This section of the research can show useful pointers to how educational change is responded to during the different stages of a teacher’s life. This large scale study involved a mixture of qualitative and quantitative methods, and an initial teacher survey of schools located within seven local authorities provided samples of 100 schools and initially 1,100 teachers. This survey effort identified 300 case study teachers, who were a representative sample of in line with national profiles of age, gender, and experience. These were located in both primary and secondary schools. Half of this sample (n=150) were primary school teachers in Y2 and Y6 located in 75 primary schools. This is important, as it allows Standard Attainment Test (SAT) data to be used as a teacher effectiveness measure, but may compromise the findings slightly, as will be demonstrated later. In the VITAE research, Day et al identified only 7 later-stage entrants to the profession, working in primary and secondary schools, exclusively in the Phase 1, the 0 – 3 yrs group, the ‘commitment, support and challenge’ section, in other words in the very early stages of their teaching. Four had a developing sense of self-efficacy, defined as the belief of teachers that they can exert a positive effect on the success of their pupils (Ashton and Webb, 1986; Rosenholtz, 1989). It noted three with a decreasing sense of efficacy, this is within 26 teachers in the phase, and 307 interviews in all phases. In such a large study, this represents a small field of research. There is little current research in this area, even though the number of second career teachers in primary school teachers is growing, and if intensification continues, will probably continue to rise. The research suggested that teacher effectiveness, identified
as both perceived (by the teacher) and effectiveness as pupil attainment (by test and SATs results) is not simply a consequence of age or experience, and that teachers professional life phases are core moderating influences upon their effectiveness, but other factors have influence. The research proposes six professional life phases relating to experience rather than position of responsibility or the teacher’s age. They are broadly based on the earlier work of Huberman (1989, 1995) who proposed a series of career phases, and Sikes et al. (1985) whose research suggested that teachers transit through five non-linear phases, ranging from Career Launching, Stabilization, New Challenges, Reaching a Plateau, and a Final Phase. A comparison of the various age stage models is shown later in this chapter, and is shown in diagram 2.3. It should be noted that the research by Day et al. had additional dimensions in that research was conducted over time, and that it was linked to pupil progress and teacher effectiveness. The five VITAE phases were:

- **0-3 years** – *Commitment, support and challenge*. This is typified by developing a sense of efficacy in the classroom, and was a period of high commitment.

- **4-7 years** - *Identity and efficacy in the Classroom*. Increasing confidence about being effective teachers: many (78%) taking up of roles of responsibility, the management of heavy workloads had a negative impact on some teachers.

- **8-15 years** - *Managing change in role and identity* – Growing tensions and transitions. This phase was identified as a watershed in teacher’s professional development. 80% had roles of responsibility, 76% show sustained engagement, with 24% showing loss of motivation.

- **16-23 years** - *Work–life tensions: Challenges to motivation and commitment*. As well as managing heavy workloads, some had work–life balance issues as many were facing additional demands outside school. The research identifies three sub groups with i) 52% indicating that promotion led to increased motivation  ii) 34% showing sustained commitment, and 14% reporting decreased commitment due to career stagnation, heavy workload or competing tensions.

- **24-30 years** - *Challenges to sustaining motivation*. This was identified by the research as ‘maintaining motivation in the face of external policies and initiatives’ with 60% of primary teachers in the research reporting retaining a strong sense of motivation.
• **31+ years** – *Sustaining/Declining Motivation, coping with change, looking to retire.* The research reported that for the majority of teachers this was a high phase of commitment, with 64% ‘maintaining commitment’ and 36% feeling ‘tired and trapped’.

(DfES [Day, Stobart, Sammons, Kington, Quing Gu, Smees, & Mujtaba] (2006) p3-4)

It is interesting that from a sample of three hundred teachers, twenty-two were in the last (31+) year group. The sample size was shaped to reflect national levels of staffing, but it is a striking example of the survivability of older teachers. A relatively high number of this sample (almost two-thirds) were judged to have high motivation. When the use of Y6 and Y2 teachers in the sample is examined, the research notes that they were selected so that key stage national curriculum tests could be used as pupil outcome, and teacher effectiveness measure. It seems likely however, that the importance of these tests as a public measure of performance is not lost on the management of schools, who would put their best-performing and more expert teachers in these important classes. Their importance to the school and its management may explain the relatively high level of motivation in the findings.

The VITAE research also notes the emotional context of teaching and suggests that teachers’ capacities to sustain their effectiveness during different phases of their professional lives are affected by their professional sense of identity. It goes on to suggest that professional identity reflects larger social and policy expectations of what a good teacher is, and the personal educational ideals of the teacher, and is situated in the school context. This may be influenced by leadership, support and feedback, but also by the personal dimension such as life outside school, linked to family and social roles. It goes on to suggest that:

“effective teaching requires emotional and intellectual investments from teachers which draw upon personal and professional capacities and experience, knowledge and skills”

(Day et al., 2006, p4)

The VITAE research goes on to explore the relationship between the various dimensions of identity, notes mediating factors and examines the influence of CPD.

Unsurprisingly, it finds that pupils of the 26% of teachers who were not sustaining commitment and resilience were more likely to attain results below the expected level, with them being more likely to report personal factors, pupil behaviour or policy initiatives as having an effect on their work. Early research into intensification concentrated on documenting teacher reactions to change and the steps that they took to mediate that change. Later research suggested ways forward, often linked to notions of ‘surviving’ (Woods, 1994). The VITAE research claims to take this further, by providing pointers as to how teachers can remain resilient and retain their commitment. The research notes that a teacher’s long term effectiveness may be at risk for those who work in schools in more challenging socio-economic contexts, and comment that ‘these teachers are more likely to experience greater challenges to their health, well-being and thus resilience’.

There are a range of age and stage models suggested by research. These can be examined in Diagram 2.4 below. Early models were proposed at a time when age and stage was synonymous, and working and recruitment conditions were very different. Some have a more recent and sophisticated profile, regarding the length of service, rather than the age of the teacher as a key factor. When dealing with second career teachers, the age or stage of a teacher becomes important as a reference to their commitment, and thus survivability.
Diagram 2.4 Age and Professional Stage Models – Comparative Structure

Sikes (1984) Age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 1</th>
<th>Phase 2</th>
<th>Phase 3</th>
<th>Phase 4</th>
<th>Phase 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21-28 years</td>
<td>28 – 33 years</td>
<td>30 – 40 years</td>
<td>40 – 50/55 years</td>
<td>50 – 55 years +</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hargreaves (2005)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>0 – 5 years</th>
<th>6 – 19 years</th>
<th>20 years +</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early Career</td>
<td>Mid Career</td>
<td>Late Career</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Day at Al. (2007)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>0 – 3 yrs</th>
<th>4 – 7 yrs</th>
<th>8 – 15 yrs</th>
<th>16 – 23 yrs</th>
<th>24 – 30 yrs</th>
<th>31 yrs plus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commitment, support and challenge</td>
<td>Identity and efficacy in the classroom</td>
<td>Managing change in roles and identity</td>
<td>Work life tension: challenges to motivation and commitment</td>
<td>Challenges to sustaining motivation</td>
<td>Sustaining – declining motivation Ability to cope with change/retire</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Diagram 2.4 (above) refers to the various models proposed. Research by Sykes (1985), Hargreaves (2005) and Day et al. (2007) as well as life history research by Goodson, has shown that age, and or professional stage, affects the capacity of teachers to deal with change and survive in teaching. Initial research by Sykes (1986) suggested a model of teacher age phases, but later work by Hargreaves (2005) and Day et al (2007) modifies this, suggesting professional life phases, differing in structure and labelling. The work by Day et al, as part of the VITAE project, suggests six phases of professional life.

It is interesting to note the similarities in research conducted by Hargreaves (2005). This was an analysis of interviews with fifty Canadian teachers in elementary, middle and
high schools in different stages of their career. In this socio-constructionist research Hargreaves examined the relationship of the emotions of teaching with teacher’s age and career stages based on experience of educational change. Hargreaves (2005) initially admits that emotional experience is notoriously difficult to investigate and suggests that this is because emotional experience is often hard to articulate, echoes the views of Hammersley and Atkinson (1983) that it is a common tendency in interviews to present credible rather than authentic accounts of one’s own actions. Hammersley (1983) suggests that only a detailed ethnographic or anthropological study that explores the experiences and actions of participants can give detailed and valid accounts of the complexity of emotions and experiences. In other research, Van Veen & Lasky (2005) consider analysis of teacher emotion as crucial to providing information about the change experience, and have possibilities for wider exploitation. They suggest that analysis of emotions while implementing reforms can deepen understanding of how a teacher responds to imposed change. The earlier paper sets out the theory behind the later research. As discussed earlier Hargreaves acknowledges the difficulty of discussing emotions relating to change after an initial pilot study, but modified the technique of enquiry, basing it on the work of Hochschild (1983) on emotional labour, and Sikes et al (1985) on critical incident analysis. Interview technique concentrated on asking teachers to recall vivid moments and experiences of negative and positive emotions, in relation to others at schools. Critical incident theory has a long history in relating emotions and is often used when investigating working lives. The study of emotional response to change can provide useful insights, but in depth research often requires great skill and close immersion with participants, and these can prove difficult in short studies.
2.10 Teachers’ Age or Teachers’ Stage?

In the 2005 study, Hargreaves concentrated on data relating to emotional reactions to change, and how that change process affected colleagues of differing ages. Three ‘age and stage’ career groups were identified: Early career (0-5yrs), Mid-career (6-19 years) and Late career (20 years+) . Although much smaller in scale to the VITAE study, and with different career groupings, the ethnographic research produced much greater detail. It should be noted that the research lacked the multi-dimensional aspect of the VITAE project as it concentrated on emotions and change rather than investigating effectiveness, leadership, or Continuing Professional Development (CPD) but portrayed teachers’ reactions to change in great detail. He suggests that the research confirms previous studies of how age and career stage affect teaching and the response of a teacher to change. He goes on to relate how young teachers are enthusiastic and have gained skills of adaptability in an insecure world, but later become more confident and while still open to change, can choose the initiatives that they support. Later in their career ‘their experiences of educational change wear them down’ and teachers become more resilient to change efforts outside the classroom. This contrasts starkly with the VITAE data where two thirds of the similar group were judged to have high motivation and commitment, although there is common ground where the study found that government policy, health issues and pupil behaviour were seen as issues. Both the VITAE and the Hargreaves research agree about the dynamic, emotional nature of professional life phases. There are also clear links in that Hargreaves concludes that whilst younger teachers might be more open to change, they may be less ‘less confident in implementing and understanding it’ because they lack the background and experience to put the change into perspective. He warns of the simple logic of removing more experienced teachers and developing a school based on youth culture, where “Schools run on enthusiasm, adrenaline and emotional intensity with little access to the knowledge and memory that increases efficiency” (Hargreaves, 2005, p.982) and lack the experience and what he terms the “emotional distance” that can protect staff and the schools themselves from burnout.

2.11 Second Career Teachers and Commitment

As outlined previously, rapid change in working conditions is continuing in English primary schools. An additional dimension is that of multiple entry routes into the profession through alternative certification programmes, and active encouragement by
organizations to attract the late entrant to teaching. The ‘late entrant’ to the profession seems likely to take an increasingly important role in the education process. Day suggests that late entrants share the outlook of their younger peers, but retain their age related work-life tensions. If this is the case, and with increased numbers of late entrants, then the pressures of intensification could be felt as much as this group, as their older colleagues.

The question then must be asked about the resilience and commitment of these teachers as they age. Although they may be in the early stages of their career, it could be possible that life stage and age factors could make them just as vulnerable as their peers. They have previous work experience to compare their working life as a teacher, and this may work as a positive or a negative influence. They also must have had high commitment to train and enter the profession, so the question must be asked how this has been affected. The next section will examine the concepts and issues regarding commitment.

2.12 Examining Commitment

As previously indicated, commitment to the profession has been identified as one of the most important factors in the success of education, not only because it is closely connected with performance but because it influences teachers’ willingness to engage in reflective practice and the change process. Elliot and Croswell (2002) argue that:

“It contributes to teacher’s work performance, absenteeism, burnout and turnover, as well as having an important influence on student’s achievement in, and attitude to school”.

(Elliot & Croswell, 2002, p.1)

Chapman, (1982) proposes that commitment is the level of psychological attachment to teaching, but one persistent difficulty has been the variable nature of definitions of commitment. Early psychological research linked the concept to identification with an organization (Firestone & Pennell, 1993). Kanter (1974, 145) reports that commitment is a “process of binding actors into social system” indicating the two strands of commitment, the psychological and social. Recent commitment studies recognise the complexities of schools, the dynamic social forces that affect them, and the complex working lives of teachers. As schools and the education system are complex social
systems, it is the view of this study that commitment is best explored in the social strand.

Another area of difficulty with commitment is its multidimensional nature, outlined by Nias, (1981), which may be linked with contextual issues in the school and its stakeholders, and with a wide variety of personal and policy issues. Many dimensions of teacher commitment have been investigated, ranging from commitment to a profession, to a school or to students (Firestone & Rosenblum 1988; Nias 1981), with Woods (1993) proposing vocational, professional and career forms of commitment.

As previously indicated, the work of Huberman (1989) demonstrated that commitment levels may vary in relation to age and experience, and a variety of studies have produced sometimes dissonant results on commitment related to the age or professional stage of the teacher (Hargreaves,2005; Day et al, 2007) The research carried out by Day et al for the VITAE project notes that commitment varies across professional life phases, and notes the initial high commitment of those entering teaching, and attrition due to a range of causes. Huberman (1993) seems to agree and notes further that commitment levels decline steadily with age and experience, and lead to conservatism and disengagement in later years. Some, more recent studies including Day, (2004) note that some teachers retain a deep sense of commitment in later years. It should also be noted that there is a high rate of attrition in the early years of teaching (Ingersoll, 2003) linked to the tensions and challenges faced at the start of a career, and it seems likely that low commitment is part of that complex picture.

Other research has examined how the personal can affect the professional: how commitment is affected by the life events such as divorce or illness (Sikes, Measor & Woods 1985). As teaching has intensified it has expanded into the personal sphere, and is only displaced by large scale life events.

Ball and Goodson (1985) note the centrality of the sense of identity to teacher commitment:

“The ways in which teachers achieve, maintain, and develop their identity, their sense of self in and through a career, are of vital significance in understanding the actions and commitment of teachers in their work”

(Ball & Goodson, 1985, p.18)

Day et al in the VITAE research suggest that commitment is a predictor of teachers’ performance, burnout, and attrition. The move from enthusiastic engagement as a newly qualified teacher to later, a more distanced involvement with the profession is the story of the working life of many teachers. This affirms the centrality of commitment to the teaching profession. The dimension of time is of great interest when looking at the development of second career teachers, as their teacher identity can be newly formed or developing at a time when they as individuals are maturing.

There are many studies that define commitment in different ways, they include:

- Commitment to school (Huber, 1999; Tsui & Cheng 1999)
- Commitment to students (Nias, 1981)
- Commitment to career continuance (Tyree, 1996; Woods 1981)
- Commitment to professional knowledge (Nias, 1981; Tyree, 1986; Woods, 1981)
- Commitment to the teaching profession (Day, 2000)

It is clear that the construct of commitment is often highly individual and constituted in many dimensions—some personal and internal, others organizational or external. Any enquiry into commitment must first establish the nature of the construct to the participants.

The examination of commitment will continue in the next section with a review of published research.
2.13 Literature Review of Commitment

There are many studies of teacher commitment ranging from that carried out by Woods, who as early as 1983 noted that teacher identity, commitment and career are closely related, whilst also commenting on some elements of intensification. The work of Nias (1984) examined teachers in the early stages of their career. Some had yet to define their identity, and their levels of commitment, but others depict themselves as missionaries or crusaders, fighting to establish a more humane and socially just world. Many of the interviewees were guided by what they reported as an inner conviction. There are many studies of trainee teacher commitment, or teachers at that start of their career. One carried out by Lortie (1975) examined the attractors to teaching, and attempted to draw out personal issues related to commitment. It has strong connections with studies of the attraction to teaching by second career teachers. Lortie (1975,p.25) proposed five themes:

- The interpersonal theme;
- The service theme;
- The continuation theme;
- The theme of time compatibility;
- The material benefits theme.

These can be seen as early indicators of career definition and of commitment. One difficulty with research of this period is a generational one. Primary teachers and schools they work in were very different work places before the 1988 Education Reform act: Teaching, and teachers have been changed by intensification, and the incremental nature of change has locked much research in its time. Another issue is that of attrition, where complex life events, including low commitment, have led to resignation, and departure from the profession, such as that reported by Woods, (1993). There is little research on teachers who exit the profession, their commitment, or attributions of their departure. The steady movement of intensification may have brought about a change in the nature of teachers themselves. A recent study by Troman and Raggl (2008) poses the question:

“Has the experience of work in new capitalism, which may be destructive of commitment, loyalty and solidarity, brought about a ‘corrosion of character’ (Sennett 1999) so that people now express their commitment and pursue ‘meaning’, ‘mission’, ‘dreams’ and ‘purposes’ in their lives, and no longer through work and occupations?”

(Troman & Raggl, 2008, p.86)
Croswell and Elliot, (2004) examined commitment through passion for teaching and was conducted in Australia. It acknowledges that commitment is considered to be the key factor in the success of educational reforms and provides an Australian perspective on intensification, recognizes that teachers must ‘experience steep learning curves and invest personal time and energy to translate the on-going reforms successfully into effective practice.

The study concentrates on a single research question:

- how do teachers characterise commitment?

Thirty teachers from a range of mixed urban and rural schools were interviewed, all with over ten years of teaching experience (in reality between 9-27 years). The study was interested in teachers with experience ‘due to concern about teacher commitment levels changing over the course of teachers’ careers.’ The lack of teachers with less than ten years teaching experience removes a large ‘problematical’ group from the data, as those in the first years of teaching often have lower survivability (Kyriacou, 1998). The method used was a semi structured interview of up to one hour. They note that teacher commitment is intimately linked to the ideology of teaching and were aware that the teachers would present a ‘public face’ and suggest that the researcher needs to keep an open mind and be ‘prepared to sift through many layers of meaning’ in responses.

The data were analysed using grounded theory, and six conceptions of teacher commitment were identified:

- Commitment as a passion
- Commitment as an investment of extra time
- Commitment as a focus on the individual needs of the student
- Commitment as a responsibility to impart knowledge attitudes or beliefs
- Commitment as ‘maintaining professional knowledge’
- Commitment as engagement with the school community

(Croswell & Elliot, 2004, p.109)

One finding of the study challenges much research, indicating that external influences have less effect on commitment and suggests that commitment itself is a highly personal construct and a teachers’ personal passion for teaching is central to sustained commitment. They make the connection with Day (2004) who suggests that a passion
for teaching cannot be considered to be a luxury or a frill, and that passion needs to be possessed by all teachers and seems essential to good teaching. The study seems to suggest that commitment is influenced by the personal self, and that external influences may have less effect than is usually acknowledged.

There are several studies that show that second career entrants to the profession arrive with a strong level of commitment, based upon their earlier careers (Crow et al., 1990, Powers, 2002). As referred to previously, Crow et al., (1990, p.202-215) proposes that second career teachers can be grouped into three groups, the Home Comers, who see teaching as they career they wanted, the Converted who turn to teaching after a life changing event and the Unconverted who risk disenchantment. When these groupings are examined, the commitment levels needed to train as a teacher must be considered, as well as how that commitment may not last. All must have some degree of commitment to go through the teacher training process, and the Home Comers commitment may be high as they are at last in the career that they wanted. The Converted and the especially the Unconverted may have issues with commitment as their career progresses. Troman (2008) linked the commitment of primary teachers to the attractions of teaching. It examined life history data from 42 teachers in six primary schools. It is interesting to note that it uses classic studies from Lortie and Nias as a springboard to assess continuity and change. It was the aim of the study to examine the changing nature of work in the public sector and to identify changes in commitment over time. They suggest that teachers in the study share the same forms of commitment as those identified in early studies such as Woods, Lortie And Nias, but their commitment is complex and parallel commitments exist. The study is of interest because the research effort gathered data from many (42% of sample), second career teachers within the group, noting their initial commitment coming into the profession. This is noted when Troman (2008, p.631) goes on to propose that:

"it must be remembered that many of the teachers in our current research had recently turned to teaching from other professions. Initial and career change decisions were characterised by a great deal of uncertainty around choices (Duncan 2005) and preferences (Hakim 2000) of career in post-industrial society (Hage and Powers 2000) in terms of portfolio careers, then, we must ask, what kind of commitment were the teachers investing in their previous occupations, and what happened to it?"

The latter is an interesting point: do the second career teachers in the study share the same commitment as their full service colleagues, or are they truly portfolio workers, whose commitment to work is temporary?
When discussing earlier research, Troman notes that some teachers failed to juggle the personal and their professional lives, leading to a crisis of identity, and suggests that the teachers in their study:

“seem more adept and realistic in both recognizing and managing their range of parallel commitments”

(Troman, 2008, p.619)

This appears to be a study of modern teachers in modern times, again hinting at a subtle change in the attitude of teachers to their work and the intensification process, as well as being a recent study, noting the existence of primary second-career teachers.

Choi and Tang (2009) studied the commitment of twenty-three Hong Kong primary and secondary teachers of mixed ages using life history techniques. It investigated the commitment of teachers in the course of their careers using teacher’s self-appraisal through extended interviews. It focussed on the changes initiated by the education reforms of 1997, and their influence on the working lives of teachers in the ten years following the political transition of that year and the reform-intensive environment that followed.

The study acknowledges that teacher commitment is a complex construct, and suggests that it cannot be understood without an awareness of factors such as the teachers’ personal characteristics, organizational factors and the wider social and historical context, Choi and Tang note that school organization is a widely studied category because of its links with teacher retention. They go on to suggest that commitment to students either through links to student learning or subject discipline is a core category of commitment. They suggest that a variety of factors enhance or diminish commitment, often related to the previous categories. They point out that previous research has suggested the interplay of personal, school organizational and education systemic factors, but little has been made of the ways the interactive dynamics play in teachers who experience different levels of commitment. Acknowledging the differing models of age and stage, they classified the informants into three groups: early-career, mid-career, and late-career.
The research effort was concentrated on two research questions:

- what characterized teacher commitment in the period 1997-2007?
- what were the factors contributing to teacher commitment trends in the period?

To resolve these research questions, Choi and Tang comment that:

“Teachers were invited to tell their personal lived experiences, career histories, critical career events and professional development experiences”
(Choi & Tang, 2009, p.769)

As part of the life history technique, teachers were asked to consider their past experiences during interviews of up to ninety minutes duration, and centred on the teacher grading their current and historical commitment level on a grade of 1 to 10.

This was used as a base for discussion and was not used as a means of comparison between teachers. An additional sixty minute interview was carried out with a significant other – partner, colleague, to provide an additional perspective, and some form of triangulation. An additional scrutiny of written sources, such as websites and newsletters was also carried out. The results of the study affirmed previous studies that teachers differ in following more positive or negative career trajectories. They note that that the three stages defined commitment in a similar way, that a committed teacher:

- Gives extra time, thought and effort for students, school and teaching;
- Is willing to seek improvement, to do things to an excellent standard;
- Is engaged wholeheartedly, more than merely to fulfil responsibility;
- Has a vision and strives to do something right for the students.
(Choi & Tang, 2009, p.769)

In their findings, they note that the early year cohort comprises the greatest proportion of teachers with a downward trend, and this echoes the issues of retention in early career teachers noted by Ingersoll. When the factors contributing to raised and lowered
commitment were then investigated, the researchers concluded that unstable working conditions had impeded collegial support for teachers in their early years. It is possible that this lack of collegiality could be detected in studies in England, and may affect all in the early years of teaching, including second career teachers. The attribution of these facts was investigated and it was found that systemic factors were widely cited by all three cohorts, with teachers citing workload and performativity issues. Unfavourable workplace issues were identified as contributing to decreased teacher commitment. Work intensification was cited by teachers in all cohorts, with some referring to ‘long working hours on non-teaching duties that stop them spending more time with students’. The research also noted the effect of personal health issues on declining commitment. The authors note:

“The interplay of personal, workplace and education systemic factors worked among the decreased commitment group in a different way. Education and workplace systemic factors exercised much more force on teachers of this group than on their positive counterparts.”

(Choi and Tang, 2009, p.775)

Some factors contributed to sustained and increased commitment, with some middle cohort teachers citing educational reform as a positive force, as providing an opportunity for development. Teachers in the early and middle cohort reported workplace factors as a factor that enhanced commitment. Choi and Tang recognize multiple factors influencing the trends of teacher commitment. They note that:

“This study shows that amongst the teachers from different cohorts who displayed a positive commitment trend ‘love for students’ plays a crucial role in counteracting the adverse influence of external factors.”

(Choi & Tang, 2009, p.775-776)

They propose that this becomes a ‘rich personal resource’ together with a sense of personal fulfilment from teaching that builds over the years, that proofs them against a turbulent educational environment. They note that the study echoes previous findings that the student provides a strong sense of commitment to the profession.
Commitment has been shown to be vital to good teaching and is associated with efficacy and retention. It is dynamic, variable and affected by the age and career stage of the teacher. It can be defined in different ways, and can be highly personal. Some teachers characterize it as passion for teaching, student needs, and engagement with the school community, maintaining professional knowledge and importantly at a time of work intensification, the investment of extra time. Some research has proposed that second career teachers may arrive with high commitment but they may have more complex commitments than their traditionally trained colleagues.

2.14 A summary of key issues
The key issues that emerge from current research literature are:

- The process of intensification has been identified, and defined; (Larson, 1980; Apple, 1986; Densmore, 1987; Hargreaves, 1991)
- Intensification has led to changes in the working conditions of teachers and has led to turbulent working environment in that it can challenge existing working practices, result in increased workload and pay little attention to teachers lives and identities; (Woods, 1994)
- It may be mediated (Ballet et al. 2006) and can have positive effects (Woods, 1994)
- For a range of complex reasons, including intensification of work and consequent attrition, increasing numbers of second career teachers have been attracted to the profession:
- Research suggests that previous work and life experiences have a profound effect on second career teachers (Etherington, 2009)
- Early research into second career teachers was based on their attraction to teaching and much was cross phase and based in the U.S. (Crow, Levine, Nager 1990; Novak & Knowles, 1992; Serow 1993; Freidus, 1994; Lee & Lamport, 2011). There are few studies of primary school teachers.
- Research into commitment show that it is vital to good teaching and retention (Day et al., 2007);
- Research into the career stages of teachers has shown that increasing age and stage can have a downward effect on commitment levels; (Sikes, 1986; Huberman 1989; Hargreaves, 1994; Day et al. 2007)
• Research into commitment has shown that it is dynamic, and affected by the personal, life spheres and by working conditions (Day 2000; Croswell & Elliot, 2004; Choi and Tang, 2009);
• There is little research on the commitment levels of Second Career Teachers, either incidentally or specifically.

2.15 Emerging model

As identified in the previous section, the process of change that is underway in English primary schools has led to increasing Intensification and increased teacher turnover. Alternative Certification Programmes (ACPs) have encouraged second career teachers, and the models proposed earlier suggest that they have initial high commitment, but this may be dynamic, even fragile, and subject to influence from their working conditions and their personal lives. Some research posits that second career teachers have parallel commitments and are more adept at managing a changing school environment, suggesting that they may be a different to their colleagues, a form of portfolio worker. As they age, do they remain early stage teachers and retain commitment, or share the frailties of chronology and suffer from falling levels of commitment. Lowered commitment can be a predictor to attrition, and as such, perhaps, the survivability and to some extent, the performance of an increasingly large group of teachers. It is the aim of this study to examine the commitment of second career teachers.

2.16 Research Questions

Many previous studies have been carried out with second career teachers from both the primary and secondary phases of education. There are few studies of primary phase second career teachers, and very few exploring their commitment. This study will add to the knowledge of second career teachers by examining the commitment of primary second career teachers. Now that the direction of research has been established, the research questions will be outlined. The first question centres locating and identifying serving second career teachers, as much previous work has been centred on training establishments. It is aimed to build up a picture of second career teachers working in primary schools by examining their background, seen by the literature as important in
the way it assists to construct their identity as a teacher. The second question will focus on defining commitment, as seen by second career teachers. This is important as commitment has been seen by previous research to be a personal construct and is individual in nature. As commitment is a personal construct it will explore the personal dimension of the study. The third question will centre on the factors affecting commitment in both a positive and negative sense. This will aim to build up a picture of commitment and the effects of Intensification, and if a previous career and life experience has given some protection against it. As it examines factors that lower and build commitment, it will also explore the level of commitment and if this has changed over time. The study will now be encapsulated in three research questions:

1. **Who are the Second Career Teachers?**
   This question explores the identity of the second career teachers in the study, aspects of their biography, and enquires about their work history. It also explores the change event that led to them becoming a teacher, and forms a base for the next two questions.

2. **What are the factors affecting their commitment?**
   This question aims to explore the factors relating to the work environment, such as school culture, organization, and working relationships, as well as issues relating to work–life balance and the teachers’ life. Negative and positive attributions will be explored, as well as any possible links to intensification. It also will provide background as to initial commitment and career change event itself, as well as an opportunity to explore the time frame of the second career teacher, linked to the concept that commitment may vary over time, and may be linked to age or stage. This question explores the time sphere of the study.

3. **How do second career teachers define teacher commitment?**
   This question aims to explore the ways that teachers conceptualise teacher commitment, and what relationship this has with their identity, and previous careers. It explores the personal sphere of the study.
Conclusion

This second chapter started with an examination of the research background to the concept and some of its features. The intensification thesis was outlined, and the effects of intensification on the working conditions of teachers were explored. The chapter then went on to tell of the rise of the second career teacher, in response to concerns about teacher recruitment because of the attrition process. It then outlined the research on the subject of second career teachers and how previous career and factors such as life history and gender can affect career choice and teacher identity and practice. It explored the difficulties of the second career teacher and how claims were made to their commitment. It outlined how much research is US-based, and the deficit in research on their commitment, especially after their early years of teaching. It highlighted how increased age can affect commitment and how the various models play out with teacher’s age and their stage of their career. The fact that teacher commitment is vital to good teaching and retention was examined, and how it is often a personal construct and affected by a variety of factors.

The key issues in the study were then summarized and an emerging model was defined. This was discussed and encapsulated in three research questions. In the next chapter, the study will go on to discuss and explore the most effective methods to answer the research questions.
Chapter Three- The Methods of Research

Introduction

The previous chapter reviewed the literature around the subjects of intensification, second career teachers, as well as the associated field of the commitment of teachers. It encapsulated the research problem as being the commitment of second career teachers. It concluded by developing a series of research questions.

This chapter will build on the previous chapter by discussing the methodologies available to resolve the research questions. It will outline the methodological background of previous research in this field and discuss how the design evolved. It will discuss the various iterations of the study and some early issues, and how the study was re-designed to resolve these issues. It will outline the final form and examine other aspects such as the ethical considerations of the study.

3.1 The Direction of Research

It is not the aim of this section of the study to debate at length or in depth the strengths and weaknesses of the various research paradigms that could be used to explore the research questions proposed in earlier chapters. All research techniques have their advantages. The strength of quantitative approaches is that they can provide outline information and explanations about phenomena in numerical form. Measuring human experiences and lives though, can be extremely difficult, and there is a danger that the complexities involved in life at work may be missed. Qualitative approaches offer description and a way to deeper understanding of socio-structural relations. The examination of previous research methodologies in the next section will give some indications of how differing research methods have been used in past research.

3.2 The Methods of Previous Research

Studies of the work life of teachers have used a wide range of methods ranging from large surveys using statistical analysis to small scale life history techniques. These have encompassed a range of research paradigms. In the ethnographic tradition, Dan Lortie (1975) in ‘Schoolteacher’ examined the working lives of teachers in a pioneering qualitative sociological study. Other early work such as Nias (1981), (1984) used interviews and observations in a longitudinal study of the working lives of primary
school teachers. Such methods closely examine working lives and are indicative of the sphere of working life research. Bertaux, conducting working life research on artisanal bakers notes that:

“A single life story stands alone, and it would be hazardous to generalize on the grounds of that one alone as a second life story could immediately contradict those premature generalizations. But several life stories taken from the same set of socio-structural relations support each other and make up, all together, a strong body of evidence”

(Bertaux, 1981, p187)

Bertaux indicates the strength of using life histories with homogenous groups. Examining the complex social sphere of teachers’ working lives Goodson & Sikes (2001) stress the need for any study to examine life history and career in depth, and goes on to propose that “life histories exist in an ambiguous, intersecting location between the personal and the professional (Goodson & Hargreaves 1996;Goodson 2001)” (Goodson & Sikes, 2001, p61). When talking of teachers, Sikes (1999) suggests that research is needed about the sort of people that teachers are, reflecting the personal, and the work that they do, reflecting the professional. Life history approaches are well suited to the study of teachers as they have the ability to examine their lives, how they see themselves, and the work that they do, and will be returned to later in this chapter.

The starting point of this study, the intensification thesis was established by Apple (1986), developed by Hargreaves (1992), confirmed by Easthope & Easthope (2000) and modified by Ballet, Kelchtermans, Loughran (2006) all through interviews with teachers. There is a long tradition of qualitative enquiry to research the nature of the work of the teacher.

A large number of studies of teachers’ working lives have used qualitative techniques: Choi & Fan Tang (2009); Day, Elliot & Kington,( 2005); Day, & Gu, (2008);, (2004); Day et al, (2007). Elliot & Croswell (2002); Gu and Day (2013);Nias (1981); Troman and Raggl, (2007); Troman (2008); Woods, (1992), but this is not exclusive as some, notably Dibbon (2004) have also examined areas such as teacher workload using large-scale surveys using quantitative techniques, although even this large scale study used interviews to recount the realities of time demands made on teachers.

Studies of second career teachers are often small in scale and have used detailed qualitative techniques to examine the nuances of teachers’ motivations and change
decisions. As mentioned previously in previous chapters, they typically qualitative and small in scale, often involving teachers in training, or in their very early years of teaching. Studies such as Bullough & Knowles (1990) used six first-year teachers, Etherington, (2009) ten student teachers, Etherington (2011) six mature graduates, Powers (2002) seven trainees. Locating participants for this area of research is made easier by the fact that they are in training and not working as teachers, and dispersed in schools, where locating participants may be more problematic. Research in this area is not exclusively ethnographic or small scale, as larger surveys such as Chong & Goh (2007) used a mixed methods approach with questionnaire techniques on 197 student teachers.

Studies in the research field of teacher commitment show a wider methodological breadth. Some studies have used survey data that was collected for other purposes, for example Huber (1999) and the U.S. Teacher Professionalization and Commitment Survey (NCES,1997) which used hierarchical modelling to derive data from the School Staff Survey (SASS). Other research has attempted to use surveys or questionnaires to measure the commitment of teachers, such as Tsui and Cheng (1999). One difficulty with surveys is that they are often produced in isolation from teachers, and do not reflect the reality of their working lives, or the complex social reality in schools. There are often basic responses available, and no possibility of feedback or clarification between the researcher and teacher. They do have the strength of providing outline data in large surveys, and can be used as a signposting device for further research effort, as well as providing triangulation for other areas of study.

The concept of commitment has been studied since 1960s with much educational research into this area taking place in the 1980s. This tended to employ psychological approaches linked to management studies, exploring the employees’ identification with organization where they worked. Adapted to teaching, the research hypothesized that a committed teacher would share the values of the school as an organization, and would demonstrate a psychological need to remain working there. They explore the interaction of teacher commitment to organizational health and often involve multi-level statistical variables. The work of Mowday, Porter & Steers, (1982), led to the development of the Organizational Commitment Questionnaire (OCQ) which attempts to measure the commitment of an individual to their organization. This has been developed and used by others to examine teacher commitment. A criticism of the psychological approach is that it pays little attention to the often powerful social forces at play on the teachers’ internal influences (Choi, & Fan Tang ,1999), and lacks the sophistication to deal with the many commitments at play, and may not reflect the
realities of a dynamic and changing working life. Later research into commitment has acknowledged this complexity by transferring the focus on the teacher rather than the organization. The working lives of teachers were accumulated into the study of their career, revealing the link between career phase, or the age of the teacher and commitment. Day, Elliot, & Kington (2005), Day et al, (2007), Huberman (1997) as well as other attributes of the teacher.

As discussed in the previous chapter, the VITAE study is portrayed by Day, et al. (2006),(2007) as mixed-methods, combining both qualitative and quantitative techniques. Teacher case studies were the central focus of the research effort. These were constructed using interviews, teacher and pupil questionnaires and school and pupil assessment data. They outline the techniques used in the VITAE research, reporting that:

“The main qualitative data collected were from semi-structured face to-face interviews (supplemented at various stages of the research by document analysis) and interviews with leaders, group of students and others. The data were collected and analysed in an iterative and evolving process consistent with the use of grounded theory methods.”

(Day et al. 2006, p. ix)

Quantitative data on school and individual teacher performance, together with pupil and teacher questionnaires made up another element of the research. Multi-methodological research such as that recounted by Day, et al. offer a number of advantages in that they have the ability to provide rich data on complex topics, and they have the flexibility to probe, and clarify data and the flexibility for the participants to provide responses that reflect their ideas (Burns, 2000). The research combined qualitative and quantitative methods in what they defined as a synergistic approach to provide a best-fit methodology, using appropriate techniques for each individual research task. At this point, it will be useful to discuss the nature of mixed methods research.

In essence the concept of mixed methods research embraces both research paradigms, the quantitative and the qualitative. One difficulty with this is that each of the two methods is based on set of assumptions that deal with reality, its ontology, and the knowledge gained from that reality, its epistemology. (Guba,1990). Quantitative methods are based on positivism, and the ontological position is that there is one
objective truth. In epistemological terms, the researcher and the researched are different entities, with the researcher having no influence on the outcome. Its aims are to measure the relationships between variables (Denzin and Lincoln, 1994). Qualitative approaches however, are based on constructivism (Guba and Lincoln, 1994). In ontological terms, the approach suggests multiple realities that may constantly change. Epistemologically, there is no access to a universal truth, and the researcher and researched are intertwined within the context of the research (Guba and Lincoln, 1994). Samples are often small, and unlike the quantitative approach, are not meant to be representative, but provide information. Combining the two paradigms within a research effort is termed mixed methods. Carey (1993), suggests that quantitative and qualitative techniques are merely tools and that by combining them we can answer questions of substantial importance. Others take a pragmatic approach, Sale, Lofeld and Brazil (2002) suggest that:

“Researchers should not be preoccupied with the quantitative-qualitative debate because it will not be resolved in the near future, and that epistemological purity does not get research done”
Sale, Lofeld, Brasil (2002) P46

Johnson, Onwuegbuzie and Turner (2007) suggest that mixed methods research is becoming increasingly attached to research practice. Some see it as a new method in itself, labelled “the third research community” by Teddie and Tashakorri, (2009, P4) whilst others see as it combining the strengths of other approaches:

“The goal of mixed methods research is not to replace either of these approaches but rather to draw from the strengths and minimize the weaknesses of both in single research studies and across studies.


They go on to make the point that although there are many paradigmatic differences between qualitative and quantitative approaches, there are some similarities. For example, both use empirical observations to answer research questions. Both use data and construct explanations from that data and speculate about the outcomes. They further suggest that pluralism in methodology and epistemology should be encouraged.
The idea of the third paradigm is further developed by Denscombe (2008) p.280, who claims that the mixed methods approach:

“can be seen as offering a third paradigm for social research through the way it combines quantitative and qualitative methodologies on the basis of pragmatism and a practice-driven need to mix methods. As such, it is framed by a whole variety of practical issues and demands (rather than being guided by some overarching philosophy) and, almost inevitably, this means that the manner in which the elements of quantitative and qualitative methodologies get combined is liable to be fragmented and inconsistent.”

That is not to suggest that mixed methods research is without issues. There are wide variations in its definition and scope, with Denscombe (2011) and Johnson Onweuegbuzie and Turner (2007) suggesting a variety of definitions, with the latter proposing nineteen, culled from a variety of researchers. Denscombe (2008) p280 suggests:

“Such variations and inconsistencies, it has been argued, should not be regarded as alien to the concept of paradigm nor in some sense a unique ‘weakness’ of the Mixed Methods paradigm”

However, others, such as Brazil et al propose that quantitative and qualitative methods cannot be combined effectively within mixed methods research and for triangulation or cross-validation as they do not study the same phenomena. They go on to propose that they can be combined for complementary purposes. Creswell (2011, p.8) proposes that a series of research problems are suitable for uses for Mixed Methods research including:

- where one source of data may be insufficient
- where results need to be explained
- further, exploratory findings need to be generalized,
- a theoretical stance needs to be employed
- An overall research objective can be best addressed with multiple phases, or projects.
- a second method is needed to enhance a primary method

The latter research problem is relevant to this study, where a second method is needed to enhance a primary method. There are three research questions, with the first being
related to the population, distribution and biography of second career teachers, leading towards a more quantitative based line of enquiry. The second and third research questions lend themselves to a more qualitative enquiry, linked to the nature of their working lives, their careers as teachers and commitment. These questions require a method that can explore the nuances of their extended working lives before teaching, as well as being able to deal with complex issues dealing with their current careers.

It is the view of this study that both qualitative and quantitative approaches have their strengths and that the three research questions developed in the previous chapter are most suitable answered by a mixed methods approach.

One of the strengths of mixed method research is designing a study to provide triangulation, to strengthen and confirm findings. Using a range of methods to confirm findings can strengthen research, and when speaking of interview techniques, Woods (1986) suggests that they are stronger as a research tool where used in conjunction with other methods, and Cohen et al. (2000) propose that the use of such techniques allows a convergence between independent measures. Gu and Day (2013) depict the VITAE mixed methods research as being positioned in the phenomenological research tradition, with longitudinal data from the 300 teachers in interviews providing rich descriptions about the teachers’ working lives, backed up by performance data about teacher effectiveness, document analysis and interviews with pupils and managers. These methods can be useful as they can draw attention to individual situations, and echoing the work of Bertaux and others that use life history, the levels of inference can rise if factors recur with many participants. Phenomenological methods are based in the areas of personal knowledge and subjectivity, and can be effective at highlighting the experiences of participants from their own perspectives.

The area of teachers’ working lives and their commitment demonstrates a range of qualitative and quantitative and mixed method techniques. The use of mixed methods research seems to offer distinct advantages in that it can use a combination of research techniques needed to gather information about teachers working lives.
3.3 Starting to Design the Study

The original area of interest was to explore the nature of second career teachers working lives, an interest stimulated by an awareness of teacher intensification. As the study developed, the focus tightened to examining their commitment to their new career, which could highlight other issues. Initial thoughts were of a qualitative working life enquiry. What became clear was that a research design was needed to respond to the first research question, which enquired about the nature and biography of the second career teacher. As this was a study of primary school teachers it was also possible that they could be distributed across a large number of smaller schools. The design of the study must be robust enough to locate them. The research carried out by Troman (2007) indicated that over a third of the randomly selected teachers in the study were second career teachers, and so any design must also be robust enough to deal with what may be potentially large numbers. As previous research into second career teachers has shown, they have a wide range of life experiences and working lives. Because they have such differing experiences, any study must attempt to locate as many of them as possible, to ensure the breadth of their experiences can be related. The distribution and population of the teachers, with analysis of relationship between age, length and type of previous career and length of teaching service could also yield useful data. Any design would also need to explore complex aspects of their previous employment, commitment and their working lives, as well as details about their commitment. An approach was needed that could span the interpretative- qualitative and the positivist- quantitative paradigms. A mixed methods design seemed to offer this approach.

3.3a Early Designs

The first design was developed in two phases. The first phase was a quantitative-based survey of teachers, with a limited questionnaire asking biographical details of the homogeneous group of second career teachers. This would also use questions on career and commitment in the form of open ended questions. Replies would be used to select interview participants for the second phase. This would take the form of extended qualitative interviews about their previous careers and allow rich data to be collected about their working lives.

One key issue in the early days of the study was locating second career teachers, and a variety of means had been discussed and later rejected because of methodological or practical issues. These had included methods such as school visits to develop a snowball
technique, advertising in the Times Educational Supplement and developing a websites or bulletin boards to attract participants. Previous research into second career teachers has been located in individual school districts or in training establishments, so it was decided to broaden the enquiry to local authority level to locate second career teachers. This would give hopefully give access to the schools within the local authority area and a means of communicating with them.

3.3b Pilot Study

The practical work of the study commenced by building up contacts with a local school. This had a population of second career teachers, who were willing to be involved in piloting the research. This group was used to test the various versions of the survey, and an example of pilot work is shown in Appendix A1.

Early feedback from the teachers in the pilot school indicated that the questionnaire should be simplified and contains less open-ended questions. This arose from comments about intrusion into school and the design of the questionnaire to be less demanding of the time of teachers. Later, pilot research interviews were also carried with some of the teachers so that interview and recording techniques could be refined.

3.3c The Design of the Study

Following the development of the research questions it was decided to use survey and interview approaches in a mixed method design. This two phase approach would take the form of an initial survey distributed by email, and follow-up interviews with a smaller sample. The questionnaire was developed along five themes. These are shown overleaf in Diagram 3.1.
Diagram 3.1 Question Themes

As can be seen from the diagram above, the five themes represent discrete areas and these were dealt with in a slightly different way. Some elements were simple responses, such as basic biographical details to elicit details of age, initial and teaching career. Others were simple written responses, such as personal definition of commitment. Factors that can affect commitment and broad definitions of commitment were dealt with by the development of questions generated by interviews with the teachers in the pilot school. This developed into a questionnaire that was broadly based on the techniques used by Day et al (2007) in the VITAE study. The VITAE questionnaire had elements investigating the participant’s attraction to teaching, commitment, and what factors affected their effectiveness as teachers.

These sections went through several changes and were developed to balance speed of completion and coverage. Commitment to teaching was examined using a range of questions based on the work of Mowday, Porter & Steers, (1979, 1982), on organizational health and commitment. As discussed in Chapter Two, the Organizational Commitment Questionnaire (OCQ) was developed to define commitment to an organization. It is widely used to examine commitment and attachment to an organization. Mowday et al. (1979) define organizational commitment as sharing the values and goals of the organization, exerting extra effort, and desiring to remain with the organization. Mowday et al define commitment as an individual’s attitude to an organization. The OCQ is composed of three aspects; the acceptance of the goals and values of an organization, a desire to remain in that organization, and
willingness to exert extra effort on behalf of the organization. Tyree (1996) makes the criticism of the OCQ in that commitment is often described as multi-dimensional and yet some measures including the OCQ attempt to measure it unidimensionally. In an attempt to deal with this issue, elements of the OCQ were examined and new measures were synthesized to combine breadth and coverage of the research question. The synthesized questions were trialed with the teachers in the pilot school and went through various changes to check coverage and suitability. As an example, item six of the OCQ “I am proud to tell others that I am part of this organization” was directly translated into item five “I feel a great deal of loyalty to the teaching profession”. Other items were synthesized from pilot responses and were intended to cover the various dimensions of commitment.

The final version aimed for balance between depth of detail in responses, and ease of completion as initially it was hoped to email the questionnaires to teachers to be completed independently. Another function of the completed questionnaire was to confirm the response from surveys carried out later in the study.

The final questions are shown below in Diagram 3.2, under their research question headings:

Diagram 3.2 - Research Questions and Survey Questions

RQ1 – Who are the second Career Teachers?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RQ1 - Biographical Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How many years have you been teaching?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What was your previous career? (this may include parenting)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What prompted your decision to change careers and become a teacher?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What attracted you to teaching?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**RQ 2 – What Affects their Commitment?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RQ – 2 What affects your Commitment?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3) I find that my profession helps me maintain my commitment to teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) I find that my work colleagues help maintain my commitment to teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8) I find that government policy helps me maintain my commitment to teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11) I find that my family help maintain my commitment to teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16) I feel that my previous work experience helps me maintain my commitment to teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18) I find that my school (as an organization) helps me maintain my commitment to teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20) I find that working with children helps me maintain my commitment to teaching</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**RQ 3 How do They Define Commitment?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RQ3 Defining Commitment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) A committed teacher keeps up to date with training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) A committed teacher puts in long hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) A committed teacher sometimes has to let down their family or life partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9) A committed teacher maintains a work – life balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12) A committed teacher maintains good relationships with colleagues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14) A committed teacher has a good relationship with their students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15) A committed teacher achieves good scores and grades in tests</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Commitment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Commitment</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13) I am proud to tell people that I am a teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17) I can see myself being a teacher for the rest of my working life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10) I can see myself looking to change career soon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) I feel that my personal values and that of the teaching profession are similar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) I feel a great deal of loyalty to the teaching profession</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21) Becoming a teacher was a good decision on my part</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19) My commitment level is falling static rising</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.3d Field Work

The field work of the study was in two phases. The first would use the email questionnaire and also locate participants for the second phase of the study, where teachers were interviewed and hopefully rich data obtained about their working lives and to explore their change event and commitment in some detail.

At the start of the survey, the numbers of second career teachers were unknown, and although the study by Day et al (2007) had located a small proportion of these teachers in research, and previous studies has shown the numbers to be growing, any design had to be flexible enough to cope with large numbers. A quarter of the teachers in the pilot school were second career teachers, and such clusters could possibly mean large numbers in a wider population. Data from the Department for Education has shown that an increasing number of late-entrants had entered teaching, but there was no information about their distribution or survivability either nationally or locally. Any research design had to be robust enough to cope with potentially large numbers.

It was decided to use one local authority as a field for data collection, and several local authorities in Northern England were contacted to assist with the study. Several agreed to become involved, but there were substantial differences between some, as one had a very high proportion of inner city schools, and one was a large predominantly rural education authority. Selection was done with an awareness of external validity, that each area was unique in some small way, and unlikely to be representative of the teacher population of England. One unitary authority was selected, as it had a wide mixture of
schools in a range of socio-economic contexts, although the initial choice was not straightforward, and did affect the outcome of the study, as will be shown later in the next chapter. Discussions with the local authority commenced about gaining access to the primary schools in the area and the email system. After consultations with a schools inspector, an email outlining the research and asking for participants was sent to all head teachers via the internal email system.

Gaining access to the teachers in the study was identified as an early issue, and the role of head teachers as gatekeepers in school based research is acknowledged as an issue in this study, as in others. Head teachers would be needed to gain access to participants. Hammersley and Atkinson (1995) comment:

“Gatekeepers will generally and understandably, be concerned as to the picture of the organization or community that the ethnographer will paint, and they have practical interests in seeing themselves and their colleagues presented in a favourable light”

(Hammersley and Atkinson, 1995 p56)

The initial approach agreed with the local school inspector was that the emails would allow a questionnaire to be sent to second career teachers and this would be used to develop a base for an opportunity interview sample, as shown in diagram 3.3 below.
The initial email briefly outlined the study, and enquired how many second career teachers were working in the school. This was designed to obtain contacts for a later email questionnaire and follow-up interviews.

Out of forty-four schools, there were three responses.

These responses all reported that there were a number of second career teachers in the school who would be interested in taking part in the research, and these ‘email schools’ later became the backbone of the interview effort. These schools, labeled the email schools, were contacted and the process of building up a relationship with the teachers took place. This started initially with a meeting with the head teacher, and later with a short session typically conducted in a staff meeting, where the study was outlined and teachers were asked for their participation. They were informed about the process of anonymising their responses and how this was a study into their working lives as second career teachers and not into their effectiveness or performance. Attempts were made to put the teachers at ease and later in the study interview sites were chosen by the teacher. Background notes about school context and personal observations were recorded in a research log, which also recorded some information from interview sessions.

3.3e The Final Form of the Study

The low response of the email enquiry challenged the quantitative strand of the study. The number of returns may have been a reflection on the lack of access to schools via electronic media, as access to head teachers and teachers is through administrative staff, who may not have understood its aims. It may also be a reflection on the ease of rejection of email surveys in a busy school environment. As biographical information and population data was still needed, it was decided to re-focus the questionnaire along more traditional lines, as a postal survey. The follow-up questionnaire developed for emailing to schools was edited down to two printed pages, and slightly modified for readability. This is shown in Appendix A3. The re-designed study is shown below in Diagram 3.4 overleaf.
This postal survey was sent to every primary school in the local authority area. Although postal surveys have some issues of validity (Belson, 1986) centering on the accuracy of responses, and the distribution of non-returns, it was felt that they were sufficiently effective in these circumstances and fitted the purpose of the study. The postal survey was designed with an awareness of the work of Hoinville and Jowell (1978) on postal survey design. With this in mind, a school pack containing a covering letter, ten survey questionnaires, and a stamped addressed return envelope, together with a covering letter to the head teacher, shown in Appendix A2, was dispatched the forty-four primary schools in the local authority. The envelopes were coded to allow tracking of responses.

Awareness of gatekeeper issues led to the covering letter outlining the research to stress the anonymity of the school and its location, and the desire to obtain a true picture of the working lives of teachers. The covering letter went into more detail than the original email. It is shown in the Appendix as item A3. Head teachers were asked to place the school pack, with its stamped addressed large envelope in the staff room, together with the questionnaire forms and covering letter. The questionnaires contained an email address where a copy of the questionnaire could be obtained and returned, as well as a
mailing address where a completed survey could be mailed by an individual teacher if they required. This was hoped to balance an acknowledged weakness of the school pack, that of the privacy of completed responses, and it should be noted that one teacher returned the questionnaire by private means.

The response to this posted school pack was more encouraging, with responses obtained from eleven teachers distributed in seven schools across the authority, all being completed in detail. The questionnaire was also completed during early visits into the three schools located in the email survey by thirteen teachers, and so the final response to the survey was from twenty four teachers distributed across ten schools. Head teachers were also asked to make a nil return by sending the pack back in its stamped addressed envelope if there were no second career teachers in their school. Six schools responded, all received with a compliments slip showing that there were no second career teachers in the school.

The response rate from the postal survey was higher than the email survey, but still moderately low. There were now combined responses from sixteen schools out of the forty-four, just over a quarter of primary schools in the local authority area. The response rate is shown below in Diagram 3.5

**Diagram 3.5 Survey Response from Schools**

![Survey Response from Schools](image)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>‘Email ’ survey Schools</td>
<td>3 schools</td>
<td>Mail shot sent to these schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Postal ’ survey Schools</td>
<td>7 schools</td>
<td>Responses received by mail</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘No Second Career Teachers’</td>
<td>6 schools</td>
<td>Confirmation of ‘no second career teachers’ by return slip</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Response from Mail – shot</td>
<td>28 schools</td>
<td>No returns from this group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Local Authority Primary</strong></td>
<td><strong>44 schools</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>44 schools</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the school responses shown in Diagram 3.5 (above) There were twenty-three completed teacher questionnaires, thirteen from the three schools initially contacted by e-mail, and ten from the postal survey school pack. Only one of the ten teachers in the postal survey volunteered for the second, follow-up interview phase. After an initial interview, this teacher was seconded from her post in the school, and took no further part in the process. This low response rate could have been because of the anonymity of the postal survey, or the timing of any follow up interviews which would have taken place during a busy time at the end of the summer term.

Analysis commenced after a period of several weeks, when it seemed clear that no further questionnaires or school packs were being returned, after some follow-up telephone calls. It was originally thought that the second career teachers may be present in larger numbers, and this seemed to be confirmed by the three schools with clusters revealed in the email survey. The responses from the twenty-three questionnaires, although low, seemed a large enough sample for basic analysis.

Further meetings with the teachers at the three schools that responded to the email survey confirmed that most would be willing to be interviewed, and eventually a snowball effect took place where all the teachers in the three schools agreed. This led to a larger number of interviews, but this had the advantages of increasing the amount of data collected and was achievable by the study.

The interview phase comprised of a series of extended follow-up interviews with the thirteen teachers, some of which were over an hour long. As well as providing confirmation and triangulation of questionnaire responses the interview phase added a great amount of detail about the working life of the teacher. This added thick description (Geertz 1973) as details of initial careers were explored. This detail was needed to discover the nuances of what for many was a long and detailed working life. The
interviews explored similar themes to the survey. Responses to questions were often extended and provided background detail, as can be seen from the interview transcript on page 200. In most cases, the teachers had been present at an introductory staff meeting when the broad aims and detail of the study were introduced and any concerns addressed. A return meeting was used to distribute, and later collect completed questionnaires. This time was again used to build relationships with the participants, so that when the first interviews took place the relationship between participants and researcher was already building. The first part of the interview dealt with biography and previous career. This was used as a warm up period for to allow the participant – researcher relationship to develop. The themes used as initial prompts in interviews are shown in Diagram 3.6 below:

**Diagram 3.6 Interview – Initial Prompts**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interview Prompts -</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Biographical details, including length of service and schools worked</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Details of career before teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reason for leaving your previous career</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What attracted you to teaching?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How would you personally define commitment?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What factors maintain your commitment?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What factors lower your commitment?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is the level of your commitment? Is it rising, static or falling?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The prompts shown above were used as a road map for interviews; with awareness that at times there may be a need to go off-course to discuss working lives and the impact of change on the personal lives of teachers. The details of the career section were often detailed and lengthy as many teachers had complex employment histories. It took over a year to conduct this phase, as interviews had to accommodate the work patterns and timings of school life, as well as fitting in to the busy working lives of the teachers. The interviews always took place at a location of the participant’s choosing, to allow a more relaxed environment, and it was stressed that the participant could take as much time as they wanted, with awareness that the interview process is not always an easy one in a busy school or after a busy working day. Pauses and active listening were employed to assist the participant, and verbal encouragement was used when needed. In some cases
themes were explored in detail, and a series of questions had to be asked as themes were explored to clarify responses.

The structure of the field work is shown below in Diagram 3.7. Interviews were recorded using a digital Mp3 audio recorder, using a noise cancelling microphone. The Mp3 audio files were transcribed verbatim.

![Diagram 3.7 Field Work Structure](image)

### 3.4 Summary of methods of analysis

This section will examine analysis of the questionnaire survey and then the analysis of the interview phase.

As indicated previously, the questionnaire provided a range of biographical data concerning the second career teachers. This allowed details such as age, gender, length of service, and limited information about previous career to be analysed and their relationship explored. This data was important as it has been shown in the previous chapter, commitment could be linked to the age of the teacher in a conventional age-related commitment model (Sikes 1986) or could be related to career length in a phase-related model (Day et al, 2007). Commitment of second career teachers may also be linked to previous career or a range of other variables including attraction to teaching.

The open ended questions of career-change decision and initial attraction to teaching were recorded and grouped. The attractions to teaching were later compared and contrasted to the model proposed by Day et al (2007) in the VITAE research. The Likert scale responses were recorded and tabulated. The relationship between data was
examined for any correlation between variables. The original intention was to use software such as SPSS, but with the low response rate, and with the need to verify the interview results, it was decided to use an analysis spreadsheet for questionnaire data. This listed responses in tabular form and allowed linking to interview responses using notes. An admitted challenge to the quantitative element of the study is the low response rate often related to postal surveys and limited conclusions may be drawn from such a low statistical sample. However, the quantitative section of the study does assist in confirming the results of interview data.

The analysis of data from Interviews was a lengthier and more complex process. This followed a simplified version of qualitative data analysis (Creswell, 2009, p185). Digital Mp3 recordings were initially listened to and transcribed. Initial analysis was by repeated listening, and then by repeated reading of the transcript. Codes and emerging themes were then developed as the material was organized into segments. The segments were then labeled. Word analysis took place using software to examine the transcripts for repeated words or phrases. Creswell (2009) p.187 notes that “the traditional approach in social sciences is to allow the codes to emerge during the data analysis”, it can be sometimes helpful to employ predefined codes “that address a larger theoretical perspective in the research” There were some predefined codes relating to factors that affect commitment that were used to analyse transcripts. Data was re-examined to explore emerging themes. Creswell (2009) p177 suggests that “qualitative research is interpretative research”, and it is acknowledged that interpretation of data was done by one researcher, but in a repeated and systematic way. The process of connection was made towards the end of the analysis phase. An example of a coded interview sheet is shown in the Appendix. The coding procedure in this study used both predefined and emerging categories that continued as analysis took place. After the formation of codes, then emerging themes were tested and re-tested as labels within the body of the interview. Transcripts were then compared with questionnaires and with the notes and observations recorded during interviews.

The study was aware of the work of Silverman (2000) on the theme of reliability, and that of Hammersley (1992) who suggested that reliability is the consistency with which instances are described by the observer. Consistent categorization was ensured by repeated focusing and by exploring and testing themes from the data.

As related previously in this chapter, mixed methods research aims to combine the strengths of both qualitative and quantitative methods. This is not without problems and
some challenges to validity and reliability. It is important to design a study so that both forms of research are used to best advantage and compensate for any weaknesses. As both paradigms differ, issues relating to the reliability and validity of the two methods are also different.

Quantitative research techniques are often used to test hypotheses and also examine the causal relationships between variables (Denzin and Lincoln, 1998). The quantitative researcher attempts to delineate or measure the world around them. Joppe (2000, p.1) makes the point that:

> Validity determines whether the research truly measures that which it was intended to measure or how truthful the research results are. In other words, does the research instrument allow you to hit the “bull’s eye of your research object.”

Validity describes how effectively the design method measures the area under investigation. Quantitative research then, aims for internal validity, where research design is effective, and a valid conclusion may be drawn. Threats to internal validity can be a faulty research design and researcher bias.

However, qualitative research aims for contextual validity that aims to capture the authenticity of the lived lives of the participants and searches for credibility and a convincing text. In other words, “did we indeed capture the phenomenon or attribute that we intended to (or we believe we captured)” (Tashakkori and Teddlie, 2003, p. 694)

In terms of external validity, or generalizability, quantitative research hopes to draw general conclusions on the basis of the data collected. Threats can include population issues, where a sample may not be representative of a larger population, or issues with time validity where results may be fixed in time and cannot be generalized. Qualitative research instead aims for transferability, where results can be translated to another context, with an example being the work conducted by Day et al (2007) in the VITAE research, examining the influences of commitment of the teachers in the study. Transferability means that the findings may be applicable to other members of the teaching profession.

In terms of reliability the quantitative researcher aims to exclude issues such as random errors for example with problems due to questionnaire design. In qualitative research reliability is related to consistency, where similarly-designed research produces the same findings. Tashakkori and Teddlie, (2003,p. 694) when discussing this concept
suggest that researcher should ask the question “Did we accurately capture/represent the phenomenon or attribute under investigation?”

Onwuegbuzie and Johnson (2006) propose that difficulties in mixed methods research differ from their quantitative and qualitative antecedents, and propose new terms to describe issues of validity and reliability. They also suggest that the merging of the paradigms can cause additional problems. These are identified in three broad areas. The first is the problem of representation, where difficulties exist in capturing the lived experience of the researched. The problem of legitimation, in essence that of validity, centres on obtaining findings that are dependable or confirmable, amplified by concerns related to quantitative and qualitative elements. This leads to the problem of integration, relating to how the two elements are mixed or combined, with further issues about the analysis. They go on to propose that:

“Because of the complexity involved in combining qualitative and quantitative studies either in a concurrent, sequential, conversion, parallel, or fully mixed manner, mixed research gives rise to what we call the problem of integration”

Onwuegbuzie and Johnson (2006) p.53

They highlight that any mixed method design should be carefully constructed so that its components are integrated in such a way to best match its research questions.

When dealing with issues relating with legitimation they go to propose a series of six legitimation classifications. It is proposed that this study can be described as having Multiple Validities. This is defined by Onwuegbuzie and Johnson (2006) p.57 as:

“The extent to which addressing legitimation of the quantitative and qualitative components of the study result from the use of quantitative, qualitative, and mixed validity types, yielding high quality meta inferences.”

To some degree, the threats to legitimation are compartmentalized, and dealt with, within the different elements of the study. Using the Morse notation system (Morse 1991) this study can be described as a:

quan + QUAL, study

in other words a qualitatively orientated, qualitative simultaneous design. As such, quantitative data was used to locate participants and produce data about work history. It
is accepted that the generalizability of this study may be reduced because of the low response of the questionnaire element. It can provide key indicators that could be used elsewhere. The qualitative element of the study also examined employment, as well as exploring issues of commitment, and working lives of second career teachers in some detail, with the interaction between the elements being used to provide triangulation.

3.5 Ethical Considerations

The study was aware of the demands made on the participants in that their life details would be the main part of the study. Hammersley (1992) writes of the idea of the research bargain, being an understanding between researcher and the researched, defining rules about the context of the research. Importantly, he also suggests that any bargain proposed must be fair, and agreed by both the researcher and the participant. In the questionnaire phase of the study this was made clear, and the bargain was struck. There was anonymity for participants and any ethical issues were internal in the mailing of the postal pack. Reduced to its most basic, if the participant did not like the research bargain, then the questionnaire remained uncompleted. Because the interview phase of the study is located towards the sphere of life history, the ethical concerns that apply to this area, apply to this study. Woods stresses the need for honesty and confidentiality, and Sykes proposes that the people in the research should be treated as “persons, as autonomous beings” and goes on to stress the need to protect them from being “managed and manipulated in the interests of research”. The research bargain was more complex, and time was given to participants to gain awareness before deciding to join the study. It was made clear at the start of interviews to all participants that their working lives were part of my study and interviews were needed to tell the truth about the reality of their lives as teachers. This was part of a statement read from a printed card so all participants received the same information. All were given anonymity, and the local authority, schools and the teachers were anonymised from the outset. This is not to say that there were not concerns, and one teacher was at first hesitant, but after a combination of clarification about the study, and discussion with colleagues, took part in the interview process. There was also awareness that the participants were literally sharing their lives to build the research, and were treated with respect and recognition as part of the research bargain that we had struck together.

3.6 The Timetable of the Study

Initial scoping interviews with the pilot school were carried out in mid-2009 as the study developed, with outline discussions with the teachers then taking place. The scoping interviews that took place later that year led to the refinement of the study, and
its focus on commitment. Discussions with the teachers in this school led to the gradual development of a questionnaire which was later used in participating schools. During this time, discussions were undertaken with local authorities about contacting schools to take part in the study. There was a positive response from several local authorities, but one was selected that had a diverse range of schools, and had ease of access. The email survey of schools was undertaken in 2010, as related previously. This provided initial contacts with three schools where clusters of second career teachers were located. Visits to the school were used to outline the research, and these later developed into interviews with the second career teachers in the schools. The final timing is shown in the diagram below. The postal survey was undertaken with all primary schools in the authority during mid-2011. Follow up interviews and return visits continued into early 2012 because of staff changes, and the need to interview all participants.

Diagram 3.8 The Final Form of the Study and its Timing

Conclusion

One of the major strengths of the study was that it is multi-methodological, in that it combines research techniques to examine second career teachers in one area of England. Cohen et al. (2000) suggest that “the more the methods contrast with each other, the greater the researcher’s confidence” It uses contrasting techniques such as a population survey, questionnaires and interviews, some in depth. The major strength of questionnaire process is that all participants in the study answered the same questions in the same order, and responding to the same stimuli, leading to improved reliability. The
interview phase was its flexible, allowing in-depth interviews, some over one hour, with the maximum number of participants and the generation of large amounts of data about their working lives. Efforts were made to build a relationship between the researcher and the participant, so that the trust gained would help reveal the complexity of their lives as a second career teacher. Any study of working lives must explore the personal sphere and the interview process allowed this to be explored, as well as the biography of the teacher. The interviews design allowed data to be obtained about the decision to become a teacher and previous working history, exploring the moment of change. These issues may be linked in complex ways to commitment, and the interview process has the ability to allow this to be explored. One of the strengths of the design was that it allowed any issues of Intensification to be revealed, important as this was the original focus of the study.
Chapter Four  Findings and Discussion

Introduction

The previous chapter set out methods used to resolve the research questions that were developed earlier in the study. It explored their development and some of the practical issues in their design and implementation as well as the theoretical background. This chapter will start by briefly outlining the biographical and career details of the teachers who took part in the research. Once the teachers are set in their context, then their career change will be examined. A working model will be proposed to classify the second career teachers by their decision to move into teaching. This will be discussed and its relationship to the attractions of the teaching will be outlined. The factors that positively and negatively affect their commitment will then be outlined and discussed. The chapter will then go on to examine the trend of that commitment, with reference to a model indicating their age and stage of teaching. It will then enquire how they as second career teachers define commitment. It will then examine that commitment in the light of their previous careers. Finally, it will examine how intensification may have affected the teachers in this study.

4.1 People and Places - The Teachers Taking Part in the Study

This section of the study aims to answer the research question, who are the second career primary teachers? It places the teachers in their context by detailing the schools that they work in. It explores their biographical background such as age and gender and examines previous career histories and their entry into teaching.

As reported in the previous chapter, the research effort comprises a total of twenty four second career teachers aged between twenty-eight and sixty-three years of age, these were based across ten schools in one local authority in northern England. Of the original twenty four, one left the profession in the early days of the research process, but completed an initial survey, so has been retained for the sake of completeness.

The number of female teachers in this study is slightly less than the English average of Eighty-five percent. There were six male teachers in the research and these were clustered in the three largest schools, with one school, River Primary containing four male teachers.
4.1a Locations

The twenty-three teachers that took part in both phases of the study worked in schools that were distributed across the local authority area, and range from urban schools in challenging circumstances near the town centre, to rural dormitory villages. The context of these schools will now be outlined.

The teachers taking part in initial, or ‘email’ phase were clustered in three schools, with River Primary employing eight second career teachers out of a total of fourteen teaching staff. River Primary is located in an area of low socio economic status (SES) and is school in challenging circumstances. Fen Primary is a school in a small town with a mixed intake, also with its school catchment in a low SES area, but is a ‘school of concern’ because of poor results. At the start of the study, three of the eight teaching staff were second career teachers, with one leaving once the study started. All had left the school by the end of the interview phase. At Wold Primary, a school with good league table results in a rural area, the entire staff of three, including the head teacher were second-career teachers. The contact with these schools started in early 2010 and ended in early 2012, spanning the end of the Labour and the start of the Coalition governments, with education policy transiting during this period. The policy context was recounted as ‘unnervingly quiet’ by one of the head teachers during mid-2010, as the previous government policies were abandoned by the incoming administration, and a new direction had not been established. This changed during 2011 when new policies were generated, and started to have a profound influence in schools. For example, during the latter part of the research, Wold Primary became one of the first primary schools in the local authority area to move to academy status in an initiative proposed by the new Coalition government. Later in the research, this was followed by River Primary, as part of an enforced academisation programme. There was a degree of resistance from the governors and some staff, but the school became an academy in late 2012. The final school, Fen Primary became an academy in a similar process later that the year.

It should be stated that the three schools in the interview phase were under a great deal of external pressure from a range of sources during the study: Wold Primary was a high-performing school, where parents, according to the head teacher had “high expectations”, and the change to academy status was making demands on the head teacher and staff. Both River and Fen schools were in school improvement situations following poor performance in school league tables, and were receiving support from a range of agencies. By 2010 both schools were on the list of underperforming schools
compiled by the Department for Education, and were receiving extended visits from local authority advisory teams and external consultants. Teachers were under pressure to improve their performance and staff turnover at all of these schools was high.

Of the other schools that took part in the postal phase of the study, five schools had one second career teacher on their staff, Reynard primary school had three and was also subject to school improvement action and involvement by the Local Authority (L.A.) . Strickland primary school had two second career teachers Diagram 4.1 below shows the distribution of the teachers in their schools.

Diagram 4.1 – Schools in the Study and Participant Teachers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Second Career Teachers / Teaching Staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>River Primary</td>
<td>8 / 14 (58%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wold Primary</td>
<td>3 / 3 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fen Primary</td>
<td>3 / 9 (33%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reynard Primary</td>
<td>3 / 12 (25%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strickland Primary</td>
<td>2 / 10 (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marker Primary</td>
<td>1 / 8 (12.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lee Primary</td>
<td>1 / 8 (12.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ewing Primary</td>
<td>1 / 7 (14%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healey Primary</td>
<td>1 / 5 (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grange Primary</td>
<td>1 / 5 (20%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[ n = 24 \]

As can be seen above, some of the schools had high numbers of second career teachers, and it should be noted that staff turnover at River and Fen primary schools was high. Lower-paid second career teachers can be an attractive proposition for schools. One of the participants in the study Albert, comments:

“Quite a few of our staff are second career teachers as well you know, ..I think that I can tell the difference between teachers who have had a real job and those who just came into the profession straight from school, college or university...you can tell. They can be more realistic and flexible I think”

The use of the phrase ‘real job’ is telling. There is an inference that teaching may not be so. The life experience of work outside teaching seems important to this participant as it defines identity and performance. Interviews with head teachers at River and Wold and
Fen primary schools showed that despite the considerable concentration of second career teachers at these schools, their selection was not a deliberate appointment policy. Head teachers reported that they felt that previous life experience was useful, and to some extent agreed with the realistic and flexible description, but had appointed teachers by individual merit rather than previous experience. There is an important point to be made here about staffing however. Although newly appointed second-career teachers may be inexperienced in the classroom, they often have life experiences and maturity that may compensate. There is a further linked and important factor of pay, as under current pay arrangements, teachers are generally paid by length of experience. In some schools, this may be important, as relatively mature staff is available for reduced costs. Coupled with the perception of teachers who are ‘realistic and flexible’, this is an attractive mix.

4.1b Mobility

The research was carried out over several years. In that time, three of the original twenty-four teachers had moved schools or left the profession. One teacher left the profession due to a stress–related condition, one moved schools with the co-operation of the local authority, and a further teacher sought retirement due to ill health, but has since returned to teaching at another school in the area. All were located in Fen Primary, which was under considerable pressure to improve. The school and individual teachers will be discussed later in the study.

It was noted from the interview phase that although many of the teachers were mobile in a career sense, many were not geographically mobile. Many had worked in the same area throughout their working lives. This was especially true of participants at River and Fen Primary. The local authority area is geographically isolated, but one possible explanation is that the participants came to teaching late, after working in the area, and had established family networks. These established networks affected their mobility.

4.1c Age and Length of Service

The average age of the participants that took part in the research is older than the normal distribution of teachers in primary schools (DfE data), and as second-career teachers, most of the participants had a previous career, meaning that they entered teaching later than teachers who entered the profession directly from higher education. This reflects
the findings of earlier research in the United States on second career teachers and their relative age.

Diagram 4.2 below shows the range of the teacher’s ages and their length of service. There is a trend for the older teachers in the research to have taught for longer, but this is by no means universal. One of the oldest teachers in the group is aged fifty-seven, and has nineteen years of service, and the youngest teacher is twenty-eight with two years’ service. There are some variations to this trend, with some younger teachers having long service and some older teachers entering late, and thus having shorter length of service.

What is clear is that the second career teacher is by no means a recent phenomenon, and that there have been second career teachers since 1992 that have been located in this study, with three teachers over fifty years of age having over seventeen years of service.
4.1 d Year of Entry into Teaching

It should be noted that in this study the definition of second career teachers is one who undertakes teacher training after a previous working career in other employment. It does not include teachers who have trained to teach and not directly entered the profession, and have been employed until they found a teaching post, or delayed the start of teaching until they have raised a family. The study found a substantial number of later entrants to the profession who had intermediate employment after training, and their career profiles reflect the turbulent nature of employment and how it is affected by life events and outside factors. This group, although interesting, are not the focus of this study, as it was clearly their intention to become teachers before they took alternative employment.

Participants were asked their year of entry into the profession, and work histories showed few gaps between training and the start of their career. It should be noted that entry to the profession for some participants was through part-time work, but nearly all entered the profession directly from training.

Diagram 4.3 (below), shows the participants’ year of entry into teaching. When the year of entering the profession is examined, there are no entrants between 1997 and 1999, with a small peak of three teachers in 2002, and a pronounced peak of five in 2006.

The three year gap is notable and follows the formation of the local unitary authority in 1996 and a changing environment of school support from the local authority. The local government re-organization had some impact in schools as the schools and their advisory service were being re-organized and budgets were held steady until the authority became more established. The period also coincides with the change of government in 1997 and the introduction of a range of education policy changes, such as the National Literacy Strategy, and the National Numeracy Strategy. Monitoring and Inspection was also gradually tightened during this period. It is possible that during this turbulent environment that the number of teachers leaving the profession may have slowed slightly and then increased, as the policies were introduced, and then enforced more tightly.

Seven second career teachers entered the profession between 2000 and 2002, with no teacher in the study entering during 2003. Interviews with Local Authority Inspectors and Head teachers showed that the Local Authority began a series of school reorganizations during 2004. There was widespread re-structuring of the teacher workforce for the next few years, with enhanced retirement packages for long serving
older teachers and school amalgamations. Broader national issues such as the cumulative effect of many reforms such as tightened inspection regimes and monitoring would also be taking effect and this would possibly have increased the number of older teachers leaving the profession. The effect of intensification on teacher retention has been discussed previously, and the concerns about what was perceived to be an ageing profession coupled with increasing leaving rates led to heightened awareness of teacher shortages. The Teacher Development Agency (TDA) reacted to this process by starting an advertising campaign to attract would-be teachers to the profession, to counter the predicted shortage. By the early 2000s a television and newspaper advertising campaign had been launched, focusing initially on the training subsidy and the possible financial rewards of teaching. This was later re-focused to highlight the respect gained by teachers and the rewarding aspects of working with children.

As can be seen, there is a peak of teachers entering the profession in 2006, possibly as a response to increased early retirement rates. The participants entering during that year were of mixed age, gender and had a varied group of reasons for entering the profession, but the majority had previous employment in the private sector. They all entered after the Teacher Development Agency (TDA) subsidy for training, and one participant reported that this as a minor factor in attracting him to train as a teacher. Twenty of the twenty-four teachers entered the profession after the introduction of the TDA subsidy in 2000, although the subsidy was only mentioned in two responses.

Another more likely explanation for this peak is the introduction of funding for Planning, Preparation and Assessment (PPA) time for teachers. One Head teacher reported that she, like other schools had employed additional part-time staff to provide teaching cover for this non-contact time for teachers. A part time introduction to teaching was noted by several second career teachers when interviewed, with some teachers building up to full-time work by Head teachers employing them to fill additional gaps in teaching cover.

Diagram 4.4 below, shows in tabular form, the national situation in England, taken from available Department for Education (DfE) data. The diagram shows new qualified teachers directly entering the profession aged below twenty five, who have taken the direct entry route into teaching, straight from training, and also indicates those who have entered the profession straight from training aged above twenty five. This latter group are likely to be second career teachers, as they have started teaching over twenty five, direct from training. As can be seen, there are 4670 under twenty-five year olds entering
teaching in 2001, against 3990 over twenty-five year olds. By 2004, the next year of available data, the situation is reversed, and by 2006 a peak of 5930 over twenty-five year old teachers entering the profession. No claim is made to closely link the situation in the participating schools with the national situation, but the national rise is significant, if only to demonstrate the greater number of teachers entering the profession, and their relative age distribution.

Diagram 4.3- Participant Year of Entry into Teaching

![Diagram 4.3](image)

Diagram 4.4 – Newly Qualified Teachers – by Age (DfE data)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Under 25 on entry</th>
<th>Over 25 on entry</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>4640</td>
<td>5570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>4190</td>
<td>5930</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>3960</td>
<td>5280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>4670</td>
<td>3990</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NB: Data shows teachers entering directly from training, with no ‘gap’

From interviews with teachers and head teachers it became evident that the local authority also encouraged Teaching Assistants (T.A.s) to train as teachers. This was in order to resolve a perceived shortfall in teacher recruitment, one that had been identified because of the poor image and geographical isolation. One third of the teachers in this study were ex-T.A.s, and they comprise nine out of the thirteen teachers who entered the profession after 2000. They will be dealt with in more detail later.

The local education authority was still moving from a system of infant and nursery schools to one of merged primary schools, and is the process is still continuing at the time of writing in 2012, and so re-structuring of the teacher workforce is still taking place.

4.1 e Previous Careers

The term second career teacher implies that there was a substantive former career. As a study of second career teachers it was assumed that this was a relevant area of enquiry, as it may have considerable influence on their working lives as teachers, as found by extensive previous research and noted in Chapter Two. To investigate this, the teachers in the survey were asked about for details about their employment history, listing the major employment, and were asked to state their main previous occupation as well as other employment in as much detail as possible. The Interview phase also gathered information about initial employment and explored initial career choices and turning to teaching.

Diagram 4.5 below, shows the main previous occupations broken down by type. As can be seen, the teachers entered the profession from a variety of occupations. There is a definition to be made here about the term career. For many of the participants, their working history was a series of unrelated jobs rather than a set career, and their responses reveal former working lives of considerable complexity. The chart shows the initial employment (1) and subsequent changes (2,3). Some participants had long employment histories, with one (Finola) having one of 40 years. With older participants some degree of change during a long working life is inevitable, especially when parenting and the changes in the economic environment and local employment situation are considered. It also demonstrates that the working lives of the teachers in the study are complex and were be affected by a variety of factors, ranging from personal to global issues. One major factor that affected employment was parenting. For many women in the research this guided their decisions regarding early employment, often into part time work that could be fitted around child-rearing and family issues. This sometimes meant that later, school support, or teaching assistant work became
attractive, not only because of the working hours, but of the synchronicity between school working days and holidays.

Interviews revealed the long term consequences of early personal decisions, and how these impacted on working lives for years to come. For some participants a teaching career was an aspiration, but one because of life issues, had to be delayed for many years. This is dealt with in greater detail later in this chapter.

Diagram 4.5, overleaf, shows the main three elements of previous employment. It should be noted that even this is a simplified employment history, as in most cases employment was diverse, complex and in some cases short term and temporary.
Diagram 4.5 - Teacher Working History

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>Employment initial, post education</th>
<th>Employment 2</th>
<th>Employment 3 (pre-teaching)</th>
<th>Previous Career Length</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Albert</td>
<td>Civil Service (office)</td>
<td>WEA lecturer (part time)</td>
<td>Industry (manager) *</td>
<td>8 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barry</td>
<td>Civil Service (tech)</td>
<td>Industry (scientist)</td>
<td>Industry (manager) *</td>
<td>16 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cherry</td>
<td>Retail Work P</td>
<td>Retail (manager P)</td>
<td>Teaching Assistant</td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denise</td>
<td>Civil service (office) P</td>
<td>Parenting</td>
<td></td>
<td>20 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elaine</td>
<td>Radiographer</td>
<td>Live-in Nanny</td>
<td>Nursery Nurse (NNEB)</td>
<td>11 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felicity</td>
<td>Teaching Assistant P</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>34 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerald</td>
<td>Poultry inspector</td>
<td>Environmental Health</td>
<td></td>
<td>31 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harry</td>
<td>Leisure Industry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lindy</td>
<td>Factory Worker P</td>
<td>Mixed Employment</td>
<td>Teaching Assistant</td>
<td>29 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noreen</td>
<td>Banking (secretarial) P</td>
<td>Civil Service (manager P)</td>
<td>Teaching Assistant</td>
<td>16 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rita</td>
<td>Office (secretarial) P</td>
<td>Office (manager P)</td>
<td></td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandra</td>
<td>Office (secretarial) P</td>
<td>Parenting</td>
<td></td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracey</td>
<td>Office (secretarial)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>13 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magda</td>
<td>Retail Work P</td>
<td>Waitress , Cleaner</td>
<td>Teaching Assistant</td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alice</td>
<td>Office secretary</td>
<td>Estate Agent</td>
<td></td>
<td>12 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brenda</td>
<td>Textile Cutter</td>
<td>Fashion Designer</td>
<td></td>
<td>25 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles</td>
<td>Technician</td>
<td>Council (office work)</td>
<td>Graphic Designer</td>
<td>21 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doreen</td>
<td>Printer</td>
<td>Teaching Assistant</td>
<td></td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estelle</td>
<td>Food Technician P</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finola</td>
<td>Nursery Nurse P</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>40 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgina</td>
<td>Police Officer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbert</td>
<td>Carer</td>
<td>Social services</td>
<td></td>
<td>23 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irene</td>
<td>Portage worker</td>
<td>Teaching Assistant</td>
<td></td>
<td>26 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>Probation Officer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8 yrs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*P = parenting gap
*Private sector entrant

As indicated in a previous chapter, some media reports suggest that second career teachers come into teaching from employment outside the public sector. The term ‘industry’ was used by two of the head teachers in interviews. When the previous careers of the teachers are examined by sector, fourteen of the twenty four teachers in
the study started work in the private sector. Five later moved into employment in the public sector by working in schools in a support role before becoming a teacher. It should be noted that one teacher in the survey trained as a civil servant, but spent most of their working life in industry and is recorded as private sector. At the time of entry, eight of the participants entered teaching from private sector employment. The other sixteen all entered from employment in the public sector.

As referred to in a previous chapter, there have been reports about how private sector employees have moved into teaching in search of a more rewarding career, and there was some limited evidence of the second career teachers in the study reporting moving to teaching because of unemployment, financial rewards or job security. The eight participants entering from the private sector were from a range of employment, such as leisure manager, secretary, estate agent, fashion designer, graphic designer and food technician. They reported a variety of attractions to teaching such as time benefits, to seeking to work with children, a desire to work in a less financially orientated environment. In interviews, many reported that they felt that their previous career had atrophied, either through lack of prospects, or their attitude to their employment had changed because of parenting, leading them to re-assess the course of their lives, including their work; only one reported that unemployment had forced the change. One participant admitted that she “drifted into teaching” after being a mature student. This relationship between initial career, change event and entry into teaching is explored in more detail in a later section.

It should be noted however, that five of this group of eight entered the profession after 2005. This may be the result of a tailored advertising campaign in newspapers and television run by the then Teacher Development Agency (TDA), who were tasked to attract high quality applicants from the private, or by other factors such as the TDA subsidy to training teachers, local employment conditions, or more complex local changes in the profession.

In the group that transited from the public sector to teaching, all had employment that brought them into direct contact with the public, such as Benefits Officer, Social Service Carer, Police Officer and Probation Officer, and so had a range of skills that could be transferred into teaching. Three out of the total of six men in the study were in this group of ex-public sector workers. It is possible that they may have entered teaching because of structural changes in the public sector over the last twenty years, but there was little direct evidence of this from interviews. A large group of participants were already working in schools as teaching assistants.
4.1 f Complex Employment History

Few of the teachers transited seamlessly from a previous career into teaching. There was some evidence of the “winding road” suggested by Ticgelhaar et al. (2008). Interview transcripts indicated the complexity of their transition into teaching, reflecting previous diverse employment history.

Modern working life was shown to be full of change for many, and even those with steady careers, for example council work, moved through different departments and roles. Local government reorganization featured in responses, where political change in the formation of unitary authorities, meant changes in work practices, routines and places of work. Such change is inevitable in a working life that can last half a lifetime and is a feature for many in modern working life.

The majority of participants in the interview phase had a previous career that comprised of several different forms of employment, often of a disjointed nature and affected by life events. The term second career teacher is really a misnomer: for some participants this was a third or fourth. For others there was no real career, merely a sequence of often low-status employment.

Magda, 44 reported her pre-teaching career as being a complex range of work:

“lots of things – selling stuff, waitressing, cleaning...I even cleaned up in a scrapyard once”

But like others, she transited into teaching through being a classroom helper and then a part time teaching assistant, full time teaching assistant and then completing a part time degree and a teaching certificate. Work for her, like others in the study, was often subject to constant change, and one of the skills that she and some other teachers in the study appeared to have acquired is adaptability and the ability to cope in a rapidly changing work environment.

4.1 g Part-Time Work

For several of the interviewees, previous careers were revealed as a portfolio of part time work. There seemed to be a range of reasons for this: unemployment, parenting, student-funding and a lack of employment opportunities. For some, part-time work had been a constant part of their working lives, where a portfolio of several jobs were managed and combined with the demands of homes. This is similar to the concept of the boundaryless career (Arthur, 1994) in that work experiences go beyond the boundaries
of a single employment setting and individuals can gain competencies on the way. For some, part-time work was a means of entry into the profession itself, starting their school careers as a part-time teaching assistant and then later as a part-time teacher supporting other staff. This continuity of experience was reported by several teachers in the interview phase. Magda started teaching by covering for teachers on courses:

“I did some cover as 0.4 and was asked to do some supply, or cover, but I still didn’t have a class of my own...that came later, but I wasn’t being paid properly, fifty quid, and the supply teachers were getting over a hundred pounds a day...things weren’t going well in my personal life and I needed to support myself, I could do that as a teacher, couldn’t do that as a T.A.”

Magda highlights the low income associated with part time work in schools, and for her, the pay differential between covering a class as a teaching assistant and a teacher was a driver in joining the profession. Part time employment in schools had been driven by teaching reforms introducing Planning Preparation and assessment (PPA) time and changes allowing retiring staff to work part time, as a form of phased retirement, or as a ‘job-share’. Teachers were often employed to cover classes during this time, which was often fragmented, in short morning or afternoon teaching sessions, distancing the teacher from the school. This minor role has been portrayed as ‘the part-time nobody’ (Chessum, 1989).

Another linked issue was the temporary nature of much previous employment. Short term contracts, cover and teaching assistant work linked to children with special needs all meant work in schools that was temporary, often with no fixed contract. Special needs support work cited by several of the participants was linked to one particular child and examples were given where the support worker left employment when the child moved schools. Outside schools, the situation seemed worse, with some employment being temporary and variable from day to day, with one participant reporting that she worked ‘cash in hand’, paid on a daily basis, making even temporary work in schools attractive in comparison.

There were positive aspects. Part-time work in schools did offer opportunities for some, as a means of entry into a teaching career, and also allowed time for study in higher education. For many of the teachers who started as teaching assistants, part time work allowed training opportunities, both for their role as a teaching assistant, and gaining a foundation degree. Part-time employment also allowed teachers who were parents a
way of working around child-care issues linked to parenting. PPA cover time also led to some employment opportunities for teachers to enter the profession.

4.1h Parenting

For many female participants, their move into a teaching career was linked to parenting. Ten teachers reported that raising a family had provided a ‘career break’ in previous employment and for many of those, a change in priorities. Four of the teachers in this group reported that they returned to their original career, but found it difficult to juggle employment and family commitments, and sought a more family friendly occupation later as a teaching assistant. For some it provided an opportunity to experience school as a parent, then a volunteer helper, allowing them to experience school as a working environment. There was a strong link to part time work, where women re-introduced themselves into employment through schools and through a school helper role. Working in a support role in school also gave the helper exposure to the working environment of the school and socialized them into the routines and practices of the school as a work place. For some, there were indications that the school helped build their social capital by building up their contacts and experience in what by comparison with some previous employment, is a regulated and ordered working environment. For some, this environment appeared to be a nurturing and supportive one, where other possibilities, such as working in schools, were glimpsed. Becoming a teacher was a logical next step in a steady progression from parent – helper to classroom assistant. This parent-school route was taken by five out of the nine women interviewed in the research phase.

Several men in the research phase noted that becoming a parent had changed their view of children, and their interest in their own children’s development had triggered an interest in education that had later developed into a teaching career.

Parenting had an indirect influence on returning to employment, in that the financial burden of raising children had motivated some to look for better rewarded, or more financially secure employment. Some of the teachers in the study reported that they chose teaching as it was compatible with child care for their developing families. For some in the research, this was a factor that attracted them into schools as paid helpers or as teaching assistants, rather than teaching.

In Summary, the teachers in the study were distributed across the local authority, but there were five schools with more than two second career teachers, with one school
(River Primary) having more than eight. This appeared not to be a policy decision by the schools, but may reflect rapid teacher turnover. Data showed a peak of teachers in 2006, and this may be linked to national workforce reform. The teachers in the study were shown to have had a wide variety of previous careers, with many involved in part-time work. Many had complex working histories, and were from both the private and public sector. One third of the participants had been teaching assistants, and this may be linked to a local re-training initiative. Whatever the previous employment path followed by the second career teacher, a decision was made during that time to change to a career in teaching. In the next section, the study will discuss that decision.

4.1 Turning to Teaching – Making the Move

This section of the study examines the career change, first by examining how the second career teachers turned to teaching, and then by exploring the attraction to the profession that was involved in that decision.

As previously discussed in Chapter Two, there is a substantial area of literature about career choice, suggesting that teachers turn to teaching for complex reasons. Strauss (1962, p.65) proposes the idea of turning points in career choice but advises that this choice part of the:

“open ended, tentative, exploratory, hypothetical, problematical, devious, changeable and only partly unified character of human course of action”

Strauss goes on to say that turning points occur when ‘the individual has to take stock, to re-evaluate, revise, re-see and re-judge’ (Strauss, 1962, p.71) and this seems to depict the process of turning to teaching, where personal and working lives are subject to a range of dynamic variables, and variation in these can lead to a turning point. These are similar to the concept of epiphanies outlined by Denzin (1989), where a person is changed by life events. Some studies examine the turning points of second career teachers, and Crow et al (1990), as related previously, proposed that second-career teachers can be grouped into the groups, The Home Comers, Converted, and Unconverted. Similarly, Troman (2008), in a study of teachers, some of who were second career teachers, analysed career change decision and proposes three categories, linked to the work of Strauss (1962) and Hodkinson and Sparkes (1997). Hodkinson & Sparkes (1997, P. 39) suggest that ‘turning points are inseparable from the times or routines that follow and precede them’ and suggest that change decisions can be
categorized into three types: structural, self-initiated or forced. It should be noted however, that Hodkinson and Sparkes work concentrated on the transition to work from school, rather than career change. Troman goes on to suggest defining the career change event in terms of turning points, to examine if choices were structural, self-initiated, or forced, based on the work of Hodkinson and Sparkes:

**Parent Turners**, who enter teaching because of its caring culture and its suitability to child care, time and other parental responsibilities

**Self-Initiated Turners**, who left often well-paid careers because they did not enjoy their previous professions

**Displaced Turners**, who enter teaching because of major changes in their previous employment, such as re-structuring or redundancy.

Troman’s classification acknowledges the inherent complexity, rather than the simple attractions of teaching. When the responses of the teachers in this study were examined, there was little alignment with the model proposed by Troman. There are some Parent Turners, but their change decision was revealed to be complex and gradual with differing life histories. There were low numbers of Self-Initiated Turners and Displaced Turners.

Hodkinson and Sparkes (1997) suggest that any analysis of turning points cannot be separated from the routine, or in other words, the experiences which precede them. They suggest three types of routine experience, the socializing, evolutionary and dislocating. The socialising routine is where a person is socialised steadily into a work identity which is not desired, the evolutionary routine is where a person grows out of a work identity. Dislocating routines occur when an original identity is no longer viable and is strongly affected by outside events.

A particular change event is often difficult to locate in the warp and weft of a changing working life. The change event then becomes even more complex when initial desire to teach is brought into the picture, with some second career teachers harbouring ambition all the way through a long previous career. When the teachers in the study are examined, in the light of Troman(2008) there is clearly one Self-initiated turner, and one Displaced turner, but again, many decisions to change career and enter teaching were seen to be complex. Parent turners exist in parallel in other groups, and for example, one teacher in the study has elements of all three categories, and some teachers cannot be placed into any change event group. Crow (1990) categorized second career
teachers into three groups. Using the Crow categories, there are no Unconverted teachers with high status, but many Home Comers, who were also in the Converted group. It has been postulated that attraction to teaching can be complex, and it seems possible that the change event may also be so. It is therefore proposed to generate new definitions more suitable to the teachers in this study.

There are difficulties in generating a model based on small groups, and no claims are made about its suitability to other groups of second career teachers. After analysis of responses, and in an effort to isolate the change decision, and its linked routines, a modified model is proposed. This will hopefully deal with the number of ex-teaching assistants and teachers referring to self-improvement as an attractor to teaching, although the complexity of responses is noted and the difficulties of allocating some of the teachers within the simple model. It acknowledges the work of Strauss (1962) on turning points, which occur when an individual has to take stock, to re-evaluate, revise, re-see and re-judge, by isolating the change decision within the previous career. It is proposed to modify the model developed by Troman and others to make it more fitting to the teachers in this study. The three groups are Parallel, Evolutionary, and Dislocatory (resulting from dislocation) Turners. They are shown below in diagram 4.6 with brief explanations:

Diagram 4.6 Teacher Turner Categories

- **Parallel Turners**
  - Moved from parallel career working in schools
  - Often have complex working history

- **Evolutionary Turners**
  - Attraction to teaching evolved over time
  - Turn to teaching when original career didn’t live up to expectations

- **Dislocatory Turners**
  - Turned to teaching after dislocating change in previous career
  - Went through rapid re-evaluation

In more detail, the three groups proposed are:
**Parallel Turners** – who have moved to teaching from a parallel career working in schools as nursery nurses or teaching assistants, confirming an original trajectory of working with children. This group may have been teaching assistants, who turned to teaching whilst working closely alongside teachers and became socialised. This group have re-professionalized, and often had a complex working history.

**Evolutionary Turners** – whose attraction to teaching steadily evolved after becoming disillusioned with their previous employment, aligning with Hodkinson and Sparkes concept of a ‘contradictory’ routine. Many in this group embarked on an original career but felt that it wasn’t rewarding and no longer lived up to initial expectations. They made the choice to turn to teaching for that reward. This group also includes those who turned to teaching to ‘improve themselves’ and sought a challenge.

**Dislocatory Turners** – who have decided to become teachers after dislocating change in their employment led to some form of crisis and turning-point, such as the demise of the company and unemployment. They have been affected by rapid change and have experienced the ‘epiphany’ (Denzin, 1989). This has led to rapid re-evaluation of their working lives and the decision to turn to teaching.

There are admitted difficulties in analyzing complex and often involved careers and the decisions taken. Several interviews showed how lengthy and complex the decision was and how many factors interplayed before the decision was taken. Gerald, for example, reported that his career in local government was over, after local government re-organization changed the nature of his job, but had always been interested in teaching, although it was not his first choice. Since the birth of his own children, he had become fascinated by the development of learning in his children. It would be possible to place him in each category, although the coding of most of the responses from other teachers was an easier task. The responses from teachers in the research were analysed repeatedly and then allocated into one of three categories set out below. Each category will now be dealt with in turn.

**Parallel Turners (n = 9)**

The Parallel Turners were already working in schools in a parallel career and progressed into teachers. Some had harboured initial ambitions to be teachers, but most had turned to teaching in a very gradual way, that confirmed their initial decision to work with children. Five of the nine had started working life in the private sector, often in work that was low –paid and often part-time. Many were volunteers and parent-helpers in schools and moved gradually into paid work as teaching assistants. This move into
school was often associated with becoming a parent, and the disruption of any previous career path accompanied by a re-assessment of priorities. The nine entered teaching in an almost even distribution between 2000 and 2009.

One of the Parallel Turners was a head teacher, who had initial ambitions to teach, but because of personal circumstances started working life in banking, moving into work as a teaching assistant and raising a family. Her school, Wold Primary is of interest, as all the other teachers in the school are Confirmatory Turners.

Some of the Parallel Turners had substantial careers in school, with one working as a classroom assistant for thirty four years. As teaching assistants, they were already working in schools, they knew what a teacher did, worked alongside them in the classroom, and grew into the role, often picking up part-time qualifications as they worked. Elaine comments:

“People ask me what do you want to go into teaching for? , well I went into it with my eyes wide open. I knew all the pitfalls and the problems, I knew exactly, and that was the thing, and I know it gave me a good grounding because I was fortunate to work alongside a lot of good teachers, I’m fortunate”

Interviews revealed a complex relationship with the teaching profession. Some, like Elaine felt that they had learned a great deal from the teachers that they had worked with, whilst others thought that they could do better, and thought that they often worked harder and put more effort into the school day. Becoming a teacher not only was a matter of raised income, it was also a matter of raised status and agency. This became a motivation to enter the profession. Magda related:

“I became a teacher, and I suppose I have to thank students, because I thought I could do that , when they came in, I saw what they did and the prep and thought I could do that!”

Others noted the pay differential between teaching assistants and their teachers working together in the same classroom, and were motivated because of financial reasons. The diagram below shows the main change attraction to teaching, showing that self-improvement and the idea of progressing their careers in schools were main the main attractions in this group. The phrase ‘bettering myself’ was common in interviews, and explained to be a mix of respect, financial gain and social standing. This group show a range of factors that aid their commitment to teaching, and all the group reported that their commitment level was static.
The group typically had between eleven and two years of service as a teacher, with the mode being four years. As can be seen from the diagram above, all entered teaching between 2000 and 2008.

Interviews revealed that one possible explanation for this was that a nearby higher education institution had organized foundation degree and teacher training courses for teaching assistants, encouraged by a local authority education adviser. This policy was run to alleviate a perceived lack of applicants to the teaching profession in the area after its formation in the local government reorganization of 1996, as referred to earlier. The geographical isolation, poor transport links, coupled with the stigmatized identity of the area in the media, led to a decline in teacher and head teacher applications and by 2000 it was an area of concern for the then newly-formed local authority, who appointed a recruitment strategy manager and took a variety of steps including setting up its own supply teacher agency. In 2001 the problems of recruiting teachers to the area was raised by a local member of parliament in questions to the Secretary of State for Education. ( Hansard , 27th April 2001 ) and one of the solutions to the problem was sought in the community itself. Teaching Assistants were encouraged to re-train as teachers. All of the ex-teaching assistants interviewed had trained as teachers at a nearby local institution of Higher Education, and many lived and taught in the communities where they had previously worked, with experience in schools that in some cases went back many years.

The question then has to be asked, can they be defined as real career changers? Ticgelhaar et al. (2008) suggest that the real career changer has recent experience outside education, and no teaching experience. Their study found some people with teaching and training experience re-training as teachers, but I would suggest that the teaching assistants in this study are a special case. Most made complex and involved journeys towards working with children, with the final move into the profession being aided by a series of reforms in teacher training, higher education and in the schools that they worked in. Once the decision was made to embark on a teaching career, interviews revealed a winding path to becoming a teacher, with part time work and extended further education.

Some found this a struggle, with financial difficulties and family commitments slowing down progress in becoming a teacher. For some, other significant life-events intervened.
Elaine embarked a teacher training course and was set on a new career:

“But unfortunately I got cancer, and I thought that I would just be a nursery nurse, I’ll be a decent nursery nurse, and you know I gave it all up, and that was that.”

“Soon I realized that I wasn’t dying, I thought no, I’m going to do this, so being a nursery nurse wasn’t good enough for me.”

“I thought I’d start again, so I did, and graduated when I was fifty, but my Mum died. I had to take care of my Mum, she died before I graduated and I had to take care of her, and I thought I’m not giving up, and I carried on with my foundation degree.”

Elaine’s experiences highlight the determination of the group, who often struggled to become a teacher in sometimes adverse working and life circumstances. The path to becoming a teacher was long and complex for many in the study. Some, like Magda initially had complex employment histories consisting of part-time employment.

“I worked in part time jobs and then started as a teaching assistant and did stuff in schools... I became a full time TA and then decided to be teacher. I thought I can do that job, I was doing it anyway when the teacher was away.”

Her decision to teach was based on her experience of working with student teachers, where she realized that becoming a teacher would not be a large step as she was already doing many of the tasks of a teacher. In some cases, the move into teaching was enabled by others. Felicity had worked in schools for nearly all of her working life of thirty-four years and entered teaching aged fifty:

“I was a teaching assistant, I was very enthusiastic, the more I did, the more I got out of it...We had an Ofsted inspection, and in those days it was a full old style four day...they were everywhere...and the special needs lady (inspector) came to me and said please do your teaching she recommended me to the head, that I should go for it.”

For most of this group, turning was a logical next step from a career that was parallel to teaching. For the next group it was a deliberate move from a range of previous careers:
Evolutionary Turners (n = 9)

The Evolutionary Turner turns to teaching when circumstances in their first career have changed, and no longer provides the rewards originally sought. They evolved into teachers as their interest in their first career declines. Albert worked in the civil service, but found the work ‘repetitive and dull’. He moved into teaching after working part time as an adult education lecturer, where he realized that teaching was more rewarding than his civil service career. He was aware of the working life of a teacher as:

“my wife at the time was a teacher, and I know what she was doing at school, so I made the move!”

Some reported that they have always had ambitions to teach, but started in another career, like Denise, who reported that:

“I worked for a while in the civil service, ok at first…but in the end I couldn’t wait to have a family and get out”

She went on to recount how she never returned to the Civil Service after raising her family re-trained to become a teacher. Gerald worked for a local council in a technical capacity, but his role as an Environmental Health Officer was re-graded and he found himself filling in forms, rather than doing an active, practical job. Like many in this group, he became steadily disillusioned with his first career as his life developed, and gradually considered a career in teaching as an alternative. He took time off to work in his wife’s school

“this was about the time I was getting disillusioned with the council and I thought I would get my foot through the door, half day flexi time to sort of get my toe in the door, I thought I would taste and do a job experience”

He goes on to relate his start in the profession:

So that was my first introduction to teaching, unfortunately it didn’t work out too well I hated it unfortunately”

Gerald tried again in a primary school, enjoyed it, and went on to do teacher training. His turning event was gradual and complex. As mentioned previously, there were elements of all three turning situations in his responses, and this highlights the complex
nature of the decision to become a teacher. It also highlights the complexities of classifying a process that may be subject to many variables, and may take many years.

One Evolutionary Turner became a teacher after becoming disillusioned with her work as a manager in a haulage company. She did not find work rewarding and ‘left to find herself’, mirroring Strauss’ (1962) concept as career development being a series of turning points. Rita left work to gain qualifications, with no real end result in mind. The change event was an extended process:

“I was earning big money, yes, and doing a good job, I was proud of what I was doing, but in the big scheme of things, it didn’t mean much. I’d left school with some ‘O’ levels and just went straight into work, I wanted some qualifications, and some respect I suppose”

She went on to complete a degree, but wasn’t sure about teaching at first, and felt that she ‘drifted into teaching’

“I never really set out to be a teacher and there are times I don’t feel that I really am, If you know what I mean”

In some respects, this response is unique in the study, as most participants cited some form of trajectory when reporting their entry into the profession. What her response shows is the incremental development that takes place when changing career, in that dissatisfaction with one career can occur before attraction to teaching takes place.

**Dislocatory Turners ( n = 5 )**

The Dislocatory Turner turns to teaching following rapid, dislocating change in their previous employment, leading to re-evaluation. This category is very similar to the Displaced Turner defined by Troman. Like the group defined by Troman, this may occur rapidly after unemployment leads to a re-assessment of the direction of peoples’ lives. More often, the dislocatory turner is forced to re-assess after a career change driver, a rapid dis-jointing change. After a long career in the chemical industry, Barry found himself out of work when his factory closed. There were no other opportunities available, and no similar employment, so he re-trained as a teacher. Another one of this group, Harry, had a slightly different change driver. He reported that he could not cope with the work that took over his life and that involved long distance travel. His work in the sport and leisure industry did not “suit his lifestyle, it was twenty four seven”, and
after several years of intense work he felt “that it had run its course…”. He suffered a crisis that rapidly escalated, leading to a rapid re-evaluation of his life. He resigned, and after consideration, followed the career of his partner, that of a primary school teacher. He was frank about his first career still being his “primary passion”, and one which he still loves, but also one where he could not fulfill the demands of the job. He accepts that teaching is a compromise, but one that suits his lifestyle.

Alice was an Estate Agent, and her small company was taken over by a large bank, leading to rapid, overwhelming change in her workplace and her satisfaction with work:

“I managed an Estate Agency, and at the end became so disillusioned by it all, it was just the money that mattered. It was incessant, and I came into teaching to work with people and just get away from that ‘bottom line’ view of the world…”

She left the business, ‘with no job to go to…’ and afterwards re-evaluated her employment prospects. She moved on quickly to complete a PGCE teaching qualification, and then into teaching. Alice did not have time to re-evaluate and explore in the manner of the Evolutionary Turners. Her decision to turn to teaching was rapid, and post-hoc, and the turning event was dictated by rapid change-events in her first career and her reaction to them.

The details of the group in full are shown in Diagram 4.7 below, as can be seen four of the five are male. There could be a variety of reasons for this, the most likely being local employment opportunities, the re-structuring of the local economic environment, meaning the closure of many local factories, and the lack of full-time job opportunities:

**Diagram 4.7 Dislocatory Turners**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Career Change Event</th>
<th>Turning Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Barry</td>
<td>closure of factory</td>
<td>rapid re-evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harry</td>
<td>work time demands</td>
<td>resignation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alice</td>
<td>take-over of firm- change of work conditions</td>
<td>resignation,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles</td>
<td>closure of firm</td>
<td>unemployment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbert</td>
<td>closure of department</td>
<td>unemployment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In most cases there was an external event that became a career change driver. This led to an event, where re-evaluation took place and then the decision to turn to teaching.

In summary, building on the work of Strauss (1962) Denzin (1989), and Crow (1990), Troman (2008) it is proposed that second-career teachers can be grouped into a choice model based on three categories. These classify the change event as structural, self-initiated or forced. This categorises the second career teachers as Parallel Turners, who have moved from a parallel career working in schools, and who often have a complex working history. Their evolution into teachers was through a steady process of socialization and absorbing school culture. Evolutionary Turners, whose attraction developed over time, and turned to teaching when their original career didn’t live up to their expectations, and Dislocatory Turners, who turned to teaching after dislocating change in their previous career such as redundancy or rapid change in the work-place and went through a re-evaluation.

Later in this chapter, commitment to teaching is examined in detail. For all the teachers in this study however, there must have been a commitment to a previous career and some degree of attachment to it. Some have been affected by change, where teaching developed into an achievable aim, and have switched from a parallel career. Others were affected by economic change, where their employers failed to survive, or by rapid change in employment conditions and turned to teaching, often leaving commitment to the original career intact. For others there was a steady drop in commitment to a previous career, a process of re-evaluation and the development of an attraction to teaching.

4.1 j Attractions to Teaching

All the teachers in the study were asked directly what attracted them to the teaching profession, at the time of their choice. This was an attempt to locate the decision at the time of choosing. Responses were examined and categorized using an adapted form of the model developed by Day et al in 2007. It was felt that this had broad similarities to
the model proposed by Novak and Knowles, who suggested that the main attractions were:

- Teaching as a worthwhile activity
- Service to others
- Personal style
- Love of subject
- Economic benefits

A new model was synthesized from the two, using altered categories. These were Identity; Personal; Making a Difference; Professional Challenge; and Accidental. There is no category of ‘subject’ as suggested by Day et al., and Novak and Knowles. This idea was not referred to by the teachers in the pilot study, and it may be that the love of a particular subject area is submerged within the wider nature of primary teaching. There was no reference to subjects in interviews. The major response by teachers was a desire to improve themselves and their lives, and to gain status. Others wanted to make a difference to children’s lives, with some attracted to teaching by personal factors such as the relative job security of teaching, time factors and financial rewards. Other responses included those who had chosen teaching by accident. Diagram 4.8 below itemizes the attractions to teaching.

**Diagram 4.8 Attractions to Teaching**

![Attraction to Teaching](chart)

The largest attraction to teaching by far was in the sphere of Identity, (n=11), where responses indicated that people became teachers to improve their feeling of self-worth or status. This chimes with the work of Novak and Knowles (1992) who suggested that
one of the attractions to teaching for the career-changer was a need to engage in worthwhile activity, and this gave a sense of self-improvement. Interviews demonstrated the urge to move on from a career to one that had respect in the community and among parents. The decision seemed to stem from a “personal transformative goal” similar to that as outlined by Novak & Knowles (1992). The teachers in the interview phase noted the respect that was given to the profession, and wanted to be part of it. The idea of a profession with respect of others has to be set into the context of the previous career, and the time at which the decision was taken. Some teachers in interviews had found their previous careers ‘repetitive and dull’, others felt that their career had ‘run its course’. This should be put into the context of an economic decline of the area in the last thirty years, where traditional industries, and supporting businesses, had declined. In such a situation, teaching retains its traditional respect, combined with opportunities for career development. Of the six male teachers in the study, four were in the Identity group, and came into teaching attracted by the concept of improving their self-worth. Interestingly, most had partners who were teachers, and so were aware of the status of the profession. Most of the ex-teaching assistants in the study cited self-improvement as a reason for becoming a teacher, seeing it as a way of gaining status and a new identity as a teacher. The path of higher education as part of the self-improvement process was noted by several of the second career teachers. That path was a long one for many of the interviewees, one that was often disconnected, complex, and was fitted around work. Felicity reported that:

“It took me ages, I left school without qualifications, I didn’t have any Maths or English or stuff like that, so I had to start again. So I did that, I took the Foundation degree for the teaching assistants, but before I did the foundation degree, I had to do my Maths GCSE and then do the English...”

(Felicity)

Many were proud of their achievements in gaining the qualifications that allowed them to become teachers, and also of the time it took to gain them, often juggling family life and work.

One teacher, Noreen, reported that it was her ‘life’s ambition’ to become a teacher, and this had never wavered. Some in the study expressed a great deal of certainty about wanting to become a teacher, but had to deal with adverse personal circumstances that delayed entry to the profession, when life altered course, school examinations were not attained, and alternative employment had to be found.
“I always wanted to be a teacher, ever since I was a child….I suppose that I was fulfilling my life’s dream, I just couldn’t because of the circumstances… I didn’t do my A levels…and I suppose that was that and I went off into banking....”

(Noreen)

Noreen was not unusual. There was a common strand, revealed in interviews, that the teachers had finally gained the career that they had wanted. Some had always wanted to teach, in contrast to the findings of Lerner and Zittleman (2002) who found that few of their second career teachers had thought about education as an initial career choice. Gerald comments that he had “poor schooling” early in his life, and went on to relate that:

“I didn’t come out with any qualifications.. like GCEs or CSEs or anything…but I had this idea in the back of my head about teaching…I liked the idea of being a teacher, but it wasn’t going to happen you see, I had no qualifications.”

Some teachers were attracted to teaching by the personal rewards of a career (n=5). These rewards were often pragmatic and practical and included the financial rewards as well as long holidays and relative job security. The compatibility of teaching to child care, and its convenience in raising a family was noted by some of the participants. Additional complexity was indicated when returning to work after raising children, where a career had atrophied, and work in school was compatible with child care. The local decline in traditional industries during the last thirty years, and pay differentials between teaching and part-time, often casualized work in the private sector was noted by some participants, and this encouraged them towards a more secure and financially rewarding role as a teacher. One participant noted the pay differential between her role as a teaching assistant and that of a teacher as a major reason for joining the profession.

‘Making a Difference’ by making a positive impact on children’s lives was also seen as an attraction to teaching (n=5). The emotional rewards of teaching, such as the idea of being an effective teacher and encouraging learning in children is seen as a major attraction to teaching. Some responses had an educational element linked to learning, others were more socially inspired indicating an awareness of the deprivation that their pupils suffered, and the desire to raise them from this and provide a service to the community. This sense of service was again identified by Novak and Knowles (1992) and also reflects the altruistic reasons that attracted career changers (Serow, 1993) and Chambers (2002) who found that the altruism was balanced with personal benefits.
Additionally, this study found that some male and female interviewees noted that after raising a child or family at home, work in school became more attractive because of their increased awareness of, and interest in children.

One participant was attracted by the challenge of working in schools, and reported that this had attracted them to teaching. They recounted how their previous employment lacked the challenge that they sought in the profession of teaching. The teacher indicated that this was linked to promotion and they had ambitions to become a head teacher.

One participant started on a journey into higher education, but did not decide to teach until completing a degree. She was classified as an ‘accidental’ entrant to teaching in the study.

“I loved my time at the university, it was a real change, and I think I changed as a person ....While I was there...I drifted into teaching if anything, there were lots of small changes...I never set out to be a teacher ...”

Teaching for this second career teacher was a last minute decision, delayed until a degree had been attained, and even then, there was considerable uncertainty about the direction within teaching. This was also enhanced by uncertainty to take the primary or secondary route when training. This was unusual in this study, as many participants reported to have nurtured ambitions to become teachers, even as they entered their first careers.

Some teachers in the study commented that teaching was an early ambition, but one that could not be achieved because of their life circumstances at the time. It was an ambition that was not in reach until their lives and teaching itself, had changed. An important point to note is that entry to the primary teaching profession in England has changed a great deal since 1964 when the first participant in this study chose their initial career. Since then, there has been a range of reforms to higher education, teacher training and the profession itself, referred to in previous chapters. It is possible that each of the participants in this study faced differing entry requirements and induction methods. The trajectory of the reforms has been to widen access to teaching, and to make the profession more accessible to the second career teacher. There are a range of higher education qualifications available, from a variety of institutions. Qualifications can now
be completed on a unit-based and part-time basis, such as the Foundation Degree that had been taken by many of the participants. Teaching now has an expanding number of multiple entry routes. As circumstances have changed, it seems likely that teaching has become more of an achievable ambition to some in the study. As the profession moved towards them by reforming its entry standards, many moved towards the profession by studying in higher education and gaining qualifications.

4.1 k Discussion

As referred to in previous chapters, there have been other studies into the choice of teaching as a career. Day et al (2007) in the VITAE research of 309 teachers asked the participants why they entered teaching. Their responses were grouped into these areas:

- Making a difference – making a positive impact on pupils’ lives (57%)
- Professional challenge – including the interest and reward offered by teaching (11%)
- Personal – including holidays and job security (10%)
- Identity – reasons such as identity, status within the community and increased self-worth (10%)
- Subject – teachers who want to teach their subject area (9%)
- Accidental – a small group who had not intended to teach (3%)

(Day et al. 2007)

There are important differences between the findings of this study, and that of Day et al. The Day research was carried out with secondary and primary school teachers and mixed traditional entry and second career teachers. By far the largest category for the choice of teaching was that of making a difference to the lives of the pupils.

Only five of the teachers surveyed in this study, 20%, found that making a positive impact on pupils’ lives, ‘making a Difference’, was an attraction to the profession, much lower than the 57% of the Day et al. study.

In this study, the predominant attraction to teaching was that of the identity of being a teacher and its associated status and sense of self-worth. This contrasts greatly with the Day study, and even allowing for grouping responses and possible mis-reporting, it is a major difference. This study indicates that personal reasons such as financial benefit and
time factors were equally ranked with making a difference to the lives of the pupils, ranked third.

The high number of responses to the attraction of the teacher identity may be explained when the previous working life of the respondents is examined. Nine of the teachers in the study were ex-teaching assistants, the Parallel Turners. When their responses were explored, one was attracted to teaching to make a difference to pupil’s lives, and one by the personal challenge of teaching. Seven out of the nine all saw the identity of a teacher and its associated status and respect as an attraction to the profession. This is shown in the diagram below. At the time of choosing to be a teacher, all were already working in schools, and unlikely to select the personal sphere, as they already had some access to some of the emotional rewards of working in a school environment. They had some access to the life of a teacher such as the challenges and the personal attractions such as holidays. This may have originally attracted them to becoming a teaching assistant, but not a teacher. It is likely that they turned to teaching to gain the respect and self-worth that being a teacher would bring, as has been discussed previously, in the section where they were labeled Parallel Turners. This difference between the study and the Day et al. research is important, as it highlights the second career teacher and the hinterland of their previous working lives in particular. When moving into teaching, the Teaching Assistants did not have far to go, as they had parallel employment, and that proximity is highlighted in this response.

The Dislocatory and Evolutionary Turners showed a range of attractions, and no clear link between attraction and the change decision, which has to be set in the context of a previous working life, as indicated previously. Attraction to the profession is not the complete picture. It has to be contrasted with a previous career, which may have lasted many years, and may have retention attractions of its own. As suggested earlier, the decision to become a teacher may have been a long process and the attraction of teaching has to be balanced against the forces of retention, in a kind of push-pull effect, as well as the effects of other, external forces such as economic change, unemployment or family and personal dynamics. The effects of employment change must also be considered, as the profession has changed substantially since the first teacher in this study entered the profession. There are many factors in this, including entry requirements, training formats and the bursary offered by the Teacher Training Agency. All are likely to have some effect on teacher attraction. Diagram 4.9 overleaf, indicates attraction and ‘Turner’ type.
Diagram  4.9 Career, Attraction to Teaching and Change Category

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>Previous Career Length</th>
<th>Attraction</th>
<th>Change Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Albert</td>
<td>8 yrs</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>Evolutionary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barry</td>
<td>16 yrs</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>Dislocatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cherry</td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
<td>Making a Difference</td>
<td>Parallel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denise</td>
<td>20 yrs</td>
<td>Making a Difference</td>
<td>Evolutionary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elaine</td>
<td>11 yrs</td>
<td>Making a Difference</td>
<td>Parallel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felicity</td>
<td>34 yrs</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>Parallel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerald</td>
<td>31 yrs</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>Evolutionary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harry</td>
<td>4 yrs</td>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>Dislocatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lindy</td>
<td>29 yrs</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>Parallel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noreen</td>
<td>16 yrs</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>Parallel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rita</td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
<td>Accidental</td>
<td>Evolutionary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandra</td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>Evolutionary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracey</td>
<td>13 yrs</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magda</td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>Parallel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alice</td>
<td>12 yrs</td>
<td>Professional Challenge</td>
<td>Dislocatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brenda</td>
<td>25 yrs</td>
<td>Making a Difference</td>
<td>Evolutionary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles</td>
<td>21 yrs</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>Dislocatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doreen</td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>Parallel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estelle</td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>Evolutionary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finola</td>
<td>40 yrs</td>
<td>Identity</td>
<td>Parallel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgina</td>
<td>22 yrs</td>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>Evolutionary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbert</td>
<td>23 yrs</td>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>Dislocatory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irene</td>
<td>26 yrs</td>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>Parallel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>8 yrs</td>
<td>Making a Difference</td>
<td>Evolutionary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In summary, the study examined attraction to teaching. A model was generated, by synthesizing the models generated by Day et al. (2007) and Novak & Knowles (1992). Differences were noted, as this study is of primary school teachers. The largest attraction to teaching was that of the Identity (n=11) of the teacher, and suggests that the traditional respect of being a teacher has its attractions, with four of the six males in this group. Many participants mentioned ‘self-improvement’ in responses, making the comparison with previous employment. Personal rewards (n=5) included raised income and long holidays, as well as the convenience of child care, as well as the security of regular employment in teaching. This last factor may be important in an area in industrial decline and increased employment tensions. Making a Difference (n=5) was seen as an attraction that offered the rewards of both social and educational aspects of working with children. Professional Challenge (n=1), and entering teaching by Accident (n=1) were noted as attractions by a small number of participants. In the Parallel
Turners, seven of the ex-teaching assistants saw identity as an attraction to the profession. When they chose to be a teacher, all were already working in schools, and it is likely that they turned to teaching to gain the respect and self-worth that being a teacher would bring. The Dislocatory and Evolutionary Turners showed a range of attractions, and no clear link between attraction and the change decision, which has to be set in the context of a previous working life, as indicated previously.

Whatever the attractions to teaching, once a career commences, then the commitment to teaching can vary. As previously stated, one of the arguments in favour of second career teachers is that they are proofed by life experience and that their previous work experience can help them retain their commitment, although this effect may be mediated by their generally increased age. The next section moves on to the commitment strand and starts by examining the factors that affect the commitment level of second career teachers.

4.2 Factors affecting Teacher Commitment

This section answers the research question ‘what are the key factors affecting the commitment of second career primary teachers’

Commitment is seen as vital to good teaching. In previous chapters the study referred to how commitment is sometimes seen as a proxy indicator of teacher retention, where high commitment levels can be translated into predictors of longer careers. This is especially important in the case of the second career teacher, who as a career switcher could be seen as possessing employment mobility, and as an older latecomer to the profession, may be subject to reduced commitment due to the effects of age and teacher stage. As discussed in previous chapters, commitment to teaching can be variable and be affected in positive and negative direction by a variety of factors. The positive and negative attributes reported by participants will be dealt with separately, starting with factors that affect commitment in a positive direction.
4.2a Positive Factors Affecting Commitment

The diagram 4.10 below shows the various positive factors reported by the participants in the study. The three major factors found by this study to positively affect commitment were the support of colleagues, working with children, and the support of family, with fifteen of the teachers in the study giving these three factors. Each positive factor will now be dealt with in turn:

Diagram 4.10  Factors positively affecting commitment.

4.2b Support of Colleagues

Five of the teachers reported the support of colleagues as important, and the phrases ‘team work’ and ‘support of colleagues’ occurred in many of the follow-up interviews. Cherry, noted:

“I think that it's the support of people that I work with – we are a real team here and we all help each other.....I’m not sure that I could do it without their help”

Some respondents noted the appreciation and the feedback from colleagues, and how their support made them feel valued. Most, but not all of this group were in the early
years of teaching, echoing the findings of Day et al. (2007). Albert considers his colleagues as being vital to sustaining his commitment:

“It has to be your colleagues and the improvement that they can bring. That spirit of working as a team, they can all help can’t they, because you get support and being part of a network that can help”

He went on to relate that team work had another dimension:

“I think that some teachers that aren’t committed are isolated, they are not part of the team…I’ve seen that in other schools, where people just go off and do their own thing”

The support of other staff was detailed during many of the interviews, with examples being given of shared experiences and how work was shared to alleviate workload such as planning and sharing of teaching ideas. Magda said that in her school, that:

“Here, we all work together, and I suppose that we are ‘all of a muchness’”

Some other interviews also stressed a social, as well as a professional aspect to this support, showing how personal support from co-workers extended into the private sphere, with friendships being formed and social networks being established. Many examples of the informal support network amongst teachers were related. These networks may be supportive, but can cause conflicting loyalties, and this is dealt with in greater detail in a later section.

The three schools in the interview phase were all undergoing change. The teachers interviewed were all under some degree of pressure. This varied between schools, but was constant and widely reported by the teachers who took part in the research. It is likely that the shared challenges faced in school mean that a network of support is established between colleagues. The teamwork reported by the teachers is part of this, and can aid commitment, especially in school situations where people are brought together in response to perceived external threat.

One difficulty is that the support of colleagues was found to be a complex concept. Interviews showed that this support may be one particular individual (a classroom co-worker for example), or an entire school. Teachers at Wold Primary cited the supportive nature of the school, and its head teacher. The school is relatively small and all the teachers in the school are second career teachers with similar origins as teaching
assistants. There is a high social element to their support. In the other schools in the interview phase, this was often defined as being a ‘team’, but there was blurring between the personal and the professional. This complex collegiate support may be established in the social sphere, but in many cases it was reported to be professional, with elements of workload sharing and team work within schools and classrooms seemingly lightening the burden of teaching, and aiding commitment. There is a link to the supportive factor school organization (n=3), where teachers reported that the school as an organization supported their commitment. Both are school related factors, and there may be some blurring, especially where social and professional spheres interact, for example in a smaller school.

4.2c Working with children

Working with children was cited by four of the teachers as central to maintaining their commitment, with some teachers reporting that ‘the main appreciation comes from the kids’. Harry, noted that working with children:

“gives you the biggest commitment…. if you don’t have a good classroom, or you didn’t have the resources, then your lessons would suffer, and the kids wouldn’t enjoy it and your lessons would be rubbish…if they enjoy it, then that is the biggest reward”

Others felt that it was the thrill of helping children and, ‘that light bulb moment when children really learn’ that strengthened their commitment. At River Primary Felicity, felt that some children “live in chaos, they come from a mixture of backgrounds...you have got to be there for them” and working in her school with such children strengthened her commitment, and provided a professional barrier to mediate lowered commitment levels. There is some degree of fuzziness about this concept though, as some attributions could be pedagogic and others in the caring sphere. They all retain a direct connection with children, and teaching itself, and so are central in maintaining commitment. In previous chapters, other research has shown that working with children was shown to be a major factor affecting teacher commitment, and a major attractor to the profession for second career teachers. There was however little connection between those who reported that they had always wanted to teach as an attractor to the profession, and those whose commitment was maintained by working with children. A force that initially attracts to the profession may not be one that sustains commitment.
4.2d Family

The support of a family in sustaining commitment was cited as important by five of the teachers in the study, all were female. The survey group all agreed that their family helped to keep them committed. However, family support was shown to be diverse in nature by the data from interviews. Many of the teachers made reference to families, especially when discussing aspects of shortage of time, and the extension of their working lives into their private lives, and their comments are included here. How a family or life-partner provides that support varied greatly between interviewees and reflected the structure of the family. Some family members assist directly in work, helping with preparation, or getting involved in other ways. Denise’s partner, however, provided support by keeping their distance and making no demands on time:

“he is really helpful and doesn’t get involved ....so I don’t have anyone to moan at me to put the books away....” (Denise)

This is support that appears to translate into absence. Lindy’s working life is similar, with work taking priority:

“I’m lucky because my husband works away, and I don’t see him during the week, he comes home on Fridays, and obviously he doesn’t want me doing work...but he understands that there will be times that I do..

If he leaves me to get on with it, then I can get on with my assessments, marking, and I can get that done at the beginning, then I’m all yours at the end..

But not all men are like that, I’m lucky, with the kids growing up

I am not very good at work life balance – I’ve got grandkids now, and I can’t have them – I haven’t got time for them, it takes over your life”

Lindy admits that the week is taken up by work, and then intrudes into the family time during the weekend. Although she admits to being poor at work-life balance, the demands of work seem quite high. They intrude into the relationship between Lindy and her grandchildren. Her husband works away from home during the week, and he spends the week at work. Her work pattern is similar, and Lindy reports long hours during the working week, but work still intrudes into the weekend. Lindy’s working pattern says much about families and work in modern times, as it does about teaching.
Elaine has a sympathetic family, who provide support. Work still intrudes into family time, however:

“The one thing that does help is my family- my daughters, they sympathise, but want to know why, well “I thought we were coming to yours for Sunday dinner?” and I say that I can’t because I have my reports to do, and they say you shouldn’t be doing things like that on a Sunday...and they have to be done, - and I’m not the kind of person that if they have to be done, well that’s it, I can’t leave it, but I have a very supportive husband and he is just great in situations like that”

It is likely that some families may not understand the professional demands made on a teacher’s time. Rita notes that she is the first professional in her family, and her work patterns are often not understood by family members, who can make demands on her time:

“I don’t think that my family are a great support to be honest.. they can add to the pressure and be quite a distraction, maintaining a work life balance can be quite hard”

Rita indicates that school can make great demands on her time, and her family seem to resent this. Felicity admits the support she gains from her family, but admits that family life can intrude into her role as a teacher:

“I have two teenage daughters, and that’s not all positive..I mean they are great , they print stuff off and do all that, but.. If we have a barney, (argument) then I am upset, and I have to put my teacher’s hat on and my big smiley face on and be there again which is sometimes really difficult”

Sandra, like Felicity, gains support from her family, with even her children helping in her role. This indicates how much the working life of a teacher extends into private family life.

“I have a very supportive husband and kids, they are fantastic, I mean when I started, he was just great he helped with the kids, and when I started work , the kids even help.. they are very understanding and help such a lot...very understanding , I just couldn’t do it without my family.”
There are many varied responses, but the common strand is that the working life of a teacher carries on at home, extending its influence to the family and the home environment. Primarily, it affects the personal life of the teacher and has a secondary effect on the family members. Time is a major factor in responses, with families negotiating the time of the teacher.

There is clearly a spectrum of support, with some families actively getting involved with the tasks of the teacher, whilst other families and partners recognize the sacrifices that teachers make and become less involved, giving the teacher time and space. Others fail, with Rita commenting that her family provide little support, and provide distractions. Family support can be anywhere on this spectrum, echoing the comments of Goodson that ‘the personal is more important than the professional’ and the effect of family in supporting a career seems important. The position of some of the teachers as the lone professional must also be understood, as their extended working hours and role may not be fully understood in families where work relationships may be broadly traditional.

It could be also possible that the supportive family has been supporting this person through an extended, complex working life, involving a previous career, higher education and a career change, and the relationships within that family are already flexible, and forming and re-forming around work related issues. They are therefore capable of providing support to the teacher because of previous experiences.

The nature of support by the family is complex. Just how the family supports the teacher can vary between being absent, helping with tasks, or more commonly, arranging family life around the demands made by work on the teacher. Many of the responses referenced time management, or lack of time, and this was indicated in the modified version of Intensification proposed by Hargreaves. Reduced time for relaxation and scarcity of time to prepare for lessons are both features of intensification, and can be seen here. The support from family was often demonstrated in this study by the intrusion of work into home spaces and home time. Hargreaves suggested that Intensification was voluntarily supported by teachers, and misrecognized as professionalism, and its intrusion into the family and personal lives of the teachers is documented here.

4.2e Other Supportive Factors

There was a wide range of other supportive factors. Two teachers cited the experience that they had gained from their previous career as providing support. This confirms the suggestion that second careers may be proofed by previous experience. The theme of
one response was that the teacher would not repeat the mistakes of their previous career and limited their involvement in teaching, thus preventing possible burn-out. The teacher gave examples of how they controlled their involvement, and effectively managed their commitment in order not to repeat previous experiences. A further two teachers reported that the school as an organization provided a supportive environment in which to teach, and that strengthened their commitment. Questioning in interviews showed that this differed slightly this from ‘support of colleagues’ factor, by giving examples of the way that the head teacher or the management of the school organization itself supported their commitment. Again, there is a possibility of blurring here, as with within a small colegiately-run school, there may be little difference between the management of a school and colleagues.

One teacher reported that the profession itself supported their commitment, citing teacher trade unions and the then GTC (General Teaching Council) and its research and publications.

One teacher also felt that their commitment was maintained by their individual sense of independence and ‘staying on the task’, providing self-support. They were aware that they were individually responsible for their life as a teacher. This may not be surprising, considering the experience of a lengthy career, protracted higher education and the ability to negotiate an often turbulent school work environment.

Nias (1981) suggested that commitment is multidimensional in nature and affected by the contextual issues in the school. The teachers in the study seem to confirm that school based elements are important such as appreciation from children, and the support of colleagues and the school organization. It seems inevitable that proximal issues will dominate commitment, as they affect the teacher’s everyday working life. The influence of the family is notable, but not surprising, as the teachers working life now extends into family space and time, and the support of the family is important to maintaining teaching and staying committed. Some teachers in this study noted that teaching, unlike their previous career extended into the rest of their life, outside working hours and into the home. To some extent, the family seem to be displaced by work, and their response to this was seen as ‘supportive’, ie accepting, or ‘demanding’, when time would not be surrendered. All of the three major responses were complex and there was a high degree of variance in individual responses. This was reflected with other attributions, where factors that contributed to sustained commitment were very individual in nature, and reflected life events and previous careers.
Day, et al. in the VITAE (2007) study of 309 teachers, found that the following combination of factors were mentioned most frequently by teachers as contributing to their sustained commitment.

**Colleagues (63%)**

**Leadership (76%)**

**Personal Support (95%) (including family)**

In some way, this reflects the responses from this study, with the personal support of family, and colleagues rating highly, despite category issues. The leadership of the school was mentioned in teacher interviews, but not always favourably. There are difficulties in comparing this study with that of Day’s, as the Day et al method is based on the analysis of a large number of interviews, whilst this study is a direct question, backed up by interviews. It should also be remembered that the Day et al research is based on primary and secondary teachers from a variety of origins, not second career teachers. The main difference is the high numbers of teachers in this study that cite working with children. This may be due to the exclusively primary school nature of the research. It may also be that, as second career teachers, the teachers in this study find working with children rewarding, in contrast to work in a previous career.

**Diagram 4.11** below, shows current positive commitment attribution and initial attraction to the profession. There seems little direct link between initial attraction and what keeps the teachers in the study committed. For example, there is little correlation between those attracted with the identity of a teacher, with professional support, or support from that of colleagues, and a range of commitments are shown for those who sought the identity of a teacher. The contextual and the personal, almost individual nature of work experiences seems to echo Nias, and may mean that these factors will affect commitment in many ways, echoing Nias’s concept of how commitment is multidimensional. There is one small exception as some teachers in the study whose commitment to teaching was supported by working with children, was attracted to the identity sphere to gain respect and increase their self-worth. Of the four working with children responses, three were in the identity sphere, with one selecting the professional challenge of working with children. One teacher from this group, Gerald, comments that he has ‘an ideal picture of a teacher’ and ‘an old fashioned, almost Mr. Chips style view of education’ that he admits is idealized. He went on that to recount that this can lead to tensions with others, but he feels that it maintains him as a teacher, and he finds it
important. His commitment is aided by the satisfaction of working with children, and this seems directly linked to his individualized identity as a teacher.

**Diagram 4.11 Positive Commitment and Attraction to Teaching**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>Positive Commitment</th>
<th>Attraction to Teaching</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Albert</td>
<td>Support of Colleagues</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barry</td>
<td>School Organisation</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cherry</td>
<td>Support of Colleagues</td>
<td>Making a Difference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denise</td>
<td>Support of Colleagues</td>
<td>Making a Difference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elaine</td>
<td>School Organization</td>
<td>Making a Difference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felicity</td>
<td>Family Support</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerald</td>
<td>Working with children</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harry</td>
<td>Working with children</td>
<td>Personal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lindy</td>
<td>Support of Colleagues</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noreen</td>
<td>Working with children</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rita</td>
<td>Self-Support</td>
<td>Accidental</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandra</td>
<td>Family Support</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracey</td>
<td>No return</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magda</td>
<td>Support of Colleagues</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alice</td>
<td>Family Support</td>
<td>Professional Challenge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brenda</td>
<td>Previous Career</td>
<td>Making a Difference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles</td>
<td>Professional Support</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doreen</td>
<td>Working with children</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estelle</td>
<td>Previous Career</td>
<td>Personal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finola</td>
<td>Family Support</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgina</td>
<td>School Organization</td>
<td>Personal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbert</td>
<td>No Clear Reason</td>
<td>Personal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irene</td>
<td>Family Support</td>
<td>Personal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>No Clear Reason</td>
<td>Making a Difference</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Commitment to teaching may vary over time, and for the teachers in this study, appears not to be tightly linked to their initial attraction to the profession. The commitment of a teacher can vary throughout an extended training period, and will develop throughout a career, and its multidimensional nature will be affected by contextual issues including the family and the teacher’s wider life. Having explored the positive factors affecting commitment, the next section will explore the negative factors.
4.2f Negative Factors Affecting Commitment

The next section explores the negative pressures on commitment, and explores some connected background issues. A range of pressures challenged the sustained commitment of the teachers in this study, but by far the largest single factor was government policy. The diagram 4.12 below shows the responses to the question “what lowers your commitment to teaching?”

Diagram 4.12 Negative Attributions

![Diagram showing negative factors affecting commitment]

In the survey of twenty-three teachers, eight, or thirty-six percent reported that government policy was the primary cause in reducing their commitment. The teachers in this group were generally older than the rest of the cohort. There was additional evidence in the survey measure, and in teacher interviews, with many teachers citing examples of how policy affecting their working lives in a negative sense. Gerald considers that policy interventions are based on a lack of trust in the teaching profession:

“I think that the government doesn’t trust us to do our job…they are dictatorial, but they are clever. they set it up and drop huge hints….and everyone then tries to follow that….they set it up, drop hints and all the organizations seem to have a hidden agenda where they don’t trust us…they won’t let us get on with it and it gets in the way.”
Cherry felt that the pressure of constant policy change affected her commitment:

“There has been a lot of pressure here, and I suppose a lot of this is from the targets and the tables and the government, so I suppose much of that pressure is the government. That’s what stops you being committed, constant pressure and changing the goalposts.”

The idea of constant, government – led change was a common theme in responses. One example is the response from Denise on the theme of the primary school curriculum. Denise admitted that change was a natural process, but considered it was wasteful, and that her commitment was affected by:

“Government changes...we have adapted to that...when it changes.... This year with the curriculum, when that changes, well its more work, I don’t like that because you have to do work all over again... I mean I don’t mind change, things have to be developed, but we are throwing stuff away...and as a profession it’s not good”

This response demonstrates the micro effect of macro national education policy change. One example is the area of the curriculum. This has been subject to constant change since its introduction as the National Curriculum in the 1988 Education Act. There were also many reviews of the primary school curriculum carried out in the period before the interview sessions. A team led by Robin Alexander had undertaken an independent review of the primary curriculum, (Alexander, 2009). In parallel, the then Labour administration had launched an additional ‘Independent’ report led by Sir Jim Rose (DfES, 2009). A modified National Curriculum was in the process of implementation by the time of the election in 2010. Many schools and Local Authorities had started to re-organise and re-plan their curriculum to match the new proposals. Denise’s response demonstrates the frustration that she felt when this effort was wasted, as another review of the primary curriculum was announced by the new Secretary of State for Education of the new coalition administration in mid-2010, with indications that the direction of the curriculum was that of a return to a more formal, knowledge-based primary curriculum (DfE, 2011). A draft English, Mathematics and Science curriculum was published in early 2012 (DfE, 2012) , and consultation in other curriculum areas continue.

It is not always as easy as this to see the hand of the government in other changes. Some respondents are aware that government decisions are implemented locally, usually by
the local authority, or the management of the school. Fen Primary is an “Improving School’ and is implementing a government developed school improvement policy.

Rita seems aware of the attribution issues:

“Much of the pressure is school improvement, so I suppose it is government policy.....although it could be the school leader, or management, because it’s all really together isn’t it? I suppose it’s so difficult to put your finger on it with the origin , because I suppose what one starts off, someone puts into practice”.

Teaching in the same school, Sandra seems to agree:

“It’s the local authority. .but it’s the government really I suppose. I know we have to do these things, but it’s the way that they are implemented, and what happens here..”

The implementation of national policy in a local context seems to vary in the schools in the study. Some school management had the ability to buffer and mediate that change process. Other schools, like Fen Primary, were at the sharp end of many initiatives. Three of the participants reporting government policy were the oldest teachers with longer lengths of service.

School based factors affected under a quarter of the teachers, and this highlights the issue of attribution. Many teachers are affected by the local implementation of national policy and attribute it to local factors, such as the head teacher. When responses were examined, the school based factors were invariably pressure to improve from local authority, and consultants. They also reflect the leadership style and individual management methods prevailing in the school. Barry comments:

“I had the opportunity of working with a deputy head and it was the most miserable time of my life...working at that particular school...I remember going home and being so depressed..and I didn’t feel I was being treated fairly.... I was...this particular person was negative, aggressive and she was unpleasant with the children, she could be cruel with the children, and she was negative and unsupportive- and you need that support- it’s crucial”

Rapid change was identified by fourteen percent of the survey. This was differentiated in interviews as related to school, or more usually local education authority in replies,
and not clearly attributed to government policy. This response being given from
teachers of all levels of responsibility, including management teams and head teachers.
As previously mentioned, all the schools in the interview phase were under considerable
pressure, and this may have magnified the response. One teacher reported rules and
regulations, as a factor in lowering their commitment, citing health and safety rules,
with others citing paperwork. A high number (four teachers, or eighteen percent) could
find no clear reason that could reduce their commitment.

4.2g Discussion

This section will discuss some of the aspects relating to what lowers and builds
commitment. Diagram 4.13 overleaf, shows the teachers who took part in the research,
together with the elements of their commitment.
Examinations of the table shows little direct link between the factors that build commitment and the factors that lower it. It is possible that this demonstrates how commitment to teaching is shaped by many influences and experiences. The teachers in this study had a myriad of personal and work experiences that may have shaped their commitment in an individual way.
In comparison, the participants in the Day et al, VITAE research (2007) found that following factors challenged their sustained commitment and efficacy:

**Leadership (58%)**

**Pupil Behaviour (64%)**

**Workload (68%)**

Initially there seem to be considerable differences between the findings of Day et al and this study, but they are not as great as they first appear. There are again category issues, for example the Day category Leadership and this study’s category of ‘school based issues’ are perhaps the same thing. Workload for many teachers was certainly mentioned by the teachers in this study in passing, but the origin of the heavy workload was clearly attributed to the government. Day et al. (2007) found that teachers with long service attributed their reduced efficacy to government policy. Some of the teachers in this study who cited government policy were older, and had long length of service, but others had a variety of ages and shorter teaching careers. This may be a highly politicised group of second career teachers, or more likely, the then recent general election (May 2010) may have focused their thinking. The election was called just after the initial interview visits in schools started and there were discussions of policy in staff room discussions. Education did become an election issue, and as research continued, there was at first a hiatus, and then a steady change of policies and an introduction of new proposals. There was much press discussion of education policies and publicity about the direction of education under the new coalition administration. This developed as the research process continued, with one head teacher defining it as a ‘see-saw’ of change. Another possible explanation is offered by Resta, Huling and Rainwater (2001) who suggest that the second career teacher has limited patience for bureaucracy, but this seems to allow for mis-attribution, of political policy as bureaucratic meddling.

Many saw workload and the time factors that were involved with it as something that ‘went with the territory’ and perhaps that this may be the first indication that as second career teachers they were to some extent proofed against the demands made on them. One third of the study had been teaching assistants, and already aware of teacher workload, even if they had not experienced it themselves.

It is of course possible that this is evidence of misrecognized professionalism suggested by Hargreaves, where the features of Intensification such as work overload, lack of time to relax or prepare are absorbed into working practices. The responses of “it goes with
the job” and “part of the territory” could then be seen in a new light, perhaps as indications of acceptance or in Hargreaves’ terms, voluntary support. This area will be discussed later, but there is clearly a strong link between the responses of the teachers in the study and some aspects of the intensification process.

There was one particularly interesting response in this study. Pupil behavior was mentioned by sixty-four percent of Day’s teachers and none of the teachers in this study attributed it to lowering commitment. This may be a result of the fact that the Day research is cross-phase and secondary teachers have influenced the data. Discipline and behavior are seen as a concern for secondary teachers (Galton & MacBeath, 2008). Another factor is that several schools in the study were under pressure, it is possible that behavior issues were not a problem, either because of the high-performing atmosphere of Wold Primary, or the effective discipline policies and systems in use at Fen and River primary schools. The latter schools were in the Improving Schools Programme (ISP) for several years before the interviews. The programme examined pedagogic practice carefully, and class and pupil behavior would have been carefully managed. Both schools had behavior management systems in place, involving teaching assistants, secure places, clear instructions and affirmations on classroom walls. In Fen Primary, the school was divided into sections and keypad entry systems and locked doors prevented unauthorized access or exit. The schools employed teaching assistants with responsibility for individual children to encourage learning and to prevent a child disrupting the lesson. The ‘bad class’ and the ‘class from hell’ were mentioned in commitment trend responses, but often in narratives of personal survival and recovering commitment. There was a sense of such situations being set firmly in the past.

In summary, there were three major factors aiding commitment:

- The support of colleagues, with many interview responses highlighting teamwork.

- Working with children, aided commitment, but interviews showed that this again had both a social and educational side, with some teachers stressing the social support of children and others the feedback from learning and achieving results.

- The support of family also was a major factor, but in the main this was shown to be an acceptance of the demands of the teacher’s working life and acceptance of a diminished role.
There were a variety of other minor factors including previous the career providing support. There appeared to be no direct link to attraction. Reduced commitment was heavily attributed to government policy, with school based issues being another element that lowered commitment. In interviews, rapid change was cited as lowering commitment, rapid change. There seemed to be little link between negative and positive factors.

4.3 Commitment Trend

The majority of teachers in the research, nearly seventy percent, found that their current commitment trend was static. In the questionnaire phase, the data seemed to back this up, with one question asking “I can see myself looking to change career soon’, all teachers in the survey disagreed. Interviews showed commitment to be high, although many teachers had admitted that it did vary. To examine future trend, a further question was asked if they could see themselves being a teacher for the rest of their life. Two disagreed slightly, but all others agreed. This pattern was echoed when the survey asked if ‘becoming a teacher was a good decision on my part’ with only one participant disagreeing, the others agreeing that it was. Reported commitment in the survey phase seemed high. The full survey results are located in the Appendix A4.

Interviews, however, showed that this was much more nuanced, and a complex story of how this had varied over the school year, or by the context of teaching was built up. Many teachers reported that commitment often dropped at the end of the year, but were keen to report their level as steady, almost as a matter of pride. Others acknowledged that a ‘bad class’, as mentioned previously, or management related issues or the interaction between the two, had brought about a drop in commitment at some time in their career. When asked about commitment level, Felicity commented:

“If you’d asked me that last year! I would have said that I was leaving teaching...it was bad...I had the class from hell...and no support...I was very down”

Felicity then went on to report recovering commitment with a steady trend. There were reports of adverse school circumstances and pressure to improve from management that had nearly led to a withdrawal from the profession. Pressure from teacher observations, linked to the ISP programme in some schools, where regular monitoring of performance takes place was seen as a source of lowered commitment. The next section will examine
the detail of their responses by examining the responses from teachers with rising commitment, and then those with falling commitment.

4.3a Rising Commitment

A total of four teachers, seventeen percent, in the research reported rising commitment levels. Diagram 4.14 below, shows details of the teachers, their commitment tend and attribution. As can be seen, two are male (Barry, Harry) and are located at River Primary. Barry reports rising levels of commitment and states that his commitment is sustained by the support of colleagues and the “meeting the challenge” of change. Harry reports that his commitment level is sustained by working with children, as does Doreen. Brenda refers to the fact that her experience in her previous employment as a designer has maintained her committed to teaching.

Diagram 4.14 Commitment Trend and Attribution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>LOS</th>
<th>Trend</th>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Evidence Base</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Barry</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Rising</td>
<td>+ Colleagues</td>
<td>Survey + Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harry</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Rising</td>
<td>+ Working with children</td>
<td>Survey + Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brenda</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>rising</td>
<td>+ Previous employment</td>
<td>Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doreen</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Rising</td>
<td>+ Working with children</td>
<td>Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rita</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Falling</td>
<td>-School management/gov. policy</td>
<td>Survey + Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandra</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Falling</td>
<td>-School based issues</td>
<td>Survey + Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Falling</td>
<td>-School based issues</td>
<td>Survey</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LOS = Length of Service

All the teachers who report rising commitment levels in the study have under nine years of service, and all have varying attributions. There appears to be no consensus in the responses, in an interview Barry comments on how change has affected him, how he has coped with it, and how he has developed as a teacher:

“Most of the time I can see the value for that change... I can see how the various strategies have been implemented over the years...they have been difficult to take on board, but I can see how they have developed me as a teacher, because I have taken them on board and I can now see the value of that change..”
Barry reported that he had suffered from falling commitment levels in the past, but has now changed his practice, leading to approval from the management due to a successful series of teacher observations. His response centered on his classroom practice, and he found the school organization as the major factor in his raised commitment, and cited examples of how he had developed and was given positive feedback on his teaching. This had the effect of enthusing him, and raising his commitment. Harry also reported rising commitment and reported that his commitment was kept high by working with children. His interview outlined his independence as a classroom practitioner and how he was motivated by improving his professional practice. He also reported that his experience in his previous career had ensured that he managed his commitment level, as he had been highly committed to his initial career, but had received no recognition or reward. His raised commitment was complex and affected by several factors. Both Harry and Barry were Dislocatory Turners.

4.3b Falling Commitment

Three teachers, thirteen percent, reported falling commitment. All were female and two were located at Fen Primary. An additional point to note is that the teacher who left the research, and later the profession (anonymised as Tracey), was also located at the school. Both Rita and Sandra reported falling commitment levels and reported that school based issues reduced their commitment. It should also be noted that by the end of the study, all had left the school. As previously reported the school was taking part in the Improving School Programme (ISP) and interviews reported that they were under pressure to improve. Another teacher, June, located at Grange Primary also reported reduced commitment.

The teachers with falling levels all cited school-based issues as the factor that lowered their commitment to teaching, and the two teachers in the interview phase both gave extended examples of pressure of work and their relationship with the management of the school as additional factors. The school was undergoing a rapid change as it sought to improve its performance. There was a high degree of involvement of outside agencies and a rigorous approach to school improvement. The management of the school was an intense focus of attention as well as classroom teaching. Both teachers reported good lesson observations, and reported that it was other pressures that lowered their commitment.

As indicated previously, previous research has suggested that commitment is often linked to the age of the teacher, or to the length of their career, the next section
examines the commitment trends of the teachers in the research and explores its links to their age and length of service.

4.3c Commitment Trend and Professional Life Phase

One method of analysing teachers’ working lives is viewing their careers as a series of phases with different themes. Many are based on the original work of Sikes (1985) who noted that occupational development, identity and ageing are all linked, and proposed an initial model of teachers careers based on age.

In Chapter Two, the various age and stage models of teacher career were examined, alongside their link to commitment. Early models were based exclusively on the age of the teacher. There are difficulties for the second career teacher in this, as examining career patterns this way “fails to take into account experiences of late entrants” (Day et al, 2007). Many of the models were designed when the common route into teaching was directly from higher education, and the relationship between age and experience was more direct.

The VITAE research project offers a possible model that has been synthesized from others. The model is multi-dimensional and takes into account other factors as well as commitment. It is a useful framework for examining the commitment of teachers over a career, and may have some strengths in analyzing the commitment of second career teachers. Diagram 4.15 overleaf, locates the teachers in this research study into some of the phases suggested by Day et al(2007).

In the next section, the study will examine the suitability of the model for this task, by populating the model with the teachers from this study, and examining if this model can be useful in interpreting the responses from the second career teachers in the study.
**Diagram 4.15 - Participants and their Professional Life Phase ( Vitae Model)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Professional Life Phase (length of service)</th>
<th>Teacher, age</th>
<th>Reported Commitment Trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-3 Commitment Support &amp; Challenge</td>
<td>June, 28</td>
<td>Falling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harry, 28</td>
<td>Rising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cherry, 40</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lindy, 49</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-7 Identity and Efficacy in Classroom</td>
<td>Felicity, 54</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tracey, 34</td>
<td><strong>Left Profession</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alice, 39</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Charles, 42</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Doreen, 43</td>
<td>Rising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Denise, 43</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Magda, 44</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brenda, 46</td>
<td>Rising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Finula, 63</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8-15 Managing Changes in Roles and Identity</td>
<td>Barry, 54</td>
<td>Rising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Elaine, 36</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Irene, 51</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gerald, 56</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rita, 48</td>
<td><strong>Falling</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Noreen, 43</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sandra, 49</td>
<td><strong>Falling</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Albert, 39</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-23 Challenges to Motivation</td>
<td>Herbert, 56</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Georgina, 56</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Estelle, 57</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24-30 Challenges to sustaining motivation</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 + sustaining/declining motivation, ability to cope with change, looking to retire</td>
<td>None</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As can be seen in the diagram above, the teachers in the research are mostly located in the earlier life phases of the grid, as they have a length of service between two and nineteen years, and the last two sections of the model are unpopulated. This may be because of the characteristics of the sample of teachers in the survey, because of the survival of second career teachers, or may reflect on the survivability of teachers in general.

In the earliest phase 0-3 Commitment Support and Challenge Day et al in the VITAE study suggest an active period when the teacher faces the early challenges of starting a teaching career and receives support. Out of a total of four teachers in this phase, one teacher, Harry (28, 3 years of service) reports rising commitment, and one, June (28, 2 years of service) reports a falling level of commitment. Lindy (49, 3 years of service) reports her commitment level as ‘static’. She feels that she has the support of her colleagues and working ‘as a team’ maintains her commitment. She goes on to talk about her commitment:

“It’s early for me in my career, and so it hasn’t really changed – its ok I think, although I can’t see me being in this job forever, I really can’t ...I’m tired now, so lord knows what I would feel like in a few years’ time.”

As new entrants to teaching, teachers can be at high risk, as some fail to adjust to working life in school and lose efficacy, whilst others build efficacy and start to build on professional practice. Research shows that some teachers do not survive this period. As a late entrant, the second career teacher can be doubly at risk, as they also may have the issue of age related tensions about work and life. Lindy seems to be aware of her life issues as she looks into her future as a teacher.

There are nine teachers in the next phase 4-7 Identity and Efficacy in the Classroom, one teacher, Tracey, reported falling commitment levels, and left the profession during the course of the research. Two teachers, Doreen, Brenda, reported rising levels of commitment.

Day et al. suggest that this phase is one where teachers build their sense of identity and build their professional practice. They go on to propose that this is a transitional period, a crossroads, where careers can take different directions and additional responsibilities and promotion start to play a growing role in teachers professional identities. Day et al suggest that this is where many teachers start to make the choice about entering management or staying as a classroom teacher. In this study, this is the phase with the largest number of teachers reporting rising commitment, and interviews with teachers
showed that many were taking on additional responsibilities such as key stage leadership, or coordination of a curriculum subject. Not all teachers were as positive. As late comers to the profession, some were aware of the issues of age and the tensions it produces. Denise, with static commitment, (43, 7 years of service) notes that:

“I’ve come to an age where I’m still a few years from retirement and dreading the thought of working ’til 67, not because of dreading doing the job, but because of my age, I’m not going to be able to do it, what if I was poorly? and that side of it worries me .how it ends ..that sort of thing”

Part of that making a choice about the direction of a future career must be a reflection on how the teacher will cope. Denise is already considering the end of her career and its uncertain end. As a second career teacher, Denise has previous experience and a working life to compare teaching with and has already moved careers. Although she has taught for seven years, Denise appears to have the life tensions of someone in middle age. This may reflect the problem with such models, as they cannot consider the complexities of age and its inevitable effect. Day et al (2007), seem to acknowledge this suggesting that:

“while analysis of the initial VITAE teacher questionnaire indicated that there is no statistically significant difference in the distribution of older teachers (mostly late entry teachers and teachers with career breaks) in terms of their motivation, commitment and professional outlooks; nevertheless, an analysis of teachers’ work-lines suggest that although these ‘older’ teachers exhibited a similar outlook to that of their younger peers, they appeared to have different concerns and face different tensions.”

(Day et al., 2007 p.79)

Denise has the tensions of middle age, and to some extent, this may affect her decisions and choices about possible career direction. Rather than heading into management, she considers retirement and survival. This appears to be a real issue for some, but not all second career teachers.

8-15 Managing Changes in Roles and Identity is the next phase, with a total of seven teachers in this study. The model proposed by Day et al suggest that this phase can be a watershed in teachers’ professional lives, with tensions in managing both personal and
professional change. Commitment may be sustained, or may be lowering, with a sense of detachment or a loss of motivation.

In this study, Barry (54, 9 years of service) reports his commitment level as rising. He attributes this to re-training and positive feedback from school management after a successful round of teacher observations. Barry suggests that his pedagogy is now more aligned with that of the school, and that has raised his commitment. He appears to be currently managing professional change. Sandra (49, 11 years of service) reported falling commitment. She reported that:

“We are under a lot of change here, you know, new head teacher and lots of change and lots of things going on."

“Changes in planning and training, and sometimes it’s the opposite of what went on before, and that can make you flag a bit really, there are rapid changes and monitoring”

Sandra transferred to another school in the Local Authority shortly after the interview. She is still teaching. Rita (48, 10 years of service) had falling commitment levels. She was part of the management team of the school, and reported herself to be ‘ambitious’ and had completed head teacher training qualification National Professional Qualification for Headship (NPQH) and reported that there had been ‘disagreements’ about the pace of change at the school. She reported that she was ‘used to working in a high pressure environment’ and was a manager in her previous career. She went on to say that:

“I’m used to being in management but sometimes here we don’t get everyone on side and there have been some rapid changes here, it’s difficult to keep up, and that doesn’t help your commitment at all”

During the course of the research Rita went absent, and has since left the school. She is currently working at another school. For Rita, her previous experience in management did not assist in the tensions of managing schools, and she admitted in a further interview that the processes of management differed in her careers, and may not have been helpful. Both Rita and Sandra are at Fen Primary school. The tensions of managing change are made real for both of the teachers, and the phase has proved to be a real watershed for the teachers in this study, just as Day et al. propose. On the other hand, there were examples of sustained commitment. Some teachers remain committed and manage the tensions. Albert (39, 15 years of service) is a deputy head teacher and is
aware of the responsibilities of his role. He admits that that being in management can be demanding and that:

“there can be a lot to do in the day, and sometimes I have management issues, but I really don’t think that there are many issues that lower my commitment”

Gerald (56, 9 years of service) suggests that he has “an old fashioned Mr. Chips type view of education, sort of idealized view of a teacher” and tries hard to live up to the image, despite tensions between his view of teaching and that of the government or the local authority. He goes on to report that as he manages the tensions and changes at school his commitment level has:

“Come and gone! – today it might be strong- it is strong, but in September it was low. I’d had a set to with the head teacher”

“On reflection, it’s about the same as when I started – on a good day. It’s not gone up any, but some days it can be so low, there are huge variations, that’s the best way to describe it”

It is likely that the variations that Gerald observes are part of the picture of managing and coping with change, both in his role as a teacher and key stage leader.

The final phase, 16-23 Work –Life Tensions, Managing Commitment has three teachers, all with static levels of commitment. It should be noted that all of the teachers in this phase of the study are in their mid –fifties, and each with over 16yrs service as teachers. All report static commitment, as they approach possible retirement. Day et al suggest that further career advancement or good results could lead to raised commitment for many in this phase, and that for others, work-life tensions may be managed by the teacher. They also suggest that workload and the failure to manage it with other tensions may have led to decreased motivation and commitment for a minority of teachers in this phase.

There are no teachers in the two last phases of the model and this is probably because of the shorter length of service of the second career teacher. There is no evidence of a second career teacher serving longer than nineteen years in this study, but absence of evidence is not always evidence of absence, and it is possible that some second career teachers have extended careers, but none were found in the course of this study. An alternative and more likely explanation may be the survivability of teachers in general, and second career teachers in particular. Survivability is a silent presence throughout the study, with three teachers leaving the study during its course. This issue will be dealt
with in greater detail in a later chapter. The Professional Life Phase model proposed by Day et al, seems to be suitable to the second career teachers in this study. The structure of the model seems to fit the commitment phases of the teachers in this study, with some minor variations. The last phases of the model are unlikely to be of use because of the shorter career lengths of the second career teachers. Previous to the VITAE study, many career models were age-based. In the diagram 4.16 below, the teachers in the study are now ranked in age order to highlight any age-based effect on commitment.

**Diagram 4.16 _ Age and Commitment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Commitment Trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Harry</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>Rising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>Falling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracey</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elaine</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alice</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albert</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cherry</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denise</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doreen</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>Rising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noreen</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magda</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brenda</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>Rising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rita</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Falling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandra</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>Falling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irene</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felicity</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barry</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>Rising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgina</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Herbert</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerald</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estelle</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finola</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>Static</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As can be seen from the diagram above, there appears to be little relationship between age and commitment level. Earlier, age based models such as that proposed by Sykes
(1985), were based on age and not length of service, although at that time the two were tightly related.

The VITAE model is a better indicator of commitment issues, with the awareness that age and other personal influences can modify commitment, and the relative sophistication of the model takes this into account. Some models (Huberman, 1996, Hargreaves, 2005) use simple models based on length of service, and do not take these variables into account, and there can be difficulties applying these to the teaching career of the second career teacher.

One of the largest factors lowering commitment reported in this study was government policy and rapid change. Given that the teachers in the study have demonstrated their flexibility and adaptability by changing careers and training as teachers, their adaptability to change is likely to be high. The effect of continuous change, demanding constant flexibility, is likely to degrade commitment. It is unlikely that second career teachers are immune from this, especially when change is accelerated in a school improvement context. The effect of policy reform is twofold. As well as the change in the professional environment, there have been recent reforms in teacher employment laws meaning that poorly–performing teachers can be rapidly removed from their teaching posts.

There is a great deal of interest in commitment of teachers and it is seen as vital to good teaching. Commitment is seen as a proxy indicator of retention, in that a committed teacher will endure the change process and stay in the profession. A combination of performativity based teaching reforms including continuous teacher observation, appraisal, performance pay, and employment reform can mean that a teacher can be removed rapidly (within one term) because of issues of competence. Commitment to teaching is only one factor in retention. When examining commitment levels, it is possible for commitment to teaching to be high, but for a teacher not to meet the exacting standards of the profession, and still to be removed from their post with a high level of commitment. One of the participants, Gerald seems to sum this up:

“a lot of people aren’t particularly effective as teachers, but they are committed. I look down the corridor.. and they do things their way, but there is real commitment there, but whether its good teaching or not, that’s another matter...”
It is also possible for a teacher's level of commitment to fall rapidly (this was reported widely in interviews, with teachers citing the bad class, or the unsupportive head teacher) and this could lead to a rapid fall in commitment and the teacher leaving the profession.

In summary, commitment was reported to be variable, responding to issues such as management and classes. The questionnaire responses mostly reported static commitment. There was little unanimity in the responses from those with rising commitment. The teachers with falling commitment mostly cited school-based factors. Previous studies have proposed that commitment can be affected by age and by teacher stage. Early models were age-based, and later ones linked to teacher stage, and these could be more useful with second career teachers as they are older. The teachers in the study were placed in an age model, and it was found that for the teachers in this study, age does not reflect commitment level. The VITAE model was then populated with teachers in the study. The VITAE model is a better indicator of commitment issues, with the awareness that age and other personal influences can modify commitment, and the relative sophistication of the model takes this into account. The question remains if commitment is a proxy indicator of retention because of the current performative environment.

4.4 How do Primary Second Career Teachers Define Teacher Commitment?

This section of the study answers the research question ‘How do second career primary teachers define teacher commitment? Because of their previous work, second career teachers bring life experience to the task of the teacher, and as such their commitment may be in a different form (Troman, 2007), to that of the teacher who entered the profession directly from higher education at a younger age. Various studies outlined in the second chapter have proposed that commitment may be defined by teachers in a variety of ways. This section of the study employs a slightly different methodology, as it was asked directly only to the interview participants (n=13). This was an acknowledgement that the survey would not be able to elicit what may be a lengthy and detailed response. This was confirmed in the pilot study, where different question wordings were tried out, but responses were often very limited. Instead, the questionnaire asked a series of seven questions along the lines of “a committed teacher….” with a series of Likert scale responses. These gave useful background in to how second career teachers define commitment. The thirteen teachers in the interview phase, usually towards the end of their sessions, were asked what they defined
commitment in a personal sense. The answers that they gave were examined and responses were grouped.

These responses will now be examined and linked to previous research. As previously discussed, there are many studies, carried out with different groups that define teacher commitment in different ways, they include; Commitment to school (Huber; 1999, Tsui & Cheng; 1999); Commitment to students (Nias; 1981); Commitment to the teaching profession (Day; 2000); Commitment as love for students (Choi and Fang Tang; 2009); Commitment to professional knowledge (Nias; 1981, Tyree; 1986, Woods; 1981) and Commitment as passion, and as extra time (Croswell and Elliot; 2004). The responses of the teachers will now be dealt with in turn. They are shown below in Diagram 4.17:

**Diagram 4.17 Definition of Commitment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Definition of Commitment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social support, 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pupil Performance, 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extra Time, 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pedagogy, 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionalism, 3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**4.4a Commitment as Extra Time – the Link to Intensification?**

The largest number of teachers in the interview phase defined teaching as giving extra time (n=4). This is similar to the research findings of both Croswell & Elliot (2004) and Choi & Fang Tang (2009). Phrases like “going the extra mile” or “being there for the kids” showed how being committed working long hours, often with a sense of acceptance. Time was mentioned indirectly in many other responses. The questionnaire response backed this up with most participants agreeing with the statement that
“committed teacher puts in long hours”. Of twenty three teachers asked, only one teacher disagreed slightly, with over twenty responses, agreeing moderately or strongly with the statement. In the Interview phase, demands on their time were referred to by most teachers, whether discussing professional issues or commitment, so it comes as no surprise that commitment was widely defined as extra time.

This raises an issue. Time, although cited as an example of commitment, was also a source of pressure. Time pressure was referred to by many of the participants in the study, and the issue of time was woven like a thread into the study itself. It even showed during the interview schedule when it proved difficult to maintain contact with teachers, or for them to fit interviews in a busy working day. Even after school, it proved difficult to fit in time during an extended working day, and flexibility had to be shown about time and venue of meetings. It is proposed to examine this area in some detail later, and to explore its possible links to the intensification process.

Time demands seemed to act in two main areas. One was to extend the working day at school, removing break times and colonizing lunch breaks with meetings and training. The day itself was also extended, with early starts and late departures. Many teachers saw that commitment to teaching was an acceptance of the long-hours culture, and that lack of time went hand-in-hand with being a good teacher. There is a link here with workload issues, and the intensification process, as in most cases, workload was often reported as extra time at work. The second time area was the extension of work into life at home, where teachers who wanted to go “the extra mile” would put in extended hours at home, as related previously in this study. A question in the commitment definition strand of the questionnaire addressed this. It used the statement “A committed teacher sometimes has to let down their family or life partners” to discover the effects of commitment. Three teachers disagreed, four agreed slightly, with seventeen agreeing strongly. This confirms the extent of how a commitment to teaching can extend into the private life of the teacher.

Being second career teachers, the participants in this study uniquely had a previous career to compare and contrast teaching with. Several noted that the time demands were greater, and there were several responses similar to “in my previous job….. when you went home, that was it”, although many made no other connection between the two careers. Those reporting this time issue often did so in a flat unemotional way with a sense of acceptance. To the third of the teachers in the study that progressed through working as a teaching assistant, the Parallel Turners, the demands on their time surely could not have come as any surprise, as they were already working in parallel careers in...
the same classroom as teachers. When asked the factors that lowered their commitment, no teacher mentioned long hours or time, and it is suggested that this is a sign of cultural acceptance, and that the originators of that time pressure (government, management) were selected, rather than the issue itself. It is possible that the previous work experience has proofed some against time demands, but perhaps in unexpected ways. Many teachers felt that as professionals, work-demands should be fulfilled first, and that the tasks associated with being a teacher took up a great deal of their home life as well.

Magda reported that one thing defines her commitment to teaching:

“It’s time.. It takes over your life, this job, it is just there all the time, there is no time to catch up with people, and I don’t really have much of a life out of here during the term- you are either marking or assessing or just getting on with things and there isn’t the time

I’m in Year Three and we have a lot to do, feedback, that kind of thing, so it takes so much time. I always have Saturdays off, but I work Sundays”

The centrality of time to Magda’s commitment to teaching is clear in her response. The issues of time will be taken up again later in this chapter when indications of intensification will be explored.

4.4b Commitment as Professionalism

Several teachers in the interview phase defined commitment as being “a professional”, by their definition of “putting the children first” and by working hard (n=3). This professionalism was often linked to wanting the best for the children under their care. Responses showed how this was associated with an awareness of the broader community and social issues that were present in two of the schools. Elaine defines commitment as a broader commitment to the school community:

“You have to be a person…that attends meetings, supports school in the wider sense, not just turning up and sitting in their classroom and just teaching…it’s all about the whole school family and caring for that community ...being part of the team”

“a committed teacher is a professional, I mean one that puts the children first and does the job there well...”
This definition of commitment as professionalism is very similar to that proposed by Day (2000) who suggested that it may be an alignment with the profession of teaching. Gerald felt that he had to live up to a professional ideal:

“I have this picture of an ideal teacher... I have an old-fashioned view of a teacher, A Mr. Chips type view...an idealized view of education”

Other studies such as Nias (1981), Tyree (1986), and Woods (1981) have suggested that commitment may take the form of gaining and developing professional knowledge. This definition differed slightly from the next section in that the professionalism was a broad and balanced view of teaching. A narrower, more focused view is shown in the next section.

4.4c Commitment as Ensuring School and Pupil Performance

This definition of commitment was linked to performance (n=2). Sandra commented that commitment was “wanting the children to do well......, and wanting the school to do well too” situating the commitment in the context of the school, and echoing the findings of Croswell (2006) who saw one of the dimensions of teacher commitment as wanting good pupil performance and achievement. Rita thought that defining commitment was not easy but felt that:

“At the end of the day, it’s about results, it’s about having a good classroom, but really it’s those results that count”

The responses showed that being a committed teacher was linked to getting good results. This may be linked to an awareness of school performance issues that were evident in their schools. The response from the questionnaire was broadly positive. When asked to agree or disagree with the statement “A committed teacher achieves good scores and grades in tests”, one teacher slightly disagreed, eight slightly agreed, eight moderately agreed and six agreed strongly.

4.4d Commitment as Pedagogical Improvement

The importance of improving the practice of teaching was used as a definition of commitment in some interviews (n=3), with some teachers noting the stress of the teacher observation process, another noting that commitment to teaching and good performance as a teacher by were two different concepts. Some noted that the ‘real teaching’ went on away from the territory claimed by observations, targets, and monitored teaching. There were no illusions though, about the importance of
observations and following the accepted pedagogical style. Barry sees commitment to teaching as being linked to professional and curricular issues, as well as pedagogy:

“commitment is really passion. You have to be passionate about working with children, you have to be passionate about moving those children on, you need to be passionate...about the curriculum itself and the curriculum content, and how you present that content”

A highly committed teacher may not be effective, although an ineffective teacher may not be committed for long. Albert sees commitment as being directly linked to pedagogy and performance:

“I think it’s about being here and being part of the team, but mainly it’s about improving your teaching and refining and improving it. The children deserve this, I mean they deserve good lessons and so good teachers, so being committed is about that.”.

In contrast, Albert goes on to define commitment in the context of improving and refining teaching:

“so being committed is about working on those lessons and making an improvement. I also think it’s about listening to your colleagues when you are asked to improve and producing those improvements...”

This puts commitment in the context of performativity, and seems to suggest that commitment to teaching may be defined and externally measured by the school and its management.

4.4e Commitment as Recognition of Social Needs

This was the smallest group of responses about commitment (n=1). Felicity produced a contrasting definition of commitment, suggesting that it was less about pedagogical issues, but more about being socially aware. Her definition was child-centered. Working at a school in an area of socio-economic need, she felt that teachers needed a broader professionalism, recognizing that:

....they live in chaos and they come from a mixture of backgrounds and you have to understand that you have got to be there for them ....the list is endless

This could be contrasted with the idea of commitment linked to school improvement, producing a much more ‘Plowden’ based view of the teacher, showing that some
teachers have a broader, child-based view of what commitment is. This view is very similar to the definition suggested by Nias (1981) who proposed that commitment to students defined many teachers’ practices. This was echoed by Choi and Fang Tang (2009) who suggested that love of students was a strong form of commitment among teachers. It is interesting to note that the questionnaire response for question fourteen, “A committed teacher has a good relationship with their students” had a strongly positive response, with all participants either strongly or moderately agreeing with the statement.

4.4f A Range of Commitments

The responses from the teachers in the interview phase showed that commitment was multidimensional and often a personal construct. This is very similar to the findings of Croswell (2006), who found that commitment ranged across several dimensions. Time was mentioned in many responses, but generally there was no unanimity in the responses and the definitions were diverse. It has been suggested that second career teachers may have their commitments formed by the previous work and life experiences. The study will now attempt to explore any link between them.

4.4g Commitment and Change Category

Previously in this chapter, this study proposed three categories of second careers defined by their change event. They are recapped in diagram 4.18, below:

Diagram 4.18 Turner Category

- **Parallel Turners**: Moved from parallel career working in schools
  - Often have complex working history
- **Evolutionary Turners**: Attraction to teaching evolved over time
  - Turn to teaching when original career didn't live up to expectations
- **Dislocatory Turners**: Turned to teaching after dislocating change in previous career
  - Went through rapid re-evaluation
When the interview responses to the commitment question were analysed, it was noticed that there was some degree of alignment with the change categories.

**The Parallel Turners** often, but not exclusively cited time factors. Some responses were located in the school and social sphere.

**The Evolutionary Turners** responses centered around achievement and professionalism

**The Dislocatory Turners** defined teaching and passion about teaching as being central to commitment

The responses from the three change categories will now be discussed in turn:

**The Parallel Turners** defined teacher commitment in subtly different ways, highlighting the multidimensional nature of commitment. Many responses were grouped around child-centred responses, and the more social aspects of school. The common strand was that of time, and a typical response from Magda saw time as being central to being committed, and this was acknowledged by others in this group. Time and ‘putting in extra time’ was referred to by many members of the group and was central in their responses.

It seems possible that, as ex-teaching assistants, already with a great deal of school experience, that the parallel turners would be aware of the time demands. It may also be an acknowledgement of the extended nature of teaching, and how it differs from their previous careers, centrally in the amount of time needed to complete the tasks of the teacher.

**The Evolutionary Turners** defined teacher commitment in terms linked to professionalism. One difficulty is that this was often a very personal construct. Albert saw being committed as being in a position to improve lessons, and Denise and Gerald aligned with this, defining commitment as wanting the children to achieve. Rita saw being committed as being a professional, but suggested that this was related to getting results. There were common professional and achievement based definitions of commitment in this group, although acknowledgement of long hours was present in some of the responses. As Evolutionary Turners, it is possible that the profession of teaching is central to their new role, and that they identify with the broader professional nature of teaching. This group made the evolutionary decision to leave one profession
and enter another, and their level of identification with their new career may be strong. This identification with the profession seems to define how they see a committed teacher.

**The Dislocatory Turners** concentrated their commitment level at a personal, classroom based level. Barry saw commitment as being about passion, and the challenge of teaching. Harry defined a committed teacher as having a strong work ethic. There could be a level of insecurity in the Dislocatory Turner, after a change event characterized by uncertainty. That insecurity may cause the teacher to concentrate on classroom practice as a means of defending their working lives as teachers. This is hardly surprising in a performative environment, where classroom performance is crucial to survival as a teacher.

**4.4 h Discussion**

As mentioned in previous chapters, research has suggested that commitment is multidimensional, unstable, affected by life events, professional phase or age. Studies have proposed that teachers define commitment in different ways.

There are elements of all the various definitions in the responses of the teachers in this study, but the large response of time factors, and commitment as extra time echoes the research by Croswell and Elliot (2004), who saw commitment as a highly personal way of viewing the self, and consequently the relationship with teaching. They found that commitment was based on passion, and often exhibited itself as devoting extra time. Commitment is multi-dimensional and can be defined as belonging to school, students, career, the professional sphere, and passion. Many responses in this study linked several areas together echoing the idea that commitment can be best seen as complex and variable, and its definition may vary over time, and so the commitment stated by the teachers in the study may not be the commitment that they held in the past or will hold in the future.

In summary, the commitment of the teachers in the interview phase was defined in different ways. The largest response (n=4) was the giving of *Extra Time*, and the working of long hours. This was confirmed by questionnaire responses. Interviews showed that extra time was also a source of pressure for many teachers, with work extending into the home, and was linked to the time demands of intensification. Commitment as *being a professional* (n=3) was show as supporting the school, and
being a professional and “supporting the school in a wider sense”. This seemed to balance the next section, which was Commitment as Ensuring School and Pupil Performance, (n=2) where being committed is defined as ensuring good results for the school and for pupils. This was generally backed up by questionnaire results, with most, but not all participants agreeing with the statement “a committed teacher achieves good scores and grades in tests”. Commitment as Pedagogy (n=3), where being committed was being focused on good teaching and refining lessons. It is a very ‘classroom based’ definition of commitment. The final form of commitment is that of Recognition of Social Needs (n=1), where commitment was child-centered, and where being committed is showing an awareness of the social needs of the pupils in a school where there is a high degree of socio-economic concerns. Interviews showed that commitment is multidimensional and often a personal construct. The study then went on to demonstrate the alignment between stated commitment and the change categories.

The Parallel Turners defined teacher commitment in different ways, highlighting the multidimensional nature of commitment, but often mentioned time in their responses. As ex-teaching assistants, many of the Parallel turners would be aware of the time demands made on a teacher. The citing of time demands may show how different teaching is from their previous role.

The Evolutionary Turners defined teacher commitment in terms linked to professionalism. The identity of being teacher is central to their new role, and that they identify with the professional of teaching. This identification with the profession seems define how they see a committed teacher.

The Dislocatory Turners concentrated their commitment level at a personal, classroom based level. There could be a level of insecurity in the Dislocatory Turner, after a change event characterized by uncertainty. That insecurity may cause the teacher to concentrate on classroom practice as a means of defending their working lives as teachers.

One of the findings of this study is that the previous working lives of the teachers in this study appear to have some influence on their personal definition of commitment. As second career teachers, their previous career, life events and more importantly in the case of the Dislocatory turners, the change event itself may define how they see themselves as a teacher, as it is part of their personal history, and helps construct their professional identity and thus their commitment to the profession.
4.5 Second Career Teachers and Intensification

One of the minor aims of this study is to examine if the intensification process is continuing and examine its effects on second career teachers. It is not suggested that intensification affects the second career teacher exclusively, rather that it would affect all teachers.

The study will now examine the time aspects of intensification reported by the teachers using the features suggested by Hargreaves (1991):

- reduced time for relaxation
- lack of time to keep up with one’s field
- lack of opportunities for interaction with colleagues
- scarcities of preparation time
- Intensification is voluntarily supported by many teachers and misrecognized as professionalism

The time elements of Intensification were evident from interview responses. During the school day, there appeared to be no time to relax or spend time in discussion with other teachers. One teacher reported that they seldom left the classroom and ate lunch there, to gain time to do work tasks. They entered the staff room only for staff meetings. Observations in staff rooms showed how in two of the schools in the ISP programme, this was not a neutral space, and the walls were covered in school development plans, targets and briefing materials for staff. There was little ownership of the area from staff and the room was clearly not a place for relaxation.

An extended working day means that there is no time before and after school. One teacher reported a race to the car park in the morning, where it was a matter of pride to be in early. There was an expectation that staff would be working in class at least one hour before school. She reported the reverse happening after school, with teachers working long after the day has ended. This has a two-fold effect. Firstly, the loss of the time itself, and then, the impact of the long working hours on time to relax. Another teacher noted that school was open during the holidays, and felt pressured into attending. In these ways, work extended into the private life of the teacher. Teachers reported that during the term, Sundays or Saturdays were often classed as a school day, with planning and record keeping being a large part of that day. Tensions were widely
reported about the time needed to prepare for teacher observations, then part of the ISP programme. Increased monitoring and teacher observation are a form of performative technology and they seem to have increased tensions and removed time from the teachers in this study.

There seemed no strong link between turner types and elements of intensification, as most teachers reported time issues of some kind. Many reported how teaching extended into their time away from work.

Elaine reports:

“I work in the early years and being committed means getting up early on Sunday morning and going round car boot sales and getting stuff for the classroom and equipment for the Nursery. There is a lot of preparation stuff to do and you have to do it…”

Many teachers indicated that there was little time for relaxation, but seemed to accept it was part of the job. Rita suggested that teaching was:

“A lifestyle really... I mean that you spend nights and weekends working and there is bags of pressure, sometimes at night, I can’t relax, I’m too pent up with it all ....we have no time.”

There was similar evidence from Magda, who compared her working life with that of other members of her family:

“I work Sundays, especially in the morning, the planning and the marking, but I say no to Saturdays, whereas most people, like my daughter and my husband, they come home from work and they are done”

To many teachers in this study, a six day week was not uncommon, with early starts, few breaks and little time to relax in the evening. One difficulty is that one teacher’s intensification may be another’s professional commitment. There are of course difficulties in attributing the extra time noted by other the teachers in the study. It could be a show of commitment, where the second career teacher sees extended hours as part of a professional approach to being a teacher, as shown in Elaine’s example of gathering resources. On the other hand, the extra time donated could be part of the misrecognized professionalism suggested by Hargreaves. This study does not suggest that longer hours are the exclusive trait of the second career teacher, and it seems likely that intensification would impact on the working lives of all teachers. There is however one
difference for the teachers in this study. They have a previous career with which to compare teaching with.

As second career teachers, a previous career can form their attitudes to their new profession. One teacher, Harry, had developed time management skills that he was now employing in teaching.

He noted that in his previous career he “had done above and beyond what I had to do” and that it had become his lifestyle, and that he was not appreciated for what he had done. He commented that:

“I always said that, well I swore to myself that I would put maximum effort into my job, I’d do what was required of me, 110%, .....but I swore I never would get like that again...ever”

“I get here in the morning, I’m here at 7.30 in the morning, and I like to leave by 4.00, and I work through my dinner hour...”

“I can’t see the point in hanging around, and people just have idle talk, just hang round the place doing nothing...”.

Unusually in this study, Harry’s approach to time and commitment is viewed vividly through the lens of his last career. His control of his work-life balance was clearly shaped by his previous experience. He also stands out by not accepting the time demands, and by controlling the balance between work and life in a rigorous manner. It seems clear that he has drawn up a barrier to Intensification, assisted by his previous work experiences.

One of the features of intensification is that of misrecognized professionalism. Another teacher’s concept of professionalism seems very limited and defined by the school management…

“I’ve moved from being a satisfactory teacher, now to being a teacher with elements of outstanding , and even delivering outstanding lessons , not as often as I’d like to, but I’m secure now, really as a result of better management”.

This idea of this received professionalism was not widespread, but it was evident in some responses. Harry felt that he brought skills from his previous career, and that in teaching, his attitude to work seems to mirror Tromans’ (1996) definition of a teacher as
a technician, robbed of skills, who “merely implements the plans which have been
designed by others”.

Harry’s view of his professional outlook is telling:

“Even if you don’t agree with things you just do it. If someone asks you to it do
it then you just do it. You might not agree with it, but if you just shut up and get
it done and it ticks the box”

Coupled with comments by others about the limited definition of professionalism as
‘getting results’, this seems to be a new kind of teacher. The responses were not
universal, and could be balanced by broader definitions of commitment.

In summary, the section reported on how intensification was affecting the second career
teachers in the study. It outlined Hargreaves (1994) description of intensification as
being time-based, and noted that the time elements of intensification were evident from
analysis of interview responses. Lack of time, or time pressures were a feature of most
interviews. During the school day, there appeared to be no time to relax or spend time in
discussion with other teachers. The staff room was seldom used to interact with
colleagues, and an extended working day means that there is no time before and after
school. Interviews noted the attrition of non-work time. This could be a show of
commitment, or may be the ‘misrecognized professionalism’ suggested by Hargreaves.
What could be ‘misrecognized professionalism’ also emerged in some responses about
teaching, where professional identity is handed over to the school, and pedagogical style
is strongly controlled. Many accepted the extended hours, suggesting that ‘it goes with
the territory’ of teaching. There were exceptions. One teacher stood out by not accepting
the time demands, and by controlling the balance between work and life in a rigorous
manner. It seems clear that he has drawn up a barrier to intensification, assisted by his
previous work experiences.

This chapter started by outlining the biographical and career details of the teachers in
this study and exploring their change event. It went on to propose a classification using
that change, as Parallel, Evolutionary and Dislocatory Turners. Their attraction to the
teaching profession was examined, as well as factors that positively and negatively
affected their commitment. The trend of their commitment was examined with reference
to a model, developed in previous research, indicating their age and stage of teaching.
The study then went on to enquire how they, as second career teachers, defined
commitment. It then explored the connections between that commitment and their
previous careers, finding some links between them. It finally explored issues of intensification and how they affected second career teachers.

The next chapter will conclude the study by discussing the links between the findings of the study and the related literature on second career teachers, career change, commitment and intensification as recounted in Chapter Two. The chapter will go on to discuss the implications of the findings and suggestions for further educational research.
Chapter Five

Conclusion

This chapter will conclude the study. It will start with an overview, and then go on to examine the substantive findings of the study in the light of previous research, as discussed in Chapter Two. The limitations will be outlined and then the implications of the study will be explored. Finally, the chapter will provide suggestions for further research.

5.1 Overview

The study commenced with an outline of the rapid pace of reform that has affected primary schools in England in the last twenty-five years. It chronicled how primary schools, and their teachers, had been in the vanguard of change. The study then suggested that one of the features of this changed working environment was work intensification. This is where work overload robs the teacher of time and promotes de-professionalization. It was noted that intensification pressures are often time related but may be buffered. Intensification may also have multiple sources, one of which may be the teachers themselves, who misrecognize its demands as professionalism. Intensification and the rapid change in their working environment challenged teachers, increased stress and produced deteriorating working conditions. As the rate of early retirements rose, continuing concern about teacher supply drove the development of Alternative Certification Programmes (ACPs). These programmes diversified entry, and attracted those with previous working experience into the profession, so-called second career teachers. The study then discussed the proliferation of ACPs in various countries, and detailed how studies had taken place into their attraction to teaching, their induction process, the effects of previous careers on their teacher identity and practice. Many studies were US based and were mixed-phase, examining both primary and secondary school teachers. It was noted that the change process, or turning-point that took place as they became teachers could be more important than initial attraction. Studies were discussed that classified the second career teachers and their choice as structural, self-initiated or forced. It also noted that is possible that second career teachers show as little attachment to teaching as they did their previous career (Troman, 1997). The study of second-career teachers’ commitment to teaching was set out as the focus of the study, aiming to fill a gap in the literature. Commitment is seen as vital to good teaching, retention and to teacher efficacy (Day et al., 2007). Research questions were formulated to enquire who, the primary second career teachers were, their work backgrounds, and in times of intensification, how they defined their commitment and what factors affected their commitment. These were encapsulated in three research questions. A pragmatic
multi-method design was chosen for the study because it had the breadth to examine the issues of population and the teachers in the context of their schools. It could enquire into the highly personal issues of working lives and their commitment to teaching. The phases of email, postal surveys and interviews were then discussed. The previous chapter outlined the emerging results of the study.

5.2 Key Findings and Discussion

This chapter will now examine the key emerging findings of the study and link them to the study of literature outlined in the second chapter.

5.2a Finding One - The Long Road to Teaching

One of the emerging findings of this study is that it seems clear that second career teachers are not a recent phenomenon, as this study had participants who had up to nineteen years’ service. Many have harboured a long-held ambition to teach that was realised by the development of ACPs and reform in higher education. For some, training to become a teacher was shown to be a complex weave of part-time education, and part-time work. The participants had a wide range of employment histories, in both the public and private sectors, and in some cases these were complex and did not constitute a career, and so the term second career teacher may be a misnomer. One third of participants had entered teaching after working in school as teaching assistants.

The findings from this study seem to confirm previous research (Novak and Knowles, 1992) in that the second career teachers were from a wide range of working backgrounds and slightly older than the average teacher. There was some evidence of the ‘winding road’ of career uncertainty, suggested by Ticgelhaar et al. (2008), where teaching provided potential security after a range of failed career alternatives. In this study, however, one difference was that many accounts reported an initial ambition to teach, highlighting the concentrated effort that many had shown achieving that aim. For many participants, a career in teaching was the final destination along what was a ‘long road’ of self-development. For one participant for example, this had involved part-time work in a bank, part-time study, parenting and transiting from being a teaching assistant to finally becoming the head teacher of a primary school.

In contrast to some press reports, the majority had entered teaching from a wide number of backgrounds in the public sector. This included the one-third of participants who entered teaching from employment as a teaching assistant. Ticgelhaar (2008) suggests that these may not be second career teachers in the strictest sense, as they have some
experience of working in educational settings. Many in this study however, had initial ambitions to teach coupled with diverse working histories, and their journey along the road to teaching was enabled by reform, so it is the position of this study that they are true second career teachers, if the nature of that journey is considered.

This study seems to confirm previous research about the varied working backgrounds and ages of second career teachers.

5.2b Finding Two - Turning to Teaching

This study proposed new categories to define the process of turning to teaching. One tentative finding was that turning to teaching could be a lengthy process, and may be forced by external events. It examined previous research by Crow et al. (1990), Hodkinson and Sparkes (1997) and Troman & Raggl, (2008) and noted that categories did not match the experiences of the participants. Consequently, a new model was developed by this study that was based on the choice events of the second career teachers. The new categories proposed by this study are shown in Diagram 5.1 below:

Diagram 5.1 Turner Categories

Teacher Turner Categories

Parallel
Turned to teaching after parallel career working in schools alongside teachers, in roles such as teaching assistants. Often confirming original career trajectory of working with children. Many have a complex career history.

Evolutionary
Whose attraction to teaching evolved steadily after becoming disillusioned with their previous employment. They turned to teaching after their previous career failed to live up to their expectations.

Dislocatory
Who have turned to teaching after dislocating change in their previous employment. They have been affected by rapid change and this has led to a re-evaluation of their lives.
The difficulties in analyzing complex change and working lives were acknowledged. The *Parallel Turners* often had initial ambitions to teach, which were denied by lack of qualifications or lack of access to higher education. Many gradually moved closer to teaching. Notwithstanding Ticgelhaars’ (2008) suggestion that they may not be second career teachers, it is proposed that they are a new category, not shown in other models. *Evolutionary Turners* evolved into teachers as interest in their first career declined. This may be a steady process, where the push and pull of declining first career and increased attraction to teaching play out. This is similar to the Crow category of *Home Comer*. Teachers in the category *Dislocatory Turners* moved after rapid, dislocating change, with the teachers reporting events such as the closure of the factory, resignations and periods of unemployment causing rapid re-evaluation or crisis. They may still identify with their original career. The teachers in this group are similar to the Troman & Raggl category of *Displaced Turner*. A detailed examination of the relationship between the categories and previous research was carried out in section 4.1i of the previous chapter.

The categories are new to this study and aim to represent what was sometimes shown to be a complex, and sometimes lengthy change process. In the case of the *Parallel Turners* the change process had a different structure, as many had ambitions to teach, denied by lack of access to training or poor qualifications. What seems likely is that the *Parallel Turners* may be more in evidence if Alternative Certification Programmes continue, as Teaching Assistants take up the teaching opportunities that are available to them.

### 5.2c Finding Three – Attraction to Teaching

One of the emerging findings of this study was that one of the major attractions to teaching appear to be that of teacher identity (47%), which reflects the ambition that many participants had been nurturing. Other attractions were making a difference to the lives of children (22%), and personal benefits (22%), with some other minor attractions. Additionally, the study found that the teacher identity sphere was selected by many of the Parallel Turners, linking their attraction to teaching with their previous career. Many were proud of their achievement in becoming a teacher, and of their efforts in training.
and higher education. They felt that they had gained a career with respect, and for many, the one that they had originally wanted after many years of compromise.

Powers (2002) found that the desire to serve was a major force of attraction to the profession, and reported that many second career teachers entered with a strong wish to make a difference to the lives of children. There is some degree of alignment in this study. When the individual attractions are examined, the *identity* category is consistent with the Novak & Knowles (1992) concept of a personal transformative goal. The next category, ‘*making a difference*’ demonstrated the sense of service shown by the teachers, who wanted their pupils to do well. This again echoes the work of Novak & Knowles, with their ‘*service to others*’ category, and that of Serow(1993) and Chambers(2002) who suggested that strong feelings of altruism of second career teachers could be balanced with the personal rewards of teaching. The high response to *Personal benefits*, (n=5), cited by those who were attracted by financial rewards, work patterns and child care arrangements, with one participant citing the pay differential between her previous role as a teaching assistant being a major attractor. This was again similar to the *economic benefits* category proposed by Novak & Knowles. In contrast, Chong and Goh (2007) found that none of the primary second career teachers in their study were attracted by financial reasons, but their study found that major attractions were *Passion for Teaching, Job Fit, Fulfilling a Mission, and Love for Children*. These categories are broadly similar to this study, but have broadly equal ranking. This again seems to highlight the *Teacher Identity* element in this study.

The large-scale VITAE (Day et al. 2007), study of teachers examined attraction, and it found the largest attraction to teaching among all teachers (including a small number of second career teachers) was *making a difference to pupils lives*, with 60% citing this as a major attraction. Smaller attractions were ‘*professional challenge*’, ‘*personal benefits*’, ‘*identity*’, ‘*love of subject*’ and ‘*accidental*’. This seems to contrast with the findings of this study. A possible explanation could be that when the Parallel turners are considered, they already would have the emotional rewards of working with children, but not the respect or personal benefits of being a teacher.

This part of the study takes forward the evidence base of the attractions of teaching of career changers by suggesting that the role of the teacher is a force of attraction to primary second career teachers.
5.2d Finding Four - Positive Factors Affecting Commitment

The next emerging finding of this study is that proximal factors sustain commitment, such as colleagues, family, and working with children. There was no outstanding category, but the largest response from participants was the ‘support of colleagues’ (22%), with interviews citing ‘team work’ and the sharing of burdens, sometimes within a social context. It noted that responses were complex, as they may be linked to the ‘school organization’ category (13%), as both are school related factors. Family (22%), all female, was cited as a supportive factor, but the complex nature of responses was noted. For many participants, support from families consisted of an acceptance of long hours, and making no time demands. There were clear links in the responses to the work of Hargreaves on Intensification, where work-life colonises the private life of the teacher. Another factor was that of ‘working with children’ (17%), but some responses had pedagogic and others had caring elements. There was little correlation between initial attraction to the profession and the factor that sustained commitment.

A previous study by Nias(1981) suggests that commitment is multidimensional in nature, and this was echoed in the diverse nature of the responses. Croswell and Elliot (2004) suggest that commitment is a very personal construct and this study seems to confirm this. The diverse nature was reinforced by interviews, which highlighted the individual elements in how the teacher received support. It also highlights the lack of research into commitment and the second career teacher. The VITAE study by Day et al. (2007), previously outlined, found that personal support, including family was important, as well as the leadership of the school, and then support of colleagues. Direct comparison may be difficult, as the VITAE study was cross-phase and of mainly direct entry teachers, The largest difference is in the ‘working with children’ category which is not mentioned in the Day et al. study. It may be that for teachers who have made great efforts to join the profession, the rewards of working with children are much greater.

This emerging finding takes the evidence base forward by suggesting that proximal factors maintain the commitment of second career teachers. The nature of the responses however, highlight the individual nature and complexity of those factors.

5.2e Finding Five - Negative Factors Affecting Commitment

A key emerging finding of this study is that a major factor reducing the commitment of second career teachers appeared to be government policy. It found that over one third
(36%) of participants asked what lowered their commitment, attributed this to government policy, with teachers citing constant change, lack of trust, and pressure from central government. The then-recent general election may have politicized the response of the teachers. School based factors (23%) affected nearly a quarter of the teachers in this study, but some teachers questioned the attribution of change, as they were aware that their management was simply implementing national government policy, although leadership style and personal relationships between staff were involved in responses. Rapid change was cited by 14% of the teachers, with a relatively high proportion of 18% finding no clear reason.

There seemed to be major differences between the VITAE, Day et al. (2007) study. Leadership, pupil behavior and workload all scored highly in the VITAE research. If these categories are analysed, it seems likely that many workload issues have been attributed to their source by the teachers in this study, and the category of ‘school based issues’ and the VITAE one of ‘leadership’ are the similar. The teachers in this study may be politicized, or it may be that, as second career teachers with greater work experience, they are more adept at allocating the origin of the factors that reduce their commitment, many citing this factor were the older teachers in the cohort. It also highlights the lack of research into the commitment of second career teachers. There was one major difference, that of pupil behavior. This was mentioned by sixty-four percent of the teachers in the Day study, and none in this study. It may be an indication of the difference between the cross-phase VITAE research, and this study of primary second career teachers. It may also suggest that discipline is not an issue for this group of second career teachers who could be equipped with life-skills to deal with pupil behaviour.

This emerging finding adds to the evidence base on second career teachers by suggesting that the main factor that appears to lower their commitment is government policy. Rapid change and policy shifts were cited as examples. Other factors included leadership style and other school-based factors.

5.2f Finding Six- Commitment and Second Career Teachers

One emerging finding of this study is that commitment was reported as static by 70% of the participants, with no teachers looking to change career soon, and most thinking that they had made the correct career decision by joining the profession. 13% reported
lowered commitment, citing school-based issues. 17% reported their commitment as high, citing a variety of factors. Commitment was shown not to be linked to age.

Commitment was high among the teachers in this study, but interviews showed commitment levels to be variable and nuanced, suggesting that levels of commitment to teaching could rise and fall within the school year, with some suggesting that ‘bad class’ or ‘disagreement with management’ had caused temporary falls in commitment. There was no evidence that age affected commitment.

Previous studies, (Sikes 1985) have proposed that increased age can cause a decline in commitment levels. This was suggested at a time when age and stage was synonymous, which does not reflect the situation with career changers. This study found that there appeared be little relationship between teacher age and commitment level.

This section of the study takes forward the evidence base on primary second career teachers by suggesting that the majority report their commitment as static and that commitment trend appears not to be closely correlated to age. The next finding reports on the connection between career stage and commitment.

5.2 g Finding Seven – Second Career Teachers and Career Stage Models

One of the key emerging findings of this study is that the career stage model generated in the VITAE study by Day et al. (2007) was robust and appears applicable to the primary second career teachers in this study, and was likely to be an indicator of commitment trend and professional concerns.

The study used the model generated in the VITAE research and populated with the participants. To recap the phases, in the earliest phase 0-3 Commitment Support and Challenge Day et al. suggest an active period when the teacher faces the early challenges of starting a teaching career and receives support. One teacher reported rising commitment, and another reported a falling level. Two others reported their level as static. As new entrants to teaching, teachers can be at high risk, as some fail to adjust to working life in school, as indicated by the varying reported levels.

The next phase 4-7 Identity and Efficacy in the Classroom, has one teacher who reported falling commitment levels, who left the profession during the course of the study. Two teachers reported rising levels and six static. It is suggested that this is the
phase where teachers build their sense of identity and build their professional practice, and this was backed up by evidence in interviews.

8-15 Managing Changes in Roles and Identity is the next phase, with a total of seven teachers in this study. The model proposed by Day et al suggest that this phase can be a watershed in teachers’ professional lives, with tensions in managing both personal and professional change. Commitment may be sustained, or may be lowering, with a sense of detachment or a loss of motivation. That watershed was reflected by two teachers with falling commitment, one rising, and four static, with interviews reflecting some concerns and doubts about direction, and concerns about career trajectory. The final phase, 16-23 Work –Life Tensions, Managing Commitment has three teachers, all with static levels of commitment. It should be noted that all of the teachers in this phase of the study are in their mid – fifties, and each with over 16yrs service as teachers. All reported static commitment, as they approach possible retirement. The Professional Life Phase model proposed by Day et al. seems to be suitable to the second career teachers in this study. The robust structure of the model seems to fit the commitment phases of the teachers in this study, and reflects their concerns within their career.

This emerging finding adds to the evidence base on second career teachers by suggesting that career stage model developed in the VITAE research is applicable to primary second career teachers. It demonstrates that the model has the flexibility to indicate the career concerns and commitment issues of second career teachers.

5.2 Finding Eight- How Second Career Teachers Define their Commitment

The next emerging finding of this study is that commitment is multi-dimensional and was defined in different ways by participants in the interview phase. The largest category was the granting of extra time, with other definitions being a professional, pupil performance, and pedagogy.

The largest response was the giving of extra time, and the working of long hours. Four of the thirteen teachers in interviews used this definition. This was confirmed by questionnaire responses. Interviews showed that extra time was also a source of pressure for many teachers, with work extending into the home, and was linked to the time demands of intensification. Commitment as Being a Professional was used as a
definition by three of the thirteen teachers. This was expanded by some as “supporting the school in a wider sense” indicating that commitment extended outside of the classroom into the community. This seemed to balance the next section, which was Ensuring School and Pupil Performance, with two of the thirteen defining their commitment as ensuring good results for the school and for pupils. This was generally backed up by questionnaire results, with most, but not all participants agreeing with the statement “a committed teacher achieves good scores and grades in tests”. Commitment was defined as Pedagogy in three of the thirteen interviews. This is where being committed was defined by being focused on good teaching and refining practice. It is a very ‘classroom based’ definition of commitment. The final form of commitment is that of Recognition of Social Needs, where one teacher defined commitment as child-centered, by showing an awareness of the social needs of the pupils in a school where there is a high degree of socio-economic concerns.

As previously discussed, there are many studies, carried out with different groups that define teacher commitment in different ways, they include: Commitment as passion, and as extra time (Croswell and Elliot; 2004); Commitment as love for students (Choi and Fang Tang; 2009); Commitment to the teaching profession (Day; 2000); Commitment to school (Huber; 1999, Tsui & Cheng; 1999); Commitment to students (Nias; 1981), Commitment to professional knowledge (Nias; 1981, Tyree; 1986, Woods; 1981) and all these factors were shown in responses from participants in this study. Interviews showed that commitment was multidimensional and often a very personal construct. There are elements of all the various definitions suggested by previous studies in the varied responses of the teachers in this study, but the large number of responses cited time factors, or defined commitment as extra time, echoing the research by Croswell and Elliot (2004), who saw commitment as a highly personal way of viewing the self, and consequently the teachers’ relationship with teaching. They found that commitment was based on passion for teaching, and often exhibited itself as devoting extra time to school work.

Commitment appears to be multi-dimensional and can be defined as belonging to school, students, career, the professional sphere, and passion. Many responses in this study linked several areas together echoing the idea that commitment can be best seen as complex and variable. Troman (2008) makes the suggestion that many modern teachers can balance out a range of commitments, both the professional and the personal. The complexity of commitment can mean that it can vary over time, and so the commitment stated by the teachers in the study may not be the commitment that they held in the past nor will hold in the future.
This emerging finding adds to the evidence base on primary second career teachers by suggesting that their commitment is a personal construct and can be variable. The largest response was that of the giving of extra time, which has a link to intensification. It seems to confirm previous research in that commitment may be multi-dimensional.

5.2i Finding Nine – The Influence of Previous Career and Commitment

A key emerging finding of this study is that the previous working lives of participants appears to influence their personal definition of commitment. Using the definitions previously outlined, the Parallel Turners often defined teacher commitment in subtly different ways, highlighting its multidimensional nature. Time, though, was central in their responses. It seems possible that, as ex-teaching assistants, already with a great deal of school experience, that these Parallel Turners would be aware of the time demands made upon teachers. The Evolutionary Turners often defined teacher commitment in terms linked to professionalism. One difficulty is that this was often a very personal construct. There were common professional and achievement based definitions of commitment in this group, although acknowledgement of long hours was present in some of the responses. It is possible that the profession of teaching is central to their new role, and that they identify with the broader professional nature of teaching. This group made the gradual, evolutionary decision to leave one profession and enter another, and their level of identification with their new career may be strong. This identification with the profession seems define how they see a committed teacher, with one teacher describing it as an “idealised picture”. Echoing the work of Lortie, (1975) examples of co-workers, teachers from childhood, and even fiction were cited. The Dislocatory Turners often concentrated their commitment level at a personal, classroom based level. There could be a level of insecurity in the Dislocatory Turner, after a change event characterized by uncertainty. That insecurity may cause the teacher to concentrate on classroom practice as a means of defending their working lives as teachers.

This emerging finding contributes to the evidence base on second career teachers by using the new categories to classify the participants and tentatively linking them to their
definition of commitment. This appears to confirm the profound effect of their previous career on their lives as teachers. It seems to suggest that the way they entered the profession helps to define their commitment to it.

5.2j Key Finding Ten – Intensification and the Second Career Teacher

The last emerging finding of this study is that aspects of intensification appear to be affecting participants in a variety of different ways. There were accounts of extended hours, lengthy work at home and evidence of how teaching had affected the personal lives of the teachers in the study. The time demands of teaching were evident from interview responses, and could be interpreted as intensification, or high commitment. Most narratives told of how the teacher managed those time demands and the coping strategies used. There were few direct references to previous careers in responses.

If second career teachers are armed with work experience and life exposure (Powers, 2002), then intensification may not affect them in the same way as their traditionally trained colleagues. That experience may form a filter through which they view the demands made on them (Kelchtermans & Hamilton, 2004; Van den Berg, 2002). Kelchtermans, (2005) proposes that teachers’ personal beliefs mediate the impact of change. In interviews, few participants made direct comparisons with previous employment. Many of the teachers reported that the time demands of teaching “went with the territory” and this may be linked to how they perceived their identity as a teacher. There was one exception, that of Harry, who developed time management skills that he now employed in teaching. He noted that in his previous career he “had done above and beyond what I had to do” and that it had become his lifestyle, and that he was not appreciated, and was determined not to repeat this. It seems that he has drawn up a barrier to time demands and to intensification, assisted by his previous work experiences. Reference was made in earlier in the study to the work of Goodson (1996) who noted that

“The compression of time and space leading to the intensification of teachers’ labour has resulted from a complex of factors”

Goodson suggests that one of the factors is technology. Allowing for its rapid development and growing influence, and if technology is interpreted in its broadest sense, then the performative technologies of monitoring processes and teacher
observation may be one of the factors. These were often cited by participants as creating time pressures, and also creating additional workload and tension.

The study examined the time aspects of intensification using the features suggested by Hargreaves (2000) some of which were; reduced time for relaxation, lack of time to keep up with one's field, lack of opportunities for interaction with colleagues, scarcities of preparation time, and finally that intensification is voluntarily supported by many teachers and misrecognized as professionalism. The time-related elements of intensification emerged from interview responses, sometimes very strongly.

The concept of misrecognized professionalism, defined by Hargreaves was slightly more problematic. Many responses showed how the teachers regularly worked extended hours, but even that could be misinterpreted. The long hours of work, lack of relaxation and down time could be a show of elevated commitment, or it could be the teachers misrecognizing the demands made on them as professionalism, as Hargreaves suggested. This may have other aspects, such as how one teacher defined his professionalism only in terms defined by the school management, and seemed to have no view of his own performance, outside the criteria of his managers. This seems to echo the definition of Troman (1996) of how intensification transformed a teacher into a technician, robbed of skills, who implements the plans designed by others, one teacher in the study regarded school as a place where you were compliant to management requests and you “just did it” and responded to any demand made because it “ticked the box”. Coupled with comments by others about the limited definition of professionalism as ‘getting results’, this does seem to be a new kind of functional teacher, as suggested by Troman.

The tentative nature of the conclusions in this section are not meant to refute the intensification thesis, but indicate that the presence of intensification is problematical to define, especially the aspects of misrecognized professionalism. Any direct links between second career teachers, the effects of their previous employment and intensification are also difficult to interpret, because of the buffered and diverse nature of intensification. It is suggested that an extensive detailed examination of intensification is outside the scope of this study, and that further research in this area is needed.
5.3 Limitations of the Study

This study has a number of identifiable limitations. The study is small and scale and any picture of the second career teachers and their commitment to their new profession is fixed to their context in a single unitary authority in England. Because of the inherent limitations of small scale quantitative enquiries, the findings are to be treated tentatively but provide indications that may be explored elsewhere.

It is acknowledged that whilst every attempt was made to locate all the second career teachers within the local authority, the participants were in effect an opportunity sample. Efforts were made to contact the teachers via a variety of means and it is accepted that the cohort is not complete, but does go some way in representing the situation, and the conclusions obtained are still valid. It is also acknowledged that some degree of compromise was made within the questionnaire to balance readability and ease of completion, with detail of response. A further limitation was the inability to track teachers who had left the study. There are ethical concerns about contacting teachers who have left the profession, but it is felt that this study, like others, is an incomplete picture. During the course of the study one teacher left the profession, and their responses about working lives would have assisted in building a more accurate picture of the issues concerning commitment.

5.4 Implications of the Study

This study went beyond many previous studies on second career teachers by focusing on primary school teachers and examining their commitment. It suggests that commitment can be formed by their previous careers, but is often based on a strong intention to teach that has sustained them through training. The study suggested that they are broadly committed and that their intention is to stay in teaching. Commitment may be affected by intensification and by other pressures such as performativity.

The setting of this study within the research environment is shown in diagram 5.2 below. This table shows the location of the study within the research environment relating to second career teachers, commitment and intensification. The table is not comprehensive, but does locate this study amongst previous major research.
### Diagram 5.2  Second Career Teachers, Commitment and Intensification

**– The Research Environment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research</th>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Second Career Element</th>
<th>Commitment Element</th>
<th>Intensification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **This Study (2013)**  
*England*                                                            | Study into commitment of primary second career teachers in times of work intensification  
Study proposed a classification of the change-event of the second career teacher; this was found to be broadly linked to commitment | Uses questionnaire (cohort = 24) and, interviews (= 12) of primary school second career teachers. Participants had a wide range of previous working experience, one-third previously working in schools as teaching assistants. | Commitment was shown to be a personal construct and study proposes a classification of the change-event. Proximal factors were found to affect commitment in a positive way, and government policy in a negative direction. | Examines issues of intensification and suggests that it creates demands of time. Also notes complexity and the interplay between commitment and misrecognized professionalism. |
| **Etherington (2009)**  
*US*                                                                 | Study showing that previous life experiences were crucially important to the second career teacher. Some thought that they were more valid than their training course content | Cohort = 10 student teachers on ACP, both primary and secondary | Not applicable (teachers in training) | Not applicable |
| **Weihe (2009)**  
*US*                                                                 | Thesis enquiring into perceptions of career choice of second career teachers | Cohort = 7 second career teachers, all have been teaching for five years, primary and secondary | Incidental, and suggests that commitment is future direction for research | Not applicable |
| **Troman (2008)**  
*England*                                                            | Examines identity and commitment in performative culture of English primary schools | Cohort = 42 primary teachers  
18 second career teachers, all based in primary schools | Examines commitment using Lortie’s (1975) attractors. Suggests that commitment to self may be evolving | Study highlights issues of performativity amongst primary teachers. |
| **Day et al (VITAE) (2007)**  
*England*                                                            | Large scale research connecting teachers’ work, lives, commitment and effectiveness.  
Uses large cohort and mixed methods research to explore issues concerning teachers’ lives and effectiveness | Large Cohort = 300 (150 primary)  
7 second career teachers in both primary and secondary schools | Large-scale research effort into commitment using extended interviews | Intensification referred briefly in relation to teacher effectiveness. No link to second career teachers |
| **Ticgelhaar, Brouwers,Korthagen (2008)**  
*The Netherlands*                                                | Supervisor study (n = 6) into differences between traditional and second career teachers  
and interviews with second career teachers (n = 8) regarding continuity and change factors | Cohort = 8 second career teachers in secondary schools | Not applicable | Not applicable |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Study Details</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chong and Goh (2004)</td>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>Study of career entry and career choice and later perceptions</td>
<td>Cohort = 80 teachers 4 in depth interviews in primary schools</td>
<td>Not applicable, but concerns expressed about future retention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Powers (2002)</td>
<td>US</td>
<td>Study concentrates on supporting the second career teacher</td>
<td>Cohort = 7 second career teachers in second year of teaching, both primary and secondary</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayotte (2001)</td>
<td>US</td>
<td>Study found gender and previous life history affected the decision to become a teacher, and how they taught. Competencies classified into: know-why, know-how, know-whom (all linked to previous careers)</td>
<td>Cohort= 4 second career teachers in first year of teaching, both primary and secondary</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easthope and Easthope (2000)</td>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>Study proposes that teachers work in intensified due to lower educational spending, accountability, administration changes. It notes teacher loss due to redundancy, stress and a move to part-time work. Focus group cohort = 16 secondary teachers and in-depth interviews with 4 secondary teachers</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Notes how teachers have reduced commitment due to intensification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author (Year)</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Noted altruism of second teachers proposed classification as:</td>
<td>Cohort</td>
<td>None, but suggested that teachers had high levels of altruism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serow (1993)</td>
<td>US</td>
<td>Extenders, Subject-Oriented, Practical And Rectifiers</td>
<td>Notable 26 students second career teachers on ACP, both primary and secondary</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author and (Year)</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Study based on the initial attractions of teaching and influences of prior life and employment history on thinking and practice</th>
<th>Cohort</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Novak &amp; Knowles (1992)</td>
<td>US</td>
<td>Study based on the initial attractions of teaching and influences of prior life and employment history on thinking and practice</td>
<td>Cohort = 6 primary second career teachers and 2 secondary second career teachers in early years of teaching</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author (Year)</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Suggests previous evidence of intensification is slender. Examines workload issues of 28 elementary teachers. Delineates time stresses of intensification, proposes ‘mis-recognized professionalism. Goes on to show effects of preparation time</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
<th>Proposed model of intensification based on Apple (1986) and suggests that intensification is a real problem for teachers, and goes some way to explain some of the changes in teachers work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hargreaves (1991)</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>Study proposed categories of career change: Home Comers – the career they really wanted Converted – possible career after a life changing event Unconverted – transfer from high status in their previous work, but risk disenchantment</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author and (Year)</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Study proposed categories of career change: Home Comers – the career they really wanted Converted – possible career after a life changing event Unconverted – transfer from high status in their previous work, but risk disenchantment</th>
<th>Cohort = 13 student second career teachers on ACP</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Crow, Levine Nager (1990)</td>
<td>US</td>
<td>Study proposed categories of career change: Home Comers – the career they really wanted Converted – possible career after a life changing event Unconverted – transfer from high status in their previous work, but risk disenchantment</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author and (Year)</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Comparative study proposed that entry into the profession was difficult for the second career teacher, with issues about adjusting to the new work environment</th>
<th>Comparison of second career and traditional entrants to teaching Mixed cohort = 6 first and second year teachers</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bullough &amp; Knowles (1990)</td>
<td>US</td>
<td>Comparative study proposed that entry into the profession was difficult for the second career teacher, with issues about adjusting to the new work environment</td>
<td>Comparison of second career and traditional entrants to teaching Mixed cohort = 6 first and second year teachers</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author (Year)</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Proposes Intensification Thesis, goes on (in Apple, Jungck, 1991) to confirm this in mathematics study of two elementary school teachers.</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
<th>Not applicable</th>
<th>Set out the intensification thesis, later modified by Hargreaves, and others</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
5.5 Recommendations

One third of the teachers in the study were ex-teaching assistants with previous experience of working in schools. This study has tentatively shown the relative success in the local initiative in the re-training of teaching assistants. Their commitment emerged strongly from the findings, as well as the diverse nature of their ‘long road’ through extended study, and diverse work experiences into the profession. The current wide access to teaching may hide the fact that working in school for an extended period, even in a reduced role, may be a useful introduction to the profession.

Interviews indicated the pressures put on teachers by externally developed school improvement programmes. One of the main features and a major source of pressure were the repeated ISP lesson observations that took place in an attempt to grade and improve teaching. Notwithstanding their ability to improve learning, their repeated and extensive use could lower commitment.

5.6 Further Directions for Research

The final section of this chapter discusses some recommendations for future research. Access to the teaching profession remains broad and there are a wide number of Alternative Certification Programmes. As the number of students and graduates has grown in recent years, there is potentially an increasingly wide pool of career changers available. This study has demonstrated that many people harboured an ambition to teach, and it seems very likely that unless major reform occurs, there will still be many potential second career teachers.

This study has added to the literature on second career teachers, as shown in diagram 5.2, but more research needs to be done so that their retention can be understood in greater depth. Although this study has shown that many second career teachers remain committed, one concern was the inability to track that commitment at length. An admitted weakness of the study was its inability to explore or track commitment over time, as it consists of reported evidence and accounts. The study found that commitment could vary over time but did not have the ability to examine this in detail. Research with second career teachers needs long term, longitudinal research to track their working lives and commitment and to separate the elements of history, such as policy, from the elements of their biography and career. A long – term longitudinal study would allow the examination of the dynamics of their working lives and their commitment.
Additionally, future research effort should be extended to the family or partners of the teachers, so that an accurate view of the working lives could be obtained. This is an acknowledgement that for many teachers, work extends into life at home.

This study has shown that there is emerging evidence that intensification affects second career teachers. Previous research has outlined its role in teacher retention, its complex nature, and how it has developed over time, despite some ameliorative reforms. Research has also indicated the difficulties of research into intensification because of its complex nature. Because of its effects and its continuing nature, further studies into its intensification should be carried out with primary teachers.
Appendices

Appendix A1 – Pilot Survey Questions (p.194)
Appendix A2 - Headteacher Cover Letter (p.195)
Appendix A3 - Teacher Letter & Survey (p.196)
Appendix A4 - Survey Results (p.196)
Appendix A5 – Example of Coded Interview (p. 200)
Bibliography (p.205)
A-1 Pilot Survey Questions Commitment Survey of Second Career Teachers

1) Female [ ] Male [ ] (tick where applicable)

2) Age in years ...........................................

3) How many years have you been teaching? ...........................................

4) What was your previous career? (this may include parenting)
   ........................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................

5) Why did you decide to become a teacher?
   ........................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................

6) What, in your opinion, makes a committed teacher?
   ........................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................

7) What factors assist you being a committed teacher?
   ........................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................

8) What factors prevent you from being a committed teacher?
   ........................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................

9) Do you feel that your commitment has changed over time? [ ] yes [ ] no
   If so, is it rising or falling?
   ........................................................................................................

9) What are the reasons for that change?
   ........................................................................................................
   ........................................................................................................
20th May 2010
Dear

I am asking for your assistance in my postgraduate research at Durham University.

My area of research is that of primary school ‘second career’ teachers, i.e., teachers who have come into the profession ‘late’ after switching careers. This definition includes parenting, or work of any kind. Research of this kind, into the working lives of teachers is vital in building a picture of the reality of teaching in a time of change.

I am trying to discover how many second career teachers are working in primary schools in the area, and their views on some aspects of their professional life.

I am asking for your help in distributing the enclosed questionnaire to any second career teachers in your school, and returning the completed items to me in the envelope provided. If there are no second career teachers in your school, please return the forms.

I am very grateful for your help with this, and I do realise how busy you and your staff are at this time of year. Thank you in advance for your help and cooperation. If you require any further information, please do not hesitate to contact me,

Yours faithfully

Richard Sugden
Postgraduate Researcher

Email richard.sugden2@durham.ac.uk
Dear Second Career Teacher,

I am currently conducting research at Durham University into the working lives of second career teachers. These are teachers who have had other employment, including parenting, before training to become a teacher. Research of this kind is vital to building a picture of the reality of teaching in a time of change. This is research into most aspects of teaching as work, but I am asking for your help in obtaining background data. This includes aspects such as previous career, motivations and some questions on commitment.

I would be very grateful for your help by completing this short survey, which is anonymous. Please complete the sheet, leaving out any questions that you feel you cannot answer. It should be placed in the envelope provided, and then mailed back to me. Alternatively, you can scan and email the survey to me at: richard.sugden2@durham.ac.uk Thank you for your help and co-operation,

Richard Sugden

Are you female ? [  ] male [  ]

What is your age? ……. How many years have you been teaching? ……..

What was your previous career (this may include parenting) please give as much detail as possible

What prompted you to change careers?

What attracted you to teaching?

Please complete the following questions....

1) A committed teacher keeps up to date with training
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree[ ] strongly agree[ ]

2) I feel that my personal values and that of the teaching profession are similar
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree[ ] strongly agree[ ]

3) I find that my profession helps me maintain my commitment to teaching
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree[ ] strongly agree[ ]

4) A committed teacher puts in long hours
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree[ ] strongly agree[ ]

5) I feel a great deal of loyalty to the teaching profession
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree[ ] strongly agree[ ]

6) I find that my work colleagues help maintain my commitment to teaching
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree[ ] strongly agree[ ]

7) A committed teacher sometimes has to let down their family or life partners
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree[ ] strongly agree[ ]

8) I find that government policy helps me maintain my commitment to teaching
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree[ ] strongly agree[ ]

9) A committed teacher maintains a work – life balance
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree[ ] strongly agree[ ]
10) I can see myself looking to change career soon
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

11) I find that my family help maintain my commitment to teaching
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

12) A committed teacher maintains good relationships with colleagues
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

13) I am proud to tell people that I am a teacher
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

14) A committed teacher has a good relationship with their students
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

15) A committed teacher achieves good scores and grades in tests
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

16) I feel that my previous work experience helps me maintain my commitment to teaching
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

17) I can see myself being a teacher for the rest of my working life
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

18) I find that my school (as an organization) helps me maintain my commitment to teaching
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

19) I am willing to put a great deal of effort into being a committed teacher
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

20) I find that working with children helps maintain my commitment to teaching
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

21) Becoming a teacher was a good decision on my part
   strongly disagree[ ] moderately disagree[ ] slightly disagree[ ] slightly agree[ ] moderately agree [ ] strongly agree [ ]

22) I feel that my commitment level is rising [ ] static [ ] falling [ ]

What prompted your decision to change careers and become a teacher?

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What maintains your commitment?

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------

What lowers it?

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Second career teachers Survey S14/T
Appendix A-4  SURVEY RESULTS – responses in percentages

13) I am proud to tell people that I am a teacher
   - slightly agree [4.3%]  moderately agree [17.3%] strongly agree [78%]

2) I feel that my personal values and that of the teaching profession are similar
   - strongly disagree [8.7%]  slightly agree [8.7%]  moderately agree [39%]  strongly agree [43.4%]

5) I feel a great deal of loyalty to the teaching profession
   - slightly agree [8.7%]  moderately agree [60.7%]  strongly agree [30%]

17) I can see myself being a teacher for the rest of my working life
   - slightly disagree [4.3%]  slightly agree [8.7%]  moderately agree [26%]  strongly agree [43.4%]

10) I can see myself looking to change career soon
   - strongly disagree [60.7%]  moderately disagree [8.7%]  slightly disagree [4.3%]  slightly agree [8.7%]

21) Becoming a teacher was a good decision on my part
   - slightly disagree [4.3%]  slightly agree [8.7%]  moderately agree [21.7%]  strongly agree [65.1%]

19) I am willing to put a great deal of effort into being a committed teacher
   - slightly disagree [8.7%]  slightly agree [8.7%]  moderately agree [17.3%]  strongly agree [82.4%]

What does commitment look like?

1) A committed teacher keeps up to date with training
   - moderately agree [26%]  strongly agree [74%]

4) A committed teacher puts in long hours
   - slightly disagree [4.3%]  slightly agree [8.7%]  moderately agree [35%]  strongly agree [52%]

8) A committed teacher sometimes has to let down their family or life partners
   - moderately disagree [8.7%]  slightly disagree [26%]  slightly agree [8.7%]  moderately agree [8.7%]  strongly agree [47%]

9) A committed teacher maintains a work – life balance
   - strongly disagree [8.7%]  slightly disagree [8.7%]  slightly agree [26%]  strongly agree [56.4%]

12) A committed teacher maintains good relationships with colleagues
   - moderately disagree [8.7%]  moderately agree [34.7%]  strongly agree [56.4%]

14) A committed teacher has a good relationship with their students
   - moderately agree [8.7%]  strongly agree [91%]
15) A committed teacher achieves good scores and grades in tests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Slightly disagree</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly agree</td>
<td>34.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately agree</td>
<td>34.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Commitment Attributes**

6) I find that my profession helps me maintain my commitment to teaching

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Slightly disagree</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly agree</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately agree</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>21.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8) I find that my work colleagues help maintain my commitment to teaching

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moderately disagree</td>
<td>8.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly agree</td>
<td>17.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately agree</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>21.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

11) I find that my family help maintain my commitment to teaching

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moderately disagree</td>
<td>8.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly disagree</td>
<td>8.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly agree</td>
<td>8.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately agree</td>
<td>34.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>39.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

16) I feel that my previous work experience helps me maintain my commitment to teaching

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Slightly disagree</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly agree</td>
<td>8.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately agree</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>60.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

18) I find that my school (as an organization) helps me maintain my commitment to teaching

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Slightly agree</td>
<td>17.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately agree</td>
<td>39.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>43.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

20) I find that working with children helps me maintain my commitment to teaching

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Slightly agree</td>
<td>21.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately agree</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I feel that my commitment level is

- Rising [17.3%]
- Static [69.4%]
- Falling [13%]
### Example of Coded Interview Sheet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transcript</th>
<th>Coding + Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sandra, Fen Primary</strong>&lt;br&gt;Initial card describing research read</td>
<td>Referenced in questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RS- Ok ?&lt;br&gt;Right, If you could go through some details about all of your working life, just to get some details, including all the jobs that you did, how long you worked, and so on…</td>
<td>Self- development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S-“Right, well there’s a lot there, so I’ll start, ....well, I started work at sixteen. I left school with some O levels and CSEs, and I enjoyed school. I did quite well, I went to (frozen food company) , but towards the end I wanted to leave. I found it hard going really. It wasn’t just the schoolwork, there was a lot going on. My Mum and Dad didn’t have a lot, and I’d thought of A levels and wanted to get on I suppose, even be a teacher really, and I had thought of that, but I didn’t go back after my O levels. I wanted a wage I suppose and some money of my own.....like you do....”</td>
<td>Economic issues?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RS- I see, and..</td>
<td>Commitment to self-development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S- “So, I started work .................. (frozen food company) and I enjoyed the first year. It was all new and exciting, I was working in the office...secretary I suppose, and in those days it was all filing and typing. It was ok......but after a year or so ...well, I realized I could have done better....if I’d stayed on.... I had friends who were doing A levels and although...... well, it seemed that they were off to better things so to speak.....leaving town and I was stuck here really. But I buckled down, did my training and went to night school to get some typing and secretarial and the like....... After a while, I was still at ............ and they shut the factory, just like that. So I moved on to ............ (manufacturing) and they were a bigger company and I carried on with my night school, with their help I suppose. After a while, I ended up doing an A level , for my own interest I suppose....”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“By then, I was getting married and that seemed that for a while. I carried on working in the office and stayed with them. After a year or two, I left to have Jack, my son, and then went back after a while, part time, and then had my hours increased. I think having Jack made me think a bit really, and I thought that I always would have liked to have stayed on and be a teacher, and got somewhere I suppose. I mean I saw friends and saw the teachers and I suppose I thought that could have been me. Anyway I was busy with my family and working part time and married, so I just got on with things. When Jack was at school, well I decided to do something about it and I made some enquiries at the school, and to be honest I was a bit disheartened really. It seemed that it was quite difficult…. But it was there in the back of my mind."

RS- So you persevered?

S- “Yes I did, Jack was growing up and I was getting a bit fed up at work. Things were changing, there were computers and the company wasn’t doing too well. I mean, my job was safe, but you couldn’t help but think. My husband reckoned that nobody was safe, but there you are. So I kept thinking about teaching.” In the end Barry’s (husband) job was safe, and I thought that I would give it a try. I wasn’t working full time, so I left and went to college. I did the degree that they had started and came out with a teaching degree, three years later. I was pretty proud of that…"

RS- So you became a teacher?

S- “Yes, well…… I started doing some supply at Cornwell Primary and ended up with a full time job about two terms later. I enjoyed that, but it wasn’t permanent and only spent…..about four terms there in total, just over a year. I went back on supply and then ended up at Alleline Primary, did a year there, all on supply. I then applied for a job here full time, and I came here”

RS- You have already given me lots of information, but can you give me some details of your career before teaching?

S- “Well, as I’ve told you, I started work at ……….. and I enjoyed it there at first. There was lots to do and I was learning on the job you see. I wanted to do well and was quite keen, but I suppose I...”
RS- How Long did you work as a secretary?

S- “Well, all told, about twenty odd years, I was off for my son, but went straight back. The job changed though. It was quite old-fashioned when I started, all typewriters, and it was a big office staff......it really changed”

RS- And what were the reasons for leaving your previous career?

S- “Well for a start I enjoyed it as I said, but it er waned really....now, whether that was me or the job changing or just me growing up a bit I’m not sure..... but when I came back part time after going off, well it wasn’t the same. Mind you, I was after something better...and like I say I wanted to be a teacher”

RS- Yes I see...so the main reason was...

S- “Well, boredom I suppose ...there wasn’t much to do...that sort of taxed you...it was all routine stuff, every day the same and I suppose I started young, so you could say that I got bored with it...”

RS- What attracted you to teaching?

S- “Now at first it was the thought of working with children and doing a good job....a sort of responsibility and ...... well ..... I quite liked the thought of being a teacher...of being a teacher that, well I suppose folk looked up to.....so in there was this idea of bettering myself and moving up from office work if you see what I mean. Mind you it was had going and the thought of the studying was a bit off-putting at first...there was a lot to do ..but it passed quite quickly.... I suppose I liked... and I still do like the idea of being a teacher”

RS - How would you personally define commitment?

S – “Well it’s a hard one that isn’t it ?..........I think that its different for everybody, and with me , well it comes down to the kids. I think that you have to want the best for them. That means I suppose....... wanting the children to do well, getting a good education and wanting the school to do well too. It’s no good just doing your own thing, shut the door and hang

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>changed.......developed if you like.....and I suppose that I never saw myself working there, when I was at school..”</th>
<th>Change-parenting-change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RS-How Long did you work as a secretary?</td>
<td>Interest in first career declining, interest in teaching continues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S- “Well, all told, about twenty odd years, I was off for my son, but went straight back. The job changed though. It was quite old-fashioned when I started, all typewriters, and it was a big office staff......it really changed”</td>
<td>Early ambition to teach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RS-And what were the reasons for leaving your previous career?</td>
<td>Interest in first career waning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S- “Well for a start I enjoyed it as I said, but it er waned really....now, whether that was me or the job changing or just me growing up a bit I’m not sure..... but when I came back part time after going off, well it wasn’t the same. Mind you, I was after something better...and like I say I wanted to be a teacher”</td>
<td>Attraction to teaching – working with children and the identity of the teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RS- Yes I see...so the main reason was...</td>
<td>Self-development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S- “Well, boredom I suppose ...there wasn’t much to do...that sort of taxed you...it was all routine stuff, every day the same and I suppose I started young, so you could say that I got bored with it...”</td>
<td>Personal Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RS- What attracted you to teaching?</td>
<td>Wanting children and school to do well</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
everyone. It’s a school and you all have to work together. You have to be committed to being a good teacher, and getting the levels I suppose.....I mean that’s how it is now.”

RS- What factors maintain your commitment?

S- “Well right from the start even was I was getting my degree I got a lot of help from my husband. It was hard at times ‘cos the kids were younger but we managed. Had a lot of help from my mum in those days.... So commitment then, well I have a very supportive husband and kids, they are fantastic, I mean when I started, he was just great he helped with the kids, and when I started work, the kids even help.. they are very understanding and help such a lot...very understanding , I just couldn’t do it without my family.”

RS- What factors lower your commitment?

S- “As you know, we are under a lot of change here, you know, new head teacher and lots of change and lots of things going on and to be fair things haven’t been handled at all well........it’s all got very personal and could have been handled a lot better than this. I know there is pressure from... (pause) well, it’s the local authority, but it’s the government really, I suppose. I know we have to do these things, but it’s the way that they are implemented, and that’s what happens here....”

RS- Could you give me some details?

S- “Stuff like changes in planning and training, and sometimes it’s the opposite of what went on before. I mean look at that new curriculum we are trying to do, there is just so much going on and that can make you flag a bit really , there are rapid changes and monitoring. The lesson observations and things like that.....there always seems to be someone checking up on you, watching....”

RS - What is the level of your commitment? Is it rising, static or falling?

S- “It’s falling...”

RS- Could you give me background about that if that’s possible ? If...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Managing Changes in role and identity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Support from family – mother, husband and children continued through training into teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change at school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School based issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change in curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesson observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Falling commitment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change referenced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of ISP</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
S- “Yes, I’d be glad to ... it can be hard here at times, and we’ve seen a lot of change... and a lot has been to do with the new head and to be fair we haven’t done that will with our results, but that’s not for want of trying mind... but we are receiving support... we have people coming in and there is a lot of change. We are all checked up on, observed... there has been a lot of pressure and us to change, but sometimes they can’t seem to make their mind up, different people give us different advice... and our management, well there not up to it”

RS – so to make clear then, it may be government policy but...

S- but it’s the way it’s done here- in this place I’ve got friends in other schools and I know the difference...

RS – Ok, I think that’s about it, thank you very much

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School based issues returned to</th>
<th>Clarification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School based</td>
<td>School</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REFERENCES


Apple,M.W., and Junck, S. (1990) You don’t have to be a teacher to teach this unit: Teaching, technology and gender in the classroom. American Education Research Journal, 27 (2) , 227 – 251


Ball,S., (1990) Teachers’ Lives and Careers , Ball & Goodson ( Eds ), Falmer: London


208


Department for Education. (2013c) Troops to Teachers. available at website http://www.education.gov.uk/get-into-teaching/troops-to-teacherwebsite

Denscombe,M., ( ) Communities of practice: a research paradigm for the Mixed Methods approach


Dibbon, D. (2004) It’s about Time – A report into the workload of Teachers, Memorial University of Newfoundland, Newfoundland


Green, F. (2002) *Why has work effort become more intense?*, Department of Economics Discussion Paper, University of Kent, No. 02,07


Ingersoll, R.M. (1997). Teacher turnover and teacher quality: The recurring myth of teacher shortages. Teachers College Record, 99(1), 41-44. Ingersoll,


213


Queensland Independent Education Union (QIEU) submission to the Striking the Balance project October, 2005 accessed via the internet at www.humanrights.gov.au/sites/default/files/content/sex.../118.doc,


Sheperd, J. 17th March 2009 Guardian Newspaper ‘It’s no longer ‘me, me, me’ – is teaching just a fall-back option or do bankers really want to ‘give something back’? available online at http://www.theguardian.com/education/2009/mar/17/ex-bankers-teaching-city


Tan, PIJ Second Career Teachers; Perceptions of self-Efficacy in the First year of Teaching . *New Horizons in Education*, v60 n2 p21-35


2013