Durham E-Theses

THE MUSIC STUDENT AS ENTREPRENEUR: AN ETHNOGRAPHIC STUDY BASED IN THE NORTH EAST OF ENGLAND

WEATHERSTON, DAWN,ELIZABETH

THE MUSIC STUDENT AS ENTREPRENEUR: AN ETHNOGRAPHIC STUDY BASED IN THE NORTH EAST OF ENGLAND

Dawn Elizabeth Weatherston

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Department of Music

Durham University

2013

THE MUSIC STUDENT AS ENTREPRENEUR:
AN ETHNOGRAPHIC STUDY BASED IN THE NORTH EAST OF ENGLAND

Dawn Elizabeth Weatherston

At the heart of this thesis is the analysis of the entrepreneurial context within which communities of university music students learn, and how this affects students' abilities to embark on self-managed careers.

Traditionally, the creative sector has high numbers of self-employed workers and significantly nearly three quarters of musicians are self-employed. Based on and contributing to this knowledge, previous studies have been carried out on the lives of working musicians and the destinations of music students from conservatories, but little is known about the specific case of university music students (a more diverse group), whilst they are still studying and anticipating entry into the world of work.

Building on existing ethnomusicological studies of conservatories and university music departments, and recent studies on the working lives of musicians, this study illuminates processes at work in three different communities of university music students in the North East of England. The methodology, drawn from ethnography, seeks to illustrate the students' identities, perspectives and attitudes through observing their entrepreneurial behaviour, individually and within their wider communities, and exploring how they envisage their future life-worlds as working musicians.

The thesis outlines a new conceptual model 'the music student as entrepreneur' arguing that a pedagogical approach which draws directly upon theories of entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning, rather than generic theories of student employability and career development, offers a more appropriate working framework in seeking to facilitate professional development for university music students. In doing so, the thesis also repositions some key theories of entrepreneurship by drawing them into a new interdisciplinary location.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

STATEMENT OF COPYRIGHT

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

The study of musical communities, past, present, and future, may in fact hold
greater potential then we might ever have suspected for cross-disciplinary debate
and exploration. (Shelemay, 2011 p. 381)

On location

It is November and semester one in a music department in a North Eastern university in England is in full swing. Lured partly by a three-line whip from management but primarily by the offer of a free lunch and nice cakes (provided by notable bakers in the music team), almost all of the music academic staff have gathered for a meeting to discuss enterprise and entrepreneurship. The department has recently been awarded some substantial curriculum development funding to enhance the delivery of enterprise to the music students and the aim of this meeting is to extend engagement with existing enterprise initiatives to a wider group of staff. The organisers (myself and senior members of the management team) are among friends but nevertheless we anticipate a difficult meeting.

After brief introduction from the Head of Music, which clearly positions me as the key protagonist, I start with a very short presentation, setting out the basic theoretical context. I focus on the history of entrepreneurship theory, hoping that some historical references to entrepreneurial musicians may provide an interesting starting point and stimulate the discussion. I consciously avoid taking up a particular position but at the same time make no attempt to conceal the more contentious attributes of the subject. I am actively seeking to provoke discussion.

The reaction to my presentation is very disappointing; I feel a wave of supressed hostility. Instead of the wide-ranging and potentially difficult discussion I had anticipated, initially there is little response. Some colleagues refer back to the most basic dictionary definition I had offered at the start of the presentation (a definition that I presented as the one in common usage that, in my opinion belied the whole complexity of entrepreneurship theory and as such was semantically unhelpful) and take issue with it. Several colleagues adopt a confused position; 'we don't know what this is'; 'this is completely opaque'; whilst others openly start to protest that they are in no way responsible for the development of entrepreneurial skills and, that the suggestion

that they should be, impinges, inappropriately, on their roles as music lecturers. The exchange becomes a little more heated, the management team is accused of having set up the meeting with a pre-agreed hidden agenda, possibly related directly to the future direction of the department, shaped by the current political demands for universities to engage with employers. 'Is there any alternative for us?' a colleague asks despairingly.

The meeting ends on a more positive note. Discussion centres on whether a way can be found to work with the concept although there is unanimous agreement that the actual word 'enterprise' creates a tension on all sorts of levels in its association with wealth generation, masculinity, aggression and competition. I leave the meeting with a strong sense that those of us more comfortable with the concept of enterprise are being asked to, in some way, try to contain it.

Later that same afternoon I have meetings with students. The first group of students are planning a music festival. They are highly organised and tell me that they have already set up a management team (they use the term 'board') and allocated roles: marketing and publicity; finance; programming. They show me a plan which looks very much like a business plan and then ask if I have any ideas about funding. At this point I mention the enterprise centre to them and they are little bemused, 'I don't think of the group as a business' says the leader. A second student comes to see me about a planned project to produce a CD of fusion music, bringing together musicians from the department's Indian music project in an innovative collaboration. 'Someone told me to come to see you because you have got funding' is the opener. He describes a vision of his future as a musician, he is bursting with ideas about the creative production but despite ideas about marketing and production, sales and websites he presents himself as an artist, not an entrepreneur. He is not describing the need to make money to support himself as an artist.

As I leave the department on this gloomy November evening, when much of the university lies silent, the music department shows itself to be still very much alive. A rock band strikes up in one of the seminar rooms, drummers are practising in the store room (which is not allowed) and in the grand hall that sits at the heart of the department the huge university wind band is playing the film score from *Jurassic Park*. Some

students play the tabla with their guru in a classroom and, true to the spontaneity of the genre, two folk musicians are rehearsing in the corridor.

This is just one day, in one music department, in one university but contained within these vignettes is the rationale for my study. There appears to be a disjunction between the community of practice that is a music department and the community of practice which embraces the concept of entrepreneurship. This disjunction is deep rooted, both politically and culturally situated, and extremely culpable when considering the effect upon the future work lives of music students.

The key issues, research questions and aims

The vignette of the staff meeting above presents a microcosm of the issues raised by study of entrepreneurship located within a university music department. The concept is politically contentious, the discourse is as highly problematic and the connection between pure theories of enterprise and entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial education remains ill defined.

The definition of the *entrepreneur* offered to my colleagues was, 'a contractor acting as intermediary, a person in effective control of a commercial undertaking' (The Concise Oxford Dictionary, 1964, p.406) and of the *enterprise* 'a company, venture, business, project or undertaking requiring boldness, energy, effort' (The Concise Oxford Dictionary, 1964, p.404). My intention had been to provoke discussion and there was general agreement that these were the terms we were all most familiar with and which, for many were at best problematic and at worst politically unacceptable. There does exist however, as showcased in Weber's (2004) collection of essays on musical entrepreneurs, a close historical association between the concept of the entrepreneur and the music industry. Ironically, had I chosen to refer colleagues to the Oxford English Dictionary of 1897 they would have found the entrepreneur defined as 'the director or manager of a public musical institution: one who 'gets up' entertainments, especially musical performances' (Gough 1969, cited in Shapero and Sokol, 1982, p.77). The terms entrepreneurship, entrepreneurial learning and enterprise, tend to be used interchangeably within an interdisciplinary context whereas the term entrepreneurship clearly signals a discipline area within a business school. It could be argued that within

arts departments, these terms exist on a continuum of acceptability, with entrepreneurship having the most direct negative connotation. One of the aims of my thesis is to reclaim the term entrepreneur and return it to its roots of association with musicians. At this point I would like to offer some working definitions as they might relate to music students:

- Entrepreneur – a student already running or in the act of setting up a music related business, project or enterprise
- Enterprise – a specific set of skills, attributes and behaviours likely to facilitate a future career within music as a freelance, portfolio worker or employee
- Entrepreneurial Learning – curricula or extra-curricular teaching and mentoring contributing to the professional development of music students

Enterprise transmutes into many different forms across the university. There are enterprise centres, centres for entrepreneurial learning and careers services with business start up, all strongly student focussed and evangelical in their post-Dearing[1] promotion of enterprise as an essential skill/ opportunity for students. Senior members within the university management hierarchy have been quick to demonstrate their commitment to the cause within their own teaching and learning documents, upon which policy decisions about curriculum development are based, including ultimately the shape and remit of the 'future university' music department. The music department does not immediately spring to mind as either a strong contributor to, or supporter of, university business 'spin out' in the traditional sense but does this then exempt staff and students from engagement with the broader concept of entrepreneurship? Paradoxically, clearly enterprising activities abound in the music department and are universally applauded whilst at the same time the underlying discourse causes an ever-present tension. Given this conflict, how can a university music department develop a meaningful pedagogical relationship with entrepreneurship that ultimately translates into the creation of an environment where our music students can learn to become successful entrepreneurs on their own terms? The aim of a recent curriculum

---

[1] The Dearing Report, published in 1997, was the largest review of Higher Education since the 1960s, most significantly focussing on the role of Universities in the nation's economy and making recommendations for the introduction of tuition fees.

development project[2] was 'the cultivation of entrepreneurial skills for self-managed careers' as part of a range of strategies to 'promote a diversity of routes for students' transition out of HE into the world of work'. 'Cultivation' implies the need to both create an environment in which entrepreneurial activity can be seeded and gain a deeper understanding of the precise climatic conditions needed to enable our students to both survive and thrive. Do such environments already exist within the institutions of this study or are music departments becoming increasingly vulnerable to the influence of wider climate change evident across the university?

For a music department, the relationship with enterprise initiatives is complex, presenting both opportunities and dilemmas for both staff and students. Students find themselves in the enterprise spotlight; they provide attractive fodder for the advocates of cultural enterprise. Positioned as the exotic 'other', they are upheld as an example of taking enterprise to a new place and, happy to inhabit this new place, they seem to thrive on 'difference', they are 'not for profit', they may be 'community enterprises' and actively distance themselves from the overtly commercial high-tech spinout. There appears to be something about music students that is inherently enterprising, they 'perform' entrepreneurship, but at the same time exhibit a natural disinclination to be seen as entrepreneurs. This raises the following key research questions:

- What are the true dynamics of this creative community of practice where music students, academic departments, the university, the wider region meet under the metaphorical umbrella of entrepreneurship?

---

[2] The national HEFCE CETL (Centre of Excellence for Teaching and Learning) programme ran between 2005 and 2010 and funded 70 curriculum and capital development projects within UK universities across a wide range of subject disciplines.

The CETL for Music and Inclusivity, a partnership between all the universities of the North East in association with The Sage Gateshead comprised 12 innovative curriculum development projects. The 'Working in Music' project; congruent with the pluralist musical learning culture fostered by the CETL, promoted a diversity of routes for music students' transition out of Higher Education into the world of work: these ranged from the cultivation of entrepreneurial skills for self-managed careers to work placements and post-graduation internships.

My own doctoral research is one of the outputs from the 'Working in Music' strand of the CETL.

http://www.cetl4musicne.ac.uk

- How might a university music department develop a meaningful relationship with entrepreneurship that ultimately translates into the creation of a cultural community where our music students can become successful entrepreneurs on their own terms?

- Is there an alternative reading of entrepreneurship which would more appropriately fit the culture of a university music department?

- How do music students selectively engage within the maelstrom of national, regional and institutional initiatives related to entrepreneurship?

- How can we use existing research relating to entrepreneurship to inform our understanding of music students?

- Is it possible to develop a new pedagogy, drawn from both entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning and musicology that is both acceptable, meaningful and above all of practical use to music students and academics alike?

These questions are important because currently it appears that music students are disadvantaged in terms of their future life worlds by the inability to make sense of their own creative practice within the context of entrepreneurship. They are not up against a glass ceiling, rather a glass wall through which they view the entrepreneurial activities of their fellow students with some suspicion. Their tutors for the most part do little to alter the perception of the entrepreneur as someone sitting firmly within the music business with all its associations, as the promoter or manager, adding to the danger of students being alienated by the presentation of entrepreneurship both within and outside of the university.

As far as pedagogical research within our universities goes, entrepreneurship is often considered in a generic and quantitative sense: number of students starting up companies from university hatcheries; number of academic spin outs; number of students completing enterprise modules. The drive to encourage entrepreneurial learning exists in strong pockets within the higher education institutions of the North East of England but closer investigation seems to suggest that we do not yet understand

enough about the effectiveness of entrepreneurial education at the subject level, specifically the arts, and for the purpose of this study, within music. The aim of this doctoral research is to find out more about the career ambitions of music students in the universities of the North East, to see how these ambitions fit with the university rhetoric on entrepreneurship and to suggest ways in which customised professional development support for students within university music departments might be implemented.

There is an ever-present contradiction in considering the present and future lives of music students within a conceptual framework of entrepreneurship. Whilst music students appear to exhibit strong innate entrepreneurial tendencies, as identified in Gibb's seminal work on entrepreneurial learning (2000, 2002, 2005), they are highly unlikely to independently forge fruitful connections with the university's own enterprise support centres.[3] At the same time, as evidenced by recent doctoral research conducted in the North East of England (Coulson, 2007), life as a working musician remains, for most, a tough one and this raises the question of whether a stronger understanding of and engagement with 'enterprise' whilst still at university could have a significant influence on the future work life of a music student. Conceptually, there appears to be an opportunity to create a new paradigm; pragmatically there may be a place for a new pedagogy that is both acceptable, meaningful and above all of practical use to music students and academics alike. In order to achieve this, new connections need to be made between communities involved in the study of music, and the concept of entrepreneurship, which will enable access to the field for music academics and students. In order for ideas related to entrepreneurship to be considered worthy of consideration within the context of music, I will argue that there is a need to reframe research related to entrepreneurship and music students as musicology using specific connections to elements of the music curriculum such as history, ethnomusicology and performance. In this thesis I intend to address the above key research questions, issues and aims through a research approach that, as an interdisciplinary ethnography of a small group of current students within a university music department, is more unusual, but which both builds on established research paradigms within the discipline and capitalises on my own academic history and position in relation to music students.

---

[3] It should be noted that students do respond well to direct introductions to individuals within enterprise departments, as has occurred over the course of this study with some of the student respondents.

The researcher

At the start of this study in 2008, as an academic developer working in the music department at Newcastle University and as a PhD student at Durham University I was a new visitor to the academic territories of both music and entrepreneurship. Initially I fought to suppress the impulse to apologise for my presence in discipline areas that, instinctively, I did not feel to be my own. But what is my own? As is the tradition within academic development, I have in the past engaged with a whole range of disciplines, (English, Geography, Fine Art, Education). Is the price paid for this vocationally highly desirable genericism a certain loss of academic identity? I started to realise, driven on and encouraged by a growing chorus of disruptive voices emerging from my reading, that the (re)location of myself would be key to the success of my research project. I needed to adopt a position and have a voice in relation to music, entrepreneurship and the research methodologies that are essential to the hermeneutic relationship I intended to build with and between my subjects.

Initially I experienced a strong sense of fear about this interdisciplinary project. What I have termed The Triptych of Fear (Figure 1) represents my early relationship to my three fields of focus; subconsciously placed in a descending hierarchy, with Music leading. For me, the discipline of music felt both the most inaccessible and the most accessible; accessible because I work among musicians on daily basis; inaccessible because I am not a musician. My access to the subject resides within my developing knowledge of the music industry, a close relationship with music students and their professional development and my understanding of the pedagogies underlying the delivery of a music degree. My fear lies in the unknown fields of musicology; composition; music analysis (Clarke and Cook, 2004). However, at the centre of the triptych sit the fields that have allowed me access the discipline (as a student of English I can learn to read history more easily than I can learn to read music), and provided me with fields such as ethnomusicology which, now reframed, have formed a central part of my methodology.

FEAR

M U S I C	Music business Music education Critical and Cultural Theory Entrepreneurship and employablity	World Musics Ethnomusicology Improvisation Music History	Composition Music skills, analysis, harmony Recording Performance
E N T R E P R E N E U R S H I P	Career development Enterprise education Government Policy	Business History Psychology Sociology Cultural	Economics
M E T H O D O L O G Y	Case Study IPA Grounded Theory	Ethnography Anthropology Feminist	Quantitative

Figure 1.1 The Triptych of fear

As an arts graduate, I found that certain aspects of entrepreneurship theory sit in a positivist and statistical land as alien to me as music analysis but these are counteracted by the left side of the triptych where there exists a strong synergy with my existing practical and academic expertise in terms of education, entrepreneurial learning and knowledge of the theories of career development. The centre of the triptych, cutting across the three parameters of my study, suggested a possible methodology, using

theories of entrepreneurship and music history with which to contextualize, ethnography with which to interrogate, and new qualitative methods with which to claim my position at the heart of the research process.

As a 'non-musician', I continue to be aware of both my naivety and vulnerability in this inter-disciplinary field but also embrace the rare position I hold within my multiple roles: overtly as colleague, administrator, manager, teacher and researcher and covertly as participant observer and ethnographer. Manathunga, (whilst herself acknowledging the limitations of the metaphor), uses post-colonial theory to suggest the inherent 'deconstructive power' within such development roles:

> the liminal, hybrid, unhomely, in-between space in which [academic developers] operate could actually be particularly ripe for deconstructing certainties and established paradigms and developing new "hybrid" understandings of teaching and learning (Manathunga, 2006, p.25)

I agree with this and intend to exploit my position as 'a self defined newcomer to the habitat and life world of his or her subjects' (Denzin and Lincoln, 2003, p.91.) to present a new interdisciplinary study, drawing on ethnographic practice to bring together hitherto unconnected research paradigms as related to music students and entrepreneurship. In doing so this study makes a new contribution to knowledge in using 'music students' as the subjects. Essentially this is a study of a society of musicians that is not purely identified by the musical practices in which they are engaged. The study takes place across three locations and, in common with ethnomusicological tradition (Cooley and Barz, 2008), pp.8-9) contains elements of comparativity, using this methodological technique as a tool with which to make new connections in a potentially complex setting. At the same time, this study does not seek to emphasise difference; the focus remains firmly fixed on the students themselves, observing and recording the way in which they operate as individuals within their own musical communities and identifying the influences that have led to their own particular development of an entrepreneurial self.

The research sites

This study is based on primary qualitative research carried out within three different university music departments in the North East of England. Whilst these three sites will be immediately identifiable to many readers of this thesis, I have deliberately attempted to anonymise the study by re-naming the institutions in a way that positions them as distinctly different and distances the reader of this study from any pre-conceived idea about the individual institutions whilst further protecting the identity of my respondents. A student of one, employee of another and long-term professional associate of the other, I am to a certain extent engaging with what Bruno Nettl describes as 'ethnomusicology at home' (1995, p. 3). In doing this I am building upon Nettl's presentation of the fictitious Heartland University in that my intention is to 'impart my personal reflections and understanding' and not to 'provide hard data about curricula, performances or personnel' (Nettl, 1995, p.4). However, although my institutions are not named, neither are they fictionalised; in common with Nettl's study, this is not a thesis 'à clef'[4]; rather than using my data to create a fictional site I am merely re-naming existing sites, whilst clearly privileging and acknowledging the sources of my qualitative data throughout.

Whilst acknowledging the historical concept of the Universities of the North East as a connected group which in the past often has often been strategically linked for the purposes of collaborative regional funding bids under the U4NE[5] umbrella, I have chosen to delimit this study both in terms of the programmes of study and location of the students. Music technology, performing arts and combined honours courses have been excluded on the basis that the study places considerable emphasis on live performance as an act of entrepreneurship, therefore I have included only purposefully selected students who are studying on BA Music, BMus or postgraduate music degree courses. Two of my sites have a long-standing, historical connection and are now the only two universities in the North East of England to have designated music departments, with a head of music. The third site is a relatively new higher education provider. The choice of these three distinctive sites offers rich potential in terms of an ethnographic study, not in a comparative or evaluative sense but as a refractive tool to

---

[4] A fiction drawn from real life people and events.
[5] Universities for the North East.

illuminate the lives of a small body of students within the huge institutions that our universities have become.

The Collegiate University

The Collegiate University draws on a very long tradition and the structure of the university mirrors that of Oxbridge. Physically and spiritually located in close proximity to one of Europe's finest Cathedrals, there is a tendency for the department to be seen as very traditional but this, and the structure of the course as a single BA in music, belies the diversity of activity within the department where ethnomusicology and new music thrive alongside the vocal and church music traditions.

The Civic University

The Civic University is located in England's most northern city, one of several higher education providers collectively drawing in over 70,000 students to the city during term time. The open campus invites the public in to its museums and galleries and new glass buildings allow staff and students to look out across to the Civic Centre and the city. The music department prides itself on inclusivity and this is reflected in terms of both accessibility to the courses and the inclusive nature of the offer itself, drawing from a plurality of music traditions: popular and contemporary, folk, classical, jazz.

The Vocational University

In a model more closely aligned to a conservatory, the Vocational University is based at the heart of a major music venue on the quayside in the North East. An example of a new player on the higher education scene, with its degree courses validated by an established Northern university,[6] this site delivers a curriculum that is highly vocationally focussed where the students sit as an integral part of this music organisation, working alongside visiting artists and with the public.

---

[6] The validating university is not one of the institutions featured in the study.

Literature Review

The nature of an interdisciplinary study such as this demands an engagement with a broad range of literature. The aim of this review is to reflect the nature of the thesis as a whole by integrating and synthesising work from across a number of different research areas. The review does not sit isolated at the start of the thesis. What is presented here is a brief overview of works consulted. At the start of each of the themed chapters there will be a more in depth analysis of the literature pertaining to that theme and the conclusion will review the way in which my findings sit and contribute to the overall body of knowledge.

The thesis draws upon established research paradigms: entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning; musicians and music education – these two areas, with their associated sub-themes, formed the basis of the initial research and have remained the bedrock for the thesis. Allied to this is the literature used to inform my methodology; ethnographic approaches, linked specifically to ethnomusicology. The hermeneutic approach employed within the methodology has extended to the review of literature; as themes started to arise from the transcript analysis, theories of creativity, community and performance and were integrated into the thesis.

Entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning

The study of entrepreneurship originated in and remains the property of the world's economists. Emerging from some of the earliest European writing on economic theory, including Cantillon and Baudeau from the French school in the mid 18th Century (Chell, Haworth and Brearley 1991, p. 13), and Adam Smith (Emerton, 1881) of the British school, the idea of the entrepreneur as the heroic creator of the new and disrupter of the old (Schumpeter, 1934) continued to develop in the 20th century. Whilst economic theories provide a key theoretical foundation for study of entrepreneurship (Casson, 1991; 2003) and the enterprise culture as applied to economic development (Burrows, 1991), the significance of the individual within the entrepreneurial process also remains at the centre of this epistemology.

Entrepreneurship theory has steadily broadened beyond its original economic roots, drawing upon the supporting research paradigms of psychology and sociology and embracing theories of entrepreneurial personality and identity (Chell, Haworth and Brearley 1991); social entrepreneurship, altruism and social change (Martin and Osberg, 2007; Steyaert and Hjorth, 2006; Avruch, 1982); and evolutionary theory (Frank 2011; McKelvey, 2004; Aldrich and Martinez, 2001). At the same time there have been calls, particularly from the Scandinavian school (Davidsson, 2004) for researchers to adopt more critical perspectives (Blackburn and Kovalainen, 2009) and employ new approaches such as paradigm interplay and case study (Howorth, Tempest and Coupland, 2005), ethnography, narratives and metaphors (Down and Warren, 2008; Nicholson and Anderson, 2005; Down and Reveley, 2004).

From this vast field two key research areas have emerged which have taken the core theories of entrepreneurship and the entrepreneur and developed them to include the broader concepts of enterprise and the enterprising person – firstly the study of small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) and secondly the concept of the nascent entrepreneur (Durham Business School Centre for Entrepreneurship, 2005; Gibb, 2000). I would argue that it is this particular paradigm shift which has enabled the building of a conceptual bridge between generic theories of entrepreneurship and pedagogical theories of entrepreneurial learning within the 21st century university. This relatively new presence of enterprise as both a skill and post-graduation option for students from across the disciplines has radically informed thinking on careers education (McCash, 2008, 2006; Saunders, 2006; Watts, Law, Killeen, Kidd, and Hawthorne, 1996) and suggests new pedagogical research questions: can you teach entrepreneurship (Klofsten, 2006; Matlay, 2006) and if you can, how do you do it (Gibb, 1993, 2002; Macht, 2010). Typically within enterprise education a tripartite approach is used bringing together nascent undergraduates, entrepreneurs and facilitators to work on 'real world'[7] projects (Collins, Smith, and Hannon 2006).

Whilst a review of the academic literature illustrates broader pedagogical issues, the practical implementation of enterprise within universities can be traced through the

---

[7] The term 'real world' is used within pedagogical situations to describe an activity where learning is based on simulation of a 'real', often worked based task; for example, as part of an assessed module my own students work in teams to put on a public music event.

grey[8] literature of European and UK reports. In 2006 the 'Fostering entrepreneurial mindsets through education and learning' conference (European Commission, 2006) lead to the Oslo Agenda which subsequently informed UK government policy and the setting up of the National Council for Graduate Entrepreneurship. Within these new policies there was specific reference to the importance of entrepreneurship and the creative industries (Great Britain. Department for Culture, Media and Sport, 2006, 2007, 2008) and this lead to a range of direct curriculum interventions (Higher Education Academy Art Design Media Subject Centre and the National Endowment for Science, Technology and the Arts, 2007), which in turn have informed the delivery of professional development skills within music degree programmes.

On being a musician

One of the central questions in my thesis is 'what does it mean to be an entrepreneurial music student'? In order to answer this less well documented question it is necessary to refer to the more widely addressed question which is 'what does it mean to be a musician?' In conceptualising the music student as entrepreneur, this study draws upon existing literature on 'the musician' to gain three core perspectives: an acknowledgement of the transition from early engagement with music to university music student and beyond; a historical perspective on being a musician and a consideration of musicians' working lives.

Generic child development texts (Bee and Boyd, 2010; Woodhead, Carr and Light, 1994) point to the important influence of early childhood experiences in shaping the individual's future interests, attitudes, skills and associated career trajectories. Although it is suggested that the musician may have innate personality traits (Kemp, 1996), parental influence and early exposure to music appears to be particularly significant (Dibben, 2006; Moore, 2003; Davidson and Borthwick 2002; Laurence, 2005). The importance of this to the particular respondents within this study is an acknowledgement of individuals' different routes into music and an understanding of how musicians, particularly popular music students, may learn in a non-traditional context (Green, 2002; Small, 1998; Fleet, 2008[9]). There has been a growth in literature

---

[8] Grey literature refers to Government reports and White Papers and other materials not subject to formal academic publishing but relevant to this study.
[9] The CETL for Music and Inclusivity Music Skills Project specifically addressed this issue.

on transition into university and beyond with a particular focus on the First Year Experience (FYE), within which there have been some recent studies on university music departments looking at the inclusivity versus technical music skills dilemma (Winterson and Russ, 2008) and the first year experience within comparative teaching settings, typically conservatory versus university (Burland and Pitts, 2007).

As a non- musician I have drawn upon historical literature to conceptualise the worlds that my subjects are both inhabiting and envisaging (Pryer, 1994; Raynor, 1972). William Weber's (2004) book on 'The musician as entrepreneur' is one of the only works to make an explicit connection between the two concepts although there are numerous autobiographical/case study texts on musicians and conductors who are entrepreneurs, for example Bashford's work on the conductor John Ella (2007). Other works have provided historical case studies of entrepreneurial musicians from different genres, even Italian opera (Rosselli, 1992), to assist my understanding of what it is to be a musician. A historical regional context has also informed the study looking at musicians and music making in the North East of England in the 18th century in both the academic and literary texts of Roz Southey (2006; 2007; 2008).

Of close relevance to this study is the body of work related to musicians working lives in the 21st century including Dawn Bennett's work on the classical music profession: education and training; patterns of practice; the work/art dilemma (2008). A regional perspective on musicians in the North East of England has also informed the thesis (Coulson, 2007, 2012) and away from the geographical region of this study, two key ethnographic texts have provided both information about groups of musicians and methodological examples for the thesis (Cottrell, 2004; Finnegan, 1989).

Creativity

Historically there has long been a close association between studies of creativity and music, allied to a mystical approach which suggests that creativity is intrinsically linked to what it is to be human (Albert and Runco, 1999) and associated with the arts through the nature of genius; in the case of music, the virtuoso (Leppert, 2004) or prodigy (Howe, 1999). Early ideas of creativity saw the individual as an empty vessel, to be filled by the divine (May, 1975).

As a research field creativity comprises a number of different paradigms: mystical; psychoanalytic; pragmatic; psychometric; cognitive and social-personality (Sternberg, 1999). As well as being a research field in its own right, the concept of creativity has inter-disciplinary connections, one of these being the contribution it makes to both studies of the entrepreneur and the pedagogical delivery of generic entrepreneurship programmes. However, the simple pragmatic approach that tends to be adopted within such programmes is challenged by Sternberg and Lubart (1999) who suggest that such approaches have a strong focus on helping to develop creativity, but little interest in understanding what creativity really is. Sternberg and Lubart offer a definition of creativity as the production of ideas that are both novel and useful. Klausen (2010) takes this a step further arguing that definition is also 'response dependent', meaning that a creative act needs to be validated by an audience, whilst Csikzentmihalyi (1999) argues that there is also an element of persuasion involved in the process.

Cognitive approaches seek to understand the neurological processes at work when the subject is thinking creatively. This scientific, quantitative approach is currently undergoing rapid expansion as technology allows for greater advances in studies of brain activity. Although cognitive approaches are not discussed in any detail this thesis, general findings, some based on personality profiling which looks at the differences between artists and non- artists (Martinson, 2011) and similarities (Root-Bernstein, 2001) reveal traits within the artists that are closely linked to what are considered to be entrepreneurial traits. Similarly, findings on the effect of environmental variables on creativity (Sternberg, 1999) echo those cited in theories of the effect of different environments on nascent entrepreneurship.

Within the afore mentioned grey literature from the university sector, music students are clearly signified as 'creatives' (Wareham, 2008; Brown, 2004) destined for the creative sector and contributing to the creative economy (Great Britain. Department for Culture, Media and Sport 2006, 2007, 2008; McKinlay and Smith, 2009).

Community

The concept of the community, both real and virtual, has become ubiquitous within the arts and social sciences. This study, whilst acknowledging the existence of a vast and

growing literature on social media and network theory, draws mainly on the literature that is specifically connected to communities of musicians and therefore closely associated with ethnomusicology. The study also draws upon a key concept which has increasingly informed both business and pedagogical practices; the community of practice, particularly the work of Etienne Wenger (1998).

Ethnomusicology is rooted in the tradition of studying communities of musicians considered to be different and exotic (Merriam, 1964), and in recent years, under the heading of 'ethnomusicology at home' it has been appropriated to look at communities more familiar to the researcher. Stephen Cottrell (2004) and Ruth Finnegan (2007) have written ethnomusicological studies based respectively on working musicians in London and Milton Keynes; whilst Kingsbury (1988) and Nettl (1995) wrote about communities of students amongst which they worked. Simone Krüger (2009) has subsequently built on this work within a more direct pedagogical context. Whilst the idea of community is subliminally accepted within much ethnomusicological writing, Shelemay (2011) explicitly acknowledges its importance. Using the terms 'community' and 'collective' interchangeably she argues the case for closer attention to be paid to a clear definition of the term by musicologists.

Wenger's (1998) theory of 'communities of practice' (described as seminal by Cox, 2005) as groups of people with a common interest, originated within a business context but has been claimed by the wider university pedagogical community and by musicologists in considering the working lives (Bennett, 2008; Green 2002) and social lives (Turino, 2008) of musicians.

Within theories of entrepreneurship, ideas emerging in the 21st century on social entrepreneurship have deconstructed some of the metaphors around the heroic lone entrepreneur, acknowledging the significance of entrepreneurial communities and the place of the social entrepreneur within them (Martin and Osberg, 2007; Steyaert and Hjorth, 2006).

Performance

The literature on performance as related to musicians, positions the act as a striking human achievement (Palmer, 1997). Taking both a psychological approach (Clarke,

2002; Palmer; 1997) and acknowledging the influence of family and environmental factors as well as innate skills (Davidson, 2002; Woody, 1999) the study of performance constitutes a major strand of musicology (Rink, 2002). Amongst musicians performance skills retain high status whilst other activities, such as teaching, take the form of support or reserve careers, enabling the higher-level act of performance itself (Bennett, 2008).

The term 'performance' also has clear meaning within the fields of business and sport and has increasingly been used as a tool with which to illustrate other paradigms; as suggested by Schechner (2006), it is possible to frame many human activities 'as' performance, including, in my opinion, entrepreneurship. There are clear links between Shumpeter's (1934) key economic theory of entrepreneurship as 'creative destruction' and Schechner's ideas pertaining to 'the new' within performance studies.

The existing literatures related to the key themes of the thesis: entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial education; musicology, specifically theories of the musician, performance and ethnomusicology; theories of community and creativity; all declare broad application and inherent ambiguities – it is this very ambiguity that permits new interdisciplinary connections to be made which may illuminate our thinking on university music students. Although there is an established body of work relating to entrepreneurship and the creative arts, both in terms of academic and grey literature, this does not appear to draw upon the core literature emerging from each of these subject areas, rather a more generic approach is deployed. There is an opportunity to build on the work of ethnomusicologists who have turned their attention to their own 'at home' communities to gain greater knowledge of what it means to be a musician and extend this model to interrogate an issue of growing pedagogical significance within universities – entrepreneurship. In doing so, there is the opportunity to reflect a new perspective back onto the theory of entrepreneurship and to build upon the concept of the musician a entrepreneur, and making claim to an allied but distinctly different new concept within musicology, the music student as entrepreneur.

Guide to the thesis

Chapter 2 asks what does it mean to be a musician and what does it mean to be an entrepreneur? I set out the foundation for the study starting with a historical perspective on the musician as entrepreneur and drawing some parallels between the past working lives and status of musicians and present day music students. I consider the on-going relevance of the notions of patronage and the portfolio worker. I look at the core discipline of entrepreneurship and draw upon some key ideas related to the personality of the entrepreneur, discussing how this might relate to musicians. Entrepreneurship has strong political connotations and directly informs national and regional policy related to re-generation. I discuss the relevance of this to the creative industries before moving on to discuss the relationship between wider policy and the delivery of entrepreneurial learning within universities. I end the chapter by suggesting the theory of nascent entrepreneurship as being particularly useful in conceptualising the music student as entrepreneur.

Having set the broader context, Chapter 3 presents findings from the secondary research carried out into principles and issues surrounding qualitative research methods and introduces the primary research data itself. In common with the musicological sub-discipline of ethnomusicology the research is centred on a series of in-depth, recorded and transcribed interviews, in this case with a small group of student musician respondents. The chapter identifies a methodology which builds upon existing research into musicians and music students and identifies the thesis as inter-disciplinary. Ethical decisions, which needed to be taken before embarking on the project are discussed. Particular issues pertaining to working with current students are raised. A pilot study was carried out prior to the main primary research; the process, findings and mode of analysis from this project are discussed. At the end of the chapter I introduce the student respondents through the presentation of a series of vignettes.

Chapters 4 to 8 present the five main themes which have emerged from the respondents' interviews. Each chapter opens with a review of the literature pertaining to that theme. An analysis of the interviews follows including direct quotes from the respondents; where appropriate the data is triangulated with primary and secondary data from other sources. At the end of each of these chapters the conclusion discusses theoretical issues

arising from the data and makes specific reference to the possible pedagogical implications of the findings.

Chapter 4 looks at the way in which the students seek and create opportunities for themselves and asks whether this has implications for how we might offer opportunities for them within the university structure. The chapter opens with a discussion on the concept of opportunity within entrepreneurship theory and uses a historical perspective to consider the associated idea of 'the opportunist'. The way in which the student respondents seem to have an innate awareness of and tendency to engage with opportunities is discussed. Risk taking and courage are considered to be key characteristics of the entrepreneur and through the student transcripts I argue that within this group of respondents, these characteristics are directly associated with an ability to take advantage of opportunities. I go on to discuss three other themes that have emerged from the fieldwork: commercial awareness; opportunity creation; career strategies; concluding with a discussion on music students as opportunity seekers and outlining the possible implications of my findings for teaching and learning.

Chapter 5 considers the concept of creativity drawing upon both generic studies and texts specifically related to creativity and musicians. Creativity is considered to be intrinsic to the act of entrepreneurship and the data from the students' transcripts appears to support this. I begin the chapter with a brief overview of creativity theory and present some definitions of the term before, drawing on the existing work of some key contributors to the debate, I move on to a discussion of the nature of the respondents as creative entrepreneurs. I end the chapter with a discussion of how theories of both creativity and entrepreneurship might be used to inform the creative curriculum for music students.

Having considered some of the key individual characteristics of the students, in Chapter 6 I move on to focus on the communities within which the student research participants operate and at this point I introduce an element of comparative analysis between the three universities in the study. The concepts of 'communities of practice' and 'the collective' are discussed in relation to theories of entrepreneurship and ethnomusicology. The chapter goes on to consider each of the field sites in turn; the Vocational, Civic and Collegiate universities, presenting primary data from the student

respondents to build up a picture of the influence their particular community is having on their lives, specifically as student entrepreneurs. The inherently collaborative nature of music-making foregrounds the significance of the musical community and I discuss how pedagogically it might be possible to further enhance the naturally existing community that is a music department to encourage enterprising and entrepreneurial activity.

Chapter 7 asks whether performance opportunity might be a trigger for entrepreneurial behaviour. A ubiquitous term, performance can be defined within a number of different contexts. This chapter uses the framework of 'performance as' to consider two themes identified through the transcript analysis: entrepreneurship 'as' performance; the pitch for a business idea 'as' performance and discusses wider issues related to music students as performers. The chapter then presents three in-depth case studies of students for whom performance appears to drive entrepreneurial activity, albeit in three distinctly different ways. The chapter ends with a discussion of the pedagogical potential to harness performance related activity with a view to enhancing broader professional development teaching for music students; specifically the teaching of entrepreneurial skills.

Throughout my interviews with the students I talked with them in depth about how they conceptualised their own future career paths. Chapter 8 'Envisaging Futures' looks forward from the perspective of the students. Contrary to existing longitudinal studies where students are reporting on actual destinations, the data presented here reflects the aspirations, fears and hopes of this group of students and argues that a greater knowledge of the way in which students think about their possible career trajectory, coupled with a deeper understanding of theoretical aspects of career decision making, might facilitate more effective provision of pastoral careers and tutorial support.

The concluding chapter triangulates the core research data against a number of additional primary resources, considers the pedagogical implications of findings from this action research and suggests ways forward for future research focussing on the music student as entrepreneur.

CHAPTER 2: ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND ENTREPRENEURIAL LEARNING

*Successful entrepreneurship is an art form as much as or perhaps more than it is
an economic activity, and as such is as difficult as any other artistic activity to
explain in terms of origin, method or environmental influence
(Livesay, 1982, p.13)*

Introduction

Entrepreneurship has been a key discourse not only in Europe for the past 25 years but also as part of the wider globalisation project in Third World countries. Global and European initiatives impact directly on government policy in the UK and in turn translate into university initiatives, directly effecting pedagogical discussions which inform the theory and practice of, entrepreneurial learning. Those initiatives falling under the broad heading of 'cultural industries' can be seen to filter down into university music departments. Hence we can draw a direct line between the global entrepreneurship project and curriculum support and development for enterprise within the university music departments of the North East. Commissioned research into what shape this support for entrepreneurship should take for musicians has pointed consistently to the lack of skills as a major inhibiter to entrepreneurial activity, specifically: knowledge of finance; the ability to construct a business plan; networking skills (Creative & Cultural Skills, 2009); and this has led to a government policy view that universities have a key role to play in addressing these skills gaps and promoting the option of starting your own business as a real career choice amongst students and graduates.

Whilst most Vice-Chancellors have been keen to embrace the enterprise project, acceptance within the wider university community continues to be more difficult to achieve:

> Enterprise education is seen as promoting capitalism, and that notion has made educators and the general public uneasy. Related to the reluctance of promoting capitalism is the concern that enterprise education, with values from the market-place and competition, would weaken equality and social justice (Erkkilä, 2000, p.134)

Nevertheless, a close bedfellow of Blairite – Thatcherite politics, enterprise continues feature strongly within current coalition government policy. Entrepreneurial capacity is upheld as the antidote to the current financial crisis, the route to future national prosperity, and increasingly the answer to social as well as economic problems. Within this political rhetoric, universities feature as the grass roots, in need of stimulation, with a focus on those areas most likely to lead to future spin-outs.[10] Currently, this link between entrepreneurship and universities has been made even more explicit with the suggestion that research funding should in future be re-focussed to those areas with potential for 'spin out', and it is unlikely that music departments will be granted exemption:

> Higher education has a vital role in maintaining the creativity base within the creative industries – the stimulation of new talent that continuously challenges existing notions, ideas and practices fostering imagination and creativity, and the skills and knowledge to produce and innovate. (Brown, 2004 p.5)

In considering the music student as entrepreneur it is important to understand how the terms entrepreneur, entrepreneurship, and entrepreneurial learning have been defined and used both in a generic sense and more specifically in relation to musicians. Placing our protagonist, the music student, firmly at the centre from the outset, I begin this chapter with a historical perspective on the relationship that has traditionally existed between musicians and entrepreneurship before interrogating more generic definitions. I then go on to consider national and regional policy on entrepreneurship and how this translates into the delivery of entrepreneurial learning in universities. I present some primary observational data illustrating policy in practice. Finally, I argue that the established research paradigm of nascent entrepreneurship offers a potential disciplinary link between ethnomusicology (as a study of musicians) and broader economic, social and cultural studies of the entrepreneur.

---

[10] University spin-out companies occur when an individual or group establish a new business based on the commercialisation of research. Although the new company exists as a separate entity, it may well still be supported by the univerisity through provision of physical space, equipment and consultancy.

Musician as entrepreneur: a historical perspective

Historically, the word entrepreneur has early origins in music, the Oxford English Dictionary of 1897 defining an entrepreneur as 'the director or manager of a public musical institution: one who 'gets up' entertainments, especially musical performances' (Oxford Dictionaries Online, 2011).

This short historical perspective makes no claim to be a comprehensive history but using the past 'as a playground for our present day interests' (Pryer, 1994, p. 683) seeks to contextualise this study of 21st century music students for two reasons. Firstly, in considering what it is to be a *musician*, it is helpful to have some understanding of the history of both music and the musician; this is reflected within many undergraduate curricula, where music history can also be used as a tool to help students consider their own practice[11] and to stimulate new music activities related to performance and composition, as well as being a discipline it its own right. Secondly, in considering what it is to be an *entrepreneur*, the literature habitually uses historical references to define and illuminate current discussion on the nature of entrepreneurship (Livesay, 1982, p. 10; Binks and Vale, 1990, p. 9).[12] Together, these two things suggest validity in foregrounding a historical/ ethnomusicological (Pryer, 1994, p. 690) perspective to help fix the concept of the music student as entrepreneur, before going on to consider generic definitions of entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning.

Turning the lens of entrepreneurship on music history texts, the presence of the musician as entrepreneur can be detected: social historians consider communities of musicians and matters of business and economics; biographers discuss the musical personality and 19th century concepts of the creative genius. Both approaches use in-depth knowledge of individual musicians and communities within a specific historical context as a way of illuminating the wider music world under discussion. Hence, taking a historical overview can also help to inform a study of students in the universities of the North East of England, offering the scaffolding which will help us to build an understanding of what entrepreneurship might mean within the workings of university

---

[11] I have used Weber's (2004) introductory chapter on The Musician as Entrepreneur 1700-1914 as the basis for an assessed reflective essay set for students on a Music Enterprise module.

[12] Business History, originating within the study of economics, is now widely used across business schools and is described by the journal *Business History* as a *sui generis* scholarly discipline.

music departments. Two historical paradigms appear to be particularly useful: firstly patronage, and its association with the musician as entrepreneur; secondly the idea of the musician exhibiting a particular characteristic of entrepreneurship - opportunism.

Patronage and entrepreneurship

> He held office at the pleasure of his patron, and if he did nothing to annoy his employer he was safe until his employer's death. (Raynor, 1972, p. 97)

Patronage is the support of an individual or organisation and their work by another individual or organisation; this support is not unconditional and the balance of power is not equal. Typically, the patronised will be an artist or artisan whereas the patron will be part of the ruling elite: royalty; aristocracy; church; government or town council. Additionally, today's patrons also include wealthy entrepreneurs, oligarchs, well-known artists including popular musicians and, increasingly, the general public through online funding.[13]

Since the Middle Ages, musicians' lives have tended to involve some form of freelance work, most musicians being at least partly freelance from end of 16th century (Bennett, 2008, pp. 36-43; Weber, 2004, p.10). This historical need for musicians to support themselves on a freelance basis stimulated an entrepreneurial approach to varying degrees; they would seek out new opportunities to provide an income through performance, venues, audiences, creating new works, mostly to keep themselves housed and fed and very occasionally supporting a more lavish lifestyle, although, as in the case of Mozart, such lifestyles were rarely maintained for the whole of their working lives. But to suggest that to be a freelance 'entrepreneur' is to be 'free' would be misleading; for such activity has traditionally been underpinned by some form of patronage, particularly in the case of musicians.

In the Middle Ages, there was a widening pattern of patronage when the role of the civic or court musician started to emerge, as distinct from the existing patrons, the church and monastic choirs. But musicianship in itself did not warrant one of these

---

[13] Examples being the Sting (internationally famous musician) Fellowship at Newcastle University and the online 'Kickstarter' fundraising platform which actively promotes itself as a new form of patronage for creative practitioners: http://www.kickstarter.com.

more financially secure positions; typically a musician employed as a Wait would have had a different primary role, for example as a watchman, using his musical instruments to warn of impending danger, then turning to the provision of entertainment when required (Bennett, 2008, p. 37). Increasingly though, musicians became a necessary commodity, socially and ceremonially, for the ruling elite within the growing cities of the 12th century (Raynor, 1972, p. 55). At this point, a clear hierarchy began to emerge as court and civic musicians who were members of the guilds, fought to marginalise itinerant minstrels to retain their own patrons and be favoured at court and with civic dignitaries, as was common throughout the professions. This apparently clear divide between the salaried and non-salaried, guild and non-guild did not necessarily reflect individual affluence; just as the itinerant musicians had to be opportunistic and novel in their performances, those with patrons would still need to supplement their income with additional work, performing at weddings and funerals (Bennett, 2008, p. 37; Raynor, 1972, p. 57).

From the 14th century, court and church continued to expand their support for musicians and remained as the main patrons. Court employment offered a real alternative to the church and these court musicians established the profession, embracing the full range of activities which continue to define the work of a musician today: composition (at this time new music was highly regarded, there was little value in old music); performance; event management and promotion. Town and guild musicians remained firmly locked into defence of their monopolies. This expansion in the number of musicians was also both mirrored and fuelled by the emergence of music as a core subject in the new European universities. There was a very definite divide between musicians who were academic theorists and the practical 'craftsman' in terms of status in these times (Bennett, 2008, p. 59.).

The 16th and 17th centuries saw new patrons emerging; private households started to employ musicians, frequently on an ad-hoc basis. But major new opportunities for musicians came with the end of the English civil war; Charles II, wanting to re-establish the cultural prestige of the monarch and the employment of court musicians, was part of this. Additionally, the first genuinely public concert, open to anyone for payment at the door, is generally considered to be that organised by John Banister in December 1672 marking a turning point in the music business:

> ...he procured a large room in Whitefryers, neer the Temple back gate, and made a large raised box for the musicians, whose modesty required curtaines. The room was rounded with seats and small tables, alehous fashion. One shilling was the price, and call for what you pleased; there was very good musick… (North, 1728, cited in Scholes, 1947, p. 206)

In the 18th century there were often families of musicians, for example the Avisons in the North East of England; Charles Avison the Tyneside musician being preceded by his father and succeeded by his two sons. Talented musicians who did not have family connections would often take an apprenticeship (Southey, 2006, p.165), maintain a subsidiary trade, such as cooks, gardeners or carpenters and rarely made a living exclusively from music. Further afield this expansion became more rapid with new performance spaces crossing both secular and sacred contexts, Leipzig being a notable example (Kevorkian, 2004, p. 61). This expansion took place across Europe including not only city councils and universities but in the numerous concert halls and coffee shops which had became recipients of many church organs removed from churches by the Puritans.

Rapid development of commercialism in Britain in the 18th century, and the growth of the concert saw the emergence of new working models for the musician, musicians becoming entrepreneurs in their own right, although the patron still existed in a less direct form. Portfolio workers, those who succeeded in making a living from music would typically be highly active, earning their income from a combination of composing, teaching, concert promotion and performing (Weber, 2004).

The late 19th century saw the emergence of the independent concert agent, and this re-defined the relationship between musician and those facilitating their performance opportunities and resulting income. This gave rise to a new form of patronage such as that practiced by Countess Elisabeth Greffulhe in setting up the Societe des Grandes Auditions Musicales de France: 'The principal form of her patronage […] was not salon concerts or artistic commissions but, rather, entrepreneurship' (Pasler, 2004, p. 221). By this Pasler is suggesting a move from a very direct form of patronage directed at individuals to the creation of wider opportunities by the patron for a large number of musicians.

Historically there is a close association between patronage and entrepreneurship. The need for musicians to support themselves necessarily stimulated an entrepreneurial approach and ultimately they were dependant upon some form of patronage. As we have seen, patrons tend to be part of the wider establishment, viewing musicians as evidence of their own cultural standing or as a means to entrepreneurial activity on their own part (Bennett, 2008, p.39). The idea of patronage helps us to understand the significance of the economic and social contexts within which musicians have historically had to operate.

Musician as opportunist

The idea of patronage can be seen to suggest a passive position on the part of the musicians but in order to operate successfully within this economic structure it was also necessary for musicians to be proactive and opportunistic. Weber (2004) demonstrates a clear link between entrepreneurship and opportunism in the 18th and 19th centuries. Opportunism is closely connected to the need to be different, in entrepreneurship parlance, to spot a gap in the market and in doing this to play on one's otherness: 'to identify an unexploited avenue of composition, performance or production – and find ways to accomplish it' (Weber, 2004, p. 5).

Historically musicians have been regarded as something 'other' the genius or virtuoso or the charlatan, as 'an inferior at court, as a fashionable object' (Weber, 2004, p. 5) and although their social status was not high (Southey, 2006, p. 191) they employed their exoticism opportunistically as they do to this day. Audiences' obsessive fascination fuelled the idea of the virtuoso and this in turn helped the development of the music economy. Musicians, such as the 'star' Franz Liszt (Leppert, 2004, p.26) in an act of aestheticisation, began to see the representation of self as an emerging tool for self-promotion.

This opportunism was not all purely individualistic in the 18th and 19th century, as it might have appeared to be in the case of the most famous of musicians, but was often linked to collaborative activity. There was a real system of exchange, of doing business jointly and this was not just altruistic networking, it was a core part of how the music industry operated at the time.

Throughout history the opportunistic musician has had to negotiate the fragility associated with being both a freelance musician and employee of some kind; teacher, apprentice: 'by definition an entrepreneur; he was risking his way of life by not undertaking a secure position' (Weber, 2004, p. 106). We will see that the music students in this study are entering not dissimilar territory.

Defining entrepreneurship

Before going any further in this study of the music student as entrepreneur it is necessary to establish a broad generic description of the terms entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning. The discourse of enterprise takes many different forms; it is a vast literature, ranging over 200 years. The key theoretical positions derive from the fields of economics, sociology and psychology but in the 1980s texts started to connect with other phenomena for example biorhythms and life-cycle theory (Livesay, 1982), linguistics and discourse analysis (Nicholson and Anderson, 2005), ethnography (Down, 2008), critical and cultural theory (Neergaard and Ulhøi, 2007) and pedagogy (Knights, 2008). It is a 'profound and pervasive human activity that is of interest to many disciplines but is not encompassed by any one of them' (Shapero and Sokol, 1982, p. 74). Thus I am suggesting a new academic partnership between entrepreneurship theory and musicology can be used to inform this study of music students.

Attempts to define both the act of entrepreneurship and the identity of entrepreneur have underpinned all aspects of the research paradigm since its origins in the 1700's, when, as we have seen, some early definitions were directly associated with the developing music industry. The complexities inherent in the continuing debate in the 21st century have recently led to a plethora of radical new methodological approaches with a notable increase in qualitative studies such as Howarth, Tempest and Coupland's paradigm interplay (2005), and the appearance of handbooks specifically addressing this methodology such as Neergaard and Ulhøi (2007). Most notable has been the case study approach, often focusing on Small and Medium-Size Enterprises (SMEs) within which the study of the individual within a field setting informs the wider research paradigm.

Attempting to define entrepreneurship over 25 years ago, Livesay (1982, p.9) reassuringly wrote of the 'vast and complex' literature 'germane' to entrepreneurial history. Despite his criticism of 'the new economic historians' and the failure of the discipline to produce 'little if anything in the way of satisfactory explanatory theory', he still acknowledges the complexity of the task. He describes entrepreneurship as an artistic act, however although this particular situating of the activity has an immediate attraction when considering the 'entrepreneurial' musician, Martin (1982, p. 16) warns that there is an important distinction to be made:

> a creative person in the literary, artistic or dramatic sense is not necessarily an entrepreneur. The entrepreneur does not innovate by creating ideas, but by recognizing their value and by exploiting them.

As we will see later in this chapter, this distinction informs policy within 21st century university enterprise centres, for example recent university campaigns such as 'make your ideas fly' and 'spirit of enterprise'.[14]

There is a general acknowledgement that we all know 'it' (entrepreneurship) exists but that the difficulty lies in agreeing on its shape, form or behaviour. Ubiquitous use of the term within the media, both through entertainment programmes such as 'Dragons Den' and 'The Apprentice'[15] and within business news contributes to this 'common knowledge'. This common usage does not help the case for entrepreneurship; my research has revealed how some of the answers to my own and colleagues' unease about its presence emerge directly from the complex semantic development of this term 'entrepreneur', its long, cross-disciplinary history and its apparent glib translation from theory to policy and practice within higher education settings.

Theories of entrepreneurship

The entrepreneurship research paradigm falls into three clearly distinct academic disciplines: economics; psychology; sociology.

---

[14] Campaigns at Newcastle university in 2009-2010 aimed drawing in student from across the disciplines.
[15] BBC reality programmes in which participants compete for funding for their own business ideas.

Historically, theories of entrepreneurship originate in economic theory of which there are five main schools; French, British, German, Austrian and American. The word itself has its origins in the French 'entreprendre', meaning to 'embark' upon or 'undertake' and it was the French economists Cantillon (1730) and Baudeau (c1763) who made early distinctions between the entrepreneur and 'others', acknowledging the part played by personal characteristics and foregrounding the inherent elements of 'risk' and 'uncertainty'. In 18th century Britain economists including Adam Smith and Jeremy Bentham either made no reference to, or were slow to recognize, the entrepreneur. The German economist Mangold (1824-58) offered a useful distinction between two types of entrepreneur engaging with differing levels of risk in their activities; the 'inventor or innovative entrepreneur' and the 'opportunistic entrepreneur'. The Austrian school is identified as a major force in the development of the concept of the entrepreneur originating in the work of Carl Menger (1840-1921) acknowledging the role of uncertainty in the entrepreneurial process (Casson, 2003, p.9; Chell, Haworth and Brearley, 1991, pp. 12-20).

Originating from the Chicago school in the 1920s and 30s, a vast literature emerged from American economists from the mid 1960s onwards, one of the most significant contributions (and possibly most relevant to musicians) being the work of Joseph Schumpeter. The classical economic view saw the entrepreneur as an exogenous factor, employing maximum exploitation of existing resources in order to establish a form of equilibrium within the market system. Schumpeter, echoing the effects within the economist community of his own theory, disrupted and destabilised the cannon of economic theory with his ideas of 'creative destruction', redefining the entrepreneur as 'a dynamic, proactive force – an endogenous factor' (Chell, Haworth and Brearley, 1991 p.22; Binks and Vale, 1990). The early work of Schumpeter (1934) in reframing the identification of the characteristics and motivations of the entrepreneur led to a large number of investigations into the psyche of the entrepreneur.

Two key quantitative methods of measuring entrepreneurial tendency emerged in the 1960s; Rotter's 'locus of control' (1966 cited in Chell, Haworth and Brearley, 1991 p. 39-42) which identifies individuals with tendencies to perform best in situations where they are personally responsible for events, and McCelland's (1961) 'NACH' (need for achievement) and NAUT (need for autonomy) ratings. McCelland's work has

subsequently been used within many large quantitative studies as a basis for studying entrepreneurs' characteristics and as a means to distinguish between entrepreneurs and non-entrepreneurs. The General Enterprising Tendency (GET) test[16] draws upon this research and is now widely used in both commercial and educational contexts to identify attributes that are highly positively correlated to enterprising behaviour; defined as the extent to which an individual has a tendency to set up and run projects (Caird, 1990, pp. 137-145; Caird, 1988).

By the 1990's, Chell, Haworth and Brearley (1991, p.1), searching for a new framework, declared an intention in their work on the entrepreneurial personality to 'break out of [the] mould' of 'sterile debate on the characteristics of entrepreneurs with no apparent progress being made'. At this point in time, defining and identifying 'the entrepreneur' was still proving to be intensely problematic within the community of entrepreneurship researchers and Chell, Haworth and Brearley's (1991, pp.1-2) starting point was that there was 'still no standard, universally accepted definition of entrepreneurship'. They made the key point that entrepreneurship can be exhibited in anyone (a further stage on from the mid 1970's when Shultz was suggesting that the term had currency beyond businessmen and could include non-market activities), and proposed a list of entrepreneurial characteristics, arguing that the identification of such behaviours represents a crucial stage in the research process. It seems to me that these posited characteristics are fundamental in considering the university music student as entrepreneur: opportunistic; innovative; creative; imaginative; ideas people; pro-active; agents of change and they have directly informed my framework for interview analysis.

Although there is no clear conclusion as to the psychological make-up of the entrepreneur, current psychological approaches to entrepreneurship theory still point to a multiplicity of traits and, despite much criticism of the trait approach on the basis that 'character traits are at best modalities and not universalities' (Stevenson and Sahlman, 1989, cited in Chell, Haworth and Brearley, 1991, p.36) these ideas continue to directly inform the discourse of universities where 'traits' may metamorphose into 'skills and attributes'. A recent Palatine report on the performance arts and entrepreneurship, whilst

---

[16] The GET test was originally developed by Sally Caird of Durham University Business School (DUBS). The test has been used as a triangulation tool in this thesis. The test itself and supporting information are available at www.get2test.net.

acknowledging the ambiguity of the concept of enterprise, foregrounds the characteristics of 'achievement orientation and ambition, self confidence and self esteem, action orientation, preference for learning by doing, determination and creativity' (Brown, 2004, p.1).

Sociological theories of working practice have traditionally focused on the workplace rather than the place of the entrepreneur within a community. As we have seen in the case of musicians, there were limited opportunities for entrepreneurial activity within medieval society in Europe. Most areas of commerce being dominated by the guilds, it tended to be only marginalized groups, for example the Jewish community, who took on new roles that represented forms of innovation (Shapero and Sokol 1982, p.74). This idea of marginalization as a stimulus to the establishment of a business continues to be considered as a key theory. Much recent research has focused on Small and Medium-sized Enterprises and this has given rise to a myriad of studies, small scale and anthropological in their focus.

National and regional policy

National

Public support and subsidy of entrepreneurial activity, particularly the acknowledgement of the importance of small businesses to the economy, began under the Thatcher government[17] and, at the time of writing, continues to be a cornerstone of policy in the Coalition Government of 2013. Endorsement of the entrepreneur as both the antidote to and saviour from the worldwide economic crisis appears to cross all political boundaries:

> *Vince Cable, Business Secretary:*
> 'If the economy is going to grow and emerge from the current difficult situation, it is the entrepreneurs who are going to make that growth happen.' (forentrepreneurs only, 2013)

> *Ed Miliband, Leader of the Labour Party:*

---

[17] Margaret Thatcher was Prime Minister from 1979 to 1990.

'I am determined that One Nation Labour becomes the party of the small business and the entrepreneur as together we create a recovery made by the many and built to last.' (tobyperkins, 2013)

As the Thatcher government was reaching the end of its long term in office there was increasing commitment to the encouragement of entrepreneurship through education both in schools and universities, building on the previous work of charities such as The Princes Trust and Young Enterprise by making more explicit links with the curriculum as well as continuing to support extra-curricular activity. The 1987 Enterprise in Higher Education Initiative was a £60m project designed with the specific intention to create curriculum change in partnership with employers and there followed a subsequent explosion of funding support in the years approaching the millennium.

The 2002 spending review committed £362m to the expansion of technology transfer by 2006 through the Higher Education Innovation Fund (HEIF) with the specific aim to 'make the teaching and practice of entrepreneurship, particularly in science, a priority on the model of such American institutions as the Massachusetts Institute of Technology' (Armstrong, 2005, p.1). 2004 saw the establishment of the National Council for Graduate Entrepreneurship NCGE (recently re-launched as The National Centre for Entrepreneurship in Education, NCEE[18]) the aim of which is to support programmes and projects aimed at cultivating entrepreneurship in higher education. A recent review stated that for every £1 invested in NCGE programmes there has been an £11 return on investment to the UK economy; estimated that the total net additional GVA (Gross Value Added) to the UK economy of NCGE programmes is £68.3m and reported on 'considerable social and cultural impact across the HE sector'. (NCEE website home page accessed 5 June 2013)

As a result of the Oslo conference on 'Entrepreneurship education in Europe: Fostering entrepreneurial mind-sets through education and learning' (European Commission, 2006) the European Commission's, Enterprise and Industry Directorate General published the Oslo Agenda for Entrepreneurship Education in Europe and put out a call for proposals to address a number of themes including creating a European Enterprise Educators Network; fostering entrepreneurship among female university graduates with the overall aim of 'improving the image of entrepreneurs in society and the

---

[18] Further information on NCEE can be found at http://www.ncee.org.uk.

attractiveness of entrepreneurship as a career choice'. The proposals covered all levels of education but sought to increase the number of students across all sectors that were participating in entrepreneurial activity and developing identified entrepreneurial skills. Building on the Oslo Agenda and its European perspective and work to date by the NGCE, a government White Paper (Great Britain. BIS, 2011) called for the enterprise education community, supported by the Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (QAA) to provide new guidance for UK Higher Education providers. The published document, Enterprise and entrepreneurship education: Guidance for Higher Education providers (Great Britain. QAA, 2012) now guides university strategy on entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial education, according to a member of staff in the Civic University's enterprise team–'it's our bible'.

Regional

As well as educational policy, a geographical region's policies are likely to impact on the employment opportunities and choices of the graduates from its own universities. For arts students (active, performing music students in particular), boundaries between the university and surrounding economic community are more closely intertwined than they might be for students from other discipline areas; they may already be performing or teaching or setting up music projects. In this sense, regional policy related to the arts is an additional factor affecting the potential for music students in the region to embark on successful entrepreneurial endeavours.

Regionally, the North East of England represents an area of high-level unemployment and deprivation. With a high proportion of workers in the public sector, the region is vulnerable in times of government spending cuts. Although the university sector is strongly represented in the region, graduate retention rates are low. This gives a regional incentive for universities to try to encourage their graduates, particularly from the creative industries, to create new businesses within the area. Following the decline of traditional industries in the region[19] (Hardill *et al.* 2006), Newcastle and Gateshead, in common with other Northern cities, experienced a period of regeneration a decade ago,

---

[19] One of the first regions in the world to be heavily industrialised. In 1900 a quarter of the world's shipping was launched from the region's docks.

helped by the opening of two major quayside arts venues[20] and the construction of the Millennium Bridge. There followed a period of great artistic optimism culminating in the 2008 bid to become Capital of Culture for which the city was shortlisted but which was eventually awarded to the city of Liverpool. The past five years has seen a brutal withdrawal of funding for the arts in the region and this, coupled with the major contraction and restructuring of the Arts Council and abolition of the Regional Development Agency (One North East) in 2012, has had a significant effect on opportunities for music students to become involved in the myriad of small projects previously seed corned by these organisations.

One economic argument in support of this policy shift is that in seeking to create a catalytic entrepreneurial event in times of recession and economic hardship, the quickest returns are to be made through 'policy specifically aimed at corporate entrepreneurs operating in a plant, machinery, and equipment sector' (Binks and Vale 1990). The Coalition Government's enterprise zone for the North East of England appears to reflect this politically expedient strategy with the key sectors identified as: energy industries; automotive; advanced manufacturing; advanced engineering; green technologies and marine industries. Although the creative industries still exist as key sectors in some regions of the UK they are no longer economically prioritized in the North East. The effect of this is likely to be to force the musicians of the region to find ways to connect with new funding streams and for university enterprise centres to develop new strategies to facilitate those creative project opportunities essential to the entrepreneurial development needs of music students. For students, the wider university and the region, the ability to understand the value of partnership working is likely to be key; although the relationship between business and enterprise and universities remains at times complex and difficult.

---

[20] The Baltic Centre for Contemporary Art and The Sage Gateshead.

Entrepreneurship, enterprise and entrepreneurial learning in universities

The discourse of entrepreneurship, unlike that of pure academic disciplines, takes on different shapes within a university. To business schools it is clear field of academic research, reflected in both the research activities of its staff and in the modules available to students. Academically, this is the true home of entrepreneurship studies. Its presence represents a long fight for recognition and credibility within the social sciences, most specifically economics. More widely the terms enterprise; the enterprise culture; cultural enterprise; student enterprise; entrepreneurship; have become embedded in the discourse of the contemporary university where institutional pressure, driven on by funding imperatives, is brought to bear on departments to encourage them to engage with, foster and demonstrate a commitment to the development of entrepreneurial skills in their students.

Meanwhile, whilst the entrepreneurship research community continues its 200-year-old quest to define entrepreneurship, there seems to be less unease about issues of definition once the term is transposed to the context of a university; indeed as far as strategy is concerned, universities seem to be quite clear about what it is, and that it is a good thing for students. Many new postgraduate courses, mostly within business schools, have emerged in recent years featuring 'enterprise' in the title; designated posts and identified responsibilities have been created such as 'Deans of Enterprise'; there has been a burgeoning of enterprise centres, hatcheries and business development departments.

Enterprise education

The expansion of provision in enterprise education over the past 10 years has demanded a fresh look at how entrepreneurial skills can be taught to students across disciplines. Gibb (2002, p. 239) sets out the case against the traditional business school model arguing for the need for a wider paradigm, centred on the concept of enterprising behaviours rather than on the characteristics of the individual and needs of organisations, arguing for a strong conceptual frame rather than 'models' to be developed. These models are ubiquitous within entrepreneurial education and are still (Young Enterprise providing a case in point), based on the traditional framework of the

business plan – a model that originated from the demands of banks rather than a natural framework within which to consider entrepreneurial ideas. Gibb (2002, p. 239) sees this as a 'conceptual confusion' leading to 'misdirection of resources via pursuit of corporate business models under the umbrella of 'enterprise'. At this point, despite the fact that universities, notably in the North East of England, were making great efforts to draw arts students into enterprise centres and facilitate the development of creative business ideas, ultimately they were often still forced by funding requirements to embrace a fundamentally economic model:

> There is a major need to take entrepreneurship out of the locker room of economics, remove it from the meta-theoretical models of Schumpeter *et al.* and place it in a wider inter-disciplinary context built upon a more pluralistic and diffused view of society and of the cultural nature of markets. (Gibb, 2002, p. 251)

In 2005, the NCGE commissioned Gibb to review the state of entrepreneurial education. The resulting paper offers an alternative model which 'not only reflects more accurately the essences of the entrepreneurial culture in society, but fits much more appropriately with the traditional 'idea' of a university' (Gibb, 2005, p.2). It is at this point in the recent history of the development of enterprise pedagogy that some possible synergies with music departments start to be able to be drawn, where it is suggested that entrepreneurial learning can be re-conceptualised as 'maximising the opportunity for experiential learning and engagement in the 'community of practice' (Gibb, 2005, p.7). This concept of 'communities of practice' as a theory of learning is now widely used in higher education pedagogy. [21]

Despite this broadening of the concept of entrepreneurship, led to a large extent by the work of Gibb, there is still some institutional confusion. Although, as mentioned above, the business school is the base for entrepreneurship studies; there is also an acknowledgement here of the difficulty of ensuring academic rigour in the delivery of entrepreneurship programmes, especially those where 'real' entrepreneurs deliver the sessions leading to anecdotal, over dramatised accounts of heroic action in the face of adversity (Gibb, 2002, pp. 239-240). The business schools continue to wrestle with the demands made upon them to both teach *for* entrepreneurship and teach *about* entrepreneurship. Still working from a very different perspective from Gibb, economic

---

[21] See Chapter 6.

definitions, where the focus is on activity rather than individual characteristics, endure. 'Entrepreneurship is […] in its most basic form, the creation of new organisations' (Klofsten, M. 2006, p. 3). However, although the main focus of research into entrepreneurial learning has been based on and connected to the academic discipline of entrepreneurship itself (Bagheri, 2009) and hence retained a footing in the business school, there has been a growing literature on the role of the creative industries and the role of universities in encouraging entrepreneurial activity within the arts and other subject areas.

Careers education

In the 1980s, the DOTS model, which had been developed by Law & Watts in the mid 1970's, sat at the heart of careers counselling theory and practice and, despite more recent challenges to its 'persistent and hegemonic status' (McCash 2006, p.429), some led by Law and Watts themselves (Watts, et al.,1996), still forms the bedrock of many careers education modules within UK universities. An example is provided by the University of Central Lancashire, traditionally a key player in the employability arena, where an 'adapted' DOTS model is used in one of their modules, reflected in the inclusion of the italicised words below (my italics):

> **D = decision learning** - recognising and applying appropriate decision making and action planning skills
>
> **O = opportunity awareness** - identifying appropriate sources of information and opportunity in training, education, jobs, *entrepreneurship etc*
>
> **T = transition learning** - putting into effect your career decisions and plans e.g. by applying, being interviewed, *starting your own business*
>
> **S = self awareness** - knowing, identifying, recognising your career-related interests, skills, preferences, goals, etc

Viewed alongside Shapero and Sokol's 'Life path change' (1982, p. 83) which considers a continuum from a possible initial state of *negative displacement, being between things or having a positive pull → perceptions of desirability → perceptions of feasibility → company formation,* we can see how at this point in history these two conceptual frameworks were emerging from two different research bases. The

established literature of entrepreneurship theory and the relatively new discipline of career development theory, both take up an inter-disciplinary position, each connecting with psychology, sociology and education. The interrelationship between 'careers' and 'enterprise' has recently given rise to much institutional discussion and has resulted in the physical re-positioning of support services for entrepreneurial activities within the North East universities.

Central services

Away from the business schools, the word 'enterprise' applies to many other forms of more practical activity across the university. Functions such as enterprise centres exist as a direct result of post-Dearing targeted funding, as well as other central government financial support as outlined above, and enterprise initiatives are seen as a potential source of revenue by university senior management. However, this 'support for enterprise' translates variably within the departments themselves. There may be pockets of engagement where a business module exists or funding has been obtained for a specific curriculum development but within an arts department it is likely that practical engagement with the concept lies with a few individuals, often labelled as 'champions' by the true, centrally based enterprise protagonists. I am seen as such a champion.

A series of reports originating from the Department for Culture, Media and Sport (Great Britain, DCMS, 2006-2008) advocated the need for entrepreneurial capacity building within the creative industries workforce. Hence at this point, within universities, arts departments moved to centre stage; targeted directly as potential new hubs of entrepreneurial development, they attracted strategically allocated funding, however, this new relationship with enterprise initiatives has presented both opportunities and dilemmas for staff and students.

Entrepreneurial learning and the performing arts

> Higher education has a vital role in maintaining the creativity base within the creative industries – the stimulation of new talent that continuously challenges existing notions, ideas and practices fostering imagination and creativity, and the skills and knowledge to produce and innovate. (Brown, 2004 p.5)

As the concept of enterprise training metamorphosed into a broader concept of entrepreneurial learning and began to be seen more as a collection of behaviours, attitudes and skills, rather than the act of setting up a business, it started to become possible to make more sense of the agenda within the setting of the performing arts as is shown in Brown's (2004, p.1) adaptation of Gibb's theories of teaching and learning in table 2.1. below.

Behaviours	Attitudes	Skills
Taking the initiative	Achievement orientation and ambition	Creative problem solving
Solving problems creatively	Self-confidence and self-esteem	Negotiating
Managing autonomously	Action orientation	Management
Networking effectively to manage independence	Preference for learning by doing	Strategic thinking
Putting things together creatively	Determination	Intuitive decision making in uncertainty
Using judgement to take calculated risk	Creativity	Networking

Table 2.1 Entrepreneurial behaviours, attitudes and skills

Within a music department

Entrepreneurial learning can be conceptualised in two main ways within a music department, firstly in terms of the apparent attributes of music students and secondly in terms of observable activities which reflect 'real world' situations:

> […] the process of getting a cultural 'product' (such as a live performance or a recorded track) from the artist/composer to the 'consumer'. This involves the 'value adding' (entrepreneurial) activities of […] record production, music publishing, artist management, audience development, promotion and distribution (retail and online). (Brown, 2004, p.7)

To work within a diverse university music department is to be surrounded by embryonic 'creative projects', 'initiatives', and 'developments' which emerge from the core musical activities themselves and may go on to transform into certain types of identifiable entrepreneurial behaviour. Students find themselves in the enterprise spotlight: they provide attractive fodder for the advocates of cultural enterprise, they are seen to be enterprising by nature; they are upheld as an example of taking enterprise to a new place, they thrive on 'difference', yet they are 'not for profit' (Benz, 2009), they may be 'community enterprises' and actively distance themselves from the overtly commercial high-tech spinout, at the same time exhibiting a natural disinclination to be seen as entrepreneurs. Music staff also find themselves navigating a new culturally ambiguous territory. For those who choose to engage with 'enterprise' there can be personal rewards: funding for a project, enhanced promotion, cash prizes but there is an ever-present sense that this engagement may be inappropriate and somehow removed from core academic roles and responsibilities.

Within the music departments of my study there appears to be a binary divide between the philosophical and the practical. Colleagues will react intensely to the political implications of the word itself, and exhibit confusion about its wide-ranging usage and yet at the same time they are highly supportive of initiatives designed to help their students to prepare for their future careers as musicians. Nevertheless, entrepreneurship remains a serious but side-lined pedagogical issue within music departments despite the fact that many of our students will be freelance, portfolio workers, prepared to accept low standards of living in exchange for the freedom to continue to do what they love.

Theory and policy in practice

During the second year of my doctoral study, in parallel with the core fieldwork with my student respondents, I set out to gain primary data from three higher education providers on the delivery of entrepreneurship, enterprise and entrepreneurial learning.[22] At the Civic University (my 'home') I initially spent two weeks observing the work of the central Enterprise Team, which is based in the university's Careers Service. The aim of the first placement was to observe the day-to-day operation of a university enterprise centre, nationally renowned for its work to encourage entrepreneurial activity amongst students. The aim of the second placement, which took place a month later, was to build on the data collected in the first period and collect appropriate supporting data, for example internal reports, teaching materials and statistical data on student destinations. Rather than long periods of observation in the centre, this placement focussed on meetings with key members of staff and the observation of specific taught sessions. Whilst the placement within one of my selected institutions allowed me to observe the provision of enterprise education in the broadest generic sense in a large university, I also sought to discover more about how the notion of enterprise might exist within a specialist higher education institution and arranged to spend a day at each of two conservatories in the North and North West of England.

The university enterprise centre

My placements in the university enterprise centre offered three different perspectives on the provision of entrepreneurial education; firstly my own observations of the physical surroundings and the community within; secondly the views of the students accessing the centre and thirdly those of the staff working directly with the students.

The enterprise centre is based within the careers centre but is distinctly different, housed in an informal open access working space - the 'elevator'.[23] Newspaper clippings are stuck on the wall, exhibiting successful ventures - there is a white board with scribbled messages and comments. The room is very light and welcoming, sitting right on one of the city's main streets, opposite the Civic Centre with pedestrians passing by outside.

---

[22] Issues related to access and ethics will be discussed in Chapter 3.
[23] The concept of the elevator pitch is used within business training – can you describe your business idea succinctly to another person whilst using an elevator.

Painted red and white it seeks to consciously reflect a separate corporate identity to that of careers; the careers department is very smart, formal and corporate and reception staff wear uniforms. This physical positioning signifies the importance of the careers and enterprise function. Situated in the same brand-new glass building as the senior management team this is the first main facility visitors see as they enter the campus which, with an open access area for the public, reflects the civic university's mission.

This designated space for entrepreneurial activity appears to create an immediate sense of community; students obviously enjoy working in the centre and as well as being a base for meetings, advice sessions and practical day-to-day running of small student businesses, it is actively promoted as a social space. Collaborative and supportive it is the antithesis of the typical view of entrepreneurial activity with the elements of competition, aggression, individualization. Rather it is operating as a successful community of practice (Wenger, 1998). For much of the time the 'elevator' is staffed by enterprise interns, paid positions for students and recent graduates typically for 10 hours a week. Although only one intern is officially on duty at any one time, several of them base themselves in the 'elevator' at other times and work on personal university assignments and developing their own business ideas; the importance of this community of practice is highlighted by one student currently using the centre:

> The […] great thing about working in The Elevator are the contacts and suggestions that are thrown around as a matter of course and would otherwise probably be missed by myself or anyone else trying to set up from home. I particularly enjoy having a bit of craic and being surrounded by other people in the early stages of business start-up. I genuinely think the first weeks of starting a business would be much more lonely, boring and de-motivating without The Elevator.[24]

A morning of observation[25] spent in the elevator reveals a huge diversity in the use of the centre by students accessing advice ranging from scientific spinout activity to very early stage enterprising ideas:

- A First Year Business Studies student is working at one of the 'hot desks'. She is already setting up an events business having joined the university following a year in industry with the specific intention to set up a business.
- A student drops in for the first time seeking advice on organising a conference in China – the Intern refers him to the duty Development Officer who comes in to the elevator to talk to him.

---

[24] An extract from personal case study written by a student.
[25] The observation took place between 9.00am and 1.00pm on the 2nd February 2011.

- Another student has an idea about setting up some kind of a language school related activity, teaching Russian. He receives some initial advice from the intern who then makes him an appointment to see the designated Development Officer for School of Languages.
- A Renewable Energy MSc graduate is currently basing himself in the centre as he works on the 'pre start-up phase' of his product, a new invention aimed at the domestic market which attaches to existing radiators and helps to circulate the warm air.
- A number of students drop in to discuss entering the current ideas competition, marketed as 'could you be the next Alan Sugar?' and offering a prize of £500 for the best idea.

The examples above illustrate the staged approach to support described to me by the head of the enterprise team, starting with an initial discussion with an intern as to facilities and support available, moving on to a diagnostic interview with a development officer and referral to a business adviser or entrepreneur in residence as appropriate; all the while promoting entrepreneurial opportunities to encourage students to engage with enterprising and entrepreneurial activity.

The centre is student focussed in both its delivery and strategic direction. In addition to the paid internships there is a student enterprise group, set up to bring together students who work for a range of organisations promoting student enterprise. They invite me to observe one of their meetings, the focus of which is the setting up of an enterprise Facebook site and the launching of a new website; they also discuss the possible use of a newsletter and Twitter. They want to 'drive traffic' and 'drive the debate'. They are trying to bring all university enterprise activities together under one umbrella, providing mutual support to each others' events which originate from different student functions within the university. There is a highly cooperative attitude between the different student groups and they are similar in their evangelical zeal for all things entrepreneurial.

A team meeting, to which I am invited, provides a snapshot of both the activity and strategic positioning of the enterprise centre.[26] The meeting opens with a discussion on the provision of modules by the university's own business school, and concerns are expressed over its perceived re-positioning as the primary/only provider of business related modules by shutting down collaborative offers in a major re-structuring of the timetable. It is reported by the head of the enterprise team that concerns have been expressed in recent meetings of the university learning and teaching committee

---

[26] Meeting took place on the morning of the 3rd Feb 2011.

regarding the proliferation of business/enterprise modules, and discussions had, on how might these be cut down and be delivered centrally. The discussion reveals strong issues around ownership of the concept of enterprise and the strategic kudos associated with its delivery raising two key questions: firstly, how do we identify the difference between teaching 'about' entrepreneurship and 'for' entrepreneurship and secondly where does the delivery of enterprise education sit within the research-led teaching agenda. What is clearly revealed by the meeting is the extent to which those engaged with the practice have a direct link to central strategic decision making at senior level in the university. In discussing forthcoming events and funding opportunities it is clear that one of the main aims is to balance the expected participation of students from the business school with engagement from across the faculties; it seems that the team base much of their success on the inclusivity of the applicants; there are frequent references to the need to attract arts students. As the business advisers and development officers report on their current caseloads there is a great deal of advocacy and networking in evidence, the team exhibiting high levels of entrepreneurial skills in their meeting. The enterprise centre appears to exert more influence than its commonly held identity suggests, acting as a hub or broker for many new university and regional collaborations and initiatives.

It is 'Creative Careers Week' the week of my first placement. This is not purely serendipitous, I was specifically invited in for this week with a view to reciprocity - there was a hope that I would be able to provide some feedback having observed some of the training sessions aimed at arts students. The first session I attend is entitled 'Working Freelance'.[27] The session takes place in a brand new, fairly formal, seminar room and is facilitated by a development officer in partnership with a business adviser who has her own thriving fine art business. There are 13 students in total, exact subject areas not known. The aims of the session are presented very gently to students 'you may well not think of yourself as a business', 'I know you may just think of yourself as an artist'. A series of questions is put to the group about their backgrounds, aims, skills and knowledge and some basic theory on entrepreneurship is briefly mentioned. Interestingly, as the session moves away from the discussion of 'soft skills' and moves on to the introduction of a business plan, the tone of the session becomes more formal and rigid but students appear to become more animated.

---

[27] Afternoon of the 3rd February 2011.

There was low attendance at this session given that it was open to the whole university and the number of arts students who express an intention to be self-employed. The word 'freelance' was used for promotion purposes but the session quickly moved into a business planning session. The reaction of the students raises some interesting questions. Have we gone too far in attempting to attract arts students to these kinds of sessions with a softly, softly approach? Would a really clear skills based session get more response for example 'how to register as a sole trader'? A few weeks later, during my second placement I attend a session on 'creative ideas generation for English students'.[28] Eight students (all female) arrive, disappointing to the course deliverers as 21 students had signed up. The session highlighted the difficulties in making such a workshop attractive to arts students. As far as music students are concerned, and possibly English students, ideas are rarely the problem. The stimulus for this session was nonetheless interesting. It is highly unusual for an enterprise centre to make strong inroads into English departments. Even though this session was strongly validated by tutors, in the end, few students chose to show up. It appears that a particular language is needed in the promotion of these sessions; the content is well received by students who attend but there are real issues in appealing to arts students in the first place.

In my role in my own music department I have frequently referred students to the enterprise centre; now on placement I found the opportunity to talk directly to a business adviser who has worked with music students. Neil (pseudonym), a business owner and adviser, has worked with students at the university for the past 10 years. He says he sees musicians all the time and has worked with several students referred by me. He tells me that for many of the musicians he works with, business is a dirty word. He feels he needs to show them how to develop a 'business head […] Music students have all sorts of stuff going on at any one time'. Although it seems unlikely that these students would have independently opted to visit the Enterprise Centre or attend one of the open training sessions, once they have met one of the members of staff they are highly likely to continue with the relationship. Contradicting the perception that arts students are not easily engaging with the centre it appears that out of a total of 109 businesses supported by the Business Advisors during the period 2005-2011, 13 were music businesses (see table 2.2 below) - 12% across the whole university.

---

[28] 16th March 2011.

ACADEMIC YEAR	MUSIC BUSINESS
2005-2006	Focal Music
	Bums on Seats
2006-2007	Myrtle Tyrtle
	Fiddle Music
2007-2008	Sarah Jane Miller – Music Teacher
2008-2009	Wildwish Music
	NowHearThis
	Dave Wisdom Music
2009-2010	Thomas Rushton
	Sapien Records
2010-2011	Crossings
	Rory McDonald
	Stephen Farrell

Table 2.2 Student music businesses supported by the Civic University enterprise centre.

Julie (pseudonym) a development officer in the team, has worked with musicians in both a work and non-work context as her partner is a musician. She feels that the geographical location of enterprise support units is highly significant and that superb facilities cannot compensate for a poor location. She emphasises the coaching element of her role, taking a diagnostic, self directed, purposeful approach, working with students to plan where they want to be. She will work with a client on a long term basis to take them to the point where they have completed their initial market research, after which time they will be referred to a business adviser. In both her current and previous jobs she reports on coaching a number of music students and feels that in general they respond really well to advice. Echoing the statements of the student users of the centre, Julie points to the importance of establishing a community, in which arts students feel comfortable.

The conservatories

If we ask the broad question 'how does government policy on entrepreneurship work in practice in higher education?' there are potentially two locations of relevance to music students; the mainstream university or the specialist conservatory. At the Civic University I had been surprised by the number of music students accessing individual business support, even though they did not appear to respond to wider provision of enterprise training in the form of workshops, competitions and optional, centrally

delivered modules. In order to gain a broader view of 'policy in practice' I carried out fieldwork at two Northern conservatories[29] in the UK, the North and North West, with the aim of gaining a broad picture of life in these specialist institutions and an understanding of how the concept of the music student as entrepreneur is received and understood in this different context. Having already started to formulate ideas and questions based on primary and secondary research to date, as part of the fieldwork I set up meetings with those staff with responsibility for professional development of the students and, taking a hermeneutic approach[30], share my initial findings with them and use this as the basis for a wider discussion.[31]

A conservatory education in the UK has traditionally focussed on vocational education and training and, as would be expected, only a minority of students at the colleges go on to pursue careers outside music. The two conservatories visited both address employability in the broadest sense seriously but in distinctly different ways.

The North Conservatory, an FE and HE institution, explicitly foregrounds the concept of enterprise with promotional campaigns and events such as 'Entrepreneurs Boot Camp – get fit for business'[32] and, with its city centre location, mirrors the ethos and the geography of the Civic University. There is a strong focus on contemporary music production and the music business with professional development activities threaded through all the programmes. In talking to staff and students it appears that there is strong endorsement, acceptance and understanding of the terms enterprise and entrepreneurship.

The North West Conservatory, whilst acknowledging that:

> The professional world of work in music requires not only that graduates should be expert performers and composers but also multi-skilled and entrepreneurial individuals able to apply their skills across a wide range of activities.[33]

---

[29] For the purposes of this study, as with the main field sites, the real names of these conservatories have been changed.
[30] To be be discussed in detail in Chapter 3.
[31] See appendix 1.
[32] From promotional flyer for event taking place in June 2011 at the North Conservatory.
[33] From the North West Conservatory CETL brochure 2010.

maintains a more traditional, professional studies approach reflecting the high proportion of students aiming for a career in the classical music profession. Providing a high profile concert venue, the conservatory runs its own music agency through which students begin to gain paid freelance work.

Both institutions have been recognised for their expertise in professional development for their students through the award of major funding (HEIF and CETL) but in spite of this there is still a sense from staff that there are sensitivities in working with particular groups, such as music students, which are not necessarily acknowledged within central government policy and remain difficult to address through mainstream entrepreneurship provision. Time spent at these institutions provided a useful specialist lens through which to view the data on the provision of enterprise and entrepreneurial learning within a typical university setting.

Nascent entrepreneurship and music students

As we have seen, there is now an established paradigm of entrepreneurial learning, which connects closely with careers and employability theory. However, as the term entrepreneurship has been steadily integrated into our universities it has been disconnected from its origins and to a certain extent trivialised. Rather than relying on a purely skills based approach, could a deeper theoretical connection be drawn between core theories of entrepreneurship and our teaching of enterprise and professional development to arts students? One theory of entrepreneurship which seems to most closely to reflect the entrepreneurial 'state' of some music students is that of nascent entrepreneurship. Here, I intend to 'make strange' key features of the theory by transposing them from their more natural home, (small business start-up) to a university music department.

Nascent entrepreneurship[34]

Within entrepreneurship theory towards the end of the 20th century, there emerged a new way of thinking based around the identification of that specific state within an

---

[34] This section has been adapted from a book chapter by D. Weatherston on Nascent Entrepreneurship and Music Students.

individual whereby 'entrepreneurial thinking has not yet expressed itself in a visible way' (Durham Business School Centre for Entrepreneurship, 2006): nascent entrepreneurship.

Nascent entrepreneurship by its very nature is hidden; to be nascent – 'in the act of being born, just beginning to be, not yet mature' (The Concise Oxford Dictionary, 1964) within the context of entrepreneurship is to be:

> Somebody who is, alone or with others, currently trying to start a new business; expect to be owners or part owners of the new firm, and have been active in trying to start the new firm in the past 12 months. (Johnson, Parker and Wijbenga, 2006)

Although the literature suggests many variants to this definition, the main agreed principle within entrepreneurship theory is that to be nascent, an entrepreneurial activity has not yet reached the stage of a company making regular (more than 3 months) salary payments. A broader, applied definition is offered by Collins, Smith and Hannon (2006, p. 336): 'undergraduate students at an early stage of their entrepreneurial development'. Offering us a way to conceptualise nascent entrepreneurship in the wider sense Wagner (2005, p. 2) uses the analogy of "biological creation", four stages with three transitions, a theory aligned with evolutionary economics: conception →gestation →infancy →adolescence.

The overall theoretical underpinning of the concept of nascent entrepreneurship is in the main drawn from a combination of data from large scale surveys and questionnaires aimed at identifying entrepreneurial traits, for example Reynolds (2005), and two major data sets: the Panel Study of Entrepreneurial Dynamics (PSED) and the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor (GEM) [35] out of which the concept of nascent entrepreneurship emerged. Evidence from these primarily quantitative research projects has had major significance. It has directly informed government policy by identifying precise stimulants to nascent activity including:

---

[35]The Global Entrepreneurship Monitor (GEM) is the largest ongoing survey on entrepreneurial activity across the globe. GEM data is widely used in quntitative academic studies of entrepreneurship. http://www.gemconsortium.org

- regional location

- visibility of role models

- gender

- ethnicity

- access to financial resources

- possession of cultural capital

- the act of writing a business plan

This field of research, which is drawn from a conventionally agreed notion of 'business', seems to offer a possible new perspective on the nature of entrepreneurial activity amongst music students, firstly by considering a music department in terms of the overarching theory of nascent entrepreneurship and secondly by setting observed activity against some of the factors identified above.

The theory and the students

If it is possible to set aside the distraction of business terminology, to forget about 'the firm' and make a conceptual step change to 'project' or 'enterprise', there exists some common space between a music student's early entrepreneurial ventures and those of the more conventionally identified nascent entrepreneur. Students might talk about their creative idea; enter a period of development; start consulting with others on putting the idea on a more business like footing and possibly launch as a business.

On the Wagner continuum, it is the transitions between phases, which invite closer examination. The conception-gestation phase is observable in the form of various student projects, but there is less evidence of successful transition to the second phase 'when the new venture either starts an operating business, or when the nascent entrepreneurs abandon their effort and a stillborn happens' (Wagner 2005, p.2). If we accept that nascency sits in the space between gestation and infancy, is it possible, or even useful, to locate where music students sit in their early engagements with enterprise?

The large scale surveys fall short in this new location: the activities of music students do not fit naturally into the questionnaires typically used to identify nascent entrepreneurs where, finding there to be no suitable category offered, they are may be forced to categorise their type of 'business' as 'something else', and as such become immediately 'othered' within the research process. There are however, some clear parallels to be drawn between the factors identified in this research as conducive to nascent entrepreneurship and a 'community' of university music students.

The importance of role models and the act of writing a business plan already take centre stage in the delivery of enterprise education and for this reason I will ignore these; I am also excluding issues of gender and ethnicity on the basis that I am not addressing these aspects of student entrepreneurship within this thesis. The three facilitators of nascent entrepreneurship (major fields in entrepreneurship research which appear to be unacknowledged and hence under-theorised within enterprise education) are: possession of cultural capital; regional location; access to financial resources. I will now consider each of these in turn within the context of university music departments.

Music department as micro-region

Taking an anthropological approach, a music department can be viewed as a micro – region within which there exist territories, both physical (student spaces, different buildings) and intellectual (genres, instruments played). Within the music department at the Civic University, students have a new common room and the existence of this social workspace appears to have directly facilitated the emergence of some new entrepreneurial activity, most recently the setting up of a student music festival. This initiative, set up to include students from all year groups directly resonates with Mueller's work (2005), most specifically in its intention to develop a spiral relationship between alumni, current and new students:

> Regions with a high population of young and small firms could stimulate nascent entrepreneurship due to the existence of a large number of entrepreneurs. The owners of these firms act as role models and are important in creating and sustaining an entrepreneurial climate. Individuals are embedded in their environment and consequently affected by friends, neighbours. (Mueller, 2005, p.4)

The Collegiate University creates two different spaces for its music students, some activities clearly located within the music department itself whilst college based activities, open to students across disciplines are also significant in the students' lives.[36] The Vocational University, as a well-known public landmark, has a significant affect on its small number of students. Being taught in an architecturally stunning location seems to engender a feeling of privilege whilst the constant contact with visiting professional artists creates a musical micro-region full of role models.

Cultural capital

Bourdieu (1984) introduced the concept of cultural capital and the significance of art and culture in the maintenance of hierarchies within a capitalist society (Middleton, 2003, p. 253). His complex theories have since been requisitioned by academics within sociology and education, primarily to illuminate issues related to inequality arising from the assumption, as Green (2003, p. 265) suggests, that the education system 'presupposes equality in values and incentives at the starting post'.

The key features of cultural capital associated with nascent entrepreneurship are access to education and work experience, although within business and economics journals 'work experience' tends to be referred to as time served in real paid jobs, as opposed to the wider interpretation of this term within a higher education context. This relationship between cultural capital and nascent entrepreneurship is complex but potentially highly significant within universities:

> Formal education, as a credential, can provide access to certain social networks (e.g., alumni network) or serve as a positive signal when nascent entrepreneurs are evaluated by resource providers (e.g., venture capital financing). However, the association between education and entrepreneurship is not necessarily straightforward. (Aldrich, 2005, p. 9)

---

[36] Musicon, Music Society

Access to financial support

There have been many studies on financial support as a determinant of entrepreneurial engagement. Grilo and Thurik (2005, p. 12) suggest that the perception of lack of financial support has no discriminative effect across the various levels of entrepreneurial engagement. If we were to apply this as a hypothesis to a community of music students would the findings be similar to a growing feeling amongst careers advisers, that only those students with more cultural and financial capital are likely to be able to take advantage of internships and work placement opportunities? Is it the case that entrepreneurial exploits are a luxury, more likely to be engaged in by those students who are more financially secure, who do not have to work during term time and who might have access to financial support from their families? Or, as Aldrich (2005, p. 8) suggests, could it be that 'at lower income levels, individuals may find the opportunity cost so low that they lose little or nothing by pursuing the uncertainties of income from a new venture'?

Not only do these theories themselves help to provide alternative readings, such theorising can be used to validate both the concept of entrepreneurship and the validity of the entrepreneurship education offer within a university setting. The act of identifying and sampling these selected theories of nascent entrepreneurship and then re-situating them within a music department provides rich potential in considering the idea of the music student as entrepreneur.

Conclusion

In this chapter I have positioned the music student as an entrepreneur both historically and theoretically and have identified the existing theoretical structures which will inform my study. This is an epistemological re-positioning of entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning with specific reference to music and music students. The rapidly changing nature of 'the university' coupled with vulnerabilities of UK regions such as the North East at this time (2013) has created a new landscape for music students. Within this challenging and changing landscape sit the music departments and students at the centre of this study and it is this micro-world that I will now go on to explore.

CHAPTER 3: ENTERING THE FIELD

On a basic level, ethnomusicological ethnographers must start off by trying to understand the experiences of their research participants on the participants' own terms, to share as richly as possible their experiences of music and social life, and to understand their interpretations of that life. (Berger, 2008, p.73)

Introduction

This thesis is inter-disciplinary and makes a new contribution to knowledge through the bringing together of three previously unconnected paradigms: entrepreneurship; entrepreneurial learning; and the study of music students within a unique geographical context. I have employed a research methodology rooted firmly in both existing research findings on entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning within universities, as discussed in Chapter 1, and the growing body of generic studies on 'the student experience' and 'student engagement'; but have repositioned these existing studies alongside primary qualitative data from within a new subject specific context – music.

This chapter opens with a discussion on the field of qualitative research and makes the case for the suitability of this approach to data gathering both practically, in working closely with a small group of respondents, and conceptually, in terms of synergies with the discipline of ethnomusicology. I will describe the pilot study which informed and supported the approach to the main study before introducing the music student respondents.

Methodology

The aim of my methodology is to move towards a new epistemology of entrepreneurship. My thesis seeks a greater richness and depth of knowledge in an attempt to gain an understanding of how the concept of entrepreneurship plays out within my purposefully selected music departments. Through a detailed study of the students with whom I work and, with an activist agenda, the aim is to make this world 'visible' (Denzin and Lincoln, 2008a). To achieve this, I have carried out a unique qualitative study, looking at the three selected university music departments; The Vocational University, The Civic University and The Collegiate University, through the lens of entrepreneurship, refracted through the prism that is the students' own words.

The research seeks to expose a much richer vein and to reveal data that remains hidden within existing large-scale quantitative data sets, such as the Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA)[37] returns and The National Student Survey[38] (NSS). In presenting my findings, interviews with students past and present, reflective essays, case studies, questionnaires and observational ethnographic data have been woven together, contextualized by secondary resource materials, to establish in the broadest sense what it means to be an entrepreneurial music student in the 21st century.[39] The text is characterised, in the tradition of ethnographic writing, by the use of the first person to present an in-depth analysis of transcripts. This has involved a complex procedure of selection and interpretation, privileging the voice of the respondents throughout by the use of direct quotes from their interviews.

Before outlining the practicalities of the primary data gathering and analysis process it is important to address the complex array of possibilities offered by the field of qualitative research in the 21st century and to acknowledge the existence of qualitative research as an academic subject in its own right. What follows is firstly an overview of the field of qualitative research (paying particular attention to the work of Denzin and Lincoln), secondly an illustration of some of the more radical aspects of the field and thirdly a discussion of the applied use of qualitative research into entrepreneurship and music. Most significantly I will identify some key methodological connections between the use of ethnography and anthropology in the social sciences and in a key paradigm in the study of music and musicians – ethnomusicology. It is at this intersection that my thesis sits.

Qualitative research - overview

Whilst acknowledging that the dates are somewhat arbitrary and that 'moments overlap and simultaneously operate in the present', Denzin and Lincoln's eight moments of qualitative research provide an important historical overview within which to consider

---

[37] The Higher Education Statistics Agency publishes an annual return Destinations of Leavers from Higher Education DLHE http://www.hesa.ac.uk.
[38] The National Student Survey publishes annual data, gathered during students' final year, on all aspects of their course and university http://www.thestudentsurvey.com.
[39] See 2: poster presentation 2010.

qualitative research and potential methodologies, contextualised within the history of entrepreneurship research:

- The Traditional Period 1900 – World War 11.

- Modernist Phase – post-war years – 1970s

- Blurred Genres – 1970 – 1986

- Crisis of Representation – mid- 1980s

- Postmodern Period

- Postexperimental Inquiry 1995-2000

- Methodologically Contested Present 2000 –2004

- Now, The Future from 2005

    (Denzin and Lincoln, 2008b, p.3.)

Denzin and Lincoln's Traditional Period is characterised by the colonialist study of 'the other', a strong concern with validity, objectivity and the need to reflect the positivist scientific paradigm; this was the period of the lone ethnographers such as Malinowski and Mead. They go on to describe the Modernist Phase as the 'golden age of rigorous qualitative analysis' with a view of qualitative researchers as 'cultural romantics' who, despite the burgeoning new ideas of the time, remained committed in some part to a quantitative reading of the data, with the use of probabilities and frequencies. By the 1970s, the Blurred Genres phase 'symbolic interactionism, constructivism, naturalistic enquiry, positivism and post positivism, phenomenology, ethnomethodology, critical theory, neo-Marxist theory, semiotics, structuralism, feminism' (Denzin and Lincoln, 2008b, p.23) were all in the qualitative researcher's tool kit until a 'profound rupture' occurred, The Crisis of Representation in the mid-1980s. The work of Clifford Geertz straddles these two periods, questioning boundaries between the humanities and social sciences. Most significantly, writing becomes more reflexive, informed now by issues of gender, class and race, problematising once again validity, reliability and objectivity. The Postmodern period experimented with new types of ethnographic dialogue and pointed towards a more participatory and activist – orientated approach until the mid 1990s, the moments of Postexperimental Inquiry and the Methodologically Contested Present; difficult, fractured times supported throughout by the publication of two new journals: *Qualitative Inquiry* and *Qualitative Research.* Finally, the eighth (present) moment calls for 'critical conversations' within the social sciences and humanities and

challenges scholars to confront 'the methodological backlash associated with "Bush science" and the evidence-based social movement'. (Denzin and Lincoln, 2008b, p.27).

A recent edition of the journal *Qualitative Enquiry* (2010) illustrates the diversity of this present moment described by Denzin and Lincoln (2003) as a space where:

> Postmodern representations search out and experiment with narratives that expand the range of understanding, voice, and the storied variations in human experience. As much as they are social scientists, inquirers also become storytellers, poets, and playwrights, experimenting with personal narratives, first person accounts, reflexive interrogations, and deconstruction of the forms of tyranny embedded in representational practices. (p.285)

This diversity of approaches is reflected in the six articles contained within this recent edition of offering us a snapshot of some of the more radical recent work:

> "What a Long, Strange Trip It's been…": Twenty-Five Years of Qualitative and New Paradigm Research'. (Lincoln, 2010)
>
> Metropoems: Poetic Method and Ethnographic Experience. (Maréchal and Linstead, 2010)
>
> Through the Looking Glass: Our Autoethnographic Journey Through Research Mind-Fields. (McMillan and Price, 2010)
>
> Qualitative Interviewing as an Embodied Emotional Performance. (Ezzy, 2010)
>
> A/r/t: A Poetic Montage. (Leavy, 2010)
>
> An Autoethnography: Music therapy after Laser Eye Surgery. (Lee, K.V., 2010)

Lincoln (2010, p.3) tracks the development of the field, which she sees as a personal journey, from 'informal conversation' to 'a cacophony, of articulate, nuanced, thoughtful, and extremely sophisticated thinkers and writers'. Pointing to the research council's dismissal of 'non scientific' research she directs doubters to see the 'tsunami' of interpretivist, ethnographic literature of the past 25 years which has added rich data to the dialogue around practices of teaching and learning, accessibility, racism, gender discrimination, class and diversity but also points to future directions:

> We are beginning to see hybridity, not as exotic and ambiguous, but as the bellwether of globalism, and there are those visionaries out there-people like George Marcus-who believe the effects of globalism are the next ethnographic frontier. (Lincoln, 2010, p.4)

She introduces the concept of 'working the hyphens' (Lincoln, 2010, p.5), the 'Self-Other conjunction' arguing for the need to remain alert to difference, aware of the limitations of rapport in the relationship. Explaining the difference in the qualitative field, where the accumulation of knowledge is so hard to demonstrate, she points to a different sort of knowledge that does not progressively hypothesise and move to the next level, suggesting that interpretivist theories lack elegance but 'are fat with the juice of human endeavour' (Lincoln, 2010, p.6).

There are questions to be asked about the radical inclusive nature of qualitative research:

> we are interpretivists, postmodernists, poststructuralists; we are phenomenological, feminist, critical. We choose lenses that are border, racial and ethnic, hybrid, queer, differently abled, indigenous, margin, centre, Other. (Lincoln, 2010, p.8)

However it would seem that as a qualitative researcher the ability to both understand and deploy this plurality of approaches can add to depth and richness. Research poetry imposes a clear restriction on the research gathering process prescribing a strict recording method allied to Oulipian[40] school of writing (Maréchal and Linstead, 2010). This method is focussed in the moment, neither a too inward reflection of the researcher themselves or too empathic towards the ethnographic Other, the poet is immersed in the experience and as such adheres to and informs the principles of ethnography. Another example of ABR (arts-based-research) is Leavy's poetic montage, which, moving beyond the more mainstream concept of 'the quilt' in qualitative research also uses the justification of 'truth that is felt and understood in the moment' (2010, p. 240).

As well as the arts-based-research discussed above, *Qualitative Inquiry* (2010) also features two examples of autoethnography exploring two diverse subjects; the teaching of research in academia and recovery from laser eye surgery.

> Who has the right to teach research? What constitutes legitimate research? What roles do narrative and imposition play in knowing and being known? Using a performative format, with Lewis Carroll's Alice's Adventures in Wonderland & Through the Looking-Glass as literary and methodological tools, the authors attempt to include readers in their arduous and sometimes comical journeys through the academic

---

[40] A form of constrained writing, linked to mathematical constructs which was originally practised by a group of French mathematicians and literary writers in the 1960s.

adolescence of Wonderland and back again through the looking glass. (McMillan and Price, 2010, p.140)

Although this abstract is initially shocking, what actually emerges is a beautifully written extended metaphor supported by a scholarly justification for the use of a fictional format as methodology. Autoethnography also employs the traditional technique of thick description, in a more internalised form. Time bound and detailed it attempts to gain richness of data, for example, the recovery process after laser eye surgery alleviated by music as described by Lee. This is thick description but is also a long way from the thick description of the old ethnomusicologists' work. It is intensely internalised; there is a thin line to be drawn between this and creative writing, where the self declared intent is to 'reflect[s] on living simultaneously in a culture of temptation and a culture of control' (Lee, 2010, p.244).

The examples presented above demonstrate some of the more radical forms of contemporary qualitative research, the most obvious features being the blurring of the arts/social science divide; a deconstructive approach to the research process; the strong presence of the researcher within the research process; and the enduring importance of ethnography, albeit in new settings. The majority of the writers are female and articles exhibit a clear feminist positioning. The journal brings a new perspective whilst at the same time referencing the cornerstones of qualitative research as used in the field: the concept of the self-other; working the hyphens; immediacy; working in the moment; quilting; montage; collecting; auto-ethnography; and thick description. The idea that new genres are needed to explore difficult situations, in this case within a university, validates my own project to identify new approaches to researching entrepreneurship. In constructing my own methodology these more radical approaches can be used to further triangulate my data and to add a richness of approach to the study alongside existing qualitative approaches to entrepreneurship, entrepreneurial learning and ethnomusicology – the key locations for my study.

Qualitative research - entrepreneurship

Established positivist empirical data sets currently dominate research into entrepreneurship[41] although recently there have been ever-increasing calls from across the community of entrepreneurship scholars for new approaches (Blackburn and Kovalainen, 2009; Davidsson, 2004). Where more radical methods of qualitative enquiry are being deployed, entrepreneurship scholars still seem to be looking nervously back across their shoulders at the ever present positivist hoards, continuing to seek validation through the inclusion of statistical data to 'back up' their more tentative qualitative approaches.

Neergaard and Ulhøi's *Handbook of Qualitative Research Methods in Entrepreneurship* (2007) emerges from the discussion of entrepreneurship theory and the growing call for the use of new qualitative methods. In their infancy as a paradigm or field, qualitative studies still attract active hostility from key entrepreneurship journals. Bygrave (2007) (ironically being forced into a statistical position in order to evidence the case), points out that it is 'extremely difficult' to get qualitative research published and presents the astonishing fact that across nine 'A' journals 95% of articles used statistical methods of analysis and that the instrument used was primarily the questionnaire in all its various forms, 10% of the articles were based on interviews, less than 1% used observation. As Bygrave wrote 'truth be told, our studies derived from theory and driven by methodology produce mostly pedestrian findings that are of little or no interest to practitioners' (2007, p.24). However, some notable examples of qualitative approaches to researching entrepreneurship have emerged over the last two decades; ethnography (Kondo, 1990); longitudinal study (Down and Reveley, 2004); paradigm interplay (Howarth, Tempest and Coupland, 2005) and social constructivism (Nicholson and Anderson, 2005).

Anthropologist Dorinne Kondo's classic text (1990) provides an excellent example of a reflexive approach; situating herself within an autoethnography of small businesses in Japan she exploits an essentially feminist methodology, building up a picture of a community geographically, socially and aesthetically. She uses conventions which are

---

[41] For example the GEM (Global Entrepreneurship Monitor) discussed in Chapter 2, p.59.

synchronous with my chosen way of accessing the field, such as the use of the 'setting trope' (p7):

> […]this sense of increasing familiarity I think anthropologists invoke when we begin our ethnographies by describing the "setting", where we lay out the map of "our" country, "our" community, and retrace the journey that brought us to those communities. (Kondo, 1990 p.7)

In his work on entrepreneurial identity, Simon Down employs qualitative approaches rooted in narrative practice, for example looking at how entrepreneurs use cliché (Down and Warren, 2008), and challenges positivist approaches to research on entrepreneurial identity using longitudinal ethnographic accounts of SMEs[42] (Down and Reveley, 2004). In their work on paradigm interplay, Howarth, Tempest and Coupland (2005) raise questions about why a functionalist paradigm dominates entrepreneurship research. They argue that 'it is counter intuitive in a field characterised by dynamism, ambiguity, discontinuity, uniqueness and innovation' and go on to demonstrate a methodology whereby data from four case studies, (interview transcripts) were each refracted in turn through normative, interpretive, dialogic and then critical lenses.

Social constructivist approaches involving content analysis and narrative enquiry provide methodologies with which to interrogate aspects of the entrepreneurial personality, for example the 'myth' of the entrepreneur through metaphor as constructed in a well-known broadsheet: 'Of all the entrepreneurial discourse, metaphor is the most vivid' (Nicholson and Anderson, 2005). The common features of these four examples of qualitative research methods are that they interrogate the data in great detail, from several perspectives, focussing on the individual subject whilst at the same time in some way acknowledging the presence of the researcher.

Qualitative research – entrepreneurial education

The original idea of entrepreneurial education was closely tied to economic development and as far back as the 1970's developing nations such as Malaysia and the Philippines were already taking this seriously, starting 'during the student's formative years in primary and secondary school and also to be extended to activities in the home

---

[42] Small and Medium Sized Enterprises, defined by the European Commission as businesses with fewer than 250 employees and an annual turnover of less than £50m.
http://ec.europa.eu/enterprise/policies/sme/facts-figures-analysis/sme-definition/ (accessed 12/6/13)

and in the community' (Nelson, 1977, p.885). Interestingly, even at this early stage, Nelson was defining entrepreneurship in a wider sense than just that of creating a new business, rather as a 'means to stimulate the creativity and innovation necessary to create a better community, a better nation, a better world' (Nelson, 1977, p.885); a statement of this kind is still likely to be expressed in presentation speeches at university enterprise awards ceremonies.

As with theories of entrepreneurship, within entrepreneurial education, with some very notable exceptions (Gibb, 2002, 2005; Matlay, 2006), there appears to have been scant interest in the possible deployment of more experimental qualitative approaches. The annual large destination and student satisfaction surveys mentioned previously provide the single most important data set on students and, although these surveys may provide some key statistics (for example number of self-employed students), they offer little in the way of potential to translate this information into meaningful curriculum development. In terms of considering the employability of music students, Janet Mills (2004) has contributed to data in a major longitudinal study of graduates from the Royal College of Music. Dawn Bennett's (2008) work also addresses the issue of working musicians in the broader sense but despite a partially qualitative approach, what both these studies have in common is data drawn from larger data sets of students than is the case within this study.

Fifteen years ago in Finland, Jorma Heiskanen took issue with the fact that enterprise education was beyond criticism, trivialised as the connections between theories of entrepreneurship became diluted within a new conceptual setting, the university.

> Enterprise education is a theoretical chaos, because it is based on deficient empirical research and because it is tied to different untested beliefs. It is not enough that entrepreneurship instructor [sic] will show a few super examples of successful enterprises. Can we derive a whole education system from those? (transl. Heiskanen, 1996 in Erkkilä, (2000)

More recently Bygrave (2007) has suggested there is a lack of practical application associated with entrepreneurship research, specifically within the teaching of entrepreneurship. He points to the unswerving belief in the importance of the business plan, in the main unchallenged within scholarly articles, and calls for pluralism or 'the losers will be our students and the practice of entrepreneurship' (p.27).

In my opinion there is an opportunity to build on existing pedagogical research methodology into entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning. Current studies on the student experience rarely acknowledge the role of the researcher and yet the student respondents are frequently studied by their own tutors, the effect of which is potentially significant. There appears to be a detachment within existing research into entrepreneurship, and although more recent studies involve a closer subject/observer relationship (Down and Warren, 2008), there is still little evidence of a self-reflective approach on the part of the observer. Entrepreneurship encounters within universities between students and advisors involve an element of emotional content, and researchers involved with students on a daily basis need to acknowledge their own empathetic and interventionist approaches. Although there appears to be some confusion in the research camps of entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning, the very presence of this confusion offers a potentially rich menu of methodologies to deploy within the research setting of this study, the university music department; specifically an ethnographic approach.

Ethnomusicology

Ethnomusicology traditionally brought together the musicological and the ethnological, often within a comparative framework, to adopt 'the study of music in culture' (Merriam, 1964) and then subsequently became a discipline in its own right, dividing the study of music into musicology, ethnomusicology and theory and composition (Schwarz, Kassabian and Lawrence, 1997, p.1). This has not happened without some fracturing of the discipline and there is still much disagreement centred on the positivist/qualitative continuum. Although the 'music' and 'culture' in my study will refer to a context far removed from that of Merriam's work back in the 1960s, I would suggest that my research draws on many of the principles of the new ethnomusicologies, enshrined below in the remit of the British Forum for Ethnomusicology which states:

> Ethnomusicology has been defined as ***the study of 'people making music'***, encompassing the study of all musics, including Western art music and popular musics. What makes it distinctive as an approach within music studies is its emphasis on first-hand, ***sustained engagement with people as music makers.*** This engagement often takes the form of ***ethnographic writing*** following one or more periods of ***fieldwork***, which

usually involves some element of performance training and practice. Typically, ethnographies aim to assess the whole process and contexts through and within which music is imagined, discussed and made. ***Ethnography may be synthesized with*** a variety of ***analytical***, historical and other methodologies, and may involve methods associated with music psychology, ***music education***, historical musicology, performance studies, ***critical theory***, dance, folklore and linguistics, among many other subjects. ***The field is therefore characterized by its breadth in theory and method, its interdisciplinary nature and its global perspective.*** (website of the British Forum for Ethnomusicology, 26/7/2010) [my italics]

This can, without too much difficulty, be abstracted to provide a methodological guide to a study of music students and entrepreneurship and it would not be the first time such an approach has been used for a pedagogical study of music students. If we accept that 'ethnomusicology, like anthropology, assumes the ability of an outside observer to collect data and report back on the musical-cultural practices of other cultures' (Schwarz, Kassabian and Lawrence, 1997, p.2), what is both unique (and it could be argued potentially problematic about my own study) is an absence rather than a presence; the music itself takes second position to the players. As far as participant observation goes, the ability to play music with your respondents gives a unique access, a point of contact, and of course this is what is referred to by Schwarz et al. This throws up some interesting questions for me as a 'non musician'. Can my point of contact, entrepreneurship, work in the same way? Is my work with students as an enabler of creative projects and in some cases, approver of funding, akin to patronage? This is an ethnographic study not dependent on discussion of the music itself, as such it can be constituted as form of new ethnomusicology, ethnographic at its heart but sitting on the outer reaches of the core practice of the discipline. This kind of hinterland has been identified by others as:

> The study of men in society in so far as they express themselves through the medium of music….Looked at in this way, it is the function of all musicology to be in fact ethnomusicology, that is, to take its range of research to include material that is termed 'sociological'. (Harrison, Hood and Palisca, in Kerman, 1994, p.4)

Titon offers us a clear definition for an epistemology of ethnomusicology:

> […]concerned with the origins, nature and limits of human knowledge concerning music in human life. An epistemology for ethnomusicology attempts to answer two basic questions: What can we know about music, and how can we know it? (Titon, 2008, p. 25)

I would argue that the epistemology also encompasses what we know and can know about musicians, and therefore music students. Titon describes his engagement with the emergence of the new ethnomusicology and rehearses many of the same discussions which exist across the social sciences. There is a move away from dialogic/dialectic/oppositional approaches:

> So began a long process in which I pondered the different kinds of knowing that arose from the structured interviews that were part of the old fieldwork, versus those life stories told to sympathetic listeners or friends in a "real life" situation that could not, then, be described as fieldwork, but whose resultant texts I maintained ought to be valued, not as a form of data gathering, but as a means toward understanding. (Titon, 2008, p. 27)

Titon highlights the difference between 'explanation' (sciences) and 'understanding' (humanities) and suggests that 'If explanation is directed toward objects, understanding is directed toward people' (p. 27). He claims that routes of academic discussion of ethnomusicology position the discipline as explanation, emerging as it did from what was known as comparative musicology. Titon argues for a re-framing of metaphors around ethnomusicology, 'the world is not like a text to be read but like a musical performance to be experienced' (p.29).

There are some key examples of ethnographic texts which sit closely with my own intentions: Kingsbury's study of an American conservatory (1988); Nettl's study of Midwestern university schools of music (1995); closer to home, Finnegan's study of music making in Milton Keynes (1989) and Cottrell's study of professional musicians in London (2004). Kingsbury and Nettl carried out their studies with music students in two educational settings in the United States. There has been ongoing interplay through articles and editorials between the two texts which requires further exploration; they are different but what they share in common is their reflexive approach - 'Let me be quite personal' says Nettl (1995, p.1) in his opening sentence. He describes his personal ethnomusicological journey, arriving at a point where he can 'look also at the familiar as if it were not, at ones own culture as if one were a foreigner to it' (p.1). Nettl's work is perhaps more directly aligned to my own study in that he is looking at music departments within universities rather than the conservatory sector used as the basis for Kingsbury's study, and his perception of the department is one that I recognise, 'small

but complex, a bit like some tribal societies perhaps, isolated in some ways and not in others' (Nettl, 1995, p.7). Both texts have been used to inform my own methodology.

Nettl in his forward suggests there is little in the literature *about* fieldwork within ethnomusicology and questions why ethnomusicologists 'are so private about the fieldwork' (2008, p.vii). He seems to suggest there is something unique in the methodology employed by ethnomusicologists but I would argue that the main distinction seems to be that it is under theorized compared to other areas in the social sciences and consequentially, a heavy focus on methodology has historically been somewhat discouraged within university music departments.

In 1988 Kingsbury, introduced at conferences as '''an anthropologist who has studied a conservatory as a tribe''' (p.11) wrote his ethnography of a conservatory. Although a music academic and teacher, he had, like me, a long history as a counsellor and advisor, and a deep interest in the emerging identities of students and the connection with their musicality. The study takes an ethnomusicological approach to studying a conservatory, which includes accounts of the individual experiences of music students. It shows little of transition processes or of the community of musicians as a whole but does root ideas in musicological theory. He draws useful connections between anthropology, ethnomusicology and the context of the conservatory describing 'music as a metaphor of the society in which it takes place' (p.8). Kingsbury's book is clearly based in ethnographic research not *of* a conservatory but *in* a conservatory, a very useful frame of reference for me. I am studying *in* the Music department, not conducting a study *of* the department.

As I have outlined above, allied to some of the key features of ethnomusicology, my own study is characterised by a close relationship with respondents:

> In contrast to the kinds of disciplines in which one may study manuscripts or texts, or statistically survey vast numbers of people through brief questionnaires, ethnomusicological data gathering is essentially a human exchange, and the quality of the human relationship between fieldworker and consultant, student and teacher, is at the heart of the endeavour. (Nettl, 2008 p.vii)

It has strong links with the traditional underpinning of good fieldwork practice in that it relies upon 'meaningful face-to face interaction with other individuals' (Cooley T. and Barz G., 2008, p. 4)

Qualitative research is a diverse field which, in summary, can best be defined by employing a comparative stance with the positivist paradigm. In the last 25 years a vast literature on qualitative research has emerged from which the following key features have been identified, summarised in Table 3.1 below which is offered, not as a comprehensive definition, but rather as a much-needed starting point, drawn from the literature encountered to date. Although necessarily reductionist, the features identified below support the choice of a qualitative approach for my study.

Qualitative methods	Quantitative methods
Words and images	Numbers
Inductive, hypotheses generating	Hypothesis testing
Researcher as primary instrument: describing, interpreting, evaluating	Laboratory study, use of data bases
Value laden, interpretative	Value neutral
Ethnographic/ anthropological roots	Scientific roots
Field settings with small populations	Large scale studies
Multi method: observing, gathering naturally occurring data, researcher as *bricoleur*	Single method - experiments
Acknowledging/ privileging positions of subjects	Subject as object of study
Holistic, prismatic: looking from different angles and perspectives	Single focus
Desire to discover more about participants' perceptions	Aim to identify behaviour
Semi-structured and unstructured interviews	Structured interviews, fixed response questionnaires

Reflexivity: the process of reflecting critically on the self as researcher.	Researcher excluded from process
In depth: close relationship with participants	Distance between researcher and participants
Activist or instrumental: deliberate intention to change things for the better	Neutrality central
Clear delimitation of study, bounding	Universality in claims

Table 3.1 qualitative and quantitative approaches

The choice of a qualitative approach facilitates an openness in the gathering and presentation of primary data that may have potential for greater revelation. Such a non-model approach features within ethnography and ethnomusicology (Nettl, 2008) and is advocated by Beaudry (2008, p.230):

> This is not to be confused with lack of preparation. On the contrary, preliminary readings and reflections are essential, for although they frame my inevitable assumptions, they also pave the way toward the openness I wish to attain.

Drawing on all of the above, my research is inter-disciplinary and, in ethnographic terms 'at home'. My relationship to and position within the study is both reflexive and activist and my tools of analysis and process are phenomenological. From this I have drawn the five pillars of my methodology, all of which have their place in research fields of entrepreneurship, entrepreneurial education, music pedagogy and ethnomusicology. It is a study that is:

- Interdisciplinary
- At home
- Reflexive
- Activist
- Phenomenological

The five pillars of my methodology

The first pillar, interdisciplinarity, sits at the centre of my structure, built from a mix of key ingredients drawn from across the established disciplines of business, pedagogy and ethnomusicology. The aim is to take a holistic approach and view the concept of the entrepreneurial music student through a number of different prisms. In the nature of all interdisciplinary studies there is an acknowledged risk of a lack of depth in specialist knowledge; this is compensated for by the depth of original data, and triangulation across the study. This methodology suits the nature of a study of musicians refracting, in the tradition of both social science (Denzin and Lincoln, 2008c, p. 5) and ethnomusicology (Cooley and Barz, 2008, p. 3), multiple perspectives and realities. Recent writings on the new ethnomusicology reveal an ongoing, two way conversation with the social sciences, facilitated by the inherent interdisciplinarity of ethnomusicology, and enabling an epistemological strengthening of the discipline through diversity and plurality (Cooley and Barz , 2008, p.3).

> Ethnomusicologists are in a unique position to question established methods and goals of the social sciences, and to explore new perspectives. These new perspectives are not just for ethnomusicologists but also for all ethnographic disciplines. (Cooley and Barz , 2008, p.3)

Cooley and Barz (2008, p.4) acknowledge the appropriation by the discipline of 'feminist theories, phenomenology, and reflective and dialogic ethnography' drawing upon the work of key qualitative research theorists Denzin and Lincoln (2003) where 'distinctions between cultures, scholars, informants, subjects, objects, selves and others have become increasingly blurred' (Cooley and Barz 2008, p.11). It can be argued that ethnomusicology has become all embracing and virtually interchangeable with anthropology and ethnography and that as such, my study could be positioned as ethnomusicology. However, this would be to deny its inherently inter-disciplinary nature and detract from the opportunity to draw the theory of entrepreneurship into the unique setting of a university music department. In practice, this interdisciplinary study is at first contextualised and framed within theories of entrepreneurship, pedagogy and a consideration of 'the musician' both in a historical and contemporary context', becoming further enriched by additional appropriate theory as other key themes emerge from the primary research: creativity, community, identity.

The second pillar of my research project is that it has been carried out, in ethnographic terms, 'at home'. There has been a steady transition from fieldwork rooted in the exotic towards research within our own communities (Nettl, 2008) although studies suggest there are 'very few explicit models for the home fieldworker to draw on' (Stock and Chiener, 2008, p.108). It is not unusual for teachers to carry out pedagogical research within their own institutions and with their own students. Typically such studies consider pedagogical issues related to the teaching of music (Green, 2002) performance (Davidson and Da Costa Coimbra, 2001) or analysis of the post-university lives or 'destinations' of the students (Mills, 2004). There are also the examples of ethnographic studies where the home is either a conservatory or university music department (Kingsbury, 1988; Nettl, 1995; Kruger, 2009) or a group of musicians to which the ethnographers themselves belong (Finnegan, 2007; Cottrell, 2004). What all these examples have in common is that they have used ethnomusicological techniques to study the processes at work in the transmission of music knowledge to music students or the working lives of musicians. My study builds upon and extends this tradition.

As a teacher of music students, based in one of the departments of my study, I am technically carrying out ethnography at home, although as a slightly displaced 'non-musician' there are certain contradictions - what is my true 'at home'? In practice and in the tradition of ethnomusicology, the act of the research itself has facilitated my own acceptance and integration into the subject area of music; as Cooley and Barz (2008, p.18) have suggested 'Fieldwork at home bridges, explains, and domesticates as it enhances the traditional academic roles of the researcher'. Research at home has facilitated initial access and an extended relationship with student respondents, staff and extending support mechanisms within each of my three sites and sets a clear geographical and philosophical bounding with which to delimit the study.

The third pillar is reflexivity. Reflexivity is the process of reflecting critically on the self as researcher. A key element within qualitative studies, this influences both the approach to the research, and the mode of data presentation which will include the use of 'I'. In reporting my findings I will acknowledge that, as the primary instrument (describing, interpreting, evaluating), my findings will be value laden and interpretative and I need to be explicit, reflective and prepared to engage in a certain level of personal disclosure to ensure that the research remains valid and ethically sound. Within

ethnography there has been an increasing acknowledgement of the necessity for some form of reflexivity in the process; Cooley and Barz in *Shadows in the Field* (2008, p.13) argue that ethnomusicology is in an 'epistemologically eclectic moment' and has been for some time but that certain aspects of the new ethnomusicology, such as reflexivity are 'now an expectation'.

> We worried that our very presence would result in significant culture change (and sometimes it did). It may have come as a bit of a surprise that the particular identity (nationality, ethnicity, gender) and the personality – shy, outgoing, quick on the uptake, contemplative – of the fieldworker makes a lot of difference in the research enterprise. (Nettl, 2008 p.v)

Although a reflexive approach will be familiar within music departments amongst the ethnomusicologists it is more unusual for it to be used as an approach to other forms of doctoral study in music. As well as building on the work of Nettl, Kingsbury, Coulson and Kruger, my own reflexive approach draws upon examples from the wider paradigm of qualitative research, outside the discipline of music (Kondo, 1990). Key to my approach is an acknowledgement that in working with my students intensely at a significant time in their lives this study will be valid but cannot, and is not designed to be, neutral.

The fourth pillar of my methodology is that it is activist. An activist or instrumental study contains a deliberate intention to change things for the better rather than the positivist aim to maintain neutrality at all cost. An activist study is particularly suited to a situation where the researcher has some agentic power to facilitate change for their respondents, in my case, a university lecturer who more globally through university systems can seek to implement change within the curriculum whilst for the individual respondent, may be able to act as an adviser, mentor or advocate outside of the research process. This activist approach is now enshrined in many ethnomusicology projects and is sometimes referred to as applied ethnomusicology.[43] As ethnomusicologists have become more confident in their methodology they have been less concerned than previously with damage neutrality and more comfortable with 'active advocacy for […] individuals and their communities' (Cooley and Barz, 2008, p.13). Stock and Chiener,

---

[43] Applied ethnomusicology is a term applied to a wide range of musical activity that can have a remit to resolve and heal differences, often in political conflict situation; it can also be a call to action. For examples of applied ethnomusicology in situations as diverse as Kosovo, Northern Ireland and Brazil, see *Music and Conflict* (2010, O'Connell, Morgan and Castelo-Branco).

2008, p.110) suggest that research at home is closely allied to this activist agenda, referred to by the authors as 'social impact': 'doing fieldwork at home allows us not only to intervene productively but also to monitor the impact of these interventions over considerable periods of time'. The funding for this doctoral thesis subliminally enshrined the idea of activist research in that it had specific remit to interrogate issues around professional development for music students. Within the period of my study interventions have included individual help for student led projects, signposting of opportunities for students and the development of a new module. As with all long term, ethnographic work, all actions acknowledge and privilege the positions of the respondents and can only take place once the researcher has earned their trust and respect.

The Fifth pillar is phenomenological; this underpins the technical process of my methodology. This is a mixed methods approach, the core data being drawn from transcripts of semi-structured interviews with a core group of 15 music students supported by a range of additional material, observational notes on meetings and naturally occurring events, student essays and questionnaires. In the process of analysis I am using a methodology drawn from a combination of case study and Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA), a method increasingly used to study lived experience (Flowers, 2005; Creanor, Trinder et al, 2006). IPA, as an analytical tool, allows us to look intently at the individual student's experience, and to find and group arising themes using a grounded and hermeneutic approach rather than an imposed theoretical structure or hypothesis. In practice within my study this means: carrying out hour-long interviews with each student at two or three points across a two year period; analysing transcripts and then attempting to make sense of the data against a range of additional material drawn from the students' own reflective writing (diaries, essays); wider questionnaires across the music student community; meetings and naturally occurring events and setting all of this within the context of generic literature on entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning (Weatherston and Laurence, 2009)[44]. The analysis is inductive, hypothesis generating and hermeneutic involving a constant re-visiting of material; researcher acting as bricoleur (Denzin and Lincoln, 2008a p. 424) and is

---

[44] See Pilot Study

presented in a way that retains the authenticity of the students' voices through the use of direct quotation woven through the text.

IPA originates from use within clinical settings but is now increasingly used in the social sciences and pedagogy. It fits well with the ethos of ethnomusicology and provides a structure that is missing in the more general discussion of ethnomusicology at home. As Berger (2008, p.68) suggests in discussing phenomenology in the wider sense, the emphasis on experience is also what makes phenomenology relevant to ethnomusicology and ethnography; phenomenology offers a rigorous method for studying experience. Berger clearly advocates the suitability of phenomenology for my study as a form of new ethnography:

> Phenomenology's emphasis on the agentive dimensions of practice allows a fieldworker to see research participants, not as merely enacting cultural scripts, but as actively constituting their experiences. And most important, understanding fieldwork itself as an attempt to partially share experience, the phenomenological ethnographer paces her/himself on the same plane as the research participant, thus forwarding the dialogic agenda of the new ethnography. (Berger, 2008, p.70)

> Experience isn't merely a mass of particularities. The relationships between its parts produce patterns and regularities that allow us to make concretely grounded but broadly applicable generalizations. (Berger, 2008, p.69)

Qualitative research has gone through many changes since its origins in the early part of the 20th century. If my aim is to construct new meaning around entrepreneurial processes, as they relate to music students, ethnography seems to hold the key both in terms of process and as a concept that already holds currency within the field of music. In choosing a phenomenological approach drawn broadly from ethnography, more specifically using the techniques of IPA, and allied to ethnomusicology (in that it is a study of musicians), I have committed to a methodology suited to in-depth research in field settings with small populations, acknowledging that whilst such a methodology cannot be used to make wider generalisations based on comparative analysis it promises much in terms of gaining in-depth knowledge about the feelings, ambitions and activities of this group of entrepreneurial music students.

The pilot study

Having established a clear theoretical base from which to enter the field I decided to pilot my proposed methodology; what follows is a description of the process deployed. The pilot study allowed me to rekindle my skills in interviewing, practise analysis and develop ways in which to present this kind of qualitative data. Most importantly, the project raised important ethical questions which are subsequently addressed in the main study.

The project aimed to gain a much deeper understanding of what it means to be a music undergraduate by following a group of students for three or four years according to their programme. Although the study was based on music students it was anticipated from the outset that many of the findings would be generically applicable to the under-graduate experience.

ICMuS Transitions

In 2007, together with a co-researcher I set up a longitudinal study of six music students as they moved through their degree courses. The study 'ICMuS Transitions' [45] originated from a successful bid for internal curriculum development funding, matched by funding from a major regional curriculum development project, and was focussed on the theme of student transition. Such longitudinal studies are notoriously difficult to complete. As discussed earlier initiatives such as the National Student Survey and the annual HESA destination statistics offer one useful form of feedback on the student experience. The pilot project crystalized the difference between such national, large-scale data and knowledge gained from a project such as this as lying in the data's journey; a one way traffic from student to report (that is highly unlikely to refer back to the student in any form) versus a reflective, hermeneutic developing epistemology.

Having been awarded PhD funding in 2009, my two research projects at this point were running concurrently and, acknowledging the potential benefits and synergies offered

---

[45]I was the project leader and Dr Felicity Laurence was my co-analyst. Although we carried out analysis of the first year data jointly, I conducted the interviews in the first year of the project alone. Subsequent follow up interviews have been run jointly.

by this, I decided to use certain aspects of the longitudinal study to act as a pilot for the PhD fieldwork, notably the methodological process of in-depth interviewing which was to form a central part of my data gathering. Although the longitudinal study was focussed on student transition, the student interviews revealed a wealth of data about the stresses, priorities, goals, beliefs, attitudes and aspirations of music students, all of which have been used to inform and triangulate findings from my PhD research. As the study progressed, I started to include questions more deliberately aimed to take a fix on the issue of entrepreneurship.

The research set out with one main aim - to make things better for music students. We hoped to get a 'take' or a 'fix' on the current reality of our students' lives – their stresses, priorities, goals, beliefs, attitudes, aspirations, and their views on what we do and what we should be doing. What we found were: contrasting levels of self-disclosure; differences in issues identified by students as key; and the emerging themes of identity, academic progress, and social/peer relationships, these presenting with strongly differing emphases and experience. In carrying out this pilot project, which had a clear agenda, I was able to start conceptualising my thesis as action research.

Establishing the base line literature

The pilot study offered an opportunity to review some of the more generic literature pertaining to music students alongside the core literature underpinning my thesis, specifically the student experience, professional development of music students, and theories of transition and narrative enquiry. We found that when considering the specific case of first year university music students, there was little published literature, with the exception of Burland's and Pitts work in which they compare the first year experience of music undergraduates in university and in conservatory settings, focussing upon those studying Western classical music (Burland and Pitts 2007). A major literature review of the first year experience in general, commissioned by the Higher Education Academy, reported that most research in this field 'is based on single institution studies, often with small samples of students, not uncommonly from a single programme of study' (Harvey, Drew and Smith 2006). Many of the key generic studies focus on the meta-themes of retention, performance and student support but underlying these themes is a general consensus that there is no single first year experience, rather, a

multiplicity of individual narratives which invite interrogation (Weatherston and Laurence, 2008). This acknowledgement of the unique experience of each individual (Baxter Magolder, 1992) was the starting point for the ICMuS Transitions project and has subsequently positioned my thesis.

Learning to work with our own students

There appears to be collective construct of 'the student' with which we all as academics collude, often drawing upon subjective data from both group (seminars, lectures) and one-to-one encounters (tutorials, student advice and counselling). From their individual and collective experiences, academic staff may reach conclusions and construct narratives upon which core curriculum decisions are subsequently based. The primary purpose of the individual tutorial or counselling session is (rightly) not an opportunity to elicit general feedback from the student and yet it is only through such interactions that university staff are able to engage in any form of genuine reflection on what they are 'doing' to students and what effect this might be having. The issue of confidentiality, for example within a tutorial or careers interview, necessarily means that such interactions contain a wealth of 'lost data'.

The pilot project provided a setting within which the interviewers were able to relate to the students in a new way. As co-researchers we both had different existing relationships with the students: my colleague is a music academic within the department, she has at some time taught all of the them and is personal tutor to one; at the time of the study I was an academic developer working with students both individually and within groups on projects related to their own professional development. We were both struck by the different level of depth our interactions with students had within the pilot project rather than in our core relationship with the students.

Methods of data gathering and analysis

The project reinvented the tutorial by both gaining the permission of the student to use the data and retaining un-interpreted evidence of the dialogue in the form of audio and

written transcripts. Students were given total control over how the data would be represented, they could request pseudonyms, ask for recordings to be erased and were consulted throughout as data moved into the public realm, commenting on conference papers and suggesting research questions.

The central ethos throughout the data gathering process was to value depth over breadth, to focus on a small sample, to remain with the selected sample only and to retain the individual voices of the students. To make sense of the data it was necessary to start to develop themes and it is at this point that it is important to use large-scale student surveys to provide some kind of control. From insights gained from our initial work with the six students, we constructed a questionnaire further to explore possible resonances, trends, and contrasts in our wider student cohort, keeping central the students' eye view now established in the course of this research. In this way, we sought to add breadth to our interpretations, without losing the impulse of the student voice which remained central to the project. As we triangulated the data with wider questionnaires across all year groups we found that general themes emerging, related to the first year experience; the importance of social networks, contact hours, financial security, personality attributes, appeared to correlate.

Having identified IPA as a suitable analytical tool, this pilot project allowed me the opportunity to test and adapt the process to suit the primary research analysis for my thesis. The project also provided me with the opportunity to practice ethnographic writing as a presentational form and produce texts heavy with quotes, description and themes subject to intense analysis against pre-existing theoretical structures. Also, as we went on to disseminate findings within conference papers [46] I developed ways of presenting the data to audiences unfamiliar and at times sceptical of this form of qualitative research.

The pilot project suggested that this form of research could become a powerful tool containing elements that could be integrated into the tutorial system. Most significantly, colleagues were intrigued by a process that was new to the department and this lead to

---

[46] During Spring 2008 papers were presented at Newcastle University International Centre for Music Studies research forum, the Newcastle University internal Teaching and Learning Conference and at the European First Year Experience (EFYE) conference.

several requests being made to the interviewers for additional projects, such as the running of focus groups. By deploying this form of research within our department, we were entering new territory. An activist approach 'construing validity in terms of empowerment of the students resulting from the research process itself, rather than its size, replicability or generalisability' (Weatherston and Laurence, 2008) which I was then able to take forward and establish as the principles of my doctoral study.

Ethical decisions

The ethical underpinning of my research is drawn from what both Denzin and Lincoln refer to as a feminist, communitarian model where the framework 'presumes a researcher who builds collaborative, reciprocal, trusting and friendly relations with those studied […]' (Denzin, 1997, p.275).

The primary research data for this thesis has been drawn primarily from individual interviews with current students within the three selected institutions[47], supported by additional interviews and focus groups with a wider group of both staff and students in the selected institutions and two specialist music colleges[48]. Administratively there was little difficulty in gaining institutional ethical approval for my research; this was not a clinical study, participants were all adults and not considered to be vulnerable and there was little in the way of physical risks to researcher or participants. I was nevertheless acutely aware of the personal responsibility I had to ensure this study was not detrimental to my student volunteers in any way, and that they were placing a lot of trust in me. The students would be sharing extremely personal data over a long period of time and their voices would be transcribed directly into my thesis and publication. In each of the institutions this was the first time such in-depth research work had taken place with music students and, in the interest of developing further projects of this nature, it was essential that my work be seen to adhere to high ethical standards that would not cause issues for staff or students. [49]

---

[47] See appendix 3: summary of participants.
[48] I discuss the process of data triangulation in the concluding Chapter 9.
[49] See appendix 4: research ethics documentation.

Three main ethical concerns need to be addressed in working with human subjects in any research capacity: there should be informed consent; the respondents have a right to privacy; the respondents are protected from harm (Fontana and Frey, 2008, p.142). In addition to this I considered the issue of reciprocity.

Consent

There are particular issues around informed consent when working with students and it is the 'informed' aspect that has to be closely attended to. At the start of the project I consulted with music colleagues from each of the institutions and asked them to identify particular students who they felt were highly active/engaged/entrepreneurial. In qualitative research terms this was a process of purposeful selection. I then contacted these students by email[50] explaining my research and asking them whether they would like to be involved. As the students had been identified by tutors, I was careful to point out that there was no obligation to participate. There was 100% response rate to my email, students seemed to be both keen to participate and intrigued:

> [51]This sounds great, I will happily take part!

> What an unusual request! Thank you for getting in touch, it is very interesting to hear about your work.

> Having read your email I would be happy to take part. I think I would find the process really interesting and would love to help you with what sounds like a really interesting thesis!

Interestingly, some of the students immediately questioned their suitability suggesting that they may not fit what they saw to be my established agenda; slightly distancing themselves from how they felt they had been positioned as 'entrepreneurial students:

> If you feel that any contribution from me would be at all helpful, I would be more than happy to take part. However, I must add that I am not at all sure I meet the description of an 'entrepreneurial' student, at least not in the commercial sense. I just do an awful lot of arts admin really!

> Thank you very much for your email. Your thesis sounds incredibly interesting, and I'd be delighted to take part, thank you. I should warn you, though, that I'm not convinced I'll be what you're looking for in an interviewee - I'm not sure what [S] has told you! But if you think I'm suitable then I'd be really happy to help.

---

[50] See appendix 5: example email text.
[51] These comments have not been attributed to individual students as they have been extracted from emails without permission.

On my first meeting with the students I felt it was important to ensure that they were fully informed about precisely what they were consenting to. For most of them this was the first research project of this kind they had been involved in, they appeared to be flattered by having been invited to participate and also trusted me as a mature student and academic. This revealed a particular kind of ethical vulnerability which I sought to address by spending some time explaining the consent form which I kept as clear and simple as possible,[52] establishing ground rules which included their absolute right to challenge anything, see and hear everything and withdraw from the process at any point. This reflects Denzin's (1997, p.275) definition of the feminist, communitarian approach where there is implicit understanding 'that those studied have claims of ownership over any materials that are produced in the research process, including field notes'.

Privacy

I encountered an interesting issue with pseudonyms pertaining to musicians, possibly because this is tied up with their musical/performance identity. Several of the students were keen for me to use their own names in the research but once I reached the point of presenting data publicly I decided to insist on using pseudonyms. Data protection is also significant in protecting the privacy of respondents and with this in mind data has been stored at home wherever possible and no data has been saved on shared university computer drives. I would argue that, in spite of claims made in numerous qualitative research papers regarding confidentiality, no matter what steps are taken, there is no such thing as total, guaranteed anonymity in this kind of research and it is the responsibility of the researcher to ensure that respondents are regularly reminded of this. An example occurred when I presented a paper at my own institution, the Civic University, at a research seminar where the audience included some of the student participants who were curious to see how they may have been presented. Prior to the seminar I sent the draft paper to all students with data included to double check their agreement with the presentation and attempted anonymisation of the data. Although I was anxious about any repercussions from this paper presentation, students were happy with the process and said they were proud to be included.

---

[52] See Appendix 4: research ethics documentation (permission statement).

Protection from harm

Although there were no risks of physical harm in this kind of study, there is potential for emotional and academic harm to students and reputational harm to the institutions involved.[53] I also risk my own academic reputation and relationship with my academic colleagues for, like ethnographers of musicians before me (Cottrell, 2004; Kruger, 2009; Kingsbury, 1988), specifically those engaged with ethnomusicology at home, I continue to work and teach within the communities in which I am researching although, unlike Cottrell's situation, the student body is more transient and this dilutes the potential for on-going ramifications. This issue of the degree of involvement of the researcher with the group is generally presented as a problematic within the social sciences but with music and musicians, the established practice of ethnomusicology facilitates a different, more acceptable position.

Students sit at the heart of this study and so although the institutions represent the communities in which they study, the structures, operations and ethos of the universities are not under scrutiny or evaluation of any kind. The thesis takes a philosophical approach supported by qualitative data but in much the same way as Nettl treats 'mid-western schools of music' this study approaches 'north eastern universities'. Universities are understandably sensitive about research which may highlight inadequacies, as Kruger found (2009, p. 7). With this in mind the university settings are referred to indirectly as the Traditional, Civic and Vocational – and as such these settings may be replicable outside of the region under study. The institutions in this study were in the main open and generous in allowing access once I had presented clear written agreements and outlines; tutors acted as initial gatekeepers through the introduction process but thereafter I was left with total freedom to proceed as I felt fit. As with the students, there was a subliminal suggestion that involvement in the project would be good for the institution, linked with student experience and pedagogy.

For the students, the risk of harm lay mainly in the possibility of emotional harm. Many of the interviews were very personal and reflective and students said they were

---

[53] To ensure protection for students and academic colleagues full copies of the original transcripts remain confidential and, following university guidelines, the thesis will initially be subject to restricted access. This restricted access will not however affect immediate publication of material as agreed with respondents on a case by case basis.

revealing things that the university was not aware of. As Merriam's (1964) work 'has suggested, by its very nature the process of being interviewed causes us to confront ourselves. A helpful construct within which to consider the how a student may position, or choose to position themselves as a research respondent is the Johari Window.[54]

	Known to self	**Not known to self**
Known to others	Arena	Blind spot
Not known to others	Façade	Unknown

Figure 3.1: Johari Window

Developed in the 1950s by Joseph Luft and Harrington Ingham, this tool is has been adapted for use within a wide range of settings including psychotherapy and management training. The most basic version of the Window shown here illustrates the four quadrants within which data from the interviews may sit. Most of the student respondents were happy to move beyond the Arena quadrant and reveal data from the Façade area. In some cases the interviews would move into the Blind Spot and Unknown quadrants, for example when students were considering themselves in a new business context, as entrepreneurs – a new identity revealed by the interview process itself.

There was also a need to be constantly alert to the risk of revealing sensitive data when colleagues asked me 'what do the students think?', as many colleagues knew who my

---

[54] A general web search on 'Johari Window' will reveal numerous versions from which I have constructed figure 3.1 above.

student respondents were. One difficult situation arose when I reluctantly agreed to supervise the dissertation of one of my respondents; this proved to be a conflict of interest.

Reciprocity

Unlike many studies, the students from the outset were not given any form of financial incentive[55] to partake in the research but once they had agreed to participate I gave them each a letter[56] describing how I would acknowledge their contribution and suggesting that they may like to use this experience as something to put on their CVs. As I worked with and got to know the students some of them started to ask for guidance on careers issues, in one case a job reference and in another a group at the Collegiate University asked me to assist with a planned careers event. I offered copies of transcripts to them all to look back on in future years and in some cases informed students about funding and project opportunities that arose within my own institution. This reciprocity has been a key part of the development of on-going trust and friendship between this group of informants and myself.

---

[55] Students in the pilot study were offered a payment of £50.00 once they had agreed to participate but to the surprise of the researchers refused payment on the grounds that they felt it de-valued their contribution; they felt genuinely rewarded purely by participation in the process.
[56] See Appendix 4: research ethics documentation (letter to students).

Framework for fieldwork

Having established and tested IPA as the appropriate method for analysis I decided, given the scale and long-term nature of my doctoral research, that I needed a clearer framework for the data gathering and adopted Carspecken's (1996) model developed to carry out critical ethnography within educational research settings. Carspecken's five stages provide a good model for grounding theories of ethnographic research into a useable methodology[57] and have been used as the scaffold for this study:

Preliminary steps

- *Identify the site* – three selected universities of the North East of England.
- *Start to draw up questions* – these were broad questions at the outset, based on my initial research questions (see Chapter 1) which changed and developed as the study progressed.
- *List information to be collected* – data on universities of the North East (student profile, destinations etc), interview transcripts, reflective diaries and essays, case studies, questionnaires.
- *Discovering my own bias* – positioning myself by writing diaries and reflective notes.
- *The interviews* – first interviews with student respondents were focussed on establishing rapport, explaining the project, taking personal histories and obtaining snapshots of their current entrepreneurial activity. Interviews were recorded and audio and written[58] transcripts were made.

Stage 1: compiling the primary record through the collection of monological data
- Becoming a participant observer, ethnographer at the heart of the enterprise/ employability initiative at the Civic University where I work.
- Building the primary record through note taking, audiotaping, writing transcripts of meetings and focus groups, collecting materials, using questionnaires.

---

[57] Carspecken uses a study on an educational project in a low-income neighbourhood in Houston as an example to demonstrate a methodology that has been used in several subsequent doctoral studies.
[58] Written transcripts from the first interviews were prepared by a professional transcription company from prepared audio data. Subsequent transcription was carried out by myself.

- At this stage the approach is monological in that I am speaking alone when writing the primary record of my observations, using thick description.

Stage 2: Preliminary reconstructive analysis

- This takes place as I begin to analyse the primary record using IPA. '[articulating] those cultural themes and system factors that are not observable and that are usually unarticulated by the actors themselves' (Carspecken, 1996 p.42).
- Written and taped interviews are repeatedly analysed in great detail line by line and quotes extracted, copied and grouped into themes.
- This stage contains an element of necessary uncertainty, areas of interest that need to be discovered, identified and interrogated as they emerge.

Stage 3: Dialogical data generation

- I (researcher) cease to be the only voice building up the primary record.
- Through the individual interviews[59] I begin to converse intently with subjects of study, generating data with people rather than about them.
- *The interviews* – at this stage I am sharing findings with the student respondents, checking their views on my analysis of their earlier interviews. Interviews also focus on what has been happening academically and socially to the students since our last meeting and issues relating to current projects future are discussed in more detail. Audio transcripts are made and analysed, data is added to the early written summaries of emerging themes and new themes are included.

Stage 4: Systems relations

- As part of the triangulation process I examine the relationship between the social site of focussed interest and other specific social sites which my bear some relation to it; other music Higher Education institutions and enterprise centres; other groups of students.
- Notes and recordings are made at the various sites and where useful, as with the focus groups, written transcripts are prepared by myself.

---

[59] See Appendix 6: record of individual interviews. Students were interviewed between 2010 and 2012. Each interview was approximately one hour in length.

- Final interviews with students are recorded and analysed, at this stage the focus is looking beyond the course. Students also discuss their feelings about participation in the project.

Stage 5: Using system relations to explain findings

- Following the themes emerging from the data analysis I draw upon theories of entrepreneurship, ethnomusicology, creativity, performance and community in presenting findings.

Introducing the music students

> *Many arrived at the university already singing, playing an instrument, and even composing at high level. They developed their talents further by playing with fellow students, and they established personal and professional networks that they maintained throughout their lives. (Kevorkian, 2004, p.71)*
>
> *(Students studying at the University of Leipzig in 1700)*

Although at some points my thesis will refer directly to the university community a student belongs to, and although purposefully selected to ensure diversity,[60] within this study students are not primarily defined by their course, musical genre, institution or gender; rather they are positioned throughout as individuals, defined by their entrepreneurial activities and behaviours. With this in mind I will now introduce the 16 students purely in alphabetical order of pseudonym:

> *Andrew*
> Andrew is a trumpet player who is a prominent presence in his music department, an initiator of extra curricular performances and projects and member of numerous ensembles. Initially unsure about going to university he took a BTEC in a conservatory and then took a couple of years out and has spent a year in Austria through the Erasmus programme. A local student, Andrew is keen to have a clear vocational route and secure income and is considering teaching.

> *Anna*
> Anna describes a very musical family background; she has been told that she composed her first song at the age of three. By the age of 12 she had set up and was composing songs for her own band; while she was doing A levels she set up a large gospel choir, inspired by her passion for inclusivity in music (there were no auditions, it was open to all), and composed for that as well. Her passion for musical performance has

---

[60] See Appendix 3: summary of student respondents.

96

increased through her time at university and now, as she completes a Masters degree, she has been directing major university operas and plays.

Bella
Bella is an international student studying for a PhD; a black American, she is a high flyer academically and an experienced teacher. Still young, she has already studied and played music in three continents. She has a diverse music pedigree but describes herself as a jazz musician. Her current ensemble is fast gaining regional, national and international recognition. At any time she is involved in numerous projects within and external to the university.

Dan
Dan talks of how he has always loved the arts. Originally drawn to drama he took to music later, learning the guitar in his teens and going on to study for an HND in music at home in Ireland. His initial dislike for music business aspects of the curriculum changed dramatically when he moved to the North East of England to take a degree in popular and contemporary music and decided to base his dissertation on a series of interviews with music managers. On completion of his degree he decided to enter what was for him the intimidating unknown world of one of the region's major business schools to study for a masters degree. He relishes the feeling of difference he is experiencing on his business course and continues to be part of the performing music scene both in the North East of England and at home in Ireland.

David
From the North East, David started to engage with music relatively late, playing guitar and setting up bands in what he himself would describe as a clichéd activity for a sixteen-year-old boy. Initially, he had no plans to go on to become a performing musician and went to college to study music production. Once at college his eyes were opened by a particular tutor, he found his musicianship rapidly developed and he is now teaching guitar and playing regularly in a number of bands. He is committed to a future life as a performing freelance musician.

Jo
Jo is an academic high flyer who originally had set her heart on study at Oxford but, when rejected, headed for the North East. The daughter of missionaries, she is active within the church and plans a missionary role for herself, coupled with ethnomusicological research, having already worked with a small rural community in the Philippines and planning to go to India once she has graduated. She is president of the main orchestral society in the university.

John
A highly talented viola player, John struggled with the decision between a university or conservatory career and maintains an ambition to work as an orchestral musician. He is keenly aware of the strong influence of his parents, both professional musicians (conductor and viola player) and now strongly involved in music education. Already having completed a year as a music assistant in a prep school before starting university, John is an active networker who seeks out professional development opportunities and is already in demand to play professionally with youth orchestras.

Lara

From the North East and wanting to study locally, Lara was initially disappointed by rejection from her first choice of music degrees in the region. She is now studying community music and has found a real niche and fully intends to work in this field. She embraces the opportunity her course has given her to make contact with musicians from across the world and has become a sophisticated networker locally and internationally through social media.

Lily

An international student from Germany, Lily came to study in the North East after a abandoning her original plan to study at an international college in Thailand. She is now happy, settled and committed to living in the North East of England and plays with several bands across different genres and intends to continue working as a freelance musician once she has completed her course.

Lisa

Lisa grew up and was educated in Hong Kong where her English parents worked as teachers and Folk musicians. Steeped in the folk community, she recalls a house constantly full with visiting musicians from across the globe. A highly political student with a strong sense of social justice, she sees herself working in the future as an activist in the field of music education. She hates the British climate and misses the Far East, her geographic if not ethnic home.

Makis

Makis was playing in a restaurant near Athens on a nightly basis, making a reasonable living and, having completed high school, was due to be called up for National Service with the Greek army. Encouraged by his parents, he followed a friend to the North East of England to study at college and once his English had improved, moved on to a degree course. Initially struggling to learn both English and Music Theory, Makis is now approaching his final year on a BMuS and intends to be a composer and performer. Although he is a committed contemporary music practitioner, he funds himself through his regular work in Greek restaurants.

Maria

Maria turned down an Oxbridge offer having had an argument with a college principal about feminism. A talented musician herself she aspires to a career in arts administration; she produces major student concerts and has a leading position on the executive of the university orchestra. She is highly motivated and organised and a driving force within her music department.

Michael

Michael entered his university by a non-traditional route. Brought up in the North of England, in a 'working class' family he was a talented but somewhat reluctant pianist and member of the school choir at primary school. His music career really started when he taught himself to play guitar, set up a band at the age of 13 and was signed to a label in his mid teens. Determined to run his own music business, he draws heavily on his early experiences of the music industry and is keen to preserve his independence.

Mack
Mack is a self-taught guitar musician who, having been unsuccessful in his recorder and clarinet lessons, decided in his teens he wanted to be a musician and skater. He left school with a slightly unenthusiastic approach to music, thinking it was probably the only thing he was good at but has developed a passion for his playing since reaching higher education. He now hopes to make a living through his music.

Phil
Phil, a mature student describes how he started playing the guitar at school at the age of 11 when he lived in rural Buckinghamshire but opportunities were limited, he gave up and didn't start playing again until twenty years ago, in his twenties, he moved to the North East to find a thriving music scene with 'bands everywhere'. He then worked for years playing in bands by night and supporting his music with numerous different jobs. Following a serious health issue, Phil decided to give up his job with a bank and take a full-time music degree course – he says the experience has been life changing.

Robert
Robert is a highly active and diverse musician and composer. Originally trained to play classical clarinet he now plays in five or more bands ranging from electronic dance, rap and jazz and composing electro acoustic and studio based music. He combines a demanding performance schedule with studying for a P/T MMus and a part-time job in a café, his performance and producing activities for the most bringing in little in the way of income. Both of Robert's parents were music teachers.

These vignettes are intended to provide an initial introduction to a diverse group of music students from universities in the North East of England, the subjects of my study, whose musical life-journeys provide the data for the chapters that follow. Within these vignettes can be seen themes that emerge and develop through the thesis. We will see the influence of the students' families, their relationship with patrons; the portfolio nature of their lives; difficulties encountered and overcome; their need for achievement and autonomy; the significance of the music communities which they inhabit and their entrepreneurial and opportunistic behaviour. What follows is an account of five years of fieldwork revealing the extent to which music students are natural entrepreneurs. Albeit in individually distinct ways, all of these students have in the past spotted and taken opportunities, they are creative practitioners who operate within the wider community of musicians and their lives are underpinned by a love of performance.

CHAPTER 4: SEEKING AND CREATING OPPORTUNITIES

It was quite a monumental thing because although I did not realise it, I was working with quite world famous people [...] it was literally an opportunity that was offered and I said, 'Yes!' (Lara)

Introduction

Opportunity is a key concept within entrepreneurship theory, the act of entrepreneurship seen to be 'the nexus of individual and opportunity' (Korsgaard, 2013, p. 131). To be entrepreneurial it is necessary to be able to identify, pursue and create opportunities and for music students and musicians this is likely to be the key to their enduring success, however that success might be defined by them. Using data from the students' first interviews, this chapter considers the various ways in which some music students both create and respond to opportunities, and suggests that the concepts of 'opportunity' and 'opportunism' can offer valuable constructs when considering their pedagogical needs.

Historically, in order to operate successfully, it was necessary for musicians to be opportunists. Weber (2004) argues that there is a clear link between entrepreneurship and opportunism in the 18th and 19th centuries. Opportunism is closely connected to the need to be different, in entrepreneurship parlance, to spot a gap in the market and in doing this to play on one's otherness: 'to identify an unexploited avenue of composition, performance or production – and find ways to accomplish it' (Weber, 2004, p. 5); musicians often employed their creative talents and 'difference' opportunistically. This opportunism was not all purely individualistic in the 18th and 19th century, as it might have appeared in the case of the most famous of musicians such as Franz Liszt (Leppert, 2004), but was often linked to collaborative activity. There was a real system of exchange, of doing business jointly and this was not just altruistic networking, it was a core part of how the music industry operated at the time.

Although Weber, as I will discuss later, uses the term 'opportunist' in a relatively benign sense it can be argued that this concept generally represents the darker side of entrepreneurship. In economic terms, the opportunist is seen to be 'making a profit out of the potential misfortunes of others' (Casson, 2003, p.141) and in psychological terms

being 'opportunistic' is cited as a key characteristic of the entrepreneur (Chell, Haworth and Brearley, 1991, p. 8). The term tends to be associated with a lack of integrity and morals, lack of strategic planning – merely responding to something as it appears regardless of whether it is the right thing to do; this is not only associated with money but also with intellectual and artistic opportunism. It is just such associations that create semantic problems when delivering entrepreneurship programmes within a music department.

Correspondingly, the lighter side of entrepreneurship typically associated with 'social', 'creative', 'not for profit' enterprise, aligns itself more comfortably to the term 'opportunity'. This is the friendly face of entrepreneurship presented within pedagogical settings, including universities, where both policy frameworks and marketing strategies foreground the availability of opportunities.[61] Although the act of identifying, pursuing, creating and seeking opportunities must not be confused with the behaviour of the pure opportunist, I would suggest that there is a continuum rather than a diametrically opposed division at work here and that music students do need to act opportunistically in some circumstances, and it is when we ask them to do this that things can feel uncomfortable. When does the much-advocated act of doing something 'that will look good on my CV' or attending a 'networking session' move from making the most of an opportunity to behaving opportunistically?

It may also be useful to take a Darwinian approach to further illuminate the concept of opportunistic behaviour, particularly if we consider music departments as communities and opportunism (or the ability to pursue and create opportunities), to be an agreed trait displayed by entrepreneurs. Darwin saw natural selection as a mechanism primarily driven by the needs of the individual, although he accepted that at times an individualistic act might also coincidentally benefit the species as a whole (Frank, 2011, p. 7). The survival of a music department, and the thriving of the individuals within it, depends to a large extent on its visibility within and perceived value to the wider university, one representation of this being high profile music events. We see in the

---

[61] Emails circulated within music departments are frequently entitled 'opportunity for music student'; typically a request for musicians to play at an event, a competition, a job vacancy or volunteering opportunity.

following data, how many of the opportunities engaged in or created by individual students are related to this demand for on-going voluntary events and performances.

The data within this chapter is drawn from transcript analysis of my first interviews with students. [62] My aim in the first, hour-long interview with each student was to establish their personal journey prior to joining their university course, to take a history of their particular relationship with music and to introduce and discuss the concept of entrepreneurship and enterprise with them. What was clear within these early interviews was the way in which the student respondents were consistently alert to new opportunities; participation in this project also being framed by them in terms of a new, interesting and potentially beneficial opportunity for them. Through analysis of the way in which this group of students seek and create opportunities, the following themes have emerged: history of engagement; opportunity awareness; courage and risk taking; commercial awareness; opportunity creation and career strategies.

History of engagement

Reflecting the epistemologies of music education (Green, 2002; Welch, Hallam et al, 2004) and developmental theory (Bee and Boyd, 2010; Woodhead, Carr and Light, 1994) most of the students describe a personal history that contains numerous examples of engaging with opportunity, often facilitated by significant events and individuals during their early experiences at home (Davidson, 2002, Mcpherson, 2009), and at school. Parental influence in terms of the way in which these students take up opportunities appears significant, albeit resulting from very different personal circumstances. Some of the students reported that their parents had had limited opportunities themselves and that this led to a strong desire to facilitate opportunities for their children, even at great cost (emotional and financial) to themselves. Significant amongst the group was the reported desire of parents for their children to be 'happy' rather than wealthy; perhaps not unsurprising given that a majority of the students' parents had some form of music background.

---

[62] NB From this point forward all quotations and attributions are referenced as footnotes indicating the name of the student and identifying the interview as the first, second or third. Exact dates of all interviews are shown in appendix 6.

Makis, an international student from Greece had been playing the bouzouki from the age of eight: 'I was jealous of my brother. He played the bouzouki and I said, 'I want to play music as well''.[63] He started playing in restaurants at 16 and by the age of 19 this had become an established way of life before a chance encounter with someone who had studied in the North East of England:

> I met a person called […] who studied here, a few years ago. He said, 'What are you doing here?' I said 'Just waiting to go to the army because I have to do this service'. He said, 'Why don't you go and study?' I said 'I have nothing, I have no theory, and I don't know anything.' He asked me what I do and everything. I told him, 'I'm writing music.' He listened to it, he liked it. He said 'Come to Newcastle with me to study.[64]

He describes returning home from the restaurant at five o'clock in the morning, having had this conversation:

> I went back to my house, woke my Mother up straight away and said, 'Look, such and such.' And she said, 'Yes.' It was five o'clock in the morning and she could not open her eyes and was like, 'What do you want.' And she said, 'You will do whatever you like otherwise your life is going to be miserable, like ours.' Neither my father nor my mother do what they like.[65]

Other parents themselves had an early history of seeking and taking up new opportunities. Lisa describes her Father's desire to take a risk, leave a steady job in England and seek new opportunities overseas: 'he decided 'I can't do this, I'm getting itchy feet' and he looked in a paper and saw there was a job in Hong Kong and a job in Singapore.'[66] Her first transcript clearly shows her own attitude to change and opportunity; she embraces both but also describes difficult times associated with this.

Without exception, the students describe a rich musical life at school with which they choose to engage. Lara describes her music curriculum at primary school:

> There were a lot of music initiatives and programmes for people to start instruments, including an initiative by one teacher to give every child in the school the opportunity to pick up an instrument […]. I think that's what really pushed it forward.[67]

---

[63] Makis 1
[64] Makis 1
[65] Makis 1
[66] Lisa 1
[67] Lara 1

Michael and Jo both describe a kind of cumulative affect throughout school and university in terms of grasping opportunities as they appear:

> Whenever I joined a musical club I never liked to give it up, so I ended up having lots and lots of musical things going on all the way through school. And the more instruments I learnt the more I had to do.[68]

It seems likely that these reported high levels of participation in the students' histories have led to correspondingly high visibility amongst teachers and that this in itself leads on to further opportunities. These early histories hint at future entrepreneurial behaviour where the students start to differentiate themselves and put themselves in the position to capitalise on future opportunities. Maria realises how positioning herself as a classical singer helped:

> I was one of the very few classically trained singers at school and in my county really. There were a lot of musical theatre singers or, kind of, jazz and pop singers, but I was a bit different being a classical trained singer, which meant I got quite a lot of opportunities, which is really nice.[69]

whilst Lisa is given an opportunity to run a concert at school by her teacher:

> He even trusted me to do an entire musical score for The Winter's Tale. This was someone who couldn't write music and I did all the music for it and I played the music with my friend Ellie. We played it. We sang it. I taught the rest of the cast the songs and that was a huge influence on me as well because of the immense creative freedom I got.[70]

Opportunity Awareness

Opportunity awareness forms a key part of the career decision-making process, as part of the DOTS model discussed in Chapter 2. Within university careers sessions for students, this is typically presented as part of the preparatory process in applying for vacancies within existing firms but for many music students, who are likely to embark on self-managed, freelance careers the ability to spot an opportunity could assume even greater significance. Trends emerging from this study reveal: relatively high levels of alertness to and willingness to engage in new opportunities; the significance of the

---

[68] Jo 1
[69] Maria 1
[70] Lisa 1

opportunity being performance related and the significance of the opportunities provided by the universities themselves.

For some of the students, the original choice of university was based on the perceived chance of extra-curricular activity. For Anna, awareness of the expansion of opportunities offered by the Collegiate University system, was as important as the course itself.

> I chose my college […], because I remember looking at the website and of how much they did musical related, and they just do a ridiculous amount of arts projects, so I was like 'I've got to go there'. So in my first year I just did everything possible in college. [71]

She describes a maelstrom of activity, composing projects, acting, opera, choir: 'I did everything and I didn't really care at that time [chuckles]'.[72] And continues to show a high level of alertness to new opportunities: 'I'm very reliant on my email, I always have been, things always come up', 'I'm always aware of things going on around me.[73] Jo, also at the collegiate university, sees numerous existing opportunities with which she can engage and in the first year took full advantage of this: 'If there was something going on I would join that'.[74]

At the Vocational University students identify strongly with the opportunities arising directly from the physical location of their course. Lisa identifies performance opportunities as key: 'I am playing in a gypsy jazz band and through our teachers we already had three gigs […] so we could play in Hall 2 and on the Concourse which was great'. She is aware of the significance of the presence of talented students to the organisation: 'If […] is asking for something, they are going to ask us first so we have got more opportunities'.[75] Both Lisa and Lara are aware of the fact that they are students within a hub of visiting professional musicians, and the opportunities for networking arising as a result:

> The more people you know, the more opportunities are there to play.[76]

---

[71] Anna 1
[72] Anna 1
[73] Anna 1
[74] Jo 1
[75] Lisa 1
[76] Lisa 1

> It was quite a monumental thing because although I did not realise it, I was working with quite world famous people and it was literally an opportunity that was offered and I said, 'Yes'.[77]

The Collegiate and Vocational universities have a greatly differing demographic in terms of the student body, however, in terms of opportunity provision there is a certain similarity in that both have existing structures which provide opportunities for their students should they wish to engage with them. Within the Collegiate University, students have a number of existing societies which they can join through the music department or their respective colleges, as well as the wider university societies. This collegiate system also greatly facilitates cross-subject activity, for example participation in productions originating from English or Drama. The Vocational University with its setting in a major regional music venue, provides on-going opportunities for contact with visiting artists although, given the small numbers of students and dislocation from the 'host' university, there are fewer opportunities for inter-student collaborations. The Civic University has fewer set offers than the Collegiate in terms of existing societies and established annual events, but a diverse group of students, staff and visiting artists appears to facilitate an on-going creation of new opportunities. At all three sites, the students themselves appear to generate much of the activity:

> With a lot of bands, as I said, it's about creating your own opportunities. A lot of band members become promoters as a way to get their own band heard, or bands that they like in the local scene exposed. So yeah, I think lots of the musicians in […] are unwitting entrepreneurs.[78]

What has emerged from students at all three universities has been a lack of engagement with opportunities arising from central university initiatives, specifically careers and enterprise centres. Students refer to some of the publicity with a sense of bemusement:

> Sometimes there are posters and things in the department and I know some of my friends even think, 'Well what's that doing here, who put that up?', because it just seems so incongruous.[79]

> We get emails coming through. I think there's one that always says Blueprint, or something. But yeah, to be absolutely honest, I just always pass them by and I

---

[77] Lara 1
[78] Robert 1
[79] Jo 1

> never really look at them because I just think they don't seem relevant to musicians.[80]

They also express a sense of alienation:

> We get emails occasionally from the, I don't know who they are; they're something to do with business or entrepreneurial learning. I'm very aware that this could just be my narrow mindedness, but their language seems very geared towards *Dragons' Den* style finance and business, rather than my kind of artistic end…'[81]

At this point it is important to acknowledge the activist effect of my research (Kemmis and McTaggart, 2008, p. 287) for as a result of participation and advice from me, several of the students have now made contact with their respective enterprise centres and are translating their entrepreneurial projects into small businesses. This points to a potentially powerful combination of activist (tutor) and opportunist (student). In this situation the tutor, myself in this instance, acts as a form or translator of, or advocate for, more centrally located support services.

Courage and risk taking

The ability to take up opportunities appears to be closely aligned to risk taking, a key characteristic cited in early theories of the entrepreneur from the French School of economists; Cantillon (1730) and Baudeau (c1763) (Chell, Haworth and Brearley, 1991 p.13). Some of the students in the study have taken great personal risk in their journey through to university, particularly the international students. It could be argued that these risks, such as international relocation, have helped to shape the entrepreneurial nature of the students; alternatively that their innate entrepreneurial qualities may have enabled them to see and take alternative paths. Whether entrepreneurial by nature or nurture, it seems that changes in location during schooling have significantly informed the future attitudes and mind-sets of the students. Perhaps more significant is the particular exposure to risk experienced by music students, as Kingsbury (1988) suggests 'the very act of walking out on stage constitutes a risk in itself' compounded by great potential for public failure of a technical or artistic nature. I would argue that, particularly within performance, the music student's willingness to risk failure in

---

[80] Jo 1
[81] Maria 1

pursuit of an opportunity that holds potential for great joy and success, indicates a propensity for entrepreneurship.

Bella is a highly active student from the USA. Her band is becoming well established regionally[82] and internationally and she is also involved in many politically active projects aligned to music. She is currently studying for a PhD at the Civic University having made a series of life-changing decisions about her education. Whilst at her first college in the USA she identifies her potential as a musician and feels this is not being fulfilled, although she is extremely happy socially and academically at this point:

> I did the audition and I didn't tell anybody, I told my closest friends, who were very, like upset, because we're a family. At college, we hung out together, we live in the same house, did everything together, we laughed, cried…[83]
>
> so I went to […] and I was amongst some of the top musicians in the State.[84]

Following her time as a student she starts teaching but after a while, encouraged by a former professor, she gives up a steady teaching job with a good salary to go to South Africa:

> So then I left, quit my job, moved to South Africa and started my Masters there. But the thing is, it was another great experience. I thought, you know, 'I'm gonna go to Africa, all the kids are gonna be, just hungry for knowledge.[85]

Having moved to Newcastle for further postgraduate study Bella continues to draw on her global experience both academically and for her entrepreneurial activity.

Two of the other international students took big risks by relocating for their education. Lily, from Germany, happy to study in English, now studies at the Vocational University, initially having decided to go and study in an international university in Thailand at the age of 18:

> I knew I wanted to do music but I didn't want to study at that place any more. There were so many things, the whole education system, wearing uniforms, being treated like children really. They didn't really teach people to research and

---

[82] Winner of the Journal Culture Awards Performing Artist of the Year 2013.
[83] Bella 1
[84] Bella 1
[85] Bella 1

that kind of thing. I did not feel like, if I finished that course, I would be able to work anywhere.[86]

Makis also took a big risk in coming to the North East of England from Greece:

I didn't speak English at all. Even when I came here I had my IELTS[87] but I could not speak English. I wanted to be close to my friend so he would help me with things like finding a house.[88]

This change of location, disconnection from the familiar surroundings and social groups can be as significant in apparently less geographically dramatic circumstances. Lara identified the need to change schools for her 'A' Level studies, remaining where she was would have meant giving up music and by the age of 16 she was committed to the idea of aiming for a career in music:

I literally just left everything from my old high school, even friends, behind. I just started fresh. I was really nervous, especially being at that age, being 17. It was a real challenge but, for some reason, I just gave myself confidence to think, 'This is what I want to do, I've got to make it work.' I'd been given the opportunity to do it. I thought 'I'm lucky enough to get to do 'A' level; I've got to make the most of it.' I gave myself some inner confidence to do it. Drive, I suppose.[89]

Interestingly, Lara whilst demonstrating a strong internal locus of control and a need for autonomy, describes this experience from a slightly different standpoint: she has been *given* the opportunity; she is *lucky* – in reality she made an extremely courageous, autonomous decision. She finds she needs to once more draw on her resources and take another risk when she fails to get into her university of choice in the region (the Civic University) and spots a new degree in community music at the Vocational University:

When I found that out, I looked around for what was available and, by chance, saw this degree that I'm on and literally took a gamble and thought: 'This might be something different, I've never experienced it before so, let's just try it.' It was a leap of faith.'[90]

Anna is an example of a risk taker within the curriculum itself. Far from being instrumental in seeking to obtain the highest marks, she engaged with such a wide range of activities across many genres and had become so visible within the department that

---

[86] Lily 1
[87] International English Language Testing System.
[88] Makis 1
[89] Lara 1
[90] Lara 1

she is approached by a friend to direct a major university opera, although at that stage she is not interested in opera, an offer she finds daunting:

> The thought had never crossed my mind, of applying for something so big. I thought I'm nowhere near qualified or experienced to even have a go. But then it sort of stuck in my head. And I remember thinking about it, I was like 'But actually I'm doing music, it's quite interesting, I've sort of had a bit of experience with acting and directing, and when else am I ever going to have the opportunity?' So I sort of thought about it long and hard and thought about whether, because I was in third year as well, whether I can actually balance both.[91]

Commercial awareness

For some of the students the way in which they both seek and create opportunities is intrinsically linked to business activity but although they describe a variety of business models, they do not themselves identify them as such. Typically their business models involve managing several parallel activities at any one time; the model of the portfolio musician with a protean career.

Makis, a singer songwriter and composer had considerable experience as a working musician in his native Greece prior to becoming a music student. He describes three clear business strategies:

- Firstly to gain visibility through an ever widening network:

> We would take any opportunity to perform, even without money. Then, more people would come back to us to ask us if we wanted to play at a party[92]

- Secondly, to be able to spot a gap in the market and have a unique selling point, for example in his home town in Greece:

> It was easy to find a job because nobody would play folk music and I actually knew it very well because I was playing it since I was eight years old. I started working when I was 16[93]

- And thirdly to be flexible and open minded about the kind of music he will perform, playing what the customers wanted, in Greece and in the North East of England:

---

[91] Anna 1
[92] Makis 1
[93] Makis 1

> Some of it I didn't know but they paid really well for it. We made some good
> money from this business[94]

> I know people that will play what the Greeks here want to hear which is
> different than what they want to hear in Greece. Here their taste is far worse.
> They go for the worst kind of music. But I can play it. [You can provide it][95]

Makis seems to be able to draw a clear line between making an income and his artistic practice as a composer but is aware of the artistic compromise involved; this impacts directly upon his ability to include fellow musicians in the gigs:

> The hard part is finding musicians that will play it. I found musicians but they
> don't want to play it. My friend who brought me here, he can play the bouzouki;
> he doesn't want to think about playing this kind of music they want here. But it
> will always pay so well.[96]

Robert, a talented classically trained musician playing a range of instruments in a number of different bands, operates in a similar way to Makis. He is strongly committed to one aspect of his music making:

> The hip hop one we played a lot of gigs for free in the beginning, because that's
> just what you need to do to start getting more gigs. So that one was probably the
> biggest curve, because we were originally playing for either no money or, like
> ten pounds between eight people, which is not even really worth giving it to us
> [laughs][97]

And he is similarly funded by other activities:

> There's another band I've been playing in recently which is, it actually is led by
> one person […] it's his songs and it's, kind of 20s to 40s folk and blues and
> things like that. I've had no real experience of that in the past; I've never really
> played that kind of music. And it's not particularly challenging, I don't have
> that much input, but it's fun and we get paid well, and we don't have to practice
> very much. So in that way I can see myself doing things that aren't particularly
> personal to me because they are more lucrative than what I actually like doing.[98]

Michael seems to operate on a different basis, using a cooperative business model involving systems of exchange, for example with a graphic designer:

---

[94] Makis 1
[95] Makis 1
[96] Makis 1
[97] Robert 1
[98] Robert 1

> It was him that came and said, 'Oh, I see you're doing this. Would you like me to do your album artwork?' And he's done both my albums. And it was favours for favours. I used to have this weird idea that you had to have so much money to do stuff, but really you can do it very budget and get the same results.[99]

Michael's perceived relationship with his audience appears to sit at the heart of his business decision-making and his idea of compromise is more complex than just performing music for purely monetary reasons:

> I think I'm one of those artists that does have quite a unique sound in the sense that it's not that easy to pinpoint who it sounds like. It's a fusion of a lot of different artists. And I think understanding where you got those influences from is really important, because that helps you understand the sort of people that will like it. And it might be people that you'd never want to like it, but if they like it, then you've got to let go of that a bit.[100]

Realising that at the moment it is difficult to be a touring artist Michael is constantly diversifying the direction of his business activity:

> I had to think, well, maybe I'm good at something else. So that's when I got into the whole social media thing. I really bought into the social media phenomenon, which is the concept of online communities […] I know for a fact it works.[101]

Opportunity creation

A key oppositional debate exists when considering opportunities and the entrepreneurial process: discovery versus creation (Korsgaard, 2013, p. 131). The discovery view remains at the centre of entrepreneurship theory, proposing that in most cases an opportunity is already present and that entrepreneurship occurs when an alert individual discovers its existence. The creation view, drawing upon broader notions of creativity, is less well- defined in this research paradigm but in this study, where students appear to be creating new opportunities, can offer an additional useful perspective rather than counter argument. If we accept that entrepreneurship's role in job creation, particularly the setting up of small businesses, underpins economic strategy worldwide, a music department can be considered to be an entrepreneurial micro-region in which the students need to seek and create opportunities for themselves and in the act of doing so, potentially contribute to the overall availability of opportunities for other students.

---

[99] Michael 1
[100] Michael 1
[101] Michael 1

It is interesting to note that amongst the entrepreneurial students of this study, there are examples of students using their time at university as an opportunity to re-create or re-invent and develop previous initiatives; adapting their ideas to suit the particular community of music students which they find themselves in. Whilst still at school, Anna had set up a gospel choir. The choir was completely inclusive; there were no auditions. She spotted an opportunity at university, joined the existing university choir and then successfully applied to conduct it: 'I felt like that was my opportunity to sort of, not recreate the gospel choir, but recreate the idea of getting people involved to sing without, mainly without having to audition.'[102] Bella, as well as constantly creating new opportunities, has re-launched new versions of her original band as she has moved between academic institutions in the USA, South Africa and the UK. In each setting she has retained the original concept for the band which is to have an ensemble for classical musicians to learn how to improvise.[103]

Both Lily and Michael created opportunities through setting up bands when in their early teens. Lily set up a girl band: 'Pop-rock music, we played some gigs and wrote our own music. When that stopped I had a new band with my brother as well'.[104] Michael's first band eventually got signed: 'I started my first band that was a serious project, that was when I was 13 and that continued for five years'.[105] Both Lily and Michael show high levels of autonomy and are highly active in constantly creating new opportunities for themselves. Lily plays in a number of bands of various genres identified through networks and internet advertisements whilst Michael focuses on the online community and networks: 'In my free time I'm updating websites, trying to get my music that I've already got recorded heard and listened to, trying to get decent opportunities'.[106]

Robert, was studying mainly classical music at school, whilst outside school he started doing his own kind of music which led to the creation of performance opportunities for himself:

---

[102] Anna 1
[103] Bella 1
[104] Lily 1
[105] Michael 1
[106] Michael 1

> [...]more off my own bat. The kind of music I was listening to was more studio-based music rather than proper bands. For a while I was mainly listening to hip hop and electronic music and things like that. So I got into dj-ing and making music to try and do that on my own.[107]

And, at university, his activities created opportunities for other students in a new band:

> One was like a world music dance band basically, so some reggae, some soca, just things that would make people dance and not be too controversial or anything. They were very percussion-based, like we had a drummer, a conga player and a general percussionist and then brass. So again, it was a band that was aimed at getting people dancing.[108]

Robert describes the different ways in which he sets up new opportunities for the band:

> [...]through the internet, pretty much exclusively, I suppose. You'd find similar bands and ask them to, sort of, swap gigs. So you'd say you'd put them on in Newcastle if they put you on wherever they were. Or you could find promoters' personal websites or MySpace, or whatever. Approach them through that; send them, like some songs you've done, or some videos of you playing gigs to try and get them interested, that sort of thing. One of our gigs in London was through a competition. We won the chance to play it. So yeah, quite a variety.[109]

> It's just a matter of casting the net out, I think. We approach lots of people.[110]

In terms of the creation of new opportunities for both self and others, it seems that performance is a key motivator and it appears that entrepreneurial activity related to performance can be seen to represent both a discovery and creation view of opportunity.

Career strategies

The students of the study, in interviews, show a tendency to talk strategically about their long-term plans and seek opportunities which will help them to achieve their ambitions. The stated career intentions of music students tend to be unique within the university. Almost without exception, students included in this study (including the early pilot study and focus groups) expressed the desire for a career that is somehow connected with music, even though this might not involve actual performance.

---

[107] Robert 1
[108] Robert 1
[109] Robert 1
[110] Robert 1

In Lara's case she had clear strategic plans in terms of aiming for a degree course but when this does not work out, she accepts the serendipity of ending up on the Community Music course and then goes on to show great flexibility, identifying the new opportunities offered by this change of vocational direction. Although classically trained, she embraces the diversity on her course:

> I like the fact that it is challenging because I think if I was around people who did exactly the same thing as me, I don't think I would necessarily learn as much. I think I've learnt more about improvisation and doing off the cuff music by working in and around these people as opposed to sticking to the sheet music and doing what I know.[111]

She describes her plans for becoming a freelance musician in terms of what she will need to do: 'It is probably going to be a case of me finding what is out there or what is needed so that I can set up my own work'.[112] And conceptualises her future career: 'I'm probably looking at it from a self-employed perspective as a community based worker'.[113]

Maria trained as a workshop facilitator prior to starting university, setting herself up for future opportunities through finding out about child protection and health and safety legislation. It was: 'A good experience for me to be exposed to'[114] she says. Although a talented classical singer who loves performing, she has made a clear decision to aim for some form of arts management:

> I say to people, kind of, I do music, but all the stuff that goes around it, rather than necessarily the actual music performing any more. But, obviously, I'm a music student and I still really love studying it and I do do performing, certainly. But […] my niche is the kind of stuff that grows around with it. The logistical side of making it happen.[115]

Jo sees opportunities at the Collegiate University to gain serious administrative experience through the existing formal structures of the Orchestral Society and shows tenacity in moving towards her current post as President:

> I ended up going for Secretary, and had to hust, which was quite scary. And I didn't get that, actually, but then the next week there was still a vacancy for a

---

[111] Lara 1
[112] Lara 1
[113] Lara 1
[114] Maria 1
[115] Maria 1

position that hadn't been stood for, Patrons & Alumni Secretary. It was a, kind of, fundraising role, so I decided to go for that and got that and then I was […] in the Exec. This time last year I went for President and I'm currently President of the Orchestral Society.[116]

She also shows the ability to make connections between her academic and career interests, strategically using ethnomusicology to make links with missionary work:

I went to the Philippines in the summer on a mission trip, but I also used that as my basis for my dissertation, which I'm currently writing. So, in a way that's […] a very short taster of something I could be doing in the future, doing work as a missionary or as a church worker, but also integrating music into that, using research.[117]

Mike makes a clearly strategic, vocational choice to study of at […] College, before later transferring to the Civic University for the top -up degree, identifying a need for autonomy; being able to produce his own, as well as other's, music: 'I didn't really do that for any reason other than to become the kind of producer that I am now. And it has really worked for me that, because I can produce really quite well now'.[118] He also takes a very strategic, vocational approach to the BMus: 'I understand why a lot of the more academic people look down their noses at the BMus. But I think they're missing the point […] we're not doing it to get somewhere; we're doing it to improve our skills.[119]

Discussion

The emerging themes outlined above and summarised below suggest that some music students may be great seekers of opportunity but tend not to be opportunistic:

- The students' life histories suggest that they have historically responded to and engaged with opportunities.
- They show tendencies towards a heightened level of awareness and alertness to existing opportunities.
- Several of the students have demonstrated great courage and a propensity for risk taking in seeking opportunities.
- The pursuit of opportunities is often underpinned by a keen commercial awareness.
- There is a need for some of the students to work collaboratively creating opportunities for both self and others.

---

[116] Jo 1
[117] Jo 1
[118] Mike 1
[119] Mike 1

- Their opportunity seeking may not be opportunistic but it can be highly strategic and driven by career aspiration.

This analysis of the first transcripts gives a picture of a group of entrepreneurial music students showing differing approaches to the pursuit of and creation of opportunities. What emerges across this group is a desire to be seen on the 'lighter side' of entrepreneurship where their activities do not take place at the expense of others, in fact they contribute to the creation of opportunities for others. They do not appear to be describing opportunistic ways of behaving. Yet within core theories of entrepreneurship (Casson, 2003; Chell, Haworth and Brearley, 1991) and historical accounts of musicians (Bashford, 2007; Ehrlich, 1985), it does seem that, as Weber (2004, p. 5) suggests, some level of opportunism is 'a *sine qua non* for a professional musician'.

Pedagogical implications

Albeit within a historical context, Weber offers up the twin concepts of 'musical opportunism' and the 'musical opportunist', suggesting that these terms have a close symbiotic relationship with the term 'entrepreneur'. He manages to position the 'musical opportunist' in a twilight zone between the 'dark' and 'light' sides of entrepreneurship as 'the professional who had the ability to perceive an opportunity and take advantage of it effectively' (2004, p.5). This definition is unproblematic and in fact sits quite comfortably alongside the words of the students in this study. I would argue that there is value in a consideration of Weber's description as an alternative to the usual pedagogical illustrations of employability enhancing behaviour within universities, which tend to adopt the default position of a prospective employee seeking to please the prospective employer. Most music students operate outside of this model; in fact Weber's historical description of the musical opportunist not only mirrors the emerging themes outlined above but also prescribes the need for a set of skills that might easily underpin the professional development aspect of a 21st century music degree programme:

> In order to succeed as a high level professional, a musician had to acquire a broad set of social skills by which to identify and accomplish promising opportunities. It was insufficient just to be a good performer or composer; to rise to the top of the profession almost always required musicians to be able to find patrons, attract a public, lead other musicians, and, indeed,

117

> organize productions of an often complicated order. That involved learning techniques of self-promotion through exposure in public and in print, through personal contacts and idiosyncratic personal behaviour, and linking to all this a distinctive and appealing musical style. (Weber, 2004, p.5)

One interesting distinction does emerge between Weber's concept of the musical opportunist and the students' stated career ambitions, which are introduced in these first transcripts but discussed in more depth in Chapter 8, the idea of rising 'to the top of the profession' (2004, p.5). For most present day musicians the definition of success is likely to be that they are able to earn the bulk of their income from music related activity (Bennett, 2008; Cottrell, 2004; Coulson, 2010) and the idea of attaining huge fame tends to be viewed realistically by these students, most of whom show contempt for the instant fame offered by such cultural interventions as 'The X Factor'.[120]

The concept of providing opportunities for *all* students would be generally accepted as desirable by both academic and support staff and the core responsibility for this provision is generally seen to belong to the university, through staff led initiatives. This data is revealing the potential in taking more seriously the existing entrepreneurial activities of *some* students, which in many cases pre-dated their courses, and looking at mechanisms to involve other, less naturally entrepreneurial students in these ventures;[121] supporting the true creative entrepreneurs who then go on to provide opportunities for others. This would necessitate a much deeper understanding of what our students are bringing with them as they enter the university; usually, as their lecturers, we know little more than their name and possibly entry grades. As discussed in Chapter 2, an economic as well as sociological ontology of an entrepreneurial community of music students' needs, drawn from theories of nascent entrepreneurship (Mueller, 2005), would suggest that supporting identified student entrepreneurs within the micro-region that is a university music department could potentially stimulate 'business' across the wider body of students.

As explained at the start of this chapter, these students were purposefully selected, identified as highly participatory, and in the view of their tutors highly enterprising. As

---

[120] A reality television competition where members of the public compete for a lucrative record deal.
[121] Some such structures are starting to emerge, for example at the Civic University where funding for projects is awarded on the provision that the project involves other students.

such they are a heightened representation of 'music studentness'. This magnification of attributes may inform pedagogical approaches to music students as a whole. Each of the field sites in this study contains a diverse range of students who will encounter different opportunities throughout their university career. They describe sophisticated modes of behaviour related to 'opportunity' both at university and prior to university: their primary motivations appear to be related to the opportunities to cause change; opportunities to create, opportunities to create their own self-funded autonomous kingdom reflecting Darby's description of the young entrepreneur in the arts:

> The striving of a young entrepreneur is fuelled by a combination of a strong desire to create something, an instinctive urge to be in control of his/her destiny and an entrepreneurial flair that seems to have been part of their character from an early age. (Darby, 2001)

It seems, through the way that these students respond to opportunities, that entrepreneurial activity is driven by creativity over and above economic necessity; even when purely commercial ventures are undertaken it is often with a view to funding a creative project. It is this crucial element of creativity within the entrepreneurial music student that will be discussed in Chapter 5.

CHAPTER 5: THE CREATIVE INDIVIDUAL

'It's there and it's mine'
(Makis)

Introduction

Creativity is about novelty. The creation of something new may be in the realm of ideas or artifacts, either of which might be classified as a product. It is this close relationship to concepts such as 'novelty' and 'production' that has lead to creativity underpinning generic theories of entrepreneurship (see Chapter 2). We have already seen the way in which the entrepreneurial student respondents in this study have been motivated to seek, create and respond to new opportunities, partly by what appears to be a strong inner creative spirit, which is intrinsically linked to their core identities as musicians. Musical creativity is a research paradigm in itself, often closely aligned to the creative act of composition (Alter,1999). Psychological studies, whilst acknowledging the extreme complexity involved in studies of creativity, suggest a propensity for high levels of creativity within musicians:

> Musical creativity is a multimodal and crossmodal human function with neurological bases that are widely distributed in both cerebral hemispheres, in frontal, temporal, and parietal areas. (Brattico and Tervaniemi, 2006, p.314)

Such overtly cognitive approaches do have their place, particularly as the technological capacity to view brain activity rapidly advances, but in a study such as this where we are considering the real lives and daily activities of current students, such approaches tend to deny the social and emotional sides of creativity which are so highly significant for musicians. In this chapter I will focus on these 'soft' aspects, using data from across the full set of transcripts to illustrate the particular ways in which these music students display and deploy their creativity within an entrepreneurial context and the difficulties they encounter in doing so.

Historically, the concept of creativity is significant in both religious and anthropological studies of what it is to be human, albeit that there are widely differing cultural historical trajectories. Western views typically originated from Christianity and the idea of creation as in Genesis, whilst much earlier Eastern thought (Hindu, Taoist and

Buddhist) was based far more on the natural rhythm and balance of things (Albert and Runco, 2009, p. 18). The universal theme has always been that the origins of creativeness were external to the individual, drawn from their surroundings, the natural world, from divine inspiration; a muse; and in some cultures from the voices of the ancestors. Throughout history artists' attributes were possibly seen as other-worldly, inspired by some external spiritual force but nevertheless attributes of which they had full ownership.

The idea of the mystical nature of the genius, seen in the time of Aristotle as 'an association with madness and frenzied inspiration' (Albert and Runco, 1999, p. 18) still persisted by the end of the 18th century, allied to the sublime (Beard and Gloag, 2005, p. 70) and distinct from the merely talented, who might be able to develop a skill such as musicianship. Notably, in the history of the discussion of genius, the musician becomes more frequently foregrounded, possibly because of the visible nature of the virtuoso performance. Whilst romantic ideas of the virtuoso as 'inspired superhuman Genius' (Leppert, 2004, p. 26) still held centre stage in the developing artistic concept of creativity, it was Darwin's Origin of Species (1859) that was to profoundly influence the future direction of creativity research, via Galton and Freud, leading to some of the psychoanalytical and cognitive approaches to the study of creativity that exist today (Albert and Runco, 2009).

Despite the historically shared understanding that appears to exist as to the nature of creativity (in an 'all-embracing' sense), defining creativity can still be problematic; more recent links to the development of artificial intelligence have introduced yet another paradigm. Bearing in mind the danger that 'creativity has been trivialized to a point where many researchers profess to find it in the behavior of anything human or artificial' (Pachet, 2006, p.348), this chapter seeks to avoid generic application by rooting the concept firmly within the context of entrepreneurship and this particular group of university music students. Some potentially useful working definitions of creativity will be offered followed by discussion of the following themes which have emerged from both transcript analysis and field observation: creativity and entrepreneurship; the 'courage to create'; 'God songs' and 'dollar songs'; applied creativity and creativity as identity. Data is suggesting that the entrepreneurial musician needs to be regarded as possessing a specific kind of creativity in that 'music differs

from other arts and therefore might engage our capacities in special ways' (Merker, 2006, p.25).

Defining creativity

Creativity has become a pervasive word. Lurking in the corridors of commerce, education, business, the arts and politics it has assumed canonical status within the marketing of both products and ideas. And, such is the ubiquitous nature of 'creativity', there appears to be a tendency to adopt an easy acceptance and agreed definition of this term, as it is seamlessly deployed across contexts, particularly within universities. Within the university, creative subject areas are clearly defined and the idea of fostering creativity to enhance employability skills (in the sense of producing students who can come up with new ideas, think about things differently and, problem solve), is accepted as a good thing across all degree programmes. External to the world of higher education, within the creative industries more is at stake in terms of the definition of creativity as successive governments report on the economic value[122] of such activity, using the following broad definition as a means to guide policy:

> […] those industries which have their origin in individual creativity, skill and talent and which have a potential for wealth and job creation through the generation and exploitation of intellectual property. (Bakhshi, Freeman and Higgs, 2013)

A recent report by the arts support charity NESTA[123] has challenged this definition suggesting significant weaknesses in the Department for Culture Media and Sport's (DCMS) classification system in which:

> The actual industries and occupations considered to be creative are still rooted in the conditions of the late 1990s' offering 'a generalised rationale, but no explicit criteria for making informed judgments on what should be counted as 'creative', and what should not'. (Bakhshi, Freeman and Higgs, 2013, p.6)

---

[122] 'Our creative industries are a real success story. They are worth more than £36 billion a year; they generate £70,000 every minute for the UK economy; and they employ 1.5 million people in the UK. According to industry figures, the creative industries account for around £1 in every £10 of the UK's exports. With the right support, they have the potential to bring even more benefits to our culture and economy.' https://www.gov.uk/government/policies/making-it-easier-for-the-media-and-creative-industries-to-grow-while-protecting-the-interests-of-citizens. February 2013 statement accessed 21st June 2013.

[123]See http://nesta.org.uk

In common with its parent concept within this thesis, entrepreneurship, creativity remains a potentially slippery subject to define, whilst at the same time we have a strong instinctive understanding of the term: it is about creating something new. Mirroring a key approach taken in defining entrepreneurship – 'an entrepreneur is what an entrepreneur does', Deliège and Richelle, (2006, p.2) suggest we disregard the more nebulous concept of 'creativity' and look at 'creative acts'. They suggest that an appropriate way to look at the processes involved in creative acts would be to 'ask persons who have engaged in acts of creation to report on their experience'. This is exactly what my fieldwork is doing.

To a large extent, drawing upon the contextual settings above, my group of respondents are pre-defined as creative; they are students of the creative arts in an arts faculty, destined for work in the creative industries. My own definition of creativity has arisen from an essentially inductive approach to fieldwork and hence challenges Klausen's (2010, p. 348) notion that 'researchers must know and be able to state what they are going to look for'. I did not set out to define creativity and then take a positivist approach to prove this definition through the words of my students. Rather, as the process of transcript analysis progressed, behaviours were revealed, which, through my own constructs, I have defined as creative acts. In developing my own definition, a number of synergies with Klausen's (2010) construct of the product and Csikzentmihalyi's (1999) ideas on persuasion have emerged.

Product

Klausen (2010) suggests that there is some value in the idea of definition through the *product* rather than the person or process. Arguing the need for conceptual analysis, he asserts that in many areas of business and the social sciences, clear definition of creativity is eschewed and an 'implicit grasp' is accepted as enough:

> It is not like height or acidity, but more like, say, humor or beauty, a quality that people – although they may concur in many of their actual judgments are prone to disagree about. Yet it is also something psychologists and educational researchers are keen to detect and measure. (Klausen, 2010, p. 348)

Klausen (2010) challenges Sternberg and Lubart's (1999) definition of creativity as the production of ideas which are both novel and useful which suggests that novelty in itself is not necessarily enough, that there is also a need for the novel act to lead to a positive result. He sees the suggestion in contemporary definitions of creativity, which imply that 'creativity is necessarily successful', as 'overly restrictive' and proposes that 'it is thus preferable to speak instead of a process which has a *propensity* for resulting in a novel work' (p. 349). Klausen goes on to outline the opposing case, made by critics of the product view, who 'object to making creativity depend on the achievement of short-term tangible effects, pointing instead to long-term or intangible effects such as self-development, enlightenment, or seeing the world with fresh eyes' pointing out that 'self development or enlightenment can also be considered 'products' in the appropriate sense of the word; they are outcomes or results of a process' (p. 351).

Response dependence

> X is creative = is such as to elicit, under suitable conditions, in an appropriate audience an impression of creativity (Klausen, 2010, p. 354)

The philosophical idea of response dependence is useful in attempting to define creativity, where 'a creative product is something that would appear creative to an appropriate audience under suitable conditions' (Klausen, 2010, p. 354). The audience provides some kind of group, social consensus about an observed entity such as a product or a performance. This idea of audience validation of creativity extends directly into entrepreneurship, for example the 'elevator pitch' where it might be necessary to 'persuade' a potential funder of the validity of your creative idea in just a couple of minutes:

> For if you cannot persuade the world that you had a creative idea, how do we know that you actually had it? And if you do persuade others, then of course you will be recognized as creative (Csikzentmihalyi, 1999, p. 314).

However, at the same time the quality of the appraiser may be called into question:

> I might succeed in persuading my neighbors that I am an extremely creative philosopher or musician, but this judgment is of dubious value if my neighbors are largely ignorant about philosophy and music (Klausen, 2010, p. 353).

The perception of ignorance may also be false, for example music students may challenge the credentials of those who assess a performance or composition when disappointed, even when the assessment team comprises highly regarded professional musicians and music academics. They may hold university enterprise teams in low regard in the judging of business ideas and awarding of prizes. What this schism between creator and audience points to is the paradoxical nature of creativity.

Even when we look at some more specific definitions of musical creativity, for example Merker's suggestion that 'musical creativity cannot be defined without reference to the quality of the music it produces' (2006, p. 25), it remains a problematic concept. The students show evidence of what I would describe as musical creativity without any knowledge on my part as to the 'quality' of performance or composition. A more helpful approach to my own particular study can be found in Sternberg's (2006, pp. 88-90) 'confluence approach' to develop his 'investment theory of creativity'. This theory immediately resonates with theories of nascent entrepreneurship (discussed in Chapter 2), suggesting that creativity is dependent upon an essential interrelationship between intellectual abilities, knowledge, styles of thinking, personality, motivation and environment underpinned by decision making.

Creativity and entrepreneurship

In the study of entrepreneurship, the concept of creativity is omnipresent but, in spite of this, rarely is a clear definition presented to explain how this particular research paradigm is using the concept, possibly because the main focus remains fixed on the act of defining entrepreneurship itself. Trait theories of 'the entrepreneur' will often use the term 'creativity' as a key descriptor of entrepreneurial personality[124] but will tend to show little connection to the wider philosophical theories of creativity, rather, they privilege the 'pragmatic' paradigm where:

> Those taking this approach have been concerned primarily with developing creativity, secondarily with understanding it, but almost not at all with testing the validity of their ideas about it. (Sternberg and Lubart, 1999, p. 5)

---

[124] Trait theory underpins the General Entrepreneurial Tendencies (GET) test discussed in Chapter 2.

Perhaps understandably, this is the kind of approach evident within creative entrepreneurship programmes, creative careers sessions, idea generation workshops and other pedagogical interventions in universities. Sternberg and Lubart (1999) suggest that this pragmatic approach can be seen as damaging to the scientific study of creativity. This is not to undermine the value of entrepreneurial education within our universities but to suggest that perhaps there is an early point in the discussion of business ideas with students, at which the concept of creativity demands clarification, before we move on to the actual pragmatic enabling of the creative act and the facilitating of the creative product. This may be particularly pertinent for those delivering entrepreneurship programmes to university music students, for whom commercialization is a sensitive issue: 'the effect of such approaches is often to leave people associating a phenomenon with commercialization' (Sternberg and Lubart, 1999, p. 6).

Michael

Michael has maintained a strong business focus on his music activities during his time as a student but does not always wear his entrepreneurship easily:

> I think that's the thing that's often challenging me in terms of university and running a business and thinking, 'Is it stopping my creativity?' And I often think *it does*. And then, at the same time, I think *it doesn't*. For instance, last year, when I was producing my album, it was completely supporting my creativity as much as it could, really. I was basically left to work on my own stuff. [125]

This contradictory stance is typical of many of the music students I have taught, and mentored as they muse upon their entrepreneurial personae. To a certain extent this is caused by a two-stage approach to many of their activities. Firstly, they may have an idea for a creative product, to use a common example, a CD. The inspiration and intellectual planning of the CD feels like a creative activity, as does the act of composition itself, but as the process moves through recording to production there is a leaching of the pure feeling of creativity experienced at the start. By the time prices are being negotiated with printers for the CD case, or alternatively web designers or artists for online distribution, the project has re-positioned itself in the music student's eyes as a business. If however, we return to the idea that creativity is defined through the observable creative act, in other words the *actual* production of the CD we have a far

---

[125] Michael 1

broader concept of what it means to be creative; that a creative music student is able to deploy their creativity across contexts.

Michael shows this broader creativity when describing his offer of a practical skill to other people. When recording one particular artist he is aware of the complexity of the project and the need to employ soft (emotional intelligence) as well as technical skills:

> He writes quite arranged music with a lot of instruments so I was having to work with some classical musicians and having to employ all sorts of different skills, even psychology because a lot of them haven't worked in studios.[126]

His creativity is also aligned to a fierce independence and self-belief when it comes to discussing creative projects. He arranges to talk to the major regional music venue about possible future work opportunities: 'Initially it was talking about what I could do if I wanted to work there' [127] but once in the meeting he explains, 'I'm not really looking to go on a course and start work on one of your projects, I've really got an idea I wanted to bring to you.[128]

The courage to create

In Chapter 3 we saw how the student respondents showed a propensity for courageous risk taking in the way in which they sought out and created opportunities for both themselves and others. The ability to be creative can also be seen to be closely connected to this trait of courage, particularly if we accept Klausen's response dependence equation as discussed above. If we acknowledge that a creative artist needs to present their work in a public forum in order for the act to be defined as creative by an audience, this public performance, exhibition, publication or presentation of a product does indeed take courage.

---

[126] Michael 2
[127] Michael 2
[128] Michael 2

Rollo May published *The Courage to Create* in the mid-1970s at a time identified with major transition in terms of social and economic structures:

> We are living at a time when one age is dying and the new age is not yet born. We cannot doubt this as we look about us to see the radical changes in sexual mores, in marriage styles, in family structures, in education, in religion, technology, and almost every other aspect of modern life. (May, 1975, p.11)

The background to any discussion of creativity today is not dissimilar to the context within which May was writing in the 1970's. The choice to consider elements of this older monograph is deliberate at this point; this is not to imply a stalling of the discussion over the last 35 years, rather to suggest that *The Courage to Create* can be used to inform contemporary thinking on creativity, firstly to challenge purely pragmatic approaches and to refresh current thinking on entrepreneurial learning and secondly to use paradigms suggested by May's text to refract themes emerging from the students' transcripts; particularly courage and creativity of the spirit. Taking an essentially optimistic position, May (1975, p.12) suggests that courage is needed to 'consciously participate' in constructing the future for society and ourselves. 'Courage' is a word rarely used by tutors and mentors considering the preparation of graduates for the existential 'anxiety of nothingness' (May, 1975, p. 12) but May's assertion that courage is needed 'to live into the future [and] leap into the unknown' offers a helpful concept, albeit one that would need careful presentation to current students. 'In human beings courage is necessary to make *being* and *becoming* possible' (May, 1975, p. 13).[129] These twin concepts of 'being' and 'becoming' offer a useful ontology for careers guidance.

May offers definitions of physical, moral and social courage but asserts that the most important is creative courage. 'Whereas moral courage is the righting of wrongs, creative courage, in contrast, is the discovering of new forms, new symbols, new patterns on which society can be built' (May, 1975, p.21). And this need for courage, suggests May, 'is in direct proportion to the degree of change the profession is undergoing' (May, 1975, p. 22). It is widely acknowledged that the music profession is

---

[129] This links directly with the acknowledged importance self-awareness in terms of career development, in the DOTS model and Maslow's theories of self-actualisation. The Socratic idea of 'knowing oneself' is also central to psychotherapy and career development theory.

an industry in the midst of huge change and it is this that is demanding more than the usual careers preparation for music students; in their dealings with the recording industry, arts organisations, orchestras and funding bodies they need to be creatively courageous entrepreneurs:

> The creative artist …must fight the *actual* (as contrasted to the ideal) gods
> of our society – the god of conformism as well as the gods of apathy,
> material success and exploitative power. (May, 1975, p. 30)

The student respondents tend to demonstrate elements of this creative courage by pushing themselves into new situations and responding positively to demands from certain tutors for them to engage with and embrace new experiences, particularly associated with the teaching of composition; 'my tutor […] said the last thing we need to see on this course is things that we saw before […] we need something new'[130] Talking about his participation in a composition module at the Civic University, Makis explains how he would never have engaged with new music had he stayed in his native Greece and that exposure to new avant-garde and experimental music texts, although tough, is taking him in new directions and enabling him to create: [131]

> I'm trying to do things I've never experienced before. I've had to do this to get a
> better mark but in reality this helps me to become, in a way, more intelligent
> because I get information from other styles of music[132]

Of the course he says it: 'opens my eyes'.[133]

Lara also describes how on the course she feels she has been encouraged to take risks:

> I tend not to listen to the internal voices; 'what if this goes wrong?' 'What if this all
> falls apart?' I'll do something about it so that it all pulls back together, that's the
> attitude I have.[134]

The creative music student has to be courageous on two fronts, defending commercial and creative decisions and balancing the demands of entrepreneurship with such demands for pure creativity from tutors.

---

[130] Makis 2
[131] Makis 2
[132] Makis 2
[133] Makis 2
[134] Lara 2

God songs and dollar songs[135]

May reminds us that there are potentially strong motivational differences between technological creativity and 'creativity of the spirit'. This is an extremely helpful dialogical construct within which to consider the music student as entrepreneur:

> By this I mean creativity that has nothing to do with technical use; I mean creativity in art, poetry, music, and other areas that exist for our delight and the deepening and enlarging of meaning in our lives rather than for making money or for increasing technical power. (May, 1975, p. 71)

This suggests a kind of creative utopia although May (1975) acknowledges that 'capitalism tries to take over the artist by buying him' (p.76). Realistically the only way of engagement for the music student is to understand, and develop a way of working within the system. My findings so far suggest that careers services and others involved in the employability agenda are genuinely committed to helping students to navigate 'the system' but the mode of presentation, which is essentially pragmatic, can fail to acknowledge a 'creativity of the spirit' and can easily reposition these services, in the eyes of the students, as capitalist in their remits. At the same time, individual students are finding ways to disrupt the system, repositioning their pitches in a way that steals funding from under the noses of those science or engineering students with an easily identifiable 'product'.

As we have seen, the student respondents consciously divide their work, particularly performance, into pure creative practice, new compositions and performances, and 'products' with immediate commercial value, which they often view as the means to fund their 'creative' projects. This business model is one offered to students by academic staff as well within professional development programmes, myself included:

> [tutor] says that 90% of the time you're doing what he calls 'dollar songs' , songs that make money, 10% of the time you should be doing 'God songs' which are what you want to do.[136]

Visiting artists talking to students about their lives as portfolio musicians also frequently refer to this model, for example North East based musician Anna Reay[137] whose presentation to my own students at the Civic University on her 'multiple musical

---

[135] A phrase used by one of David's tutors.
[136] David 2
[137] http://www.annareay.co.uk/homepage1.htm

identity' business model typically generates a lively group discussion and is often analysed by students in subsequent reflective writing tasks. Like Anna Reay, David, Makis and Lily all operate a business model which includes their 'god songs' and 'dollar songs'. For all three of them their true worth as musicians lies in their own compositions or alternative ensembles but they all sit quite comfortably with idea of being working musicians. The Vocational University seems to strongly validate this approach helping David to become what he describes as an 'overall musician'.[138] He works with four different bands but sets up one band to play to what he describes as a 'unique sound'. Although he strongly identifies this band with the creative side of his practice he still maintains a business perspective saying that the band is 'not that much in demand but where it is there is a market for it'. In this sense he is identifying this band/business as having a USP (unique selling point); he is creating a new artistic venture but also a new creative product. [139]

Both Lily and David from the Vocational University focus on the breadth of their offer, performing in several genres – 'trying to keep things open so you're not pigeon holing yourself'.[140] Makis centres all his work on the idea of Mediterranean Music but as we saw in Chapter 3, it is his work in Greek restaurants that is totally commercially focused:

> When you play in a Greek restaurant we are supposed to play Greek music because that's what your selling, your culture – with food – it's part of the culture, people know what they are going to hear, they expect to hear Greek music. But when the poster says Mediterranean Music it doesn't mean that it is going to be in Greek or Spanish.[141]

But Makis's own original compositions sit within the broader genre of Mediterranean. He has recently started to perform his solo compositions in public:

> In the restaurant I had to perform covers, now I have to do my own stuff and I really worry that people will not like my own stuff. If somebody else wrote a song and most of the people like the song and there are like five people in a hundred that don't like it then I would go for this song but when it comes to new stuff, my stuff, that I'm proud of I want it to be perfect, I really worry about it and […] it is very personal[142]

---

[138] David 2
[139] David 2
[140] David 2
[141] Makis 2
[142] Makis 2

Makis describes the feeling of creating something new and permanent:

> When I do something and finally see the fruits of this work that's exactly why I'm doing composition. It's not a process […] when it comes to the end, the piece of music, it makes me happy. It might be classical, which is not new, or Greek folk music, but it's mine, a piece of my soul in a way, and it really makes me happy – that's why I do it.[143]

He describes how he always had a creative drive: 'it wasn't always music before, I used to paint stuff […] but I wanted to have a result.[144] And, how after creating a new piece of music 'at least for a couple of days I'm smiling even when I'm sleeping […] it's there and it's mine'.[145] David crystalizes the artistic dilemma felt by many of the performing respondents in this study, albeit with higher expectations than Lily who feels that 'with original music you do not really expect to be paid'.[146] He says:

> 'To some extent, to make money in music, creativity needs to take a back seat'[147]

Applied creativity

If we accept that for something to be creative there needs to be an observable creative act it is helpful to identify the creative acts of the student respondents. It appears that music students frequently demonstrate combinational creativity, that is creating 'novelty that results from fresh combinations of pre-existing elements'. (Reybrouck, 2006 p.55)

> Creativity in music is combinational in a radical sense, but it is creative only to the extent that the elements and their combinations yield a product that can be perceived as something new. As such there is always the possibility of making new distinctions and this is perhaps the hallmark of the creative musician, be it at the level of listening, performing or composing. (Reybrouck, 2006 p.55)

I would add entrepreneurial activity to this list in the form of setting up new music related projects, not only connected to performance and composing but often to do with arts management, educational and university outreach projects. Whereas creativity is often considered to take place in an internalized, solitary sense, these students describe how they externalize their creative ideas.

---

[143] Makis 2
[144] Makis 2
[145] Makis 2
[146] Lily 2
[147] David 2

As well as performance Lara has several diverse projects on the go. She is teaching piano to a severely autistic pupil who had failed to get on with a series of previous tutors and describes how she needs to constantly try new approaches.[148] She is also creating a sound sculpture as a project for a regional National Trust property:

> I've got a bit of a wacky idea about creating a sound sculpture […] create it but you can also play it. There's a history of bottleworks in the area […] I'd love to create a piece out of bottles so that people can play it but that it's also something that you can look at and admire.[149]

The fact that she is on a community music degree course at the Vocational University is strongly influencing the direction of her creativity, focusing on the outreach potential of her musical practice. Maria too is interested in outreach. Although she does not refer explicitly to or describe high levels of creativity, she does take an extremely creative approach to the course at the Collegiate University, constructing opportunities within the academic curriculum which will enhance her future career, for example using the dissertation as an opportunity to explore the concept of outreach projects.[150] She appears to be exhibiting an oxymoron – a form of administrative creativity.

Both Anna and Bella are extremely busy leading creative projects and for them, working with other creative artists is a major driver. They work in an interdisciplinary way; in drama, opera, and music. They are both developing existing projects by taking them in different directions and creating entirely new projects themselves. Anna's creativity manifests itself in terms of working with teams, drawing out the creativity in others and she is simultaneously quite modest about her own skills although obviously a talented actress:

> What I really enjoy is working with really talented actors […]. I really love acting but I really like the whole creative process, working with people and bouncing ideas off each other.[151]

This suggests that creativity is an interactive as well as individual quality amongst these students, and is significantly affected by projects with other musicians.

---

[148] Lara 2
[149] Lara 2
[150] Maria 2
[151] Anna 2

At the time of writing, Bella is engaged in a number of diverse projects:

- Working with a team of young folk musicians who will be performing at one of the Olympic venues in London using her past experience of marching bands to train them in movement:

    > What I have been doing with them has been listening to their music […] trying to make up small movements they could do with their bodies, looking at phrases and how they can move.[152]

- Performing in theatre in Newcastle:

    > The weirdest thing I am doing is working for the Theatre Royal for their 175th birthday celebrations and I'm playing Juliette but my trombone is gonna be the voice and so the Romeo will be some acrobat unicyclist guy – I'm really interested in that.[153]

- Even playing at funerals:

    > I play at funerals sometimes, it's a celebration of the life. Normally at funerals I wear white and I'll perform percussion and send them out. It just lifts the spirit and helps them to go, helps people to feel ok on that day.[154]

Like Anna, she displays a kind of symbiotic creativity:

> A lot of the people want their voices heard so they're willing to work with me and the fact that it's music and it's creativity and it might be dancing, it's poetry and it's me tapping into their creativity.[155]

This idea of giving people a voice through creative projects sits at the centre of Bella's academic work which has a strong activist remit: 'Artists have a lot of power. We have a responsibility to try to enlighten or to try to pass on knowledge or information that's not readily available'.[156]

---

[152] Bella 3
[153] Bella 3
[154] Bella 3
[155] Bella 2
[156] Bella 2

She describes the shape of her PhD, a highly creative piece based on her own fieldwork with different tribes in the Democratic Republic of Congo:

> […] different case studies for each of them and then re-interpret their stories. The performances will be a mixture of music, of visual, prints and videotapes and all the recorded voices will be streamed through […]. It's not necessarily a musical or an opera, I don't know what you want to call it – a creative project. It will have poetry, the spoken word, it will have a few girls who are from the Congo who are dancers and I have some poets.[157]

Originally framing himself as a creative artist, Michael now directs his creativity towards creating educational projects within schools and youth groups where being able to use iTunes, set up websites and record music often represent real skills gaps for students: 'They'll get to work in groups and create music together which will eventually be produced and released'.[158]

Robert's creativity is demonstrated in the way in which he makes new conceptual connections which then lead to new creative combinations within his compositions. His engagement with the new Indian Music modules at the Civic University, taught by Indian gurus, has directly affected his composing both in terms of process – thinking about the shape of a particular piece before he starts:

> And I think that's really useful and quite necessary to kind of establish yourself as an artist with a particular style or with a particular sort of signature sound. You can't really get that unless you know what that sound is beforehand.
>
> Some of the rhythmic style is quite similar to some of the music that I like, the Western electronic stuff anyway […] everything informs everything else.[159]

His Indian Music modules have also directly contributed to content: 'I've been playing tabla or recording tabla for bits of my compositions'.[160] He constantly draws connections between different areas of creative practice and feels that studio music and the use of studios within the Civic University are somewhat disconnected both physically:

---

157 Bella 2
158 Mike 2
159 Robert 1
160 Robert 2

135

> My interest has always been in the more creative side of how you could use the studio – that's what I think, it isn't being used so much for that sort of thing, apart from by the odd Masters and PhD student.[161]

and creatively.

He had enjoyed electro-acoustic music as undergraduate but felt:

> We were taught it as a separated thing from other studio music and I feel there's a lot of scope for that being used within the stuff I already do. I think a lot of what I will be trying to do will be to find links between the two and make them work together.[162]

Robert displays a breadth of musicianship, experimenting with a wide range of instruments:

> I play bass guitar and double bass and I hoard instruments and play the bare minimum. And I do a lot of sampling very basic things that I've played myself, and then using the technology to expand on it and develop it and make it more complicated.[163]

Creativity as identity

In talking about themselves as creative individuals, some of the students reveal a developing creative identity rather than one that is fixed. Often these developments are directly connected to opportunities made available to them at their respective universities.

Lara describes a newfound creativity, particularly related to her improved technical ability in composition:

> I never considered myself as someone who would write music before I came here […]. I do think I am more of a creative person than I used to be, I can sit down and I'll start composing things in my head for something random that's happened, so sitting in the café and listening to all the people talking. I did a composition on soundscapes absorbing the natural environment and then using a piano piece to go with it.[164]

---

[161] Robert 2
[162] Robert 2
[163] Robert 1
[164] Lara 2

Both Michael and Bella feel their work has been challenged through some of the improvised music sessions at the Civic University. Bella's music was challenged as being too aesthetically pleasing and this challenge has been a catalyst for the development of her musical collaborations:

> I'm very open to learning new things. I tried out some of the free-improv stuff so I think from this experience and being around this group of people it's opened me up to expanding and elaborating in a different way cause I've always wanted to collaborate with different artists. But for me to add electronics and a scratch DJ that is just opening up my sound.[165]

Michael reflecting back on his first year, joining the Civic University after college, sees now that:

> Even the things I hated doing like a lot of the creative projects involved stuff that I never thought I would ever want to do […]. It felt like a step back but it's kind of ended up making me a lot more open to a lot more new things.[166]

> The best thing about making music is just pushing the boundaries a bit more each time. You can see where you can take things a bit differently. I know for a fact the next album I'm going to make is going to be a lot more experimental just based on what I've learnt.[167]

Although not suggesting that her creativity arises entirely from her university base, Bella acknowledges the key role her institution has played in the facilitation of her creativity: 'This place has allowed me to create a really strong voice and a presence'.[168]

> This place has really great structure, really great support. If you're motivated, if you have enthusiasm, if you're clever this place can work for you but you have to want it to create what you want […][169]

> Here you can make your dreams come true.[170]

For Jo, the way in which she deploys her creativity is intrinsically linked to her identity as a Christian. As she moved through her undergraduate course she became increasingly interested in ethnomusicology and now, as a masters student she has combined fieldwork with a specific mission; looking at Christian music in indigenous communities: 'In the Philippines it was quite a new introduction, to introduce

---

[165] Bella 2
[166] Michael 2
[167] Michael 2
[168] Bella 2
[169] Bella 2
[170] Bella 2

workshops and encourage indigenous people to write their own worship songs'.[171] She is using her own creativity for a specific mission.

Discussion

The following emerging themes from the transcripts suggest the importance of understanding music students as creative individuals when seeking to understand the music student as an entrepreneur:

- The students appear to be uniquely 'hard-wired' for creativity and therefore 'hard-wired' for entrepreneurship.
- They appear to be able to apply this creativity across a broad range of entrepreneurial activities.
- In common with traits shown when engaging with opportunities, the students' creativity appears to be underpinned by courage and willingness to take risks.
- Their creativity is a core part of their identity but this is not fixed; they can deploy creative skills across different contexts.
- Commercialisation of their creativity causes an ever-present dilemma.
- Their creative activities are facilitated by wider university environment in which they are located.

As discussed previously, the term 'creativity' within a university is often closely associated with practicality; with ideas generation and creative approaches to academic tasks, frequently discussed in relation to future employability and commercialisation. In actually talking to students about their activities what emerges is that a key aspect of their creativity is intrinsically linked to much more subjective motivations (as Pachet (2006) has identified in the study of creativity and musical interaction), including 'personal enjoyment, excitement and well-being' (p.350), echoing to some extent more psychoanalytical/ spiritual theories of creativity.

Pedagogical implications

My findings suggest the need for a specific approach to the teaching of entrepreneurship to music students, where creativity, one of the corner stones of entrepreneurship theory, appears to be an innate attribute but where facilitation and development of creativity within the extended music curriculum, specifically within professional development

---

[171] Jo 2

programmes and initiatives, appears somewhat fragmented. If we attempt to draw together the three entities of entrepreneurship, creativity and music students there are two existing paradigms which together might suggest a new model with which to address this conceptual confusion from a sociological and psychological perspective: nascent entrepreneurship and the concept of 'flow'.

The theory of nascent entrepreneurship, as outlined in Chapter 2, informs notions of the significance of the location or 'region' in which the students are operating to facilitate 'entrepreneurial thinking has not yet expressed itself in a visible way' (Johnson, Parker and Wijbenga 2006). An alternative way to frame this might be to say 'creativity that has not yet been unleashed'. If, as has been suggested, we consider a music department within a university to be both a geographically and conceptually located region it would suggest that the way in which this region is constituted will be likely to facilitate or inhibit the creativity of its students. Significantly, when the student respondents describe their own creative work they refer less to the physical structure, resources and facilities (even those studying in the stunning location of the Vocational University), more to individual relationships with members of faculty who have inspired them, visiting artists and academics, and staff available to support 'real world' project work, both assessed and extra curricular. Although the physical attributes of a university department may be highly significant in terms of recruitment, I would suggest that it is the permanent inhabitants of that 'region' that most greatly influence the creative output of its transient student body.

Csikszentmihalyi's (1990) concept of 'flow', often used informally ('going with the flow'), describes an almost trance like state within which 'the boundary between the interior psychological self and the performed activity dissolves' (Schechner, 2006, p. 97). Flow offers us a unique view on the creativity of music students as it is not only an agreed part of the creative process, it also connects directly with the experience of musical performance. If we accept Pachet's (2006, p.352) suggestion that 'we consider Flow as a prerequisite for creativity, then creativity enhancement can be achieved indirectly by augmenting the chances of creating Flow experiences'. Therefore, in order to enhance creativity and entrepreneurship within a music department there needs to be an understanding of the conditions in which flow might exist on the part of both the

deliverers and receivers[172] of the music curriculum. Whilst there is an easy connection to be seen within composition and performance, it would seem more difficult to encourage flow within, for example a music business module. However, in seeking to draw more pragmatic pedagogical conclusions when considering creativity and music students it would be easy to loose the essence of this aspect of human nature that has been so visible in my work with the student respondents, and I suggest that we need to retain an explicit acknowledgement of the more subjective elements of creativity:

> What if imagination and art are not frosting at all, but the fountainhead of human experience? What if our logic and science derive from art forms and are fundamentally dependent on them rather than art being merely a decoration for our work when science and logic have produced it? (May, 1975, p.125)

As we have seen so far, music students seek and create opportunities and behave creatively but their activities within both of these areas are neither isolated nor individualistic. A key feature is that in their creative endeavours they are working as part of a much wider community and it is the way in which they foster community that will be considered in Chapter 6.

---

[172] This concept was introduced to my students within a session on songwriting, delivered by an external speaker and feedback suggested this provided was a new and useful concept for them in reflecting on their own creative practice.

CHAPTER 6: FOSTERING COMMUNITY

'You have to be part of it'
(Bella)

Introduction

The concept of 'the collective' is important in studies of musicians, students and entrepreneurs, most notably in the three respective disciplines of ethnomusicology, pedagogy and entrepreneurship. Firstly, ethnomusicologists have been concerned historically with the post-colonial 'exotic' in terms of tribes and their musical practice in remote geographical locations (Merriam, 1964); the discipline now embraces a wide definition of practice to include 'ethnomusicology at home' (Krüger, 2009; Cottrell, 2004; Finnegan, 2007; Kingsbury, 1988). Secondly, serious pedagogical study of groups of university students tended to emerge alongside the major expansion of the university sector in the UK during the 1980s and has traditionally been closely associated with issues of transition and employability (Gibb, 1993; Saunders 2006). And thirdly, the study of entrepreneurship has always been multi-disciplinary, although there has been a distinct move away from the study of the entrepreneur as the 'heroic lone wolf' towards a consideration of more collaborative practices as the concepts of social entrepreneurship and the study of SMEs (small and medium sized enterprises) have taken centre stage (Jack, Rose, and Johnston, 2009; Steyaert and Hjorth, 2006). To be defined as a musician, an entrepreneur or a student is to have automatic membership of one of these communities; for the entrepreneurial music student membership of these three communities exists in a unique combination.

As we have seen so far music students, as is the case with all successful entrepreneurs, seek and create opportunities and behave creatively but their activities within these areas are not necessarily isolated and individualistic. We have seen how the individual characteristics of the students are an integral part of how they perform as entrepreneurs. Operating within the environment of the university they are creative opportunity seekers. As musicians, these students have indicated, through their transcripts, that they not only operate as individuals but also as part of a much wider community within and externally to the university and it is the way in which they both engage with and foster community that will be considered in Chapter 6.

The term 'community' provides us with a conceptual framework that is both clear and helpful with a general cloak of consensus around it, so I will present a brief discussion of the concept. An alternative and similarly useful term is that of the 'collective'. In this chapter I will firstly identify how these terms have been deployed across the tripartite disciplines of this thesis (ethnomusicology, education and entrepreneurship) before moving on to interrogate the themes which have emerged from the students transcripts:

- the university as a community
- the wider community of musicians
- business networks

This will be followed by a discussion of possible pedagogical implications.

Within ethnomusicology the idea of community is central. The Oxford English Dictionary defines a community as 'a group of people living in the same place or having a particular characteristic in common' (Oxford Dictionaries Online, 2011). In the case of ethnomusicological studies, it is common for both these identifiers to be present, the typical characteristic being a genre of music taking place in a specific location, a notable early example being Malinowski's studies in the Pacific in the 1920s (Merriam, 1964). Here I am considering a group of students located in the Universities of the North East of England who have an entrepreneurial disposition in common, the aim being to build on a growing body of work which uses ethnomusicology to facilitate the interrogation of inter-disciplinary issues, such as pedagogy (Krüger, 2009; Nettl, 1995; Kingsbury, 1988) and the music business (Cottrell, 2004; Coulson, 2007).

Shelemay (2011) offers us the following definition of a musical community:

> A musical community does not require the presence of conventional structural elements nor must it be anchored in a single place, although both structural and local elements may assume importance at points in the process of community formation as well as in its ongoing existence. Rather, a musical community is a social entity, an outcome of a combination of social and musical processes, rendering those who participate in making or listening to music aware of a connection among themselves. (pp. 364-365)

In recent discussions of community, particularly with reference to business and entrepreneurship, the term has been extended and adapted to include the idea of the 'collective' and 'the community of practice'. These are the terms that bridge the gap between the collaborative sense of community and community in a more commercial sense, as 'cooperative enterprise' (the Oxford Dictionary Online definition of a collective), hence they are useful terms in the study of entrepreneurial communities. Shelemay tends to use the terms 'community' and 'collective' interchangeably within the context of ethnomusicology. 'A musical community is, whatever its location in space or time, a collectivity constructed through and sustained by musical processes and/or performances' (Shelemay, 2011, pp.364-365). Pointing out that there has been little interrogation of the term 'community' by musicologists, she argues that there is danger in abandonment at this point in time, and proposes a new model for the understanding of 'community':

> In forfeiting explorations of community, music scholars may miss an opportunity to join broader conversations. Musical scholarship has moved away from explicit discussions of community at precisely the moment when the subject has come of age. (Shelemay, 2011, p. 379).

Wenger's (1998) seminal theory of 'communities of practice' and the idea of 'situated learning' taking place between groups of people with a common interest, specifically within a business context, can be used to further illuminate the ethnomusicological concept of 'community' particularly in discussions of working musicians (Bennett 2008, p.131; Green 2002, p.16).

Taking on board both Shelemay's (2011) ideas on musical communities and Wenger's work on communities of practice, my field sites can be regarded as constructed collectives, such as may occur within a workplace or a business organisation. This study reflects an approach that clearly defines the group as geographically fixed, in common with the tradition of imagined communities and community construction which was originally quite static in anthropology and ethnomusicology. However it also reflects some of the 'routes instead of roots' approaches which have increasingly emerged in anthropology in the 20th Century (Shelemay, 2011, p.359); to be a student is to be inherently transient and, as we will see in Chapter 8, any study involving the student

experience has a constant underlying theme in which students are envisaging their own futures.

Whilst university teaching and learning schemes acknowledge the importance of students working collaboratively and seek to integrate practical initiatives to facilitate this practice, such as group work exercises, I would argue that the conceptual background to such work is rarely discussed explicitly with the students themselves.

> […] the human being is a social being embedded within a social context; a being that is immersed in a network of relationships with whom reciprocal exchange is expected and anticipated to take place and that these relationships can be manipulated by all parties involved so that if and when made manifest, they can impact on the individuals involved in many different ways and with varying consequences. (Jack, Rose, and Johnston, 2009, p.4)

The discipline of music offers us a unique opportunity to encourage students to think about themselves as individual musicians within the wider community of musicians in a way which will directly contribute to their future success, particularly as freelancers and entrepreneurs. This understanding of self within the community is integral to the work of all musicians, indeed many examples of collaborative social practice have, in the past, been drawn from ethnomusicology and anthropology.

Chapters 4 and 5 focussed on the individual characteristics of the student subjects as entrepreneurs and whilst acknowledging the different sites in which they operate, I did not adopt a directly comparative approach. In this chapter, the theme naturally suggests a more comparative approach between the communities of the Vocational, Civic and Collegiate universities. The physical location, the buildings, the history, the university structures both formal and informal and the cultural capital associated with each of the sites all appear to have a direct influence upon the way in which community is fostered and in turn how the fostering of community directly influences the entrepreneurial activities of these communities of music students. The importance of community in entrepreneurship is an overarching theme from the student transcripts and the concept provides an interdisciplinary lens with which to view the particular pedagogical missing link that is the music student as entrepreneur. What is emerging from the student data is that, evidenced by research in the field of business and commerce, the fostering of communities of practice rather than the overt construction of communities is a powerful

tool in encouraging entrepreneurial activity among university music students. Moving between the local and the global, this chapter considers the way in which the student subjects are influenced by their university, the wider community of musicians and other social and business networks before going on to consider the pedagogical implications of fostering community within a university music department.

The Vocational University

University community

The Vocational University located within a major music venue and well-known public landmark, has a significant effect on its small number of higher education students. Being taught in an architecturally stunning location seems to engender a feeling of privilege amongst the students whilst the constant contact with visiting international and regional artists offers students wide opportunities in terms of networking and working with role models. There is a strong 'real world' focus to all aspects of course delivery. Situated on the less fashionable South side of the river in a Northern conurbation, the Vocational University has a complicated identity. The music students are not studying at the university's main city site some ten miles away but in what is effectively an outpost. This is an exaggerated geographical example of the myriad of franchises, collaborations and accreditation arrangements that typify higher education in the United Kingdom in the 21st century.

The Vocational University is housed within a shimmering glass building, designed by Norman Foster[173], dominating the Quayside like a stranded ocean liner. Its design is both loved and hated by local people but most will acknowledge the status and international recognition it has brought to the region. Public traffic is actively encouraged through the building; in fact a city trail goes straight through it. Entering the building from East or West during the day you will find yourself on a wide elevated concourse with cityscapes on all sides. There is a gentle hum of activity within the building, from the cafe in particular, which forms a hub not only for the public but also for meetings, where senior directors and well-known musicians are frequently seen. A stairway leads down from the main concourse to the lower ground floor where the

---

[173]Internationally famous architects http://www.fosterandpartners.com/projects/

education centre is located. Here, within the many practice and meeting rooms, which are used for all of the venues' outreach music activities, can be found the university students of this study. Their entire degree programme is delivered at this venue and although they can theoretically access all the usual university support services; accommodation, health and well-being, careers and enterprise, library – this is all located at the distant host university. 'I feel like I'm more part of [the music venue] than I am […University] because of the way it's structured'[174] says Lara. The effect is that the students base themselves almost entirely within this building and have no sense of regret about estrangement from a wider university community: 'it's not that important to us'.[175] They embrace the difference and privilege associated with their unusual location which is neither conservatory or university but seems to bring with it a particular kind of prestige: 'I think were so lucky to be here' says Mack 'it's properly me'.[176]

The students here have a very different arrangement from the Collegiate and Civic universities in terms of accommodation, living in private student houses or halls in the city, usually amongst groups of students from the other two city universities. Mack lives in such accommodation:

> I would say the disadvantage of being here is you don't mix in with all the tons of people you would at a uni, but that's music, music is sort of separate, outcast from other degrees, but you deal with it.[177]

Here Mack is identifying the otherness of music students within a large institution, seeing the situation at the Vocational University as a natural reflection of a community of musicians. The students here continuously highlight both the advantages and disadvantages of being a part of this very small university community. They generally feel that it is an advantage to be part of a small course group, specifically in the way that this fosters a close relationship with tutors, who seem to be a close part of the student community and know individual students really well.[178] A sense of privilege exists, as it does in all three institutions but here at the Vocational University this privilege is associated with feeling known and mentored by staff and students.

---

[174] Lara 1
[175] David 2
[176] Mack 1
[177] Mack 1
[178] David 2

For Lily, being in the small community of the Vocational University, where she is virtually the only international student, has been good; she has not become part of an international student community in the way she would have been likely to do in a larger university and she sees this as an entirely positive situation in that it has allowed her to integrate with the 'home' and often local students.[179] Whilst international students at the Civic University have strong links to their own ethnic communities and may use these connections as a basis for their entrepreneurial activities, Lily's entrepreneurship is driven by economic and social necessity rather than existing networks.

At the start of my fieldwork the courses at the Vocational University were very new and some of the respondents were from the first cohort of students. During the period of my research some considerable effort has been made by tutors to foster more activity and socialisation across these small year groups[180] and course groups, pragmatically through the creation of a degree choir[181] and a cross-course big band[182]. Now, Lily feels 'if you do [course] you get to know four other years except from your own'[183]; 'we just see each other more. At the other college I hardly ever saw anyone from the other years'[184]; although both Lily and Lara feel that the courses at the Vocational University still operate very separately 'there's definitely a segregation'.[185]

Lara describes how initially, arriving at the Vocational University having failed to get in to her first choice of the large Civic University, the small size of her course group was a surprise. She sees both advantages and disadvantages to studying within such a small community of music students:

> It has worked really well in some respects but not so well in other respects because with it being a close-knit group, we're really good friends with one another. We can talk reflectively about a lot of things quite easily but, in terms of work, when someone lets you down, it's more obvious because there is only a certain amount of people. I think there's a bigger trust issue with smaller numbers of people. I think that some people maybe don't latch on to that as well. If they're not necessarily a reliable person, it's harder when they're not reliable

---

[179] Lily 2
[180] At the start of the study there were less than 50 students in total.
[181] Lily 2
[182] David 1
[183] Lily 2
[184] Lily 1
[185] Lara 1

and when they don't turn up. So, it's got its pros and cons. All in all, I do think it's better being a small cohort because, I think, you learn more by doing.[186]

What she is describing here is more closely aligned with a description of a work-based team, a community of practice rather than a typical student course group. These elements of teamwork can be artificially constructed in a group, through assessed work activities such as the setting up of an event. This concept of trust is interesting in its association with modes of music business practice where reputation, particularly for performers, is so significant: 'It is unusual, albeit not entirely unheard of, for musicians to book somebody they do not know, or who has not been recommended by someone whose judgement they trust' (Cottrell, 2004).

Dan discusses how, being part of a small course group, he has needed to get on with other students through constructed group work situations:

> That is quite an entrepreneurial skill, to get on with people that you don't necessarily like and to be able to communicate with other people and I think there is quite a big link between the music industry in that way. Because, if you want a gig you're going to have to get on with the people you're trying to talk to even if you don't like them, just because it is such a small community. Everyone just meets each other in the end.[187]

Whilst some of the students like Lily have only ever been part of the course in its current location, others such as David, are in a position to make comparisons with the course's original location within a large local further education college. He describes how he finds being part of this smaller student community to be a positive experience socially and professionally. In his final year there are now only ten students left on his particular course cohort but 'the three years are quite close'.[188]

Community of musicians

In entrepreneurial education, role models are highly prized and frequently used. The Vocational University carries with it a priceless attribute in that it is part of a major music venue through which there is the constant traffic of international artists. These professional musicians will often provide workshops or motivational talks for the students. The students are well aware of the value of being part of this community of

---

[186] Lara I
[187] Dan 1
[188] David 2

148

visiting artists. Lily describes an on-going integration of role models into the programme creating a transient community of course deliverers:[189] 'I've met loads of other musicians which is really important'.[190] Lily and Mack talk in a slightly star struck way, mainly in terms of learning by sitting at the feet of these visiting gurus ('We met Sting'[191]). Lara conceptualises the complex way in which potential opportunities are created by virtue of being a part of this conservatory style university community:

> You're not just surrounded by students; you're surrounded by professionals all the time. We get given the option to meet these people and they will give us a background in how they work. We are placed on placements and projects, we are leading things. So, it's like we're right in there. A lot of it's about networking and obviously, when we finish, the hope is that we will get some kind of employment out of it whether we're employed as project musicians or whether we actually start up our own projects. It's a lot about getting to know people and getting your foot in the door, so to speak. I think that only works because we're in this type of building. I think it's very much vocational so you try to do what you can to get your name around so people know who you are.[192]

Although the students have access to this global network of visiting musicians, for most of them it is 'the band' that forms the hub of their own musical community and, as previous studies of young musicians have shown (Green, 2002, p.78), this has been so since they were at school. David, Mack and Lara, all popular musicians from the Vocational University, exhibit multiple band membership; Dan emphasises the importance of this to him: 'I don't think there is quite a feeling like getting together with a bunch of friends, just playing in a band'.[193]

Business networks

As natural entrepreneurs, opportunities are often created, presented initially through the music communities of practice inhabited by the subjects of this study. It is difficult to clearly delineate the division between social and business activities but it is clearly the case that social interaction is not just a side product, an added extra in the life of the musician, it is inextricably linked to their ability to fund their lives as musicians (Cottrell, 2004; Coulson, 2007). It seems the ability to move between a number of different bands, sometimes as in the case of David[194] across different genres, can

---

[189] Lily 2
[190] Lily 2
[191] Mack 1
[192] Lara 1
[193] Dan 1
[194] David 2

contribute directly to the students' success as entrepreneurs. The potential to set up multiple music networks is greatly influenced by the geographical location. There are a number of local students studying at the Vocational University who, like David, were already integrated into the thriving city music scene prior to joining the course. Lily also sees this large city in the North East as a rich music community, in stark contrast to her home in rural Germany: 'Here if you wanted to you could have a gig every week'.[195]

Lara sees the opportunity to develop a global business community through being based in a major international music venue. She embraces the opportunity to make new contacts and create networks through collaborative music making, recently with a visiting group of Japanese musicians and through participating in a Gamelan workshop.[196] 'Little moments like that and people that you meet, I really don't think I would have done that if I was based on campus at one university, I do think this building has something unique about it'.[197] She keeps in touch with a worldwide network of musicians through Facebook[198] but in a very proactive way; intending to visit contacts in South East Asia in the future.

The community of music students at the Vocational University appears to facilitate entrepreneurship by virtue of its location in a large music venue where students are immersed in public music events. As would be the case in a conservatory, they also benefit greatly from role models both on the staff team and visiting artists and do have some direct input from teaching staff on business practices for portfolio musicians. They do not access any of the wider university support systems and societies; most significantly none of the students accessed any form of business guidance or support for entrepreneurial activity.

---

[195] Lily2
[196] Lara 2
[197] Lara 2
[198] Lara 2

The Collegiate University

The Collegiate University promotes itself on the basis of the history and culture of the medieval city in which it resides. The college system creates two different spaces for its music students, some activities clearly located within the music department itself whilst college based activities, open to students across disciplines are also significant in the students' lives.[199] The music department sits at the geographical centre of the university, on the cathedral green. This is a well-known tourist venue so at any time there will be members of the public mingling with students in the adjacent cafes and restaurants. The very old buildings are closed with smartcard entry but contain state of the art music studios and a fine concert room. Teaching accommodation and rooms for staff are quite basic and traditional.

University community

For music students at the Collegiate University there are three distinct communities of practice; the music department, the college and the university. This structure encourages the existence of a wide network of musicians across the university: 'most people who study music know most other people who study music'.[200] With an approximate annual intake of 55 students, the department is of a size that appears to be large enough to generate a thriving community in terms of music activities:

There are so many things going on […] there is a really good network.[201]

Whilst at the same time being small enough to encourage socialisation across years and course groups:

> Because Music is a small department, I know everybody in my year.[202]

> As a year group we all ended up getting on very well, as I think every year group does in the music department. We all gelled really well and we had weekly socials somehow, you know with 60 of us. So that was great. And yeah, you do get to know each other.[203]

This also affects the students' relationship with the lecturers:

---

[199] For example the Music Society
[200] Jo 1
[201] Jo. 1
[202] Maria 2
[203] Jo 1

> Because it's small, they know you as well. You're not an anonymous marking code to them, you're a person. That's a really, really important thing about the department.[204]

Two aspects are significant. Firstly, the Collegiate University music department clearly identifies itself as a tight-knit community. The university itself, although one of the top UK institutions, is relatively small, and the music department is located on the defensive 'peninsular' in its medieval city:

> [the Collegiate University] does operate in its own little bubble, and because it is so small anyway you're always going to know people. If I was in a different university, London or something, I think that would be quite different.[205]

Secondly, the department exhibits the inherent community nature of music, many of the student musicians are classical players of a high standard and the orchestra brings a large proportion of the community together.

Maria identifies some of the unique features of being a music student:

> Everybody in the university does lots of extra curricular things, most of them aren't related to the subject, whereas in music that's a particular anomaly, which is a big reason why the department is close knit, because you spend your academic time and your extra-curricular time with the same people.[206]

Unlike the Civic and Vocational universities, the students at the Collegiate University highlight how they are part of a much wider network of musicians across the university.[207] As with other activities such as sport, there are college-level and then the more prestigious university-level activities related to music and drama. Anna feels that the colleges allow space to develop in a more relaxed way as opposed to the university wide initiatives where 'some of the groups can become almost semi-professional and it takes over your life and is not that enjoyable any more'[208] whereas, according to Maria, 'at college its never ever like that, its always good fun and a good stepping stone'.[209] In describing this 'stepping stone', Maria reveals the path many students take through this hierarchy of music communities from college level activity to university level:

---

[204] Maria 2
[205] Anna 3
[206] Maria 2
[207] Jo 2
[208] Anna 2
[209] Maria 2

> In a lot of ways the university wide things are probably better CV experience because they reach a bigger number of people or are more serious in some ways, or a higher calibre of activity.[210]

Music students will tend to apply to particular colleges which have high levels of music activity. Anna chose her college on the basis of music and art related projects that were happening there, which gives instant access to a community of practice: 'you're in sort of the music community within your college'.[211] The fact that colleges attract particular students according to interests appears to facilitate the transition for first years from school to university:[212] 'the thing I love about it is that when you arrive in the first year you've got a ready-made community and a ready-made group of friends'.[213] Jo also describes how curriculum choice and society membership have dictated how her networks have evolved: 'It really depends what society you are involved in'.[214]

In describing how she has always been involved in cultural activity outside the department, particularly drama and opera,[215] Anna presents a picture of the university as a microcosm of the wider community of professional musicians:

> You do build up a network and its really good […] by the third opera I was doing I couldn't find a rehearsal pianist but I had five names I could think of and coming to do twelfth night they were like 'do you know a producer' like yes I know four brilliant girls who could do this job and that's something you learn on the way, you get to know all these people, especially musicians they really have a big network of people. They will have the network of people on the project and then networks with people back home.'[216]

Community of musicians

Within this extended community of musicians at the Collegiate University, encompassing the geographic locations of department, college and wider university there exist many communities of practice – that is groups of students united in pursuit of a specific music activity. Jo, Anna and Maria offer examples of this.

---

[210] Maria 2
[211] Anna: I
[212] Anna 2
[213] Maria 2
[214] Jo 2
[215] Anna 2
[216] Anna 2

A lover of drama and literature as well as opera, Anna has embraced the interdisciplinary opportunities provided through the strong opera scene at the Collegiate University. Floundering a little at first she builds up her experience and confidence until, on finishing her masters degree, she decides to aim for a career as an opera director:

> By the second opera I felt like I was within the community of musicians. The first time I did it I hadn't got a clue and was starting to get an idea of who people are and who to ask and so by the fourth production. I was right, who to go through to costumes, how to do this, who to ask for this. […] I'm only starting to know the community in Wales, the opera scene.[217]

The concept of a music community is important to Anna in her ventures although she acknowledges 'I think it will take me a while to find my own community'[218]. In a state of transition when she has left university, she draws on the experience of her gradual development of university networks as she begins to immerse herself in the wider community of musicians.

Given the historical and ecclesiastical roots of the city in which the Collegiate University resides, singing is extremely important. More inclusive in terms of enabling participation, singing gives rise to numerous communities of practice.

> There's a lot of singing that goes on in […], with every chapel, every college has a chapel choir and there are loads of choirs. And I'm not actually a singer but I found that you can't help but be involved in the politics if you're in some sort of political position yourself, and a lot of those people are people I have a lot of contact with as friends. You always know what's going on generally. It's always very busy.[219]

Jo has used her music in engaging with the local church community:[220] 'I have been able to network with local people and feel a part of local [Collegiate University city] as well as student [city]'.[221]

---

[217] Anna 3
[218] Anna 3
[219] Jo 1
[220] Jo 2
[221] Jo 2

Business networks

Although the students in this study do not represent the extremely privileged backgrounds often stereotypically applied to the Collegiate University, they do appear to bring with them more of what Pierre Bourdieu (Robbins, 2000) describes as cultural capital than the students from the Vocational University, particularly in terms of their family backgrounds and existing links to the music industry. They are enterprising in the way in which they make use of this advantage to construct networks, which in turn facilitate the development of their own social capital. Anna, however does identify a difference in wealth, or economic capital, between different colleges which she feels is subsequently directly reflected in the success of some drama productions.[222]

John, whose parents are both professional musicians, shows high-level networking skills and describes how he was engaged in networking at an early age in school, setting up ensembles: 'I knew all the musos at school and who were the ones who would be interested and who were the ones who were good'.[223] Joining university after a 'gap year' teaching and performing, John has found that his established connections with an external community of musicians has impinged upon his ability to join university initiatives:

> People find it quite hard to understand […] then I say I can't come on the university tour because I've got this freelance gig that I've committed to. People say 'you're at university your're supposed to be doing university things' but at the same time if I'm seen to have said 'yes' to a concert and then say I can't do it, giving back-word is a really bad thing to do because then you'll get known as someone who says yes to things – and you just won't get asked back.[224]

He describes an increasing engagement with professional work, helped recently by a 'fixer' setting up orchestras for specific events.[225]

John views the concept of networking in quite a subtle sense. Far from the constructed networking sessions set up within universities and the business community which will often be associated with helping small business and entrepreneurs, John points to a particular kind of understated networking within the music community where you are

---

[222] Anna 1
[223] John 3
[224] John 3
[225] John 3

155

directly judged as you are in the very act of performance. John is keenly aware of the omnipresent professional community where, whenever he is playing, there 'could be someone in the audience'.[226]

Jo has links with missionary organisations through her parents, combining missionary work with ethnomusicology and basing her thesis on fieldwork in the Philippines and India.[227] She describes the global network she has experienced growing up, she talks about moving house frequently during school years, resulting in extended networks for herself and her family: 'My parents used to be missionaries […] I was born when they were missionaries'[228]. At the start of this study, whilst she is still an undergraduate, Jo goes to the Philippines with same mission organisation her parents were working for when she was born (in Japan),[229] she is part of a wide Baptist network.[230] Taking an increasingly professional position as an ethnomusicologist as she moves onto a masters programme, Jo describes the process of her integration into communities in North India, both the college and the wider local community:[231]

> I had to learn just by observation. My approach was just to try and forget myself
> as much as possible and just really learn through observation what to wear, what
> to do, what to say, what to do when people come round to your house for tea.[232]

Within theories of nascent entrepreneurship, the significant factors in cultural capital, as associated with entrepreneurial skills, are access to education and work experience and it is these features which appear to be underpinning the strong entrepreneurial characteristics of these students. They come from families with music routes, who value education and show strong tendencies to follow similar routes to their parents. Anna, talking about experiences prior to university describes a significant event when through her mother, who is music teacher, she is approached to compose a musical with a film composer as part of a large music festival.[233]

---

[226] John 3
[227] Jo 2
[228] Jo 2
[229] Jo 2
[230] Jo 3
[231] Jo 3
[232] Jo 3
[233] Anna 1

Anna's opportunities at university and now in the early stages of her career are intrinsically linked to her wide network of friends. There is a real symbiosis in Anna's pattern of work; she often refers to helping friends with their own projects, recording for them, writing music for them. Speaking of one friend who she is helping: 'he's down in London at the moment and he's working for the BBC [yeah], so I was like keep my links [laughs…] I want to keep all my links'.[234] This is not just a cynical approach to networking but demonstrates how Anna values the community of musicians of which she is a part and shows her awareness of the importance of building networks now that she has left university:

> It's really funny, people have always said this, you just need to start meeting people because at the end of the day all people want is reliable people who they'll get on with, it doesn't matter how creative you can be because you could just not be able to work with these people. I've been able to make a few contacts from that, I met [...] and he's the artistic director of mid-Wales opera.[235]

Having just finished her masters degree Anna throws herself into a range of voluntary activities back at home whilst applying for jobs. Having been offered an interview with a London Youth Opera she reflects on existing links which might help her to be successful:

> I already have an inkling that one of the persons on the interview panel went to […] he did his degree and then went to be a singer, I don't know if he set it up or is just part of the group. I also know a guy who was in the first opera I directed, he was in their operas last year – so that could be a potential link. I just don't really know the London opera scene too well at the moment.[236]

Maria operates within a community that includes ex-students who she met whilst in the first year. They are an important part of her present network:[237]

> Networking is really important and that's something you can only really do for yourself whatever official advice and official mentoring processes are in place within the university, knowing the right people at the right point, outside of uni.[238]

---

[234] Anna 1
[235] Anna 3
[236] Anna 3
[237] Maria 3
[238] Maria 3

By interview three, Maria is actively fostering new communities through a developing interest in community musics connected to her dissertation research and projects from university.

> I've started taking part in a community project where a group of students go to a local community centre a couple of miles away and just do a performing arts group each week just to enable disadvantaged kids who don't really have any access to music and drama and stuff. Just to take part in something like that […] that's been such an eye opening experience seeing the huge difference it makes to just have an hour or so of that each week, its amazing to see that.[239]

Students at the Collegiate University demonstrate a very particular kind of entrepreneurship which is heavily rooted in their family backgrounds and associated cultural capital. The concept of networking is central to all of the students. They arrive with considerable existing ability both academic and social; these existing skills are then supported and developed by the university system itself both through collegiate and university wide structures for extra-curricular engagement.

The Civic University

The Civic University has a reputation for an extremely diverse curriculum and a student body drawn from a range of access opportunities as well as traditional entry routes of which the department is proud. Sitting at the heart of its large northern city its civic credentials are of utmost importance to the Vice Chancellor. Unlike the gentler, traditional setting of the Collegiate University, the Civic University is located in 'the best partying student city'.[240] Students making the choice to come here are attracted by not only the university but the thriving city life that goes with it – not least the music scene which boasts some famous alumni;[241] 'its good that they're trying to not be closed off to the rest of the city and the rest of the different music scenes that are here'.[242]

---

[239] Maria 3
[240] The Civic University regularly scores highly for city entertainment in the annual Times Good University Guide.
[241] For example Sting, Brian Ferry, Lindisfarne, Kathryn Tickell, Mark Knopfler.
[242] Robert 2

University community

The Civic University music department is at least twice the size of the Collegiate University and of course much larger than the newly established music base of the Vocational University, but with its typical intake of approximately 100 students it is a still a community where students and staff are able to get to know each other.

Bella, who has studied in a range of institutions across the globe feels that there is something quite special about this particular music department saying that she has 'never been a part of something so […] magical'[243] in terms of a supportive community of staff and students: 'Here the students just help each other'.[244] She describes the support as 'subtle', which suggests that there is less in the way of structured societies and groups but there is something about the way in which students interact and set up their own communities of practice that contributes to a supportive entrepreneurial whole. She does though acknowledge the necessity for personal efficacy; an extremely proactive student herself with a strong internal locus of control (Rotter, 1966 cited in Chell, Haworth and Brearley, 1991 p. 39-42) she is aware that not all students will find it easy to engage in a loosely structured menu of opportunity: 'you have to be a part of it'.[245]

Robert highlights the diversity of students on the course:

> I had assumed it would be mostly classical musicians on the course. I think it's good for everyone to have the variety there, so you don't just get lost in your own world [yeah] and you're a bit more aware of what other musicians are doing because they're just around you all the time.[246]

This richness in terms of the university student community appears to provide a successful breeding ground for entrepreneurial activity on the part of the students. A rolling series of student initiatives has been set up, often involving cross-genre and course collaborations, for example a now firmly established summer music festival.

---

[243] Bella 2:17.06
[244] Bella 2:42.28
[245] Bella 2:19.27
[246] Rob 1, p5:126

Community of musicians

In addition to the classical and jazz scenes evident at the Collegiate site, the city in which the Civic University resides has a broad music scene with which the student respondents engage: 'The difference between [...] and other places is that it is a very particular size, it's big enough for lots of different things to be going on but not so big that they're all separate'.[247] Quite aside from the music scene Bella talks about the nature of people on the street in the city: 'helpful, friendly, with a real sense of community[248].

Like John at the Collegiate University and David at the Vocational University, Robert, as a local student, operates within a large network of local musicians but this pre-existing community affects his full integration into university-based initiatives:

> I felt a bit like I didn't make enough effort to really get in on, like there is a strong community, probably based around the Music Society, and I was just, kind of, on the fringes of all that because... I think partly because I live in [Civic University city] already.[249]

In common with the student respondents at the Vocational University, what emerges significantly amongst the students of the Civic University is the social importance of band membership. Robert engages in multiple band membership, which for him works well, informing and expanding his musical development as well as his networks: '[city] is a small place and the longer you live here the more the groups all interconnect'.[250] He does however point out how some musicians like their band members to stick with them and may worry about cross-dilution of songs, performance and individual identity.[251] Robert sees the band as a collaborative community:

> Those bands, quite unusually I suppose, were very, very communal. So, someone might come along with a basic idea of a song, or a suggestion of a song to play, but everyone was responsible for their own role. I've never really been in many bands where it's led by one person and you're playing one person's songs. I'd much prefer the more collaborative thing where everyone's got their own input and the overall, the outcome tends to be more of an organic, yeah, a group result, anyway.[252]

---

[247] Robert 2
[248] Bella 2
[249] Robert 1
[250] Robert 2
[251] Robert 2
[252] Robert I

Talking about his reggae band, Robert describes another collaborative model: 'It was driven by one person but the actual music was collaborative'.[253] He is currently working in a collective of 10 producers and DJs, where he is the only musician from the university:[254] 'We do a lot of remixes of each other's songs and a lot of people pair off and make music together'.[255]

Business networks

The student respondents at the Civic University show high levels of engagement in the professional management of their music enterprises alongside their academic study. These enterprises have many different drivers but are generally underpinned by a need to perform and a need to make a difference, artistically or socially and although not so specifically expressed, the need to make some money.

Robert seeks to engage in a wide range of genres but has a close eye on how one activity may facilitate and fund another. As an entrepreneurial musician his ultimate aim is to be able to support himself though his music activities. He has not yet achieved this and earns casual money through working in a restaurant. He has deliberately opted for part-time study to enable him to maintain both university and external activities; he operates in two different communities. Describing the forthcoming tour of his band, he describes how the national tour has been set up through existing connections in London, Birmingham, Wales. The band by this point is on a real professional footing.[256]

For Makis, his business connections are essential for him to be able to survive financially as an international student in the North East of England and he had set up business links before arriving:

> My friend Michaelis, who I met in Greece, he played for a year in […]. He knew the boss and I met him when I came for holidays and he said, 'Look, Michaelis is playing the bouzouki, when you come here to study, you can come and perform.' He knew that I was performing in Greece for three years because he asked me. So, it was a deal before I came here.[257]

---

[253] Robert I
[254] Robert 2
[255] Robert 2
[256] Robert 2
[257] Makis 1

Makis responds to as many offers of work as possible to keep within the city network: 'We would take any opportunity to perform, even without money. Then, more people would come back to us to ask us if we wanted to play at a party'.[258] But like Rob he has also extended his business networks with 'good contacts in Cardiff, London, Newcastle, Manchester and Leeds'.[259]

Bella clearly expresses her activities as her business but everything she does is underpinned by clear socio-political objectives. She sees her band's goal 'to community build through music, bring various communities together through music'[260] and to create 'safe spaces' where people are 'comfortable enough to participate with our music, to dance, to talk and to meet other people from various walks'.[261]She has started to set up monthly double bills with other ensembles, bringing together the international community that lives in Newcastle;[262] connecting different genres for example setting up a collaboration with a folk musician, which has the advantage of bringing together two different music communities and expanding the audience.[263] Her other activities have included setting up kids camps in the USA:

In the Summer I go up to lake […]. This Summer there were 40 kids and there was this amazing drum and dance show – that's my speciality really, just to get kids performing.[264]

and recently working with a well known local folk musician on a Cultural Olympiad project. Bella sees these multiple networks as the key to how she operates as a musician: 'it's about who you know'.[265] Importantly, she feels the department has enabled this network development: 'I'm a networker and the department has enabled that';[266] 'networks are crucial, crucial, crucial'.[267]

---

[258] Makis I
[259] Makis 1
[260] Bella 2
[261] Bella 2
[262] Bella 2
[263] Bella 2
[264] Bella 3
[265] Bella 2
[266] Bella 2
[267] Bella 2

Michael describes a particular community of practice amongst musicians involving the sharing of practical skills or 'favours for favours' and the importance of exchange: 'I used to have this weird idea that you had to have so much money to do stuff, but really you can do it very budget and get the same results'.[268]

> I: It's a community where you've all got different skills, is it?
>
> IV: Yeah. That's exactly what it is. And I think you have to find people in the same position as you. For instance, the guy that produced my album's actually a hip hop rap artist and I'm actually on one of his records […] we worked on a song together. And in doing that, it opened up this brand new way of thinking where, because at the moment, my business is a band, the Mike Gatto music thing, the whole concept as an artist, that's what I was trying to say.[269]

The size and diversity of the Civic University is reflected in the different communities of practice, some with creative drivers, some centred on social activity and some clearly economic. The communities of the Civic University are characterised by an external focus, often linking closely with existing city networks.

Discussion

Analysis of the transcripts, following one of the strongly suggested themes of 'community', has led to the following findings on music departments as communities, the wider community of musicians inhabited by the student respondents, and the students professional and business networks:

- These music students are members of multiple communities of practice within which 'the band' or 'ensemble' is highly significant.
- Their ability to engage in entrepreneurial behaviour is directly related to membership of these groups.
- Networking has a very specific meaning in the context of university music students; closely connected with collaboration and exchange rather than marketing and promotion.
- The physical location and operational structures of the students' universities directly affect the richness of the entrepreneurial environment, all sites are relatively small and close knit.
- The relationship between the students' social/artistic and business practice is complex and the communities in which they operate reflect strong value systems.

---

[268] Michael 1
[269] Michael 1

- High levels of business ethics are exhibited by the students– trust, exchange, obligation, debt.
- Generic central support tends not to be accessed unless endorsed by music staff.
- Cultural, economic and social capital are significant in dictating access to and participation in different communities.

Pedagogical implications

These findings suggest that communities of music students both mirror and connect with the wider community of professional musicians. Academic staff also tend to be members of multiple communities through their external performance, composition and research activity.[270] This idea of 'local' and 'wider' communities echoes Ruth Finnegan's (2007) ethnographic account of musicians in Milton Keynes where she found 'Musical worlds […] were bound into complex relationships with a series of institutions and patterns outside the city' (p.184). Finnegan describes a kind of two way osmotic process between the inside/outside of Milton Keynes:

> It would be misleading to envisage musical worlds and musical activities as fully contained within Milton Keynes itself […] no town in Britain is *only* local, isolated from the wider region, country or civilisation of which it forms part. (Finnegan, 2007, p.183)

In the same way, the student respondents describe their own crossing between the inside/outside of the university and the region. As a result, all the university music departments of my study have thriving connections with the wider music business, regularly bringing in visiting musicians to perform, lecture and run workshops with the students. This is established pedagogical practice within university music departments and conservatories. However, whilst this pedagogical model seems to have been successfully implemented within the core music curriculum there appears to be scope to extend this practice into professional development aspects of music programmes; specifically to encourage enterprise and entrepreneurship. Might it be possible to enhance the existing practice of offering role models of individuals to students in a teaching context, and to find a way to demonstrate more clearly the effective working of music communities as a whole, possibly using a new case study approach, using communities of musicians as examples – using ethnomusicology to teach entrepreneurship? Taking on board some aspects of Wenger's work on Communities of

---

[270] This has gained greater significance in recent years as all academic staff need to demonstrate the wider 'impact' of their work as part of the Research Excellence Framework (REF).

Practice, there are opportunities to enhance existing models of 'real world ' learning and adopt a model of constructivism and situativism rather than a cognitive approach (Cox, 2005, p.529). Wenger's idea of the apprentice links with the idea of the music guru and fits with the learning style that both entrepreneurs and musicians have in common, a preference for learning by doing.

In order to enable entrepreneurial activity within university music departments the idea of entrepreneurship needs to be valued by all members of the community. Evidence suggests that individuals are more likely to start a business if entrepreneurship is valued by the society in which they operate (Gnyawali and Fogel, 1994). Evidence from my research suggests a close and fruitful relationship between staff and students, suggesting that, if enterprise opportunities are endorsed by staff, students are likely to respond to them. One factor inhibiting such endorsement appears to be either lack of knowledge or deliberate disconnection from this part of the music curriculum on the part of the staff themselves. Staff commitment is also important in counteracting the problems of a community of music students as a transient community, guiding and mentoring new students and providing stepping stones though different university communities and networks such as alumni.

The way in which the student respondents network appears to be highly sophisticated and different from a more traditional business model of networking, with its association with self-promotion, typically within a drinks reception at a 'networking event'. Within music communities, being a musician offers an immediate point of contact from which to discuss issues of collaboration and exchange rather than networking with the purpose of selling services or generating funding in a direct sense. Although the students did not discuss online communities in depth, a large part of their networking also takes place via social networking sites.

There is a tendency for the public conception of the entrepreneur to be that of the heroic lone wolf, someone engaged in intensely individualistic behaviour where collaborative and community input may be less to do with altruism and rather more concerned with the networking opportunities it may facilitate. Whilst there are strong elements of 'professional sociability' (Dobson, 2011, p.248), that is the need to be popular and sociable as directly related to getting work, what emerges from the student transcripts is

a different picture of the importance of community than that traditionally offered within a business context. Music is inherently collaborative and if we are to enhance the entrepreneurial skills of our students we need to be able to transpose the essence of this community activity from an artistic to a business context, for to foster community is to foster entrepreneurship.

CHAPTER 7: PERFORMING IDENTITIES

You're depressed, you're happy, you're sad, you know, it's the worst experience but then the best, and once it's over you can look at it and it's, like, 'Okay, I did it.' (Bella)

Introduction

It is an October night and I am attending a concert in the main hall of the large music venue that is the home of the Vocational University. The headline act is a famous female UK singer songwriter and the hall is sold out. There are two supporting singer/ songwriter acts. First on is a young man representing talent from the region who intersperses his set with references to his new CD, Facebook site, up-coming performances and jokes about his needs as a musician to eat and buy new jeans. The second support act is an established UK folk musician (the tour's main supporting act) who cynically refers to the need to mention his latest CD to please his agent. Finally the famous headline act starts with a justifiably cool assumption of knowledge about her products; particularly the launch of her most recent album. This is the place where entrepreneurship and performance meet in public and display an uneasy relationship. We have already seen how performance both underpins and defines the lives of the music students in this study. This chapter presents case studies of three of the students and considers how their lives as performers intersect with their lives as entrepreneurs.

Frequently analysed from a psychological perspective, the performance of music is universally accepted to represent one of the most complex human achievements in terms of the use of cognitive and motor skills which 'at its highest level demands a remarkable combination of physical and mental skills' (Clarke 2002, p. 59); although as Palmer (1997) points out these skills are not necessarily unique to music performance. I would argue, as a non-musician working among musicians, that there is a certain kind of respect afforded to the musician that is drawn from the knowledge that the ability to sing or play an instrument to a high standard represents years of engagement with the project, a 'massive investment of time and effort'[271] (Clarke 2002, p. 59). 'Speaking, typing, and performing music are among the most complex forms of skilled serial action produced by human beings' (Palmer, 1997. p. 117).

---

[271] The idea of 10,000 hour rule put forward by Anders Ericsson (based on his research with virtuoso violinists) although contested, is now widely referred to in popular self-help and management training texts. (See for example *10,000 hours: you become what you practice* by Phillis Lane).

Defining performance and performativity

The concept of performing has a brief that extends beyond that of the skilled musician on stage. We are all subject to personal scrutiny in our daily performance as human beings and frequently to be deemed as not performing is to be deemed to fail. There are expectations on us to perform in fields both personal and professional, whilst at the same time we may also be judged on the performance of our prized technological possessions; computers, cars; mobile devices. The 2012 Olympics focused the whole British nation on performance in the most positive sporting sense whilst in recent years, governments and nation states find themselves judged and held to account on the performance of their financial markets. The two most common uses of the term performance can relate either to the arts or business. Within the arts it is broadly defined as 'an act of presenting a play, concert, or other form of entertainment' (OED online, 2011); some form of public display of art, which has a temporal nature, as opposed to a more traditional, static art exhibition. In the pre and post digital age these boundaries have become increasingly blurred, for example in the case of video installations and performance artists.

> There is no historically or culturally fixable limit to what is or is not "performance". Along the continuum new genres are added, others are dropped. The underlying notion is that any action that is framed, presented, highlighted or displayed is a performance (Schechner, 2006, p.1).

Within music the term remains fairly clear: the musicians are making music and this music is being watched by others, the audience, or even in community/participatory music situations where participants are simultaneously performer and audience. In a business context it appertains to 'a task or operation seen in terms of how successfully it is performed' (OED online, 2011); strongly linked to achievement and status it is also sometimes allied to notions of masculinity and sexual performance; the 'winner-take-all-market' (Frank, 2011).

In common with Schechner (2006, p.31), I would suggest that these two meanings of performance (arts and business) are not usually analysed in conjunction with each other, but for a study based on arts and entrepreneurship I would argue that the juxtaposition of these two definitions can offer us a useful construct to analyse what is, for music students, the Janus face of performance; for in the very act of performing they are being

judged (assessed) on performance. 'Anything and everything can be studied "as" performance' (Schechner, 2006 p.1); there are clear links between the acts of musical performance and entrepreneurship. Whilst defining pure 'performance' is relatively unproblematic, if we apply the term to a field such as entrepreneurship it is helpful to employ an additional layer of complexity and consider the 'as', in this case 'entrepreneurship *as* performance'.

Performativity is associated with the way in which we choose to present ourselves to the world and the way in which we construct our own identity. Notions of 'the performative' originate in early 20th Century philosophy and have subsequently featured in the seminal work of Jacques Derrida on speech and Judith Butler on sexuality (Leitch, 2010). We are all living in an increasingly performative world where we have the power and entitlement to create our own 15 minutes of fame – or considerably more: 'people are increasingly finding the world not a book to be read but a performance to participate in' (Schechner, 2006, p.26). Students exhibit these 'multiple literacies' (Schechner, 2006, p.4) through the use of social media sites, and in doing so they might mirror the 18th century charlatan; moving beyond mere social communication and starting to perform academic, artistic and even entrepreneurial acts. As academics we acknowledge the seductive nature of these communication tools in the pedagogical structures we employ and encourage, for example reflective blogs.

The idea of the performative as the actual utterance, a declaration about an intended act, a 'leading incident in the performance of the act' (Austin, 1962 in Shechchner, 2006, p.124) can be helpful in considering two common features of entrepreneurship; the business pitch and its associated idea of the business 'angel' or mentor and the music patron:

> Since Jill's talent is attributed to her by Jack, the validity of her talent is contingent upon Jack's musical esteem' ….subsequently 'When Jack says that Jill is very talented, his own esteem becomes tied in part to her social acceptance as a musical performer (Kingsbury,1988, p.75)

There is an expectation that we will all comply with this demand for performativity. This has direct implications for my fieldwork, performance as an aspect of the ethnographic process itself, a meeting of subject and scholar within which the subject is given complete freedom to present themselves in a particular way. Both student and

scholar are in turn performing, interpreting, re-playing, and reconstructing. This implies a level of dishonesty, but is merely the reality of all the choices we make as individuals in presenting ourselves.

Entrepreneurship as Performance

As outlined at the outset in this thesis, there have been limited studies on musicians as entrepreneurs other than in a biographical or music industry context yet, in looking at key theories of entrepreneurship (see Chapter 2), there appear to be striking, yet hitherto, unacknowledged synergies between the act of entrepreneurship and the act of musical performance, although this is not to suggest that entrepreneurship is a natural extension of the musician's skills. Rather, music students appear to possess some transferable skills which may facilitate entrepreneurship.

 The distinct epistemologies of both entrepreneurship and performance cross three clear paradigms: psychological, economic, social/environmental. Psychological approaches to both the study of performance and the study of entrepreneurship point to observable behaviours in the performer and the entrepreneur. Two key factors pertaining to the act of performance and entrepreneurship are the presence of creative 'flow' and 'courage'; the ability to take creative risks. Elements of the creative process at work in both entrepreneurial endeavours and performances embrace the concept of 'flow' (Csikszentmihalyi, 1999) as mentioned in previous chapters; it is certainly the case that both entrepreneurial and performance related activity is motivated in some part by the pure joy of doing it:

> Flow – the state in which people are so involved in an activity that nothing else seems to matter; the experience itself is so enjoyable that people will do it at great cost, for the sheer sake of doing it (Schechner, 2006, p.97).

This 'sheer sake of doing it' can work against a clear strategy for music student entrepreneurs. The joy of the performance activity is for them the prime motivator, not necessarily the audience. This self absorption with the 'performance that is product' is an exaggerated version of entrepreneurship; the experience of 'flow' meaning there is a need to repeat it. The 'cost' is closely connected to the particular kind of risk inherent

in performance. In common with entrepreneurs, performers have to deal with risk but risk is likely to be very personal when tied to performance rather than a product (Brown, 2004). In a psychological, behavioural sense 'an entrepreneur is what an entrepreneur does' (Gibb, 2000); correspondingly 'a performer is what a performer does'.

There is a striking link between the key economic theory of 'creative destruction' (Shumpeter, 1934) and Schechner's idea of 'new combinations'. In economic terms, Shumpeter describes the most radical form of entrepreneurship that, in a Darwinian sense, creates as it destroys but is ultimately based on innovations which have gone before (Westhead, Wright and McElwee, 2011, p.35; Casson, 2003). This idea, transposed to an artistic context, resonates with Schechner's description of performance where:

> Even the "latest," "original," "shocking", or "avant-guard" is mostly a new combination of known behaviours or the displacement of a behaviour from a known to an unexpected context or occasion (Schechner, 2006 p.35).

All musical performances, from the classical concert to the rock cover band, seek to present some form of new combination and in doing so can displace what has gone before.

There are particular similarities between environmental circumstances likely to lead to an individual becoming a successful performing musician, or a successful entrepreneur. Davidson identifies five critically important environmental factors contributing to the successful career of Louis Armstrong:

1. Casual but frequent exposure to musical stimuli.
2. Ample opportunities over an extended period of time for freely exploring the jazz medium and for developing performance presentation skills.
3. An early opportunity to experience intense positive emotional or aesthetic states in response to music.
4. An opportunity to amass large numbers of hours of practice.
5. A number of externally motivating factors such as a key adult

(Davidson 2002, p.91).

These factors also contain elements associated with entrepreneurship, specifically environmental factors related to nascent entrepreneurship. It appears that in terms of

motivation, external social reinforcers are extremely important to performing musicians, as are mentors to entrepreneurs.

Social isolation, working alone, is common to both lone musician practising and the 'lone wolf' entrepreneur. At the same time, the ability to work in a team is also essential to both performer and entrepreneur. For music students, teamwork frequently takes the form of ensemble performance for which Elaine Goodman identifies four significant factors (Rink, 2006, p.165) which might also apply to a business context:

- Coordination
- Communication
- Role of the individual
- Social factors

The pitch as performance

I have five minutes to convince a panel of the viability of my business idea. Waiting in the hotel corridor with other pitchers the atmosphere is tense but strangely supportive. The business ideas are so different, the element of competition seems to have dissipated, although in reality we are all competing for the same award. The large swing doors leading into the conference room open and I am invited through. I am led to the front where there is a lectern and my pre-prepared presentation is on the screen. A row of six judges sit before me and behind them, invited members of the business community. I begin:

> My name is Dawn Weatherston, I am a Development Manager from […] University where I run a £5m HEFCE funded music project. I am here to tell you about ICMuS Sounds, a low cost market entry internet platform for student and academic musicians.
>
> As one of the country's most successful university music departments we already have products and genuinely believe that we have a model to create a commercial outlet for students and staff that does not currently exist within the regional universities or in other universities across the UK. I will now outline the key features of ICMuS Sounds using the '5 ps' of marketing: people; products; potential; projections and progress.
>
> Music at […] university crosses five genres giving an exciting and wide ranging product base; we have the only folk degree in the country staffed by professional musicians and regularly producing successful new talent such as […] who won BBC Radio Scotland Young Traditional Musician of the year last year . We have

[…] the internationally famous jazz musician on the staff. Several of our rock bands […] are enjoying some success. We also have a strong record in classical composition and some of our students have recently performed new work at [major regional music venue]. We have a famous Bolivian composer on the staff who has a specialist new music following world wide.

Our first product comes from the world music genre with one CD complete (you have a free copy in your pack) and the second in production. These first two CDs have been recorded by two internationally renowned Indian classical musicians and the first consignment has just been taken out to India by university alumni for distribution.

The core business of ICMuS sounds will be downloads, CDs and educational material including compositions, supported by web advertising and consultancy (to be offered to other universities). Based on its track record […] music department is to be further expanded with a brand new music building currently under construction due open in next year. ICMuS Sounds is part of this expansion. It will be a social enterprise, led by a small management team but also making use of student expertise, providing opportunities for work placements and professional development to prepare them for entry into the music business. Profits will be used to grow the business and support regional and national music initiatives.

This current business plan is only one way forward. Taking one of our income streams, downloads, as an illustration we need to achieve […] to break even. With the other supporting income streams this will be achievable.

ICMuS Sounds as already moved a long way since the start of the business planning competition. In addition to regional partners identified, we already have considerable interest in the business and the key support of a new visiting professor […] ex CEO of EMI.

Thank you, I am now happy to take questions.

This pitch was made by me five years ago at the regional final of the Blueprint[272] annual business planning competition for students and academic staff from the universities of the North East, just prior to the formal commencement of my doctoral studies. The first round was within the university, promoted as an opportunity for academics to pitch business ideas and my decision to enter was based purely on a perceived need for personal professional development. Although already established as a lecturer in music and business enterprise I had no direct experience of pitching and decided to take a risk. I entered the internal first round at my own university with no expectations and won. At this point I found myself a contender in the regional finals with a business mentor who worked with me over the next few weeks to formally develop a business plan and the above pitch – which was unsuccessful.

---

[272] http://www.blueprintcompetition.co.uk/blueprint-2013

Most entrepreneurs will at some point need to seek funding or other forms of support for their business projects. This is likely to involve the preparation of written bids and proposals but they may also be required to pitch to a panel of potential investors at some point. Like a solo or ensemble performance, the lone or business team pitch has a clear presentational format in the way that say a classical concert might; a code of practice (Nettl, 1995, p. 92). Instead of the audience and musician there is the entrepreneur and customer. Proposers are expected to summarise and sell their business idea in a few minutes (10/15) or sometimes, in an 'elevator pitch' in an even shorter period of time (the time it would take to explain the idea to a fellow traveller in an elevator).

> Although musical performance is an extremely public experience, the preparation for a performance usually takes place privately, and often in complete isolation. Most performances are one-off events, rarely lasting more than a couple of hours at most, but they are cultivated during days, weeks or even years of intense work (Reid, p.102, in Rink, 2006).

Some performances are easy to judge in sports (results), business (company reports) but this is not necessarily the case in the subjective assessment of a 'performance' and a business pitch. Often potential investors or judges show irrational choice and instinct in their support of what they see as a potentially creative business idea, although it may be less financially sound.

Students and performance

Within a university, I would argue that there are few subject areas where students need such a high level of existing skills at the start of their course. To be a music student is to be a performer. With a few exceptions, students on university degree courses will have been motivated in their choice of degree course to be involved in performance in some way, even though they may never intend to become a professional performing musician. For most students, live performance sits at the core of their university experience, often motivating and inspiring them but equally causing them considerable anguish within the assessment process.[273] There is also a hierarchy in terms of music activity, performance having high status, with teaching often the reserve career (Bennett, 2008, p.90).

---

[273] This is such central issue that my music colleagues at the Civic University asked me to run a series of focus groups with students, following which a series of joint seminars for students and staff took place to discuss the assessment process. Issues related to performance assessment were also raised by the student respondents in their interviews with me.

So far we have seen how students, in common with the template for all successful entrepreneurs, are highly creative opportunity seekers but that they are distinctly different in the way in which they view collaboration (see Chapter 6). This, as we will see in greater detail in this chapter, appears to have its roots in the inherently collaborative nature of music making – most specifically the performance. It appears through analysis of the transcripts that the prime motivator for entrepreneurial activity is the putting on of a performance, even when the project may be presented as having a broader remit, such as fundraising. Experience shows that the easiest way to engage students with an entrepreneurial project is to present this as a performance opportunity. Assessed modules related to entrepreneurship often tend to take this approach.

In this chapter, using the overarching idea of 'entrepreneurship as performance' I will present three case studies of students, one from each of my field sites, for whom performance is prioritised above other aspects of being a music student. I am not in a position of judging the students as performers, rather identifying the way in which their relationship with performance shapes them as individuals and entrepreneurs. I am responding to statements they are making about being performers. I have chosen one student from each institution to represent three different genres of music. All three embrace an entrepreneurial way of life in a different style: activist; traditionalist; pragmatist.

Bella: The Activist

'I'm a performer and I really wanna help to change lives'

Bella has arrived at her current destination via a circuitous international route; she loves the North East of England, has established her band regionally and nationally and intends to remain in the UK for the next few years until her doctoral studies are complete. Her whole life, including her doctoral studies, is focussed around composition and performance with a purpose.

Typically, Bella's engagement with music began early on. She started playing seriously at the age of nine, showing a precocious confidence in her early choice of instrument: 'I started with the trombone. My mom thought it was gonna be […] too big for me,

175

because I was quite short and so I was like 'I wanna play the trombones.'' [274] At school she is firmly positioned as a musician and the strength of her engagement with the music community facilitates and underpins her university entrance to the state university in Virginia where she joins a Black marching band.[275] She describes the different identities of black and white marching bands: 'I'd say it's very White and Black in the States, so it's not a racist thing, it's just really about race a little bit, it's just different styles'.[276] The band she says, gave her a strong sense of belonging 'like a fraternity or sorority'.[277]

Bella's description of these early years in higher education illustrates the development of a 'work hard/play hard culture' that signifies the personalities of both musicians and entrepreneurs. She starts to develop a pattern of work in which extra curricular activity is at least equal to core academic studies in terms of her university life. Membership of the band demands high levels of commitment; it is 'intense […]especially in the summer, you know, you're just out there for, maybe, like 12 hours a day'.[278] There are high levels of competition involved, at football matches and between different bands away from football matches: 'It's a very intense regime'.[279] She describes the stresses of touring and performance; the high physical demand; the need to be sportsmanlike. She fails an important audition at one point:

> And after the audition they said, 'Well, you didn't make it, you're not strong enough to hold up, you know, the harness and it's 12 hours a day, like and they compete, they just compete, it's just intense. Every single day and you tour the whole summer, you sleep on buses, it's crazy.[280]

As she talks Bella appears to thrive on these extremes of experience and the stress of performance:

You're depressed, you're happy, you're sad, you know, it's like the worst experience but then the best, and it's like, once it's over you can look at and it's, like, 'Okay, I did it.'[281]

---

[274] Bella 1
[275]http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=V0B2SPgN9jg&list=PL8FA3BFD52147B927&index=15&feature
[276] Bella 1
[277] Bella 1
[278] Bella 1
[279] Bella 1
[280] Bella 1
[281] Bella 1

It is interesting to see how this student who shows huge amounts of originality and creativity comes from an early music background that is very prescribed and disciplined: 'With a lot of black marching bands […], it's like you're marching, you try to lift your knees up to a 90 degree angle every step and everybody marches like that'.[282] It is this disciplined, hardworking approach that forms the bedrock for her future approach to entrepreneurial initiatives. This band experience dominated her early experience of university; there is little mention of her academic study: 'so I did that for three years and we travelled all over the South and flew to California and, you know, just travelling and competing, and the band was pretty good.'[283]

There is a significant change when Bella moves to a prestigious music college in New York where she finds a dramatic leap in the standard of musicians she is working with. There is a strict hierarchy amongst the performance musicians and this directly affects the inclusivity of opportunity: 'the problem with that [is] they'll have all these grad students who are just, like stellar. So that means that the orchestra, the first jazz band, are gonna be dominated by these musicians.'[284] Drawing on her strong work ethic and sense of autonomy she states her ambition: 'I would rather be the worst amongst the best than the best amongst the worst.'[285]

> I had this crazy sense of practicing. So, like for all my music I would practice for, like three to six hours a day, you know, different things and I never had a teacher, so I always taught myself. I didn't have a teacher until I came to college.[286]

Significant in her development at this point are two performance mentors her: trombone tutor and a professor. This relationship mirrors that of the mentor in entrepreneurship training relationships. Through contact with this particular professor she joins a Salsa band:

> My career started to take shape in the salsa band […]and from that experience then I made a little sect and I started my own ensemble but still through the salsa band. And there's like a big Latino community at […] University and because [prof] was doing salsa band, and one of the Vice Presidents for […] University was Latino, Puerto Rican, we were part of this court. And so you're just allowed certain privileges and, not privileges, but you're in the right connections to do

---

[282] Bella 1
[283] Bella 1
[284] Bella 1
[285] Bella 1
[286] Bella 1

different things. So because I was in salsa band, they would do cool things like, say, 'Okay from this Latino centre we're gonna run a course for this time and this time and then we're gonna go to the Dominican Republic or Puerto Rico for the spring break and it's gonna be about learning,' and [prof] was the professor on it […] it was just like a family thing.[287]

This represents a 'significant event'[288] that connects with Bella's particularly eclectic performing identity and helps to shape her future direction as a musician entrepreneur. She is very open to new performance opportunities and happy to move out of her comfort zone. Because of this she is continuously engaging with and creating new networks. Her core motivation for performance is as an activist, seeking to further social good across a number of fields: womens's rights, equality, poverty. It is the drive to set up performance initiatives related to this agenda that brings out the entrepreneur in her: 'I'm a performer and I really wanna help to change lives'.[289] Aside from this core motivation these activities continue to allow her to perform. She describes how she makes a deliberate attempt to extend her repertoire to include more styles, African based, Caribbean based, to appeal to a wide range of students but later discusses an arising dilemma: 'I started to teach more than I was performing and more than I was learning, and I was, like, 'This is not the best situation.'[290] This is a key dilemma for the creative entrepreneur – the love of the product itself and its relationship with the need for its commodification.

By the time of my final interview with Bella in 2012, she has established herself as a brand. Although she does not employ this particular terminology herself, she does not object to my framing her work in this business context. She has transported her original idea for a band […], developed whilst she was in New York, to South Africa and then the North East of England. The band is now on a professional footing. She talks of thinking big now that she has established the UK brand and wants to take the performance 'to a new level now'[291]. The band has a national tour planned with gigs in Birmingham, London and Wales 'all through connections that I've had'[292]. As part of this professional transition she makes a strategic decision to slightly disconnect from the

---

[287] Bella 1
[288] Findings from the ICMuS Transitions pilot project indicated how participation in one-off events or experiences can inform a student's future direction as a musician, for example contact with Indian classical musicians.
[289] Bella 1
[290] Bella 1
[291] Bella 3
[292] Bella 3

image of a 'student band' seeing that in developing the product 'staying out of the student circuit may be helpful'[293]. To facilitate this she is experimenting with new regional venues to reach different audiences; choosing to launch the band's new CD with a performance at the Town Hall[294]. However, Bella's main ambition is not ultimately to achieve massive commercial success; she positions herself quite differently: 'It's about self-worth and self-value and I'm acquiring that as I move into my shoes, my adulthood'.[295]

> I used to feel I wasn't good enough because I couldn't play all these notes but I just have something different […] a lot of my friends are 'performing with Beyonce', got nominated for grammies, you know. They're performing but none of them are doing what I do in terms of trying to community build through music and networking from the grass roots levels.[296]

This focus on performance related to community building is what drives Bella's entrepreneurial activity across a diverse range of activities. She performs at funerals: 'I'll wear white and I'll perform',[297] an area of ritual music in which it is rare for students to engage (see Cottrell, 2004 p.150 on musicians and funeral ritual). Other recent projects also include working for the Cultural Olympics and a project at the Theatre Royal: 'I'm playing Juliette but my trombone is going to be the voice and so I have never done that – high-level acting'.[298]

Bella also intends to further exploit political networks in driving forward her activist agenda:

> My big brother [name] he's huge he plays he doesn't even have has his own band now, like he's all over. When you are really high profile the government and organisations will seek you out and try to pin themselves to you in order to bring themselves up. I'm seeking them out to so we can kinda come up together […] I'm saying I'm here and I want to help you.[299]

Bella blurs the division between performer and audience seeing participation as key: 'my speciality is to get people performing'[300] and it is this that drives her entrepreneurial initiatives.

---

[293] Bella 3
[294] Bella 3
[295] Bella 3
[296] Bella 3
[297] Bella 3
[298] Bella 3
[299] Bella 3
[300] Bella 3

John: The Traditionalist

I just want to be able to get up and think right, I'm going to work today, I'm going to play Beethoven's 5th

Immersed in a performing family, John describes his Father as 'a clarinettist but primarily a conductor';[301] his mother is a peripatetic teacher with the local music service. He acknowledges the strong influence of his early family musical background and describes a certain diffidence towards music when he was younger: 'I didn't particularly immediately love it or become brilliant or anything like that, it's just one of those things that you plod along with'.[302] His real enthusiasm for music started when, on the suggestion of his mother, he switched from violin and piano to viola.

What is significant from John's first interview with me, in his first year at university, is the clear career trajectory that he is on. He is aiming at being a performer of the classical and new music repertoire. He appears to exhibit talent having received offers from both universities and music college:

> I thought it would be more useful to do university first, and I still want to do this, and go and specialise in performance as a sort of post grad, maybe at a music college after I've finished up here, with a view to hopefully professional orchestral playing – that is what I want to do for the first stage of my career.[303]

When still in year one, he expresses his long-term plans in a way that demonstrates a clear sense of direction, a strategic approach to the course as performance preparation:

The course is structured so that by the end of third year, I can do a double weighted recital. So a third of my final year will be based on my recital and supporting work and then I'll just do four other modules as well, which I think will set me up really well for auditions.[304]

At the same time he engages with a huge amount of extracurricular activity, the focus always on performance, and becomes involved in as many initiatives as he can. He is aware of the importance of developing high-level skills as a soloist and the accompanying solo versus team dilemma:

> Even though I want to be an orchestral musician and I'm trying to get in as many orchestras and stuff as possible, the solo playing is what is going to get you a job in an orchestra. Auditions, getting into college and getting a job just depends so

---

[301] John 1
[302] John 1
[303] John 1
[304] John 1

much on your solo playing so I'm trying not to let that fall behind, my orchestral ambitions.[305]

John is well informed about the nature of performance as a career and the need to launch into this career whilst still young: 'judging by some people who I've spoken to, it can be a very tiresome, stressful profession'.[306] He is driven primarily by his love of performing:

> I love playing in orchestras, I look forward to going to orchestra and just being part of that collective, artistic whole where you are basically getting the chance to play. For a job, I just can't think of anything that's better than playing some of the best music that is around with some of the best musicians that are around. Then the money, wanting to be a musician, I don't think anyone can really hope to be rich or anything, that doesn't interest me at all. I just want to be able to get up and think right, I'm going to work today, I'm going to play Beethoven's 5th or something like that and you're getting paid for it. You don't get paid very much but that's not really why I would be doing it all, I just want to be able to have access to that music at the highest level.[307]

The life John envisages for himself is traditional, that of the freelance orchestral musician. This in itself does not make him an entrepreneur but the behaviour he needs to engage in in order to be successful requires a high level of entrepreneurial skills; therefore if we take Gibb's (2000) behavioural approach and accept that 'an entrepreneur is what an entrepreneur does' music students actively positioning themselves for a traditional classical performing career, in the way that John is, can arguably, be defined as an entrepreneurs. John displays high-level skills in self-marketing and promotion, networking, and understanding of the music business and identifying niche markets. He exhibits a sophisticated awareness of appropriate self-promotion activities in the field of classical music where a web site or Facebook play second fiddle to the promotion inherent in the standard of your last gig. 'I think of myself as quite old fashioned, I don't really want to have a website, I know that […] a fixer isn't going to go on the internet and search for players…].[308]

> You're always promoting yourself when you do one of these gigs, just by your playing, and not looking scruffy and conforming to the stereotype of a student I suppose and acting in a mature and appropriate way – it's a work engagement

---

[305] John 1
[306] John 1
[307] John 1
[308] John 3

and not 'taking the […]'. For example, the humour that goes on in a university orchestra, you don't crack jokes – you have to be really careful.'[309]

This idea of 'promoting yourself anywhere you play'[310] works almost as an on-going business pitch where: 'you never know who's in the audience'[311], containing the same element of random luck any entrepreneur may be faced with in terms of an investor who could be watching. Such a potential investor or patron may see bad behaviour or a brilliant performance and subsequently know and recommend you to other contacts, or correspondingly advise them against working with you: 'It goes by your name and reputation really. That's what the business is':[312]

> If you present yourself well; try and show yourself off to the best of your abilities you're bound to get opportunities. Maybe it's just more noticeable with music because it's a practical thing, someone sees you doing it and doing it well they recommend you rather than reading an office report you've done and thinking its really good.[313]

One example of the way in which John's desire for performance opportunities motivates entrepreneurial behaviour is through his positioning himself in a niche market as a niche product. Whereas some students seek 'the novel' to attract business, John spots shortage areas through his more unusual choice of instrument: 'being a viola player you tend to be asked to do everything anyway'.[314] It is generally accepted within musicology that the choice of instrument is significant in terms of performance identity (Wych, 2013) and closely related to issues of gender. In John we see the way in which early choices of an instrument by a musician directly affect potential opportunities; for a performing musician their instrument is both product and market. John extends this niche market concept to maximise his performance opportunity within Higher Education:

> If you're a good focussed performer in an institution like this you're going to actually end up better off. Say if you were a really good flautist here you'd probably get asked to do all of the opera and concerts here whereas if you were a very good flautist in a year or very good flautists at The Royal Northern or something, obviously you are going to be playing 12th piccolo in the Rite of Spring instead of first [...]. You can actually get better opportunities if you are at a university.[315]

---

[309] John 3
[310] John 3
[311] John 3
[312] John 3
[313] John 2
[314] John 2
[315] John 2

In common with students from Science or Engineering, who may become heavily involved in developing a product whilst still at university, John discusses the dilemma of a being a freelance musician, as well as an undergraduate, even to the extent of feeling the fear of turning work down. He has been playing Principal Viola with the Scottish Youth Orchestra 'a good thing for my CV and a fantastic experience'[316] and works at the major concert venue in the region (home of the Vocational University) where he is involved in Young Sinfonia as half-student, half-teacher; he has participated in number of group projects, also educational projects. His activities already mirror that of a professional musician:

> I've got in with a fixer in Lincolnshire near where I live. I've had quite a few jobs through him now, £130 for a concert which is pretty much as you're going to get at this level[317]

He clearly shows his life as almost equally divided activities, professional music making and university, and does allude to certain inconsistencies in the level of regard afforded to him within and outside the university; he received high enough grades to be accepted on to the performance specialism, but was disappointed with his mark. He identifies a certain level of disconnection from the university:

> I'm doing hardly any performance activity within the university, I'm doing so much stuff that's outside […] every weekend from the last weekend in October to the last weekend in January I've got a concert or performance of some sort.[318]

> It does sometimes feel, when there's a lot of work to be done, a lot of concerts and stuff […] you struggle to keep your head above water […]. The thing that I'm missing out on is the university music, I'm doing the university chamber orchestra but I haven't been able to play in the opera or the musical and I can't next term either; there's only so many weeks in a term. […]. I was chatting to my Dad about this because he was getting quite worried I'd got too much on my plate.[319]

He is in the process of developing himself as a viable freelance musician, a business, and although he is not driven by money he is driven by the desire to be able to live a reasonable life supported by income from performance. As we will see in Chapter 7, John is already thinking long term and realises that he is entering a period of time whilst he is still young when he will be at the peak of his performance abilities. His identity is

---

[316] John 3
[317] John 3
[318] John 3
[319] John 3

completely tied up in the idea of himself as performer and, in order to achieve and maintain this identity, he needs to behave entrepreneurially.

David: The Pragmatist

Brought up in North East of England, David is a self-taught guitar player. Having had a difficult time at school in terms of finding music teachers, almost all his pre-university music experience was set up through his own initiative. On joining the Vocational University his musicianship entered a sharp trajectory; supported and encouraged by excellent lecturers and music tutors and being one of a very small cohort of students, he worked hard to catch up on music theory, his sight-reading developed rapidly and he discovered a love of critical and cultural theory – something he had never come across before. Now as he approaches graduation, he plays in several rock bands, teaches guitar and intends to embark on a full-time career as a freelance musician.

David began engaging with music at primary school but identifies a disconnection with his original choice of instrument in terms of his own emerging identity:

> I started playing flute when I was about nine or ten and I got up to twelve when I decided that flute was not a fun instrument anymore. I was not practising it. I did one concert with the school orchestra and then I decided I wanted a guitar because it was cool, I suppose.[320]

As he expresses his love of performing he also acknowledges the relative potential for early performance opportunities; 'there is probably more demand for flute players than there is for guitarists but I don't regret it because it has come this far and it is something I enjoy so much.'[321] David's emergence as a performer begins in adolescence at school when his membership of bands, as with many young men at this stage is part of his social transition into adulthood (Green, 2002):

> My first performance opportunities were through school. Up until I was about sixteen it really was not a big driving force until I went to college and it became my primary goal.[322]

He exhibits the standard behaviour for a lot of aspiring rock musicians: 'It was just four friends playing classic rock covers.' The fact that they could choose to do whatever they

---

[320] David 1
[321] David 1
[322] David 1

184

liked, free from the restriction of assessment helped: 'It brought us on quite a lot, opened us up to, not a great amount of different styles of music, but yeah.'[323] His band helped him to gain confidence and develop ideas, being creative but using existing tried and tested 'products'. This freedom also allows for the entrepreneur's need for autonomy or NAUT in Rotter's terms (Chell, Haworth and Brearley, 1991, p.39) on two fronts: musicianship and business awareness. As with many rock musicians David was initially self-taught and then went on to set up his own ensembles. Taking responsibility in a rock band at a young age appears to be very different from orchestral experience at a young age, 'I took on the lead guitarist role in that, it was quite a big responsibility, when you are 15, to have to learn to do all these big solos in rock songs.'[324] His early years were at a Catholic school where the potential for his rock band to 'speak' to the students was identified: 'It was a Catholic – we got drafted in to do all the masses and things although, at one point, we did have a fall out with the Chaplain but we won't go into that.'[325]

David describes a significant event, evidence of the way in which within music, as other students have discussed, it is often your performance that speaks for you:

> The first one was supporting a big Pink Floyd tribute band. We used to practise in a Working Men's Club in Stanley and they were rehearsing in the hall and they heard us downstairs. It was surreal because a man, he was from Doncaster, came downstairs and he filmed us and he took the film back upstairs to the band and they said, 'We want them to play at our first show.' It wasn't very big but when you are fifteen and you walk into room and there are about three to four hundred people in a room .[IV And he just heard you?] Yeah, he just came down and filmed it, I think I've still got the video somewhere because he sent us the DVD of the performance.[326]

Although by the time he starts at college he is performing regularly and developing a clear identity as a rock musician, up until this point he has not clearly committed to being a musician: 'I wasn't very serious about being a musician until, probably, I started the BTEC. There was a particular tutor who opened my eyes as to the possibilities.'[327] This encouragement and endorsement by a 'significant other' appears to mark a turning point in terms of David's relationship with music, and belief in himself as a future

---

[323] David 1
[324] David 1
[325] David 1
[326] David 1
[327] David 1

freelance musician. He also mentions two other performance role models; both being tutors with different styles but operating at high professional level.[328]

Unlike many of the other students who he finds himself alongside on the college course, he develops high levels of commitment and a strong work ethic, which he sees as key to being a successful performer:

> They would just turn up and at the end of the week get the EMA[329]. They would only turn up to what they needed to turn up to. If you have a band of five musicians and only three of them turn up, you are immediately dropped in it and your life becomes so much more difficult. It does start to put you off things but then I found a few people who were really interested in nailing it down and getting the work done and I formed a couple of bands.

In researching degree courses David takes a clear vocational approach, describing how when he was trying to choose he was observing performers in the region, particularly jazz players. Watching and learning from them he discovered that many of their curriculum vitae showed that they were alumni from his chosen degree course.[330] For David, performance was the most important focus when applying for courses. He was actively worried by other institutions that did not invite him for audition: 'if I wanted to be a performing musician I wanted to know why they didn't want to see me perform beforehand'.[331] The location of the Vocational University within a large regional music venue means there is big public performance opportunity, more so than at the other universities: 'The performance opportunities are being given. You are doing your assessment performances in Hall […] and in the […] Foundation Hall, it is quite a big deal'.[332]

David clearly identifies performance as his main source of entrepreneurial activity and associated future income:

> At the moment I'm doing performance, I'm going to continue that next year. Hopefully, that will lead from now, over the summer, starting to get some function bands together and find agencies to try and get work so that, at the end of year three, rather having to go and work in Tesco, to have music as a main source of income and start teaching at the same time, that's another source of

---

[328] David 2
[329] Educational Maintenance Allowance
[330] David1
[331] David1
[332] David1

income. Starting to develop now what I need in place for this time next year when I will be finished.[333]

But at the same time he is aware of difficulties, and the need for a unique product:

> I know that it is going to be very difficult because there's such a huge amount of competition and obviously there are a huge amount of established players from this course, and not from this course, already in the region and it's just a case of development of as broader style of music as possible. One of the bands I'm talking about is a jazz quartet. Rather than sticking to the standards we have decided we want to do more modern stuff so that when people come and say, 'We want this' we can do a broad style and you can pick and choose what you like rather than saying, 'We only do standards or we only do modern stuff.[334]

He sees the importance of maintaining a profile, 'as soon as you're off the scene, it is very hard to get back on'[335] and understands the importance of visibility, being part of people's contact lists:

> I think it is hard. It is establishing yourself. Once you have become established and you have filled up a big enough contact base. That is another thing, if you have not got the contacts then you are not going to get the work. You need people to be able to think, I'll look at the contact book and I need a guitarist or saxophonist and he's good or he's the best and I want him. So, it is just establishing yourself which is the difficult part. You can't do that without getting out there and playing.[336]

As David approaches his final year the strong performance focus on his course is self-evident:

> You have got to do a 20 minute performance in December and then a recital in May time. So, that is another thing for the summer. Start organising, transcribing and arranging all your music so that when you come back in September you can get your band together and obviously spend the next three months then rehearsing for that. Then, when that's over start rehearsing for your recital. It is just deciding what sort of music you are going to do. In some respects you have to do what you want to do but you have to play towards what the tutors are going to appreciate.[337]

Alongside this, in his last interview with me in January before he graduates, he is performing, or planning to work with, four different bands: he is auditioning for a jazz function band; performing a guitar quartet with people from the course: 'there's nothing really of that format anywhere in the North East'[338] (Gypsy, jazz, swing); playing with a

---

[333] David 1
[334] David 1
[335] David 1
[336] David 1
[337] David 1
[338] David 2

pop function band and running his original rock band. His approach to performance is very business focussed. Clearly he wants to perform as much as possible, and his motivation for entrepreneurial behaviour is performance opportunity:[339] 'I'm trying to keep things open and not pigeon hole myself'.[340] For David, the conservatory style of course at the Vocational University directly facilitates entrepreneurship.

Discussion

Bella, John and David present with three distinctly different performing identities although all have a pure love of performance. For Bella this is balanced equally with her desire to use performance to create change and perform social good and to achieve this. She blurs the boundaries between performer and audience in her performance projects. She assumes the identity of an activist and her work is mainly in her own band. John's identity is firmly fixed as a freelance classical professional musician; he clearly understands the music business world he intends to inhabit and the skills he will need to be successful. Whereas Bella's identity becomes reinforced by feedback from the groups she seeks to help, and political battles won, John's identity receives affirmation from more senior players and managers within the classical music industry and this approval is more important to him than the academic approval on his course. Although working in a completely different genre to John, David also plans for a career as a freelance musician but whilst he spends some of his time working in existing ensembles, he also sets up his own bands which allow him freedom to play and perform what he wants to. His identity is that of pragmatic, working rock musician.

Although these three students assume very different performing identities there are striking commonalities in their histories, behaviours and attitudes, mirroring Davidson's (2002, p.91) critical environmental factors, which in turn have encouraged their entrepreneurial tendencies:

- Performing from an early age.
- Changing from their first instrument and taking up an instrument that fits their identity and offers more performance opportunity.
- Work hard/ play hard ethic.
- Blurring of boundaries between their academic and performing lives.

---

[339] David 2
[340] David 2

- Keen awareness of competition.
- Important mentors; lecturers, parents.
- Significant events; (joining salsa band, being spotted by the Pink Floyd tribute band).
- Performance not seen as 'x factor' route to money and fame, although all see performance to be a major source of income in the future.
- Sophisticated approach to self-promotion.
- Mainstream work is supported by additional (funerals, cover bands).

Of overriding significance is that for all these students entrepreneurial activity is inextricably tied to the desire for self-fulfilment through performance. The themes emerging from the hermeneutic research process employed in this thesis, related to acts of entrepreneurship by all of the student respondents, reveal a striking similarity to Schechner's seven functions of performance (2006, p. 46): to entertain; to create beauty; to make or change identity; to foster community; to heal; to teach or persuade; to deal with the divine and the demonic. These three case studies suggest hitherto unacknowledged synergies between the identity of the music student entrepreneur and the identity of the music student performer; an understanding of which can be used to directly inform pedagogical approaches to the teaching of enterprise and business skills to university music students.

Pedagogical implications

If we are to accept, as my findings suggest, that there is a symbiosis between entrepreneurship and performance, we could then argue that performance can be an entrepreneurial act as much as entrepreneurship can be a creative performance. This can be a helpful construct in considering how we might integrate professional development into existing programmes for music students. As is the case with the other attributes already identified in this thesis, as performers and developers of performances student musicians have specific innate qualities – such as a mental advantage held by musicians in terms of problem solving and the ability to 'tune into' problem solving tasks more quickly than others (Davidson, 2002, p.90). This, coupled with the fact that much that is written about young entrepreneurs' (Darby, 2002, Kourilsky and Walstad, 2007)[341] suggests that at a particular stage in a music student's development they might be

---

[341] There are numerous projects aimed at funding the enterprising activities of young people for example Princes Trust http://www.princes-trust.org.uk and Young Enterprise http://www.young-enterprise.org.uk.

particularly tuned to developing entrepreneurial projects which will ultimately support them in their desire to be professional performing musicians.

There is an opportunity for more transparent conversations with students about the sometimes enforced, uncomfortable relationship between performance and entrepreneurship, illustrated by the concert hall vignette at the start of this chapter. It appears that for music students, performance is a key motivator for entrepreneurial activity and that the ability to behave entrepreneurially will be a key success factor in their future careers as working musicians. In Chapter 8 we will see how the student respondents envisage these future careers and how they position themselves as future entrepreneurs.

CHAPTER 8: ENVISAGING FUTURES

Whatever path I take may be different to what I was expecting but if that happens it happens. The big thing is trying not to lose who I am. (Lara)

Introduction

By its nature, careers research is retrospective, observing and reporting on what individuals have already done or describing a current activity. In order to gain a different perspective on the music student as entrepreneur, this chapter focuses less on what the student respondents have actually done, rather the way in which they envisage their futures (a key component of a careers interview that is rarely captured), and how this corresponds with the reality of musicians' working practices. Tracking back across all the interviews, a key theme, the envisaged future, has emerged. This chapter is about aspiration rather than destination.

Much of the theory related to individuals' careers is drawn from two key data sets: firstly information about what people have done in the past, secondly about what they are actually doing now. These data sets provide the cornerstones of research into both entrepreneurship, with its strong focus on the use of case study and large-scale questionnaires with known entrepreneurs, and university pedagogy, within employability related modules and, most significantly, the Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA) annual return on Destinations of Leavers from Higher Education (DLHE). This retrospective data is primarily presented in a quantitative form although it can be argued, as in the case of my own study, that the data gathered is also very dependent on self-report and as such it is not as concrete and fixed, as might at first appear. The HESA survey is a highly significant annual exercise which feeds directly into marketing information resources which in turn inform the decision making of potential students on their choice of university course. At the same time, within the university, this data is sometimes regarded as unhelpful in providing a true picture of the ultimate worth of a degree course in terms of future career opportunity. This is felt particularly keenly within the arts where the practice of reporting on a student's situation six months after graduation takes little account of the nature of musicians' or artists' careers. It also seems that a false line is drawn between pre and post graduation; which for the entrepreneurial music student negates what might already be seen as a

thriving professional life as a musician, the start of a 'protean career' within the creative industries.

There is a fuzzy line for music students where much of their future is already evident in their current activity. Both Mills (2004) and Coulson (2012) refer to this as an on-going feature of musicians' careers. Mills, in her study of conservatory professors reports that: 'several professors speak of seeing their careers in music as a series of threads that link past activities to the prospect of future activities' (2004 p.195). It appears that for music students there may be a more seamless transition, post graduation, from that of other graduates:

> Surveys of the 'destinations' of graduates of UK institutions […] frequently overlook the achievement of music graduates who have arguably been most successful- because they are earning their livings by practising their subject as a musical performer. (Mills, 2004 p. 179)

This gradual continuum into a music related career has a very different trajectory from that of many other graduates where the degree is quite separate from what comes next, for example the geography student who joins a graduate training scheme with an accountancy firm.

In reporting on the students' envisaged futures in this chapter it is important to be clear about two methodological issues: firstly, although I refer at times to first, second or third interviews, this is not a longitudinal study. The students' envisaged futures have been omnipresent throughout my conversations with them and the data presented can only offer a snapshot, influenced by their relationship to me as interviewer, their frame of mind on the day of the interview and what they choose to reveal about themselves. Secondly, I need to be aware of the implication of my own past role as a careers counsellor and the influence that this might have of on the research itself at this point; also, as a parent of graduating students at this point in time I am potentially emotionally engaged with the topic.

It is important to acknowledge that these students will be taking a particular career position. They have been purposefully selected as having a certain way of behaving; so by definition, this is the way in which an entrepreneurial student is envisaging their future. In envisaging their futures these students appear to share some of the key

characteristics associated with success, in theories of career development and the emerging entrepreneur. They exhibit decision-making ability, opportunity awareness, transition learning and self-awareness; the keystones of the traditional and generic DOTS model of careers guidance as discussed in Chapter 2. They can also be positioned on Shapero and Sokol's 'Life path change' (1982, p. 83), a theory of nascent entrepreneurship which reflects the concept of moving from 'perceptions of desirability' about their future career towards 'perceptions of feasibility'. The model of career development that appears to be most helpful at this point is that of the 'protean career' where 'the individual, rather than the organization, takes responsibility for transforming their career path, in taking responsibility for their career' (Baruch, 2004 p. 71). Taking into account the way in which discussions about the future have arisen throughout the interviews, this chapter includes data drawn from all of the transcripts and considers the major influences on the students as they envisage their ideal futures. What has emerged is a picture of a group of students who view their futures with a certain amount of fear but at the same time take personal responsibility for their destiny.

Fear and Destiny

Fear

What is evident in discussions with the students as they envisage their future careers is a passion for music that dictates their decision making; it appears to be less about career choice and more about destiny; inextricably linked to their own identity:

> It was completely a part of me from the beginning and I allowed it to do that.[342]

> I needed to do music.[343]

> I don't know what it was but something happened when I started playing music and I just knew that it was what I wanted to do. I was really passionate about it.[344]

> There is nothing else but that.[345]

---

[342] Michael 1
[343] Anna 1
[344] Lara 1
[345] Makis1

This slightly re-frames the classic DOTS model of careers guidance, where decision making about a career is dependent on a number of stages leading to self-awareness, suggesting that the very act of being involved in music creates a strong sense of identity earlier than is normal; that music is always sitting there as the default choice. Several of the students describe how they have resisted other considered routes; in envisaging her future career Jo states: 'I couldn't imagine a life without music, but I could imagine a life without maths or law or anything else I was planning on doing'.[346] Maria too describes how originally she was not going to apply for music, feeling she wanted something 'more stable' with 'better career options'[347] but then ultimately 'decided to do what I loved instead'.[348]

In justifying their choice to commit to music both Lara and David use the same oppositional clichés expressed by many undergraduates within careers interviews; Lara doesn't want 'a desk job'[349] nor David a 'normal job'[350]. David also reflects how music is a long-term project and like most of the other respondents he feels he has made a huge personal investment and is totally unable to abandon it:

> By the end of year three, I will have spent five years studying solely music. To go and throw that away and not put it into practice, into something I love would be foolish. I know it is going to be hard but if it is not hard, it is not worth doing.[351]

'It's really scary'[352] says Lily when I ask her to talk about her course finishing and forthcoming graduation. Allied to feeling of a sense of destiny, that they must do music, the respondents all exhibit differing levels of fear and uncertainty about how their careers may actually develop in the future. Even though they are fearful (in the same way that most young graduates are) of leaving the security and identity associated with being a university student they also maintain a strong internal locus of control, taking responsibility for their own destiny, expressing little in the way of external excuses related to the economy and current job market. Lara expresses this sense of fear coupled with personal responsibility for making things happen:

---

[346] Jo 1
[347] Maria 1
[348] Maria 1
[349] Lara 1
[350] David 1
[351] David 1
[352] Lily 2

> It's a daunting thing to think that I will have to become some kind of entrepreneur and get myself out there and get myself noticed but at the same time I can't let myself be frightened of that – I've got to be an opportunist and take advantage of whatever comes along.[353]

David too exhibits this combination of anxiety and self-belief:

> It's a bit scary but I'm thinking ok, I've got the skill to do it, I've got my degree, its not that I can't do it its just that I maybe have to try a bit harder or approach more people and find other ways in.[354]

A local student who intends to remain in the region, David shows a realistic and pragmatic approach towards his goal of being a portfolio musician describing how he is:

> […] starting to get some function bands together and find agencies to try and get work so that, at the end of year three […] to have music as a main source of income and start teaching at the same time, that's another source of income. Starting to develop now what I need in place for this time next year when I will be finished.[355]

Maria has clear plans by the time of her final interview with me. Originally considering a career in arts administration, as a result of several periods of work experience, she now wants to be more directly involved in music education and delivery but she says that the idea of graduating makes her feel 'scared'.[356] Anna's anxiety is triggered by the attitudes of fellow non-music students who appear to be on a more steady linear progression towards their chosen career:

> I was actually a little bit afraid when some of my other friends were, you know, saying 'Oh I'm going to go do law, I'm going to go do this and there's a job right at the end.' And my initial fear was I'm going do music but what can I be at the end?[357]

By the time of her second interview with me, as she approaches graduation, she also compares herself with peers in terms of age and maturity:

> What scares me is that I have now become the eldest member of my network and I in no way feel I deserve that position. I've got some experience but I don't feel I know exactly what I'm doing.[358]

---

[353] Lara 2
[354] David 2
[355] David 1
[356] Maria 3
[357] Anna 1
[358] Anna 2

As international students, Bella and Makis face additional pressures as their courses draw to a close.[359] Makis, as a European intends to remain in the United Kingdom, as is his legal right; but, having been immersed in the music scene in the city since he first arrived for a pre-university college course, he is aware of the safety net that the status of 'university student' has provided in terms of resources, support and connexions. For Bella, as a US citizen, there is even greater pressure; she is so involved in the life of the university and reliant on its associated facilities, she feels a strong need to put everything in place before she graduates – 'when I'm done with this schooling I cannot fall back down'.[360] Her envisaged future, should she return to the US, she describes as quite bleak:

> I'm in this bubble here. I went home and all my friends, mostly activists are saying 'things are bad, things are bad, things are bad'. In terms of the economy, shops are closing, things are really bad, America is […]. The 1%, they are just trying to bleed it dry before it falls.

But displaying her typically autonomous, activist self she still sees this as an opportunity to create change for the better:

> The point is it doesn't have to be bled dry. Things are just gonna be bad quicker than we think – it's just because these people are selfish and so to my friends who say 'I've gotta make money' I say 'screw you, you're being selfish'. It doesn't have to be like this.[361]

Autonomy

Autonomy is a key characteristic of the entrepreneur and is constantly evident in the students' transcripts, as they look ahead they are taking responsibility for making their own careers happen. They are envisaging multiple future roles; protean careers as freelancers, heavily rooted in a realism that has been facilitated by their life as university music students. There appears to be a steady transition for some music students between pre- university/university/post-university. In some cases the lines between professional musician and student become blurred and even transposed.

---

[359] From April 2013 a number of new regulations for students wishing to remain resident in the UK were introduced which have made on-going rights of residency much more difficult to obtain. See http://www.ukcisa.org.uk/International-Students/The-next-stage/Working-after-your-studies/.
[360] Bella: 3
[361] Bella: 3

For Michael, who enjoyed some early success as a singer in his teens, his career takes precedence over his degree course and he is always thinking about his future:

> God, there's so much I need to do in my music career and business that I can't do because I'm doing an essay that I'm not interested in or I'm reviewing something that nobody's going to read.[362]

> I would quit the degree over my business completely. I wouldn't even have a second thought about it, whereas I would never do the opposite.[363]

He is heading towards what he describes as a 'realistic professional future'[364] describing how he has 'started to think more about realistic goals […] that are going to satisfy my desire to make music[365] well informed by his experience up to this point in time:

> You can't possibly rely on just writing music. You've got to think, 'Well, what else can I do?' I don't just have to produce me, so maybe I'll produce this band and charge £50 for the session and maybe £30 for the mixing; just little bits of pocket money here and there using those skills.[366]

He envisages an autonomous future and in doing so feels more confident: 'in the past when I've let other people take control, it's gone wrong'.[367] He sees autonomy as the route to personal freedom: 'you've got to have your fingers in lots of different pies in order to get by and to avoid the whole nine-to-five job'.[368]

Like Michael, Robert has an established autonomous persona and does not see himself working for others with the exception of basic jobs (like his current work in a café 'to pay the bills'[369]). As a part-time masters student he has already established a pattern for the future and is leading the life of a portfolio musician:

> In the short term I will carry on doing very similar things like working in different bands, recording different people, working on my own music, and probably having some sort of job in the meantime to keep some kind of steady income. Then if something does pick up and goes well, maybe I can think about not working in the café, but it's not something I have a problem with at the moment.[370]

---

[362] Mike 1
[363] Mike1
[364] Mike 2
[365] Mike 2
[366] Mike1
[367] Mike1
[368] Mike1
[369] Robert 2
[370] Robert 2

Both Lara and Anna see themselves with protean careers, shift-shaping between projects of various kinds but ideally paid by established organisations. Their autonomous approaches also show a sophisticated level of career awareness suggesting that music students are unusually well equipped to deal with more standard job seeking practices as well as directly entrepreneurial initiatives. As Lara says: 'I don't think it's going to arrive on my doorstep. An opportunity may come along but if I want something to happen I need to go and get it'.[371]

My second interview with Anna took place shortly before she was due to finish her MA at the Collegiate University; at this point she is already networking and checking out numerous opportunities and taking control of her future; 'I've got to that point where I have to sit down and think what I want to do; exploring options, trying my hardest not to end up in arts admin'[372]. Despite all her efforts whilst still at university, when I interview Anna for the final time[373] she is back in her Welsh home town, having applied for some jobs, but so far unsuccessful. She describes to me how she has decided to start looking for work experience rather than paid work as she feels she hasn't had enough experience in 'the real world'; she draws up a list and starts to email people and one contact bears fruit. Her behaviour now mirrors her behaviour at university, she is following up contacts, talking to people, grabbing any opportunity; 'you just need to start meeting people; at the end of the day all people want is reliable people who they will get on with, it's not just about how creative you can be'[374]. Anna's protean career strategy is to make as many contacts as possible: I don't really know if these things will happen but I've just learned very quickly to say yes to absolutely everything'.[375]

---

[371] Lara 2
[372] Anna 2
[373] This was a Skype interview
[374] Anna 3
[375] Anna 3

Influences

The way in which the students construct their imagined futures continues to be influenced, as it has been historically, by their parents and particular tutors and is less dependent on the designated careers support systems within the university.

Tutors

Far from taking the open approach which tends to underpin much careers counselling, the students frequently refer to being given very directive advice by teachers and tutors. Anna reports her piano teacher's reaction to her suggestion that she might do law, the response being 'don't you dare'.[376] Several of the students report on close career conversations with instrument tutors rather than their academic personal tutors who, although highly respected, tend to be seen as 'very academic people who might not know about current ways to get into careers'.[377] Anna describes how her personal tutor forwards useful information to her regarding possible contacts or interesting conferences but she feels that these all point towards an academic route that she is not sure about pursuing at this point. Interestingly, when I talk to Anna in her second interview, she says she feels uneasy about having careers discussions with her tutor because she is unclear about where she is heading: 'I feel quite embarrassed – it's something I just wouldn't talk about with my tutor'.[378] It does appear that there is a closer relationship in terms of careers support at the Vocational University where the cohorts are smaller, the course staff are drawn from actively performing musicians and there is a much lower focus on research. David speaks of the influence one member of the teaching staff at the Vocational University has had on him: 'I wasn't very serious about being a musician until, probably, I started the BTEC. There was a particular tutor who opened my eyes as to the possibilities'.[379]

---

[376] Anna1
[377] Anna 2
[378] Anna I
[379] David I

Careers Service

There seems to be is a general perception amongst the students of the value of professional careers advice: that it is good at the provision of clear facts and hard information but less useful in terms of facilitating the decision making process, particularly for those students who are very undecided. Careers education takes, necessarily, a generic approach within universities, but is often seen as falling short on specialist knowledge of, for example, the music business. Although recently there have been real efforts to provide useful designated support for arts students, often in the form of workshops for creative subject areas, this too can lead to an alternative but less than useful new label that fails to acknowledge the needs of the individual in the process other than that they are 'a music student'.

Where central careers support has been most effective seems to be in the facilitation of students' existing entrepreneurial ideas. Michael, who in his first interview said that he had 'no idea'[380] about any university support, reports in his second interview on how he did go to the careers service at the Civic University and that they helped him to conceptualise more clearly his future direction: 'I started to understand where I was really going to take this'.[381] It appears that the actual process of discussing business viability acts as a mode of delivery in providing careers guidance, that for students like Michael, might be far more helpful than a traditional careers interview.

Where there are already stronger existing links between enterprise and music departments, students have been engaging with the central services. However, in the Collegiate University, which has a central support function for enterprise and a strong reputation in terms of student business start-up, music students see little of relevance to them. Jo describes careers support for musicians as 'not very strong here'[382] and in discussing the various promotions emanating from the careers centre says 'I never really look at them because I just think they don't seem relevant to musicians.'[383]

---

[380] Michael 1
[381] Michael 2
[382] Jo 2
[383] Jo 1

> I don't know, workshops that tell you how to run a business and that kind of thing. And in a way, maybe it would be relevant, but it's just not something that registers with me or, I think, other musicians. Maybe it should, but I never have been to anything like that.[384]

Anna and Maria, both from the Collegiate University, are also quite critical of the little contact they have had with the careers service, reporting on careers fairs which seem to have a strong focus on finance. Maria does show a greater understanding of the wider careers support mechanisms open to students and says that collegiate support, although quite generic, is helpful, particularly the alumni scheme, but overall feels there is a lack of support for the arts.

Course

The students' experiences on their courses are influential in the way they start to envisage their futures both directly and indirectly. As would be expected, in contrast to the other two institutions in this study, the Vocational University is explicit in its provision of what appears to manifest itself at times as direct training; students are fully aware of this and originally applied to this course for this reason. In her first interview Lara shows a clear vocational focus and this is constantly re-validated by the intrinsically vocational nature of her course. By the time she returns to her final year she 'feels like it is more real life' where staff are running the course in a way that makes the students feel they are working; this 'real world' focus makes her think that 'this is what I could be doing when I graduate'[385] and 'this could be what you need to be doing when you finish in order to get a job'.[386] Lily, also at the vocational university, describes the visiting speaker programme as having been extremely helpful to her in her careers choice saying it helped her 'to see there is still work out there; to be more positive about it'.[387] Michael, at the Civic University has always had a clear vocational approach to his choice of degree course and sees his future in music production where he has the skills to produce the sound he really wants, independent from other producers.[388]

---

[384] Jo 1
[385] Lara 2
[386] Lara 2
[387] Lily 2
[388] Mike:1

For Jo and Maria it is their developing academic specialisms which have progressively informed the way in which they see their future careers:

> [tutor] gave a sample ethnomusicology lecture […]. I still trace that as the beginning of my interest; so that little bit of the course is what set me on the route to ethnomusicology, to the Philippines and then to India […]. It was that little bit of inspiration but a lot has come from the church.[389]

> To have a dissertation that's relevant to what I want to do as a career will be an asset I think.[390]

Projects / placements/ extracurricular activity

For several of the students, the participation in a project, placement or extra-curricular activity has provided them with a new conceptual framework from which to look into their future. Originally Maria had envisaged a career in arts administration and at one point sets up an eight week unpaid internship in London, with a leading West End production company: 'I was right in at the deep end'.[391] The experience changed her planned future career trajectory:

> It was quite difficult in some ways. I definitely don't want to do that as a career […] which surprised me […]. I still really enjoyed it and it was quite glamorous working in London but that's not where I want to be.[392]

The placement appears to help her to re-assess her ethics and values and she finds herself:

> […]surprised by the corporate nature of the environment, even though it's the arts it's still very, very commercialised. At the end of the day its just about making money, but not making money to plug back in to the arts which is what I find interesting and want to do, but making money for investors and partners.[393]

This experience subsequently moves her towards the idea of a career in music education. For her dissertation she carries out research at the large regional music venue, investigating issues related to their education programme, and says she would love to stay in the North East and get a job there.[394]

---

[389] Jo 3
[390] Maria 2
[391] Maria 3
[392] Maria 3
[393] Maria 3
[394] Maria 3

Other students like Jo, at the Collegiate University, develop their ideas about the future by high-level participation in university and college societies and through engaging with as many extra-curricular opportunities as possible within the music department.[395] John, who exhibits a very clear career plan from year one, decides to take a year out to gain experience performing in France supported by any kind of basic job whilst he is there: 'not to do with music […] one of the interviews I have got is to work in the office of a national estate agent chain'.[396]

Anna feels she needs to spend the period immediately after graduation testing out career ideas, putting together her own plan for work experience:

> I never took a gap year and I'm only 22 […]. When I come out in September I'm going to have a masters in music, I'm academically trained up and I've got a bit more experience in the music field and I would like to dabble and see what I can do. It doesn't really matter about the money, say for a year, and I can see how far I can get.[397]

In describing her plans for the immediate future, Anna shows a sophisticated understanding of the intrinsic value of a multiplicity of cultural experiences, participation in which is not just about a clear route to the desired destination but is a first destination in itself, albeit that the value of this is unlikely to be captured within any official destination survey.

Parents

It is clear that just as parental influence was strong in terms of the students' original choice of university course, parental approval and support has a strong affect on how the students view their next step after university. Michael sees a future as a musician as carrying on a family tradition:

> The root of my musical career was my granddad on my mum's side, who was a huge musician. Because he died when I was so young I felt that I was fulfilling something that I would never do [...] because I knew I'd never get to talk to him about music, I felt like I was doing that.[398]

---

[395] Jo 3
[396] John 3
[397] Anna 2
[398] Michael 1

Both Lisa and Jo have their own ideas about the future but at the same time live with the ever-present cautioning of the parents in whose steps they are following. Lisa accepts that her immersion in an expatriate musician family will inevitably influence her choice of work pattern but her envisaged future is tainted with her parents' realism:

> I sometimes think it would be more likely that I would achieve success in music in a career as a musician if my parents hadn't constantly – if they'd been more supportive, rather than being, I guess, responsible or realistic. Do you know what I mean? But I think both me and my brother may have gone for it in a much bigger way if it had not been my parents hanging back saying 'You know, we've only ever been able to have it as a hobby. You can't really make any money. You want to make sure that you can make money.' Do you know, this constant worry? [399]

Jo sees her family background directly affecting the way in which she views her own future in a global sense, potentially living and working overseas: 'My willingness to go has come from my background in that going places is something that can be done […] its never seemed impossible to me'.[400] At the same time she describes her mum as having a slightly contradictory stance when thinking about her daughter's career, thinking 'when am I really going to get a job'[401] although she herself was also a missionary.

Maria's mother also strongly influences her own ideas about the future and (as in the case of Jo's mother) Maria reports she exhibits well founded reservations about her daughter following in her footsteps, worrying about her career prospects: 'My mum was, kind of, a bit anti me doing music'.[402] In her first interview Maria describes her mother's career as a finance manager, frequently working with arts projects. She feels she has learnt a lot from her 'by…osmosis really'[403]; later, as she approaches graduation, she says she has found talking to her mum about her job to be 'unexpectedly interesting'.[404]

> Looking back over the last few years at just those dinner table discussions that you have at home has been a factor in increasing my thinking […] both my parents are accountants, I've just assimilated an aspect of business.[405]

[399] Lisa 1
[400] Jo 3
[401] Jo 3
[402] Maria: I
[403] Maria 1
[404] Maria 2
[405] Maria 2

The Ideal future

Michael

Michael describes how he has moved from early fantasies of his own glittering career as a rock star (which he himself admits was part of his adolescence and growing identity):

> From an early age I was always obsessed not just with the idea of being in a band and playing music, but the complete package. So the image, the quotes, the interviews: everything. I always wanted it all. I didn't really just want to be making music. It sounds a bit strange.[406]

He has now moved towards his current dream which has re-focussed on the imagined futures of others. Motivated by his own experience of the education system, having struggled with dyslexia, his ideal future would be to work on music projects in what he describes as 'alternative education' based around non-traditional learners. He has been highly influenced by a work placement at the large regional music venue describing the experience as a pivotal point in re-focussing his direction towards education facilitation, in his words ' music for development'.[407] His ideal would be to work at the large regional music venue on a project basis and he has already set up meetings with the outreach/education arm of the organisation to pitch ideas for project work: 'this is where I see myself going now'.[408]

Anna

Based on a growing love of directing which has been facilitated by highly professional extra-curricular opportunities at the Collegiate University, Anna's ideal future role is to be working with opera both directly and in an outreach capacity, taking productions out to children who have had no previous experience of the art form. Whilst completing her masters degree Anna described her desire to test her directing skills in the real world[409] and when I talk to her shortly after graduation she is putting this into action; she has applied for directorship of a youth opera in London (unpaid) and a travel fellowship to go to the USA to learn about education programmes there and bring this knowledge back to projects in Wales: 'I've just realised I'm going to use this year to see if it is at all possible for me to be in opera directing because I'm also really interested in opera in

---

[406] Michael 1
[407] Michael 2
[408] Michael 2
[409] Anna 2

education'.[410] Following advice from a mentor, she describes how she has now started to introduce herself as an opera director:

> She said to me 'you need to start saying to people 'I'm an opera director'' – I've got over that hurdle and I'm saying to people 'I'm Anna and I am going to be an opera director'[411]

Maria

Maria is very clear about how she sees a future in which she combines her steadily developing business and management skills with music education and she expresses a strong activist agenda. She is not interested in 'nurturing or teaching people whose parents have a lot of money to shove at them' but wants to help 'people who don't have a natural exposure to music, especially classical music:'[412]

> Ideally I'd like to be working in outreach in some way, with a charity or a venue that does outreach projects and things like that to enable people that are marginalised or from a difficult background to access the arts – that's my ambition.[413]

She talks with confidence about her future, displaying a sophisticated knowledge of management models of arts organisations;[414] aware of her own strengths, built up through the many management roles she has taken on during her time at university:

> Often people who have absolutely invaluable skills within the arts in delivery and performing and stuff just don't have the business or management mind-set to back that up whereas I think that's where my strong point is, and I'd like to be able to use that to enable other people to do there delivery of outreach projects.[415]

> The fact that I'm interested in the business and management end of it means I could end up being quite unique in being interested in both; a long way down the line I could combine them into setting up my own business doing the education outreach stuff[416]

---

[410] Anna 3
[411] Anna 3
[412] Maria:1
[413] Maria 3
[414] Maria 3
[415] Maria 2
[416] Maria 3

In the short term Maria's ideal would be to engage with a wide range of different activities:

> If I was lucky enough to have the career that I really want I'd like to spend my twenties doing as varied roles as I can in as varied places, getting experience working in really big organisations that are really well funded, and small ones that it's a constant battle in, and then potentially use all that experience to potentially set up a project of my own.[417]

And in the long term she can see herself 'as a freelance arts consultant maybe going into different places for a period of time, turning round one aspect'.[418]

David

David is strongly tied to the region and his ideal future is to be a successful freelance musician working in the North East of England. As he approaches the end of his degree course he already has his own band, is performing in several other bands, and gaining various other one-off performing opportunities. He teaches guitar and is building up the number of pupils to a level that will provide him with a basic income, supplemented by his income from performance.

For David, participation in this project has, he says, helped him to 'clarify my values and decide where I want to go'[419]. Part of this process for David appears to be conceptualising what he is already doing in terms of a viable business, creating an umbrella for all his existing activities to create a future that is enabling him to have a career in music on his own terms. David has responded enthusiastically to his degree course at the Vocational University and identifies strongly with the numerous freelance musician role models he has come across during the last three years.

Lily

For Lily, an international student from Germany, her ideal future is to remain in Newcastle where she has made connections and plays in a number of bands. Her dream opportunity would be to gain a traineeship at the major regional music venue but she is aware of the competition she would face for a place on this programme. She intends to

---

[417] Maria 2
[418] Maria 2
[419] David 2

apply for this although realistically she knows she will need to have alternative plans. She sees herself as a freelance musician although acknowledges the work she will need to do in order to set herself up as financially independent once the course has finished: 'I think I might be doing half teaching and half band work; I'm going to try to set that up over the next 6 months.'[420]

Location seems to be a key factor in Lily's ideal future; she is looking at ways for her music to facilitate staying in the North East of England rather than placing the music at the heart of the decision making and considering a wider geographical field.

John

John's dream is to be a professional performing musician and this has been his clearly stated goal since joining the Collegiate University. Ideally he wants to go straight into performing after graduation: 'The best time to do performing is straight after graduating when you're at your peak really, when you're freshest and it's the best time to learn things'.[421] Acknowledging the competition for work as an orchestral musician in the UK he is looking more widely:

> One of the routes I've thought of for getting into orchestral playing […] is going to one of the European orchestras, because there are so many more, slightly less good orchestras than here, there are more jobs going.[422]

The ideal long-term career plan he describes mirrors that of many high level freelance musicians and also reflects the careers of his parents:

> I don't envisage myself doing it for ever. I'm going to want to do a few other things, arts admin or teaching […]. I don't want to just do one thing for ever.[423]

Bella

Bella sees a future travelling and empowering communities through a continuation of the music projects she is already involved in, maintaining all the international links she has made with staff and students whilst in the North East. Her envisaged future is of

---

[420] Lily 2
[421] John 3
[422] John 3
[423] John 3

herself as activist and she speaks mainly in terms of forthcoming individual political initiatives and interventions rather than a clearly projected career. She sees her current life in the city of the Civic University as a very special time in her career and development as a musician: 'I have everything to be thankful for – I'm very blessed.'[424] She sees a strong difference between the UK and US in terms of opportunity for her to push forward with her activist project and is not planning to return to America in the immediate future.

For Bella, part of her ideal future is to establish some form of geographical stability, a base:

> After the PhD I would like to purchase a small piece of land and a house. I want somewhere in this world to house my stuff, I want to have a place to go and say 'ok, that's home'. I'm not really set on how big it is, I can always upgrade at some point, […] as long as I can store everything and have a base. I plan to travel and perform everywhere and to do workshops in conjunction with or separate from the performances.[425]

Lara

Lara is passionate about community music and the idea of enabling other people. She 'has started to teach clarinet and piano to students with learning difficulties'[426] and describes how proud she is of the progress of one of her pupils who is autistic. She feels instinctively that she is on the right track and that the community music degree has been 'the right route for me […] maybe I was meant to find this path because it fits'.[427] She sees her ideal future work pattern as consisting of a combination of teaching and project work: 'I think I will always teach because I think teaching is something that I can get regular income in if I have regular pupils, unlike a project that may finish after six weeks.'[428] But, she says: 'I'd love to do project leadership'.[429]

Most importantly, she wants to retain her own sense of identity:

> Whatever path I take may be different to what I was expecting but if that happens it happens I think the big thing […] is trying not to lose who I am, I

---

[424] Bella 3
[425] Bella 2
[426] Lara 2
[427] Lara 2
[428] Lara 1
[429] Lara 2

have done all these things and I have all of these experiences and as long as I can maintain this when I'm finished I'll be content.[430]

Makis

For Makis, the ideal future would be to be a composer:

> Composing music for any occasion, like for film, that would be fantastic. T.V., advertisements, that is what I have in mind. I could do CDs but it would not pay me very well.[431]

Makis outlines how he wants to continue to develop his skills in composition but also suggests that he is slightly unsure of his direction at the moment, as he is also considering training for a specialist form of music therapy. As an international student approaching the end of his course he talks about feelings of displacement, the choice of return to his native Greece becoming increasingly difficult:

> I don't think I would like to go back to Greece right now, or even in 5 years because things are really bad now'. I think its going to be like suicide if I go back – I won't find a job.[432]

And yet he says he feels (humorously) that he doesn't want to take jobs from English people so will stick to work with Greek community. He has a job on a Greek florist's stall.[433]

Jo

Jo is quite ambivalent about what would be her ideal career route in the future. She is quite set in the short term, planning to return overseas to one of her previous placements and to continue with fieldwork in a Christian missionary setting; although says she 'can't really see it as a long term thing at this stage'.[434]

> My focus is ethnomusicology, so that's what I've ended up taking as my route and it's definitely something that I want to do in the future. But career wise, you know, it's hard to really see where that would take me, but it's definitely an area I would want to work in.[435]

---

[430] Lara 2
[431] Makis 1
[432] Makis 2
[433] Makis 2
[434] Jo 3
[435] Jo 1

The way Jo talks suggests that she has a very specific idea about career decision making, that it is something very definite and not something that will evolve organically. By the time of her final interview with me she talks professionally about her experience of teaching overseas, as if she has already made the transition to the workplace.[436]

Discussion

Analysis and construction of a narrative centred on career related discussions within the students' transcripts, from the perspective of an envisaged future, reveals a complexity generally absent in discussions of careers provision for music students. The findings suggest that this new approach to the discussion of and reporting on career related issues and arts students, in which students' envisaged careers are taken seriously and discussed in depth, can provide a valuable source of information for pedagogical decision making; an antidote to many of the 'quick fix' responses to annual destination survey. Most significant amongst this group of entrepreneurial music students, as opposed to many university students, is that they appear to be starting from a different base. They are not 'pre career' – many are already very active and their envisaged futures are being continuously re-shaped by current activity. Through gaining an understanding of the way in which these students envisage their futures it becomes evident that they disrupt normal linear theories of careers guidance and adhere more closely to theories of the development of the entrepreneur, particularly the nascent entrepreneur.

Analysis of the transcripts has revealed the following:

- A high degree of certainty about their future career – a sense of destiny to be a musician allied to a personal sense of responsibility and autonomy.
- An early engagement with shift-shaping, protean careers, blurring traditional notions of the transition from university student to working graduate and exhibiting the characteristics of a nascent entrepreneur.
- A significant geographical attachment to the region as they envisage the future; this has particular implications for international students.
- Parents and instrument tutors are important mentors in future career decision-making, less significant are personal tutors and central advice services.

---

[436] Jo 3

- The students exhibit a gritty realism in thinking about their futures, rooted in genuine 'real world' experience.
- The non-directive research interview itself has had some impact in shaping upon how students think about their futures.
- A link between academic work, particularly dissertations and career decision making.

Pedagogical implications

My research suggests that a deeper understanding of how music students envisage their futures could directly facilitate more effective careers support and guidance. New structures may need to be put in place within music departments which enable us as teachers to develop our own understanding of how today's students envisage their futures. This strongly suggests developing different kinds of relationships, initiating different conversations, within the tutorial setting. There is a need to somehow acknowledge the omnipresent sense of fear amongst music students about the apparent lack of a clear career route for musicians, compared with their perception of clear routes and options for fellow students within other subject areas, rather than seek to dismiss these fears through constant reference to transferability skills. This supports existing established thinking on the importance of the use of alumni and role models within the curriculum, particularly in the teaching of enterprise and entrepreneurship.

Music students appear to be different, 'othered' within the central careers guidance process both in terms of sophistication and naivety. They show sophisticated levels of self-awareness and engagement with the act and identification of being a working musician whilst at the same time having a naïve approach to the business aspects of this chosen path. Despite having access to free support as students, many do not take advantage of this support. This could be because traditional models on which many careers departments still base their programmes do not necessarily provide appropriate frameworks for music students who, as has been discussed, do not follow the traditional DOTS model. As it appears to be the case that a state of self-awareness (as applied to career decision-making) is obtained earlier in the case of some music students, very early intervention may be key to successful careers input. Introductory sessions for new students may need to be re-framed acknowledging and accounting in their delivery for already active careers and not positioning the start of the degree as the starting point.

For some music students, use of the careers service can work well but for the entrepreneurial music student who already has a clear idea about a freelance future, the most appropriate primary support input may be from a university's enterprise centre rather than the core careers team. This would appear to be the case for the students in this study, nascent entrepreneurs on the brink of creating new projects and businesses.

In discussion about the future, geographical location is significant for both international and home students. This is a key issue for international students who may be more fully integrated into life in the UK than international students from other subject areas by virtue of being part of a community of music students, performing and working collaboratively with musicians from the university and region. For some of the students, envisaging a return to their home countries has also become more problematic during their time as students. Some of the home students too appear to become rooted in the region as part of a wider community of musicians with whom they see a continuing relationship post graduation. This offers clear pedagogical opportunities in terms of developing a thriving alumni association which has two-way support, acknowledging the civic, collegiate and vocational styles of the regional universities in this study.

Whilst the influence of central services on the way in which students envisage their futures appears to be minimal, parental and instrumental tutor influence seems to be significant. Personal tutors are specifically identified as career mentors and, given the relatively small size of music departments, in some cases, they are able to develop a close relationship with their tutees. However, these tutors are not qualified careers advisers – students describe the mode of advice given as very directive, although inspirational and often based upon the tutors' own experience. This points to a schism between skill sets of careers advisers and tutors into which students are falling. It appears that tutors are well placed in terms of credibility as both academics and musicians to deliver guidance but are unlikely to be equipped with the necessary, up to date counselling skills and careers information.

The pedagogical concept of 'real world' experience is now firmly established across disciplines. Within a music department, many of the elements of course delivery fall naturally into this categorisation in the form of creative projects, performances and placements. The data reveals that real world elements of the course are highly significant and can quickly change the way in which students envisage their futures.

Even for those students who already seriously engage in their own 'real world' activities, opportunities within the course appear to have been influential.

What has been significant in my interviews with these students, as a careers adviser myself, has been the level of autonomy exhibited: a strong internal locus of control is clearly visible. Having probably interviewed thousands of university students in the past, I would say that these students present differently from the typical mode of presentation in first career interviews where a student's opening statement is often 'I don't know what I want to do'. Much of the criticism levelled at careers advisers arises from the perception on the part of students that the careers adviser was unable to answer this question for them. The student respondents have commented on the way in which participation in the project has helped them to envisage their futures in a positive way.

The student respondents are overwhelmingly envisaging protean careers: project based; short term; freelance. They describe these perceived futures differently at different times, sometimes confidently, at other times with a level of anxiety. What is consistent is the way in which the respondents are engaged in a process of positioning their identities as opera director, community musician, producer, project leader, activist, composer; and across the period of the study, none of the students has moved away from their original desire to work with music:

> I: You are committed to being a professional musician?
> IV: There is nothing else but that[437]

---

437 Makis 1

CHAPTER 9: CONCLUSION

The qualitative researcher [...] is like a quilt maker or jazz improviser. The quilter stitches, edits, and puts slices of reality together. This process creates and brings psychological and emotional unity – a pattern – to an interpretative experience. (Denzin and Lincoln, 2008a, p.7)

Introduction

This doctoral study, originating from the CETL Working in Music project, makes a new contribution to the provision of entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning support for music students from both a theoretical and pedagogical perspective and, reflecting this, the following conclusion is presented in two parts. In Part 1 I present a theoretical discussion of my findings, revisiting the interdisciplinary positioning of the thesis with particular emphasis on how established theories of nascent entrepreneurship and communities of practice might inform our understanding of the way we work with our music students. In Part 2, I discuss how these theoretical findings might inform a pedagogy of entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning, firmly rooted in the discipline of music, that is both acceptable, meaningful and of practical use to music students and academics alike. Also, acknowledging the nature of this research as activist, I will show how my work has already had some impact and will make some suggestions for how this research might be taken forward.

My initial research questions were drawn from the core remit of the Working in Music project. My instinct was that much of what was currently being delivered to music students as professional development was being prescribed without diagnosis. I wanted to question what it means to be a music student and what it means to be an entrepreneur and found there were many hitherto un-theorised synergies. I had an existing sense of the nature of music departments as thriving communities but found that the significance of this was greater than I had thought and that an understanding of these communities is critical in discussions of provision for their student members. In re-locating the canon of entrepreneurship theory I have shown how an understanding of this alien research paradigm can offer an alternative reading which can be drawn upon to inform both the theoretical and pedagogical debate relating to music students as entrepreneurs.

PART 1: REVISITING THE INTELLECTUAL CONTEXT AND HERITAGE

Introduction

This study of the music student as entrepreneur has been contextualised and framed using appropriately selected theories of musicology and entrepreneurship. New synergies between these two discipline areas have been identified and these have subsequently provided the scaffolding for analysis of the primary data, identifying themes related to creativity, community and identity. As is the nature of an interdisciplinary study, this has created a new two-way conversation between musicology and entrepreneurship facilitated by a conceptual bridge in the form of 'communities of practice'.

Musicology

The fact that an anthropological or ethnographic approach has been taken to study a group students who happen to be musicians does not necessarily make this ethnomusicology and therefore this is not the place for in-depth discussion of the discipline itself. However, Cook (1999) suggests, that the discipline of musicology embraces the 'inclusion of all imaginable kinds of research into music' and, whilst this thesis makes no direct claim to being or interrogating pure ethnomusicology, it certainly has benefitted from broadly aligning itself with ethnomusicology in the following ways: it is interdisciplinary; it is located 'at home'; it takes an approach that is both reflexive and activist and it is underpinned by a methodology rooted in the tradition of fieldwork – the conceptual pillars identified in Chapter 3.

Interdisciplinarity

An interdisciplinary approach, supported by primary data drawn from fieldwork, has allowed the study to refract the concept of the entrepreneurial music student through a number of different prisms and consequently gain different perspectives. An acceptance of this approach within the ethnomusicological community has provided a point of access for me as a non-musician; it extends the recent developments in terms of a dialogue between ethnomusicology and the social sciences which has contributed to a

developing plurality and diversity within both disciplines (Cooley T. and Barz G., 2008, p.3). Accepting that there are inherent risks for all interdisciplinary researchers in terms of a potentially perceived lack of subject specialism, the benefit of interdisciplinarity in this case has been the facilitation of an original contribution to knowledge; drawing the theory of entrepreneurship into the unique setting of a university music department.

A key concept associated with notions of validity in interdisciplinary, qualitative research is triangulation, defined by Stake (2008 p. 133) as: 'a process of using multiple perceptions to clarify meaning, verifying the repeatability of an observation or interpretation'. This process of triangulation was used throughout; acknowledging that there is some bias in this form of research, I have compensated through the depth of additional data I have been able to obtain. Currently, much research related to students (from the large scale national student surveys referred to previously, to subject based module feedback) is arguably based on quite crude numerical measures, eliminating any subtlety and losing valuable data 'between the tick boxes' – in qualitative research terms, failing to 'work the hyphens'. However, I am not suggesting that small-scale studies such as this can rest solely on the laurels of their rich data. Throughout the preceding chapters I have considered the emerging themes with reference to appropriate academic literatures and pre-existing research data with a constant eye on potential contradiction. Whilst acknowledging, in common with Stake (2008) that my core research is not 'perfectly repeatable', throughout the study, in line with the framework suggested by Carspecken (1996), I was constantly engaging in the process of triangulation, testing my emerging hypotheses with wider groups of students and staff.[438] There was a strong element of participant observation, as a member of the teaching department at the Civic University I was able to, with the permission of staff and students, identify potential opportunities to use questionnaires, focus groups and discussions with individuals to check out my findings, and write my own reflective observational field notes; in ethnographic terms, to exploit all opportunities to research 'at home'.

---

[438] See appendix 10

At home

The concept of 'at home' as used within ethnomusicology has proved to be a useful construct in researching the lives of university music students. As discussed in Chapter 3, there is established practice in terms of teachers using their own students and institutions to research pedagogical issues and this is certainly the case in considering music education, for example Green's (2002) work on the teaching popular musicians and Davidson's (2002) work on employability as it relates to the future working lives of university music students. Whilst the work of Davidson and Green sits clearly within music education, other studies clearly related to music education and based in conservatories or universities have chosen to position themselves as ethnomusicology (Kingsbury, 1988; Nettl, 1995; Kruger, 2009). This thesis has sought to interrogate the concept of the music student as entrepreneur and although the process has resulted in certain pedagogical insights it is not a study of the teaching of entrepreneurship or the teaching of music. Rather, the study has a broader perspective, looking at the behaviours, thoughts and attitudes of music students. Research at home has enabled this holistic portrayal of the lives of these particular music students and subsequently provided a new way of viewing entrepreneurial behaviour.

Reflexivity

Although I was comfortable with the notion of interdisciplinarity having had a background in academic development and was 'at home' with music departments by this stage in my development manager role, I was new to music as a research discipline. At an early stage, guided by my supervisors (a 19th/20th century music specialist and an ethnomusicologist), I realised the need to have my roots firmly planted in the music school before reaching out into more generic employability based research paradigms and drawing them back towards the discipline; in short, in the course of this doctorate, I have needed to become a member of the music academic establishment and to understand the broader discipline of musicology. The process of reflecting critically on the self as researcher or 'reflexivity' has facilitated this process, particularly in terms of positioning the study. The value of reflexivity is acknowledged within ethnomusicology, indeed is an 'expectation' according to Cooley and Barz (2008, p.13) hence, by aligning my study with ethnomusicology I have been able to use an approach familiar within the social sciences (including studies of entrepreneurship) in a way that

is acceptable to the intellectual context of a music department. Reflexivity also allowed me to be explicit about my own cultural heritage. Without an academic history in a music department there would have been complications in claiming to be an ethnomusicologist therefore, drawing upon a number of qualitative research approaches I have completed the study as an ethnographer who is working with music students.

Activist

I have consistently positioned this thesis as action research and this has certain consequences in presenting conclusions. In common with my respondents who are simultaneously students and freelance musicians, throughout my time as a doctoral student I have also had a dual role, teaching within a music department. As was intended for this doctoral project, this has already informed and influenced some student interventions in my own university.

The agentic nature of this research was enshrined in the origins of its funding. The intention was that the study would contribute to knowledge to inform the provision of professional development for university music students. The activist agenda has been embraced within applied ethnomusicology, a term used to describe a wide range of musical activity that has a remit to resolve and heal differences, often in political conflict situation; in some cases as a call to action.[439] Within any context, activist studies assume some power on the part of the researcher to make change and in the process of my research this proved to be the case. As a university teacher I have been able to influence curricula decision making as well as at times acting as adviser, mentor or advocate to my respondents.

From the outset, as described in my methodology, I was aware of the possible effect of participation in the project on my student respondents – indeed in the spirit of reciprocity I sought to help them.

---

[439] For examples of applied ethnomusicology in situations as diverse as Kosovo, Northern Ireland and Brazil, see *Music and Conflict* (2010, O'Connell, Morgan and Castelo-Branco).

Nascent Entrepreneurship

Whilst the context of this thesis is music and the methodology is underpinned by qualitative approaches familiar to ethnomusicology the issue at the heart of the thesis is entrepreneurship. This study has demonstrated how different aspects of entrepreneurship theory can be used to consider the entrepreneurial music student and has identified the theory of nascent entrepreneurship as a particularly useful concept.

At the start of this project I embarked upon a major review of literature pertaining to entrepreneurship. Initially, finding that much of the traditional theory fell into the distinct fields of sociology, psychology or economics I struggled to find an access point which made sense in the context of my own study. It appeared that many core theories of entrepreneurship had little relevance to the subjects of my study, most of whom were likely to become independent freelance workers. However, the large body of work on SME's (Small and Medium Sized Enterprises) slowly began to reveal synergies, particularly in its association with marginalized or disenfranchised groups operating outside of the business mainstream: women; refugees and immigrants; third world communities and, although they have not been previously explicitly framed as such, music students. From within this paradigm the idea of nascency emerged as a potent conceptual tool. In what I felt to be a serendipitous validation of my chosen theory, I discovered that the institution at which I was studying had a few years earlier held one of the first major entrepreneurship conferences centred entirely on nascent entrepreneurship (Durham Business School Centre for Entrepreneurship, 2005). This international conference was a direct response to worldwide data emerging from GEM (the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor) which pointed to huge untapped entrepreneurial potential across the globe. Moving from the global to the local I considered how this theory might help me to interrogate entrepreneurship and music students. Most importantly it crossed boundaries previously imposed by entrepreneurship theory, acknowledging an important combination of factors at play which in themselves resonated with the themes that were emerging from my fieldwork.

The definition of nascent entrepreneurship in Chapter 2 describes a particular way of thinking and behaving that to the qualified observer indicates a pre-disposition for entrepreneurship but which 'has not yet expressed itself in a visible way' (Johnson, Parker and Wijbenga, 2006). If we are to look at the practical application of this theory

within a music department we need to acknowledge that our students frequently arrive in a nascent state with existing skills and capital. My research has shown that some students arrive as fully formed portfolio workers with a history of engaging with opportunities and alertness to new ones. We also need to be aware that this cultural, economic and social capital is significant in dictating access to and participation in the different communities they will encounter as they enter the university: departmental; social; and regional. At the same time, the theory of nascent entrepreneurship points to the significance of the environmental conditions in triggering entrepreneurship; we need to ask how might this play out in our own locations?

One of the overarching aims of this study was to gain a deeper understanding of what it means to be a music student. I had for some time felt instinctively, based on my business mentoring relationship with some students, that we did not know enough about the students as they entered the university. I had often discovered (as has subsequently been the case with the student respondents) that students from previous focus groups, and my own tutees, may have parallel lives as musicians of which their tutors may be unaware. The student respondents could all be said to be nascent entrepreneurs in that they were thinking and acting in ways which can be defined as entrepreneurial but none had yet reached the point where their activities would be legally described as an actual business.

Understanding an individual student's position on the nascency continuum could arguably better inform our interactions with our students, particularly within the tutorial process where issues of professional development might be raised. My fieldwork suggested that part of the inherent resistance on the part of music academics in terms of their personal contribution to the employability agenda is that it is often represented in a way that has no clear theoretical base. In presenting the theory of nascent entrepreneurship as an employability theory that directly resonates with the difference and otherness of their students, particularly the fact that music students are often starting from a different base (a fact that can be misunderstood by central careers service provision), there is an opportunity to give theoretical validity to some of the central demands for employability provision.[440]

---

[440] I have tested this approach through presenting a paper at The International Centre for Music Studies (ICMuS) research forum at Newcastle University, 25th April 2012, 'The pursuit and creation of opportunity: perspectives from a study of entrepreneurial music students in the North East of England'.

This concept of nascent entrepreneurship as it relates to university music students makes a new contribution to both pedagogical and theoretical knowledge. Whilst the core theory of nascent entrepreneurship is well theorised I have yet to discover the use of this theory within a pedagogical context, with the exception of the recent work of Zuleika Beavan, a fellow doctoral student at Manchester Metropolitan University Business school who has been studying a group of 10 graduating music students as 'Nascent Musician-Entrepreneurs'. In common with my own study, Beavan avoids the retrospective position traditionally adopted within business academia, instead presenting a real time account of this group of musicians who, whilst at university, had expressed entrepreneurial 'intent' (Beavan, 2009; 2012). There appear to be opportunities for future collaboration, making a connection between these stories of the recently graduated musician and the music student still fully immersed in university life.

The focus of the study is on the students as individuals and in positioning them as nascent entrepreneurs I have illuminated their independent activities and ways of behaving. My research has shown that there are specific key triggers that are likely to switch on entrepreneurial acts which were previously nascent, namely performance opportunity, projects and placements coupled with notions of the significance of the location or 'region' in which the students are operating to facilitate entrepreneurial thinking. In talking about 'region' we are describing the community that is a music department. If we understand students as nascent entrepreneurs, that they are entering university with a high level of potential for future entrepreneurial activity but that this needs to be acknowledged and fostered, this would appear to provide a new theoretically underpinned starting point for curricular intervention.

Communities of practice

From a theoretical perspective, this thesis has clearly positioned university music departments as creative communities of practice where the opportunities for professional development and practice are as dependent on the student members of that community as on the staff and formal curricular and central support structures. The

precise dynamics of these communities may be different, according to the setting, but all thrive on the transient nature of the student body and the particular way in which music departments interact with the wider community of musicians. Privileging one particular reading of entrepreneurship for its cultural 'fit', nascent entrepreneurship, I have argued that it is appropriate to consider a music department as an entrepreneurial community, showing evidence of the various ways in which students engage in projects and set up businesses and creative initiatives on their own terms, and in doing so, prepare themselves for future protean careers.

In presenting the concept of nascent entrepreneurship I have argued that a hitherto alien research paradigm, originating in economic, sociological and psychological business theory, can be drawn in to a different epistemology – the study of music students. The idea of a community of musicians is accepted historically and theoretically for by its nature music is collaborative. To conceive of a group of musicians as a community is not new although studies of university students as communities are more unusual. Existing studies tend to focus on individuals' developing musical abilities and career progression but tend to refer less to the way in which these groups of individuals relate to each other and the academics who teach them. A music department offers a unique fixed microcosm of a musical community (albeit a community that reaches outside itself to the wider world of music) as opposed to other more fluid musical communities who, as ethnomusicologists will often suggest, are more ephemeral, defined in a myriad of different ways by the individuals who inhabit them (Cottrell, 2004; Finnegan, 2007). What I have discovered in the course of my research is that the accepted concept of 'community' can also be used to construct a conceptual bridge to theories of business and enterprise using the Wenger's (1998) idea of 'communities of practice'.

At this point I need to reiterate my own perspective on community in this thesis. Once the theme had emerged I realised the opportunity I had to see the three very different communities through the students' eyes. This study centres on the words of the individual student respondents from which the theme of community emerged and upon which the following conclusions have been based, not on any form of anthropological study of the music departments in the study as a whole. However, in Chapter 6 'Fostering Community' I decided to present data from three field sites separately, describing the different models for creative communities and showing how the physical

location and operational structures of the students' universities directly affects the richness of the entrepreneurial environment. Here I am drawing some more generic conclusions.

Wenger's (1998) work on communities of practice, although originating in studies of an office workplace, has been widely appropriated, more recently within certain higher education contexts; for example the Higher Education Academy website offers the concept as a 'thinking tool' for engineering education. Here they offer Wenger's different forms of belonging to a community of practice: engagement (doing things together), imagination (constructing an image of ourselves), or alignment (making sure our activities are aligned with those of others) and point to the additional value of the theory in conceptualising boundaries between, and collaboration across, different communities – all concepts which fit the ontology of this thesis. As far as direct connections with musicians are concerned, Bennett (2008, p. 131) makes this link in a broader discussion of the music industry within the cultural sector and Green (2002, p.16) within music education and the notion of the apprentice. Interestingly, although Wenger makes no mention of music communities in presenting his theory, he uses the analogy of 'rhythm to music' to describe the relationship of an enterprise to a community and the idea of 'a shared repertoire' – potentially (accepting that his definition of music is contestable) fine starting points for further research:

Rhythm is not random, but it is not just a constraint either. Rather it is part of the dynamism of music; coordinating the very process by which it comes into being. Extracted from the playing, it becomes fixed, sterile, and meaningless, but in the playing, it makes music interpretable, participative, and sharable. It is a constitutive resource intrinsic to the very possibility of music as shared experience. An enterprise is part of practice in the same way that rhythm is part of music. (Wenger,1998)

The potential value of this theory to future research projects was identified through my qualitative approach. I was aware that the issue of community would be part of my findings but surprised by the opportunities offered by drawing what is essentially a business construct into the microcosm of the music department. Using the transcripts to generate theory, testing my ideas with my triangulation data has allowed me to identify the significance of the students' different communities to their entrepreneurial activity. I would argue that there is an opportunity for greater understanding of this concept to underpin 'real world' and problem based learning areas of the curriculum. The three

communities of my study, although different, appear to be highly effective in terms of providing students with opportunities to become their future imagined selves and, in terms of crossing boundaries, there could be great potential in taking some of the significant features of the music student respondents' communities and developing further theory and practice in other arts related subject areas.

PART 2: PEDAGOGICAL IMPLICATIONS

Introduction

In Part 1 of my conclusion I drew together my findings on what it means to be an entrepreneurial music student with reference to two existing research paradigms (nascent entrepreneurship and communities of practice) that sit clearly outside music studies, supported by a methodological approach that positions the study as musicology. At this point I will return to the home of this thesis, the music department and its inhabitants, outlining how my interdisciplinary approach could provide a new way to conceptualise the professional development aspects of a music student's programme. Transposing my findings to a practical pedagogical context I am proposing that we can help our students understand their entrepreneurial, as well as musical identity through the core curriculum, extra-curricular activity and individual support systems by providing a pedagogical language of entrepreneurship that is acceptable to music students and their teachers. I will show how, in line with the pedagogic imperatives of the project, there have been some early effects on the curriculum and individual students which can be built upon theoretically and practically in the future.

Community

The student community

As I worked through the transcripts it became clear, in contrast with many entrepreneurial students from different subject areas with whom I have worked in the past and observed in my placements in the enterprise centre, that music students rarely work alone. As is the case with professional musicians, these music students are members of multiple communities of practice within which membership of 'the band' or 'ensemble' has been highly significant since an early age and their ability to engage in entrepreneurial behaviour is directly related to membership of these groups. In my opinion there are new ways in which we might make use of these existing groups of enterprising students within a learning context. Rather than depending upon the traditional input from visiting speakers (who are often, by virtue of the staffs' own networks, long established in the industry, or well-known artists visiting the region), we

might look at other mechanisms which facilitate greater involvement of the less naturally entrepreneurial students in these ventures – a kind of internal alumni. I have tested this approach in my own teaching, constructing student project teams extremely carefully, based on my knowledge of the students' activities, skills, interests and course and setting a real world task that is new to all of them. There is often initial resistance but as the year progresses the teams frequently lead to new friendships and ideas for future entrepreneurial ventures.

The valuing of collaboration and co-operation over competition was striking amongst the respondents and might explain why there is often a low take-up of central enterprise support by this group where much of the inducement to participate in entrepreneurial activity is framed in competitive terms – indeed presented as actual competitions. In promoting opportunities to students I have consistently found phrases such as 'work with other students' to be highly effective whereas 'enter a competition' has drawn little response. As I have shown, in their entrepreneurial ventures the respondents consistently prioritise creativity over and above economic necessity and although their opportunity seeking may be highly strategic and driven by career aspiration it could not be described as opportunistic. Allied to this, networking has a very specific meaning in the context of university music students; closely connected with collaboration and exchange rather than marketing and promotion. I would argue that if handled correctly this collaborative form of entrepreneurship, often evident in individuals running social enterprises, provides a unique way for a music department to operate – the students themselves creating opportunities for each other.

The Faculty

Apart from meetings with staff referred to in the thesis, the views of music academics do not feature in this research; a deliberate decision taken to ensure that my research reflects the student voice, rather than the staffs' beliefs about students, at all times. However, in drawing conclusions on music departments as communities it is essential to acknowledge the role of the music academic within this, most importantly because they represent the semi-permanent inhabitants of the community and as such counteract the transient nature of the student body. My thesis has shown that the most important student mentors, in terms of personal professional development and career decision making, tend to be: individual lecturers who students like, trust and value; parents

(particularly those who are themselves musicians); instrumental tutors. Less significant are personal tutors and central advice services. The academic staff provide an important link between the community of students and internal and external opportunities, acting as both gate keepers and facilitators. The student respondents often referred to how they had been pointed towards an opportunity by a member of staff with whom they had established a close relationship. Correspondingly, members of the enterprise team, in my meetings with them on placement, frequently emphasised the importance of a having a 'champion' among the academic staff.

Whilst the central careers teams describe their close contacts on the academic staff team as 'champions' the staff concerned may be more uncomfortable with the term. It is certainly the case that as Gnyawali and Fogel (1994) suggest, individuals (in this case music students) are more likely to start a business if entrepreneurship is valued by the society in which they operate (the music department) but in the data from my student respondents, and other focus groups, it appears that this is not a simple matter of blanket endorsement. As the students discuss their involvement in various projects and experiences they have revealed a particular kind of advocacy and patronage at work within their communities. Given how issues on inclusivity and equality are central to the ethos of universities these are prickly terms to confront but I would argue that there is a potential dichotomy between the support for entrepreneurial projects and equality of opportunity, particularly where funding is involved. In my own role, where I frequently manage funds for student projects I am a participant in this process. Although ethically publicised to all students it is often the case that I will also talk directly to colleagues about such funds and they will respond by pointing towards those, who in their view, are particularly deserving students. Because of the smaller numbers, closer relationships with staff and relevant research interests, the students are quite often postgraduates. Additionally, academic staff will often contact me initially on behalf of one of their students who might be looking for funding to extend their work in some way such as; setting up an event, producing a CD or creating a website. It appears that individual relationships with members of faculty who have inspired them and mutual support provided by that member of staff can be powerful contributors to entrepreneurial, as well as academic, success. Exchange, advocacy and patronage have historically formed part of the working musician's life and it might be that a deeper understanding and more

honest acknowledgement of these processes as they exist in a music department could be used to inform the various formal mentoring schemes already in place.

Core Curriculum

My research has shown how, in spite of the growing pedagogical requirement for the provision of enterprise and entrepreneurial education within universities as outlined by the QAA (Great Britain, 2012) there are still barriers to students accessing centrally provided generic opportunities. However, similar activities, if presented as part of the music department, or validated by staff as we have seen above, are more likely to be embraced by the students. Given that the context in which interventions related to entrepreneurial learning appear to be key there appears to be an opportunity to consider the way in which some areas of the core curriculum may be appropriate places through which to enhance entrepreneurial skills: ethnomusicology; performance; music history; cultural and critical studies; independent research projects.

Ethnomusicology and entrepreneurial learning

Ethnomusicology is a core subject at both the Civic and Collegiate universities, both having world-renowned ethnomusicologists on the academic staff. As we have seen, the community in which the students operate affects their entrepreneurial behaviour. There is an opportunity to extend existing practice in providing students with the tools and the theoretical background to carry out ethnomusicology at home, practising the techniques of fieldwork whilst at the same time gaining an in-depth knowledge of the lives and activities of musicians in their department outside their usual friendship groups. This would provide a structured stimulus to networking, collaboration and entrepreneurial activity. Within ethnomusicology modules, students are traditionally asked to practise some of the key skills of ethnography, recording and transcribing, writing reflectively and producing case studies. This work could be captured and used to build a repository of data which could also be valuable in the teaching of enterprise and entrepreneurship. I am not proposing that established ethnomusicology modules be colonised by such activities but that tutors may just introduce students to the idea of transposing ethnomusicological techniques more widely across their curricula and extra-curricular activities. Within existing modules related to arts administration or music enterprise lecturers could explicitly harness processes from ethnomusicology in setting tasks, for

example extending the knowledge gained from visiting speakers by asking students to construct detailed case studies or sending students out on projects to observe music settings that have relevance for their own potential enterprises. Understanding the field, interviewing respondents and engaging in reciprocity can in turn inform market research, networking and collaboration.

Performance and entrepreneurial education

Whereas ethnomusicology can help students to understand their own community, performance can help students to build confidence in themselves as entrepreneurs. As we have seen, as performers and developers of performances student musicians have specific innate qualities that relate closely to entrepreneurship; for example there appears to be a mental advantage held by musicians in terms of problem solving and the ability to 'tune into' problem-solving tasks more quickly than others (Davidson, 2002, p.90). Within the curriculum, performance naturally offers established pedagogical structures of 'real world experience' and 'problem based learning' both for actual performing students and the business activities which surround the putting on of an event. For music students the opportunity to perform themselves or create a performance opportunity for others appears to be a major incentive to engage entrepreneurial activity. Over the years I have run a module where students are required to work in teams to organise an event; a huge proportion of the events are based around a performance, even though the students are not allowed to perform themselves. Also, many of the student project funding initiatives I have been involved in have been associated with performance. If performance is a major driver we need to acknowledge this more explicitly in the delivery of entrepreneurship teaching and not just rely upon the most enterprising students seeking out extra-curricular opportunities, as has tended to be the case with the student respondents. Performances provide a secure scaffolding for the teaching of entrepreneurial skills and I would argue for a move away from a reliance on entirely problem based learning perpetuated in some contexts and for the direct input of more hard skills presented through the use of appropriate language: customers/audience; product/project; costs/funding; premises/venues.

Music history and entrepreneurial learning

Over the past three years I have drawn upon my own business history approach, with which I introduced the thesis, and in the spirit of research led teaching, I have presented my music enterprise students with a historical perspective of the musician as entrepreneur using Weber (2004). I have set a reflective reading task based on this text followed by an assessed essay assignment and found that my students, like Kathryn, have responded well when being asked to discuss entrepreneurship within a different context.[441]

> There are many similarities in the working practices of the musician today and the musicians of the 18th and 19th centuries, much more than I realised before. By looking back we can see that musicians have always been entrepreneurs and opportunists and that this is something musicians should be proud of and not dismiss. (Kathryn, extract from portfolio, 2010)

This presenting of a historical perspective almost seems to give students permission to engage with the concept and reflect back on their own position as musicians. It is rare for a historical perspective to be used in enterprise modules and this shows how a breaking down of barriers between the sub-disciplines of the music department can be of pedagogical benefit. There could be further opportunities here to connect with music history staff, possibly inviting them to provide one-off lectures within an enterprise module. Much of the entrepreneurship teaching in business schools is based around case study. Historical texts can be used in place of case study – the use of the long view is highly relevant, particularly in illustrating the lives of average working musicians rather than using contemporary examples drawn from the lives of the most famous stars. By offering a historical context, students can be provided with an acceptable language of entrepreneurship.

Cultural and critical studies and entrepreneurial learning

Within the individual interviews that underpin my findings I have discovered that the students, in describing their entrepreneurial activities, engage in a running critique of themselves as entrepreneurs. As I observed in the training sessions in the enterprise team, the issue of values and ethics when discussing business ideas is raised as an important part of the planning of any business – even if the morals behind the process

---

[441] Approximately 100 students have completed this assignment to date.

itself may have become a little clouded with the growing need for businesses to demonstrate their ethical credentials (particularly from a environmental and social aspect) as part of their overall business strategy. A more explicit drawing upon the critical and cultural theory, that forms a compulsory part of most music degrees, would enrich the enterprise curriculum and could be used to help students understand their own entrepreneurial identity. There is an established body of work on the female entrepreneur, particularly in relation to small businesses and feminist theory which could usefully be introduced. Marxism and ideas of forms of capital, as mentioned earlier, should arguably also be included in the teaching of entrepreneurship to music students. Most importantly, critical theory could help students to make important conceptual connections between their academic course and professional practice and deconstruct the standard university enterprise offering.

Research projects and entrepreneurial learning

Within the music curriculum it is often the opportunity to write a dissertation or thesis that some students will use to investigate an area of personal interest that informs career decision-making and in some cases this is linked directly to an entrepreneurial project. In my experience, such research, particularly with undergraduates, can be difficult to supervise. In the case of two of the student respondents their entrepreneurial absorption in the project detracted completely from the academic task in hand and in one case, although there was fruitful business activity, academically the assessed written aspect of the dissertation received a low mark. If we accept that it is appropriate for students to carry out entrepreneurial projects I would suggest that those involved in supervision need a clear theoretical understanding of entrepreneurship. This is not to suggest that all music colleagues need to engage with an alien research field but there could be value in establishing a pool of interested and suitable supervisors. At the Civic University over the past three years there have been a number of students requesting supervision for business based projects who were unable to be supervised. An entrepreneurial project, supervised well, can form the basis of rigorous research whilst at the same time forming part of an individual's transition out of university.

Research-led teaching

Research led teaching has become accepted practice within all universities in recent years but it would be fair to say, based on my core and triangulation data and experience in the field, that practice based modules, in particular those related to enterprise and employability within specific subject areas, tend not to draw directly on the research practice of those delivering them for several structural reasons. Firstly, a substantial amount of delivery is carried out by non-academic members of staff, sometimes referred to as 'pracademics', meaning individuals who both practice an activity and teach it. Examples would be a business owner who does some teaching on a small business module within the local university or a visiting musician running a workshop for students in a music department. It is likely that such individuals will not have a strong research profile. Correspondingly, the academic within a department tasked with running an enterprise module will often regard this as peripheral to their main research field and will run the module from a very practical basis making use of bought in expertise; possibly from the central enterprise centre. The exception to this is the business school, although arguably expertise in theories of entrepreneurship, as suggested by Gibb (2005), has caused a conceptual confusion in terms of teaching 'about' or 'for' entrepreneurship.

My own research, new to a music department, has offered an opportunity to write and deliver a new assessed module entitled Music Enterprise where practical entrepreneurial project activity is underpinned by theories of entrepreneurship, introducing a set of new concepts to music students. The development and delivery of the module has also fed directly back into my research, the students being regularly consulted as part of the triangulation process. Interestingly, two or three students each year have moved on to various masters degrees related to enterprise and the creative arts as a direct result of completing this undergraduate module. The success of this module seems to be primarily to do with the structure of delivery. Students seem to value delivery by a lecturer from within the subject area but within a small music department it is rare to find academics willing to take on this field of work. The practical way forward for research led teaching may be through joint research projects involving both enterprise staff and music academics.

An AHRC project

At the end of 2012, as a direct result of my doctoral study, I successfully won AHRC[442] funding to lead a collaborative student project related to the theme of Entrepreneurship and the Creative Economy:

'Speaking the Same Language' is an interdisciplinary training project which aims to develop new partnerships between staff and students at the universities of Durham, Newcastle and Queen's Belfast. The project will foster dialogue and knowledge exchange about enterprise and entrepreneurship between postgraduate English and Music students, a group of students who tend not to opt for traditional modes of business/ enterprise training.

The project will design and deliver a one-day intensive, interactive workshop for 30 students aimed at enhancing enterprising and entrepreneurial awareness. Taking on board the importance of using the right language when discussing entrepreneurship in a creative context, a small group of Student Facilitators will work alongside an experienced Arts Practitioner to develop and co-deliver the workshop.

In the long term it is hoped that this pool of students will be equipped not only in terms of their own enhanced entrepreneurial skills but additionally, in the case of the Student Facilitators, that they will contribute to future training initiatives and through speaking the same language as their subject peers, will enhance the potential for the launch of future creative businesses in North East England and Northern Ireland.

(Bid summary by Dawn Weatherston, October 2012)

Following an initial meeting with fellow PhD students at Newcastle and Queen's Belfast Universities, both with interests in entrepreneurship and the arts, we agreed that the language used to discuss entrepreneurship in a creative context is key and that the bid should be based around this idea. The act of transposing my findings into a formal bid case for support[443] further synthesized my own thinking on the importance of the language used and as our planning meetings have progressed, as a team we have started to produce a glossary of new terms. The new contacts facilitated by this project, particularly with the fellow PhD student based at Newcastle who (acknowledging my own preceding work) is carrying out an ethnographic study of all aspects of entrepreneurial activity in her own English department, hold potential for a new research group. The project will initially act as a conduit for practical action with students based on my findings and the early findings of the fellow PhD students but

---

[442] Arts and Humanities Research Council, Collaborative Skills Development Award – Student Led.
[443] See Appendix 9: AHRC project case for support.

could also provide the basis for future interdisciplinary/inter-institutional [444] collaborative research and dissemination.

A model for student projects

Part of the remit for the AHRC project arose from the identified difficulty of getting music students to independently sign up to enterprise support and training in the absence of direct signposting by a trusted advocate or patron. Although enterprise centres described to me the care taken in targeting provision to different groups of students they also reported on numerous cases where workshops for 'creative' subjects were poorly attended, on many occasions students had registered but subsequently not turned up on the day. As my findings emerged they started to inform my approach to setting up student opportunities. As we have seen, these students are autonomous and creative and will often be driven towards entrepreneurial activity by a desire to perform or facilitate performance opportunities for fellow students and, mirroring the wider world of arts funding, I began to experiment with new ways of engaging the students in extra-curricular activity. Circumventing the traditional prescriptive model, with the help of funding from the CETL project, I set up the CETL Student Project Fund[445], asking students to bid for funding, the only limits set were those that I had learned would sit well with the values of the students and the remit of the universities: the projects should be of benefit to the wider community and involve other students. Funding awarded was between two and five hundred pounds. Aware of the danger of creating a local support system that could negate the central expertise of the enterprise teams, the students were also asked to go through the process of applying for matched funding from one of the various central funds available through careers and enterprise services and in doing so, they forged new relationships with the support services on their own terms.

To frame an opportunity as a funding bid appears to draw music students in in a way that a business competition does not (although several of the projects did subsequently go on to win recognition through a university award). The funded projects have subsequently helped to build the music department communities and have led to a

---

[444] There is an existing Newcastle, Durham, Queen's consortium submitting a large institutional bid relating to Entrepreneurship and the Creative Economy which will reference the 'Speaking the Same Language' project.

[445] See examples of student funded projects at http://www.cetl4musicne.ac.uk/studentarchive.html

strengthening of alumni relationships with one project alumni of the Civic University now acting as consultant to the aforementioned AHRC project. It is important to acknowledge that, for logistical reasons, the bulk of this activity has taken place at my own institution but that this has provided a model for working with music students which could in the future be expanded across the other universities in the study, establishing the department as patron.

Pastoral support and entrepreneurial learning

The student respondents talked about how some of the inspiration and support for their entrepreneurial activity came from individual members of staff, although these were not necessarily their allocated personal tutors. As expressed by some of the respondents, students can be intimidated by the tutorial system with its dual association with progression and personal problems of various kinds. Reflecting on my relationship with the student respondents I would suggest a different form of pastoral support might be more appropriate in some situations. It may well be that the allocated personal tutor may not be best placed, or see it as their role to provide support for intended musician entrepreneurs. At the same time, I have shown how students place high value on support that is offered from within the department. Student respondents commented on how participation in the research had given them space to talk about themselves and their activities in more depth than they had ever done before, suggesting that we may need to look at developing structures to facilitate this, but this is not to deny the value of what already exists in the three field sites. At the Vocational University students automatically had close support from tutors given the small numbers of students on the courses. We saw how the Collegiate University has strong support and mentoring systems within the colleges themselves but this is not subject specific. At the Civic University structured support for entrepreneurial activity was extremely variable within the department itself although, once correctly signposted, students had access to excellent support outside the department. In discussing pastoral support we return back to some of the central issues raised at the start of the thesis – that some staff may not see this as their role and actively resist any attempt to facilitate them to deal with this. However, some small structural changes to, and awareness of, referral mechanisms

within music departments could mean that nascent student entrepreneurs may receive initial support at a crucial point in their entrepreneurial development.

New students

In 2006, prior to the start of the doctorate together with two other colleagues, I distributed a qualitative questionnaire which was given to all new music students at my own institution. We felt that we needed to audit students to gain a deeper understanding of what they were bringing with them as they entered the university; usually, as their lecturers, we know little more than their name and, possibly 'A' Level entry grades. The aim was to get a much more detailed picture of how students felt at this significant point in their lives. We asked the students about their background, career aspirations, how they felt about the application procedure, induction and their first couple of weeks at university. A wealth of data was obtained which has subsequently informed curriculum planning in areas such as induction. On revisiting the raw data from this survey as part of my triangulation, it is clear that there would be value in repeating this exercise to include specific questions about existing enterprising activities pre-dating university entry. Given the recent foregrounding of enterprise within schools, both secondary and primary, it is likely that new students may now more readily understand a carefully worded question related to the concept within a questionnaire.

Central support for careers and enterprise

Careers and enterprise centres have a strong presence within universities and as student and parental demand focuses increasingly on the vocational value of degrees it is likely that universities will respond by further strengthening these central services. These centres are no longer peripheral, offering only the icing on the cake of the core curriculum, they are serious contributors to the taught programmes of many departments. However, what has emerged from my research has been a schism between these departments and music students, unless there is some kind of direct person-to-person referral involved or, where students are taught by a member of one of these teams. At the Vocational University there was virtually no contact with the central careers team, understandably as it is based at the validating university 10 miles away. Although this was compensated for, to some extent, by the high levels of staff attention, as mentioned above, there were evident gaps in the students' vocational awareness.

This thesis has shown how music students have specific needs. As part of the triangulation process I used the open question 'ideally what would you like to be doing three years after graduation' in questionnaires that have covered over 300 students from universities in the North East and, in common with the envisaged futures of the students in the study, it is the absolute exception for a student to describe a future that does not involve working in music in some form. We have seen how the student respondents exhibited a high degree of certainty about their future career; a sense of destiny to be a musician allied to a personal sense of responsibility and autonomy and an early engagement with shift-shaping, protean careers blurring traditional notions of the transition from university student to working graduate and exhibiting the characteristics of a nascent entrepreneur. At a particular stage in a music student's development, they might be tuned to developing entrepreneurial projects which will ultimately support them in their desire to be professional performing musicians – this suggests that a different kind of careers service provision might be needed, not based on the stage or year of the student but based on an assumption that interventions may be needed at any point in a music student's university career; the key is for students to know how to access support when they need it.

Although it appeared from the perspective of the student respondents that the enterprise centres were very differently constructed within the three field sites, as my field research progressed I decided that I needed to test my thoughts and findings more thoroughly with the delivery staff and set up a meeting with a director and senior development officer of the centre at the Civic University to present and discuss my findings.[446] In re-visiting and analysing the transcript it is evident that, as is the case with the distinct discipline areas above, the central support services in universities hold great resources which may not be worked hard enough by music departments and that, contrary to the opinion often expressed by students and academic staff, the ethos of the enterprise teams has natural synergies with a music department in a way that mainstream careers provision may not. Garth (Director) sees traditional models of careers as being about 'delivering a service' as opposed to the enterprise team where they are 'building a community'. Both Garth and Chloe (Development Officer) demonstrate empathy towards arts students for which such centres are often not given

---

[446] The meeting took place at the Civic University on the 9th February 2011. Names of staff have been changed to protect identity.

credit and disrupt the perception of such centres as being purely focussed on the setting up of businesses. 'We are not trying to create entrepreneurs, we are trying to create entrepreneurial people' (Garth). They see their role to be the providers of a physical (the Elevator) and emotional space where 'people can get comfy' (Chloe) and recognise, as has been evident throughout this study, the importance of 'someone taking an interest' (Chloe) and that 'you have got to build one-to-one trust and rapport' (Garth).

In terms of pedagogy that is associated with curriculum development and support there appears to be an opportunity to consider a re-positioning in relation to music students. Traditionally the careers advisers are often the gatekeepers to the academic departments, leading the way for curriculum interventions from outside. Without exception, given my long history of working in and with this field, I would say that careers advisers are driven by a desire to customise and adapt their approach, according to the discipline area to provide the best guidance for students, and this includes music students. However, even in the highly effective provision in the Civic University the issue of freelance is not given equal status to that of other destinations considered to be more worthy. Enterprise staff suggest that freelance has not yet moved beyond being seen as a secondary route by careers advisers and this can also appear to be the case in terms of the way in which student destinations are presented to potential new applicants. As fees have increased it may be that there is more security in presenting real or described examples of students who have obtained salaried, recognised posts than the more nebulous picture of the freelance, protean careers which in reality many of our students are engaged in. This partly points to a lack of confidence on the part of both academic and support staff in presenting the term; 'careers advisers don't quite get it' says Chloe whilst Garth feels that 'unless and until self-employment is acknowledged by HESA as being a graduate level destination its always going to be at best an exciting bolt on'. Both Garth and Chloe express the opinion that self–employment in terms of status, particularly as a small scale freelancer, is still not considered to be a viable graduate job whilst 'the truth is […] for some people it's a given, for some people it's a choice, for some people it's a necessity' (Garth).

Through my field research in the three music departments of my study and the wider support services at the Civic University I have discovered a wealth of existing knowledge and provision available to the entrepreneurial music student. This provision

comes from two key bases, the music departments themselves and the careers and enterprise centres but whereas this capacity is potentially strong, connections are weak. The strength of the music departments lies in the inherent transferability of skills gained in the specific subjects (as outlined above) to entrepreneurial activity; the knowledge and professional experience of the academic staff; the contact with the wider community of visiting artists. The strength of the support services lies in the generic business expertise; links to networks of support and funding; curriculum development support for academics and most importantly the availability of time to mentor students in a safe space. This disconnection is acknowledged by all sides and efforts are made to address the issue. At the Collegiate University students have recently started to set up their own careers day, inviting careers staff to participate but drawing upon their own contacts amongst the music departments' alumni as visiting speakers. At the Civic University a series of entrepreneurship forums have been set up where invited academics from across the disciplines, including music, meet with the enterprise team to discuss and exchange good practice on the delivery of entrepreneurial skills and the enterprise team are directly involved in the delivery of an enterprise module for music students. The concept of 'working the discipline' moves away from the traditional formulaic mode of professional development presentation and acknowledges the complexity in the process, potentially opening up a new form of dialogue which could inform, engage and connect academic and support staff in new ways.

Participating in the project

The activist nature of this research has opened up new conversations with the students who, over the period of the research, have been on unique journeys through their university careers. At the end of the final interviews I asked the students how the experience had been and whether they felt there had been any negative effects. The responses were unanimously positive but they also pointed towards the potential for different kinds of interventions with our students which might help both their academic and professional development. Several of the students, including John and Bella, referred to the experience as having been 'enlightening' and helpful in a counselling, therapeutic sense.

It is always quite therapeutic – just to have a conversation about me and what I want to do. I find myself saying things and finding 'oh, I didn't really realise I thought that. It's always quite enlightening really.[447]

I thought it was a cool thing. To sit here, to recap and pull things together, to have little light bulbs come on about why things have happened –I just don't talk about myself, it's really been enlightening.[448]

I'm not a talkative person but somehow you got me to talk.[449]

They described how they had rarely had the opportunity to talk about themselves in depth in a professional context and that the process had increased their confidence: 'I was flattered first of all to be asked' says Anna.[450] Both Anna and Maria describe how they have always found it difficult to talk about themselves, that the project has forced them to and has directly contributed to their confidence in applying for jobs: 'It's been very confidence building, it makes you think 'I'm quite good, I do all those things.'[451]

The students found that the term 'entrepreneur' offered them a new way in which to conceptualise their professional practice:

When you first interviewed me I thought that's definitely not me, I'm not an entrepreneurial type at all and I would still not call myself an entrepreneur but I definitely thought when I was in India - I must remember this and that to tell Dawn and then hang on, I am starting a music course with somebody.[452]

When you came along saying entrepreneurship I really thought 'what is it?' I didn't really have a clue and talking about it I've thought well actually I do have the skills – just the word entrepreneurship shadowed what I thought it was – it's been quite eye opening for me.[453]

Aside from the personal effects on the respondents, for both Bella and Maria, participating in a qualitative research project informed their academic practice:

Being part of a research based study gave me experience of it before doing my dissertation – before I would have felt more anxious about doing something that was so research based if I had not had the experience of participating in a study like this.[454]

These responses raise questions about the current nature of on-to-one provision for music students. It can be argued that to provide this level of attention to all students is

[447] John 3
[448] Bella 3
[449] Jo 3
[450] Anna 3
[451] Maria 3
[452] Jo 3
[453] Lara 3
[454] Maria 3

logistically impossible, however in total I spent between three and four hours with each of them – possibly not unrealistic provision within the context of a three or four year degree programme? As I talked to the students it seemed to me that what they were sharing was close to the kind reflective practice we expect them to engage with when completing personal development portfolios but which they appeared to value far more highly. We encourage them to engage in extra-curricular activity but who actually listens to them and talks to them about what they are doing? Would it be helpful for tutors to understand more about the lives of their students? Is it possible to create a space within the music curriculum for students to have these kinds of conversations that fall outside the usual remit of the tutorial? Such interventions would make new demands on academic staff who may not have any formal training in the interviewing and counselling skills required to have extended discussions with students at this different level.

Finale

In this thesis I have turned the lens of entrepreneurship in a new direction, focussing in on the lives of a small group of highly active music students studying and working in the most northern cities of England. I have shown how the construct of the music student as entrepreneur can offer us a way in which to both understand and work with students within university music departments. As is the nature of such an interdisciplinary study, there are multiple potential directions for future research, both pedagogical and theoretical.

Pedagogically there is the opportunity to use this established methodology to carry out further small-scale studies in different locations, for example within other regional groups of universities or in conservatory setting, acknowledging the opportunity for change facilitated by this form of action research. Further dissemination of findings, particularly through teaching and learning channels, holds potential for developing closer links between academic music staff and careers and enterprise teams. My findings relating to individual student support also suggest the need to reconsider

existing approaches to portfolio and tutorial systems for music students which might also inform decisions about student support more generically within universities.

Theoretically, I return to the analogy of post-colonial theory in presenting a conceptual move forward. The hegemony that is government, university and business school owns and controls knowledge, funding and strategy as it relates to enterprise and entrepreneurial learning. Within this pedagogical 'state' sits the exotic location that is the music department with its othered inhabitants. This thesis has begun to deconstruct the text of entrepreneurship, demystifying power from the centre and deciphering the codes, appropriating existing theories of entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning and musicology and using them to discuss the music student as entrepreneur. In doing so the marginalised music student has been given a new voice. In postcolonial terms this thesis 'writes back to the centre' (Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin, 1989) destabilising the text of entrepreneurship and reclaiming the term for university music students and their future lives as professional musicians.

APPENDICES

Appendix 1: summary of initial findings

Royal Northern College of Music
Monday 13th June

Music Student as Entrepreneur: An ethnographic study based in the universities of the North East

'to turn what you love doing, music, into a business is actually the best and the worst thing you can do […] at the same time. People say, 'Do you ever feel like quitting?' and that is yes, it's pretty much...it's more like, 'Do you ever not feel like quitting?' because it's so hard and you have to deal with so much let down for little reward. And the only thing that keeps you going is the fact that you can't stop'

Background

- Interdisciplinary, considering the core literature of entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial learning within the context of three university music departments in the North East.

- Methodology is qualitative, ethnographic data being drawn from in-depth interviews with students, focus groups, fieldwork observation, questionnaires, students' essays and diaries. Discussions with staff and students at other selected sites will be used to triangulate the data.

Some early findings

- In considering pedagogical support for the professional development of university music students, the concept of 'entrepreneurship' appears to be more useful than that of 'employability'.

- Psychological theories of entrepreneurship, although somewhat unfashionable within business schools, resonate closely with some of the student participants ('Locus of control' - Rotter; 'NACH' and 'NAUT' – McClelland 1960's)

- More recent socio-economic theories such as 'nascent entrepreneurship' can be used to inform support initiatives e.g. using role models, understanding the influence of gender, ethnicity, cultural capital

- Students are less hostile to the term entrepreneur than I had anticipated; they are particularly receptive to a historical presentation of the concept.

- Indifferent to university wide promotions around enterprise but respond well if introduced to experts through an advocate – evidenced by action research.

- Strong themes emerging from the interviews are: a sense of difference, the need for autonomy, possession of self-confidence and self-esteem.

- Students who are behaving in an enterprising or entrepreneurial way have done so from an early age, not as a result of university support.

- Student participants have strong networks; suggests further work on network theory and communities of practice.

Appendix 3: summary of student respondents

Student	Site	Gender	Degree course
1	Civic University	M	BMus Popular and Contemporary
2	Civic University	M	BMus Popular and Contemporary
3	Civic University	M	BMus
4	Civic University	F	MA
5	Civic University	M	MMus
6	Civic University	F	PhD
7	Collegiate University	M	BA
8	Collegiate University	F	BA
9	Collegiate University	F	BA
10	Collegiate University	F	MA
11	Collegiate University	M	MBA (previously BMus at Vocational University)
12	Vocational University	F	BMus Jazz, Popular and Commercial
13	Vocational University	M	BMus Jazz, Popular and Commercial
14	Vocational University	M	BMus Jazz, Popular and Commercial
15	Vocational University	F	BA Community Music
16	Vocational University	M	BA Community Music

Appendix 4: research ethics documentation

Research ethics approval request

Researcher: Dawn Weatherston

Programme: PhD Music

Year of study: Year 2 (2 years P/T study completed)

Date of request: January 2011

Working title: Music student as entrepreneur: An ethnographic study based in the universities of the North East

Background

- PhD **originates** from the CETL for Music and Inclusivity Working in Music project aimed at "the cultivation of entrepreneurial skills for self- managed careers"[455].

- The **aim** of this research is; to gain new insights into how music students selectively engage within initiatives related to entrepreneurship; to find a way to make sense of these findings within the context of existing research relating to entrepreneurship and music.

- **Research questions:**

  Do music students exhibit innate entrepreneurial tendencies?

  How do music students envisage their future life- worlds as working musicians?

  How do communities of music students connect with university enterprise initiatives?

- **Cross-disciplinary;** music, business, employability and entrepreneurship. This study will concentrate on the specific case of *music students in universities*.

- **Methodology** is ethnographic, case focussed, conferring validity on a small sample and, most importantly, the research will be inductive, identifying the area for investigation but not attempting to prove a pre – established hypothesis.

---

[455] CETL bid document

Proposed fieldwork

- Fieldwork will primarily take place within music departments and enterprise centres across the universities of the North East[456] and The Sage Gateshead, with some additional research at Leeds College of Music and The Royal Northern College of Music.

- Field data will be drawn from:
    - observation of interviews, meetings and events
    - in-depth interviews with staff and students (taped and transcribed)
    - questionnaires
    - analysis of students' written portfolios

Consent procedures

- All subjects involved in one-to-one interviews or observations, whether audio taped or not, will be given an information sheet (above) and be required to give written consent.

- In spaces where general observation of processes, traffic, interactions is taking place, any individual entering the space will be informed verbally of the researcher's presence and, should they express concern, the observation will stop.

.

Confidentiality

- All data will be anonymised and although absolute anonymity cannot be guaranteed, confidentiality will be respected at all times.

- Written consent will be obtained. Participants will be re- consulted should the need arise to expand usage of data.

- Normally, data (transcripts, audio tapes, questionnaires and other written material) will be stored at researcher's home, not on shared university drives.

Documentation

Participants will be clearly informed throughout with customised documentation. See attached examples of documentation.

---

[456] Newcastle, Durham, Sunderland, Northumbria, Teesside, jointly referred to as U4NE

EXAMPLE 1

(Newcastle University Careers Service fieldwork placement
2nd – 9th February 2011 and 14th - 18th March 2011)

Research ethics checklist (based on Newcastle University Ethics Committee documentation)

1. Is this a valid research project?

a) Peer review- supervisor, internal, external
PhD project supervised externally by Professor Bennett Zon and Dr Simon Mills, Durham University Music Department.

b) Clear aims and objectives
Aim – to gain new insights into how students engage with university initiatives related to enterprise and entrepreneurship.

Objectives – to a complete two week fieldwork placement; to observe the day-to day workings of the Rise Up team; talk to individual students using the service; interview staff across the EDU (Entrepreneurial Development Unit); participate in meetings and events as deemed appropriate.

c) Feasible (practical, time, skills of researcher)
Researcher is already familiar with the fieldwork site and will need limited induction. Researchers own background as a Careers Adviser facilitates an immediate empathy with staff and students. Researcher is also an experienced interviewer.

d) Consistent with the aims and ideals of the university
Research led pedagogical practice; interdepartmental collaboration; reflective sharing of good practice; student centred study.

2. Risk assessment
a) potential harms: participants/ researcher/ environment
- Staff may feel they are being monitored, may be uncomfortable being observed
- Students may be confused by the observer's presence
- There could be confidentiality issues regarding business discussions
- Researcher may feel under pressure to present data in a particular way

All the above will be addressed by the researcher through ongoing dialogue with all staff involved, clear available written information about the research for all participants and rigorous use of consent documentation.

b) complaints procedure
Participants will be encouraged to talk directly to the researcher about any concerns in the first instance; they can withdraw from the project at any time and have any data relating to them destroyed. In the event of a serious complaint, participants should contact Nick Keeley, Head of Careers.

3. Researcher safety
a) Training
Ethics training has been completed in preparation for entering the field. Brief health and safety, fire drill information should be provided at the start of the placement. No further specific training is necessary as research is taking place within the researcher's normal workplace.

b) Experience
Researcher is an experienced interviewer and works in a university environment with staff, students and external stakeholders on a daily basis.

c) Lone worker/researcher strategies
No safety issues related to this, researcher will be working on university premises throughout.

d) Risk assessment for researcher
 Low safety risk, researcher will be working in her normal workplace environment.

4. Subject/ participant recruitment strategy (for participants)
a) Who is the researcher seeking to recruit?
Students, EDU staff, visiting business advisers, graduates, mentors.

b) How will they gain access to and approach participants?
By requesting directly once in the field, for example as students drop in to the Rise up team. Where possible, interviews with staff and visiting support staff will be set up in advance.

c) By what process – direct approach, via gatekeeper etc.
I most cases via a gatekeeper from the EDU team. In the drop-in centre this may take the form of an introduction and explanation of the researcher's presence. With external staff, the EDU team will introduce the researcher -the researcher can then negotiate arrangements from that point on. Many interactions will be more intuitive and spontaneous but at no point covert – subjects will be clear about the researcher's presence at all times.

5. Consent procedures
a) Information for subjects/ participants- including who is sponsoring/ funding the research, who is supervising and to whom participants can complain or raise concerns.
See attached documentation.

b) Consent procedures- form of consent (implied, verbal, written), description of process and documentation.
Written - all subjects involved in one-to-one interviews or observations, whether audio taped or not, will be given an information sheet (above) and be required to give written consent.

Verbal - in spaces where general observation of processes, traffic, interactions is taking place, any individual entering the space will be informed verbally of the researcher's presence and, should they express concern, the observation will stop. Implied – the agreement of the Careers management team to my presence in the department will be taken as implied consent to gather data of a non personal nature e.g. descriptions of the environment, observations of drop-in traffic, web based research.

6. Confidentiality
a) Information to participants (confidential or anonymous – level of anonymity)
All data will be anonymised and although absolute anonymity cannot be guaranteed, confidentiality will be respected at all times.

b) Consent re data management, retention, further use etc
Written consent will be obtained. Participants will be re- consulted should the need arise to expand usage of data.

c) Storage/ management of data
Normally, data will be stored at researcher's home, not on shared university drives.

EXAMPLE 2

(Briefing sheet on fieldwork taking place in the Newcastle University Careers Service Entrepreneurial Development Unit, February and March 2011 – to be handed to all participants)

Researcher: Dawn Weatherston   d.e.weatherston@ncl.ac.uk

Supervisors: Prof Bennett Zon and Dr Simon Mills, Durham University

PhD working title: Music student as entrepreneur: An ethnographic study based in the universities of the North East

Background

- PhD is **HEFCE funded**, originating from the CETL for Music and Inclusivity Working in Music project aimed at "the cultivation of entrepreneurial skills for self- managed careers"[457].

- The **aim** of this research is; to gain new insights into how music students selectively engage within initiatives related to entrepreneurship; to find a way to make sense of these findings within the context of existing research relating to entrepreneurship and music.

- **Cross disciplinary;** music, business, employability and entrepreneurship. This study will concentrate on the specific case of *music students in universities*.

- **Research questions:**

  Do music students exhibit innate entrepreneurial tendencies?

  How do music students envisage their future life- worlds as working musicians?

  How do communities of music students connect with university enterprise initiatives?

- **Methodology** is ethnographic, case focussed; conferring validity on a small sample and, most importantly, the research will be inductive, identifying the area for investigation but not attempting to prove a pre – established hypothesis.

- **Ethics:** research has ethical clearance from Durham University.

Should you have any questions regarding this research please feel free to contact the researcher.

Should you have any concerns or complaints relating to this research please contact the Director of Careers, Nick Keeley.

---

[457] CETL bid document

EXAMPLE 3

(Letter to students participating in taped/ transcribed interviews)

Dear Robert,

Dawn Weatherston – Doctoral research project

Thank you for volunteering to participate in my doctoral research project. I greatly appreciate your support for this in-depth study, which I hope will contribute to existing knowledge about music students and the concept of the music student as entrepreneur.

I would like carry out three in-depth interviews with you over the course of this academic year. The interviews will be open-ended; whilst I will have identified a number of themes for discussion I will be using a non-directive approach.

I hope participation in the project will be a positive experience for you. I will acknowledge your contribution in all research reports and presentations, which in turn you may wish to refer to in your own CV.

You will be asked to sign a permission statement authorising your views to be quoted.

If you have any concerns or questions about the project at any stage please do not hesitate to say.

Dawn Weatherston

Teaching Fellow in Music Entrepreneurship (Newcastle University)
Durham PhD Fellow

EXAMPLE 4

(permission statement)

Dawn Weatherston – Doctoral research project

Dawn has told me about her Doctoral research project which aims to contribute to existing knowledge about music students and the concept of entrepreneurship.

I give permission for my views to be recorded and to be used in publications from the research project and I understand that they will not be used for any other purposes.

When my statements are quoted in research papers I would like (circle one):

- to be quoted by name

- to be quoted by pseudonym, rather than my real name

- to be quoted anonymously

This permission includes (circle all that apply):

- quoted words

- voice recording

- photograph

Signed

Name

Appendix 5: example email text

Dear […],

I teach in the Music Department at Newcastle University and I am also a PhD student at Durham, in the Music Department. […] is one of my Durham supervisors and he suggested I contact you...

The working title for my thesis is 'Music student as entrepreneur: an ethnographic study based in the universities of the North East of England. I am trying to find out more about:

- Whether music students exhibit innate entrepreneurial tendencies
- How music students envisage their future life-worlds as working musicians
- How communities of music students connect with university enterprise initiatives

As part of my fieldwork I intend to carry out some in-depth case study work and was wondering whether you might consider being one of my case studies? This would involve me interviewing you in depth two or three times over the course of this academic year. Interviews would be recorded, transcribed and subsequently analysed by me. Absolute confidentiality would be assured at every stage. I have full support from the Heads of Music and Research at Durham and Newcastle and all of my research will be subject to formal ethical clearance by Durham University.

This is very much just an initial enquiry, please do not feel under any obligation to participate - but, if you would like to take part, let me know and I will arrange for us to meet and discuss my request in more detail once you have returned from the Christmas break.

Best wishes,

Dawn

Dawn Weatherston
Teaching Fellow in Music and Entrepreneurship

tel: +44(0) 191 2223844

http://www.ncl.ac.uk/sacs/staff/profile/d.e.weatherston

Appendix 6: record of individual interviews

Name	Interview 1	Interview 2	Interview 3
Andrew	8/12/10		
Anna	25/1/11	24/5/11	31/10/11
Bella	17/12/10	23/5/11	13/1/12
Dan	21/10/11	5/7/12	
David	31/5/11	16/1/12	
Jo	21/1/11	24/5/11	15/5/12
John	8/2/11	10/5/11	30/11/11
Lara	4/5/11	16/1/12	
Lily	3/6/11	16/1/12	
Lisa	16/3/11		
Makis	9/6/11	4/11/11	
Maria	8/2/11	24/5/11	30/11/11
Michael	8/12/10	23/5/11	
Mack	16/1/12		
Phil	13/7/11		
Robert	6/12/10	26/5/11	

Appendix 7: music business module permission request

Research Permission

As part of an ongoing pedagogical research project into Music Students and Entrepreneurship, I would like to request your permission to be able to report on issues raised by you and your fellow students over the course of the Music Business module. This research will help us find out much more about the way in which music students learn and to develop the curriculum to support individual professional development needs.

Permission includes the use of quoted words from sessions or from assignments, recordings and photographs. All quotations will be completely anonymised – in most cases it will not even be possible to identify the institution as Newcastle University. Material will be used exclusively in publications related to the research project.

If you have any concerns about this or would just like further clarification please email me at the start of the programme. Otherwise, I will assume your consent and thank you in advance for contributing to this research.

d.e.weatherston@ncl.ac.uk

Appendix 8: triangulation questionnaire, emerging themes

Music Business Module 3095 - Newcastle University
26th October 2010

DATA FROM THIS QUESTIONNAIRE WILL BE USED TO INFORM RESEARCH INTO 'MUSIC STUDENTS AND ENTREPRENEURSHIP' AND WILL CONTRIBUTE TO THE PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT SUPPORT PROGRAMME FOR ALL MUSIC STUDENTS AT NEWCASTLE UNIVERSITY.

THIS QUESTIONNAIRE IS COMPLETELY ANONYMOUS

Part 1 - Please circle a number to indicate how closely you agree or disagree with each of the following statements:

1. I will always take the initiative in a given situation

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

2. I solve problems creatively

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

3. I am good at managing things autonomously

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

4. I can maintain my own independence whilst networking and collaborating with others

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

5. I enjoy putting things together creatively

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

6. I use my judgement successfully to take calculated risks

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

7. I am ambitious and achievement orientated

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

8. I am self-confident and have high self-esteem

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

9. I am action orientated, always busy

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

10. I have a preference for learning by doing

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

11. I possess a high level of determination

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

12. I am highly creative

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

13. I am skilled at creative problem solving

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

14. I have good negotiating skills

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

15. I possess good management skills

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

16. I am a strategic thinker

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

17. I am good at intuitive decision making in uncertain situations

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

18. I possess good networking skills

Strongly disagree   1   2   3   4   5   Strongly agree

Part 2

1. What do you understand by the term entrepreneur?

_____

_____

_____

2. Do you think you would ever describe yourself now or in the future as:

(Delete as appropriate)

An entrepreneur?   **YES/NO/POSSIBLY**

A social entrepreneur?   **YES/NO/POSSIBLY**

A creative entrepreneur?   **YES/NO/POSSIBLY**

3. If at some point in the future you were to find yourself running your own music related business, how would you like to be described?

(If you are already running a business how DO you describe yourself?)

_____

Thank you for completing this questionnaire
Dawn Weatherston

Appendix 9: AHRC project case for support

Case for support

Content of skills development package

This bid responds directly to the theme of Entrepreneurship and the Creative Economy with a focus on interdisciplinarity arising from a tripartite student partnership; a Music student from Durham, an English student from Newcastle and a student of Creative Writing and Music at Queen's Belfast. All three of the Student Organisers have established histories in the application of their academic subject to broader entrepreneurial initiatives. Taking on board that many other students within these subject areas have existing untapped expertise, the project will establish a small group of students (4) to work collaboratively with an external arts consultant to develop and co-deliver the workshop.

It tends to be more difficult to attract PGRs from the Arts and Humanities to training which is linked to enterprise or entrepreneurship, as these concepts and the associated discourses are identified with conventional business; however if students wish to achieve creative goals, pursue and enable creative practice or embark on a creative career, which may be freelance, they need to develop their enterprising and entrepreneurial skills and attributes. As researchers, seeking to be creative and make an impact, they also need to develop and apply these skills and attributes – successful PGRs need to be resourceful, able to solve problems creatively and address challenging issues in innovative ways. They also need to be equipped to take on a challenge and see it through to completion. The ability to build networks, present ideas convincingly and win support for projects and funding proposals is vital.

This project will target students from Music, English and the Digital Arts subject areas where research reveals that students are likely to be highly creative and enterprising (Weatherston, 2009 Brown 2004; DCMS, 2006)[458]. Current qualitative ethnographic fieldwork being carried out by the lead and partner students at Durham and Newcastle universities respectively is revealing some interesting synergies in the attitudes of Music and English students. Typically, many of these students are resistant to ideas of commercialisation or commodification which they associate with business, but they do respond well to the idea of using their discipline to solve societal issues, create social good or further their artistic practice. Based on this growing awareness of the attitudes of these students, those responsible for postgraduate training programmes are increasingly taking on board that PGRs in humanities departments need to be appealed to in a different way from the other faculties when it comes to the offer of enterprise training. A key issue is how to appeal to these students in a way that is relevant to them, and it appears that using the right language to discuss entrepreneurship within a creative context is key.

This project will involve the design and delivery of a one-day intensive, interactive workshop, which will take the students through a series of steps, rooted in the theoretical, but which will be extremely practical and which will develop transferable

---

[458] Brown, R. (2004) *Performing Arts Entrepreneurship*. Lancaster: Palatine
Overview, definitions of cultural entrepreneurship, approaches to teaching, examples of projects
Weatherston, D.E. (2009) 'Nascent Entrepreneurship and Music Students', in Clews,D. (ed) *Dialogues in Art and Design: Promoting and Sharing Excellence.* ADM-HEA/GLAD
Great Britain. Department for Culture, Media and Sport (2006) *Developing Entrepreneurship for the Creative Industries: The Role of Higher and Further Education.* London: DCMS

skills and enhance enterprising and entrepreneurial awareness and attributes. Materials from the day will be made available to the wider body of students and staff in the participating institutions following the event.

Unlike most skills training for PGR's, students will be involved from the start in the organisation, development and delivery of the workshop, which will then be offered to a wider group of their peers. Within the workshop, participants will engage with a creative arts practitioner, alongside the student facilitators, working on real life problems and issues from the creative economy, in an interactive and experiential learning environment, as a way of developing and enhancing their creativity, enterprise and entrepreneurial skills and attributes. They will also reflect on the implications of this learning for their research, future employment or creative enterprise.

Aims
1. To foster dialogue, knowledge exchange and co-creation of research/ knowledge between Music, English and Digital Arts Postgraduate students
2. To offer networking opportunities in order to identify interests and opportunities for future co-research and/ or entrepreneurial initiatives
3. To attract a group of students who may not normally sign up for enterprise programmes
4. To develop existing university partnerships through shared training provision, building new networks for future PGR research, training and development activities
5. To enhance potential for the launch of future creative businesses in North East England and Northern Ireland.

Objectives
1. To provide training to improve knowledge and skills in entrepreneurship through participatory arts-based practice
2. To set up an ongoing collaborative network underpinned by mentoring, initially by an experienced arts practitioner and subsequently by a developing pool of student mentors.
3. To stimulate discussion about the entrepreneurial mind-set and its relation to creative practice
4. To offer the opportunity for students to work with an experienced practitioner to develop and assist in the delivery of a workshop training day
5. To provide a workshop where participants will work on a real life case study from the creative sector
6. To disseminate the event via the web and university Teaching and Learning conferences.

Programme Management

The programme takes place in two phases. Firstly there will be a development phase where the three student Project Leaders, together with four Student Facilitators, will work with an appointed Arts Practitioner to develop and eventually deliver the programme. The second phase will be the running of a one-day workshop at one of the partner universities where participants will work on a real life business issue taken from a creative business and, through a case study approach, gain knowledge and practical experience of:
- Markets and marketing
- Developing and presenting a sustainable business model
- Commercial awareness including finance, leadership and teams, communication, intellectual property

Workshop participants will be recruited on a first come, first serve basis.

Both Durham and Newcastle Universities have committed informally to providing accommodation and technical support.

Timetable and targets

February- Initial planning meeting between the three student organisers at one of the partner institutions.
March – Recruit student facilitators and consultant.
April – First planning meeting of student facilitators with consultant
May – June Three further planning meetings; confirm date and book venue, publicise workshop
September - Workshop takes place; debriefing meeting for student facilitators
October – December - compile materials and create toolkit; dissemination at conferences
January 2014– prepare and submit final report

The main barrier is likely to be establishing dates for the planning meetings where students and the consultant are working in three locations with heavy workloads. This will be overcome by agreeing a clear meeting schedule at the outset and drawing up a memorandum of understanding between the Arts Practitioner, the Student Organisers and Student Facilitators.

Added Value

There are numerous workshops and modules available to students related to entrepreneurship, some of which specifically target the creative sector. This project provides added value in the following three ways:
- The workshop targets two specific subject areas, bringing together students from three different institutions creating new potential partnerships and synergies.
- Whilst Participants will be gaining skills and expertise in entrepreneurship; a further four Student Facilitators will gain extra benefits in terms of training and experience in course delivery.
- There will be a legacy of materials co- developed by students and the arts practitioner.

Publicity

Based on the recruitment strategies currently employed by the careers teams and graduate schools at all three of the partner institutions and the added popularity of training geared directly towards particular subject areas, it is anticipated that it will be relatively easy to recruit the equivalent of 10 students from each institution. The institutions and schools involved are very supportive, but it will be vital to ensure that the students are attracted by developing the appropriate language and marketing to resonate with them – however this is a key part of the design and development, and will draw on the experience of the three Students Organisers on the team, who are confident that this can be achieved.

Publicity will make use of existing mechanisms at the partner universities Careers departments; social media; plasma screens; Schools of English and Music websites and internal communications; PGR Blogs, Facebook pages as well as direct marketing by the organising students to peers.

Based on consultation with the Careers Team at Newcastle on appropriate selection strategies, selection will be on a first-come first-serve basis for students in the designated subject areas.

Monitoring and evaluation

- Feedback from participants via two short questionnaires, one at the start and one at the end of the workshop day
- Incorporation into fieldwork research of the Durham and Newcastle student organisers (notes and reflective observations will be written up with permission from participants)
- Report to Durham Teaching and Learning Committee

Dissemination

- Simple toolkit, available on Blackboard sites at partner institutions
- Presentations at Teaching and Learning conferences at participating universities

Sustainability

Although this is a one-off workshop it will potentially inform the basis of future bids from both the student organisers and the Newcastle, Durham, Queen's consortium. The workshop materials and report will be made available for future use and it is anticipated that the Student Organisers and Facilitators will be equipped go on to organise their own enterprise training events in the future.

Appendix 10: Summary of triangulation data

Fieldwork/location	Date	Data
'Breaking into Music' regional careers event held at The Sage Gateshead.	2/2/2009	Feedback questionnaire included question on future career aspirations. 65 responses.
Music Enterprise taught module at Civic University including students from both Civic University and local FE/HE College.	Across academic year 2010/11	Data from approximately 40 students across the academic year: Participant observation by module leader.[459] Questionnaire including question on career aspirations. Data from reflective portfolios. Assessed reflective essays 'Musician as entrepreneur' Triangulation questionnaire checking emerging themes.[460]
Liverpool John Moores University AGCAS (Association of Graduate Careers Advisory Services) information day on 'Working in music'	June 2011	Notes from presentations and informal conversations with a series of visiting speakers working in the music industry.
Royal Northern College of Music (RNCM)	June 2011	Notes from informal discussions and formal meeting with staff responsible for professional development of students.
Leeds College of Music	June 2011	Notes from informal discussions and formal meeting with staff responsible for professional development of students. Feedback from questionnaires completed by students who had participated in enterprise training.
Civic University ICMuS Transitions project (pilot)	Academic year 2009/10	Transcript analysis Triangulation questionnaires
Civic University Careers service Placement	February 2011	Observation notes on key operational activities. [461] Audio records of interviews with students. Audio record and transcript of triangulation meeting with staff.
The Sage Gateshead Additional student interviews.	October 2011 and July 2012	Audio record of interview with this student who had moved from a music degree at the Vocational University to a Masters degree in the business school at the Collegiate university
Main field sites GET test (General Enterprising Tendency)	March – May 2011	10 psychological profiles from student respondents and members of the student focus group.
Civic University First year student questionnaire	September 2006	Qualitative data from 40 incoming students on their thoughts and feelings about their first few weeks in the music department.
Civic University Focus Group	March 2011	Transcript of discussion of my research findings with a group of nine music students and their tutor.
Collegiate University Composition students	2010/2011	Video recordings and written case studies

---

[459] See Appendix 7: music business module permission request.

[460] See Appendix 8: triangulation questionnaire, emerging themes.

[461] See Chapter 2.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Albert, R.S. and Runco, M. A. (1999) 'A history of research on creativity', in Sternberg, R. (ed.) *Handbook of Creativity.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Aldrich, H.E. (2005) 'Against all odds: the impact of financial, human, and cultural capital on becoming a nascent entrepreneur', *Nascent Entrepreneurship: the hidden potential conference.* Durham University, Durham 21-23 September. Durham Business School Centre for Entrepreneurship.

Aldrich, H.E. and Martinez, M.A. (2001) 'Many are called but few are chosen: an evolutionary perspective for the study of entrepreneurship', *Entrepreneurship: Theory and Practice,* 25 (4), pp. 41-56.

Alter, J.B. (1989) 'Creativity profile of university and conservatory students', *Creativity Research Journal,* 2 (3), pp. 184-189.

Armstrong, P. (2005) *Critique of entrepreneurship: people and policy.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Ashcroft, B., Griffiths, G. and Tiffin, H. (1989) *The empire writes back: theory and practice in post-colonial literatures.* London: Routledge.

Avruch, K. (1982) 'New markets and good deeds: on altruism and exemplary entrepreneurship', *Anthropological Quarterly,* 55 (4), pp. 211-223.

Bagheri, A. (2009) 'An exploratory study of entrepreneurial leadership development of university students', *European Journal of Social Sciences,* 11 (1), pp.177-190.

Bakhshi, H. Feeman, A. and Higgs, P. (2013) *A dynamic mapping of the creative industries.* London: NESTA.

Baruch, Y. (2004) *Managing Careers: theory and practice.* Harlow: Pearson Education.

Barz, G. and Cooley, T. J. (2008*) Shadows in the field: new perspectives for fieldwork in ethnomusicology.* New York: Oxford.

Bashford, C. (2007) *The pursuit of high culture: John Ella and chamber music in Victorian London.* Woodbridge: The Boydell Press.

Baxter Magolda, M. B. (1992) *Knowing and reasoning in college: gender related patterns in students' intellectual development.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Beard, D. and Gloag, K. (2005) *Musicology: the key concepts.* Routledge: Abingdon.

Beaudry, N. (2008) 'The challenges of human relations in ethnographic enquiry: examples from Arctic and Subarctic fieldwork' in Barz, G. and Cooley, T. J. *Shadows in the field: New perspectives for fieldwork in ethnomusicology.* New York: Oxford. pp. 224-245.

Beaven, Z. (2012) 'Complex entrepreneurial journeys: "pragmatic" and "tactical" nascent musician-entrepreneurs', *Institute for Small Business and Entrepreneurship Conference.* Dublin, 7-8th November.

Beaven, Z. (2009) 'This is how its gonna be! Intender musician-entrepreneurs develop entrepreneurial identity', *British Academy of Management Conference: End of the Pier? Competing perspectives on the challenges facing business and management.* Brighton, 15th – 17th September.

Bee, H. E. and Boyd, D. (2010) *The developing child, Twelfth Edition*, London: Pearson.

Bennett, D. (2008) *Understanding the classical music profession: The Past, the Present and Strategies for the Future.* Aldershot: Ashgate.

Benz, M. (2009) 'Entrepreneurship as non-profit-seeking activity', *The International Entrepreneurship and Management Journal*, 5, pp.23-44.

Berger, H. M. (2008) 'Phenomenology and the ethnography of popular music: ethnomusicology at the juncture of cultural studies and folklore', in Barz, G. and Cooley, T. J. *Shadows in the field: new perspectives for fieldwork in ethnomusicology.* New York: Oxford. pp. 62-75.

Bergland, H. (2007) 'Researching entrepreneurship as lived experience', in Neergaard, H. and Ulhøi, J. (eds.) *Handbook of qualitative research methods in entrepreneurship.* Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Binks, M. and Vale, P. (1990) *Entrepreneurship and economic change.* Maidenhead: McGraw Hill.

Blackburn, R. and Kovalainen, A. (2009) 'Researching small firms and entrepreneurship: past, present and future', *International Journal of Management Reviews,* 11 (2), pp127-148.

Brattico, E. and Tervaniemi, M. (2006) 'Musical creativity and the human brain', in Deliège, I. and Wiggins, G. A. (eds) *Musical creativity: multidisciplinary research in theory and practice.* Hove: Taylor and Francis, pp. 290-321.

Brown, R. (2004) *Performing arts entrepreneurship*. Lancaster: Palatine.

Burland, K. and Pitts, S. (2007) 'Becoming a music student: investigating the skills and attitudes of students beginning a music degree', *Arts and Humanities in Higher Education,* 6 (3), pp. 289-308.

Burland, K. and Davidson, D. (2001) 'Investigating social processes in group musical composition', *Research Studies in Music Education,* 16, pp. 46-56.

Burrows, R. (ed.) (1991) *Deciphering the enterprise culture: entrepreneurship, petty capitalism and the restructuring of Britain.* London: Routledge.

Bygrave, W. D. (2007) 'The entrepreneurship paradigm revisited', in Neergaard, H. and Ulhøi, J. (eds.) *Handbook of Qualitative Research Methods in Entrepreneurship.* Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Caird, S. (1990) 'What does it mean to be enterprising?', *British Journal of Management,* 1, pp.137-145.

Caird, S. (1988) *Report on the development and validation of a measure of general enterprising tendency.* DUBS occasional paper.

Carspecken, P. F. (1996) *Critical ethnography in educational research: a theoretical and practical guide.* London: Routledge.

Casson, M. C. (1991) *The entrepreneur: an economic theory.* Oxford: Martin Robertson.

Casson, M. C. (2003) *The entrepreneur: an economic theory, 2nd edn.* Cheltenham: Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Chell, E., Haworth, J.M. and Brearley, S.A. (1991) *The entrepreneurial personality: concepts, cases and categories.* London: Routledge.

Clarke, E. and Cook, N. (2004) *Empirical musicology: aims, methods, prospects.* Oxford University Press: Oxford.

Clarke, E. (2002) 'Understanding the psychology of performance' in Rink, J. (ed.) *Musical performance: a guide to understanding.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Clayton, M., Herbert, T. and Middleton, R. eds. (2003) *The cultural study of music.* New York: Routledge.

Collins, L.A., Smith, A. J. and Hannon, P.D. (2006) 'Applying a synergistic learning approach in entrepreneurship education', *Management Learning,* 37 (3) pp. 335-354.

Cook, N. (1998) *Music: A very short introduction.* Oxford University Press: Oxford.

Cooley T. J. and Barz G. (2008) 'Casting shadows: fieldwork is dead! Long live fieldwork', in Barz, G. and Cooley, T. J. *Shadows in the field: New perspectives for fieldwork in ethnomusicology.* New York: Oxford. pp. 3-24.

Cottrell, S. (2004) *Professional music-making in London: ethnography and experience.* Aldershot: Ashgate.

Coulson, S. (2012) 'Collaborating in a competitive world: musicians' working lives and understandings of entrepreneurship', *Work, Employment and Society,* 26 pp. 246-261.

Coulson, S. (2010) 'Getting 'Capital' in the music world: musicians' learning experiences and working lives', *British Journal of Music Education,* 27 (3) pp. 255-270.

Coulson, S. (2007) *Singing for your supper: musicians' improvised working lives in a regional context.* Unpublished PhD. thesis. Newcastle University.

Cox, A. (2005) 'What are communities of practice? A comparative review of four seminal works', *Journal of Information Science,* 31 pp. 527-540.

Creanor, L., Trinder, K., Gowan, D. and Howells, C. (2006), *LEX The learning experience of e-learning final project report,* Glasgow Caledonian University.

Creative & Cultural Skills (2009) *Creative and cultural industries workforce survey.* Creative & Cultural Skills.

Csikszentmihalyi, M. (1999) 'Implications of a systems perspective for the study of creativity', in Sternberg, R. (ed.) *Handbook of Creativity.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Csikszentmihalyi, M. (1990) *Flow: The psychology of optimal experience.* New York: Harper Collins.

Darby, G. (2002) *The young entrepreneurs.* London: RSA The Royal Society for the encouragement of Arts, Manufactures and Commerce.

Darwin, C. (1859) The origin of species, in G. Beer (ed) *Charles Darwin the origin of species.* (1996) Oxford, Oxford University Press.

Davidson, J. (2002) 'Developing the ability to perform' in Rink, J. (ed.) *Musical performance: a guide to understanding.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Davidson, J. W and Borthwick, S. J. (2002) 'Family dynamics and family scripts: A case study of musical development', *Psychology of Music,* 30 (1) pp. 121-136.

Davidson, J.W. and Da Costa Coimbra, D. (2001) 'Investigating performance evaluation by assessors of singers in a music college setting', *Psychology of Music,* 32:3.

Davidsson, P. (2004) *Researching entrepreneurship.* New York: Springer Science+Business Media.

Deliège, I. and Wiggins, G. A. (eds) (2006) *Musical creativity: multidisciplinary research in theory and practice.* Hove: Taylor and Francis.

Deliège, I. and Richelle, M. (2006) 'The spectrum of musical creativity', in Deliège, I. and Wiggins, G. A. (eds) *Musical creativity: multidisciplinary research in theory and practice.* Hove: Taylor and Francis, pp. 2-6.

Denzin, N. K. (1997) Interpretive ethnography: ethnographic practices for the 21st century. London: Sage.

Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) (2008a) *The landscape of qualitative research: theories and issues, 3rd edn.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) (2008b) *Strategies of qualitative inquiry, 3rd edn.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) (2008c) *Collecting and interpreting qualitative materials, 3rd edn.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) (2003) *The landscape of qualitative research: theories and issues, 2nd edn.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Dibben, N. (2006) 'The socio-cultural and learning experiences of music students in a British university', *The British Journal of Music Education*, 23(1), pp. 91-116.

Dobson, M. C. (2011) 'Insecurity, professional sociability, and alcohol: young freelance musicians' perspectives on work and life in the music profession', *Psychology of Music,* 39, pp. 240-260.

Down, S. and Reveley, J. (2004) 'Generational encounters and the social formation of entrepreneurial identity: 'young guns' and 'old farts'', *Organization,* 11 (2) pp. 233-250.

Down, S. and Warren, L. (2008) 'Constructing narratives of enterprise: clichés and entrepreneurial self-identity', *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behaviour and Research*, 14 (1), pp. 4-23.

Durham Business School Centre for Entrepreneurship (2005) *Nascent entrepreneurship: the hidden potential.* Durham University, Durham 21-23 September.

Edinburgh Conference Centre (2009) *International Entrepreneurship Educators Conference: advancing enterprise education.* Heriot-Watt University, Edinburgh 2-4 September.

Ehrlich, C. (1985) *The music profession in Britain since the eighteenth century: A Social History.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Emerton, W.P. (1881) *Adam Smith's inquiry into the nature and causes of the wealth of nations.* Oxford: James Thornton.

Erkkilä, K. (2000) *Entrepreneurial education: mapping the debates in the United States, the United Kingdom and Finland.* New York: Garland Publishing.

European Commission (2006) *Entrepreneurship education in Europe: fostering entrepreneurial mindsets through education and learning conference.* Oslo, 26-27 October.

Ezzy, D. (2010) 'Qualitative interviewing as embodied emotional performance', *Qualitative Enquiry,* 16(3), pp.163-170.

Finnegan, R. (2007) *The hidden musicians: music making in an Engish town.* Middletown: Wesleyan University Press.

Fleet, P. (2008) *The provision in 'music skills' for degree students on popular music programmes across selected north eastern and national institutions.* Available at: http://www.cetl4musicne.ac.uk/CETLMusicSkillsReport2008a.pdf

Flowers, P. (2005) 'Interpretative phenomenological analysis', *Workshops for LEX.* Glasgow Caledonian University, Glasgow, 8 November.

Fontana, A. and Frey, J. H. (2008) 'The interview: from neutral stance to political involvement', in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) *Collecting and interpreting qualitative materials, 3rd edn.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, pp. 115-159.

For Entrepreneurs Only (2013) *Meeting business secretary Vince Cable.* Available at: http://forentrepreneursonly.co.uk/news/meeting-business-secretary-vince-cable. (Accessed: 5 June 2013).

Frank, R. H. (2011) *The Darwin economy: liberty, competition and the common good.* Oxford: Princeton University Press.

Gibb, A. (2005) *Towards the entrepreneurial university: entrepreneurship education as a lever for change.* [online]. Available at: http://www.ncge.org.uk (Accessed: 27 January 2010).

Gibb, A. (2002) 'In pursuit of a new 'enterprise' and 'entrepreneurship' paradigm for learning: creative destruction, new values, new ways of doing things and combinations of knowledge', *International Journal of Management Reviews,* 4:3, pp. 233-269.

Gibb, A. (2000) 'SME policy, academic research and the growth of ignorance, mythical concepts, myths, assumptions, rituals and confusions', *International Small Business Journal,* 18(13), pp.13-35. DOI: 10.1177/0266242600183001 (Accessed: 2 December 2009).

Gibb, A. (1993) 'The enterprise culture and education', *International Small Business Journal,* 11(3), pp. 11-34

Gnyawali, D. R. and Fogel, D.S. (1994) 'Environments for entrepreneurship development: key dimensions and research implications', *Entrepreneurship theory and practice,* Summer 1994, pp. 43-62.

Great Britain. Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (2012) *Enterprise and entrepreneurship education: guidance for higher education providers.* London: QAA.

Great Britain. Department of Business Innovation and Skills (BIS) (2011) *Learners at the heart of the system.* London: BIS.

Great Britain. Department for Culture, Media and Sport (2008) *Creative Britain: new talents for the new economy.* London: DCMS.

Great Britain. Department for Culture, Media and Sport (2007) *The feasibility of a live music economic impact study*. London: DCMS.

Great Britain. Department for Culture, Media and Sport (2006) *Developing entrepreneurship for the creative industries: making the case for public investment.* London: DCMS.

Great Britain. Department for Culture, Media and Sport (2006) *Developing entrepreneurship for the creative industries: The role of higher and further education.* London: DCMS.

Green, L. (2003) 'Music education, cultural capital and social group identity', in Clayton, M., Herbert, T. and Middleton, R. eds. (2003) *The cultural study of music.* New York: Routledge.

Green, L. (2002) *How popular musicians learn: a way ahead for music education.* London: Ashgate.

Grilo, I. And Thurik, R. (2005) 'Determinants of entrepreneurial engagement levels in Europe and the US', *Nascent entrepreneurship: the hidden potential conference.* Durham University, Durham 21-23 September. Durham Business School Centre for Entrepreneurship.

Hardill, I., Benneworth, P., Baker, M. and Budd, L. (2006) (eds). *The rise of the English regions?* London: Routledge.

Harvey, L., Drew, S. and Smith, M. (2006), *The first year experience: a review of literature for the Higher Education Academy,* Sheffield Hallam University, October.

Higher Education Academy Art Design Media Subject Centre and the National Endowment for Science, Technology and the Arts (2007) *Creating entrepreneurship: entrepreneurship education for the creative industries.* York: Higher Education Academy.

Howe, M. (1999) 'Prodigies and creativity', in Sternberg, R. J. (1999) (ed.) *Handbook of creativity.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 431-448.

Howorth, L., Tempest, S. and Coupland, C. (2005) 'Rethinking entrepreneurship methodology and definitions of the entrepreneur', *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development,* 12 (1), pp. 24-40.

Jack, S., Rose, M. and Johnston, L. (2009) 'Tracing the historical foundations of social networks in entrepreneurship research', *The ISBE Liverpool annual conference.* Liverpool, 4-6 November.

Johnson, P. S., Parker, C. P. and Wijbenga, F. (2006) 'Nascent entrepreneurship research: achievements and opportunities', *Small Business Economics*, 27, pp. 1-4.

Kemmis, S. and McTaggart, R. (2008) 'Participatory action research: communicative action and the public sphere', in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) *Strategies of Qualitative Inquiry, 3rd edn.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, pp. 271-330.

Kemp, A. E. (1996) *The musical temperament: psychology and personality of musicians.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Kent, C. A., Sexton, D. L. and Vesper, K. H. (eds.) (1982) *Encyclopedia of entrepreneurship.* New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Kerman, K. (1994) *Write all these down: essays on music.* London: University of California Press.

Kevorkian, T. (2004) 'Changing times, changing music: "new church" music and musicians in Leipzig, 1699-1750', in Weber, W. (ed.) *The Musician as entrepreneur 1700-1914: managers, charlatans and idealists.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press, pp. 62-101.

Kingsbury, H. (1988) *Music, talent, and performance: a conservatory cultural system.* Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Klausen, S. H. (2010) 'The notion or creativity revisited: a philosophical perspective on creativity research', *Creativity Research Journal,* 22.4, pp. 347-360.

Klofsten, M. (2006) 'Can entrepreneurship be taught? Supporting academic enterprise', *Associated Universities of the Northeast Conference on Entrepreneurship.* Newcastle upon Tyne.

Knights, B. (2008) 'Leitch, skills and prosperity for all: towards a humanities perspective', *HEAC English Subject Centre Newsletter,* 15, pp. 22-24.

Kondo, D. K. (1990) *Crafting selves: power, gender, and discourses of identity in a Japanese workplace.* Chicago: University of Chicago press.

Korsgaard, S. (2013) 'It's really out there: a review of the critique of the discovery view of opportunities', *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behaviour and Research*, 19:2, pp. 130-148.

Kourilsky, M. L. and Walstad, W. B. (2007) *The entrepreneur in youth.* Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Krüger, S. and Lincoln, S. (2010) *Enhancing employability in music: an ethnographic study into student's work-based learning experiences.* Liverpool John Moores University: Palatine.

Krüger, S. (2009) *Experiencing ethnomusicology: teaching and learning in European Universities.* Farnham: Ashgate.

Lane, P. (2012) *10,000 hours: you become what you practice.* CreateSpace Independent Publishing.

Laurence, F. (2005) *Music and empathy.* Unpublished PhD thesis. University of Birmingham.

Leavy, P. (2010) 'A/r/t: a poetic montage', *Qualitative Inquiry,* 16(4), pp. 240-243.

Lee, K. V. (2010) 'An autoethnography: music therapy after laser eye surgery', *Qualitative Inquiry,* 16 (4), pp. 244-248.

Leitch, V. B. (ed) (2010) *The Norton anthology of theory and criticism, 2nd ed.* New York: Norton.

Leppert, R. (2004) 'The musician of the imagination', in Weber, W. (ed.) *The musician as entrepreneur 1700-1914: managers, charlatans and idealists.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press, pp. 25-58.

Lincoln, S. Y. (2010) '"What a long, strange trip it's been..": twenty-five years of qualitative and new paradigm research', *Qualitative Inquiry*, 16(1), pp. 3-9.

Lincoln, S. Y. and Denzin, N. K. (eds.) (2003) *Turning points in qualitative research: tying knots in a handkerchief.* Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.

Livesay, H. C. (1982) 'Entrepreneurial history', in Kent, C. A., Sexton, D. L. and Vesper, K. H. (eds.) (1982) *Encyclopedia of entrepreneurship.* New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Macht, S. (2010) *How to teach entrepreneurship: the student's perspective,* Newcastle upon Tyne: Northumbria University.

Manathunga, C. (2006) 'Doing educational development ambivalently: applying post-colonial metaphors to educational development?', *International Journal for Academic Development,* 11(1), pp. 19-29. DOI:10.1080/13601440600578771 (Accessed:3 June 2008).

Maréchal, G. and Linstead, S. (2010) 'Metropoems: poetic method and ethnographic experience', *Qualitative Inquiry,* 16(1), pp. 66-77.

Martin, A. (1982) 'Additional aspects of entrepreneurial history', in Kent, C.A., Sexton, D.L and Vesper, K.H. (eds.) *Encyclopedia of entrepreneurship.* New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Martin, R. L. and Osberg, S. (2007) 'Social entrepreneurship: the case for definition', *Stanford Social Innovation Review,* Spring [online].

Martinson, Ø. L. (2011) 'The creative personality: a synthesis and development of the creative person profile', Creativity Research Journal, 23(3), pp.185-202.

Matlay, H. (2006) 'Researching entrepreneurship and education Part 2: what is entrepreneurship education and does it matter?', *Education + Training* 48 (8/9), pp. 704-718.

May, R. (1975) *The courage to create.* New York: Norton.

Mayes, T. (2006), *LEX the learning experience of e-learning methodology report,* Glasgow Caledonian University, September.

McCash, P. (2008) 'Career studies handbook: career development learning in practice', *The Higher Education Academy.*

McCash, P. (2006) 'We're all career researchers now: breaking open career education and DOTS', *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling,* 34(4), November, pp. 429-449.

McClelland, D. C. (1961) *The achieving society.* Princeton: Van Nostrand.

McKelvey, B. (2004) 'Toward a complexity science of entrepreneurship' *Journal of Business Venturing*, 19, pp. 313-341.

McJKinlay, A. and Smith, C. (eds) (2009) *Creative labour: working in the creative industries.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

McMillan, S. and Price, M. A. (2010) 'Through the looking glass: our autoethnographic journey through research mind-fields', *Qualitative Inquiry,* 16 (2), pp. 140-147.

Mcpherson, G. E. (2009) 'The role of parents in children's musical development', *Psychology of Music,* 37 (1), pp. 91-110.

Merker, B. H. (2006) 'Layered constraints on the multiple creativities of music', in Deliège, I. and Wiggins, G.A. (eds) *Musical Creativity: Multidisciplinary research in theory and practice.* Hove: Taylor and Francis, pp. 25-41.

Merriam, A. P. (1964) *The anthropology of music.* Evanston: Northwestern University Press.

Middleton, R. (2009) *Musical belongings.* Farnham: Ashgate.

Middleton, R. (2003) 'Locating the people: music and the popular', in Clayton, M., Herbert, T. and Middleton, R. eds. *The cultural study of music.* New York: Routledge.

Mills, J. (2004) 'Working in music: the conservatoire professor', *British Journal of Music Education*, 21:2, pp. 179-198.

Moore, D., Burland, K. and Davidson, W. (2003) 'The social context of musical success: a developmental account', *British Journal of Psychology*, 94, pp. 529-549.

Mueller, P. (2005) 'Entrepreneurship in the region: breeding ground for nascent entrepreneurs?', *Nascent Entrepreneurship: the hidden potential conference.* Durham University, Durham 21-23 September. Durham Business School Centre for Entrepreneurship.

Neergaard, H. and Ulhøi, J. (eds.) (2007) *Handbook of qualitative research methods in entrepreneurship.* Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Nelson, R. E. (1977) 'Entrepreneurship education in developing countries', *South Asian Survey,* 17(9), pp. 880-885.

Nettl, B. (1995) *Heartland excursions: ethnomusicological reflections on schools of music.* Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

Nicholson, L. and Anderson, A. R. (2005) 'News and nuances of the entrepreneurial myth and metaphor: linguistic games in entrepreneurial sense-making and sense-giving', *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice*, 29(2), March, pp. 153-172.

O'Toole, M. (2009) *Stimulating enterprise and entrepreneurial Learning: A snapshot of Newcastle University*. Newcastle University (internal research report).

Oxford Dictionaries Online. Oxford: Oxford University Press [Online]. Available at: http://oxforddictionaries.com/definition/entrepreneur (Accessed 18 November 2011).

Palmer, C. (1997) 'Music performance', *Annual Review of Psychology,* 48, pp. 115-38.

Pasler, J. (2004) 'Countess Greffulhe as entrepreneur: negotiating class, gender, and nation', in Weber, W. (ed.) *The musician as entrepreneur 1700-1914: managers, charlatans and idealists.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press, pp. 221-225.

Pachet, F. (2006) 'Creativity studies and musical interaction', in Deliège, I. and Wiggins, G. A. (eds) *Musical creativity: multidisciplinary research in theory and practice.* Hove: Taylor and Francis, pp. 347-375.

Phelps, R. P., Sadoff, R. H., Warburton, E. C. and Ferrara, L. *A guide to research in music education, 5th ed.* Oxford: The Scarecrow Press.

Pryer, A. (1994) 'Re-thinking history. What is music 'history' and how is it written? Anthony Pryer reflects on the problems of music historians and some recent histories of early music', *The Musical Times,* 135 (1821), November, pp. 682-690.

Rae, D., Martin, L., Antcliff, V. and Hannon, P. (2010) *The 2010 survey of enterprise and entrepreneurship.* London: National Council for Graduate Entrepreneurship and Institute for Small Business and Entrepreneurship.

Raynor, H. (1972) *A social history of music: from the Middle Ages to Beethoven.* London: Butler and Tanner.

Reybrouck, M. M. (2006) 'Musical creativity between symbolic modelling and perceptual constraints: the role of adaptive behaviour and epistemic autonomy', in Deliège, I. and Wiggins, G. A. (eds) *Musical Creativity: multidisciplinary research in theory and practice.* Hove: Taylor and Francis.

Reynolds, (2005) 'Identification of entrepreneurs questionnaire', *Nascent entrepreneurship: the hidden potential conference.* Durham University, Durham 21-23 September. Durham Business School Centre for Entrepreneurship.

Rink, J. (2002) (ed.) *Musical erformance: A guide to understanding.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Robbins, D. (2000) *Bourdieu and culture.* London: Sage.

Rosselli, J. (1992) *Singers of Italian opera: the history of a profession.*

Robson, C. (2002) *Real world research: a resource for social scientists and practitioner-researchers, 2nd ed.* Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.

Root-Bernstein, R. S. (2001) 'Music, creativity and scientific thinking', *Leonardo,* 34:1, pp. 63-68.

Saunders, M. (2006) 'From 'organisms' to 'boundaries': the uneven development of theory narratives in education, learning and work connections', *Journal of Education and Work,* 19:1, pp. 1-27.

Schechner, R. (2006) *Performance studies: an introduction.* Abingdon: Routledge

Scholes, P. A. (1947) *The Oxford companion to music*, 7th ed. London: Oxford University Press.

Schumpeter, J. A. (1934) *The Theory of economic development.* Translated by R.Opie. Reprint, London: Oxford University Press, 1969.

Schwarz, D., Kassabian, A. and Lawrence, S. (eds.) (1997) *Keeping score: music, disciplinarity, culture.* Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia.

Senior, R. (2011) 'Can Durham be a brand', *Durham First* (no. 31, Winter), pp. 6-7.

Shelemay, K. (2011) 'Musical communities: rethinking the collective in music', *Journal of the American Musicological Society,* 64:2, pp. 349-390.

Shapero, A. and Sokol, L. (1982) 'The social dimensions of entrepreneurship' in Kent, C. A., Sexton, D. L. and Vesper, K. H. (eds.) *Encyclopedia of entrepreneurship.* New Jersey: Prentice Hall, pp. 72-89.

Small, C. (1998) *Musiking: the meanings of performing and listening.* Hanover: University Press of New England.

Southey, R. (2008) *Chords and discords.* Chesterfield: Crème de la Crime.

Southey, R. (2007) *Broken harmony.* Chesterfield: Crème de la Crime.

Southey, R. (2006) *Music-making in North-East England during the Eighteenth Century.* Aldershot: Ashgate.

Stake, R. E. (2008) 'Qualitative case studies', in Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) *Strategies of qualitative inquiry, 3rd edn.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Steiner, G. (2001) *Grammars of creation.* London: Faber.

Sternberg, R. (2006) 'The nature of creativity', *Creativity research Journal*, 18:1, pp. 87-98.

Sternberg, R. (1999) (ed.) *Handbook of creativity.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Sternberg R. J. and Lubart, T. I. (1999) 'The concept of creativity: prospects and paradigms', in Sternberg, R. J. (1999) (ed.) *Handbook of creativity.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 3-15.

Steyaert, C. and Hjorth, D. (eds.) (2006) *Entrepreneurship as social change.* Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.

Stock, P. J. and Chiener, C. (2008) 'Fieldwork at home: European and Asian perspectives', in Barz, G. and Cooley, T. J. *Shadows in the field: new perspectives for fieldwork in ethnomusicology.* New York: Oxford. pp. 108-124.

The Concise Oxford Dictionary (1964) London: Oxford University Press.

Toby Perkins (2008) *Labour launches small business taskforce report – 'an enterprising nation'.* Available at: http://www.tobyperkins.org.uk/2013/03/labour-launches-small-business-taskforce-report-an-enterprising-nation (Accessed 5 June 2013).

Titon, T. T. (2008) 'Knowing fieldwork', in Barz, G. and Cooley, T. *Shadows in the field: new perspectives for fieldwork in ethnomusicology.* New York: Oxford, pp. 25-41.

Turino, T. (2008) *Music as social life: the politics of participation.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Wagner, J. (2005) 'Nascent and infant entrepreneurs in Germany: evidence from the Regional Entrepreneurship Monitor', *Nascent entrepreneurship: the hidden potential conference.* Durham University, Durham 21-23 September. Durham Business School Centre for Entrepreneurship.

Wareham, T. (2008) *Creative graduates: enhancing teaching-research links in the creative arts.* Lancaster: Palatine.

Watts, A. G., Law, B., Killeen, J., Kidd, J. M. and Hawthorne, R. (1996) *Re-thinking careers education and guidance: theory, policy and practice.* Routledge: Taylor and Francis Group.

Weatherston, D. E. (2009) 'Nascent entrepreneurship and music students', in Clews, D. (ed) *Dialogues in art and design: promoting and sharing excellence.* ADM-HEA/GLAD.

Weatherston D. and Laurence F. (2008) 'Changing lives: perspectives from a study of six music undergraduates in their first year', *EFYE conference,* Wolverhampton: University of Wolverhampton, 7-9 May.

Weber, W. (ed.) (2004) *The musician as entrepreneur 1700-1914: managers, charlatans and idealists.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Weber, W. (2004) 'From the self-managing musician to the independent concert agent', in Weber, W. (ed.) *The musician as entrepreneur 1700-1914: managers, charlatans and idealists.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press, pp. 105-129.

Welch, G., Hallam, S., Lamont, A., Swanwick, K., Green, L., Hennessy, S., Cox, G., O'Neill, S. and Farrell, G. (2004) 'Mapping music education research in the UK', *Psychology of Music,* 32(3), pp. 239-290.

Wenger, E. (2000). 'Communities of practice and social learning systems'. *Organization*, 7(2) pp. 225-246.

Wenger, E. (1998) *Communities of practice: learning, meaning and identity.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Westhead, P., Wright, M. and McElwee, G. (2011) *Entrepreneurship: perspectives and cases.* Harlow: Pearson.

Winterson, J. and Russ, M. (2008) *Understanding the transition from school to university in music and related subjects*. [Online]. Available at: http://www.hud.ac.uk/tqef/1c (Accessed 27 May 2009).

Woodhead, M., Carr, R. and Light, P. (eds) (1994) *Becoming a person.* London: Routledge.

Woody, R. (1999) 'The musician's personality', *Creativity Research Journal,* 12(4), pp. 241-250.

Wych, G. (2012) **'**Gender and instrument associations, stereotypes, and stratification: a literature review', *Applications of Research in Music Education,* 30(2) pp. 22-31.

Yorke, M. and Longden, B. (2007) *The first-year experience in higher education in the UK,* Higher Education Academy, February.